

BRISTOL BAY FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE
REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

PUBLIC MEETING

VOLUME II

Dillingham, Alaska

October 31, 2019

8:33 a.m.

COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT:

Molly Chythlook, Chair

Dennis Andrew

Nanci Morris Lyon

William Trefon

Dan Dunaway

Richard Wilson

Robert Larson

Frank Woods

Regional Council Coordinator, Donald Mike

Recorded and transcribed by:

Computer Matrix Court Reporters, LLC

135 Christensen Drive, Suite 2

Anchorage, Alaska 99501

907-243-0668/sahile@gci.net

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2
3 (Dillingham, Alaska - 10/31/2019)4
5 (On record)6
7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I'm
8 going to call the meeting to order, it's 8:33. And,
9 you know, before -- what I'm going to do is I'll go
10 over the agenda, what's left of our agenda, but before
11 we do that Dan Dunaway has a birthday wish he wants to
12 have. So let's have that and then we'll continue with
13 the agenda.
1415 MR. DUNAWAY: Well, I checked Facebook
16 this morning and I believe according to Facebook it
17 said that Mr. Trefon's birthday is today and we thought
18 we'd wish him a happy birthday.
19

20 (Laughter)

21
22 MR. TREFON: Thank you.23
24 (Singing)25
26 MR. TREFON: Thank you.27
28 (Applause)29
30 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair, I've
31 attended a couple of other meetings, other RAC meetings
32 where things were rather stiff and formal and I truly
33 love the camaraderie and friendship we share on this
34 RAC.
35

36 So happy birthday, Billy.

37
38 MR. TREFON: Thank you.39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Let me
41 quickly go through what's left of our agenda and see if
42 my review will coincide with yours.
4344 We'll start off with our 19-07 harvest
45 reduction for caribou this morning and then we'll go to
46 2020 Fisheries Resource Monitoring Program, and then
47 identify issues for FY 2019 annual report, then we had
48 crossed off the Alaska Board of Fisheries because we
49 didn't have any proposals for that. Number 11 is
50

1 agency reports and we have the tribal government,
2 Native organization, U.S. Fish and Wildlife and then
3 the National Park Service. Then we have ADF&G, BLM and
4 then OSM. then number 11 would be future meeting
5 dates. Number -- I'm sorry, number 12, it would be
6 number 12. Remember we had a couple of 11s here so we
7 had to redo our numbers. Then number 13 would be
8 closing comments, then 14 adjourn.

9
10 So does that coincide with your agenda?

11
12 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yes.

13
14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: And then --
15 Donald, you want to check to see who's online.

16
17 MR. MIKE: Yeah, good morning, Madame
18 Chair. This is Donald Mike, Council coordinator.

19
20 For those folks online, please state
21 your name and the agency you represent.

22
23 MR. BORNE: Good morning. This is Ray
24 Borne from Yukon Delta Refuge. I'm the acting Refuge
25 manager. I'm just listening in.

26
27 Thank you.

28
29 MR. MATHEWS: This is Vince Mathews,
30 acting Fish and Wildlife Service InterAgency Staff
31 Committee member calling in from Fairbanks.

32
33 MR. REAKOFF: Jack Reakoff, Western
34 Interior Regional Council.

35
36 DR. REAM: Good morning and happy
37 Halloween, everyone. This is Joshua Ream with the
38 National Park Service in the Anchorage regional office.

39
40 MR. BURCH: This is Mark Burch,
41 Department of Fish and Game in Palmer.

42
43 MR. WHITFORD: Good morning. This is
44 Tom Whitford. I'm the Regional Subsistence Program
45 leader for the Forest Service and I'm based here in
46 Anchorage.

47
48 MR. RENICK: Good morning. This is Ross
49 Renick with ADF&G in Chignik.

50

1 MR. MIKE: Thank you. Anyone else.

2
3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Who was that?

4
5 MR. MIKE: Excuse me. Can you restate
6 your name, please.

7
8 MR. RENICK: Yeah, this is Ross Renick.
9 I'm the assistant manager with ADF&G in Chignik.

10
11 MR. MIKE: Thank you. Anyone else.

12
13 MR. LIND: Good morning. Orville Lind,
14 Native liaison for the Office of Subsistence
15 Management. Good morning.

16
17 MR. MIKE: Thank you, everyone. If I
18 missed anyone just please state your name and the
19 agency you represent.

20
21 Thank you, Madame Chair.

22
23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I think
24 we're ready to deal with this Mulchatna caribou. We're
25 pretty bright this morning after we rested up for the
26 night. So let's take this agenda up.

27
28 MR. McKEE: Thank you, Madame Chair,
29 members of the Council. For the record my name is
30 Chris McKee and I'm the Wildlife Division supervisor at
31 the Office of Subsistence Management.

32
33 I'm hoping that I'm not going to bring
34 back the stiff and formality to this process, but I
35 have to kind of necessarily go over some process with
36 you regarding special actions. You've already heard
37 about the biology, it's been discussed a little bit and
38 can certainly -- we have other staff here that can
39 answer some of those questions if you want to get into
40 that regarding this herd. But I really just wanted to
41 go over with you the special action process and how it
42 works and how it differs from the regular proposal
43 process which you guys have already been addressing
44 here at your meeting.

45
46 So a special action is an out of cycle
47 request for a change in regulations. You know, right
48 now we already have the regulations in place for
49 wildlife and we got this request in a few months ago

50

1 and it's asking for something to be done temporarily.
2 So what happens in our process is we get the special
3 action request in, we validate that request and then my
4 staff actually writes the analysis. Looks at the
5 biology, works with the Anthropology Division to look
6 at the cultural issues at hand and writes the analysis.
7 And once it goes -- that's written I review it and then
8 it goes through a series of reviews. It goes out to
9 the Federal members in the field, team field review,
10 then it comes back for internal review at OSM by the
11 leadership staff at OSM. Then it goes to the
12 InterAgency Staff Committee for review. And then
13 finally after that we get a recommendation from the
14 InterAgency Staff Committee and that -- all of that
15 information is put together and then and only then does
16 that analysis go to the Board in preparation -- in
17 anticipation of their meeting.

18
19 However for a temporary special action
20 we are required by regulation to hold public hearings.
21 And so the analysis does not go to the InterAgency
22 Staff Committee for their review until the public
23 hearings are -- take place and we incorporate the
24 comments from the public in -- from those public
25 hearings into the analysis. So necessarily it's a
26 rather slow and deliberative bureaucratic process to
27 get the analysis completed and sent to the Board. So
28 however it does involve public input in the sense that
29 the public gets a chance to voice their comments on the
30 request at these public hearings. We had two public
31 hearings for this special action, one here in
32 Dillingham and another one in Bethel. And at those
33 meetings the public did have an opportunity to weigh in
34 on the request.

35
36 And so now the regulations state that
37 if it will not incur undue delay, that's the
38 phraseology used in the CFR, that we will take these
39 special action requests to the Councils for their
40 recommendation. In the case of this special action we
41 did not do that because we had a special action request
42 that when it was submitted the season was already open.
43 So we have an open season right now and we made the
44 decision that timeliness was the most important thing,
45 that we wanted to get this analysis to the Board, we
46 wanted to get the Board together for a meeting to make
47 a decision on this because of the issue that we have an
48 ongoing season and we wanted to get the Board acting on
49 this as quickly as possible.

50

1 So because of that if we had taken it
2 to all the relevant Councils we would have had to wait
3 until the YK Delta Council met which is going to happen
4 on the 4th and 5th of November I believe. So we would
5 have had to wait until then after going through all the
6 other Councils, getting their recommendations, got the
7 recommendation from the YK Delta, inserted that
8 information into the analysis before it would even go
9 again to the InterAgency Staff Committee for their
10 review. So we would have had to wait until the 5th of
11 November to get that information, put it in the
12 analysis, get it to the ISC for them to review, they
13 have to have a certain period of time to review it, a
14 week at least to review it, then we would get their --
15 we would have had to have gotten their comments back
16 and any edits on that analysis from the ISC and then
17 finalize the analysis and then only then it would have
18 gone to the Board then.

19
20 As it stands now the Board is going to
21 be meeting via teleconference on the 5th of November to
22 take action on this special action request. Had we
23 waited for all of the councils to weigh in with a
24 formal recommendation it would be -- it would probably
25 be at least a couple weeks if not a month later than
26 it's currently going to happen before there would be
27 any action. And like I said we have a season that's
28 already ongoing. So we thought timeliness was very
29 important.

30
31 However despite that we have gone
32 through the -- the Western Interior Council did have
33 their meeting and they weighed in on this. And as a
34 result of that I believe you all have the letter that's
35 -- that was written by the Western Interior Council. I
36 think you have that in front of you where they kind of
37 give a good overview about what they discussed and some
38 bullet points as to what they would like to hear from
39 the other Councils, YK and Bristol Bay, in terms of
40 what they think -- what they would like to have happen.

41
42 So even though it's not a formal
43 recommendation and deference from the Councils doesn't
44 apply in this case, the comments that we get from the
45 Councils obviously are going to be very important for
46 the Board to hear about during their deliberations.
47 And we're going to take those comments from the
48 Councils and make sure that we have that information
49 with us to present to the Board at their
50

1 teleconference.
2

3 In addition to the Western Interior
4 Council taking this up at their meeting we also had a
5 teleconference with all the affected Chairs. Molly was
6 involved in that along with Alissa from YK Delta and
7 Jack Reakoff from Western Interior where we got all the
8 comments from the affected Council Chairs on this
9 special action as well. And then additionally the
10 Chairs of YK and Western Interior I believe were also
11 in on the teleconference portion of the public hearing
12 so they also had an opportunity to weigh in at that
13 public process as well. And so we -- even though we
14 didn't ask for a formal recommendation from all the
15 affected Councils, we did have -- there was a good
16 opportunity for the -- at least the Chairs and anybody
17 else on the Councils that wanted to put forth their
18 concerns regarding this special action both at their
19 meet -- at that meeting and at the public hearings.
20

21 So you have that letter in front of you
22 from the Western Interior Council where they kind of
23 give a bulleted list there at the second page about
24 what they're looking for. You know, we've heard from
25 both the YK and the Western Interior obviously about
26 what their major concern is and, you know, just what
27 they're really looking for is an immediate closure to
28 this winter hunt for this herd. They're also
29 interested in submitting an emergency order to the
30 Alaska Board of Game to close the winter hunt for the
31 herd on the State side as well. They're asking for
32 some better quantified information about harvest and of
33 course asking for involvement from the tribes and local
34 users to basically stand down on the hunt for this
35 herd.
36

37 So you have the letter there in front
38 of you, I'm not going to -- you know, I'm not going to
39 read it to you because that information is there for
40 you. But we're really -- that letter is basically
41 asking for this Council to also weigh in on these
42 issues. I'm here to take notes on this also and I have
43 some other staff. So any information that you talk to
44 us about at this meeting, we're going to make sure that
45 that information gets to the Board during their
46 teleconference. And also you'll also have the
47 opportunity to call in for the Board's teleconference.
48 And we do have the news release that talks about that
49 teleconference. I don't know if you have one, but
50

1 there's printed copies of it up at the table there here
2 at the entrance to the meeting if you want to have one
3 of those.
4

5 So we're going to have all that
6 information, we want to make sure -- I want to make it
7 clear that the Councils, even though we haven't asked
8 for a formal recommendation, the information that we
9 get from the Councils has either already been
10 incorporated into the analysis or we're going to take
11 the comments from this Council at this meeting and have
12 them presented to the Board at their teleconference to
13 make sure that your voice is heard. So I just want to
14 make that clear that we're not -- we're not skipping
15 over the Councils, far from it. It's just a little bit
16 of difference in process, the difference between a
17 recommendation which has deference and a little bit
18 more informal comments. But obviously the concerns
19 from the Councils will weigh heavily on the Board's
20 decision.
21

22 So with that I guess I'll leave it to
23 this Council to discuss that, but I wanted -- I thought
24 it was important to kind of talk about the special
25 action process because obviously during the proposal
26 process you -- that you guys just went through
27 yesterday, you go through a very formal step process
28 where you do have formal public comments either read
29 that are -- or we have written comments in the analysis
30 or people come to the meetings and give those public
31 comments. And you don't really get that on a special
32 action except for the public hearing process for a
33 temporary special action. So it's a little bit
34 different, but you do have public involvement, it's
35 just maybe not quite as involved as the proposal
36 process.
37

38 But that shouldn't be surprising given
39 that for a temporary or emergency special action it's a
40 timeliness issue, we get something that's asking for
41 something to happen, that usually they're -- the
42 request they're asking for they want fairly quickly.
43 In the case of this by the time we got the request the
44 season was already ongoing. So again it was a
45 timeliness issue. There's some very real concerns for
46 this herd and the biology and we just felt like it was
47 very important for the Board to take action on this as
48 soon as possible. But given that we still wanted to
49 make sure that the public was able to weigh in and then
50

1 we got some of these comments from the affected
2 Councils.

3
4 So with that I'll stop talking, but I
5 will certainly be glad to answer any questions you
6 might have on the process or anything else.

7
8 Madame Chair.

9
10 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

11
12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

13
14 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. I've been trying
15 to follow this. I've managed to sit in the Togiak
16 Refuge teleconference and the caribou -- Nushagak
17 caribou herd which is a little different. You know,
18 but this letter from Mr. Reakoff is asking for
19 additional action beyond what Togiak Refuge is
20 proposing; is that correct?

21
22 MR. McKEE: Yes. Both the -- yes.
23 They're asking -- basically what they're asking for is
24 an immediate closure of the winter hunt. So that's
25 beyond what -- the original request was just to simply
26 reduce the harvest limit from two caribou to one
27 caribou.

28
29 MR. DUNAWAY: If I may continue, Madame
30 Chair.

31
32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

33
34 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. So my mind's been
35 mostly geared to thinking about this bag limit
36 reduction. And is there like additional analysis on
37 what this would do if we followed Western Interior's
38 guidance. Is there folks that can speak to that?

39
40 Thank you.

41
42 MR. McKEE: Well, I mean, it would -- I
43 mean, if -- an immediate closure would be a closure to
44 -- you know, there would be no harvest, the hunt would
45 close immediately under Federal regulations if the
46 Board chose to go with that recommendation or those
47 comments. And it would depend on when they would close
48 it, either immediately or they would come up with some
49 other date or some version of that essentially. It

50

1 would -- it would close the hunt under Federal
2 regulation.

3

4 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

7

8 MR. DUNAWAY: I'm kind of scanning the
9 room, this is pretty dramatic and I'm kind of -- I
10 think what I've heard when I was sitting in
11 teleconference is more just discussion of bag limit
12 reduction. So I'm kind of looking around, if there's
13 some anthropologists or whatever, how severe an impact
14 or even we got other Council members here, I'm very
15 curious to hear what they think on a whole closure
16 idea.

17

18 Thank you.

19

20 MR. McKEE: I also believe that Jack
21 Reakoff, the Chair of the Western Interior Council, is
22 on the line too. So if you wanted to I'm sure he could
23 go into a little bit more detail as to why they might
24 be asking for this.

25

26 MR. REAKOFF: Madame Chair, this is
27 Jack Reakoff.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Sorry, Jack.
30 You're -- you've got the floor.

31

32 MR. REAKOFF: Thank you. I didn't --
33 I'm not in the room so I didn't see your nod.

34

35 When we had a meeting in March of 2019
36 in Fairbanks we had the representative from the YK
37 Delta Refuge at our meeting, Aaron Moses. And during
38 his briefing as you all get briefings, he was
39 discussing the high caribou harvest that had occurred
40 that winter and people were getting a lot of caribou.
41 When this issue came up this summer that the herd had
42 fallen by 50 percent I immediately reviewed my notes
43 regarding that high harvest. When I started analyzing
44 what and when we had our meeting at McGrath and the
45 Western Interior Council met in McGrath on October 9,
46 we had Aaron Moses on the phone, we had Alissa Rogers
47 was on the phone, we had the Alaska Department of Fish
48 and Game on the phone. And so the numbers that the
49 Alaska Department of Fish and Game was using reflected

50

1 a fairly low harvest, but that is not actually what's
2 occurring.

3
4 We have a high winter harvest with the
5 -- on the winter hunt and ONC from Bethel and some of
6 the -- even the biological division of OSM, some of
7 those harvests can be double what is actually being
8 reported on registration hunts and various ways to the
9 Department. So the Department of Fish and Game is
10 showing a fairly low harvest, but that's not actually
11 what's happening. I thought Alissa Rogers was going to
12 be on the call here this morning also, she has been
13 looking further into some of these numbers.

14
15 But there's -- they're hunting in
16 winter, they're chasing caribou in open country,
17 they're shooting into herds and there's wound loss rate
18 that's unaccounted for. And some of the figures could
19 be 800, 900 caribou harvested, but the wound loss rate
20 is an unknown number. The herd is healthy, the herd
21 reflects -- you can get Fish and Game sitting on the
22 phone, they're reflecting 92 percent pregnancy rates,
23 you got two year old cows producing calves. Caribou
24 only have one calf per year. The herd is a healthy
25 herd, but it's being overharvested heavily in the wintertime.

26
27 The Western Interior's position is the
28 minimum would be to align with the State season of
29 reducing to one the caribou bag limit of one caribou,
30 cow or bull, but we need to close the winter hunt now
31 because one more winter of high harvest on that herd
32 could push this herd to the point where it could be
33 down for decades. There's large brown bears that live
34 on their calving area, once the herd gets small those
35 bears eat those calves at a rate to where it takes
36 decades for them to recover from that.

37
38 So we feel, the Western Interior feels,
39 that this herd needs additional protection and that
40 their harvest data is extremely lacking with the
41 Department and I don't blame the Department if that's
42 what the harvest rates were, but if a moose herd fell
43 by 50 percent there'd be zero cow moose hunting period.
44 Well, these are caribou, they have less -- they don't
45 even have twins, moose have twins. So the reality is
46 this herd needs addition protection.

47
48 Thank you, Madame Chair.

49
50

1 MR. McKEE: Madame Chair.

2
3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Go
4 ahead.

5
6 MR. McKEE: In the myriad of things I
7 tried to cover on the special action process, the -- I
8 was reminded that I failed to mention one important
9 thing. And so if you're talking about having concerns
10 about a closure or whatever's going to happen, one
11 thing that I need to make clear is that no matter what
12 the Board acts on, no matter what the Board's final
13 decision, it's only good for this season. So any
14 action that they take is only going to be relevant
15 until the end of the season under Federal regulations
16 which is either March 15th or March 31st depending on
17 the unit you're talking about. So it would be only
18 good for this season.

19
20 In order for there to be another
21 reduction in the harvest limit or a closure on this
22 herd for next season, there would have to be another
23 special action request submitted for the next season.
24 And then if you wanted to have it closed permanently in
25 regulations we'd have to have a formal proposal that
26 would have to be submitted and that doesn't happen
27 until January of 2021. And the Board wouldn't act on
28 that until March of -- April of 2022. So you'd have to
29 have another special action after this to cover it
30 until the proposal would take affect.

31
32 So I just wanted to make that -- that's
33 very -- that's not an unimportant point. It would only
34 -- this temporary special action is only going to
35 affect this current season. And after that we'd have
36 to have another special action in order to take -- to
37 take action on anything beyond that.

38
39 Thank you, Madame Chair.

40
41 MR. ANDREW: Madame Chair.

42
43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dennis.

44
45 MR. ANDREW: Yeah. Good morning.
46 Thank you, Madame Chair and Board members. With the
47 caribou and stuff, you know, you mentioned closure and
48 stuff and bag limit down to one and then from the
49 hunter side, just the hunters, my concern is another

50

1 critter, wolves. You guys do any count how many wolves
2 are getting to these caribou or is there a pretty good
3 sized population around the caribou on the wolf side?
4

5 Thank you.
6

7 MR. McKEE: I'm not in a position to
8 answer that question. If somebody with Fish and Game
9 or with the Refuges can come up here and answer that
10 question, but I'm not in a position to be able to
11 answer that kind of -- that kind of question.
12

13 MS. WATINE: For the record this is
14 Lauren Watine with the Alaska Department of Fish and
15 Game. I'm the area biologist here.
16

17 Just to reiterate the question was do
18 we look at the wolf impacts on the caribou. So
19 currently we have a study going on looking at the
20 affects of wolf predation on our caribou calves. Part
21 of that has to do with our Wolf Control Program. So we
22 have wolves being removed in areas surrounding the
23 calving grounds and also within the calving grounds and
24 trying to see if that's impacting calf survival.
25

26 Depending on the level of harvest we do
27 -- of wolves, we do see that there are some potentially
28 positive impacts on caribou calf survival with wolf
29 removal, but it hasn't been consistent enough for us to
30 say one way or another if removing wolves is helping
31 this population or not.
32

33 And that's mostly having to do with
34 variable snow years. So wolf harvest is greatest when
35 we have good snow cover. Our pilots -- pilots can get
36 out and adequately track the wolves for harvest. But
37 when we haven't had those good snow years we don't see
38 as many wolves being harvested under the Wolf Control
39 Program. There are still people out there harvesting
40 wolves on their traplines, trapping in that manner, but
41 in terms of the Wolf Control Program we don't know that
42 it's having an enhanced affect of caribou calf
43 survival, if that helps answer your question.
44

45 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.
46

47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.
48

49 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
50

1 Chair. Lauren, I'm also curious to know, we've heard
2 from Jack that there's a very large harvest that's
3 being unaccounted for. What's the Department's take on
4 that?

5
6 MS. WATINE: That's a great question.
7 So the harvest we report is of course what is reported
8 to us. We do our best to reach out to the public and
9 emphasize the importance of them reporting on whether
10 they have hunted or not and what they've harvested or
11 not. At this point we don't have a reliable or very
12 good way to estimate unreported harvest, but that is
13 something that the Department is working on and looking
14 to, but it's a very challenging thing to assess.

15
16 MS. MORRIS LYON: Totally understand
17 that and I guess my question for you is we heard from
18 you yesterday that you have a very high confidence
19 level for the first time in many years on the size of
20 this caribou herd. And that those numbers are very
21 reliable numbers. So if the herd is healthy and there
22 does not seem to be substantial reason to believe that
23 predation is a large portion of why this herd has taken
24 such a huge decline, do you feel there's a pretty high
25 value placed in the probability that there is a very
26 large unreported harvest on the herd?

27
28 MS. WATINE: I think it is something
29 that should certainly be considered and we should have
30 in the front of our minds along with all the other
31 possible reasons why this herd could be declining.

32
33 MS. MORRIS LYON: Enlarge that, what
34 are some of the other possible reasons you are taking
35 into consideration?

36
37 MS. WATINE: So it could be something
38 with the age structure of the herd, that could be off
39 balance. There could be problems on the landscape,
40 there could be disease, there could be reduced forage
41 available. If you look back at the history of the
42 Mulchatna when we had over 200,000 animals on the
43 landscape, that has a pretty big impact on what is left
44 for caribou into the future. Just thinking about
45 lichen, it can take a hundred years or so for lichen to
46 return after being heavily grazed.

47
48 So I -- there's any number of things
49 that could be impacting this decline. It could be a
50

1 little bit of everything, but and one thing on its own
2 doesn't -- wouldn't have an impact on the herd. But
3 when taken together it could have a pretty -- it could
4 be having the impact we're seeing right now. But we
5 don't want to say one way or another because we don't
6 have the information to back it up.

7

8 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you.

9

10 MR. ANDREW: Madame Chair.

11

12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dennis.

13

14 MR. ANDREW: Thank you, Madame Chair.
15 Just interested in the Mulchatna herd and plus around
16 McGrath. Is some of these caribous coming back towards
17 us, is there any numbers that are returning to their
18 natural calving grounds and also is there any other
19 herds like from McGrath area and stuff coming down to
20 this -- down further down this way?

21

22 MS. WATINE: So the Mulchatna has held
23 pretty steady to its traditional calving grounds. We
24 haven't seen any change in where they're having calves
25 each year. In terms of movements of the caribou are we
26 seeing any changes. Time will tell. We do go out and
27 we listen for them and we track them down and we plot
28 where we're seeing these animals. But what animals
29 might do one year, it might be completely out of whack
30 from what they traditionally do. And they might do
31 that for a couple years and revert to a more -- more
32 traditionally what they are known to do.

33

34 So I don't have an answer for you on
35 that as of right now. But they are still using their
36 traditional calving grounds. That hasn't changed.

37

38 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

39

40 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank and then
43 Billy.

44

45 MR. WOODS: Yeah. Thank you for all
46 your work. And like Nanci said I value the confidence
47 that you have. I'm still not convinced that we did a
48 or I guess the State did a full confidence survey with
49 the reporting process because it's not that it's

50

1 against you or anything, but since you're new it would
2 have been nice that we -- when we had the luxury of
3 long term management and what long term means for me is
4 10 years.

5
6 In 2011 we implemented at a State level
7 the Intensive Management Plan for upper
8 Mulchatna/Nushagak -- the calving herd between here and
9 Koliganek. The area was only 3,000 miles so we
10 expanded that last year into 10,000 miles above the
11 Mulchatna in Dennis' I think part. We worked hard and
12 your boss and everybody else in the Department worked
13 hard at getting that intensive management strategy in
14 place. Because 50 CFR 135.25 says what. We have a
15 population that's in decline and then we have at that
16 time in 2009 when I started working for BBNA
17 Subsistence, Molly was my boss, in 2011 we implemented
18 this Intensive Management Plan. It was a long road.
19 If you understand what that looks like for the State,
20 you probably do, but we worked hard at getting that
21 plan in place. And we needed all the information from
22 the Caribou/Moose Enhancement Project, the biology
23 you're talking about, we don't have that in front of
24 us. We don't have the calf to cow ratio, we don't have
25 the predator to prey ratio, we don't have the bull to
26 cow ratio right now.

27
28 I'm just -- and OSM did a great job on
29 reacting, but on a big scale as a user you've got to
30 look one or two cycles. We kind of relaxed the hunting
31 requirements for -- on the State side from one caribou
32 in the fall up until January, we relaxed it to two the
33 whole year. So within one cycle you're asking a
34 subsistence user to totally cut off the supply that
35 feeds them in the wintertime. And you're right, the
36 highest harvests are in the winter because people can
37 get out and harvest.

38
39 So and the people on the phone are
40 talking about a different area.

41
42 And the State did a great job of
43 implementing the permit requirement. So if I file for
44 a caribou permit on State land and if I don't return
45 that I don't get to hunt next year. That's the key is
46 that we in this area worked hard and we still work hard
47 at working with all agencies, ADF&G and Togiak Refuge
48 staff, I know that they go out and do projects together
49 like wolf collaring and caribou and moose counts and
50

1 work hard at kind of coordinating services that make it
2 -- it's pretty common sense to work together.
3

4 On the other hand we don't have the
5 luxury on Federal lands to implement any sort of
6 intensive management. That means in a 30 mile radius
7 of Dillingham, to the west of us is thousands of miles
8 of Federal land that no Intensive Management Plan can
9 be implemented. When we're trying to protect the land
10 in a 30 mile radius there's seven established packs, I
11 can count them in my mind.
12

13 I travel a lot in the wintertime.
14 Nothing against the Federal system, we have a great
15 process here. On a administrative -- it's not the
16 purview of this Board to figure out how we do this or
17 the staff here. As a user and person that travels
18 pretty hard in feeding my family throughout what we're
19 talking about it's frustrating, it is totally
20 frustrating. And I have a hard time that I don't --
21 you know, in every area that we have from 2018 when we
22 relaxed the caribou or there's been a Board cycle or
23 two since we relaxed the caribou hunting restrictions
24 on users and now within two years, a year, two years,
25 we're cutting -- totally cutting it off. That kind of
26 is alarming.
27

28 And, you know, I'm in total favor of
29 conservation and you're right if we need to act on
30 something let's act responsibly. But I don't have the
31 science in front of me, if you could -- we've had years
32 and years of luxury of having all the information in
33 front of us. That means the calf mortality rate, the
34 cow to calf ratio, the age composition and those things
35 are huge for us to make decisions and recommend what
36 you're talking about.
37

38 So I'll stop there. I -- what's the
39 existing -- my question now I guess is what's the
40 existing regulation and the State stance right now?
41

42 MS. WATINE: Mr. Woods, one of the
43 things I wanted to emphasize is Fish and Game is not
44 advocating shutting down the season entirely. We just
45 wanted to reduce the bag limit from two caribou to one.
46 This is -- this recommendation does not come from Fish
47 and Game to shut down the hunt entirely. So I just
48 want you to know that this is not a Fish and Game
49 proposal that you are discussing. And I can entirely
50

1 appreciate your concerns. You've mentioned several
2 times I am new here and I am, but I already feel that I
3 am part of this community in that as Dan Dunaway had
4 said earlier people have shared their harvest with him
5 when he wasn't able to get anything. People have done
6 that with me as well. So I can appreciate your
7 position.

8
9 MR. WOODS: I'm not trying to
10 disrespect any of your work that you're doing, it's
11 well appreciated, I swear. And I'm trying to look at
12 the big picture. I've looked at everything because I
13 sit on the Nushagak Advisory on the State side looking
14 at regulations. And I'm new to this process, but not
15 new to the Federal system. And it's frustrating as a
16 user that we live in a dual management process. And
17 it's cumbersome for people.

18
19 So if this Board -- you know, and what
20 they're talking about on the phone is a different area.
21 I can't speak for the McGrath or YK Delta or anybody
22 else reporting. I know that this region in 17 that we
23 manage, we work hard at trying to get confidence in the
24 reporting process, we work hard at getting enforcement
25 on our side to help us to cooperate and agencies to
26 cooperate to get the users to report. That means if we
27 have an issue with enforcement either in management,
28 any sort of hiccup and burp in the whole system, that
29 we work hard at educating the public on helping and not
30 making that divide, that -- what I guess is what I'm
31 getting to that if you're having issues up in reporting
32 then the harvest limits, all that stuff has got to be
33 on the relationships that we share with our
34 communities. And that's huge. Because if we don't
35 gain the confidence of the people that we're trying to
36 serve and the State used to do well, I mean, Jim
37 Wellington used to go to villages and pass out moose
38 tags, Neil Barton -- what I'm saying is that our
39 relationship and confidence in people getting accurate
40 reporting is on us sitting in this room, including the
41 managers, including enforcement, including the biology,
42 including us Board members. Because it's all huge, we
43 need confidence in those reporting numbers.

44
45 And I applaud you. Thank you for
46 showing up. No disrespect to you being new here and
47 welcome. It's just -- you know, it's just we were --
48 had the luxury for years of having a pretty stable
49 management and a body that worked well together. Now
50

1 that we're in crisis, I'm not trying to point the
2 finger, please, but we're in crisis now, we're asked to
3 close down a whole hunting, cutting off a resource that
4 people depend on. And I'm looking at only for our area
5 and Bristol Bay and our region, I can't speak for
6 outside. But, you know, that's a big hit. And like
7 Dan says I take -- have a different take on that.

8
9 So I'll shut up and let you finish your
10 report, but I appreciate all the information. And if
11 there's anything that we can do to help please pass it
12 on.

13
14 Thanks.

15
16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I guess do you
17 have a comment and then Billy has a comment.

18
19 MR. McKEE: Yeah, I just want to make
20 it clear that the request that OSM has analyzed is only
21 the original request that the -- which was the request
22 to have the reduction in harvest limit from two to
23 caribou to one caribou. We didn't get a request and we
24 didn't analyze a request asking for a closure or
25 anything else. So we certainly would let the Board
26 know what their options might be in terms of
27 alternatives to what was requested, but we're -- OSM
28 was not analyzing a closure request, we were simply
29 analyzing the request as it came in from the YK and the
30 Togiak Refuges.

31
32 Now that being said, the Board is going
33 to use information in our analysis and all the public
34 comments from the hearings and the Chairs'
35 teleconference that we had and this letter that you see
36 in front of you, all that information is what the Board
37 is going to use during their deliberations and make
38 their final decision. And the Board can go beyond what
39 is originally requested. So the Board could very well
40 shut down the hunt immediately if they wanted to,
41 they're not limited to the actual request. So I -- and
42 I'm not going to try to divine how the Board is going
43 to act, it's just to let you know that they're going to
44 be using all the information, not just the analysis,
45 but the comments from the public and everything else
46 that I've already mentioned to make their decision.
47 And so the Board can go beyond what is requested in the
48 original request. But OSM itself is only analyzing the
49 request to have the reduction in harvest limit.

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Bill, did you
2 have a comment?

3
4 MR. TREFON: Yeah. This kind of caught
5 me by surprise about the closure from the
6 Interior's request here because I was actually in Dan's
7 mindset of supporting the one to two -- I mean, the two
8 to one because the numbers is a dramatic change in
9 numbers. And I don't -- and living in Nondalton in 9B,
10 it's already hard enough for us to even get caribou. I
11 mean, that used to be -- I grew up with that caribou
12 herd. And I watched it change and I watched them
13 change their calving grounds. It used to be -- well,
14 the calving grounds are the same, they're still between
15 Talakwana and Turquoise -- I mean, Twin Lakes.
16 Thousands of them calve there and I watched them calve,
17 I watched the bears chase them around, I watched the
18 wolves chase them around. But the thing is it's right
19 inside the Park, I mean, the Park could impose no
20 hunting there during that time of the season, calving
21 season. And for hunting, we can't hunt anyway because
22 a caribou herd is a moving, migrating animal, they
23 don't stay in one place overnight waiting for you to
24 come back. You might see them there and tomorrow they
25 might be 20 miles away.

26
27 But just watching the changes and the
28 numbers drop from the '70, '60, '70s, over 280,000 and
29 when -- I hate to bring Pebble into this, but 10, 12
30 years ago is when we started seeing the numbers
31 declining dramatically and their changing of their
32 routes. It used to be from down here, Igiugig area, to
33 Twin Lakes pretty regularly. That was their
34 traditional migration routes. If you look at the
35 trails there's ancient caribou ruts, I mean, there's
36 lines of it. And then after the -- Pebble came in all
37 the scientists are saying that the reindeer moss and
38 the lichen and their food depleted so they changed
39 their routes.

40
41 And I see the change -- and to say a
42 closure, I don't support that idea at all because of
43 the fact that we already struggle with the hunt with --
44 in 9B particular -- just 9B because for us we have to
45 travel almost 20 to 50 miles to get a caribou. And
46 that's every year. Back in the '80s it was half a
47 mile, right across the lake, there was always a herd on
48 the beach right across the lake. Not anymore.

50

1 And my question is about the wolves,
2 wolf pack. Do you have any idea how many packs are
3 following these caribous, are there any mega packs, are
4 any numbers or -- that's my question.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 MS. WATINE: That's a really great
9 question. So in terms of mega packs, we don't see mega
10 packs. For the most part we're seeing packs of about
11 six to eight animals in and around the calving grounds,
12 the traditional calving grounds. And maybe another
13 Fish and Game employee who's on the line can speak to
14 that in more detail. But as for the -- and especially
15 in terms of the number of packs. But we don't have
16 these big mega packs because there is such a great
17 amount of harvest of our wolf population in these
18 areas.

19
20 MR. TREFON: So there's really not a
21 major affect on the wolf predation, it's more human, is
22 that the study now?

23
24 MS. WATINE: Can you repeat that
25 question better?

26
27 MR. TREFON: Taking a caribou, I mean,
28 the wolves are really aggressive hunters, but it makes
29 it sounds like through this here it's lot of
30 mismanagement of killing, just literally killing,
31 outright killing caribou, chasing them down and it
32 sounds like it's people that's the problem. Maybe
33 certain areas should be limited instead of cutting
34 everybody off. Suggestion.

35
36 Thank you.

37
38 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

39
40 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard and
43 then Dan.

44
45 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, thank you.

46
47 MR. BORNE: Madame Chair, this is Ray
48 Borne at Yukon Delta Refuge. If I could speak for a
49 minute, please.

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We have.....

2

3 MR. WILSON: Go ahead.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I guess, yes.
6 We had Richard and then Dan, but they say that you can,
7 you know, have the floor right now.

8

9 MR. BORNE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
10 This is Ray Borne. I'm the acting Refuge manager at
11 Yukon Delta and one of the authors of the special
12 action request.

13

14 Reviewing it and talking with the
15 people, we actually started reaching out to the
16 villages. We contacted 13 of the 15 villages here
17 along the Kuskokwim River that are having an impact on
18 the herd. And every village that we talked to, we
19 talked to 13 of them, eight of those all agreed that
20 close -- going from two to one is a great idea. And
21 all of them also said they did not want a full closure,
22 but they were open to a closure maybe of a month or
23 month and a half or something like that to protect the
24 herd when they're most vulnerable and their fat
25 reserves are at the lowest.

26 So I think that's important that we
27 have an opportunity for people to harvest, but
28 everybody I've talked to has said, yes, they're
29 interested in going from two to one. We are
30 emphasizing with the villages here in unit 18 the need
31 to register and the need to report and additionally
32 this year we'll have a more robust presence of
33 patrolling out there during the caribou season. So I
34 think the -- we get a better sense of what the human
35 harvest is this coming year.

36

37 And that's -- that completes my
38 comments.

39

40 Thank you.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Well,
43 thanks.

44

45 And then we have Richard and then Dan.

46

47 MR. WILSON: Thank you, Madame Chair.
48 I just -- I'm trying to visualize what's happened here
49 and probably in the last 15 years say, you know, we --

50

1 the herd was huge, it was in our region here. Back up
2 in Lake Iliamna you had big herds crossing in the
3 wintertime, they'd go from the north side of the lake
4 over to the Big Mountain side on the east and we'd have
5 caribou over there and the herd was big. And in the
6 fall we had -- we had -- you were able to take five at
7 that time, you were able to take five caribou. And you
8 had people from all over the State that would come and
9 do fly-ins with their own planes, with -- they were
10 chartered in, they were guided in, they were just about
11 every way you could figure people were taking caribou
12 and not just one, but they were taking five. They
13 would land on anything that was possible and believe me
14 there's a lot of areas between the Swan Lake on the
15 edge of Iliamna Lake going north over to the Nushagak
16 Hills and, you know, there's a lot of areas where
17 people land in lakes and sand blows and things. So the
18 herd got picked on real heavily. And what were they
19 after, they were after the big bulls. And most of them
20 got the big bulls. And it was a few years down the
21 road and it was hard to find a big bull.

22
23 Well, the pressure was on and at that
24 time the caribou herd was up and now they started
25 declining. And with all the pressure going on the
26 caribou either ate themselves out or maybe, you know,
27 they had to move on because of all the pressure.
28 Whatever the case may be. But it -- so here we are,
29 the caribou moved out of our region basically, left a
30 little behind. Now they've moved where they are now.
31 Now those communities up there have had the same
32 opportunity of plenty. They've had -- you know, they --
33 it just -- we've -- you know, it's been on the news,
34 you know, people getting caught with -- you know, kids
35 out there shooting caribou for no reason at all and
36 just whatever. But there's -- so they got plenty. So
37 that region has had this benefit that we've had a while
38 back of plenty. And now the herd is dropping again.
39 And so here we are, over time we've gone from five
40 caribou, we're down to two now and now there's
41 something before us to go to one in a conservation
42 mode.

43
44 Well, you know, you got to do what you
45 got to do, but I -- I want to know I guess how many --
46 what's the percentage of take in that region now up
47 there compared to us here. I mean, that to me is
48 important. Like, you know, you have the majority of
49 the harvest I believe is up in that area now and not
50

1 here. I could be wrong, but the herd is shrinking.
2 And like Woodsy here was saying, you know, for us to
3 take the hit on -- you know, on total closure, you
4 know, we've gone -- you know, we're down to two and the
5 winter hunt really is the -- it's that time of year
6 when families need meat, you know, and it's tough on
7 them.

8
9 So I just -- I'm just trying to
10 remember all that's gone on since I've been around here
11 and visualizing this herd and where it's gone and now
12 the size as it is and we've got the North Peninsula
13 herd, you know, south of Naknek River on down that's --
14 that got so low and it was down for 15 years or at
15 least 12 before we could even hunt on that herd, now
16 it's coming back up again, it's taken a while. And I
17 believe that same thing happened there when there was
18 plenty all the big bulls were taken, all the good
19 breeders were taken and it hurt the herd. And you have
20 -- and they have a hard time coming back. And then you
21 get, you know, all the predators are there to help that
22 out. So it's an interesting thing we have to deal with
23 here.

24
25 Thank you.

26
27 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Dan.

28
29 MR. DUNAWAY: I think he.....

30
31 MR. MCKEE: I think Fish and Game will
32 have some current numbers, but I just wanted to give
33 you first some historical context. Since 2009 -- well,
34 harvest is not evenly distributed across the range of
35 the Mulchatna. And since 2009 54 percent of reported
36 harvest has occurred in unit 18. And 17 percent has
37 occurred in unit 17C. And that's among local users.

38
39 So I just wanted to -- you're talking about how
40 it's -- you know, harvests and what happens in one
41 unit, what's going on in McGrath might not be the same
42 as what's going on in your area. I just wanted to give
43 you some historical perspective about how it's -- we're
44 not talking about an even harvest across the range of
45 the herd. And that's historical, but I believe Fish
46 and Game might have some more recent numbers.

47
48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

1 MR. WILSON: Thanks, Chris. You know,
2 and it's -- this proposal's coming before us in a
3 different manner. You know, for a -- as for a
4 reduction it's coming out of, you know, the biological
5 side of things, but this one here is the human factor,
6 you know, it's not a biological factor. And it's -- so
7 it's -- yeah, we got some thinking here to do.

8
9 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan. Or did
10 you have a reply?

11
12 MR. McKEE: No.

13
14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Dan.

15
16 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
17 And thank you, Richard, for kind of helping with
18 broadening the historical perspective.

19
20 Yeah, this -- especially bringing up a
21 closure kind of -- I start feeling kind of set off here
22 and frustrated. But it's some other stuff that I
23 believe I've heard in other meetings is that Dennis'
24 neighbors and the Koliganek folks have been doing extra
25 duty on the wolf reduction, I think somewhere like 50
26 to 80 wolves a winter. And a lot of it's just on the
27 ground guys and none of the aerial stuff. I'm kind of
28 in awe of their ability and appreciate their efforts
29 because that helped some. And I also feel, you know,
30 looking at Richard and Nanci, the folks down in the
31 Naknek area have been really whacked with peninsula
32 conservation issues and then also, you know, doing
33 their part on not harvesting the Mulchatna.

34
35 So over -- I've got a whole list of
36 stuff here, I hope -- I'll try not to go too long, but
37 also the last few years I've been hearing how we're
38 trying to do our best, there's probably a few folks
39 that don't comply around here, but we hear rumors more
40 and more of Kuskokwim folks not reporting. And there
41 was changes, we went from just a harvest ticket to a
42 registration hunt to improve it. We've heard that
43 folks up there do like 100 percent reporting on moose
44 registration hunts and not very good at all on caribou.
45 I'm hoping some ONC and KANA people are listening, we
46 really need their help. They've also been burdened up
47 there with the failure of king runs and so if there's
48 caribou that's their alternative.

49
50

1 So I'm somewhat sympathetic, but I'm
2 also annoyed if that's the problem. I might list a
3 number of questions and then let folks answer, but so
4 my first question is if anybody from Orutsararmiut in
5 Bethel in listening because I thought I heard on one of
6 the other consultation there was somebody. And even
7 one of their reps I believe hinted that well, people
8 aren't doing a very good job of reporting. Well, I
9 would beg ONC and KANA to bear down on their folks.

10

11 Also if we went to some closure like
12 this given the attitude we seem to have up there, will
13 it make any difference, will people go hunt anyway.
14 And if they're really hurting for fish I have a little
15 sympathy that they might ignore it, just a tiny, tiny
16 bit of sympathy because I've been up in that country
17 and they're not -- often those folks aren't as
18 fortunate as we are around the bay.

19

20 But again that kind of gets back to if
21 we were to close Federal lands just how effective would
22 it be, would it make much of a difference.

23

24 And then I think I've kind of got an
25 answer to my next question that Lauren mentioned
26 earlier is like would the State -- if we went to a
27 closure would the State do a like action on State land
28 because there's a lot of country out there that these
29 animals run around on that would still be open.

30

31 And then it gets down to maybe some of
32 the problems are really insufficient enforcement. How
33 vigorous has enforcement been up there. Now State's
34 been whacking the budget away, but also at some times
35 in the past I've got a sense among some of the more
36 I'll say and try not to offend my Federal friends, but
37 there's been times where they seem to be reluctant to
38 clamp down, if people are doing illegal stuff clamp
39 down. If they aren't reporting then they don't get
40 harvest tickets the next year. Of course if they still
41 go hunting that's where the vigorous enforcement comes
42 in.

43

44 But because I'm kind of wound up on
45 this. I'm thinking of some of my friends over on the
46 south side of Lake Iliamna who eke a caribou out here
47 and there and it's very valued in those villages. And
48 those animals over there are kind of a part of the
49 herd, but not as much as say the folks or the animals

50

1 up say more in the interior. And I hate to see them
2 either closed off entirely or too severely restricted.
3 And I also feel like a lot of us over here been trying
4 to comply to do our share.

5
6 So that's kind of my rant. If you have
7 some -- especially like would we get compliance, would
8 we have any affect on taking these actions.

9
10 Thank you.

11
12 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

13
14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Bill.

15
16 MR. TREFON: I just got to do with the
17 take of the caribou up there in what's on the other
18 side of 17B, that seem like where the overtaking of
19 harvesting of caribou is in that particular area. Is
20 there any State land -- I mean, Federal lands up there,
21 right around the Bethel area?

22
23 MR. McKEE: The majority of unit 18 is
24 Federal land.

25
26 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

29
30 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
31 Chair. My question is for you, Lauren. Do you have
32 answers to any of those questions and, you know,
33 harvest numbers that you've collected through Fish and
34 Game and, you know, what the State's position might be
35 on that?

36
37 MS. WATINE: That's a great question,
38 Nanci. And I was waiting to see if anyone was going to
39 answer Dan's other questions before I got to answering,
40 but I'm happy to go first.

41
42 So the State right now is not in a
43 position where it would match a Federal closure. Again
44 we wanted to reduce the limit from two caribou to one
45 because we just had a single estimate, a single point
46 in time, one -- really one data point that is certainly
47 concerning, but we wanted to gather more information to
48 try and understand is this a true trend that we're
49 observing. And do we have any other more solid
50

1 information to target where that decline is occurring.

2

3 So we -- I was -- I have this data --
4 this information that you guys were mentioning earlier
5 that isn't in front of you and I was going to present
6 that in my report later today, but I'm happy to go over
7 it now and I think now is the time certainly to do
8 that.

9

10 So we conducted our fall composition
11 survey just a couple weeks ago and we got our calf to
12 cow and our bull/cow ratios. So for 2019 we counted a
13 total of 3,496 caribou. When we go ahead and conduct
14 this survey our goal is to -- we call it comp the herd,
15 right, so we're trying to get this composition
16 information. When we go to comp a herd we try to get
17 at least 10 to 15 percent of the herd. If the herd is
18 at 13,500 animals we wanted to count at least 3,000 and
19 we got more than that. So that was encouraging and
20 that helped to solidify our confidence in the
21 composition we did obtain. So of the 3,496 caribou our
22 ratios are calves per 100 cows and bulls per 100 cows.
23 So we had a total of 24.6 calves to cows and 41.7 bulls
24 to cows. And this is without breaking it down by the
25 eastern and the western herd just yet. And what I want
26 to say about these figures right now is our calf/cow
27 ratio is down from last year, but our bull/cow ratio
28 has increased.

29

30 Now breaking it down by east and west,
31 in the eastern section of the herd we counted a total
32 of 1,851 animals and that calf/cow ratio in the eastern
33 herd was 31 calves per 100 cows. So that's a little
34 bit down from last year, but it's still above
35 objective. We want 30 calves per 100 cows. Our
36 western ratios for calves to cows was 18.2 per 100
37 cows. That's concerning. That is down from previous
38 years as well. So last year that calf/cow ratio in the
39 west was 29 per 100 cows. Our bull/cow ratio for the
40 eastern herd is 42.1 per 100 cows and the west isn't
41 too terribly different, it's 41.3 per 100 cows. That's
42 increased from last year. In 2018 the eastern bull/cow
43 ratio was 33 per 100 and the west was 32 per 100.

44

45 MR. MIKE: I want to remind the folks
46 online please mute your phone, we're picking up some
47 background noise.

48

49 Thank you.

50

1 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

4

5 MS. MORRIS LYON: I have to ask, that
6 is a severe difference in the cow/calf ratio. Any
7 analysis or educated guesses on to why there's such a
8 large difference from the east to west on those -- that
9 ratio in particular?

10

11 MS. WATINE: So earlier I had said
12 something about it could be -- the decline in the herd
13 could have something to do with a change in the age
14 structure of the herd. And if you have less productive
15 breeding cows that could certainly -- that would affect
16 it. So most of our cows are breeding by the time
17 they're three years old. If somewhere in that age
18 structure the animals that are three to eight or older,
19 if somewhere in there we've lost some of those cows,
20 we've lost our breeders, our producers for the
21 population. And so that could be a reason to see less
22 calves on the landscape. You're seeing a more dramatic
23 difference in the western calf ratio than the east.
24 The east has also declined, but the west has declined
25 more appreciably. So that tells us that there is
26 something happening in the west that's most likely
27 driving most of the decline in this herd.

28

29 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

30

31 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I've got Billy
34 and then Dan.

35

36 MR. TREFON: Yeah, this has got to do
37 with -- I probably missed the numbers on the take, the
38 birth rate in the Mulchatna area, but that's -- that
39 pretty much sums up the east and the west. Being that
40 their calving grounds are within the Park and Park
41 Preserve and on the west side it's more access for
42 public and there's a lot of communities out there,
43 would that be a difference in the take because you got
44 more communities on the west side and literally none on
45 the east side taking of caribou during the calving
46 season?

47

48 MS. WATINE: So I also just want to
49 bring a little bit of the caribou behavior into this

50

1 conversation. So we talk about the eastern and the
2 western animals, but all of the -- whether they're
3 eastern or western they all come to essentially the
4 same calving ground to have their calves. So but then
5 after that they kind of go off on -- back to their
6 separate areas that they like to be in. So you have
7 your animals that are in the western area of the range
8 coming over and intermingling with the east and then
9 they go back. And so those animals that are going back
10 might be harvested to a greater degree than the animals
11 on the eastern side.

12
13 And again as you pointed out there are
14 more and some larger communities on the western part of
15 the Mulchatna caribou herd's range. And so just
16 because there's more people you have a greater amount
17 of harvest out there. And our numbers do reflect that
18 a good amount of our harvest comes from unit 18. Now
19 seasonally it changes where these animals are being
20 most heavily harvested. So right now in the fall it
21 seems like quite a few caribou are being harvested in
22 unit 17, but that's also because that's where the
23 caribou are right now. As the season changes they're
24 going to move and do their usual migratory pattern.
25 And so it seems in the winters they've been spending a
26 lot more time in the western section of their range,
27 closer to some of those communities. And that might be
28 making them more vulnerable to harvest.

29
30 If that answers your question or part
31 of it.

32
33 MR. TREFON: Yeah. It pretty much
34 clarifies that it -- it sounds like it's human intake
35 on the -- destroying our herd.

36
37 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Dan.

38
39 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
40 And -- thank you. You know, I'm -- you know, Billy,
41 when I especially see this cow/calf ratio I'm not
42 certain it's showing the human harvest as the main
43 culprit. That drop in cow/calf ratio makes me start
44 wondering if you would be able to look at condition of
45 the cows, could the cows that are hanging out in the
46 west, are they going into the calving season in poor
47 condition or something which could be related if
48 they're getting chased or something. But maybe there's
49 -- these horrible winters, is there, you know, problems

50

1 with them getting food or if they're shivering
2 themselves dry all the time from rain instead of
3 staying, you know, warmer from just being dry. I
4 wonder if things like that could hurt them. Because
5 the bull/cow -- you know, if that was heavy harvest I
6 would think we might see a bigger shift in the bull/cow
7 ratio.

8
9 But maybe I'm -- you know, I'm a fish
10 biologist. I don't know. But anyway I'd just throw
11 that out and see if you got responses. And it looks
12 like we have a Togiak guy here who might want to say
13 something. So anyway I'm interested in hearing.

14
15 Thank you very much.

16
17 MS. WATINE: So, Dan, something I want
18 to emphasize too is those ratios I just gave you are in
19 the fall. So those aren't the calves that are being
20 born each year, that's just what survived the summer.

21
22 So in terms of what we call the
23 pregnancy rate or the parturition rate of the
24 Mulchatna, we do have information on our breeding cows
25 here and if you bear with me it's in a historical chart
26 and I just want to make sure I'm giving you the best
27 information right now. So in spring, 2019, 23 percent
28 of our two year old cows were pregnant or observed to
29 have a calf at heel. 92 percent of our three year olds
30 were observed to have been pregnant or with a calf at
31 heel. 73 percent of our four year olds and then 72
32 percent of our five year olds. So we have pretty good
33 parturition rates, pretty good pregnancy rates. Our
34 cows are in fairly good condition. And the fact that
35 we had two and three year olds breeding and a pretty
36 good number of our three year olds breeding, is
37 encouraging. So our animals are in good condition.

38
39 Do we see animals expressing signs of
40 disease, of course, just like in people populations, a
41 few of us are going to have some illnesses. But the
42 vast majority of the animals we observed this past
43 spring were quite healthy and that was reflected in
44 their pregnancy rates.

45
46 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

47
48 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

49
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I think we
2 have Dan and then Richard.

3
4 MR. DUNAWAY: Thanks, Molly, for
5 letting me follow-up. So then -- okay, I was thinking
6 pregnancy not -- but then for some reason the cows
7 aren't -- in the western aren't doing as well to bring
8 their calves -- get them to falltime as -- and so what
9 would that indicate, is that predation issue possibly
10 or still again if the calf condition isn't as food for
11 whatever reason.

12
13 But I see -- I'm interested.....

14
15 MS. WATINE: So we just went ahead and
16 collected our calf collars this -- in I guess the
17 beginning of October. We're still looking at that
18 information from the calves that did not survive the
19 spring through the fall. So I don't have an answer for
20 that right now. But, I mean, it could be predation, it
21 could be that something has happened to the mothers and
22 so the calves can't survive without a mother. It could
23 be the calves have some sort of disease, maybe there's
24 something on the west that's making them susceptible to
25 death. I mean, we don't -- we don't have that
26 information right now, but we have some information
27 that we're looking into at the moment after having
28 collected these collars.

29
30 I can tell you we did pick up a calf
31 that we had heard it alive three days before and then
32 it went into mortality mode. And it was actually on
33 the side of a really beautiful spot, I told my co-
34 workers it wouldn't be a bad place to go, there's a
35 nice lake. But it looked like it had been predated on
36 by a bear, possibly a sow with some cubs based on the
37 kill pattern and the feeding behavior.

38
39 MR. ANDREW: Madame Chair.

40
41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

42
43 We have Richard and then Dennis.

44
45 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, thank you.
46 So now I guess I'm curious as to on your harvest
47 reporting if they're reporting a lot of females in
48 their harvests and not a lot of males. You're talking
49 about, you know, the reduction in calf stuff here and
50

1 generally and you guys can correct me if I'm wrong, but
2 usually females in the winter are more accessible than
3 the bulls. Usually the bulls are up higher in the
4 hills and separate from the cows. And so the
5 communities with these poor winters and things that,
6 you know, they got snow, they can't get way out there,
7 but they're getting out there far enough to get some
8 caribou and generally the caribou that are accessible
9 are the smaller females and those that come into the
10 low lands.

11
12 Is that -- am I off base or -- and I'd
13 like to know if the take there is more female or what
14 that ratio might be, please.

15
16 MS. WATINE: So I can tell you so far
17 at least for 2019 we've had 28 females and 47 males
18 harvested. As for those ratios you've requested I need
19 to go through our data set a little bit more in order
20 to have an answer for you. But that answer does exist
21 somewhere.

22
23 MR. WILSON: But that's just a
24 reflection off of our fall hunt, that's not the
25 reflection on the winter one.

26
27 Thank you.

28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dennis and
30 then.....

31
32 MR. ANDREW: Thank you, Madame Chair.
33 Just on listening to you on the calving, the
34 percentages and stuff, is there -- do you guys see
35 anything on the hoof disease on these critters?

36
37 MR. MOOS: Through the Chair. Again my
38 name is Kenton Moos, I'm the acting Refuge manager for
39 Togiak National Wildlife Refuge. I'm a little bit new
40 to the area, arrived here in April, but I'm glad to be
41 here.

42
43 I'm going to ask Andy Aderman to come
44 up and address the hoof disease, but before he does I
45 just really -- just to back up a little bit, Dan had
46 asked about as far as -- you know, if we reduced the
47 bag limits from two to one and/or potentially shut it
48 down will it have an affect. Obviously if we -- if it
49 was to be shut down it should decrease the harvest.

50

1 Should.

2

3 One of the things that we
4 have
5 discussed with -- I've discussed with our leadership as
6 well as Yukon Delta to the north, is we are going to
7 put forth a concerted effort for education, but also
8 law enforcement for this. Either way, whatever
9 happens. We recognize that law enforcement has --
10 well, we don't have a law enforcement officer up in --
11 at Yukon Delta right now. We have one here, we have
12 committed him to go north and work as well as in this
13 area as well. And so we will be putting forth an
14 effort and I'm guessing we may ask for additional
15 resources for this because this is a conservation
16 concern.

17 So with that said I'm going to ask Andy
18 to address the hoof rot.

19

20 MR. ADERMAN: Andy Aderman, Togiak
21 National Wildlife Refuge. You want me to address
22 disease with -- in regards to Mulchatna caribou.

23

24 So what I know, there's several things
25 that caribou can get. Member Andrew, yesterday you
26 talked about hoof rot. Back in the late '90s, I think
27 it was '98, there was a severe or a real prevalent
28 outbreak of hoof rot in the Mulchatna caribou herd.
29 This is a bacterial disease, it's a bacteria that is
30 common in the soil. It's also common in the rumen or
31 the stomachs of caribou where it doesn't really show
32 itself. What they believe is when you get an
33 abnormally wet summer and fall, caribou I guess maybe
34 the skin or whatever gets some cuts or lesions in it
35 and that bacteria gets in there and the foot swells and
36 it can swell almost three times its normal size. And
37 you'll see limping caribou.

38

39 Does it kill them, probably not just
40 from the disease. But what it does do is it makes them
41 more prone to predation, you know, by bears or wolves
42 or whatever. It did seem to have an affect on the
43 number of calves the following spring. So in '99 there
44 was a severe drop in the number of calves being born if
45 I remember correctly. And I believe there was a few
46 animals seen probably just prior to '98 and after '98
47 that had -- showed signs of hoof rot.

48

50

2

49

Other diseases, parasitic influenza,

50

1 type three. It's a respiratory disease. Again it's
2 usually not -- it's not fatal, but it can just weaken --
3 I mean, it's like us having a bad cold, we're just not
4 ourselves, may predispose caribou to again predation or
5 other things might -- it might start to cascade.

6
7 There's been some reports again back in
8 the late '90s I think of lungworm. I don't know a real
9 lot about it.

10
11 Brucellosis is another disease that I
12 believe is more fatal, but I'm not aware that it's been
13 documented in the Mulchatna herd.

14
15 MS. WATINE: It has.

16
17 MR. ADERMAN: It has.

18
19 MS. WATINE: Yeah.

20
21 MR. ADERMAN: Okay. I'm -- that's all
22 I really know.

23
24 MS. WATINE: So during our fall
25 composition survey we saw at least three animals on the
26 landscape with brucellosis. And you can tell because
27 their joints get very swollen. And it's very obvious
28 once they've started presenting if they have
29 brucellosis. So we saw about three cows in both the
30 east and the west with these symptoms. And there might
31 have even been a large bull that died from brucellosis,
32 but we didn't investigate too carefully because we
33 weren't prepared to handle an animal that might have
34 that disease at that time.

35
36 So it is prevalent or it is in the
37 herd, but how common it is or if it's affecting the
38 herd is not known at this time.

39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I think
41 Nanci?

42
43 MS. MORRIS LYON: No.

44
45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

46
47 MS. MORRIS LYON: Chris has something.

48
49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Chris.

50

1 MR. McKEE: So I just kind of want to
2 go -- come back full circle to what I started with at
3 the beginning of it and I just want to make sure that
4 we capture any comments or thoughts that you want to
5 make sure that we get to the Federal Subsistence Board
6 for their -- during their teleconference. I've heard a
7 lot of discussion from the Council, but I just want to
8 make sure. And obviously you all can feel free to call
9 into that teleconference as well, but if there's
10 anything specifically that you would like us to note
11 for the Board to know, I'd just kind of like to bring
12 it back to that so I can make sure we capture that
13 information.

14
15 Madame Chair.

16
17 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

18
19 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

20
21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci and
22 Frank.

23
24 MS. MORRIS LYON: So I just have one
25 more quick question for you, Lauren. It was totally
26 weird that brucellosis came up because that was my
27 senior thesis. So I was like it's still alive and
28 well.

29
30 But you have not observed specifically
31 a lot of health issues in either the east or the west
32 herd, that is not -- I mean, from what I've heard you
33 tell us this morning, it does not seem to be the
34 prevalent reason why we're losing numbers, correct? I
35 just want to make sure I hear that right.

36
37 MS. WATINE: Correct.

38
39 MS. MORRIS LYON: Okay.

40
41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

42
43 Frank.

44
45 MR. WOODS: I appreciate the science
46 behind it now that I can wrap my head around what's
47 happening to decline this huge, in your work and the
48 OSM Department. I'd like to pass on to the full Board
49 and when they convene that harvest record. If I look
50

1 at page 26 under reported harvest for Mulchatna caribou
2 herd from 2000 to 2018, the harvest declined almost to
3 nothing in the last couple years. We have 219 in 2009
4 reported, it's probably lower this year since there's --
5 we have warming winters and there's no snow
6 conditions, I don't know if very many people went up
7 across here and I see the harvest in -- mostly in 17
8 and 17C. 17B is -- reported 60 and then unit 17C is 39
9 and zero from east -- it would be west of us in 17A
10 because there's -- basically travel conditions are
11 really a big factor.

12
13 And I don't think -- I mean, I don't
14 think I -- it warrants a full closure. Number 1, the
15 harvest -- if you look at the harvest numbers, that why
16 I mentioned them yesterday, because those harvest
17 numbers are almost minuscule. For the whole unit in
18 2018 was 219 animals out of a reported 27,000 that the
19 last survey count. And stop and think about that.
20 That human harvest are only 219 total. And I can say
21 in confidence that this office in '17 that those are
22 actual numbers because most people will comply in order
23 to keep hunting in our area.

24
25 So if you could pass that on and
26 capture that information that would be great.

27
28 Thank you.

29
30 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

31
32 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

33
34 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. We have
35 Dan and then Billy.

36
37 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
38 Especially for unit 17 and 9 I'm reluctant to see a
39 full closure. I was -- really appreciated Mr. Moos
40 discussion on increased education and enforcement. I
41 think that -- especially if we suspect poor reporting
42 that needs to be really vigorous. And I don't see a
43 State enforcement person here and I don't know if they
44 have one in Aniak anymore or not, but I would hope the
45 State could coordinate. And similarly and the same
46 with issuing any sort of permits, if folks aren't
47 reporting then pay the consequences. I got nasty
48 letters a couple years ago when I forgot I had two
49 cards instead of one because of the change. But I got
50

1 it squared away.

2

3 So I'm kind of reluctant to see full
4 closure. I'm also really alarmed on this brucellosis
5 thing. You know, I've heard in the news where
6 brucellosis is a big worry of the bison coming out of
7 Yellowstone and going into ranch country. And it's --
8 the ranchers are always pretty worried about it. And I
9 wonder if that might be one of the issues with poor
10 calves or something.

11

12 Thank you.

13

14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Now
15 we're I guess talking about harvests. And I know that
16 there's a Caribou Committee, I don't know how active
17 that Committee's been and I don't know if Andy has any
18 information on, you know, your latest meeting or what
19 the harvests would be for this area. To my knowledge I
20 think the harvest for this area has been pretty -- you
21 know, pretty accurate. People have made an effort to,
22 you know, report their harvests. So I was kind of
23 dismayed to hear nonreporting. And hopefully that's
24 not from this area.

25

26 I see Andy on the -- you know, at the
27 door. I just need to know if, you know, your Caribou
28 Committee met and what the -- you know, what the -- you
29 know, how accurate or how often does the harvests, you
30 know, of caribou would be from -- you know, from this
31 area. Since we're -- you know, we've been talking
32 about accurate harvests. And I just have a passion for
33 this area and knowing that in the past we've built up
34 confidence enough to have people, you know, report
35 their harvests on a regular basis.

36

37 So if you can kind of update us on your
38 Caribou Committee and if you're still active.

39

40 MR. ADERMAN: Andy Aderman again. Yes,
41 so the Nushagak Caribou Planning Committee met just
42 last Friday I believe and there was eight of the 11
43 representatives there. We discussed the -- what we
44 know about the herd. The population really didn't
45 change from the previous year. The minimum count was
46 one more than last year. The estimate was a little bit
47 higher, but -- than the -- than 2018, but essentially
48 the same. So we had a minimum of 710 caribou that we
49 counted when we did the photo census. The estimate --

50

1 boy, I'm trying to think what the -- what it was. But
2 it was -- 710 was the minimum. The point estimate was
3 I think just like 864. I can get that for you.

4
5 But anyway so we talked about, you
6 know, what we want to do as far as harvest and that and
7 I can present that now or in my other agency report. I
8 guess I'll go for it now.

9
10 But we're concerned with that number,
11 it's still fairly high we think for the herd. And what
12 we've been seeing with our lichen cover surveys down
13 there is lichen's been continually declining, it's
14 actually -- it appears to be declining at an
15 accelerating rate such that in the next 10 years it may
16 be down to a level where caribou may decide to leave.
17 And whether they do that or stay or leave and -- for
18 part of the year and come back, we don't know. But
19 we're -- we'd like to see a lower level and we think
20 about 400 for that herd right now would be better than
21 the 750 that we thought earlier.

22
23 That's something that that Committee I
24 guess approved, that level and so taking the mid point
25 or between the minimum count and the point estimate I
26 believe puts us 366 caribou over that 400 level.

27
28 So we went into the season with the way
29 we ran it last year, people could harvest two caribou.
30 We wanted to take about 150, we had 14 reported
31 harvested. Twelve of those were in the Federal hunt
32 and then the RC501 hunt immediately north of the
33 Federal hunt, there was two.

34
35 So one of the things that the Committee
36 also agreed with is to up the harvest limit, not
37 immediately, but probably starting the beginning of the
38 new year it'll likely be five caribou per hunter.
39 We'll see how that goes.

40
41 As far as reporting I think it's gotten
42 better. I'm still a little frustrated in these sort of
43 non-winters, there's lots of people that get permits,
44 most of them did not hunt. I mean, it's pretty obvious
45 that people couldn't get down there very easily. Their
46 -- I think out of that 14 three were taken in the
47 winter hunt, I think one in February and two in March
48 by airplane based hunters.

49
50

1 But I think the people that get the
2 permits when they harvest they're pretty good, they're
3 not always timely. There is a five day -- report
4 within five days if you're successful. I think a lot
5 of times the people that don't hunt, they just kind of
6 forget about it. But when you sign your name on that
7 permit you're agreeing that you're going to report even
8 if you didn't hunt.

9
10 So hopefully that answers your
11 questions.

12
13 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Andy, does
14 this Committee, does it mainly deal with 17A or is it
15 overall?

16
17 MR. ADERMAN: It really just deals with
18 Nushagak Peninsula caribou herd which most of the
19 peninsula is 17C. The western edge is 17A.

20
21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thanks,
22 Andy.

23
24 Dennis, did you have a

25
26 MR. ANDREW: No.

27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

29
30 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

31
32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Billy.

33
34 MR. TREFON: Yeah, you might be able to
35 answer this because I did -- something about the math
36 here. You were mentioning three years ago in 2016
37 there was some like 27,000 caribou in the herd and this
38 year's count is like 13,440. So we're losing like
39 3,200 caribou every year and it sounds like the hunt
40 don't even come close to those numbers, the number of
41 hunt and takes reported.

42
43 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

44
45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

46
47 I think we need to kind of start
48 winding down on this topic here, we've dealt with it
49 for a while.

50

1 We have Frank and then we have one blue
2 card here that maybe we can deal with before.

3
4 Frank.

5
6 MR. WOODS: Just a quick comment.
7 Thanks, Andy, that separating the proposal before us is
8 just for the Mulchatna caribou herd north and then the
9 Nushagak Peninsula's separate and then the ADF&G has
10 theirs. See I like -- thank you for the information
11 because that separates it. For me as a Board member I
12 can now have the science behind what we're talking
13 about, the proposal before us and then how it --
14 agencies and the Togiak Refuge actually contributes.

15
16 Thanks.

17
18 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

21
22 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you. Another
23 thought. I'm really liking to hear the more
24 enforcement, more education.

25
26 And when I spent a couple summers more
27 on the Aniak and the Kuskokwim back then ONC out of
28 Bethel had a pretty darn good natural resources group,
29 they were a real pleasure to work with. KANA, the same
30 way. I didn't really have occasion to work with AVCP
31 so much, but I think they would be critical in getting
32 the education part. I think they could possibly -- you
33 know, if we could engage those folks in convincing
34 hunters to report what they're catching would be really
35 good.

36
37 So I appreciate Kenton here and is his
38 name Ray, I don't know him, there in Bethel for sitting
39 in on this.

40
41 Hopefully we can have better success.

42
43 Thank you.

44
45 MS. WATINE: Madame Chair, can I say
46 something about reported harvest here on the Mulchatna?

47
48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Sure.

49
50

1 MS. WATINE: So since the registration
2 hunt has been instated and we have this failure to
3 report list, hunters that receive permits have been
4 fairly good about reporting their harvest. So, I mean,
5 they're -- like Andy said if people don't hunt
6 sometimes they forget, but once a hunter has found
7 himself or herself on the failed to report list, they
8 don't want to be there again. So they've gotten much
9 better about reporting. So I would say the vast
10 majority of our local subsistence hunters are reporting
11 on their tags.

12
13 Thank you.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I think
16 to move this along, I think we've had plenty of
17 discussion on this, we can go through this procedure
18 for proposals?

19
20 No -- okay. Do you have.....

21
22 MR. McKEE: I just want to emphasize
23 again we're not -- we're not asking for a
24 recommendation so this is not an action item, we're not
25 asking you for a vote so you don't have to go through
26 that process. Just looking for comments.

27
28 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

31
32 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. Yeah, one
33 final thought there, Chris. As we get into this and
34 you get to the Board, you know, back in the day when
35 registration hunt for moose was talked about, going
36 from just a permit system into the registration part,
37 you know, it kind of lit everybody on fire saying, you
38 know, why do we got to register, you know, why is this
39 not working. And so the State goes, well, you know,
40 we're not getting enough reporting going on. So we as
41 a community had this working group, we got it together
42 and we decided to go -- to agree to go to a registered
43 hunt with the exception that everybody, including the
44 Departments, would do their best to get the public
45 involved in knowing what the rules are.

46
47 And they -- back then they committed
48 themselves to go into these communities and to hold --
49 whether it be classes or sending information in or

50

1 flyers and I just want to encourage those entities to
2 still continue that because you still have -- you know,
3 you got hunters that -- new hunters, you know, and just
4 -- it's always good to see a flyer sitting on the
5 bulletin board there as you go into the post office or
6 something, any kind of reminder that it really does
7 help for that reporting. And we agreed on that to go
8 to a registered hunt even though it was more cumbersome
9 for the people, but in lieu of getting more information
10 out there so that the biologists, everybody can do
11 their job better so that we could do our job better.

12

13 Thank you.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

16

17 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

18

19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

20

21 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
22 Chair. And I also think that there's a lot of
23 validity, we've had a lot of comments for you to share
24 I'm sure, Chris, I don't even know if your fingers
25 could have captured them all. But, you know, I think
26 there's encouragement for me anyway to hear that this
27 herd is healthy, that the cow/calf ratios are
28 improving, albeit slowly. The bull/cow ratios have
29 definitely improved and I hope that things continue to
30 work in that way.

31

32 It sounds to me like we really need to
33 concentrate on pinpointing better where our loss is
34 coming from. I understand that it's from a bunch of
35 different areas, but when it's that severe there's got
36 to be one bad hair on the head. And I think we do need
37 to find it. I think we are narrowing it down between
38 the east and the west. I know that you'll continue to
39 do this.

40

41 But like the rest of -- what I'm
42 hearing from our group, I feel like a drastic full
43 closure is not going to be the answer for us. We have
44 a need to have access to caribou over here. We are not
45 heavy users nor abusers. The numbers are reflecting
46 that so I have a high confidence level in saying that.
47 And I appreciate the Department's readiness and
48 willingness to actually come forward with a special
49 action in order to address the issue so that it doesn't

50

1 spiral out of control. However I also am not willing
2 to take extreme actions when I don't see that they're
3 fully warranted yet.

4
5 Thank you.

6
7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I think
8 at this time if it is proper I want to hear from one
9 tribal or non-consensus item comments from Gayla.

10
11 So if we can have Gayla come up to the
12 table.

13
14 MS. HOSETH: Thank you, Madame Chair.
15 For the record Gayla Hoeseth, director of natural
16 resources for Bristol Bay Native Association.

17
18 When we participated in this special
19 action request teleconference that occurred one thing
20 that was noted that we are concerned about is the time
21 of year that the survey was conducted because it was at
22 the hottest time of the year. And some of the reports
23 that we have received that the caribou possibly weren't
24 congregated as they normally are when these counts are
25 done. So that is a big concern for us that we -- as we
26 are having these population counts that are done and
27 for us Federally-qualified users who harvest these
28 animals are always at the point where we're the point --
29 we're the people that are always being reduced of
30 harvest or we're the ones that are always paying the
31 consequences price and we don't really know what the
32 population is.

33
34 So I think that another survey needs to
35 be done at a more time of year when the caribou are
36 congregated because for it to be reduced in half in the
37 last two years is very concerning. And were -- was
38 there any reporting of any carcasses anywhere, where
39 are all these animals if there was a die-off of 15,000
40 or more caribou.

41
42 We also did a -- for the -- there was a
43 -- it was funded by the Western Alaska Land
44 Conservation, I forgot what the other C stands for,
45 group that ADF&G, BBNA, and National Park Service did a
46 study for the local traditional ecological knowledge of
47 Mulchatna caribou herd ethnology project which was a
48 documented project of over 55 years of the herd. And
49 that is a good reference tool document. And when we

50

1 were doing these interviews with local traditional
2 users the reports about the caribou are finally coming
3 back to the area. And where they were traditionally
4 having their calving grounds, they weren't going there
5 before from the local users and now they're returning
6 back to like the Kemuk Mountains and Koliganek area and
7 they were starting to see this back. And then just
8 briefly looking at the notes from last meeting, it was
9 noted that people are also seeing an increase of
10 caribou.

11
12 I guess one of the things that could
13 possibly be discussed here and instead of -- you know,
14 there's a reduction from two caribou to one caribou,
15 that this is for Federally-qualified users. That this
16 isn't open to all statewide users and we go to the
17 Federally-qualified user on Federal lands. Because how
18 it is right now with the State permit, anybody
19 statewide could come and hunt these caribou on our
20 Federal lands with this permit. So we should have it
21 be for Federally-qualified users. And if -- and I
22 think another survey needs to be done. But if we're
23 going to walk down anything then we need to have it for
24 our user population first.

25
26 At that Nushagak Peninsula caribou
27 meeting that Andy referenced is we discussed forming a
28 Mulchatna Caribou Committee. One of the things I want
29 to personally work on at BBNA is that we actually form
30 co-management of these resources because we are the
31 people of the land and we are the ones who are the
32 caretakers of the land and we also have very good
33 traditional knowledge people that are the observers and
34 our own scientists on the ground.

35
36 Also I'll just mention it for
37 consideration or to talk about, but with that Mulchatna
38 caribou herd since that was also a topic of discussion,
39 instead of having 380 caribou harvested to have a
40 population threshold of 400, that's going to have a
41 reduced bag limit for residents that is also open
42 statewide which we need to have -- wait for another two
43 year cycle to go back to how it was for the seven
44 villages. But possibly relocating some of those
45 Nushagak Peninsula caribou to another area with the
46 decline of the Mulchatna herd. And then also with --
47 because that grew. And so why are we going to go and
48 harvest 380 more caribou on that peninsula because the
49 lichen is going down and that they might not have
50

1 enough food resource.

2

3 So these are just some options and some
4 things that we're talking about, but I think the main
5 thing here is that if there is a take away from this
6 RAC meeting is that we close it to -- for only
7 Federally-qualified users on Federal lands.

8

9 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
10 comments.

11

12 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

13

14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

15

16 MR. DUNAWAY: Just a quick explanation,
17 Gail. I was laughing with Richard because earlier on
18 he says well, give us some of the animals back.....

19

20 (Laughter)

21

22 MR. DUNAWAY:because they came
23 from over his way originally.

24

25 Thank you.

26

27 MR. McKEE: And just again to
28 reiterate, I really, really encourage anybody that's
29 interested in -- on this Council or anybody else in the
30 public to call in to that Federal Subsistence Board
31 teleconference meeting. The news release like I said
32 are on the table. That is going to be open for people
33 to comment if the Chair allows it and, you know, you'll
34 hear this information. And I just really want to
35 encourage people to participate in the process. So
36 please if you're interested please feel free to call in
37 for that meeting.

38

39 Thank you.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: What's the
42 dates?

43

44 MS. MORRIS LYON: November.....

45

46 MR. McKEE: It's November 5th.

47

48 MS. WATINE: Madame Chair, this is
49 Lauren again with Alaska Department of Fish and Game.

50

1 I just want to clarify something about the survey that
2 we conducted in June to estimate the population.

3
4 We do this every year at what is
5 typically the hottest time of the year purposefully
6 because at that point the animals are trying to
7 congregate on -- congregate together to escape from
8 insect activity. There's power in numbers. If your
9 neighbor is squishing right on top of you, your
10 neighbor might be more likely to get bitten than you
11 are as an example.

12
13 So this is the best time of the year to
14 get a population estimate because all of the caribou
15 are together and most of the time they're found on
16 whatever remnant snow patches are left in the hills.
17 So they're looking for colder areas to escape from the
18 bugs and then they ball up with their neighbors to try
19 and reduce their chances of being bit by bugs.

20
21 So again we do conduct this survey in
22 June, end of June, early July purposefully for that
23 reason. And also as I said yesterday and today, this
24 was a very good survey that we conducted. We went out
25 multiple times before actually conducting the survey to
26 make sure we knew where all of our caribou were and we
27 locked in on them and we found the majority of our
28 animals.

29
30 And also the data reflects the
31 precision and the accuracy of this survey. So we have
32 a high degree of confidence and see no need to conduct
33 another population estimate. We will continue to
34 monitor this herd and implement other activities to
35 better understand what's happening, but we have
36 confidence in this estimate.

37
38 Thank you.

39
40 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

41
42 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank and then
45 Bill.

46
47 MR. WOODS: Thanks for the explanation.
48 I understand that just being part of the survey process
49 is -- since I think it was Jim Wellington and then Neil

50

1 Barton, explains it well, not only for you, but, you
2 know, this comes up as -- over and over is that we all
3 live in the same area and work together. And the very
4 first, most productive meeting I ever went to was a
5 consensus meeting. And a consensus meeting is that we
6 all agree, even if it's to disagree. But we have a
7 problem before us that's -- we're on a Subsistence
8 Board and we're asked for reduction and like a lot of
9 the members said here, we might not agree with it, but
10 we have something in front of us that we have to deal
11 with. So when we come into consensus doesn't mean I
12 have to agree with you, but we all agree that there's a
13 problem.

14

15 Thank you.

16

17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Bill.

18

19 MR. TREFON: Yeah, this is just
20 something I just thought about. The diet and I -- as a
21 firefighter I deal with evasive species. Are there any
22 studies on evasive species as in plants and bugs, like
23 the ticks coming up?

24

25 MS. WATINE: Not by the Alaska
26 Department of Fish and Game at this time in this area.
27 I don't know if the Refuge or anyone else has any work
28 being done on that.

29

30 MR. TREFON: Yeah, the reason I bring
31 that up is because the people that come up from the
32 Lower 48 they're bringing those little critters up in
33 their bags.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I think
36 we're -- what's the next step with this just.....

37

38 MR. DUNAWAY: Coffee break.

39

40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK:just
41 we're ready for a break.

42

43 MR. MIKE: Yeah, Madame Chair, thank
44 you. I think the discussion brought up a lot of
45 comments for our staff to -- we took a lot of notes on
46 it and it'll be presented to the Federal Board through
47 the analysis process.

48

49 Thank you.

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Let's
2 take a five minute breather and then get back to the
3 rest of our agenda items.

4
5 (Off record)

6
7 (On record)

8
9 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I'll call this
10 meeting back to order. Next is the Fisheries Resource
11 Monitoring Program.

12
13 Okay. You've got the floor.

14
15 MR. STONE: Thank you. Hello, Madame
16 Chair and members of the Council. For the record my
17 name is Jared Stone and I am a fisheries technician
18 with the Office of Subsistence Management. This is my
19 first time presenting to this Council and so I'd like
20 to first thank you for having me here today.

21
22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Could I have
23 your name again?

24
25 MR. STONE: My name is Jared Stone.

26
27 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh, Jared.

28
29 MR. STONE: Yeah.

30
31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thanks.

32
33 MR. STONE: My goal today is to present
34 you with a brief overview of the Fisheries Resource
35 Monitoring Program and some of its accomplishments to
36 date. I'll review the funding process, your original
37 overview and finish up by requesting Council comments
38 on the projects submitted for the southwest region
39 during the 2020 call for proposals. This is not an
40 action item and there is no motion necessary for this
41 process.

42
43 The Fisheries Resource Monitoring
44 Program materials begin on page 113 of your Council
45 member books. And so I'll give you a moment to find
46 that.

47
48 The Fisheries Resource Monitoring
49 Program is a multi-disciplinary, collaborative effort

50

1 that enhances subsistence fisheries research and
2 provides necessary information for the management of
3 subsistence fisheries on Federal public lands in
4 Alaska. The program encourages partnerships between
5 tribes, rural organizations, universities and Federal
6 and State agencies. In addition in encourages
7 interdisciplinary approaches to conducting research and
8 addressing issues.

9
10 The Office of Subsistence Management
11 administers the Monitoring Program. The program's
12 intent is to advance projects of strategic importance
13 to the Federal Subsistence Management Program and
14 coordinate information sharing of ongoing and new
15 subsistence research efforts.

16
17 Since its inception in 2000 the
18 Monitoring Program has funded more than 450 projects
19 statewide with a total allocation exceeding \$120
20 million. The figures on this slide demonstrate both
21 the allocation fund and the number of projects funded
22 through the Monitoring Program by the organization of
23 the principal investigator. Although not displayed
24 here, some of these funds have been used by principal
25 investigator organizations to subcontract with research
26 partners such as communities, tribes and other research
27 organization.

28
29 This slide shows the guyline allocation
30 of funds by region. While this provides an initial
31 target for the planning, allocations are often adjusted
32 as needed to ensure that quality projects are funded.

33
34 Next I'll jump into how the funding
35 process actually works.

36
37 The program divides the State into six
38 regions. These regions correspond to Federal
39 subsistence fisheries areas that generally hold stock,
40 harvest and community issues in common. And I'd just
41 to remind the Council that the southwest region is made
42 up of both the Bristol Bay Regional Advisory Council
43 and also the Kodiak-Aleutians Regional Advisory
44 Council.

45
46 During the first step of the process
47 the Regional Advisory Councils with support from OSM
48 staff and Federal and State fishery and land managers
49 ensure the Monitoring Program focuses on the highest
50

1 priority subsistence fishery information needs for each
2 region. Councils ensure issues of local concern and
3 knowledge gaps related to subsistence fisheries are
4 identified for priority information need development.
5 Ideally principal investigators will work closely with
6 the Councils in order to develop strong proposals that
7 are responsive to those needs. The Office of
8 Subsistence Management provides technical assistance as
9 needed.

10

11 The second step is requesting new
12 project proposals which the program does every two
13 years. Submission must be complete, on time and
14 address the five criteria outlined in the notice of
15 funding opportunity in order to be competitive. The
16 criteria are strategic priority, technical scientific
17 merit, investigator ability and resources, partnership
18 and capacity building and cost benefit of the project.
19 A more detailed description of the five criteria can be
20 found on page 118 of your Council book.

21

22 Once submitted a Technical Review
23 Committee evaluates and rates each project proposal
24 package. The Technical Review Committee is a standing
25 interagency committee of senior technical experts
26 brought together to evaluate project proposals and
27 ensure that the program is maintaining consistency with
28 its mission. It is the responsibility of the Technical
29 Review Committee to develop the strongest possible
30 Monitor Program for all regions across the State based
31 on the evaluation criteria.

32

33 During the proposal evaluation process
34 the Technical Review Committee adheres to specific
35 guidelines in order to assess how well a project
36 addressed the five criteria. While some agencies may
37 have more than one senior expert on the Committee such
38 as a social scientist and a fisheries biologist, each
39 agency provides a single, consolidated review.
40 Agencies also do not score their own proposals. The
41 final score for each proposal is based on an assessment
42 of the five criteria.

43

44 Once a draft Monitoring Program is
45 developed it is brought before the Regional Advisory
46 Councils for their input and comments. This is where
47 we are at in our current cycle and we'll come back to
48 this in a moment.

49

50

1 Additional comments on the process and
2 draft 2020 Fisheries Resource Monitoring Program for
3 the southwest region will be provided by the
4 InterAgency Staff Committee. These along with the
5 comments developed by the Councils are all provided to
6 the Federal Subsistence Board. The Board takes into
7 consideration comments and concerns generated by the
8 process and endorses the funding plan. Final approval
9 of the funding plan is made by the assistant regional
10 director of OSM.

11
12 So now we'll shift into an overview of
13 the southwest region. In southwest Alaska 55 projects
14 have been undertaken for an approximately 10 million in
15 funding. You can see from the chart that the project
16 leads have been predominantly the State of Alaska or
17 the Department of Interior agencies. Most of those
18 projects also included other agencies and Alaska rural
19 organizations as research partners. The other category
20 includes universities, nonprofit organizations and
21 independent contractors.

22
23 For 2020 there is an anticipated one to
24 one and a half million dollars available for new
25 projects statewide and up to \$1.8 million for ongoing,
26 already funded projects. The available funding amount
27 for the new 2020 projects is budgeted for each
28 project's first year, not the total project request.

29
30 For the southwest region there were two
31 projects submitted for the current cycle. The projects
32 are listed in numerical order by the project number.
33 Justifications for the Technical Review Committee
34 scores begins on page 124 of your Council books and a
35 project executive summary can be found on page 127 of
36 your books.

37
38 So once again we are at step four of
39 the FRMP funding process. Today I'm asking you for
40 your comments on the draft Monitoring Program for your
41 region. There is no motion necessary. What our
42 program is seeking is any thoughts or ideas that you
43 might have on each proposed project that would make
44 them more successful in the event that they were
45 selected for funding. We want to ensure that the
46 selected projects have the greatest chance at
47 successfully answering the Council's information needs
48 as possible. We also want to know if the Council has
49 any specific concerns about a project based on the
50

1 provided materials.
2

3 And then lastly after the Council has
4 completed commenting specifically on the projects we're
5 always interested in hearing any thoughts that you
6 might have to better improve the FRMP program.
7

8 I'd like to thank you, Madame Chair,
9 for your time.
10

11 Then I'll take any questions if you
12 have any.
13

14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
15 questions for -- is it Jared, regarding this program.
16

17 (No comments)
18

19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I've always
20 appreciated this project where, you know, it gives --
21 like for instance Natural Resource Department in BBNA
22 to get involved with the surveys that this Board really
23 sometimes need, you to calculate different resources
24 that we have questions about.
25

26 One thing that I've always wondered
27 about is the Technical Review Committee. I know that
28 it just consists of the biology, science folks that are
29 within not only OSM, but I think ADF&G. And my
30 question is have -- I don't know if you can answer
31 this, but have the organizations thought about, you
32 know, getting somebody from like the other -- like for
33 instance a Native person, you know, that possibly would
34 be able to give input. I know that this Technical
35 Committee gets the -- I guess works on the funding,
36 which projects to fund. And, you know, I think that --
37 I don't know if it would improve the -- you know, the
38 Committee if they would get somebody else or some
39 Native representative from, you know, any -- like for
40 instance even somebody from the Board to be involved
41 with the decision making of this group.
42

43 Robbin.
44

45 MS. LaVINE: Madame Chair and Council
46 members, through the Chair. Certainly we can take your
47 comments down and composition of the TRC is, you know,
48 one of the comments we can accept.
49
50

1 The TRC doesn't necessarily make
2 decisions, the TRC evaluates the proposals based on the
3 five criteria. The meeting is thorough and rigorous
4 and can take many days. And there is every attempt
5 within the meeting itself to debate and discuss each
6 criteria and the proposal -- the research proposal's
7 ability to meet those criteria. And often we find that
8 people can say this issue is so very important, right,
9 the issue that this proposal is attempting to address,
10 this issue is very, very important. But if that
11 proposal does not meet a number of criteria and those
12 criteria are forwarded to help everyone assess the
13 success of that project, if that project is determined
14 to be -- may not have everything it needs to be
15 successful then that proposal can be resubmitted.
16

17 But the TRC doesn't make -- they don't
18 make the decision, they don't choose, they rate. They
19 rate those projects that meet all the criteria and if
20 those criteria are met at a high level, a high degree,
21 then those projects are determined to be successful at
22 doing what they've said they're going to do. And
23 that's the role of the TRC.
24

25 Thank you.
26

27 MR. STONE: Madame Chair, and
28 additionally one of the criteria is the partnership
29 capacity building. And projects that demonstrate
30 partnerships generally do better. And when you look at
31 some of the projects that have been funded in the past
32 generally they've got two or three or more agencies
33 involved and I think that's where they're most
34 successful.
35

36 MR. ANDREW: Madame Chair.
37

38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Dennis.
39

40 MR. ANDREW: Yeah. Thank you, Madame
41 Chair. On the monitoring part, especially the smolts
42 on the rivers and stuff, earlier in the year, I mean,
43 the water temperature was great the first week of June
44 or last -- I mean, the kings even all the way back down
45 to the last week of May when the kings are in and
46 stuff. But, you know, the last few years with the
47 climate change and it really changed, I mean, even last
48 fall like spring where the water's real high and you
49 were waiting for the fish to come up and then pretty
50

1 soon it way down and even the guides were even driving
2 in them little streams with a four-wheeler. I'm really
3 curious about them smolts, if they're making it out or
4 are we going to have a stock in the future, I mean, I
5 don't know.

6

7

Thank you.

8

9

MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

10

11

MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

12

13

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan and then

14

Frank.

15

16

MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, I can't remember

17

his name. I thought we had a guide that was a Chignik
18 manager was listening in earlier, you know, and we've
19 been facing some pretty scary situations in Chignik and
20 I'm wondering if it's a little -- you know, that kind
21 of gets run out of Kodiak. But I'm hoping or I'm,
22 asking whether the managers or folks involved with
23 Chignik see some sort of project that could be funded
24 with this. It's just not been good at all down there
25 and I'd be willing to support some project down there
26 if there was something in line.

27

28

Thank you.

29

30

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Jared.

31

32

MR. STONE: Thank you, Madame Chair.

33

And these concerns that you're bringing up, they're
34 great and yesterday I passed out those timelines, the
35 FRMP timelines. And it's just kind of a framework to
36 show how the FRMP process works. And I'm going back to
37 Mr. Andrew's concern and also Mr. Dunaway's concern.
38 Next year in I believe the fall -- we'll start with
39 working groups in the summer depending on each region,
40 but next year in the fall we'll be soliciting what we
41 call the priority information needs. These are
42 concerns that your Council gives to us such as the one
43 that Mr. Andrew had just mentioned with the concern of
44 smolt in the rivers.

45

46

Also these priority information needs

47

are really what directs the program and the type of
48 research that it can fund. And so keep those concerns
49 and write them down and then bring those to our next
50

1 Council meeting so that you can present these needs to
2 our program.

3
4 MR. RENICK: Madame Chair, this is Ross
5 Renick with the Alaska Department of Fish and Game in
6 Chignik.

7
8 Just to address the question that was
9 posed earlier, I guess it was more of a statement. In
10 terms of that -- those projects in Chignik, we have
11 already started discussions with U.S. Fish and Wildlife
12 Service and OSM on that in terms of getting funding to
13 do projects out there. It's still in the early stages,
14 but that has been brought to our attention already.

15
16 Thank you.

17
18 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Robbin.

19
20 MS. LaVINE: Madame Chair and through
21 the Chair. And just as a reminder this Council has a
22 number of members, Molly, I believe you are one, Dan,
23 you are another, that serves on a southwest Alaska
24 working group, right, and so you work with our other
25 Council members, some of those from the Kodiak-
26 Aleutians to develop and identify priority information
27 needs for this region. And then that working group,
28 each member from the Council returns to their own
29 Council to report on the issues that have been of
30 greatest concern and identified by both Councils to
31 best serve this region.

32
33 We usually conduct the working groups,
34 we have a couple of meetings over the summer so that
35 would be next summer. So when we meet in the spring we
36 may want to review where we're at in the timeline and
37 we may want to identify those members of your Council
38 that would like to participate in discussing,
39 generating and identifying those issues of greatest
40 importance to this Council. And then they will
41 participate in the working group over the summer. So
42 we might have a really good discussion about some of
43 those priority information needs that you're bringing
44 up right now. Things change very quickly as we know
45 and we may have more information by next spring. And
46 actually by middle to the end of next summer when the
47 working groups meet we may have more information. And
48 again new issues may come to -- come to bear at that
49 time.

50

1 Thank you.

2

3 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

6

7 MR. WOODS: I think, Robbin, you
8 answered my question, this Technical Group or Technical
9 -- yeah, the Committee is going to meet next spring.
10 And then I see the ongoing budget it looks like it's --
11 we're utilizing almost all of it, but looks like -- am
12 I not correct that we're utilizing about half of it.
13 Looks like on a -- the budget number on 127 wasn't
14 clear and then the next page, is there not enough
15 applicants or enough projects?

16

17 I'm sorry, just a clarification on my
18 part.

19

20 MR. STONE: Through the Chair, Madame
21 Chair. To answer your question the TRC has already met
22 this last year and they've already ranked and reviewed
23 the projects and scored them based off of the criteria.

24

25

26 The funding allocation is by region.
27 And so for this region I believe it's about 10 percent.
28 And so that total amount of money that you see that's
29 available for this year's funding is a snapshot of the
30 funding available for the entire State. And so that's
31 why you're seeing a smaller amount of funding
32 available.

33

34 MS. LaVINE: Madame Chair.

35

36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Robbin.

37

38 MS. LaVINE: And just one more point of
39 clarification because I know there's so many different
40 groups getting together. So the TRC is the Technical
41 Review Committee. And the Technical Review Committee
42 meets when it is time to review all of the proposals
43 for a particular cycle. And where we're at starting
44 next summer will be the development of our priority
45 information needs and the identification of priority
46 information needs to your region. And that's your
47 regional working group and it's the working group is
48 made up of members of this Council and members of the
49 Kodiak-Aleutians Regional Advisory Council. So the

50

1 working group is the one that will be meeting next
2 year, the TRC meets to address the proposals that were
3 submitted.

4
5 And the two proposals that you see in
6 your Council book were the only two we received for
7 this region.

8
9 Thank you.

10
11 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

12
13 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We have
16 Richard and then Nanci.

17
18 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, thank you.
19 This is more -- you know, I'm looking at the list that
20 we've created over time here with the working groups
21 and that and I know one thing that Mr. Dan O'Hara who
22 no longer sits on this Council, but a few years back we
23 were looking to get chinook on the list for the Naknek
24 and the Alagnak. And I'm not seeing it and I was --
25 last year I think there was some -- with the
26 partnership program and stuff, some of this subject
27 came up and they were going to put it in a different
28 category I thought. But I want to still emphasize that
29 I'm still not seeing where we've even had any
30 discussion or I'd like to know I guess if any of you
31 subcommittees had discussions on some of the requests
32 that we had over there in the Naknek and on the Alagnak
33 for the chinook because we believe still that there's
34 still a problem with the chinook over there and that it
35 needs to be addressed or monitored so that we have more
36 info.

37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Uh-huh.

39
40 MR. WILSON: So I'm just -- I'm looking
41 at the list and I'm not seeing it there again this
42 year. So that's my question.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, normally
45 this group or this Board kind of develops these I guess
46 survey projects that are needed for this region. And
47 if -- you know, if that need was presented then we
48 should have had that on the list to have somebody pick
49 it up to, you know, I guess apply for the -- you know,
50

1 to do the survey for that concerned resource.

2

3

Jared.

4

5

MR. STONE: Thank you, Madame Chair.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

You know, if there's other concerns that you might have that are maybe more specific, again I would advise you to next fall when we call for priority information needs again to develop these priority information needs and maybe make them even more specific if there's a concern that you have that you want to have addressed.

Thank you.

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

MR. WILSON: Thanks, Jared. I had not looked on page 123 otherwise I might not have asked.

Thanks.

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, thank you, Madame Chair. The part that I always find frustrating about this, Richard, is we do come forward with our suggestions and where we see priority information needs and that -- which is -- and it's heard, I'm not -- but the frustration is is then some entity has to come up with a plan to put forward in front of the Technical Review Committee in order for action to actually be taken. So that part is completely out of our hands. So unless we can get one of the entities out in the audience interested in formulating a plan that will pass technical review it doesn't go anywhere.

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Did you have
2 an answers for Nanci's comment, Robbin.

3
4 MS. LaVINE: Yes, Madame Chair and
5 member Morris. This is the time for -- I think there's
6 a lot of folks here, there's some amazingly rigorous
7 invested agencies that are present, they're listening.
8 And when we get the working group together, this is
9 also a time for the Councils to work with and -- work
10 with other agencies that may be able to address their
11 concerns. We encourage the agencies out there,
12 research agencies, to contact Council members and
13 question them about what they see and, you know, their
14 priority information needs.

15
16 So we have a process now that's really
17 open and we encourage collaboration and we encourage
18 people to work with you.

19
20 And then a final reminder that -- where
21 we're at in the cycle. So the priority information,
22 we're really going to -- we're going to really start
23 digging down into those for the next cycle when we meet
24 in Naknek. And then when the working group meets over
25 the summer and then the final approval by this Council
26 in -- next fall, so a year from now will be on the
27 priority information needs. But at this point in time
28 we're here to receive your comments on the proposals
29 that we've received and those comments now will be
30 added to the TRC's comments. Those go before the
31 Board, the final decision will be made on the
32 Monitoring Plan by the OSM ARD. And that should be in
33 the -- at the January Board meeting. I think that will
34 be -- or after the January Board meeting.

35
36 Thank you.

37
38 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

41
42 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you, Molly.
43 Yeah, I see no problem with studies that are planned
44 and from my days in Unalaska that's a real small
45 system, but really prized, so I'm glad to see they're
46 paying attention.

47
48 Getting back to, you know, in the
49 future since we have folks out here, I too become aware
50

1 when I visit Naknek that their kings are an issue again
2 as there's growth in the sport industry and the
3 competition for it. And we add that to some really hot
4 summers, I can't help wondering, I'm kind of looking at
5 Cody Larson and Troy Hamon, maybe some of these
6 agencies could get together and Naknek's a good place
7 or King Salmon/Naknek's a good place to have studies
8 because you have a lot of agencies right there
9 including the Paug-Vik and so on. I'm -- you know, my
10 heart's still at Meshik River, but I can't figure out a
11 project to make it worth where as like egg deposition
12 and some of that, right, like in Big Creek and around
13 the Naknek might be highly workable. So I'm
14 encouraging the agencies over there to think hard about
15 what kind of a project would work.
16

17 And again because of these really hot
18 summers recently it might be a really critical time to
19 look into it or the Alagnak too, but anyway trying to
20 get some ideas perking.
21

22 Thank you, Madame Chair.
23

24 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.
25

26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.
27

28 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
29 Chair. Yeah, I would -- that has been my thought too,
30 Dan, is I think that to have a positive light on what's
31 happened in the region this last summer and it sounds
32 like it's somewhat predictive for next summer as well,
33 we take advantage and find out what -- as quickly as
34 possible what potential damage or non-damage or, you
35 know, health -- how these summers are going to affect
36 the health of our fisheries. And that's going to take,
37 you know, some fairly quick action. So I don't even
38 know, we may have to go off of the TRC and off of this
39 whole point, but my comment I think to the Committee
40 would include also some fairly quick action so that we
41 can have some sort of analysis made on fisheries that,
42 I like Dan's point, are easily -- more easily accessed
43 and evaluated than other fisheries that are larger and
44 more spread out.
45

46 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.
47

48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.
49
50

1 MR. WILSON: Thank you, Nanci and kind
2 of Dan here, kind of brings to mind, you know, we're
3 looking for partnership programs here, looking for
4 funding and I wondered if, you know, some of the
5 entities that are using this resource, like is there an
6 organization with the sports industry that can chime in
7 or I know on the commercial side
8 of things, the
9 commercial fisheries, the BBRSDA, you know, the 1
10 percent that is taken out for -- you know, for the
11 commercial side of fishing, you know, they're always
12 looking for ways to invest in the fishery, you know.
13 And maybe monitoring, you know, as far as funding goes,
14 that might be, you know, a method for getting some of
15 these concerns that, you know, involve those areas. It
16 might be a funding source. I don't know about the
17 sport fish side of it, but I do know that the
18 commercial side does have funding that, you know, a
19 yearly budget this could be a topic for them.

20 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

21
22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

23
24 MS. MORRIS LYON: And, Richard, just
25 real quick. I -- to my knowledge sport fish monies
26 that are collected are mostly through license sales.
27 There are no fees any longer for any guide licenses.
28 And those monies go directly into the general account.
29 We've got nothing that's actually attributed to sport
30 fish.

31
32 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

33
34 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

35
36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We have Bill
37 and then Dan.

38
39 MR. TREFON: Yeah. My concern is about
40 this year's hot weather and what the return -- the baby
41 salmons are leaving the lake right now. I watched the
42 birds, the hawks, the ducks, I mean, the water was so
43 milky in Lake Clark and Sixmile you couldn't see the
44 bottom right on the shore. So I saw increase in bird
45 intake on these baby fish. I mean, they had no choice,
46 only the fish on the surface they can get. So maybe
47 create a baseline study for this first season of hot
48 weather, see how it affects the return in four years,
49
50

2

49 create a baseline study so we know what's going to

50

1 happen with the change in climate.

2

3 Suggestion.

4

5 Thank you.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

8

9 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, Richard, when I was
10 still working we coordinated with various groups
11 everywhere from Bethel to Naknek on some joint
12 projects. I was pretty proud of working with Togiak
13 and the KANA, I think ONC as well and with Togiak
14 Refuge in some cases on weirs and such. And it takes a
15 lot of advanced planning, but I think it can be done.

16

17 I will say that about the time I
18 retired the State bean counters made it so difficult to
19 work with some of these projects. The State -- the
20 Federal folks were fine to deal with. We had a whole
21 bunch of folks in Juneau that sure made it difficult to
22 the point where some of those State workers gave up
23 trying to make these projects because they had these
24 bean counters in Juneau just muddled the water. And
25 I'm going to say it the way it was, it was -- start
26 throwing up our hands, it wasn't worth it. Yet working
27 with Togiak Refuge is great. And they'd say well, we'd
28 mess up or we had a little problem, oh, you work with
29 it, fix it, and we moved on.

30

31 So anyway there is a possibility, it
32 takes a lot of lead time. And the sport fish
33 biologists were here earlier, but I don't see them here
34 right now. I was kind of hoping they would hang around
35 and, but I think like Cody knows them and Courtenay
36 knows them and I don't know if you have counterparts
37 out at Naknek, but work with them and hopefully come up
38 with a project because I think those projects were good
39 to work with the corporations and with the other
40 agencies.

41

42 Thank you.

43

44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Jared.

45

46 MR. STONE: Thank you, Madame Chair. I
47 think the level of discussion that we're having is
48 great for future projects and I would tell you
49 wholeheartedly to keep those so that next year when we
50

1 get back to soliciting the priority information needs
2 to bring those forward so that we can direct what types
3 of future research projects could occur in your region.
4

5 Again I just want to remind you that
6 today we're really looking for comments on just these
7 two proposed projects. One takes place down in Kodiak
8 and the other takes place in Unalaska. And I know
9 these two projects aren't necessarily in your region so
10 maybe your comments or concerns on them are limited,
11 but I just want to remind you that that's really what
12 we're after for today.

13
14 Thank you.

15
16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: So you need
17 our blessings to have those two projects I guess
18 started. So this is an action item. If we don't have
19 anymore

20
21 MS. MORRIS LYON: No, it's not an
22 action item.
23

24 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I thought it
25 was an action item.
26

27 MR. STONE: Madame Chair.
28

29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Jared.
30

31 MR. STONE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
32 No, this is not an action item. Just simply if you
33 have any concerns or comments regarding these projects
34 or the FRMP program, we did take notes today on some of
35 your suggestions regarding our program, but again this
36 is not an action item.
37

38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Anymore
39 comments regarding these two projects.
40

41 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.
42

43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Bill.
44

45 MR. TREFON: Could you explain to me
46 what this 20-450 on the Kodiak road system subsistence
47 fishery harvest assessment is? That was a mouthful.
48

49 MS. LaVINE: Through the Chair. This
50

1 is an Alaska Department of Fish and Game, Division of
2 Subsistence project. They're also working closely with
3 the Sun'aq Tribe of Kodiak. They will be conducting
4 harvest monitoring. So basically applying their
5 subsistence surveys, their household surveys, to assess
6 the harvest of fish in the road system communities of
7 Kodiak. And I think this was something that has not
8 been done in a while. There were a few that were done
9 in town I believe, but they were very limited and this
10 is more of a comprehensive approach, all fish, salmon
11 and nonsalmon species. And I'd have to review a little
12 further, but it is basically harvest monitoring and
13 it's looking at how -- what people are catching, how
14 much they're catching per person, per household and by
15 community.

16
17 MR. TREFON: Okay. Thank you. And I'm
18 assuming that McLees Lake sockeye escapement is just
19 like -- 22 mile in Lake Clark salmon count towers is a
20 yearly thing?

21
22 MR. STONE: Through the Chair. Yes,
23 that's correct. It's a fixed picket weir that
24 enumerates salmon passing into McLees Lake which is
25 nearby the community of Unalaska.

26
27 MR. TREFON: They're just continuous
28 projects?

29
30 MR. STONE: Yes and no. So this
31 project has had a long history of being funded, but
32 they did have a few years of not being funded. And so
33 they're hoping to bring this project back alive and to
34 begin counting salmon again in McLees.

35
36 Thank you.

37
38 MR. TREFON: Thank you.

39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
41 other comments regarding this.

42
43 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

44
45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

46
47 MR. WOODS: Just a simple comment that
48 I -- sitting on the Board of Fish in the area I know
49 that subsistence concern was along the Aleutian. And
50

1 what you're talking about as one of the projects is
2 that continuation for the McLees Lake on Alaska Island.
3 And I just want to comment that, yeah, we would support
4 any monitoring for subsistence use and/or traditional
5 knowledge on that project, but also the Kodiak since
6 it's out of area. But it is southwest Alaska so looks
7 like those are really good projects for people in those
8 areas. And we'll support -- I would support those
9 projects just out of curiosity of what that brings
10 back.

11
12 But sitting on a different level at the
13 State level that Unalaska was I think at the last
14 couple Board cycles those concerns were brought forward.

15
16 But in the second I guess that -- the
17 next for the TLC since you're meeting next summer is,
18 yeah, the Chigniks, I see it's on there, one of the
19 action items that's huge. So appreciate all your work
20 and it's good to know that money is filtering down to
21 the actual science behind this.

22
23 Thank you. 50 CFR 135.25.

24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
26 other additional comments.

27
28 (No comments)

29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I've always
31 supported the survey projects such as this because, you
32 know, it involves local people. And it gives them
33 ownership, you know, to a project such as this, you
34 know, when we involve them to help with surveys like
35 this. So any surveys that happen anywhere I fully
36 support.

37
38 Okay.

39
40 Are we finished with this item here.

41
42 (No comments)

43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Gayla.

45
46 MS. HOSETH: Thank you, Madam Chair.
47 For the record Gayla Hoseth, BBNA. I just had a
48 question in regards to the priority information
49 committee that is formed and what the participation
50

1 might look like where people could participate with the
2 people in the region to bring in ideas of what priority
3 informations that are out there.

4
5 I know it was before my time that I
6 worked at BBNA that there was a priority information
7 needs document that there are still needs that are
8 identified with all the different villages of priority
9 needs. And I guess, you know, funding is an issue, but
10 to bring those needs back, but just so that you have a
11 lot of people in the room that hear a lot of
12 information of what priorities are out there in the
13 region. And if there was -- I don't know who's on the
14 priority information needs committee for the region,
15 but I think that it would be good for us to meet or
16 whoever's on that committee to meet prior to the next
17 meeting because there's a lot of needs that are out
18 there that need to be identified.

19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Jared.

21
22 MR. STONE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
23 And Gayla brings up a great point. The priority
24 information needs do need to come from the Regional
25 Advisory Councils, however the participation that comes
26 from potential investigators, Refuge managers, land
27 managers, can come and voice those concerns to the
28 Council. And if the Council agrees with that potential
29 need for priority information needs, then that could
30 make it to the notice of funding opportunity for the
31 region.

32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, normally
34 this is where the priority -- you know, information
35 needs come from is, you know, with our discussions and
36 if there's any issues or needed more information from
37 our -- of the resources, this is where the discussion
38 starts. And then so.....

39
40 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

43
44 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah. Thanks for
45 reminding us, Gayla. I think back when I was working
46 Ralph convened a big meeting. And that list probably
47 still exists and you probably have it. I don't know if
48 you've talked to Ralph, but you -- we could probably
49 stand a lot of reminding if -- that was a big, long

50

1 list. I'd sure welcome getting a refresher on that.
2 And anything you can do to help us focus would be
3 great.

4
5 Thank you.

6
7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Gayla.

8
9 MS. HOSETH: I guess -- through the
10 Chair. I guess the -- is there any funding out there
11 or anything to help identify what priority information
12 needs we have in the region, to revisit that document
13 was done with BBNA when Ralph Anderson was the CEO
14 because there's a lot of needs that are still -- we
15 were wanting to pursue that, but we should be able to --
16 be able to identify within the villages of the region.

17
18 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

19
20 Robbin.

21
22 MS. LaVINE: There were a number of
23 strategic planning documents that were conducted. It
24 was with a large amount of participants. I got on the
25 tail end of that when I first started working at BBNA.
26 I believe for the southwest region that strategic plan
27 was complete by 2005. The challenge with those kind of
28 documents is that eventually a lot of projects come,
29 address a lot of those priority information needs and
30 then the situation shifts. However we do review, we
31 have reviewed in the past, the strategic planning
32 documents until they've become a little more outdated.

33
34
35 I know that there had been some talk at
36 one point in time in trying to conduct another
37 strategic planning process. I know that -- I'm not too
38 sure where the funding for that effort would come at
39 this point in time. It was really long and involved
40 and really costly. And that was just for this region,
41 let alone all the regions across the State.

42
43 But those documents do exist, the one
44 from 2005 does exist. It's now 2019 and when we get
45 around to doing this call again it's going to be
46 further along and further away from those needs that
47 were pressing in 2005. But those documents -- again
48 they might be able to be -- to serve the working groups
49 next summer and you can review them on the working
50

1 group. And the working group can invite whoever they'd
2 like to participate in their discussions, inform the
3 discussion and then the working group can adjourn and
4 meet and decide for themselves based on the information
5 that was given.

6
7 Thank you.

8
9 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Billy.

12
13 MR. TREFON: Yeah, my question would be
14 just looking at this project titles, are all these
15 projects active from now or from 2000 to now?

16
17 MR. STONE: No, that's a longstanding
18 list of the projects that have occurred in your region
19 since the inception of the FRMP program, since 2000.

20
21 Thank you.

22
23 MR. TREFON: Okay. I was just asking
24 because I see the Lake Clark escapement was -- that's
25 every year, so that's a project that we go after every
26 year with the Park Service and tribal council.

27
28 Thank you.

29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Are we
31 talked out of this?

32
33 (No comments)

34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
36 We'll go to the -- I guess the next.....

37
38 Jared, did you have a last comment.

39
40 MR. STONE: Yes, sorry. My last
41 comment. So I do have two more program updates on our
42 fisheries regulatory cycle, it'll be pretty short and
43 brief, and then lastly a partners update that would
44 talk about our future partners for this next cycle if
45 you would like.

46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Go ahead.

48
49 MR. STONE: All right. Thank you,

50

1 Madame Chair and members of the Council. This is a
2 brief update for two of the other fisheries
3 programmatic areas. The Fisheries Regulatory Cycle and
4 the Partners for Fisheries Monitoring Program. This is
5 only an update and please ask any questions and I'll do
6 my best to answer them.

7
8 First the Federal Subsistence Board
9 took action on the last regulatory cycle proposals
10 during their April, 2019 public regulatory meeting.
11 The revised regulations have been published in the
12 Federal Register and the new fisheries regulatory
13 guides for the years 2019 through 2021 and are now
14 available.

15
16 The next call for proposals will be in
17 early 2020 and the Council will have an opportunity at
18 the next meeting to discuss and submit any proposals
19 that they see fit.

20
21 This concludes the Fisheries Regulatory
22 Cycle update.

23
24 Do you have any questions?

25
26 (No comments)

27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seeing none.
29 I guess the report doesn't.....

30
31 Pardon?

32
33 MR. WILSON: No, we're good.

34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We're good.

36
37 MR. STONE: All right.

38
39 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

40
41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

42
43 MR. WOODS: One little comment. I --
44 I'm new to the Board and I'm getting used to all the
45 acronyms. So I'm trying to keep track of the FSB
46 refers to the RAC for the RMP -- the FMP for the TLC.

47
48 (Laughter)

49
50

1 MR. WOODS: So when Robbin was up there
2 talking about OSM and all its acronyms I was trying to
3 keep up and trying to keep track. As a new member it's
4 -- I thank you for your explanation though. And it's
5 really good to know the timelines. As a new member
6 that this project and this money that's available for
7 anything that goes on is really huge because it's real
8 important that not only we or I, I guess, we can still
9 collaborate and ask because we're -- let me tell you
10 why I'm speaking. ADF&G has removed the subsistence
11 director from the State of Alaska's commission. The
12 commissioner that took care of rural Alaska was Hazel
13 Nelson last. And then now we've lost Ted Kreig. And I
14 don't know if those positions are getting replaced.

15
16 So those key positions really have an
17 impact on -- you're talking about partnerships, is
18 those partnerships that we want to work together for
19 those projects or we have no longer nobody to talk to.
20 Other than we have wonderful staff and biologists at
21 the ADF&G office that we -- but, you know, we used to
22 have the go to people. I remember growing up that
23 Molly would do all the.....

24
25 (Laughter)

26
27 MR. WOODS:and basically like for
28 20 years we had it really good. That we had number 1
29 coordinators for every department and what you're
30 talking about and now with the cut backs in budgets I
31 think we're at a deficit. So anymore collaboration I
32 think would be better. So thank you for sharing that.

33
34
35 I joke about the acronyms because I
36 have to catch up, just as you're talking I have to
37 translate them acronyms into -- what actually need --
38 you know, the names of those.

39
40 Thank you.

41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Jared.

43
44 MR. STONE: Okay. Moving on. So I'll
45 talk next about our Partners Program and give a brief
46 update on our Partners for Fisheries Monitoring
47 Program.

48
49 The Partners for Fisheries Monitoring

50

1 Program seeks to strengthen Alaska Native and rural
2 involvement in Federal subsistence management by
3 providing funding for biologist, social scientist,
4 educator positions in Alaska Native and rural nonprofit
5 organizations with the intent of increasing the
6 organization's ability to participate in Federal
7 subsistence management.

8
9 The Office of Subsistence Management
10 has begun developing cooperative agreements for the
11 2020 through 2023 Partners for Fisheries Monitoring
12 Program. Seven partners -- seven partner organizations
13 were chosen through a competitive process. Those
14 organizations are Bristol Bay Native Association,
15 Native Village of Eyak, Native Village of Napaimute,
16 Orutsararmiut Traditional Native Council, Qawalangin
17 Tribe of Unalaska and the Yakutat Tlingit Tribe.

18
19 This concludes the Partners for
20 Fisheries Monitoring update.

21
22 Do you have any questions?

23
24 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

25
26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

27
28 MS. MORRIS LYON: Just real quick out
29 of curiosity. How often do they have to re-up or
30 reapply or reinstate themselves?

31
32 MR. STONE: The Partners Program call
33 for proposals comes up every four years. So it's a
34 little bit different than the Fisheries Resource
35 Monitoring Program, that's a two year cycle. The
36 Partners Program is a four year cycle.

37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I think we are
39 good with this. And thank you for updating us and
40 giving us information on the Partners Program.

41
42 MR. STONE: Thank you.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Next on
45 our agenda is Donald, identifying issues for fiscal
46 year 2019. Page 132 in your book.

47
48 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
49 Donald Mike, Council coordinator. Yeah, on page 132

50

1 you'll see the annual report summary.

2

3 The annual report establishes a way for
4 the -- really the Advisory Councils on subsistence uses
5 and needs to the Secretary's attention. So under title
6 VIII of section 805 and 50 CFR 100.11 describes what
7 may be contained in an annual report from the Councils
8 to the Board.

9

10 So this is an opportunity for this
11 Council to bring up issues in your annual report to
12 bring forward to the Board's attention.

13

14 Thank you, Madame Chair.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

17

Any.....

18

19 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

22

23 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, I would like
24 included in our concerns the concern that pretty much
25 everybody voiced at the beginning of this meeting with
26 the hot and low water condition years and the effects
27 of -- that we would -- it would really behoove us to
28 have some studies done on both our fish and animals for
29 those areas and in particular once again the Chignik
30 area and the severe problem that it's incurred. And
31 probably I guess we should separate those two because
32 to me the Chigniks are a priority, they're not getting
33 anything that they need down there.

34

35 Thank you.

36

37 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

40

41 MR. DUNAWAY: I think we can add -- I
42 wholeheartedly with what Nanci said, I had Chignik
43 salmon on my list. It's pretty scary when you're
44 closing subsistence. But also I guess the -- what's
45 going on with the Mulchatna caribou is pretty big.

46

47 Those are what I can think of.

48

49 Thanks.

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
2 other comments.

3
4 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

7
8 MR. WOODS: I was trying to think of
9 number 1, like the fisheries in general, but maybe
10 since the out migration of salmon starting from we
11 could study the streams, the out migration, but the
12 full lifecycle out. You know, they talked about the
13 glob or the blob out in the middle of the Gulf last
14 year for Chigniks and they blame it on Chigniks'
15 decline. I'm pretty sure that's in all the scientific
16 kind of research, but I think the ecosystem is
17 changing, that we have a -- we just have a snapshot of
18 what's going on. Not -- I'm looking at fisheries and
19 then the return like I'm glad that Richard mentioned
20 that, you know, the king salmon return. And we live on
21 the Nushagak that we -- we live off a high abundance
22 right now and things might change where we -- we're all
23 going to be affected. Not only the fisheries as a
24 whole, but I would focus on local -- like the Chigniks.

25
26
27 The caribou populations on the western
28 side we have a huge -- I would encourage some sort of a
29 collaboration other than at meetings like this where
30 you have emergency closures or emergency action item
31 before us. And we includes everybody in the room that
32 we be more proactive in the management of that because
33 its long term effects. Like 25 years the peninsula
34 hasn't been able to harvest, I don't want that to see
35 here locally that we end up having to suffer the
36 consequences of a decline that's going to curb our
37 activities.

38
39 So not only working at -- on a local
40 level, I really enjoy honestly everybody working
41 together and, you know, the Togiak Refuge to ADF&G,
42 bringing all their science forward. I would encourage
43 more of that I guess, that we include -- because I
44 worry when we come together at a meeting without the --
45 someone mentioned the annual reports happen before our
46 meetings and since we're out of Board cycle we don't
47 have that.

48
49 I guess it -- I'll stop there because

50

1 that is my concern that we keep up to date and we keep
2 working.

3

4 Thanks.

5

6 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Bill.

9

10 MR. TREFON: Yeah, I stand behind what
11 Dan and Frank was saying about the Mulchatna caribou
12 herd. I think they really got to be looked into
13 heavily.

14

15 And my concern is with this extreme
16 changes in weather, what we saw this summer we're going
17 to continue to see and it's not going to improve
18 anytime soon. So a baseline study on both the moose
19 and the fish or wildlife and fish beginning this year
20 around this weather/climate change would be a good
21 start to have a baseline so we'll -- to study the
22 extreme temperature changes and the affect on our fish
23 and game. Because I have not really heard anything
24 about the thousands of fish that died up on the Yukon.
25 I don't know how much truth's in that, but I never
26 heard anything about them. But this shows -- it looked
27 like it has a major affect which will affect us
28 eventually.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
31 other comments.

32

33 (No comments)

34

35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: And I'll
36 follow or I guess with Bill's comment about baseline,
37 possibly baseline study regarding moose and caribou, it
38 would also be interesting to include the harvesting
39 areas for these. I don't think we've had information
40 on harvesting areas for our land mammals in a while.
41 So I think, you know, for this Board it would be
42 interesting to get us updated on harvesting areas for
43 not only each community, but overall hunting locations.
44 The harvesting locations were in place in the mid to
45 late -- latter part of 1980s and I don't think those
46 have been updated in a while. So I think, you know, if
47 there's a baseline survey done regarding our land
48 mammals that would be interesting to include in there.

49

50

1 And, Dennis, you know, you've
2 mentioned, you know, that caribou foot disease several
3 times during this meeting. And I think that, you know,
4 if somebody could expound on the findings of that foot
5 disease, it seems to be affecting, you know, your
6 hunting area.

7
8 That would also be something to look
9 into.

10
11 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

12
13 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Bill.

14
15 MR. TREFON: Yeah, I brought this up
16 earlier about evasive species and doesn't sound like
17 the State or nobody doesn't have any surveys or studies
18 done on evasive species. Maybe that could be an affect
19 on our caribou, maybe that could be an affect on our
20 fish because we don't know what is being brought to
21 Alaska that doesn't belong here. And how it affect
22 their diet, how it affect their health. Maybe some
23 studies based on the evasive species, flower and like I
24 was saying the bugs and maybe the -- well, snakes every
25 now and then get in freight. And they come up from the
26 Lower 48.

27
28 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

31
32 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you. Yeah, I
33 think we should always be vigilant on that. I'm pretty
34 sure the Federal agencies watch that super close. I
35 know that when I was with Fish and Game we were
36 watching for whirling disease which comes from
37 hatcheries down south. There's slime that -- is it mud
38 slime, some sort of slime thing that's getting into
39 rivers. That's also why the Board of Game has
40 forbidden felt soled boots being used so we don't bring
41 up mud snails and zebra mussels. And so there's some,
42 but it's -- still you're right. And in fact I think
43 BBNA for a while -- I was talking -- when Harold Andrew
44 was working there. He was on the watch for invasive
45 plants up around these guide camps on the Nushagak.
46 But you're -- I think you're absolutely right.

47
48 I saw something about ticks in the
49 newspaper in the last few days. So there's that winter
50

1 tick and other things. So whether we can address it
2 here or not, I don't know, but, yeah, definitely pay
3 attention.

4
5 Thanks.

6
7 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

8
9 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Billy.

10
11 MR. TREFON: Yeah, I just brought it up
12 so it could be the beginning of a -- something to start
13 looking into and thinking about.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any other -- I
16 think we have a pretty good list here to start with.
17 So if we don't have any other additions I guess we can
18 move on.

19
20 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

21
22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Frank.

23
24 MR. WOODS: On the caribou and moose
25 population at baseline, I just realized that, you know,
26 that I don't know of anybody that has a predator/prey
27 ratio or calf mortality in the spring that -- or in the
28 fall. I know we had the calf survival up until now,
29 but the -- I think real important is also the
30 predatory/prey ratio and on caribou. But also the
31 spring mortality for bears on land that -- where if
32 we're having a decline.

33
34 Thanks.

35
36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I think
37 we have a pretty good list that we have -- we've got
38 started. So if nothing else.....

39
40 MR. WILSON: Gayla's got her hand up.

41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Gayla.

43
44 MS. HOSETH: Thank you, Madame Chair.
45 Just for the record Gayla Hoseth.

46
47 I just wanted to make sure that this
48 list of your annual report is open to where you can
49 hear from tribal governments and all the reports that
50

1 are coming after to add to this list throughout this
2 meeting. Because we have some real important issues
3 that we're going to bring to the Council's attention.

4
5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: You are on the
6 list, you know, if you have reports that you want to
7 bring forth.

8
9 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

12
13 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
14 Chair. I -- yeah, I -- can we request that the list
15 stay open if there's other items that we choose to add
16 before the end of the meeting, please.

17
18 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

21
22 MR. MIKE: Yes, Madame Chair. You can
23 add to the list that we currently have the additional
24 items that you identified. We can add it later on in
25 the meeting before we adjourn.

26
27 Thank you.

28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I guess I have
30 a hard time hearing you so when you speak you need to
31 talk a little bit louder.

32
33 Okay. Ready to move on?

34
35 MR. WILSON: Yep.

36
37 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Let's
38 move on to -- I guess we're down to agency reports.
39 And the first one is the tribal governments.

40
41 And then we have -- if there's nobody
42 under tribal governments we have Native organizations
43 and that's BBNA.

44
45 MS. CARTY: Good morning, Madame Chair.
46 Courtenay Carty for the record. Curyung Tribal
47 Council, I'm the tribal administrator. Gayla Hoseth is
48 our second chief. Ashley Subsok is our environmental
49 assistant.

50

1 I guess I'll start with the four
2 fabrics of our tribe Curyung, the Federally recognized
3 tribe of Dillingham. In our logo we have culture,
4 subsistence, education and Native justice. And we
5 really feel -- I'll echo some of the comments I made at
6 the Federal Subsistence Board meeting in April that
7 Federal subsistence management system is really a forum
8 where these four fabrics that we try to weave into all
9 the programming that we do as the tribe comes together.

10
11 Our tribe has a long history of
12 stewardship for our resources in our region. And we've
13 been very active over time in subsistence co-
14 management, commercial fisheries management, very
15 active at the Board of Fish and Board of Game. And
16 just really our chiefs do an incredible job advocating
17 to protect our way of life here in Bristol Bay.

18
19 We're building a Natural Resources
20 Department right now as a deliverable through our IGAP
21 program. That's what Renee and Ashley are doing,
22 really trying to learn about the different resource
23 forums that our tribe engages in and build their
24 capacity as staff and us as an organization so that we
25 can maintain the advocacy in protecting our ways of
26 life and our access to our traditional food resources
27 not just as it applies to the Indian -- IGAP Assistance
28 Program.

29
30 And also just so that our -- we can
31 build our people, you know, not just the chiefs or
32 myself who have worked in this for, boy, almost two
33 decades now, coming to these meetings, hearing from us.
34 Sometimes I feel like I'll listen in and, boy, we just
35 had the same conversation about the Partners Program
36 that we had about 10 years ago at this same meeting.

37
38 So hopefully in time we can do that.

39
40 I guess I'll let Gayla talk a little
41 bit about some ANILCA stuff while I grab some paperwork
42 and come back right over.

43
44 Thank you.

45
46 MS. HOSETH: Thank you, Madame Chair.
47 For the record Gayla Hoseth and I'll put on my second
48 tribal chief hat for Curyung Tribal Council.

49
50

1 So at the Federal Subsistence Board
2 meeting we presented and we asked a question of the
3 Federal Subsistence Board when weighing in on proposals
4 to make sure that ANILCA is being followed. And we --
5 there was that positioning of caribou that was brought
6 on the floor two years ago during the wildlife cycle.
7 That failed at the Federal Subsistence Board with a
8 four to four tie vote. So therefore it failed. But we
9 had agencies that were voting with their regulations
10 within their groups and then with not following ANILCA
11 with how it's supposed to be followed if there's a
12 conflict it defaults to ANILCA for subsistence use.

13
14 We are still waiting for an answer from
15 the Federal Subsistence Board as to the questions that
16 we asked on the record, was who's responsibility is it
17 to make sure that ANILCA is being followed at the
18 Federal Subsistence Board level when proposals are
19 being voted on. And also if ANILCA is not being
20 followed who is to enforce that.

21
22 These are real issues that we have that
23 are being brought to the table for Federally-qualified
24 users and we want to make sure that ANILCA is being
25 followed. We are still waiting for an answer six
26 months later. And I don't think that is adequate
27 especially as us as a tribal government to be waiting
28 that long for an answer from the Federal Subsistence
29 Board.

30
31 And I guess as a part of your guys'
32 annual report we would like to include that during the
33 Bristol Bay RAC a request to present this during the
34 Federal Subsistence Board as a part of the annual
35 report for that request. And it's also on the record
36 with the dockets that we provided with our testimony.

37
38 So these are real issues and it just is
39 concerning to us as when these proposals are past
40 proposals that were voted on and agencies are sitting
41 on this Board, just with the -- you know, with the
42 lenses with just their regulations and voting on these
43 issues is concerning to us.

44
45 MS. CARTY: The majority of the rest of
46 the report that I have for you I believe will fall
47 under the Pebble agenda item. And I know it's getting
48 close to lunch so I'll just hold those comments for
49 that time.

50

1 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

4

5 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, thank you,
6 Madame Chair. Thank you for bringing that up too,
7 Gayla. I think that I would like to see that that
8 would be included on our annual letter. I think it's a
9 very valid request and I am rather appalled that your --
10 it has not been answered yet. I too have had
11 frustration in the past with the makeup of the Federal
12 Subsistence Board and the entities thereof and the
13 reasoning behind where they position themselves on a
14 vote.

15

16 So I think that that was an excellent
17 thing for you as tribal authority to do and I would
18 like -- I would like to express our concern about it as
19 well.

20

21 MS. HOSETH: If I can, Madame Chair.
22 And of course it's all on the recorder's record of the
23 discussion that took place. It was quite an event when
24 we were there in person as we were asking these
25 questions because you could hear a pin drop in the
26 room. It was pretty interesting.

27

28 MS. CARTY: If I may, Madame Chair.
29 Just a couple more things from the tribal perspective
30 of things to consider for the RAC and others in the
31 room is that we're the only tribe here today.
32 Oftentimes on the record at the RAC meeting us and a
33 couple others are the only ones there. We know that we
34 have a hard time getting public into the meetings and
35 involved. And it is sometimes very frustrating when we
36 put aside everything to make this our priority and then
37 we're the only ones here and then we don't get the
38 answers for the asks, you know.

39

40 Us as a Federally recognized tribe we
41 have unique government to government relationships with
42 all of the five Federal agencies that are represented
43 at the Board. And for us to ask for specific tribal
44 government to government consultation, request at the
45 Federal Subsistence Board and not specifically
46 regarding this ANILCA thing that Gayla just brought up,
47 but in regards to Pebble and an 810 analysis that I
48 said I'll get into again after lunch.

49

50

1 Our request was unmet by the Federal
2 Subsistence Board. We have not had a formal response
3 from anyone and I guess we would like to ask our RAC to
4 follow-up on that. You are our voice at the Board for
5 our region who has deference. We as the tribes of
6 course do not. And so I think we would really ask for
7 you guys to strongly advocate that when you do have
8 tribes who are participating in the process, we go to
9 the government to government consultation sessions.
10 I'm very thankful Mr. Dunaway got -- literally just
11 came into my office, okay, we've got consultation, I
12 don't know if you know about it, for this special
13 action 19-07. And we called in and we got that on the
14 radar, but sometimes things get missed and fall through
15 the cracks. So when we are there and attentive and
16 educated and doing our homework and putting meaningful
17 words and research into the record and then it goes
18 unrecognized and unresponded to, that's very difficult
19 to work through, to engage meaningfully in the process
20 when we're not getting that follow through.

21

22 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

23

24 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

25

26 MR. WOODS: Thank you for bringing
27 those issues forward because we I think -- I'm a new
28 Board member, I know the process, I know the
29 frustration sitting at the Federal Subsistence Board.
30 There are four entities that don't have the same
31 mandates that we do. Locally we represent the people
32 of Bristol Bay. We have laws and regulations that are
33 like you said, you're engaged, Gayla's engaged. We
34 have ANILCA, we have ANCSA, we have multiple layers of
35 bureaucracy. The problem I have is, you know, we end
36 up meeting about these issues over and over and over.
37 And because of it I think people get frustrated and
38 it's okay to be frustrated. It's okay to get totally
39 out of whack because if something happens. But if I
40 don't come to the problem -- if I don't come to the
41 table with a solution then I'll forever be stuck in the
42 problem. So if something needs to change at a Federal
43 level you got to start -- I don't know how this process
44 can, so one of the issues might be, okay, we need to
45 change regulations how we operate. That means the
46 coordinator, the RAC, the Federal Subsistence Board.
47 And if those need to be addressed, OSM or OMP might to
48 a FS -- no, I'm teasing.

49

50

1 (Laughter)

2
3 MR. WOODS: You understand what I'm
4 saying is that we live in a process world that it's
5 real -- it's new ground. And if we're going to start
6 making change let's make recommendations how to make it
7 better. That means your voice as a Federal subsistence
8 coordinator or operator or someone that has to deal
9 with the Federal Subsistence Board, this RAC is
10 mandated through this process. If we don't like the
11 process then show us where we need to fix it.

12
13 Those things are real important because
14 number 1, if they're already in place we have to know
15 that this process works. So I'll stop there. So if we
16 have an answer to the problem then I'd like to hear it,
17 not only from this Board, but at a higher level.

18
19 Thank you.

20
21 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

22
23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

24
25 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
26 Chair. Frank, and I agree with you and I -- what I am
27 hearing Courtenay say is that she needs our help on
28 this because she does not have the voice that we have,
29 but we can put some meat into what their ask has been
30 without a response. And I do think that they deserve
31 that and I do think that we should follow-up whoever --
32 which -- whoever represents us at the next Board
33 meeting needs to ask for accountability personally on
34 their behalf as well as our behalf.

35
36 Is that correct, Courtenay?

37
38 MS. CARTY: Through the Chair. Yes,
39 ma'am, or even highlight it in your annual report as a
40 concern that needs to be addressed. We're not asking
41 you, the RAC, to provide the answer to the Federal
42 Subsistence Board, we have made many recommendations
43 and will continue to do so. But to ask them to follow
44 through, that's what we want is a response. We're not
45 asking you to craft the response or feed it to them,
46 but to work with us and follow through on their Federal
47 responsibility to the tribes of Bristol Bay.

48
49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

50

1 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

4

5 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you, Madame
6 Chair. I think I heard Orville was on this morning.
7 You know, I hope you're not feeling too beat
up,

8 Orville, but I'm wondering is -- are you empowered to
9 help out on this or can you enlighten us a little bit
10 maybe what you can do and what -- if you need help from
11 us or just what on that?

12

13 (No comments)

14

15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Orville, are
16 you online?

17

18 (No comments)

19

20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Orville, you
21 know, he's our Native liaison, he's one that would --
22 number 1 help us. I feel your frustration and if --
23 you know, if things aren't being answered, if this --
24 we need to punctuate on. And who is supposed to be
25 responsible for this, you know, with the answer.

26

27 Gayla, did you have a comment?

28

29 MS. HOSETH: I did. Thank you, Madam
30 Chair. I guess the ask would be for the Council to
31 follow-up with what we asked at the Federal Subsistence
32 Board to make sure that ANILCA is being followed and
33 whose responsibility is it to make sure that ANILCA is
34 being followed. If ANILCA isn't being followed when
35 proposals are voted on then whose responsibility is it
36 to call it out at that meeting.

37

38 So those are our asks, that's what
39 we're waiting for and that's what we're asking for your
40 support in your annual report.

41

42 Thank you, Madame Chair.

43

44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Do you have
45 a.....

46

47 MR. DOOLITTLE: Tom Doolittle, acting
48 assistant regional director for OSM. When there's an

50

2

49 annual report obviously there's an annual report reply.

50

1 So something would be done, you know, in that reply.
2 Also the Board did listen to what people said and we've
3 approached the Solicitor, you know, for -- you know,
4 for some answers relative to -- you know, the take
5 issues on caribou relative to position to shoot. And
6 as you know that some Federal regulatory agencies have
7 different regulations that are set in place as for all
8 National Parks, National Wildlife Refuges and Federal
9 lands, that, you know, may be in conflict. And the
10 Solicitor at this time is not addressing that and that
11 that -- those questions to be honest haven't been
12 tested in court.
13

14 And so it's not that there has been
15 avoidance by the Board, it's just that it's bigger than
16 the Federal Subsistence Program and some of the issues
17 go beyond even the scope of the Federal Board, it goes
18 to actually some legal questions that are within the
19 Solicitor's purview. So not within the Board
20 specifically or the individuals on the Board or within
21 OSM. So I just wanted to make sure that everybody
22 understands the complexities.
23

24 But on a positive note this Regional
25 Advisory Council has looked at a position to shoot
26 issue, you know, that you've had in front of you and
27 you've, you know, made a position to bring in front of
28 the Board as a step. You know, looking at the
29 direction as the Board looked at unit 18 in a very
30 similar position to shoot issue that is now in
31 regulation already.
32

33 So I think that as you go on it's just
34 -- you know, the bigger question in the -- you know,
35 the 10 mile high issue is, you know, how far do -- you
36 know, when we get answers, you know, are we getting
37 where we need to go. And rather than looking at, you
38 know, that there's legal -- you know, whether there's
39 legal remedy or not. So that's something just to
40 consider.
41

42 Thank you, Madame Chair and Council.
43

44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Well,
45 thanks.
46

47 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
48

49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
50

1 MR. DUNAWAY: Well, thank you for that.
2 You know, I don't know if we can go -- start writing
3 letters to senators. But at the same time it's kind of
4 -- you know, we're still pretty small crews and I'd
5 hate to see Curyung or Sagamute or any of these other
6 folks have to go to court to battle the government to
7 sort this out. So I don't know, how do we build a fire
8 under these Solicitors. It kind of sounds like some
9 bureaucratic foot dragging to me. Now I'm sure they're
10 all over loaded, they all are, but you can hear a lot
11 of frustration here and it would be nice to know where
12 we can poke.
13

14 Thank you.
15

16 MR. DOOLITTLE: You are right now. I
17 mean, just by having the forum that you have and having
18 the discussion and having proposals that are addressing
19 this issue and having a Board look at those issues and
20 vote on them is moving the process forward. I think
21 the expectation is that, you know, some people would
22 like to see the brush go to all Federal public lands in
23 one brush, but at least it's being addressed region by
24 region, council by council, conservation unit by
25 conservation unit as a productive way forward. And
26 again we're a land of laws that work through a process.
27 And so again you're part of this process. If you think
28 that it'll be the first and last frustration that we --
29 that any of us have relative to the process of
30 bureaucracy, it's just -- but again you should be very
31 proud of what you've done. And also with the
32 discussion on why you're making these decisions because
33 it is all part of the record which is very important
34 for the decision process for any group.
35

36 So I really want to applaud the Council
37 and for BBNA and others that are bringing up these
38 issues because without those issues we can't move
39 forward. And so -- and it's all part of the public
40 process.
41

42 Thank you, Council, Madame Chair.
43

44 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.
45

46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.
47

48 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
49 Chair. It just appears to me that a huge piece of the
50

1 process isn't working. And it's one that I hadn't
2 realized until it was brought up in front of me minutes
3 ago. And I think it's my opinion that we need a
4 process to get this process piece in place. And if
5 it's going to be a process then it's going to be a
6 process. But I do think we need to move towards that
7 because I think it's a question that's written in
8 Federal law that actually deserves an answer and a
9 process to go through to analyze so we know who is
10 going to answer the question of who is responsible for
11 it.

12

13 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

16

17 MR. WOODS: No, I thank you, Nanci.
18 And I'm bad at names, but you're the director of OSM
19 for -- Office of Subsistence Management.

20

21 I understand the whole picture of
22 Federal subsistence. I sat there my very first Federal
23 subsistence meeting and listened to two Solicitors, the
24 Solicitor's Office and the State, argue for two and a
25 half hours about the same thing you're talking about.
26 Never got anywhere, it's never going to get anywhere.
27 What solution do we have to this, I have no idea. All
28 I know is if I'm part of the problem then I become the
29 problem. If I'm part of the solution as a new Board
30 member I feel number 1, frustrated. Number 1, I feel
31 put in a place where I don't have any answers. Number
32 2, I get attacked both politically, personally and
33 morally and ethically that these solutions aren't part
34 of the process.

35

36 So either we come up with -- maybe that
37 ought to be a recommendation to the Federal Subsistence
38 Board that we have an advocacy, some sort of a -- some
39 sort of a plan like Nanci said, outlines the process to
40 make it more user friendly for not only ANILCA, but for
41 the Federal Subsistence Board themselves. Because that
42 process hasn't been fixed since I've been -- and I only
43 -- I'm a young -- I'm a newcomer to this whole process.

44

45 Thank you.

46

47 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

48

49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

50

1 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
2 Chair. The other thing I would like to note on record
3 as well as a part of this process is the fact that we
4 have had in my opinion extremely low tribal
5 participation at the Federal Subsistence Board. I have
6 not been to a ton of Board meetings, but I've been to a
7 number of them and there's always a lack of tribal
8 participation. So for me it would be really, really
9 important to make sure to support the tribal
10 participation we are seeing at these Boards in order to
11 encourage other tribes to participate. Without the
12 answers to these questions and where we stand on ANILCA
13 I don't think we're going to get the participation
14 because you're going to get the feeling from the tribes
15 just like we're hearing in front of us right now that
16 they're not being heard and they're not being
17 acknowledged for the rights that are theirs by Federal
18 law.

19
20 And I just -- I think that that needs
21 to be pointed out.

22
23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

24
25 MS. MORRIS LYON: Courtenay wants to
26 say something.

27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Courtenay.

29
30 MS. CARTY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
31 Just following up on the process or policy. You know,
32 there are policies in place, the consultation policy,
33 our tribes through BBNA participated in developing the
34 consultation policy for DOI and OSM. And so those
35 policies are in place, they need to be followed through
36 on. It's that simple. Let's stop dropping the ball.
37 All of us are understaffed, every Federal agency, every
38 State agency, the tribes, we don't even have money to
39 come to these meetings. But we find -- I mean, I'm
40 obviously across the street right now, but when tribes
41 are carving out what little resources they do have to
42 send a delegation to a meeting or spend three days on a
43 teleconference because they can't afford to leave,
44 there needs to be some follow through and not
45 sugarcoating on the issue.

46
47 Thank you.

48
49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Gayla.

50

1 MS. HOSETH: Thank you, Madame Chair.
2 And just for the record I'm here speaking on behalf of
3 our tribe. As stated earlier BBNA was referenced, by
4 this is our tribal government portion.
5

6 But I guess, you know, just to
7 reiterate, we still haven't gotten an answer. This
8 isn't only a positioning issue, this is a statewide
9 issue for every proposal that is brought to the Federal
10 Subsistence Board for fisheries and wildlife and that's
11 what we're trying to address here. And it should be an
12 easy answer of following ANILCA. That's the charge of
13 the Federal Subsistence Board is to make sure that
14 we're -- when they're voting on these issues. And to
15 also remind everybody that a lot of these regulations
16 are sport regulations in the Lower 48 that we are
17 slowly trying to get regulation by regulation changed
18 to have our traditional ways of life recognized by the
19 Federal Subsistence Board as Federally-qualified users
20 and as tribes and tribal members.
21

22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
23

24 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
25

26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
27

28 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
29 Gayla, did you submit a letter with a lot of that and
30 if you did or you could provide us a copy that we could
31 attach might be helpful. It is a little interesting
32 thinking that, you know, we're here because of ANILCA
33 and yet I was thinking of other slow Federal processes
34 that have had some progress would be like Red Fish and
35 the Naknek. That took a long time, but it happened and
36 they're working on Pike Ridge boundary which is still
37 not done. Another one was the off road vehicles for
38 access from the -- like Lake Iliamna area into the
39 Preserve part of Katmai. In all those cases seemed
40 like we beat on the doors for a long time and then
41 finally it -- to say what Mr. Doolittle said, finally
42 somehow a door opened and things moved ahead. But,
43 yeah, I think maybe a letter showing what formally
44 you've done already, partly -- you know, every time I
45 try to write it down I don't have the whole language,
46 might help us.
47

48 Thank you.
49
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
2 other comments. Do you have.....

3
4 MS. CARTY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
5 That was actually going to be part of my report was it
6 would be helpful if tribes had the same opportunity and
7 maybe we do and just need to work through this, to
8 provide materials for the meeting packets just like the
9 State and Federal agencies do. If we could provide a
10 report to you so you have something written and could
11 be prepared as to what we're going to talk about when
12 we come here and get on the record. Everything we're
13 referencing is part of the public record through the
14 Federal Subsistence Board and the RAC meeting
15 transcripts which we've done our homework and pulled
16 back up so that we can restate or recite or provide
17 back to you.

18
19 Some of these I will cover what I
20 previously stated at the Federal Subsistence Board
21 later on on another agenda item.

22
23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
24 comments or questions.

25
26 (No comments)

27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Well,
29 thank you.

30
31 It's about 12:10, lunchtime. Do we
32 want to break for lunch? I see -- I hear yes and I
33 hear no. So should we just break for lunch for about
34 an hour and come back about 1:15?

35
36 MR. WILSON: 1:30.

37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: 1:30. Okay.
39 Let's break for lunch until 1:30.

40
41 (Off record)

42
43 (On record)

44
45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I'll call the
46 meeting to order and it looks like it's 1:28. And we
47 have Board members that need to be out of here by 4:30
48 so I'm going to be pretty strict on -- if we have our
49 reports 15 minutes long we'll make it to about our

50

1 future meeting minutes by 4:00 o'clock. So I will be
2 strict with the time frame of the reports.

3
4 And we're starting off with U.S. Fish
5 and Wildlife, Togiak National Wildlife Refuge and then
6 the Alaska Peninsula.

7
8 It sounds like the school kids want to
9 have public testimony. We'll make time for them.

10
11 Who's going to start off?

12
13 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: Come on, Robin.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We have Robin
16 Savo.

17
18 MS. SAVO: I'm Robin Savo. I'm the
19 youth rep for Bristol Bay. And I was just wondering
20 what considerations you had put in for the caribou
21 count this year. I've heard you guys talked about it
22 and I wanted to know what's -- what do you think is the
23 main cause of the drop in population?

24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Do we
26 have a caribou biologist here?

27
28 MS. WATINE: Good afternoon. This is
29 Lauren Watine with the Alaska Department of Fish and
30 Game.

31
32 To answer your question we don't have
33 any definitive answer as of right now as to why the
34 caribou population has declined since our last
35 estimate. But we are gathering more information on
36 adult survival and also our calves and trying to build
37 a picture of where the decline has occurred. It might
38 be a problem with the age structure of the herd and we
39 just -- we don't want to -- we don't want to make any
40 assumptions about a decline until we have the best
41 scientific information available and in front of us to
42 look at.

43
44 MS. SAVO: Do you ever consider
45 different ways of counting and making estimates?

46
47 MS. WATINE: That is a great question.
48 So we used to simply get minimum counts of a population
49 and put that into a mathematical model to tell us what
50

1 we thought the population might be sitting at. And in
2 2012 we moved to a different way of estimating the herd
3 population. We are still -- since 2012 we've been
4 consistently using this new method, but we are always
5 looking at new ways to try and assess the population of
6 this herd because there should always be a better way
7 and we should always be trying to improve our
8 understanding of what's going on in a given system
9 especially when we're dealing with species and
10 populations that are of such importance to our
11 communities.

12
13 MS. SAVO: Since 2012 has there been
14 any dramatic change since then or any change with the
15 amount of caribou that you guys count?

16
17 MS. WATINE: So our minimum counts of
18 the caribou population have changed and that has also
19 affected what our population estimate when this
20 mathematical model tells us. So we discussed it a
21 little bit yesterday, but the Mulchatna caribou herd
22 has traditionally before this big population eruption
23 that happened in the '90s where the herd was at 200,000
24 animals, before that period the herd was pretty
25 comfortably sitting at about 20,000 animals before
26 these periods of great population growth. So after the
27 herd declined in the '90s and -- the late '90s and
28 early 2000s, beginning probably around 2010 the herd
29 was sitting between 20 and 30,000 animals, but each
30 year that we were getting an estimate from 2012 until
31 2016 the population would increase by a few thousand
32 and then it would drop. And so it looked like the
33 population was trying to settle around this natural
34 number for it, but it never quite got there. And then
35 in 2017 and 2018 we weren't able to get a population
36 estimate. And so this past summer was the first time
37 since 2016 we could actually estimate the size of this
38 population. And we went from around 27,000 animals in
39 2016 to 13,500 in 2019.

40
41 MS. SAVO: And I was also just
42 wondering have any of the regulations changed since the
43 drop or increase?

44
45 MS. WATINE: As in since 2012?

46
47 MS. SAVO: Yes.

48
49 MS. WATINE: Yes. So we've been
50

1 sitting, and correct me if I'm wrong if someone knows,
2 we've been able to harvest two animals per person for
3 the last several years. There hasn't been a rule on if
4 it's a bull or a cow in the last couple of years as far
5 as I know, it was just two animals per person.

6
7 MS. SAVO: Do you think that maybe that
8 people may be harvesting cows more often than bulls and
9 that might be affecting the future population?

10
11 MS. WATINE: That is certainly a
12 possibility. Looking at our reported harvest we
13 haven't really seen that, but what has gone unreported
14 from various communities is unknown.

15
16 MS. SAVO: That will be all. Thank
17 you.

18
19 MS. WATINE: Thank you for your
20 questions.

21
22 (Applause)

23
24 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
25 you, Robin. Any other students?

26
27 (No comments)

28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: If not, we can
30 start on our agenda here.

31
32 Togiak National Wildlife Refuge.

33
34 MR. LARSON: Madame Chair, Cody Larson
35 here with Bristol Bay Native Association. I think that
36 we maybe skipped the Native organization on the agenda
37 there.....

38
39 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yes.

40
41 MR. LARSON:and I was hoping to
42 get 15 minutes for Bristol Bay Native Association.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We had this --
45 I thought we had this prior to.....

46
47 MS. MORRIS LYON: No, that was tribal
48 governments.

49
50

1 MR. WILSON: That was tribal.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Okay.
4 We'll start with that then.

5

6 MS. HOSETH: Thank you, Madame Chair.
7 Gayla Hoseth, director of natural resources for Bristol
8 Bay Native Association. And I'm here with Cody Larson,
9 our subsistence fisheries scientist. Sorry, we have
10 all these job titles. And I also have Heidi Kris, our
11 program activities coordinator here with us from BBNA.
12 And we won't take up too much time.

13

14 I just wanted to put on the record that
15 as BBNA with Curyung Tribal Council on the record that
16 we do support the ANILCA issue with the Federal
17 Subsistence Board as tribes come to us to help us write
18 proposals and we were helping Manokotak with that
19 proposal and through that process and we're stilling
20 following through with that. And we just want to make
21 sure that tribes are being heard at this meeting and at
22 the Federal Subsistence Board.

23

24 And with time constraints I'll turn it
25 over to Cody.

26

27 MR. LARSON: Thank you, Madame Chair
28 and Board members. I'm at your -- I appreciate to be
29 here and I appreciate your insight in all of these
30 issues and in the directive that you give to the
31 priority information needs that steer the FRMP funds as
32 Jared had spoken to earlier.

33

34 Right now we are partnering in three of
35 those FRMP projects and I just wanted to highlight some
36 of the progress so far that we've had on those.

37

38 So in 2016 there was a concern of
39 looking at the Togiak chinook harvest and health of
40 that population. And from that priority information
41 need it was then directed to the FRMP process and a
42 proposal was written and then this project was
43 selected. And so what I passed out there and Donald's
44 got a copy for the record is a synopsis of the chinook
45 harvest and assessment of the health using traditional
46 ecological knowledge and local knowledge in the
47 communities of Togiak and Twin Hills. And so that's
48 some of the results of -- a paper which is about 450
49 pages so I wasn't going to print a copy for each, but

50

1 that's available online as the synopsis leads you
2 there. And so that's a result of setting the priority
3 information need and sending it out for a project to be
4 done. So that one was just finished up.

5
6 There's another one that looks at
7 sharing networks on the Alaska Peninsula. And that
8 project had two years of data collection and now we're
9 synthesizing that information and writing a paper.
10 Actually tomorrow morning the group that's
11 collaborating on this is Oregon State University, the
12 Alaska Department of Fish and Game Division of
13 Subsistence and BBNA. And so we'll have a rough draft
14 be putting together tomorrow and probably have that
15 published I would say by the end of January or February
16 time frame.

17
18 That is an interesting -- very
19 interesting project for me and as Dan had mentioned
20 earlier in the meeting sharing is a huge component of
21 community well-being. And those are certainly the
22 themes that are coming out of this project in the
23 interviews with the elders and also through the
24 household, you know, surveys and open ended interviews
25 and things that it's something that is inherent in the
26 way of life, how people are just distributing the
27 wealth of resources without considering what they're
28 going to gain in return. It's something called
29 generalized reciprocity where if you've got enough for
30 yourself you're going to provide for others. And that
31 in itself provides for, you know, an equitable quality
32 of life within our communities. And that's really I
33 think a big component to subsistence and the sharing --
34 the focus on sharing. Well, typically there's not a
35 focus on sharing because it's something that just
36 occurs. But that part of subsistence in that it's not
37 a resource being harvested by an individual or even in
38 a household, it's at a community level and a regional
39 level is some of the themes that are coming out of that
40 project.

41
42 And so I'll be hoping to update the RAC
43 on that again in the spring.

44
45 And the third project I wanted to
46 highlight was one that was put forth as a priority
47 looking at the dolly varden migration and harvest and
48 traditional knowledge around that species in the Togiak
49 drainage and the drainage into the community of
50

1 Quinhagak. And so that's a project that's underway.

2

3 One of the interesting observations so
4 far in that project is, you know, last spring, Molly,
5 you had mentioned that there was a change in
6 the patterns of harvesting fish because of the lack of lake
7 ice. And so folks aren't able to do ice fishing in the
8 same way without the ice on the lakes. So in late
9 March last year we had scheduled field observation
10 trips to the communities of Togiak, Twin Hills and
11 Quinhagak and one of the observations that we were
12 hoping to do was look at people harvesting dolly varden
13 through the ice, you know, with rod and reel. But the
14 rivers didn't have ice either on the Togiak River or in
15 the Kanektok River.

16

17 And so something that I think will
18 probably be happening again is that, you know, the
19 patterns of harvest and the patterns of social well-
20 being through community -- family interaction. So some
21 families only get together during those harvest
22 periods. Some families only get together when they're
23 going to be fishing for smelt or fishing for Dolly
24 Varden. And when that activity changes or goes away
25 then also those social patterns go away within the
26 communities as well. And so, you know, the links to
27 community well-being and reliable patterns of
28 subsistence are very interwoven and that's the theme
29 that's coming out of that.

30

31 And it's also going to shift I think
32 methods and means. And in regulations that's -- we're
33 going to be coming across that as well, so the folks in
34 Togiak and Quinhagak aren't going without dolly varden,
35 they're shifting their methods and means. And so in
36 the springtime if there's no ice to fish through you're
37 going to be fishing off of shore or off of shore fast
38 ice and that means not going through a hole, but
39 possibly casting or, you know, setting jig lines or set
40 lines or something like that. There's going to be
41 different methods and means as these ecosystem shifts
42 start occurring.

43

44 And so I just wanted to, you know,
45 acknowledge Molly's observations from last spring and
46 also put forward some of the observations we've had so
47 far again this year.

48

50

2

49

I think I'll just stop at that.

50

1 But if anyone has any questions on
2 these projects I'm available like everyday, but if you
3 have any now I'll take them.

4

5 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

8

9 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, this is fascinating
10 what you're bringing up. And so have you seen
11 compensation, like did people take boats out to fish or
12 it's -- in a way maybe it's fortunate we're having this
13 study going on right when these changes are happening.

14

15 MR. LARSON: It's fortunate to see the
16 observations, it's a little difficult to schedule trips
17 around things where you're expecting to like document a
18 practice, but then the practice is changing right
19 there. So, yeah, some folks are using skiffs, others
20 are taking ATVs to the riversides rather than snowgoing
21 up the river itself. I know in Quinhagak there was
22 some big pattern changes with -- there was a beluga
23 harvest in the spring where typically they'd be
24 actually snowgoing out and hunting seals, you know,
25 three miles out on the ice. There was no ice to Sno-Go
26 out to seal hunt and so folks were then harvesting a
27 different species all together.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.

30

31 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

34

35 MR. WOODS: Thanks, Cody. It looks
36 like ADF&G's -- well, good partner, it says community
37 subsistence information system. Is that where the '16
38 and '17 surveys were logged? And then out of that,
39 amount necessary for subsistence use, is that part of
40 the picture when it comes to like -- I'm connecting up
41 here, you do great work that -- how do we recognize it
42 other than just in a report, putting that to use. You
43 know, just like you said conditions are changing. It's
44 like if we have a concern for chinook in the Togiak
45 drainage where our fisheries come up, we can actually
46 use that information. Right now it is, but for future
47 generations the amount necessary for subsistence, I
48 haven't heard that in a long time.

49

50

1 MR. LARSON: Right. Yeah, that's a
2 good question. I know that the data collection through
3 the household surveys will create, you know, a data
4 point to look at trends of usage and then also
5 contextualize usage. So that if there's a decrease in
6 the use of a resource it may be a pattern that there's,
7 you know, less need or perceived need say if there's
8 like less dog teams within a community or something.
9 But it also contextualizes if there's a decrease in
10 harvest because there's a decrease in availability.

11
12 MR. WOODS: Yeah.

13
14 MR. LARSON: And so I think that's a
15 good point to be made. As far as amount necessary for
16 subsistence or ANS, that's a State -- that's a State
17 regulation term and that's an analysis that I think
18 incorporates, you know, this data along with the other
19 years and trends.

20
21 MR. WOODS: Right. Thanks.

22
23 MR. LARSON: Yeah, so this would be a
24 component within that, yeah.

25
26 MR. WOODS: Thanks.

27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
29 other questions.

30
31 (No comments)

32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Seeing
34 none, do you have -- Gayla.

35
36 MS. HOSETH: Thank you, Madame Chair.
37 I just have one more thing to add and that is a
38 communication breakdown problem in tribal consultation,
39 government to government tribal consultation
40 opportunities. I think that the State of Alaska has a
41 good model that you could sign up at an email docket
42 and receive email notifications when these
43 consultations are available. And many of us have
44 brought this on the record at the Federal Subsistence
45 Board, but I guess following the chain that needs to go
46 to where we're actually being heard is coming here.
47 That when you hear Orville's reports on these proposals
48 even within our region and statewide when we have the
49 government to government consultation reports, there's
50

1 hardly any tribes that are participating. And I think
2 part of the problem is is because they're not having
3 access to know when these meetings are. And thank you
4 to Dan for -- he also contacted me at my office about
5 the Mulchatna caribou herd consultation.

6
7 So there's an email sign-up docket that
8 would be great, but it is a problem and it's sad when
9 -- I mean, we attend these meetings every year and
10 Orville hardly has anything to report on from tribes.

11
12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
13 other comments.

14
15 (No comments)

16
17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Is that -- are
18 you done?

19
20 (No comments)

21
22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Let's
23 move on to U.S. Fish and Wildlife.

24
25 MR. WALSH: I'm Pat Walsh from Togiak
26 Refuge and this is Andy Aderman. And if it's okay
27 we'll present these slides from up here.

28
29 Okay. Again, Madame Chairman, I'm Pat
30 Walsh and this is Andy Aderman from Togiak Refuge.

31
32 We were going to give a normal staff
33 report without a Power Point presentation until we
34 listened to all the discussion yesterday, particularly
35 from members of this Council, who were all relating how
36 they're seeing climate affects to the ecosystems that
37 they work in that we wanted to kind of touch on that a
38 little bit more than we normally would. And so with
39 this title we're not trying to put an ancient Chinese
40 curse on you, but these are very interesting times to
41 us and I can tell from what you people said yesterday
42 it's the same for you. So we're going to talk to what
43 we've learned in this past year and provide some
44 additional information.

45
46 We chose this title slide because
47 there's kind of a story going on here. What you can
48 see is us radio collaring a moose cow last year.
49 That's Neil Barton collaring the cow. And there's a

50

1 moose coming up very aggressive looking, that's a calf
2 coming to the defense of her mother. And that's a very
3 big calf. And it's a female calf too. And it's 470
4 pounds. And for that particular calf which is about 3
5 percent heavier than moose calves on Togiak Refuge over
6 the past 15 or so years counting both cow and bull
7 calves. So this is a calf in exceptional physical
8 condition at the end of winter. We've noticed this
9 same thing with other moose as well.

10

11 So give a bit of history on moose.
12 We've explained this before so we won't spend a whole
13 lot of time. Our moose population has been growing for
14 the last 25 or 30 years and it's continuing to grow.
15 We expected the growth to decline a few years ago, but
16 we haven't noticed that yet.

17

18 MR. ADERMAN: Well, with the recent
19 sort of poor winters where we don't have complete snow
20 cover, we're kind of at a -- that's traditionally when
21 moose are counted is when you have complete snow cover
22 and we usually don't get that until February, March.
23 So we started a project about three, four years ago
24 trying to count moose when there is no snow. And we've
25 had some success with it and we've used our radio
26 collared animals in sightability trials to correct for
27 the moose that we're missing. And these are blind
28 sightability trials. We did conduct another one of
29 those surveys just a couple weeks ago in 17A, I don't
30 have any results at this point to share with you, but
31 we're still trying to keep our finger on the pulse of
32 what moose are doing on the Refuge.

33

34 MR. WALSH: In addition to counting
35 them we've measured all the demographic factors that
36 we've talked to over the years and the -- to summarize
37 it moose on Togiak Refuge are bigger and more
38 productive than moose in most populations. There was a
39 study published in 2007 by Borchee and Andy was one of
40 the authors on the study that found that when you
41 compare Togiak Refuge moose with other populations
42 throughout the State, cows mature earlier, they have a
43 higher percentage of cows that calve, a higher twinning
44 rate, heavier calves. So everything about these moose
45 are exceptional. And it's -- you know, when you
46 combine that with these mild winters where you produce
47 these moose that come through the winter like we're
48 seeing here now, they're even more exceptional.

49

50

1 So what's the reason for moose being
2 bigger and demographically higher performing. Well,
3 it's diet. If you look at the amount of digestible
4 protein in the willow on Togiak Refuge and compare that
5 with other areas, and that's what this graph does, the
6 green line is Togiak refuge, the blue and red line are
7 other study areas in the State and on the axis over on
8 the far side that's the amount of digestible protein
9 which is important in moose diets. And on the bottom
10 axis is time, from June up through September, the time
11 that plants grow through the summer. And you can see
12 that throughout -- all summer long they all start from
13 a relatively high standpoint of digestible protein and
14 decline through the course of the summer. But by the
15 end of the summer Togiak Refuge is still way higher
16 than these other areas. And if you model this, those
17 same numbers into weight gain in moose, and that's what
18 this does, this Y axis shows lean body weight over time
19 that Togiak Refuge moose by the end of the summer are
20 still putting on weight and the moose in these other
21 areas have gone below that zero line so they're losing
22 weight. By September they're already losing a pound or
23 two pounds per day while Togiak Refuge moose are still
24 putting weight on.

25
26 So yesterday there was talk on
27 comparing 17A moose to unit 17B and C and Mr. Chythlook
28 made the point we have to look out and make sure that
29 the same thing that happened over on the 17A side
30 doesn't mirror what happened on the 17B and C side. So
31 if in fact what we're seeing here is the reason for
32 this, we're certainly following this, but it's probably
33 likely that over time the nutritional quality in the
34 plants on Togiak Refuge are going to go down and moose
35 on the Togiak Refuge side will be similar in physical
36 condition to those to the east.

37
38 So we're cognizant of that and
39 appreciate the observations we're hearing and we'll
40 keep you informed as we go through this.

41
42 So we've got moose that are really
43 abundant and they're in really good physical condition
44 and they've gone through these really mild winters
45 where they're just at the top of their game, how do --
46 how do wolves do. You know, wintertime is the time of
47 abundance for wolves normally, but this last winter we
48 found that the wolf weights that we measured and we
49 measured about 10 of them, were about 20 percent lower
50

1 than normal. The -- two of them were emaciated, one
2 had starved to death, four of them had porcupine quills
3 in them. Now over the last 10 years or so we've
4 handled about a hundred wolves on Togiak Refuge and
5 this is the only time we've encountered porcupine
6 quills. And I talked with a pilot who we fly with
7 regularly who's handled about 1,800 wolves throughout
8 his career and asked him how many has he encountered
9 with porcupine quills, he said only one.

10

11 And so this is anecdotal information
12 we're providing now, this is pretty convincing to us
13 that there's something really unusual going on. And
14 the first thing that probably is jumping into some of
15 your minds and it's the same with us is there must be a
16 rabies outbreak because rabies do affect wolves and can
17 cause this kind of behavior. So we tested one of the
18 wolf heads and it was rabies negative. And we removed
19 quills and collared wolves that we caught and continued
20 to follow their fate and they're alive and doing well
21 now. So they didn't -- it wasn't rabies that was
22 affecting wolves. What our guess is it was -- they
23 were being pushed through starvation to turn to eating
24 porcupines. And even though moose were super abundant,
25 moose were in such good condition based on these -- you
26 know, the fact that there's no snow that drug them
27 down, that this is what we're seeing and we've never
28 encountered this kind of thing before.

29

30 I'll get back to wolves here in a
31 second because there's some other stuff we wanted to
32 relay.

33

34 MR. ADERMAN: Just wanted to point out
35 over on the right side of the picture here is I think
36 17 different rivers that we monitor water temperature
37 in. And you'll see -- so over to the left there is --
38 or up on top is the temperature, but to the left is
39 colder and as you go to the right warmer. And the
40 Weary River just west of us here, that's the coldest of
41 the 17 rivers that we monitor. Up in the upper left
42 there's some blackfish that were -- probably died
43 because of warm water. And I'm not sure what the
44 bottom left is.

45

46 MR. WALSH: Yeah, what that is, that's
47 a graphic of Katlim Lake in 2015 where these blackfish
48 died. That's the warmest lake up there at the very
49 top. So we noticed that in blackfish then in 2015.

50

1 But we monitor all these rivers and so it's -- Andy
2 made a good point by pointing out the Weary River at
3 the very bottom. That's the coldest river that we have
4 and it's just outside of town here. In fact if you --
5 here's a map that shows Dillingham and it shows three
6 rivers, it shows the Weary there in the center and the
7 Snake River and the Igushik. The Weary River does not
8 have a headwater lake, the other two do. The Snake
9 River does, in fact there's a very big lake at the
10 Snake Lake and the Igushik River goes up in Amonka and
11 Ualik Lakes.
12

13 So go to Snake Lake that we monitor as
14 well. These are water temperature measurements done at
15 various depths in Snake Lake that drains into the Snake
16 River. And you can see this last year, 2019, the
17 temperature kind of jumped through the roof. It's way
18 up above 20 degrees centigrade. That's a temperature
19 that can be lethal to fish when they're in it long
20 enough. And you can also see in that year that there's
21 a real separation if you -- as you look at the levels
22 below that where they're not mixed as well as in the
23 previous years. That's because if you remember this
24 last summer when we went through this heat spell for
25 six weeks there was almost no wind. So this lake was
26 unmixed with very hot water at the surface, but plenty
27 of cool water underneath. So if a fish made it there
28 they'd have cool water to get to.
29

30 The problem is getting there. This is
31 a screen grab from a video clip that Kim Sands sent me
32 from a set-net skiff in the Igushik River and it's a
33 real bad picture, but what those are are dead salmon
34 that haven't spawned, they died to cross from the bay
35 up into the lakes. We saw the same thing in the Snake
36 River, but we also saw the same thing in the Weary
37 River. And the Weary River as Andy mentioned, that's
38 the coolest river we had. But these fish trying to
39 pass through this long period of slow moving tidal
40 water, many of them didn't make it. We did not
41 quantitatively assess what was there, it appeared to me
42 as I flew over it on several occasions that there were
43 thousands, but I can't really tell you what that number
44 was.
45

46 To get back to wolves, well, the wolves
47 that we put radios on actually survived through the
48 winter. I did not think some of them would, but they
49 did. And what you're looking at here, the red arrows
50

1 are pointing to den sites at three locations. The two
2 locations over to the west are both the same pack, we
3 call that the Ualik pack. There were two three year
4 old sisters that both had pups. The other pack that's
5 close to the Weary River, we call that the Snake Lake
6 pack. As it turned out the pack furthest to the west,
7 the pups there didn't make it. We believe they starved
8 to death. And the wolf then -- the mother wolf there
9 then joined her sister which is the one down near the
10 Igushik River and helped raise those pups. And they
11 did, they made it.

12
13 There's -- these are pictures in fact
14 that Lauren and I took.....

15
16 Yeah, Billy, go ahead.

17
18 MR. TREFON: My question is is that
19 just one wolf that's collared or is that numerous
20 number of wolves there?

21
22 MR. WALSH: Yeah, thanks. I'm going
23 through this faster than what's easy to follow. Those
24 are -- that's three different wolves that are collared,
25 the two mother wolves there from the Ualik pack and the
26 single other wolf -- the wolf from the other pack was
27 not a mother, it was one of the helpers, but it -- it's
28 traveled paths to find its territory. And that was my
29 point in showing that slide.

30
31 These are really hard slides to see, if
32 you had better definition you could probably see that
33 the wolves in that photo, the main photo that says
34 Snake Lake pack, appear to be older than the pup in
35 that one that says Ualik Lake pack. And I know that's
36 hard to see. But they were actually born at the same
37 time and in fact the Ualik Lake pack pups were probably
38 one day older than the Snake Lake pack pups. But these
39 Snake Lake pack pups seem to be developing faster.
40 Well, the red arrow is pointing to the den site for
41 that Snake Lake pack and all those lines are travel
42 paths between that pack and the Weary River. So what
43 that wolf's doing is going over to the river and it's
44 harvesting those salmon that died from that super hot
45 water and returning them home.

46
47 So the wolves that barely made it
48 through the winter now have an abundance of food that
49 climate change brought to them that they would not
50

1 normally get. Normally it would take another month or
2 more before the salmon reached their spawning grounds
3 and spawned out, but these were -- these were pre-
4 spawned salmon so the nutritional value per fish was
5 about twice as high as it was after they've spawned
6 out. In fact that was about a six mile distance so
7 that's a wolf leading the pups closer to the river and
8 they settled down where those blue lines are where they
9 were closer to the river and continued to feed on fish
10 for the next month.

11

12 So big changes in really everything
13 we're seeing just based on difference in temperature.

14

15 Let's talk for a second about caribou.
16 This is a photo of Nushagak Peninsula caribou taken in
17 March of 2015. It looks like it's October here, rather
18 than having three feet of snow and thick ice, there's
19 none that affect the caribou from being able to graze
20 there on the Nushagak Peninsula. The more they graze
21 the more lichen they eat.

22

23 MR. ADERMAN: Yeah, so the main picture
24 there, the green is blackberry plants or crowberry.
25 The brown spots are where lichens were growing at one
26 time and they get pawed down right to mineral soil and
27 it'll take a long time for lichens to recover. There
28 is lots of little bits of lichen there right now for --
29 I mean, it's not completely gone, but it'll take a long
30 time for it to recover. And this is down on the south
31 end of the peninsula, it's an area where caribou
32 traditionally winter especially in years where there is
33 good snow cover. I think it gets a little bit less
34 because of the wind and a little closer to the ocean.
35 But this is one of the more extreme sites, there are
36 areas you can find fairly good lichen cover, but it's
37 noticeably declined over the years since we started
38 monitoring.

39

40 And that's what's kind of shown in
41 this, this figure here. The vertical bars are the
42 population minimum counts summer and winter when we got
43 them. The curvilinear line goes through four red
44 vertical bars and those are lichen cover estimates or
45 percent lichen cover on the right side of the graph.
46 So in 2002 we had about 48 percent cover of lichen and
47 these are on lichen dominated sites. And then we
48 measured at five year intervals and you can see the
49 decrease where our last one was two years ago, we're
50

1 down to 30 percent lichen cover. And if that line
2 continues, I mentioned earlier that we were seeing an
3 increasing rate of declining cover in -- especially
4 between the last two surveys that that suggests that,
5 you know, within 10 years we could be down near zero.

6
7 MR. WALSH: Yeah, but is it possible
8 for caribou to drive it all the way to zero. Probably
9 not. And if you look at the example from Hagemeister
10 Island there's some information that can be applied to
11 the Nushagak Peninsula. Hagemeister Island was a -- I
12 think most of you here are aware of the reindeer on
13 Hagemeister Island that were established in the '60s
14 and then they grew to more than a thousand. They
15 overgrazed lichens and just about depleted lichens in
16 the early '90s. About a third of them starved to death
17 in the early '90s and we removed the remainder in that
18 same year. We then assessed lichens after that, we did
19 a very rigorous assessment in 2003 then followed it up
20 in 2015.

21
22 In 2003 we found about 22 percent
23 lichen cover and when we looked at it visually it
24 looked like it was still ungrazeable even though this
25 was a few years after all the reindeer had been removed
26 lichen was such -- of such short stature that it
27 appeared ungrazeable. It's increased to about 28
28 percent cover by 2015. That looks slightly grazeable,
29 but it wasn't when we first got there. And if you
30 model those two numbers out into the future then it's
31 going to take about 65 years before lichens would
32 recover on Hagemeister Island to their original state.

33
34 But anyhow the real point from that
35 lichen study is that lichens are about ungrazeable when
36 they reach about the 20 percent point, not when they go
37 to zero. And so we're just about there now. And so
38 we're working -- we've worked with the Nushagak
39 Peninsula Caribou Planning Committee for the last
40 several years because we've seen this coming. We've
41 been working to increase harvest, to lower the number
42 of caribou on the peninsula, we think that's still the
43 strategy to take. And we'll continue doing that. We
44 think it's likely that sometime within, we don't know
45 how long, the next decade, caribou are likely to leave.
46 And so if they do they'll likely join the Mulchatna
47 caribou herd. Maybe they'll return to the peninsula
48 and use it as a calving area in the summertime, we
49 don't really know. But following habitat there tells
50

1 us that the end is near for caribou to be able to use
2 the Nushagak Peninsula the way they have for the last
3 20 years.

4
5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Are we going
6 to be wrapping up here pretty soon?

7
8 MR. WALSH: Right now.

9
10 MR. ANDREW: Madame Chair.

11
12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dennis, you
13 have a question?

14
15 MR. ANDREW: Yeah. Thank you, Madame
16 Chair. Upon the Nushagak on the moose we do a moose
17 habitat where guys be cutting stuff down. Same thing
18 on (in Native). So that's working real good for the
19 moose for feeding them.

20
21 Thank you.

22
23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Is that
24 the end of your.....

25
26 MR. WALSH: That's it.

27
28 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

31
32 MR. WOODS: Just a quick comment.
33 Thank you, Andy and Pat, and the Togiak Refuge for
34 always presenting really good information that --
35 utilizing what we actually on the ground need.

36
37 Thank you.

38
39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Andy, what I
40 miss is your one page or two page summary of all the
41 resources that you normally give us. That's what I'm
42 missing.

43
44 And, you know, with your graphs there
45 would it be possible for you to give a copy of that --
46 of your report to Donald so, you know, he can give it
47 to the Board if need be, you know, if the Board --
48 because you have a good report there, you know, with
49 your graphs and it would be -- probably be useful for
50

1 the Board to have.

2

3 Thank you.

4

5 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan, did you
8 have a comment?

9

10 MR. DUNAWAY: Just for you here. I was
11 looking, there is kind of the standard report they
12 usually give to us on -- starts on 266. It's got all
13 their little programs and stuff.....

14

15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah.

16

17 MR. DUNAWAY:which like you say
18 has been wonderful. But the visual was really nice
19 today.

20

21 Thank you very much.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I guess
24 Alaska Peninsula, Becharof.

25

26 MS. ALEXANDER: Thank you, Madame
27 Chair, members of the Council. Susan Alexander, Refuge
28 manager, Alaska Peninsula and Becharof National
29 Wildlife Refuges.

30

31 I've just handed you copies of our
32 agency report which unfortunately is not in the book
33 this time. And I just want to give you a few
34 highlights. Togiak is kind of a tough act to follow.
35 But just to point out a couple things in the report and
36 then also a couple of things that have occurred since
37 the report was written back around the deadline for the
38 book.

39

40 Our Federal subsistence caribou hunt
41 continues to go along smoothly. It's a fairly small
42 hunt, but we did go through the process of consultation
43 with other agencies and Fish and Game and the public,
44 opened the season. One change this year due to some
45 clarification of intent between us and OSM is that the
46 first few years of this hunt we were running it as a
47 draw hunt. And we have come to understand that what
48 was passed by the Federal Subsistence Board was a
49 registration hunt, not a draw hunt so it is now being

50

1 administered as just a straight registration hunt.
2 Functionally I don't think that's making a lot of
3 difference in the number of permits that are being
4 given out because there wasn't a terribly high demand
5 in the first place. I mean, there was one draw for 9E
6 that I can remember where we had like 12 applicants and
7 gave out 10 permits.

8
9 So far this year both seasons for 9C
10 remainder and 9E opened August 10th. So far we've
11 given out two permits for 9C remainder and 10 for 9E.
12 And there hasn't been any harvest reported yet. Of
13 course a lot of people are hunting on the Refuge under
14 the tier II State permits which they're also allowed.
15 You know, those permittees are permitted on the Refuge
16 along with the Federal permit holders and the State
17 gave out just shy of 300 on the TC505, tier II caribou
18 hunt. So those permit holders also can hunt.

19
20 I wanted to give you a brief update on
21 staffing. It continues to not be good, but I'm
22 cautiously optimistic there's some hope on the horizon.
23 I did the math the other day for my supervisor and
24 right now our org chart is about 48 percent vacant. So
25 we're at about half staff right now compared to where
26 we were when I got here six years ago. And new
27 positions coming vacant are, I think I told you when I
28 was here before, a law enforcement officer was leaving
29 after being here a year. Deputy refuge manager's gone,
30 assistant Refuge manager is gone. Our law enforcement
31 person also handled our permits so those have been kind
32 of picked up by our visitors services folks and me.
33 But and of course our mammal position that I know is
34 particularly of interest to the RAC has been vacant for
35 over two years now in spite of my efforts to get that
36 filled.

37
38 A good deal of why this has been
39 happening is that Alaska Refuges as a whole have been
40 in the -- a very lengthy process of retooling how the
41 budget is divvied up between the different Refuges in
42 the State. That process is drawing to a close and I'm
43 cautiously optimistic that we will get to the end of
44 that process, there will be a new way of divvying up
45 the budget and that will cause an end to this holding
46 of almost all vacancies in the region. That was
47 supposed to be an interim thing while we got this new
48 process going and the new process has just taken longer
49 than anybody would have liked. So that mammal
50

1 biologist position is right at the top of my list for
2 positions that if I do get the blessing to go ahead
3 we'll be filling, I can promise you that.
4

5 That said, our HR Department is in the
6 middle of a big organization so that's another story.
7 But, you know, there will be at least a way forward I
8 hope because this is too long to be without a mammal
9 biologist.

10
11 Right now our Biology Department
12 consists of our supervisory biologist in King Salmon,
13 our pilot biologist is mostly a pilot, our avian
14 biologist who's in Alaska during field season in the
15 summer and Hawaii in the winter and a half a
16 subsistence biologist in Colorado because a half
17 subsistence biologist in Colorado is better than no
18 subsistence biologist at all. He's the one helping
19 with, you know, giving out the caribou permits and that
20 sort of thing. So he's, you know, doing as much as he
21 can from there.

22
23 So we're kind of cobbled together at
24 the moment which is why you're not seeing a lot of new
25 studies and particularly not a lot of mammal work
26 because we don't have a mammal biologist.

27
28 Frank, you look like you have a
29 question.
30

31 MR. WOODS: Maybe just a comment that
32 if you're short staffed I know that like partnering and
33 co-management agreements, whatever staffing you have
34 that we have different departments where I work and
35 I'll lobby for Forestry, if you got any Forestry money
36 we'd help prevent.

37
38 (Laughter)

39
40 MR. WOODS: But I'm just saying there's
41 different ways of dealing with a staffing problem
42 because we have to reinvent the -- basically I'm
43 speaking to the region as a whole that staffing is a
44 huge problem. So I'm -- I encourage you to keep
45 trudging along.

46
47 Thanks.

48
49 MS. ALEXANDER: Thank you. And I don't
50

1 want to make it sound like it's all doom and gloom, I
2 am optimistic that things will improve the next year or
3 two.

4
5 And thank you, Frank, that -- we don't
6 actually -- we don't have any Forestry money, but
7 partnering is -- I mean, even in the best of times we
8 all need to be doing that because none of us -- I mean,
9 we -- a number of people have said it since we've been
10 here. None of us have the resources that we would
11 really need to do the jobs we're supposed to be doing.
12 So we've got to help each other out.

13
14 One other small bit of good news that I
15 mentioned earlier yesterday is that we do have a new
16 officer coming, he's in training at the moment, but we
17 expect him here in May or June. And in the meanwhile
18 I'm bringing in -- detailing other officers from other
19 parts of the State to cover in particular our bear
20 hunts. As I mentioned earlier keeping an eye on the
21 commercial hunting guides is a high priority. And
22 those folks primarily do bear hunt, but they also do
23 some moose. So we're trying to keep that covered even
24 though we don't have an officer.

25
26 We have also been partnering with Fish
27 and Game in King Salmon to help -- kind of help them
28 out in that they need air support and they can help us
29 out in that they have more bodies available. So we've
30 been -- we've been providing some flight time and
31 they've been providing some additional surveyors and
32 between the two of us we're managing to cover their
33 trend use areas and ours.

34
35 So skipping ahead, we are -- we have
36 done two contracts in the last couple of years to
37 start. We all have obviously talked a lot about
38 climate change for good reason. We're -- we know there
39 has been vegetation change on the peninsula, I mean, I --
40 you know, we've seen it, you can see it in
41 photographs, we hear it from everybody, but we're
42 trying to start quantifying some of that, getting a
43 more detailed description of how it's changing both in
44 terms of vegetation and in terms of wetlands which of
45 course go together. But we did one contract to assess
46 change using a normalized difference vegetation index
47 in NDVI and then we've done another one looking at
48 wetland habitat change. And the NDVI one is almost
49 finished, we will have those results soon. And the
50

1 wetland habitat change, they'll be working on this
2 winter, they did the field work this summer.

3
4 So we're hoping to have a little bit
5 better understanding of the context that we're all
6 operating in for the part of -- and we just didn't do
7 the Refuge boundary we did kind of the Alaska Peninsula
8 adjacent to the Refuge as well. Since we only go like
9 two-thirds of the way across, there's that strip of
10 State and Native corporation land, we looked at that
11 also because it's -- this is done on satellite imagery,
12 there's no point in drawing a line right at the
13 boundary.

14
15 And also a climate change related item
16 is that we are continuing to monitor some lake
17 temperatures along the lines of what you saw on the
18 Togiak slides.

19
20 On the visitors side, this is another
21 one that I've mentioned to the Council in the past and
22 that is that we have been going through a process of
23 determining whether or not two new uses on the Refuge
24 would be compatible with the purposes of the Refuge and
25 the mission of the National Wildlife System and those
26 are commercial filming and guided wildlife viewing.
27 And we've just finished the 30 day public comment
28 period on that. We held -- well, we tried to hold
29 three public meetings, but we got weathered out of
30 Chignik Bay. And didn't get a lot of comments, most of
31 the comments we got were positive.

32
33 And the -- so both of those will be
34 determined compatible which basically just means that I
35 am then legally authorized to give somebody a permit to
36 do those activities. It doesn't mean it will be a
37 rubber stamp. Every permit application still needs to
38 be looked at critically for whether or not -- and
39 particularly in relation to the Council, whether or not
40 it will impact subsistence activities.

41
42 Part of the reason that these uses were
43 found compatible is that the level of demand we have
44 now is very, very low. I've probably gotten five
45 requests for each of them in the six years I've been
46 here. And it says every single place I could think of
47 to write it in there, that if that level of demand
48 grows substantially and of course what constitutes
49 substantially, but that there will need to be a

50

1 reexamination, that the only reason this is being found
2 compatible is because it's a very low level.

3
4 So I honestly had hoped to have
5 something more concrete than that, but we have so
6 little information to base -- to base a decision like
7 that on. Like back in the day something at McNeil
8 River said 10 people, I think 10 people sounds good.
9 And that's how many people you can take to McNeil River
10 at a time now and we don't have that anymore.

11
12 So this is part of what has prompted me
13 to want to start looking harder at visitor use on the
14 Refuge. We have some money set aside that I want to
15 find someone to partner with to help us develop a good
16 plan for how to use limited resources to get the best
17 understanding of, you know, let's -- we did in the '90s
18 a survey of visiting the villages with the specific
19 intent of talking to folks about where they're hunting
20 and fishing, where are they running into conflicts,
21 what are their concerns to be just better
22 characterizing patterns of use and looking for any
23 potential conflicts there as we go forward because if
24 conflicts develop either with these new usages or with
25 some of our existing uses. Guided sport fishing has
26 increased a lot. I don't know of issues there, but,
27 you know, so to be able to identify any emerging --
28 existing or emerging issues in that whole suite of
29 uses.

30
31 Couple of other more minor things.
32 Again in line with what a lot of other people have --
33 what others have observed. Our biologists when they
34 were doing some work over on the Pacific side noticed
35 that -- certainly, I mean, everyone is aware of the
36 situation with Chignik, but that all up and down the
37 Pacific coast of the peninsula streams were extremely
38 low or dry. And they tried to get some good
39 photographic evidence, documentation of that and share
40 that with ADF&G. They may have already done photos of
41 their own, but while we were there seeing that we
42 figured it would be good to at least have some
43 documentation of it.

44
45 And another initiative that we are
46 trying to move ahead with is that our supervisory
47 biologist this past winter did some training in hazard
48 analysis for invasive species, how to evaluate your
49 situation, determine what the risks are and come up
50

1 with some -- you know, we've been trying to be careful,
2 just follow general best practices, but this will
3 enable him to do a much more specific analysis of where
4 our risks are, what preventive measures do we need to
5 be taking, how should we be surveying to try to catch
6 things if they do get introduced, elodea being probably
7 the biggest concern there in our lakes.

8
9 And so we will be moving ahead with
10 that, to put protocols in place, both for our own
11 operation and for commercial operators that we permit
12 on the Refuge.

13
14 So that's everything I have unless the
15 Council has any questions.

16
17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

18
19 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

20
21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

22
23 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, thanks.
24 Thanks, Susan. I don't see in here, you know, on the
25 moose part of things I see where you're doing some
26 studies, but is there any numbers that you have this
27 year, you had of what the amount of moose, commercial
28 and traditional use was -- has been taken in the
29 Becharof National Wildlife Refuge?

30
31 MS. ALEXANDER: Those numbers are
32 compiled by Fish and Game and as far as I know we have
33 not received any of that information yet. So I'm
34 afraid I don't. The Fish and Game folks in King Salmon
35 would be the ones who would have those numbers for the
36 Refuge. So I'm afraid I don't have that information
37 from them yet.

38
39 MR. WILSON: Thanks.

40
41 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

42
43 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

44
45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank and then
46 Dan.

47
48 MR. WOODS: I guess the first question
49 on Richard's question, are those -- so those are State

50

1 managed hunts or -- I know that they have Federal hunts
2 over there too so I'm out of area and not familiar. If
3 you could maybe update?
4

5 MS. ALEXANDER: Absolutely. That's a
6 good question. It is a little confusing. The State
7 has primary responsibility for management of the moose
8 population on and off the Refuge. And they manage the
9 State hunt. There is in our area no Federal
10 subsistence moose hunt. There's a Federal subsistence
11 caribou hunt, but for moose it's all just the State,
12 yeah.
13

14 MR. WOODS: Thank you.
15

16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
17

18 MR. DUNAWAY: You mentioned invasive
19 species. I'm glad you're being alert to it. I keep
20 wondering right around Dillingham, I think maybe it's a
21 State highway project that we've come up with strange
22 weeds since that -- some of the work got done on Lake
23 Road. There's this thing I think it's called yellow
24 south, that stuff is everywhere. So I hope, you know,
25 you don't -- maybe you don't have any highway projects
26 where you are, but I wish the State was a little more
27 careful with that stuff.
28

29 Also speaking of hunts and conflicts, I
30 was just trying to call up maps of Becharof Lake,
31 wasn't it at one time, was it Severson Peninsula or
32 something like that that used to be a real
33 controversial -- isn't -- is it Becharof Lake got a
34 peninsula like that or somewhere over there there was a
35 big fuss going on for a while, but I haven't heard
36 anything about it in a long time.
37

38 Severson Peninsula is what separates
39 the main body of Becharof Lake from Island Arm. And I
40 know there was some controversy years ago around that
41 area and it -- I honestly have not dug back into the
42 records to see what it was about. I have -- none of it
43 has surfaced since I've been here. I've wondered if
44 perhaps it had something to do with the fact that
45 apparently one of the reasons Becharof was created as a
46 Refuge and I have heard people say this is true
47 although I don't know of any country documentation,
48 that bears den on islands and Island Arm. I don't know
49 if that has anything to do with the controversy in that
50

1 area, but Severson is of course right -- what is right
2 across the top of what creates Island arm.

3
4 So I'm sorry, I don't have very good
5 information on that one.

6
7 MR. DUNAWAY: I thought it might have
8 had to do with something more like caribou hunting or
9 moose hunting or something, but maybe you're doing
10 something right, it's not a problem anymore.

11
12 So the only other thing I was thinking
13 if you could make more of those positions that were
14 part of the time in Hawaii and part of the time in
15 Alaska you'd probably have to fight everybody off.

16
17 So anyway I enjoyed the report.

18
19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Anybody else.

20
21 (No comments)

22
23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
24 Next up is the Lake Clark National Park.

25
26 MS. FLEEK-GREEN: All right. Thank
27 you, Madame Chair and members of the Council for
28 inviting Lake Clark to make a presentation. For the
29 record my name is Suzanne Fleek-Green, superintendent,
30 Lake Clark National Park and Preserve.

31
32 For the sake of time I think I will run
33 through these slides pretty quickly and then leave it
34 to your questions. Also I want to highlight that we
35 did pass out this summary of Lake Clark activities that
36 you should have and I'm just going to highlight a
37 couple of things that are in this report to call your
38 attention to them and again feel free to ask questions.

39
40 I want to start talking about some of
41 the public access improvements that we've made over the
42 last year or so. One of our Secretary's priorities is
43 to improve access to Park and Preserve lands. So at
44 Lake Clark we have focused in the Preserve area
45 improving a -- what used to be a traditional trail and
46 still has been used, but was heavily grown over. We
47 brushed that trail and rerouted it to get it off
48 private property and back onto public lands.

49
50

1 So the Portage Creek trail opened this
2 fall, it's 3.4 miles. It goes to the top of the ridge
3 toward Lachbuna Lake and opens an area to better access
4 for hunting and fishing.

5
6 We also just opened the Joe Thompson
7 Public Use Cabin. This is a
8 historic cabin that has
9 been in Park property for a long time. This is to meet
10 one of the goals of our General Management Plan to open
11 up to five public use cabins again to facilitate
12 greater access and use of this area. We also are going
13 to go to a model so that subsistence users can reserve
14 the public use cabin free of charge. Otherwise to
15 members of the general public this cabin is \$45 a
16 night. It will be open for another couple of weeks for
17 those of you that might want to go see it. And then
18 depending on ice conditions, hopefully the lake will
19 freeze over, probably late January or February to use
20 over the winter and then reopen it again in mid May for
21 summer use.

22 I do want to say a couple of thank yous
23 for this project. We did consultation with tribes and
24 with Kijik Corporation on this, but we also had an
25 amazing partnership, Mrs. Chythlook, thank you for the
26 continued support from Bristol Bay Native Corporation,
27 that funds a teen trail crew for the last several
28 summers that comes and does work on trails around Lake
29 Clark. And then we have a cultural component where
30 they meet up with our Onk'Tazn culture camp around the
31 historic Kijik area. And we have a lot of elders and
32 youth that come together for two weeks. And so we
33 bring the trail crew in as well to overlap with that
34 camp. And I got to spend a couple of days with them
35 this summer, it's a wonderful experience and a great
36 way to transfer knowledge from our elders down to the
37 youth.

38
39 So a very appropriate topic to be
40 discussing here, these are just a few of the headlines
41 that we have all seen this summer. And this really
42 scratchy graph really just gives you a picture of what
43 we had seen in Lake Clark. We had a couple of
44 temperature monitoring stations at the outlet of Kijik
45 Lake and then also at the outlet of Lake Clark.

46
47 Oh, yeah, that does improve it a little
48 bit, but I won't be able to see my notes here. That's
49
50

2

49 okay.

50

1 But what you will see in this -- follow
2 the black line is that up until the middle of July when
3 we were recording data and this graph was made, we had
4 record high temperatures at those two monitoring
5 stations that crept dangerously close to the
6 temperature deemed lethal for salmon. They actually
7 did get above the temperature that starts to prove
8 hazards for spawning and rearing of salmon. It also
9 affected our ability to do our annual fish counts at
10 river mile 22. The fast melt created a lot of
11 turbidity in the river and so our count was very low
12 this year at that point. And we believe that some of
13 it was because you couldn't actually see the fish from
14 our counting tower. And we are looking at ways to
15 improve the technology. We do have a sonar on one side
16 of the river and we're trying to determine if we can
17 install sonar on the other side of the river as well so
18 that we can make sure that even in these conditions we
19 can have more accurate salmon counts. So that's
20 something we'll be looking to as we move forward.

21
22 I will note that if this black line
23 extended it would continue with the same pattern and
24 that we saw over 80 percent of the summer days being
25 higher on average than the next record high temperature
26 for both of our temperature monitoring areas.

27
28 A couple of the cultural resource
29 projects that we are undertaking. We just completed
30 the Respect the Land Chulitna Project which you all
31 have received copies of. We'll also be doing cultural
32 landscape reviews for the Kijik historic area and for
33 the Twin Lakes area. From our SRC we've always
34 received comments that they want the Park to support
35 the transference of knowledge of subsistence practices
36 from the elders and so this skin sewing and squirrel
37 snaring project is one of our Park responses to that
38 request. We just brought together a group of elders
39 and recorded their discussion of skin sewing practices
40 and we're trying to secure funding to take some youth
41 and some elders out this next summer to do a snaring
42 project so that more of the youth understand that what
43 used to be a very common practice and is not so much
44 any longer.

45
46 We started our (indiscernible)
47 archeological survey this summer and again we had a
48 very good partnership with Nondalton Tribal Council
49 where we did a local hire program to support that
50

1 archeological survey of the area. And we found four
2 new sites along the lake bed and will be continuing it
3 next summer at Tazimina.
4

5 And then we also in response to our SRC
6 and a number of the tribe's concerns about increasing
7 beaver populations are launching a new project to do an
8 aerial survey of beaver dams in Lake Clark as well as
9 water quality surveys to see if there has been an
10 affect below beaver dams on water quality as a number
11 of folks have thought is occurring. So we're going to
12 try and gather some data so that we can actually report
13 out with numbers whether or not that is an issue or
14 not.
15

16 And then again every summer we now
17 conduct our cultural camp at Kivik which is a great
18 success and so I wanted to highlight for any of you
19 that we would love to have your help in getting the
20 word out for the application process for that. That is
21 something that is done by NonDalton Tribal Council and
22 they usually put the applications out in April. So we
23 will let you know when that occurs. We try and get
24 youth from all over the region to come together for
25 that two week camp.
26

27 We also I wanted to highlight do a
28 number of local hires every summer for the Park and we
29 send those notices out to all the communities and the
30 tribes, but it is something that we are trying to put
31 more emphasis on so that we can have local hires across
32 all of our divisions at Lake Clark. So please also let
33 us know if you would like to get those notices, but
34 hopefully you are seeing them on your community
35 Facebook page, posted in tribal halls and other
36 locations.
37

38 And then lastly I wanted to follow-up
39 and use my time quickly here on a couple of things that
40 came up in the meeting. One, at the very beginning the
41 Federal waters question was brought up around the
42 Sturgeon decision and I just want to offer that the
43 Park Service would be happy to give a briefing at your
44 next meeting if you desire on the status of that
45 decision and the management of Federal waters within
46 National Parks because it is a moving target after the
47 Sturgeon decision. At this point waters within Lake
48 Clark have not been designated navigable so our
49 jurisdiction has not changed, but it's something that
50

1 could occur.

2

3 I also wanted to mention that the Park
4 Service along with Fish and Wildlife Service put very
5 extensive, 80 pages of comments, into the Army Corps of
6 Engineers on the Pebble Mine project and I would be
7 happy to send you a copy of those comments or you can
8 get them off the Army Corps site as well. We sent some
9 follow-up comments after our technical meetings on a
10 couple of key issues for Lake Clark at least having to
11 do with the migratory patterns of the local bear
12 population there, concerns that we had about migratory
13 dust coming from the road corridor as well as light
14 pollution into the Preserve side of Lake Clark.

15

16 So again happy to share those with
17 anyone who would like to see them.

18

19 And then lastly another pitch on youth
20 programs for the National Park Service. Every year we
21 do a partnership with the Student Conservation
22 Association to bring 12 youth from around the State
23 into what's called the SCA Academy Program at Lake
24 Clark. We always have one of these interns come and
25 work either on our fish crew or in our visitors center
26 and we really try and hire local youth who have a
27 traditional background in the area. Those applications
28 are now open and so if you know some young people that
29 would like a summer job with Lake Clark or another
30 Park, please direct them to the Student Conservation
31 Association website. And I can share that information
32 with Donald as well and he can get it out to the
33 Council.

34

35 And that's all I have for today.

36

37 Any questions?

38

39 Oh, I did also want to say before I
40 forget. We had a lot of smoke in the Park this year
41 and I want to thank the locals who really were the
42 early detection of those fires as well as the crews
43 that came and put the fires out in the Park and in the
44 neighboring lands. And we are looking to install a
45 number of air quality monitors because we were not well
46 prepared to assess the impact of that persistent smoke
47 in the Park either on our staff or the visitors and
48 residents that are using the Park resources.

49

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any questions
2 for Susan?
3
4 MR. DUNAWAY: What's her name?
5
6 MS. FLEEK-GREEN: Suzanne Fleek-Green.
7
8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Suzanne.
9
10 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.
11
12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.
13
14 MR. WOODS: I'd like to commend you on
15 your use of your SRCs because that's huge I think in
16 different regions. And, you know, I think you're --
17 the only matters that have reported SRC are utilizing
18 the SRC to what you're doing on the Park really
19 connects up with what I think this Board has for focus.
20
21 Thank you.
22
23 MS. FLEEK-GREEN: I will say it is the
24 highlight of our year, twice a year, to get together
25 with our SRC members and really hear what their
26 concerns are on the ground because they know the Park
27 better than we do frankly.
28
29 MR. WOODS: Okay.
30
31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.
32
33 MR. WOODS: So I heard you say you're
34 co-managing with different -- like the tribe there in
35 Nondalton doing different projects, working closely
36 with the village it sounds like. So, yeah, I'm trying
37 to connect.
38
39 MS. FLEEK-GREEN: I wouldn't call it
40 co-management although that's certainly something that
41 we could explore. We have created several memorandums
42 of agreement so that we can partner with the tribes as
43 well as Kijik Corporation to undertake projects.
44
45 MR. WOODS: And a second thing, the
46 smoke thing. I -- yeah. I really appreciate
47 addressing that because region wide, not just up in
48 Nondalton, but region wide, everywhere in Bristol Bay
49 was fully engulfed in smoke, up the Nushagak and that
50

1 has to be addressed. And I have to back off and not
2 joke about my day job because I joke too much, but that
3 is a huge concern for the region and impacts not only
4 for staff, but everything else.

5

6

Thanks.

7

8

9 MS. FLEEK-GREEN: Yeah, I think --
10 again we were all very surprised by the persistence of
11 the smoke and in the interior the hazard that that
12 created not just on the ground, but also for our
13 commercial operators and residents for flying
14 conditions. You would get into valleys that were just
15 much more choked with smoke than others. So we are
16 trying to do a better job of putting out public
17 information about smoke conditions and visibility, but
18 we also want to do it for air quality for public
19 health.

19

20

MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

21

22

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Billy.

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

MR. TREFON: Yeah. This occurred to me
this summer watching the water. Maybe we should start
looking into the evasive species because we got weeds
that I've never seen in Sixmile Lake before, I mean,
they almost look like rocks and the water's so thick.
Maybe se should start looking into that.

MS. FLEEK-GREEN: That is an excellent
point that our SRC has brought up as well as local
residents. I think there's a number of factors this
year that we saw low water levels early in the season
and then higher growth of Native plants that was really
choking up the lakes and the rivers that made access
difficult. We did send our natural resource team out
and they tested 20 different lakes in the Park and the
Preserve to ensure that it was not elodea which is one
of our primary concerns just because of the fast spread
of elodea once it gets to a location. None of those
did report any signs of elodea, but we have a new
process that we're undertaking called EDNA where we're
taking water samples, sending it to a USGS lab so that
we can definitely say whether or not there's any trace
of elodea in those lakes and water bodies.

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
you.

1 MS. FLEEK-GREEN: Thank you.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Next on our
4 agenda will be the Katmai National Park.

5

6 MR. HAMON: Madame Chairman, members of
7 the Council. My name is Troy Hamon, I am the natural
8 resource manager for Katmai National Park and Preserve
9 and Alagnak Wild River and Aniakchak National Monument
10 and Preserve. This afternoon we'll have a brief update
11 from our wildlife biologist, Leslie Skora, on seabird
12 activity.

13

14 And you probably want to hold off on
15 that because she's going -- Linda will be a little
16 later. And then if you can get the lights back on.

17

18 And then I'll give four brief updates
19 of information pertaining to things that have been
20 discussed here just so -- some things that you might
21 have a chance to think about. And then I'll give you a
22 brief update on Pike Ridge. And Linda Chisholm, our
23 subsistence coordinator will give you a briefing on the
24 unplanned road.

25

26 So we'll start with Leslie.

27

28 MS. SKORA: Madame Chair, members of
29 the Council. As Troy said my name is Leslie Skora,
30 wildlife biologist at Katmai. And I would like to
31 share with you a project that Katmai has been
32 participating in along with many of the other agencies
33 here and communities and that is the monitoring of
34 seabird die-off events. There's an information sheet
35 that's up at the beginning of the table.

36

37 Did you guys grab one of these sheets?

38

39 We can provide it.

40

41 So the monitoring of seabird die-off
42 events. Seabirds are a great indicator of ecosystem
43 health and function as they rely on zooplankton and
44 cold water fishes. So when extreme die-off events
45 occur this can indicate that there are changes in the
46 food system, food availability and/or something such as
47 harmful toxic algal blooms.

48

49 So Katmai has participated in

50

1 monitoring this along the Katmai coast and the past
2 five years we've seen high numbers of murre die-offs.
3 And we did not see that this year on the Katmai coast,
4 however there were high numbers of die-offs occurring
5 along the Bristol Bay side this year.

6
7 So this information sheet that was put
8 out by the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service goes into
9 detail as to what was discovered this year. But it's
10 also a good piece of information that can be passed
11 along as to what any members of the community can do if
12 they see dead seabirds along the shore, what to do, who
13 to contact, to help monitor the geographic extent of
14 the timing of these events that can go towards
15 monitoring conditions.

16
17 Thank you.

18
19 MR. HAMON: If there are no questions
20 for Leslie I'll move on with the next.

21
22 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

23
24 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Billy.

25
26 MR. TREFON: I'm not understanding.
27 I'm looking at these percentages here up on the right-
28 hand side, it says months and there are colors in it.
29 And it says 100 percent on the short-tail shearwaters.
30 Is that the death mortality or is that just number
31 counts?

32
33 MR. HAMON: I believe those reference
34 the composition of the dead birds. So that means that
35 of the birds that were found dead onshore they were all
36 that species in that case.

37
38 MR. TREFON: Thank you.

39
40 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

43
44 MR. WOODS: I have a quick comment.
45 Right along the peninsula I fished out of Egegik and
46 there was tens of thousands of those shearwaters
47 everywhere, unprecedented amount of numbers during the
48 whole season along the water, onshore and offshore.
49 And there were a lot of sick ones. So I try to
50

1 identify these birds and I just now realized that,
2 yeah, I'm glad somebody's paying attention because
3 there was unprecedented amount of numbers of those
4 birds out in the water. They -- and a bunch of them
5 really looked sick. So that's pretty good, I'm glad I
6 was able to identify that bird because it -- I could
7 not find it in -- I thought it was a murre or a gull or
8 a baby of some sort and I try to work through the -- we
9 have a migratory bird program and try to go through
10 that list. But I can reassure you that right -- the
11 bottom circle was a huge -- I mean, there was a huge
12 number of not only die-offs, but numbers of them that
13 were just unprecedented.

14

15 So thank you for the report.

16

17 MR. ANDREW: Madame Chair.

18

19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dennis.

20

21 MR. ANDREW: Hi. Thank you. Under or
22 over what Frank was saying that blue -- blue area for
23 the last couple of years, the locals and stuff, you
24 know, concerning geese and other birds and stuff, even
25 ducks. Boy, it's just been terribly lacking, hardly
26 any left.

27

28 MR. HAMON: If we're ready to move on
29 -- we'll -- I appreciate that update. We'll see what
30 we have about -- in the future that we can bring to
31 bear about other species. Most of our work is not on
32 the Bristol Bay side. In this case we do have some
33 fieldwork on the Bristol Bay side as a part of our work
34 in the classrooms. So that's where the Park Service
35 has been able to see some of this on the Bristol Bay
36 side. And I'm not sure if we have a mechanism within
37 our office to monitor the -- more of the game bird
38 species, but the Fish and Wildlife Service is more
39 likely to be active in that. But we can follow-up on
40 that and get back to you on the next one.

41

42 MR. ANDREW: Thank you.

43

44 MR. HAMON: A couple of quick updates
45 just from things that came up. Member Trefon's been
46 mentioning the interest in invasive species. Most of
47 that discussion was about the Mulchatna herd. And
48 we're not central in the kind of discussion as far as
49 our land mass that we manage so I didn't want to weigh

50

1 in. But I did think it would be useful for the Council
2 going forward to know what our invasive program is.
3

4 We have an exotic plant management team
5 that's terrestrial based. They spend time every summer
6 looking for new invasive plants in the park in
7 different places and Aniakchak. We don't get down
8 there every year with them, but we try to cycle
9 through. And they spend time every year trying to deal
10 with known infestations. Most of our known
11 infestations, in fact just about all of them, are
12 either in developed areas or vectors. So the Lake Camp
13 area right next to the end of the road and Brooks Camp
14 where we have a large number of active kind of movement
15 of people and gear. This is where we have most of the
16 species that we deal with annually.
17

18 We do have some places elsewhere in the
19 Park, but many of them are actually in-holdings where
20 we've negotiated with the landowner and they are happy
21 to have us come and help because we're trying to keep
22 things from spreading into the Park, including the
23 Battle River camps.
24

25 I would say that as far as terrestrial
26 plants for the most part on the backcountry areas where
27 we don't have a lot of activity we aren't seeing things
28 that are spreading rapidly across the landscape that
29 are from a human vector away from where humans are. I
30 will say that climate is changing enough that the
31 vegetation makeup is changing rapidly, but it's not
32 necessarily because we're bringing stuff there in that
33 manner.
34

35 And like Suzanne was talking about for
36 Lake Clark, we also have been part of this effort to
37 look for aquatic invasives as well. And we've been a
38 participant in some of those same efforts, trying to
39 get a handle on whether we have aquatic invasives that
40 are major known problems and then following up on ways
41 to monitor it so that we'll be able to tell that things
42 aren't showing up there in the future.
43

44 The thing about invasive plants though,
45 it's difficult to win every single time and that's kind
46 of the game you're playing. So it's a -- it's a hard
47 effort. So far we don't see a lot of them on the
48 backcountry landscape in our portion.
49
50

1 Couple questions have been -- are there
2 questions about the invasives before I move on?
3

4 MS. MORRIS LYON: My only question,
5 Troy, is -- there hasn't been any big wins then is what
6 you're also saying on the invasive side, correct,
7 because I do know of some in our area that have made it
8 in and.....
9

10 MR. HAMON: Haven't been any big wins.
11

12 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yes.
13

14 MR. HAMON: Well, I --so I would
15 actually defer to our BLM counterpart, Bonnie Million,
16 and.....
17

18 MS. MILLION: Oh.
19

20 MR. HAMON:because she was in
21 charge of the statewide program for the Park Service
22 for a while so she might have a different opinion about
23 what a big win is. I feel like constraining how far
24 they get is a big win myself.
25

26 Do you have any big wins? If you know
27 stuff you can't escape.
28

29 MS. MILLION: I know. Good afternoon.
30 My name is Bonnie Million, I'm the field manager for
31 the BLM's Anchorage field office. I'm going to take
32 off that hat though right now and answer this question
33 in terms of a position that I used to hold with the
34 National Park Service.
35

36 Big wins in the area. I know there
37 used to be a pretty decent sized orange hawkweed
38 infestation out on Kodiak. And that was taken care of
39 after a pretty long -- not long, but multi year
40 treatment event. There was also a purple loosestrife
41 infestation in Anchorage proper. And that was
42 controlled after many years of diligent hand pulling by
43 volunteers. And there's several other ones. It's
44 primary those, especially if you can catch an
45 infestation when it's still small in size, hopefully
46 that yellow sow thistle that you were talking about is
47 small in size.
48

49 MR. HAMON: Up and down the road.
50

1 MS. MILLION: Well, at least it's
2 contained to the road corridor. There are options for
3 treatment and I would encourage whoever the land
4 manager is for that to definitely take a look at it.
5

6 But it's -- it's definitely difficult
7 and it's definitely a long path. If you can catch
8 something early you have a much better shot. If you
9 don't you can still do something about it, it's just
10 going to take a little bit longer. But there are a lot
11 of tools in the toolbox.
12

13 And if the Council is interested we can
14 get in touch with I believe Gino Graziano is the State
15 extension invasive species specialist and I'm sure he'd
16 be more than happy to present on some of the different
17 efforts that are going on around the State of Alaska
18 when it comes to invasive species.
19

20 Thank you so much.
21

22 MR. HAMON: If you know stuff you can't
23 get away.
24

25 (Laughter)
26

27 MR. HAMON: One of the things that come
28 up a few times is the affect -- questions about the
29 affect of the high water temperatures on fish. I'm
30 going to just share a couple of observations from our
31 field experience this summer.
32

33 Most of -- and you saw this actually
34 from Pat's temperature graphs as well, most of the high
35 high temperature this year was in the first half of the
36 summer, it was extended, it was very bizarre. We've
37 had warm summers before, but I haven't seen anything
38 quite like this one. But that time frame coincides
39 with when the fish are migrating and migrating to the
40 spawning grounds. And so most of that time is not
41 necessarily spent where we have the best view of them.
42 We did not have a fish kill event like Pat saw on the
43 riverbank there.
44

45 What we do see on a warm year when the
46 water is warm later and when the salmon numbers are
47 high, is we will see a fish kill on the spawning
48 grounds and it does not have to be water warm enough to
49 be what people consider lethal. Warm water has less
50

1 oxygen, warm fish have a higher metabolic demand for
2 oxygen. And so a low water stream that's warm that has
3 a larger than normal abundance of salmon in it, they
4 can actually suffocate. They can breathe all the
5 oxygen out of the water. And the way that manifests is
6 they jump out of the water and they die on land. And
7 I've seen that two or three times in my 26 summers. I --
8 we did not see that this year.

9
10 And I bring that up because this was an
11 absurdly warm year. The only reason we -- and it
12 coincided with escapements in the Naknek systems of
13 almost three times the management objectives for the
14 Department of Fish and Game and those conditions are
15 perfect for having a huge fish kill if that temperature
16 spike is just later in the summer. And so in this case
17 that didn't happen, but it was that close. And I don't
18 have a solution to that, but I think it's worth being
19 aware of the circumstance.

20
21 Questions about that?

22
23 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

24
25 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

26
27 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci and then
28 Dan.

29
30 MS. MORRIS LYON: Just -- this is just
31 a comment on my part and just something for maybe the
32 bigger brains here on the Council can stop and think
33 about for the future as well.

34
35 One of the things I did, and this was
36 years ago when we had a couple warm summers in a row
37 and it was quite a few years ago, but they weren't to
38 this temperature change that we saw this year. But
39 back then I noticed on some of the smaller streams I
40 was using even for my sport fishing that it was taking
41 an inordinate length of time to revive the fish before
42 we released them and it was very obvious. And we quit
43 using those streams because just personally I felt it
44 wasn't a good practice for the fish and it was
45 stressing them too much.

46
47 But I wish we could come up or think
48 about a way to come up with a tool like that to put in
49 place on years like this because there's not always
50

1 that level of consciousness. I'm not -- and I'm not
2 saying I'm perfect, but it's something to think about.

3
4 MR. HAMON: That's a good idea, I
5 think. And that's reminding me of something else that
6 we saw very definitely in Katmai. And that is at
7 Brooks River during the height of the July migration
8 where we got the warmest days, we actually had a period
9 in the middle of July where there were no fish in the
10 river. And, I mean, there are times when we have more
11 and fewer fish that pass through the river so that part
12 you could explain away, but it was remarkable and it
13 was obvious to all the people that were there, my
14 staff, other staffs. So they avoided migrating up the
15 river during a major part of July when they would
16 normally be going by in great number.

17
18 The last point just of clarification
19 before I move on to a brief coverage of Pike Ridge and
20 that is just I talked with Susan after her -- after her
21 report and we just wanted to make sure that we were
22 clear. The Federal managers don't have a direct in-
23 season management of a moose hunt on the peninsula, but
24 there is a -- there are Federal subsistence moose hunts
25 in the Refuge and on our land at Aniakchak and Katmai
26 Preserve. The reason we don't have a direct in-season
27 management is because the moose working group wanted to
28 try to coalesce the management of these things so that
29 it was easier for people. So they're all managed under
30 the State registration permit system, but there are a
31 few differences where sometimes Federal hunters have
32 either a longer season or a bag limit that differs.
33 Whether it's a different restriction, I mean, in some
34 cases any bull instead of a spike fork 50, that kind of
35 thing.

36
37 And any questions on that?

38
39 (No comments)

40
41 MR. HAMON: Last thing is Pike Ridge.
42 So people -- members of the Council I'm sure are mostly
43 aware of the effort over long years. Pike Ridge trail
44 leaves the Lake Camp road from King Salmon to Lake Camp
45 and goes north along the Park boundary. And that Park
46 boundary was built in ANILCA in a manner that just of
47 makes it complicated. And it's been complicated for a
48 long time.

1 We've been working with our local
2 community to try to sort out a longer term solution so
3 that everybody's on good footing legally both for the
4 members and for us. We had a number of just informal
5 idea sessions, we drafted up every alternative that we
6 could imagine just as far as what the options were.
7 And we went through and threw out the ones that were
8 totally not feasible. We've started looking at
9 expanding on the ones that were feasible and some of
10 those are complicated and involve legal reviews and of
11 course the ones that are most useful are included in
12 that.

13
14 So as a result of that we are still
15 waiting for feedback from the Department. It's our
16 intention to follow it through because we've started on
17 this path, we're going to do what we can, but we do not
18 have a -- we don't have approval, we don't have
19 disapproval. Right now we have a -- we're waiting for
20 them and I'm not sure it's their highest priority. But
21 that's where we're at.

22
23 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

26
27 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Madame Chair
28 and thank you, Troy. I -- a couple of things, you
29 know, since I came to this country that Pike Ridge
30 thing's been a sore spot. I used to sit in a lot of
31 meetings over in King Salmon where -- and I think the
32 Park Service is making a good faith effort to fix it.
33 But it sounds like once it gets to the lawyers it takes
34 forever.

35
36 But you were talking earlier about fish
37 and so on. I was kind of anxious all summer that in
38 the past I think the Copper River has seen some die-
39 offs when you get this lots of fish and high
40 temperatures. And I was kind of relieved I never heard
41 of it there. Sounds like you've seen some other
42 places.

43
44 But I just got a question from Gary
45 Neilson over in Kokhanok just a couple of days ago.
46 He's -- they have high water, it's quite warm and he
47 says there's -- the gulls are feeding really heavy on
48 something. And he was asking me what -- if there was
49 like any sort of fry or hatch or anything. You know,
50

1 he's way over there, it would be just a wild guess on
2 my part. You're a little closer and know that country.
3 I just wondered if high water is loosening salmon eggs
4 or something, but he didn't see anything. And I just
5 thought that since you know that country a little
6 better than me if it could be a temperature related
7 thing or what.

8
9 MR. HAMON: I don't know the answer.
10 The primary active species in the fall are the
11 different char species that spawn and silvers and
12 that's -- I mean, in terms of things that we don't
13 know, silvers are at the top of my list as a salmon
14 biologist because they -- all their spawning activity
15 is now and who wants to be in the field now. And so
16 honestly we have relatively less information about
17 spawning activity in populations of silvers than we do
18 most other species.

19
20 So I would be interested in whether
21 it's silvers or whether it's char related, but if it's
22 in those numbers it sounds more like a sockeye related
23 thing. And in that case because I don't know because
24 we have -- I will say that I have seen some rivers this
25 month running at absurdly high levels. So I wouldn't
26 say it's impossible for scour to be bringing some stuff
27 out of the gravel. It seems like it would take a lot
28 though to manifest what you're describing.

29
30 I don't know.

31
32 It's interesting.

33
34 MR. DUNAWAY: He called it near flood
35 levels. Now when I lived in Dutch Harbor we had -- or
36 just after I moved out, maybe I was back and forth a
37 lot, and they had heavy, heavy rains in Unalaska and it
38 blew out in the Tecan River. You couldn't have moved
39 as much gravel with 10 dozers as got -- and it blew --
40 you know, two years later I was back and it had wiped
41 out the humpys, there were hardly any coming. But
42 again he couldn't -- he just said the gulls were just
43 in there going crazy eating stuff. And I reminded him
44 that char starts spawning sometimes now, but I'm
45 wondering if scour might be what's going on.

46
47 So thank you very much.

48
49 One other thing, Troy. You're the
50

1 first person that alerted me to invasive species
2 concerns years ago. And I didn't quite take you
3 seriously the first time, but the elodea issue and the
4 weeds and stuff we see around.

5

6 And so I know he's been ever vigilant
7 for a long time and I thank him for it.

8

9 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

12

13 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
14 Chair. Troy, I just too wanted to commend you on the
15 Pike Ridge Trail issue. We've all that live on that
16 side have been waiting not to be in the wrong when we
17 go to use the trail anymore. And I believe if I'm not
18 wrong, we're on our fourth superintendent, but you've
19 seen the whole thing through so please continue to do
20 so for us because we may hit number 5.

21

22 MR. HAMON: I will be there I hope.

23

24 (Laughter)

25

26 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

27

28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Bill

29

30 MR. TREFON: Just one comment about I
31 saw that post that Gary put out. And they do have
32 silvers over there in large numbers in Kokhanok area.
33 And at Sixmile this month I've seen schools of -- they
34 had to be red salmon, yet they're still trying to leave
35 the river yet this late in the season.

36

37 And that's not the only thing. I mean,
38 the birds are leaving late, the sea gulls are leaving
39 late, the eagles are still around. But they do have
40 silvers over there I know that in large numbers.

41

42 MR. HAMON: Yeah, one thing about --
43 Pat showed the temperature thermocline development.
44 One thing we don't know very much about is the extent
45 to which these fish can go hangout both on their way in
46 to preserve energy down where it's colder and they have
47 less metabolic demand, but also juveniles on their way
48 out. It -- I don't think we have enough history of
49 these kind of temperatures to know whether or not they

50

1 might go down there to relieve thermal stress before
2 they leave. I don't know the answer to that.

3
4 But our -- the rest of our report will
5 be from Linda Chisholm. She's got a couple slides to
6 show regarding the unplanned road.

7
8 MS. CHISHOLM: Madame Chair and Council
9 members. Thank you. I'll be speaking in my capacity
10 as the cultural resource program manager. And at the
11 last meeting the RAC requested some images and a map of
12 the unplanned road to help orientate as I'm discussing
13 our updates. So here's a map of the Brooks Lake area
14 of Brooks Camp. The unplanned road is the white
15 delineation on top of the aerial photograph here. And
16 it's approximately 110 feet long. You'll notice that
17 there is another track, a historic jeep route that
18 originally was located in that same area. And then
19 there are several house depressions with archeological
20 site XMK008 which is a 3,000 year old Arctic small tool
21 site.

22
23 So the next image here is what the jeep
24 track looked like. So historically this is how U.S.
25 Bureau of Fisheries accessed different parts of camp.
26 There's also if I go back a bit here you can see
27 there's also a track going up to the falls where there
28 was a fish ladder. And people today sometimes still
29 take their route if they're angling near the falls.

30
31 So here's the same aspect from this
32 former picture looking towards Brooks Lake. So you can
33 see that there is a gravel road on top of the historic
34 jeep track. And here is looking back towards the
35 north. So that pretty much encompasses the entire span
36 of that road.

37
38 We have been working with local
39 partners, Paug-Vik Limited and the Council of Katmai
40 Descendants to restore the action that took place here
41 in 2014. So our draft MOA right now consists of a
42 combination of mechanized and hand tool removal of the
43 road bed down to the Katmai ash layer which is the
44 protective layer from the 1912 eruption. All our
45 archeological resources are below that layer. And then
46 this activity would be done with the tribal monitor and
47 would be collaboratively undertaken by Park staff and
48 any of the signees on the agreement.

49
50

1 We will keep the restoration plan going
2 forth as a running agenda items with the Council of
3 Katmai Descendants and any of the signatories on the
4 agreement. And that restoration plan is still very
5 early in the works, but basically if I go back to our
6 maps some of our earlier discussion were thinking about
7 using this as an opportunity to discuss the history of
8 the area and specifically the Arctic small tool
9 tradition as we do not have currently exhibit
10 information on that particular occupation at Brooks
11 Camp.

12
13 We also are complete with a standard
14 operating procedure for compliance and consultation
15 that's very comprehensive and includes not only our
16 section 106, but also our NEPA and natural resource
17 regulations into a very comprehensive and annual
18 process.

19
20 We've already instituted changes in our
21 staff training and we've been working with the Council
22 of Katmai Descendants and BBNC to corporate culture
23 bears and folks who can appreciate and talk about the
24 history of Brooks Camp and the traditions and cultures
25 within Katmai.

26
27 We have plans to upgrade and improve
28 some of our waysides and exhibits, again going back to
29 that restoration plan, and also improving existing
30 exhibits. Some of you may be familiar with the
31 barabara or the cultural exhibit at Brooks Camp. And
32 so we'd be updating the language and images within
33 those exhibits.

34
35 And then finally to create
36 collaborative youth opportunities for local youth in
37 the park during the summers. So in a sense this is a
38 way to create some real culture change within the Park
39 and to strengthen and foster relationships with
40 important partners.

41
42 And if you have any questions I'm happy
43 to answer them.

44
45 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Billy.

48
49 MR. TREFON: With the purchase of the
50

1 Katmai land how is your relationship with BBNC?
2

3 MS. CHISHOLM: So one of the members of
4 the Council of Katmai Descendants is a board member
5 from BBNC and so we've been able to work with Andrea
6 Eggley as one of the speakers for our training in the
7 spring. And she's very active on the Council of Katmai
8 Descendants. And also in her capacity at BBNC too. So
9 she has to take and put on her different hats, but --
10 yeah.

11
12 MR. TREFON: Oh, so you got a good
13 relationship going on there.

14
15 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

16
17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

18
19 MR. WILSON: Thank you. Once again,
20 Linda, please don't forget to as you gather information
21 or want information, go to the local village councils
22 and the Native corporations there. The Katmai
23 Descendants are just a select few of people that have
24 chose to get involved and they don't really have a full
25 relationship with our tribes in the area. So if you
26 want the information that you're looking for, you need
27 to go to the tribes.

28
29 MS. CHISHOLM: Thank you. I appreciate
30 your comments, Richard, and I will make sure that we
31 follow your recommendation.

32
33 Thank you.

34
35 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

36
37 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

38
39 MR. WOODS: I'd like to thank Travis
40 for -- and the biologist for bringing information
41 forth. Thank you for your wonderful presentation.

42
43 The first bullet point up there I'd
44 like to comment on that the Lake Clark National Park.
45 You talked about that in the beginning of this, but you
46 represent.....

47
48 MR. HAMON: Katmai.

49
50

1 MR. WOODS:Katmai National Park
2 and Preserve which makes it really important because I
3 think the designation that you operate under is
4 prestated, correct. I want to point out that that
5 first bullet point talks about the removal of hand
6 tools in a MOU that wilderness designation disallows,
7 is that -- am I correct on that?

8
9 MR. HAMON: So in this case the use of
10 hand tools is not related to wilderness designation.
11 Brooks Camp is a developed area within Katmai.....

12
13 MR. WOODS: Yeah.

14
15 MR. HAMON:and that's where this
16 occurred. The combination of mechanized and hand tools
17 is that the area of the road which is not over known
18 sensitive resources, they intend to use mechanized
19 equipment to remove, but the area where it's
20 potentially impacting known cultural sites would be
21 removed with hand tools to minimize any potential
22 damage to the sites.

23
24 MR. WOODS: Okay. I get it. I'm going
25 to say I read the Katmai National Park and Preserve
26 Management Plan, it's probably four volumes thick, it's
27 pretty -- it's a special area because it's pre-
28 Statehood.

29
30 MR. HAMON: The complicated, multiple
31 -- the repeated additions to the original Katmai
32 Monument which was established in 1918 have made for
33 some very interesting, complicated sort of
34 jurisdictional patterns through time. So, yeah, that --
35 you -- you're not wrong if you read through a bunch of
36 our stuff. You have to know exactly where you are and
37 when it became Katmai to know which sets of things are
38 directly applicable.

39
40 MR. WOODS: Right. I applaud your
41 efforts and staff for that -- weeding through them
42 layers of tools I guess they call them. Because it
43 becomes a hinderance for us as users or locals too and
44 I'm just -- I'm just saying that, yeah, it's a whole
45 different animal and I appreciate the information. At
46 some point we'd -- maybe a good presentation, a outline
47 of where we're at with that. You know what I mean,
48 Travis, as a Board.

49
50

1 So I'll shut up, Richard, it's your
2 area. But I went up and visited and I know the area
3 and I know the rules enough to get in trouble.

4
5 (Laughter)

6
7 MR. WILSON: Sometimes it's better to
8 listen than to speak for me so.....

9
10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Do you
11 have any more?

12
13 (No comments)

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Let's
16 move on to ADF&G. We have ADF&G, BLM and OSM. But we
17 need the ADF&G now.

18
19 MS. WATINE: Good afternoon again,
20 everyone. This is Lauren Watine for the record. Again
21 I'm the Alaska Department of Fish and Game area
22 wildlife biologist here in unit 17. Out of respect for
23 the Board's time I'm going to try to keep this short.

24
25 And, you know, during the course of
26 this meeting I was largely thrown into the role of
27 caribou biologist and that's a huge part of what I do,
28 but I am not just a caribou biologist. I am also
29 responsible for managing moose, wolves, bears,
30 wolverine and other furbearers in this unit. You could
31 probably think of me more as a community wildlife
32 biologist rather than just species specific, but I have
33 to know a lot about a lot of critters to adequately
34 manage them.

35
36 So I think we went over a lot regarding
37 the Mulchatna caribou herd and we can discuss that more
38 if you wish, but I feel like I should give some
39 attention to some of the other critters here in unit
40 17.

41
42 Specifically we had our unit 17B and C
43 fall moose hunt not too long ago. We are still waiting
44 on some reports to come in. But as of right now we've
45 had 144 reported moose harvests for 2019. As some
46 members stated the first part of the hunt was pretty
47 low on harvest. In all of August there were 24 moose
48 that were harvested, but come September the remainder
49 of the season, 119 animals were harvested. Again we're
50

1 still waiting on final reports to come in. Some people
2 are late even though we do consistently ask please
3 report within five days of your hunt and within 15 days
4 of the end of the season whether you've hunted or not.
5 And that goes for all of our hunts.

6
7 We heard from Andy about unit 17A and
8 the Togiak National Wildlife Refuge moose population
9 which is doing well. There aren't really any concerns
10 about that beyond there might be too many. So we need
11 to work towards harvesting those animals in the manners
12 that they've recommended.

13
14 In terms of 17B and C moose, we still
15 are seeing a declining and reduced moose/calf survival
16 which is a concern which leads to some concern
17 regarding the size and stability of this population.
18 So we will continue to monitor unit 17B and C moose
19 because we do recognize this is a very important
20 resource for our community, especially in light of the
21 reduced caribou bag limit.

22
23 We had a lot of reports on bear
24 activity from our hunters on that moose -- fall moose
25 hunt. And quite a few people had reported a lot of
26 beaver activity and wolverines on the landscape. And
27 wolverines are somewhat surprising to us and it's all
28 very good information. So I would encourage you
29 anytime you submit a report to us about your hunt, if
30 you can report on any other wildlife sightings
31 informally, we would really like that information
32 because that helps us to track some other wildlife
33 trends that we aren't actively pursuing on the
34 landscape.

35
36 Now in December we will have our winter
37 moose hunt and that runs from December 1st through the
38 31st. And again as with every hunt we ask that if
39 you've received a permit you remain up to date with any
40 new information that might be posted on the Fish and
41 Game website or in our offices. We are doing our best
42 to post flyers around our office and in the city of
43 Dillingham and other local villages. And I will
44 discuss many of these topics that were brought up by
45 the Board today and yesterday when I go out and I do my
46 November visit/tour to the villages and the communities
47 to issue more licenses and permits.

48
49 So caribou and moose are usually the
50

1 two big species of interest to our communities. And
2 I'm happy to comment on more if you have any questions
3 about them and also other critters that I didn't go
4 over, but I just want to make sure everyone has time
5 and speak and do what they need to do today.

6
7 Thank you.

8
9 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

12
13 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Lauren. You
14 know, thinking of that food study that the Refuge was
15 showing and then I think about when I first got around
16 here and there's a moose on every sandbar up the
17 Nushagak and it's not like that anymore. When -- is
18 there any chance to be able to do a similar food
19 quality study in the area here and have something to
20 compare to. I'm wondering if food is part of the
21 issue. I know that when they did a study up around
22 Glennallen where heavily browsed areas that plants
23 actually start producing chemicals that make them less
24 appealing to the moose or less nutritional. And then
25 also are -- is the winter moose hunt registration, is
26 it open to sign up?

27
28 Those are my two questions.

29
30 MS. WATINE: So I'll address your last
31 question first. The winter moose registration permit
32 has been available to the public since October 25th.
33 So all you have to do is come into the Dillingham
34 office and show us your license or PID card and we can
35 issue that permit to you. To our communities,
36 Manokotak, Koliganek, Ekuk, and New Stuyahok, I will be
37 visiting them, each village, the week of November 18th
38 to issue those permits.

39
40 To your question about food quality, we
41 have a preliminary study that has been worked on and
42 seems as though it's going to be expanded in this
43 upcoming year. We've been working with the University
44 of Alaska to go out and look at food availability on
45 the landscape and try and come up with a unit wide
46 habitat suitability predictor map and use that to look
47 at habitat quality and food availability for moose and
48 hopefully we can also at the same time work on that for
49 caribou. So kind of knock out two questions in one

50

1 survey and research effort.

2

3 So when we have more solid information
4 on that I would of course present that to the Board and
5 our communities. But that is something that is of
6 interest to us and that we are working towards.

7

8 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

9

10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

11

12 MR. DUNAWAY: You also -- it was kind
13 of interesting at a time when Jim Wellington was here,
14 there was demands for studies and he didn't have money.
15 And then the ammunition sales skyrocketed and money
16 started flowing while Neil was here. How is that
17 funding, are you going to -- is it ongoing or are you
18 going to be able to keep doing some of this more active
19 moose work that has happened?

20

21 MS. WATINE: So there are funds to
22 continue this moose habitat study. As I said I think
23 it was this past summer they -- the university students
24 got something of a pilot study and so they were able to
25 look at I think it was 60 different sites up on the
26 Nushagak and they're hoping to expand that further.
27 And there's funds to expand this study to a larger area
28 of unit 17 because 60 plots along the Nushagak River,
29 while 60 plots is a lot it's very little for unit 17
30 which is a very large and very remote area. So in
31 terms of that we do have funds continuing for that
32 project.

33

34 For the moose calf survival study we
35 have going on, we will now be in our fourth year of it
36 this coming spring and we have put in further proposals
37 to receive more funding for that study because we still
38 need that information to help us to manage our moose
39 population.

40

41 So those two are the main studies we
42 have on moose right now and we still have money for
43 that as well as our usual survey and inventory where we
44 go and we collar adult moose. And run our surveys, our
45 composition surveys when possible, but that's always
46 snow dependent. So some years we're able to get our
47 moose composition and some years we're not. And most
48 years it's -- since Neil was here we have been able to
49 get a population estimate for B and C and that usually

50

1 occurs on alternate years.

2

3 MR.DUNAWAY: Yeah, I got the
4 impression the last year or so that Neil was
5 increasingly concerned about moose abundance in
6 general. And I was even wondering if we can even -- or
7 should we be worried of whether or not we're going to
8 have a winter hunt here. I'm glad to see the relative
9 success we had here for fall, but I just keep waiting,
10 is the other shoe going to drop or how's it looking to
11 you?

12

13 MS. WATINE: So that -- Neil was
14 concerned and we continue to remain concerned about
15 that population. The hunt is still open and we hope to
16 be able to get a survey in to look at our sex ratios of
17 the moose. And that will tell us more about a general
18 trend or a status of that population and if that hunt
19 should remain open or not. I would think -- I would be
20 cautious similar to how Neil closed the season or part
21 of the season in 2017, you know, the last couple years
22 it seems like that's been a consistent potential. So I
23 don't want to say it's going to stay open, but I also
24 don't want to say it will stay closed. We are primed
25 for -- if we get a good snowfall we're going to be out
26 and surveying that population to determine where it's
27 at and the sustainability of a harvest.

28

29 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

30

31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Bill.

32

33 MR. TREFON: Yeah, I was just thinking
34 about the number of fires we had this year. And in an
35 example of bringing moose population back fires are
36 actually a good way of getting the land back to where
37 the animals because -- McGrath is a good example. They
38 did a bear relocation program for many years trying to
39 get their moose population back up. It took one big
40 fire right outside of McGrath, and that burned up a lot
41 of country. And after that their moose population came
42 back so strong everybody in that community gets a moose
43 now, everybody including the young kids.

44

45 MS. WATINE: That is very true. So
46 fire is really good for moose. It brings a lot of
47 nutrients back to the soil that promotes the plants
48 that moose really like. And it changes the vegetation
49 composition of the landscape. And that's really great

50

1 for moose, but a lot of the times what's really great
2 for moose isn't so great for other critters. Fires
3 aren't exactly the greatest for caribou for the most
4 part. So it's a balance, it's a balancing act.

5

6 MR. TREFON: Just to be aware or look
7 into, I mean, after this year see if there's been an
8 increase in moose next year after the number of fires
9 we had statewide.

10

11 MR. BORDEN: Madame Chair, members of
12 the Council. My name is Lee Borden. I'm the assistant
13 area management biologist for the Division of
14 Sportfish. I'll keep it brief and just kind of give
15 you an overview of some of the work we're doing and
16 have done.

17

18 We've completed a two year study
19 looking at catch and release mortality of chinook
20 salmon on the Nushagak River. We are in the process of
21 writing the report, biometricians are going through the
22 data now. We have a preliminary mortality estimate for
23 Nushagak River. I again would like to emphasize the
24 word preliminary. Our biometricians are still
25 analyzing the data. But it appears to be around 6.7,
26 that's the number we have right now and until the
27 report is published that's what we're going to go with.

28

29 So keep your eyes out for that. I
30 imagine that will be published this winter. So I will
31 do my best to try and get that -- the word out that
32 it's been published so everybody can take a look at it.

33

34 We did a round of krill surveys this
35 summer, we are extending that into next summer. We're
36 going to try and do fisheries surveys of the main
37 chinook fisheries in the area. We have done the
38 Nushagak, we have done the Alagnak, that was this last
39 summer. Coming up in the summer of 2020 we will be
40 doing the Togiak and we will also be doing some more
41 work on rainbows over at Naknek. And but the big ones
42 for this Council definitely would be the Togiak work
43 next summer and then the Alagnak work we've done this
44 summer.

45

46 And that's it for me unless anybody has
47 any questions.

48

49 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

2

3 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
4 Chair and thank you, Lee.

5

6 I'm also wondering with your
7 permission, Madame Chair, if -- when he's done with his
8 report if we could see if Ralph's on the phone from
9 down at Chigniks to get a report on what their future
10 plans are, what they -- what their observations were
11 for the season and kind of a plan going forward from
12 those fisheries down there.

13

14 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

17

18 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you, Madame
19 Chair. Thanks Lee. It's going to be exciting to see
20 some of these results. I don't think you were here for
21 a little while before lunch and Curyung was giving
22 their presentation and maybe BBNA. But I was going to
23 in the -- when I was sitting over in your office I did
24 team up with some of the corporations and Federal
25 agencies on some of these, what do they call it,
26 fishery partnership projects. And I wanted to
27 encourage you to see if there's -- if one, if you see
28 some needs that could fit into that or if there's
29 opportunities to team up with other groups. I think we
30 were talking one of our big concerns is like king
31 salmon escapement, quality escapement and spawning
32 success say like in Big Creek and, you know, has to
33 have that Federal nexus. But if there's opportunities
34 to team up on these fisheries -- Federal fisheries
35 projects. Have you been talking to them or are you
36 looking for things like that?

37

38 MR. BORDEN: Yeah, thanks, Dan. Yeah,
39 we -- you know, we're always looking to find ways to
40 stretch what resources we have. That's definitely
41 something that's been on our radar. The work we're
42 doing this summer is pretty much contained within our
43 budget. Any outside of that scope of work we would be
44 definitely be interested in partnering with entities
45 that would be in line with what we're trying to
46 accomplish, yeah, for sure. And, you know, going
47 forward with budget issues with the State that might
48 become more of a route that would be taken, yeah.

49

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I
2 guess, Nanci, was the guy supposed to call in?
3

4 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
5 Chair. Yeah, he was on the line earlier. Ralph, are
6 you still available online, Ralph Renick?
7

8 MR. RENICK: Yeah, this is Ralph Renick
9 in Kodiak, out of Chignik there. I can give you guys a
10 brief update on what the 2019 season looked like if
11 you're interested in that.
12

13 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yes, I think that we
14 would enjoy hearing that.
15

16 Thank you, Ralph.
17

18 MR. RENICK: Okay. I didn't have any
19 time to prepare a formal report, we had some turnover
20 here, our manager actually left about a month ago. But
21 I do spend my summers in Chignik so I do get to
22 directly observe a majority of the subsistence fishing
23 that goes on in Chignik.
24

25 2019 was a fair bit better, just
26 slightly better than 2018. The weir was operational
27 June 1st and early indications looked very similar to
28 2018. Due to that we saw a lot of subsistence effort
29 early in June. We typically don't see much until July
30 and August. But we did see a fair bit in June and
31 subsistence fishing was a lot better this season.
32

33 The overall 2019 season was much better
34 than 2018 was as we all know. I'm sure you guys are
35 familiar with the disaster that happened last year.
36 But the early run did fail to develop again as
37 comparable to the forecast. We did end up with 346,000
38 early run fish, our goal is 350,000. So there was no
39 commercial fishing, but there was subsistence fishing
40 opportunities. Due to the lack of early run fish the
41 Federal fisheries manager did shut down subsistence
42 fishing to non-Federally-qualified users on June 26th.
43 And about 95 percent of the harvest in Chignik is by
44 Federally-qualified users. So it does have a small
45 effect, but not much of an impact.
46

47 Those Federal permits were issued by
48 the Federal fisheries manager and those residents at
49 the lake and the lagoon who are our biggest users were
50

1 still able to do subsistence fish for the entire
2 season. It did open up again to non-Federally-
3 qualified users on July 24th as our late run actually
4 did come in much stronger, about four times stronger
5 than it was in 2018. We had about 960,000 fish come in
6 on our second run. And overall the reports were fair.
7 People did for the most part get their subsistence fish
8 compared to 2018, got a lot more fish. We won't have
9 the official reports until the spring, but from the
10 reports we did receive it was much better. They had to
11 work a little harder than they have, you know, in
12 previous years when we have runs of, you know, a couple
13 million fish. But they were able to get their fish and
14 a large majority of the fish in June and then they do
15 have a late harvest on redfish in September that occurs
16 and those reports were very good. I got a couple phone
17 calls about that and those numbers were good.

18
19 Overall escapement was much better.
20 Again we didn't meet our first run goal, we were short
21 by about 5,000 fish, but the second run exceeded that
22 minimum escapement goal this year which was excellent
23 and we do incorporate an in-river run goal for
24 subsistence purposes. It was actually lowered last
25 year at the Board of Fish from 75,000 fish to 20,000
26 fish based on the ANS from the Subsistence Division.
27 But the minimum goal is 220,000 for the late run and
28 again we got 336,000 for escapement. And good
29 subsistence harvest later in the year in August and
30 September for those late fish.

31
32 Other than that I'd be happy to answer
33 any questions you guys have in terms of subsistence in
34 Chignik.

35
36 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you. Thank
37 you, Ross. I -- do you have any sort of a forecast yet
38 or any ideas or how you're going to proceed next year
39 for the subsistence fishery in particular?

40
41 MR. RENICK: Yeah. So we do -- we are
42 working on the forecast right now, it's pretty
43 unofficial. We usually have a formal forecast out in
44 December. I have seen -- gotten a sneak peak at it and
45 most of our -- it is a sibling relationship. Without
46 getting too much in the weeds here it is a forecast
47 based on the sibling relationship. Most of our fish in
48 Chignik are three ocean fish, particularly one/threes
49 for the first run and we've had a weak one/three age
50

1 class the last two years, in fact they were as compared
2 to -- or much like most of the Gulf of Alaska in 2018,
3 we were pretty missing our one/three age class and
4 that's why the run did not do well.

5
6 This year we had a stronger presence of
7 one/threes, but also a strong presence of zero/threes.
8 And basically our forecast is really based off of our
9 one/two ocean survival fish. If we have a strong class
10 of one/twos come back our forecast is much better. We
11 did not have a strong one/two class this year, we did
12 have a strong zero/three class. So we're -- again
13 without getting too much in the weed we're -- our
14 efforts -- we're looking at right now is doing some
15 research in the Black Lake area and trying to figure
16 out what's going on with that age class.

17
18 The forecast next year doesn't include
19 zero this year which is a good thing, but it is -- it
20 is fairly weak for the first run. And like 500,000ish
21 fish, typically it's 1.3, 1.4 million. And the late
22 run is about average, a little below average, but it's
23 800,000ish without giving away too much without the
24 formal forecast coming out.

25
26 MS. MORRIS LYON: Okay. Thank you.

27
28 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

31
32 MR. DUNAWAY: Ross, thank you very
33 much. That was hugely helpful because mostly what I
34 knew about Chignik amounted to a news cast from KLEG
35 about how things were looking like total disaster in
36 late June. I heard roundabout through some connections
37 from a commercial guy that they did salvage a season of
38 some sort out of it. So it wasn't a total -- the total
39 disaster of 2018, but you really helped a lot with the
40 information.

41
42 Thank you very much.

43
44 MR. RENICK: Yep. Not a problem.

45
46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Well,
47 thank you.

48
49 MS. MORRIS LYON: Lee, I just want to
50

1 say personally thank you because Lee was instrumental
2 in making sure that Ross would be on the phone for us.
3 And he did that via my personal request. So just thank
4 you for myself and I know the rest of the Board was
5 interested in it as well.

6
7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Let's take a
8 five minute breather and then come back and finish our
9 agenda.

10
11 (Off record)

12
13 (On record)

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: followed
16 by OSM.

17
18 MR. MIKE: Please find your seats.

19
20 MS. MILLION: Okay. Good afternoon.
21 Madame, Councilmen and -- Councilman, sorry, afternoon
22 sugar rush. My name is Bonnie Million, I'm the field
23 manager for the BLM's Anchorage field office. And with
24 me today.

25
26 MR. SEPPI: Hi, I'm Bruce Seppi,
27 subsistence wildlife biologist for the Anchorage field
28 office.

29
30 MR. GUSSY: Good afternoon. This is
31 Walker Gussy, I'm the Anchorage based law enforcement
32 officer/pilot for this area, all the way towards
33 Kotzebue and down south toward the Aleutian Chain, the
34 whole area.

35
36 MS. MILLION: So the whole area. Our
37 field office covers about 24 million acres of BLM lands
38 and it does stretch from north of Kotzebue all the way
39 down to Kodiak and the Anchorage bowl area. So we
40 cover quite a distance.

41
42 I did want to thank the Council so much
43 for allowing us to speak today and apologize, I realize
44 that the BLM has not been present at this Regional RAC
45 in the past and I am here with my team today to let you
46 know that we are planning on participating in the
47 future.

48
49 We pulled together this little one page

50

1 and hopefully everybody's got a copy of it. It's a
2 summary of some of the accomplishments our staff
3 completed this past 2019 field season. I apologize
4 profusely about the photo on the front, I did not
5 realize at the time that I chose that photo that
6 caribou was such a hot topic item for this RAC. And so
7 that was very insensitive of me and I apologize for
8 that. I just thought it was a very cool photo.
9

10 So that's really the length and breadth
11 of the presentation that I had. If you have any
12 questions about the accomplishments or if you have any
13 ideas or questions I'm more and happy to research them
14 and come back and prepare to present to the group in
15 February.
16

17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

18
19 MS. MILLION: You might have got off
20 easy.
21

22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Do we
23 have questions for BLM?
24

25 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
26

27 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Maybe because
28 you hadn't been here for so long we'd forgotten about
29 you.
30

31 Dan.
32

33 MR. DUNAWAY: Well, thank you for being
34 here, Bonnie. I think Dan Sharp, didn't he use to come
35 and spoke well for you. But I'm -- I got your name,
36 Bonnie, and Walker earlier, but I missed your name,
37 sir.
38

39 MR. SEPPI: It's Bruce Seppi. I'm a
40 wildlife biologist/subsistence coordinator for
41 Anchorage field office.
42

43 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. Welcome. And.....
44

45 MR. SEPPI: Thanks.
46

47 MR. DUNAWAY:I think we have a
48 few square miles here and there that are BLM, but it's
49 really nice to know that you're -- and then when was --
50

1 was Glenn Chen part of your group or.....

2

3 MS. MILLION: No.

4

5 MR. WILSON: BIA.

6

7 MR. DUNAWAY: He's BIA. Okay.

8

9 Thank you.

10

11 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

12

13 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

14

15 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, thank you.

16 Walker, I'm very excited to hear that you're going to
17 be working out in the area too and I'm just wanting to
18 know -- I'm assuming you're going to be in coordination
19 with some of the other Federal agencies as well and
20 covering all sorts of things, not just BLM things. Is
21 that a possibility?

22

23 MR. GUSSY: Yeah, thank you. Walker
24 Gussy with the Anchorage field office.

25

26 Yeah, two main messages I wanted to
27 share here today. First is who I am, get my face out
28 there, say hello to everybody. The second is that I am
29 coordinating with the Fish and Wildlife Service here in
30 Togiak and the State Troopers and everybody else.
31 We're trying to build those bridges of communication
32 and get all of that happening a little bit more
33 efficiently.

34

35 So I have business cards for everybody.
36 If you could take them back and hang them in your post
37 office in your rural villages I'd appreciate it. And
38 there's another point to that. Oh, the main point.

39

40 So you talked a little bit about law
41 enforcement earlier today and yesterday. Probably the
42 biggest messages I can share to make our law
43 enforcement efforts productive is timely reports. They
44 need to come in accurately and as soon as possible. So
45 that's -- whether it's the State and you call the
46 wildlife safeguard number on the back of your sport
47 regs or contact one of the Federal agencies we'll -- we
48 will pursue it. That's the message.

49

50

1 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

2
3 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

4
5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank and then
6 Dan.

7
8 MR. WOODS: Yeah, I got a comment.
9 Thank you for showing up because I've been involved in
10 this since '09, I'm 10 years old. So I -- the
11 heartburn I hear from the villages and that overzealous
12 enforcement without education is really huge. That --
13 it kind of puts a rift so people have a hard time
14 reporting is that makes sense. That they don't comply
15 willingly, but they comply because of different avenues
16 of -- you know, in the past. And since we're a young
17 State, 1959, I'll go back to the oldest standing
18 resource user in the room, but that process has been
19 kind of ironed out, that we work closely with
20 enforcement in our region and I thank you for showing
21 up here. Because I see yellow -- a whole bunch of
22 yellow on BLM property.

23
24 I thank you because number 1, that
25 compliance issues are huge, but also the secondary or I
26 think is the most important is the education part of
27 enforcement, that people comply with -- willingly and
28 they don't have a bad taste in their mouth because of
29 enforcement. We need rules and we need these rules and
30 regulations in place to help manage a resource. And I
31 think the flip side of that is people have been -- how
32 do I put, we've had overzealous enforcement to make
33 that taste kind of go away working with enforcement up
34 until this point in time. So it's really important as
35 you're young that we work -- we work with you and BLM
36 and every Federal officer that we want to educate
37 first. And that comes with compliance just like you're
38 talking about.

39
40 Thank you.

41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

43
44 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, that's a good
45 point, Frank. I think a lot of people are better able
46 to comply when they know why.....

47
48 MR. WOODS: Yeah.

49
50

1 MR. DUNAWAY:and that's where the
2 education. And sometimes people -- some few need a
3 little more education than others.
4

5 But I also had a question, do you --
6 I've been looking at this map with the little yellow
7 spots. Is there some kind of a general -- is there a
8 way you could generally discuss what lands you cover or
9 when would be the time to get ahold of you, that kind
10 of thing?
11

12 MR. GUSSY: So feel free to get ahold
13 of me at any point that you want to have a conversation
14 is the first part of that.
15

16 The second part of that is primarily
17 I'm only going to deal with lands that are yellow on
18 your map. So if Mr. Moos contacts me, Kenton Moos, or
19 the Fish and Wildlife officer out here requests for
20 assistance, my supervisor's right here, I am pretty
21 sure she's going to support me assisting them.
22

23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Well,
24 thanks for your presence. See you next time.
25

26 MS. MILLION: Thank you so much.
27

28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. OSM.
29 We're getting fewer and fewer audience here.
30

31 MR. MCKEE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
32 Again for the record I'm Chris McKee, I'm the Wildlife
33 Division supervisor at OSM. I know Tom Doolittle has
34 gone to the airport real quick to check in. I think he
35 was going to plan on covering some of this, but
36 depending on how quick you go we'll see if we get done
37 before he gets back or not.
38

39 So I just want to quickly go over a few
40 highlights, specifically, you know, the 2019 Federal
41 Subsistence Board actions, some OSM staff highlights
42 and then finally an update on OSM staffing.
43

44 So at the Board -- Federal Subsistence
45 Board's April, 2019 fisheries regulatory meeting the
46 Board took action on 19 fisheries regulatory proposals
47 analyzed by OSM staff. The Board also implemented a
48 system of temporary special actions to cover approved
49 changes to the regulations until they were published
50

1 officially in the Federal Register. The Board also
2 took action on one nonrural proposal, one fisheries
3 special action request and three requests for
4 reconsideration.

5
6 At a July 19th, 2019 teleconference the
7 Federal Board took action on three wildlife temporary
8 special actions. WSA 19-03 which dealt with unit 13
9 moose and caribou, they rejected that request. WSA 19-
10 05 which dealt with unit 10, Unimak Island caribou and
11 they approved that request with a modification to allow
12 for a limited bull caribou hunt in that area. And then
13 WSA 19-06 which dealt with caribou regulations dealing
14 with the Fortymile caribou herd and they approved that
15 request.

16
17 At the Board's August, 2019 public work
18 session the Board reviewed the Regional Advisory
19 Councils' nominations and charter package and this
20 package has been submitted to the Secretary's Office
21 after being reviewed by the special assistant to the
22 Secretary's Office and the USDA Regional Forester.

23
24 Also the Federal Board took action on
25 three further temporary wildlife special actions. One
26 was WSA 19-01 which dealt with unit 18 moose which they
27 approved. Another one was WSA 19-02 dealing with unit
28 2 wolves which they also approved. And then finally
29 WSA 19-04 which dealt with unit 23 moose and they
30 approved that request with modification.

31
32 And the Board will take action on two
33 further temporary wildlife special actions, WSA 19-07
34 which deals with the Mulchatna caribou herd which we've
35 talked about extensively at this meeting. And WSA 19-
36 08 which deals with ptarmigan in unit 13 echo. And
37 again that meeting, that teleconference is going to be
38 on the 5th of November.

39
40 The Board also reviewed two Federal
41 Subsistence Program informational videos entitled How
42 to Submit a Proposal and How to Become a Member of the
43 Regional Advisory Council. We're going to be doing
44 additional videos on how to submit special actions and
45 how to request a cultural educational permit. And the
46 existing and future videos are available for viewing on
47 the OSM Facebook page, our actual OSM webpage and also
48 on YouTube. So I encourage you to check those out
49 because those are kind of new for our program. And
50

1 we're kind of hoping to expand that kind of audio video
2 way and expanding it on social media is kind of a way
3 to get out, you know, kind of what we do as a program
4 to people in a larger viewing area in a way that
5 people, you know, tend to find more informative and
6 appealing in a video aspect.

7
8 The Federal Subsistence Board has
9 scheduled the following meetings for the upcoming year.
10 One, they're going to have a Federal work session and
11 Board retreat on January 28 through the 30th. That's
12 going to be held in Anchorage. And at that meeting the
13 Board will address the Fisheries Resource Monitoring
14 Program and under other agenda items that we're still
15 working on.

16
17 And also on April 20th to the 24th of
18 2020 is when the Board is going to have its wildlife
19 regulatory meeting to make -- take final actions on the
20 proposals that you guys acted on here and along with
21 the other Regional Advisory Councils. And that is
22 going to be held in Gakona.

23
24 So that's the first time we've ever
25 held a Federal Subsistence Board regulatory meeting
26 outside of Anchorage to the best of my knowledge
27 certainly in the decade or so that I've worked here.
28 So we're kind of excited to do something a little bit
29 different and kind of bring the Board out closer to the
30 users and hopefully get some attendance from folks that
31 maybe not -- might not have come into Anchorage during
32 a -- you know, the regularly scheduled, located Board
33 meeting. So we're kind of excited about that.

34
35 So in terms of what we've been doing
36 the last -- over this past year, 55 wildlife proposals
37 have been analyzed by OSM staff and are being --
38 currently being presented to the affected Regional
39 Advisory Councils. You've heard analyses results from
40 a few of those proposals in your area at this meeting
41 obviously and the Federal Board will take action on
42 these proposals at that April, 2020 meeting in Gakona
43 that I just mentioned.

44
45 Anthropology staff conducted analyses
46 on 10 customary and traditional use determinations
47 proposals for the southcentral, southeast and interior
48 Alaska regions.

49
50

1 So far this year OSM staff have also
2 analyzed eight wildlife temporary special action
3 requests. And I mentioned all of those and along with
4 the final action on those last two at our -- at the
5 upcoming November 5th teleconference.

6
7 Wildlife staff also analyzed 17
8 wildlife closure reviews and they were presented to the
9 appropriate Regional Advisory Councils, Suzanne went
10 over the one that was relevant for your region. And
11 the Federal Subsistence Board is going to take final
12 action on those closure reviews again at its April,
13 2020 meeting in Gakona.

14
15 Also OSM Wildlife staff made comments
16 on 46 different Alaska Board of Game proposals with the
17 potential to affect Federally-qualified subsistence
18 users for the southcentral and southeast regions. And
19 we are currently working on comments for the western
20 Arctic, western region and the interior and eastern
21 Arctic regions as well. So there's a lot of potential
22 proposals in those regions so we're going to be pretty
23 busy.

24
25 One Federal subsistence chinook salmon
26 fishery was restricted by the Federal Subsistence Board
27 through the temporary special action process on the
28 Kuskokwim River and two Federal subsistence chinook
29 salmon fisheries were restricted or closed through the
30 emergency special action process this season, one on
31 the Situk and the other on the Stikine River.

32
33 Two Federal subsistence sockeye salmon
34 fisheries were closed through Federal actions,
35 emergency special actions, due to low return this
36 season, one in the Chignik and also on the Stikine.

37
38 The Stikine River after the in-season
39 run assessment prompted an automatic closure through
40 the Pacific Salmon Treaty due to no harvestable
41 surplus.

42
43 Our Native liaison, Orville Lind, who's
44 been on the phone with us during the meeting has
45 conducted numerous consultations with the 149 Federally
46 recognized tribes and 10 regional corporations. He
47 conducted 10 tribal engagement sessions and also worked
48 with high schools in four different regions throughout
49 the State with the goal of increasing awareness of the
50

1 Federal Subsistence Program and its objectives.

2

3 As you may know in 2017 the Board
4 adopted a new policy on nonrural determinations and in
5 the spring of 2018 the first call for proposals to
6 change nonrural determinations was issued. OSM
7 received a proposal from the southcentral region and
8 the Federal Board determined that the proposal met the
9 threshold requirements at its April, 2019 fisheries
10 regulatory meeting and the Board has directed the staff
11 to proceed with the full analysis. This analysis will
12 go before the Board for final action at its January,
13 2021 meeting.

14

15 OSM staff is drafting a best practices
16 document to be finalized in 2019. This document will
17 provide general guidance for data requests exchanged
18 between the State of Alaska and OSM.

19

20 And also OSM outreach and informational
21 booths are scheduled -- one took place at the AFN
22 annual meeting. The BIA providers conference that's
23 going to be coming up and as well will have the booth
24 there, I believe that's at the beginning of December.
25 And several regional corporation annual meetings.

26

27 One of the primary functions of the
28 Regional Advisory Councils is to provide
29 recommendations to the Board on the take of fish and
30 wildlife on Federal public lands. The -- this past
31 regulatory cycle, the fisheries cycle, the Board
32 received 20 fisheries proposals and with one being
33 withdrawn by the proponent. The Board accepted the
34 majority of the Council recommendations in whole or
35 with modification on 18 of 19 of the officially
36 analyzed proposals which is a 95 percent acceptance
37 rate.

38

39 And I say this all the time, but I just
40 wanted to emphasize it again at another Council meeting
41 on the record is that the Regional Advisory Councils
42 are really where the rubber meets the road for this
43 program. It's a bottom up, user driven program. And I
44 can't thank you enough for all the participation of all
45 the Council members and emphasize just how critical
46 your recommendations are to the Federal Subsistence
47 Board in making its decisions. Because in my almost 10
48 years here at OSM I can think of only maybe a handful
49 of times in which the Board went against Regional

50

1 Advisory recommendations. The recommendations you make
2 on proposals at these meetings are critical and really
3 drive the program. So I just wanted you to know that
4 we do hear the voices of the Regional Advisory Council
5 members and how important you are in this process.

6
7 And, boy, talk about perfect timing, I
8 just got through with my end of the report and now here
9 is Tom Doolittle to talk about OSM staffing. It's
10 almost as if we planned this.

11
12 MR. DOOLITTLE: Board and Madame Chair.
13 And of course we're a well oiled machine at OSM. And
14 so we really wanted to kind of give you kind of the
15 bigger picture update of the program.

16
17 You know, the first thing I always like
18 to do and I've been going to as many Council meetings.
19 I went to, you know, to Northwest Arctic up in Kotz and
20 then got down here this week. So I've been trying to
21 hit two a week and get over, but, you know, my first
22 and foremost is that I want to thank you because you
23 volunteer to come to the plate all the time on behalf
24 of your region and the Federal Subsistence Program.

25
26 And so, I mean, you are the heart of
27 what -- why we exist. We're a bottom up program and
28 this is where the regulations are formed. And I don't
29 know if Chris put it in his report, but, you know, the
30 Board actually listens to you guys about 95 percent of
31 the time. And that's pretty good odds especially if
32 you're playing baseball.

33
34 And so the -- you know, so with that,
35 yeah, go RACs. So I want you to understand, you know,
36 from the bottom of my heart, understanding the time
37 that you spend out of your private time with all the
38 issues that you have from your region and bringing
39 forth good thought and assisting our process because
40 without it our program couldn't exist.

41
42 The other part about it is seeing all
43 the assistive, you know, staff members, you know,
44 people on the phone, Federal agencies, our State
45 partners, you know, our citizens and everybody that is
46 here that actually helped facilitate and kind of add to
47 this big machine that we call subsistence in Alaska.
48 And I have to admit it, this winter it will start to be
49 the 40th anniversary of ANILCA. Our -- which is, you
50

1 know, starting to look at many years so it's starting
2 to be a -- you know, I think we started to create a
3 bureaucracy around that so I've been told by
the
4 Regional Advisory Councils over the State. But again I
5 -- we thought that, you know, one of the most important
6 things about, you know, having our meetings is that
7 every once in a while we need to be in rural Alaska.
8 So, you know, being in Dillingham, we had Council
9 meetings up in Point Hope this year, in Cold Bay,
10 McGrath. So we are trying to within the confines of a
11 reduced budget to still kind of get out there to be
12 able to do that.

13
14 This year's Board meeting on the 20th
15 of April will be in Gakona, in the interior. And so
16 again right in the heart of Katie John country. And so
17 I want you all to know that our ability to make fish
18 and wildlife regulations, you know, through our process
19 is still alive and well.

20
21 And so that's what will be coming up to
22 our fish cycle and a proposed rule will go in for that.

23
24 But again I think that the main part of
25 subsistence that we really need to thank and get out
26 there is the people that actually are using the
27 resource, all the constituents that are out there, all
28 the people that are still Federally-qualified users
29 that are out there, you know, using the resource,
30 bringing that to you. It's important. And also making
31 sure that we build healthy RACs and that we keep
32 recruiting people, young, seasoned people that are --
33 that have been around the ropes and really to encourage
34 that application process for our Regional Advisory
35 Councils.

36
37 OSM right now is about 13 staff members
38 down, from 44 to about 31. And it's -- so we are in
39 this new change and I think you heard from Susan
40 Alexander about her Refuge being at about half staff.
41 And we're not quite as bad as that so I was like, oh,
42 gosh, thank goodness we're not some of the Refuges
43 right now.

44
45 And the fortunate thing is that I feel
46 that, you know, I have a staff, a core staff that is
47 still in the program. We don't have a lot of depth
48 left, but it -- I have some of the best staff I could
49
50

2

49 ever want. And I am extremely proud of all of them

50

1 when I go to each of the meetings and I'm working with
2 everybody. So, you know, the whole thing about, you
3 know, with leadership is really recognizing not people
4 that you know, the people that facilitate it, but the
5 people that you work directly with. And I never say
6 that they're my staff, they're people that I work for.

7
8 And that's the -- and that's been a
9 pleasure, you know, that I've had for the last year and
10 a half that I've been the acting assistant regional
11 director since Gene Peltola left the position a year
12 ago July. So I've been here in that acting position
13 for quite a while. It looks like we'll see resolution
14 for the permanent hire here coming up in a few months.
15 The applications are closed, there's a hiring panel so
16 who knows, maybe by the holidays we'll see, you know, a
17 permanent selection for that position.

18
19 We also had a little bit of glorious
20 that as you might guess the timekeeper's one of the
21 most important people in the office. And we were down
22 to one administrative staff person, but we just got put
23 into USDA Jobs three additional administrative staff
24 folks to help out with letters and correspondence and
25 some of the things that really, you know, get all the
26 information out to all of you and are assistive to our
27 staff. So that's really pretty good news.

28
29 Greg Risdahl is our new Fisheries lead,
30 but also is the acting deputy assistant regional
31 director for OSM. And he was a former Refuge manager
32 at Izembek National Wildlife Refuge out of Cold Bay.
33 And so I'm really happy to have, you know, Greg's been
34 on staff for over a year now so it's good to have him.

35
36
37 You might know a gentleman named Tom
38 Kron that's been around the block for a number of
39 years. He is the acting supervisor for Council
40 Coordinators. And so I'm really glad that Tom
41 volunteered to step into that position. And so it's
42 like he's a -- you know, he's a seasoned biologist and
43 one of the things that really is his -- he told me the
44 other day one of his greatest pleasures was getting out
45 to the bush and going to -- you know, to Regional
46 Advisory Council meetings.

47
48 Suzanne Worker is back here. She took
49 Jennifer Hardin's place who went to -- got hijacked by
50

1 the Park Service. And Josh Ream did too from our
2 office. But Suzanne stepped in as the policy
3 coordinator so when you have those kind of legal policy
4 questions Suzanne's now our point person for being able
5 to do that.

6
7 And I know that there's, you know,
8 folks that need to catch airplanes and everything, but
9 again I want to thank you and thank everybody here for
10 all their participation in the process.

11
12 With that I'm more than willing to
13 answer any questions that folks have.

14
15 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

16
17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

18
19 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
20 Thank you, Tom. If you can have FSB meetings in Gakona
21 you can have them in Dillingham and King Salmon too.

22
23 We'd like to see you out here.

24
25 Thank you.

26
27 MR. DOOLITTLE: Duly noted.

28
29 MR. DUNAWAY: We've had Board of Fish
30 and Board of Game meetings in both places and it would
31 be wonderful to have you out here.

32
33 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

36
37 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, thank you.
38 Thanks, Tom. You know, OSM has always been very good
39 at informing this Council I believe. You know, I sit
40 on several other Boards and one of the things that we
41 really try to emphasize is team work, you know. And as
42 we go through the year, you know, your staff and, you
43 know, team has been -- has been really great and I
44 really appreciate all the effort and the knowledge that
45 they bring because it seems like as time goes on less
46 and less of the agencies are showing up here at this
47 table, I mean, you know, in the audience. You know, a
48 lot of them are on teleconference now because of budget
49 cuts and whatever. So but it always -- I just really
50

1 appreciate you guys and the work that you do.

2

3 Thanks.

4

5 MR. DOOLITTLE: Thank you very much,
6 appreciate it.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I also want to
9 thank you for stepping in. And like Richard I really
10 appreciate the OSM staff. I know that, you know, since
11 I've gotten on seem like their effort to understand,
12 you know, the rural issues, our traditional and
13 ecological knowledge and their willingness to work --
14 you know, work one on one with us, has been really
15 encouraging.

16

17 So thank you for, you know, your staff
18 and all their help on -- you know, with this Board.

19

20 MR. DOOLITTLE: (In Native)

21

22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I think
23 we're through. Thank you.

24

25 We're going to have a couple -- I think
26 two or three of our Board's leaving so what I want to
27 do is there's a couple of action items that we need to
28 take care of. One is future meeting dates. And then I
29 think there's that one, I don't know if we want to take
30 this up, but it was a request from Federal Subsistence
31 Board about possibly having this Board write a letter
32 encouraging other Chairs to attend. I don't know if we
33 want to pick this up right now or just leave it as
34 information for now.

35

36 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

37

38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

39

40 MR. MIKE: Yeah, thank you, Madame
41 Chair. Just for our future meeting dates you can find
42 those on page 276 and 277. And on page 276 is to
43 confirm our winter meeting date which is February 4th
44 and 5th in Naknek. And then the Council need to come
45 up with a fall meeting date of 2020.

46

47 But as far as writing a letter to the
48 other Council Chairs requesting an all chairs meeting.
49 I think we had enough discussion and from the annual
50

1 report response or a letter, I can get that draft
2 started and we can have a draft for you ready to review
3 and approve at our next meeting.

4
5 Thank you.

6
7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
8 you, Donald.

9
10 I guess what we need to do is just
11 confirm the 2020 meeting dates which are February 4 and
12 5 at Naknek. I guess we need to confirm -- reconfirm
13 those dates and then pick a fall, 2020 Regional
14 Advisory meeting here for the -- that will be held in
15 Dillingham. The last two days have worked out really
16 well. And when I was looking through the calendar
17 here, I was looking at either the 28, 29 or 29, 30 of
18 October. I don't know if -- what your thinking is. I
19 think we've -- in the past we've tried avoiding having
20 our meeting like on Friday. So maybe 28, 29 of October
21 would be my suggestion if there's no.....

22
23 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

26
27 MS. MORRIS LYON: Richard, how does
28 that work for your meeting, I think you were the one
29 with a meeting?

30
31 MR. WILSON: Thank you. Yes, I was
32 just going to mention that that does work. The other
33 meeting that I have close to that is the last Tuesday
34 of the month and as long as we -- if I can get here on
35 Wednesday morning like I did this round it works for
36 me.

37
38 Thanks.

39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. So
41 let's -- I guess we can look at October 28, 29, if
42 there's no conflict from the other Board members.

43
44 Dennis?

45
46 (No comments)

47
48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Billy?

49
50

1 (No comments)
2
3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank?
4
5 (No comments)
6
7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan?
8
9 (No comments)
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I guess
12 we could.....
13
14 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.
15
16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
17
18 MR. MIKE: Yes, Madame Chair. I just
19 want to look at our staff from OSM. The Seward
20 Peninsula selected 28 and 29th. We don't have any
21 staff that we share with Bristol Bay, right?
22
23 Staff, I'm talking to you.
24
25 MS. LaVINE: There's no conflict.
26
27 MR. MIKE: No conflict, Madame Chair.
28
29 Thank you.
30
31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: So I can -- we
32 could confirm those two by a motion or would we need an
33 action on this, just.....
34
35 MR. MIKE: You can call for a motion or
36 call for a consensus on those dates.
37
38 Thank you, Madame Chair.
39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Nanci.
41
42 MS. MORRIS LYON: Either or.
43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Call for --
45 call for consensus I guess. Everybody's all nodded yes
46 when I mentioned this. So confirm February 4 and 5 in
47 Naknek and 28 and 29 here in Dillingham, 2020 meetings.
48
49
50

1 Okay. Closing comments. Normally we
2 use this for the Board to have their closing comments.
3 I don't know if the two of you or three of you that are
4 going to be leaving want to have their closing comments
5 and then we'll get into the Pebble. Because Pebble was
6 listed under closing comments also.

7

8 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

9

10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Billy.

11

12 MR. TREFON: Yeah, on closing comments
13 I'd just say we should start looking in -- instead of
14 looking within the box or looking outside of the box of
15 just what kind of effect it'll have on our fish and our
16 wildlife. For example, fish farming in southeast, does
17 that have an affect on our wild fish. And basically
18 start looking at like Pebble or mining affects which
19 would involve sound and vibration pollution in the air
20 that I think might also have affect on our caribou. I
21 mean, that's a theory of mine about vibration of noise,
22 especially extensive, prolonged, month at a time ground
23 vibrating. That's the kind of thing to start looking
24 into.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah. Okay.

27

28 Dennis.

29

30 MR. ANDREW: Yeah. Thank you, Madame
31 Chair, and the staff for putting this meeting together.
32 And people that travel in to attend this meeting.

33

34 I know I made a motion to get that
35 Pebble Mine on. I was really impressed about those two
36 young ladies up in Fairbanks during Youth and Elders
37 that put the Pebble on issue and stuff. And even our
38 Chair from Bristol Bay Native Corporation spoke heavily
39 on it. I think we really need to be real strong on
40 this, help them. You know, when you see young folks
41 like that, I mean, young. They're worried about their
42 game, their dinner table, everything, you know, from
43 fish to birds and everything especially in that Pebble
44 project, you know, the fire to shoot it down.

45

46 We need to help them young folks. I
47 was really happy I attended that Youth and Elders
48 resolution with my wife and worked with those -- worked
49 with those kids during this last go around up in
50

1 Fairbanks.

2

3 Thank you. Thank you, Madame Chair.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

6

7 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, thank you,
8 Madame Chair. I also appreciate all the participation
9 that we had here at the meeting this
week. And I

10 appreciated the kids coming in. I do think we need to
11 continue to monitor and be aware of the changes that
12 are taking place to our birds and our fish and our
13 wildlife in general. And just, you know, look forward
14 to hearing some more updated reports and information
15 come our spring meeting.

16

17 And any -- the follow-up that you'll
18 have for us, Donald, I'll be looking forward to seeing
19 as well.

20

21 Thanks.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. We have
24 -- if there's no more comments from the Board we
25 have.....

26

27 MS. MORRIS LYON: Richard wanted to
28 make a comment.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh, Richard.
31 Sorry.

32

33 MR. WILSON: I thought we were just
34 going around the table here.....

35

36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, we are.

37

38 MR. WILSON:for final comments.

39

40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, we are.

41

42 MR. WILSON: So thanks. No, just I'm
43 very thankful too, you know, for all the agencies that
44 are, you know, willing to participate here and just
45 keep encouraging our area over there on the east side
46 to keep coming, to keep, you know, bringing us that
47 information because it's always very valuable and very
48 needed.

49

1 Thank you.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

4

5 MR. DUNAWAY: I talk too much the rest
6 of the time. Thank you, everybody, really appreciate
7 it. Good to see everybody.

8

9 Thanks.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

12

13 MR. WOODS: Same with Dan, I probably
14 spoke too much, but new round -- new -- different being
15 on this side of the table.

16

17 Thanks.

18

19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I guess
20 for me I again want to thank the agency folks. You
21 know, last two, three meetings we've whined about not
22 having agency present at our meeting. And I think
23 today it was really nice to see the majority of the
24 chairs filled with people. I wish the other half of
25 the -- more of the chairs were filled with local people
26 because, you know, the proposals that we work with here
27 affect the -- affect the people that are hunters.

28

29 And I don't know how much more we could
30 advertise to get the local people in. Seem like the
31 only time they attend is if there's an issue that, you
32 know, they need to expound on.

33

34 I know it's expensive, you know, for
35 the villages to come in and participate and so that's
36 why we have low -- one of the reasons why we have low
37 participation. But, you know, there's about 2,500 or
38 so people here in Dillingham plus Aleknagik that, you
39 know, could participate. But I don't know how much
40 more advertisement, how much more encouragement we can
41 give our people. Because, you know, the proposals that
42 we discuss and pass affect the people, especially the
43 hunters and then the users.

44

45 So I guess I again want to thank the
46 agencies especially and our OSM staff for coming in to
47 help us with the -- with the process of our Board here.
48 And Donald for all the help, all the patience, that he
49 gives us, you know, with supporting our Board here.

50

1 And so if.....

2
3 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

4
5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank, did you
6 have a comment?

7
8 MR. WOODS: I agree with you. I --
9 since I've been involved in this process the public
10 participation has been real hard to keep. It just hit
11 me that we have a SRC process or an subsistence
12 resource committee for every agency, why don't we have
13 them in close -- coinciding with this RAC meeting or at
14 least that it involves at least some participation from
15 the resource -- they call it subsistence resource
16 committees -- commissions.

17
18 So I'm just thinking outloud that we do
19 need that impact and I'm -- you know, I'm encouraged --
20 I'm encouraging OSM and the whole subsistence --
21 there's a huge office in Anchorage that we never to get
22 see and I appreciate their input, but then also there's
23 -- like you said, you're putting it down to the.....

24
25 MR. MIKE: (Indiscernible).....

26
27 MR. WOODS: I need to shut up.

28
29 (Laughter)

30
31 MR. WOODS: Well, we -- Molly is right.
32 When we only have a limited amount of public and Joe is
33 a public, the only non-paid person probably here, but
34 as we grow in this whole development, you know, I --
35 like I volunteer my time to be here and it's real
36 important that when you're sitting on this end how we
37 outreach has got to be just as important and how we
38 present ourselves.

39
40 But it's real -- I'd like to thank you
41 and expand on that, Molly. We've been working on this
42 for how long and.....

43
44 MR. DUNAWAY: Forty years.

45
46 MR. WOODS: I'm not that old yet. But
47 I'll shut up. I think I just wanted to point out there
48 that SRCs might be an avenue for getting public and
49 tribal participation or elders or at least some youth.

50

1 Because it's good to be here at the school, but you're
2 right, Molly, we do need the people that are involved.
3

4 Thank you.
5

6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
7

8 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.
9

10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Billy.
11

12 MR. TREFON: Yeah, reflecting on that
13 getting the word out. We work very closely with BBNA
14 who actually is in contact with all 31 villages. And
15 we have areas where we had executive committees that
16 could get the word out to the villages. That's an
17 avenue because the BBNA works with all 31 villages and
18 that's their job.
19

20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, I'm sure
21 BBNA reaches out, but again we have funding issue.
22 People can't afford to, you know, fly in from wherever.
23 And I thank BBNA for flying in people that -- like I'm
24 sure they helped Kenny and Moses to come in today.
25 So.....
26

27 MR. TREFON: No, that's not what I
28 meant. Not meant flying them in, but to get a notice
29 out, a written notice saying that they have a meeting
30 and if they have any issues to bring it to the Council
31 and the Council will bring it to the local commission.
32

33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Anybody
34 else.
35

36 (No comments)
37

38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: If not we have
39 -- Courtenay, are you online?
40

41 MS. CARTY: Yes, Madame Chair, I am. I
42 believe Gayla is in the room and would also like to
43 speak on this issue.
44

45 For the record Courtenay Carty, Curyung
46 Tribal Council, tribal administrator. I am also a
47 mother and at home with my two year old right now.
48

49 Thank you, Madame Chair and members of
50

1 the RAC for making the motion to formally put this
2 agenda item on the agenda today. I know there was some
3 homework that had to be done and a lot of talking on
4 the record to justify this which for me I will say is a
5 little frustrating considering that the Bristol Bay
6 Regional Advisory Council is the forum for local people
7 to voice their subsistence concerns about resources in
8 our region. And really the entire RAC record, this is
9 where Pebble has come up, this is where the
10 conversation has always been. And so to hear OSM staff
11 today say that -- or maybe it was yesterday rather, say
12 that this -- you know, put up -- really put up the
13 fences and the boxes, make sure you know what your
14 authority is and what your decision is to make.

15 And I respect understanding the rules,
16 but you're also making all these decisions and weighing
17 in on -- we just heard about 46 -- in the last
18 presentation 46 Board of Fish proposals that we're
19 going to have to make action or make recommendation on.
20 So to say that because Pebble is a decision made on
21 State land and therefore not in your wheelhouse is
22 very, very disingenuous. And as one of the
23 participants in this process really frustrating to deal
24 with.

25
26 But what I wanted to bring up and what
27 I did mention earlier during my tribal report was our
28 tribe's request at the April Board meeting for a
29 government to government consultation on a section 810
30 analysis. We understand that this is a State land
31 decision and it doesn't necessarily apply, but we think
32 the true intent of the law and as ANILCA states it's
33 public lands, ANILCA doesn't get down into the detail,
34 and delineate Federal and State lands. That's what our
35 agencies do, that's what their job is. And that's what
36 is happening today.

37
38 So I'm going to take a quick second to
39 try to get some of -- through some of what was stated
40 on the record, but only what's applicable, not the
41 literally six pages I pulled off the webpage on Monday.

42
43
44 I'll reiterate our tribe's request.
45 Page 132 of the transcript starting on line 20. But
46 today I'm going to go on the record and formally ask on
47 behalf of the Curyung Tribal Council that the Federal
48 Subsistence Board host a separate tribal consultation
49 session with our tribe as well as our as our neighbors
50

1 throughout the State before the public comment period
2 is over on May 30th. And that we sit down and hash
3 through some Pebble issues and try to really come up
4 with a plan to get the Federal Subsistence Board to go
5 on the record and do essentially an 810 analysis.
6

7 This is not a (indiscernible)
8 management decision, but ANILCA was here before Pebble,
9 before all of this, and it is important that we hold
10 our Federal decision makers and other agencies to the
11 true intent of the law. And I think public coming from
12 the Board -- public comment coming from the Board in
13 the lines of an 810 analysis on what impacts to
14 subsistence this plan as put forward in the permit
15 application submitted by Pebble that's being analyzed
16 through the DEIS, what this really has to humans --
17 what impacts this really has to humans and our ability
18 to maintain a traditional way of life, what little is
19 left.
20

21 I'll stop quoting there, but it is very
22 important to note that we're the last salmon based
23 culture in the world and we fight at RAC meetings for
24 our rights to use snowmachine to position an animal.
25 We're talking about WSA 19-07, the Mulchatna caribou
26 herd. Multiple times over the last decade including on
27 the record today the caribou used to be there before
28 Pebble. Things are changing. The decision that you
29 guys made a recommendation on or that the Federal Board
30 will make a recommendation on regarding that proposal
31 is modern day, real life affects of what has already
32 been happening through exploration. And if we don't
33 address this, if our Board that is established and has
34 been hearing public comment from our region and our
35 people for the last 20 years about our subsistence
36 concerns including Pebble don't get on the record then
37 what have we done for these last 20 years.
38

39 I'll hand it over to Gayla.
40

41 Thank you so much for allowing me to
42 participate this week. It was really nice to see you
43 guys. I know I've been calling in.
44

45 (In Native)
46

47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
48 you, Courtenay.
49
50

1 I guess Gayla.

2

3 MS. HOSETH: Thank you, Madame Chair.
4 For the record Gayla Hoseth. I'll be speaking with my
5 director of natural resources for BBNA.

6

7 I just wanted to point out the handout
8 that you guys all have received there for what the
9 Department of Interior submitted for the draft
10 environmental impact statement comments. And I guess
11 the ask that we have here for you guys here today is
12 that you guys write a letter to the Department of
13 Interior to support DOI's comments on what they
14 submitted. And I made a copy of all of the pages that
15 were submitted, that included U.S. Fish and Wildlife's
16 comments and National Park Service's comments. And I
17 want to thank those agencies for taking the time to be
18 cooperating agencies as well.

19

20 Just to briefly state on page 3 of the
21 document, it says due to the substantial deficiencies
22 and data gaps identified in the document and the
23 Department with multiple cooperating agencies, the DOI
24 recommends that the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers
25 prepare a revised or supplemental DEIS.

26

27 And going on to subsistence, I know
28 that time is of the essence here, but for the
29 subsistence comments it clearly states that subsistence
30 resources and continuation of subsistence practices are
31 extremely important to the subsistence communities in
32 the vicinity of lands managed by our bureau. The
33 subsistence sections in the DEIS do not properly
34 portray important considerations or subsistence
35 activities by Alaskans. The analysis is insufficient
36 and does not fully disclose potential impacts to
37 subsistence resources and the communities that depend on
38 them.

39

40 And if you go to the final -- the final
41 page with the signature of Mr. Philip Johnson, in the
42 second to the last paragraphs asks again. Therefore we
43 recommend that the U.S. Army Corps prepare a revised or
44 supplemental DEIS to resolve the significant gaps in
45 the current document.

46

47 This is really important and the ask
48 that we have is that you guys write a letter to the
49 Department of Interior supporting these comments and
50

1 also include it in you guys' annual report to the
2 Federal Subsistence Board because we also asked for
3 that ask through the tribal council, Curyung Tribal
4 Council asked for that ask. And the importance that
5 the Curyung Tribal Council also asked for a tribal
6 consultation on this with other tribes in the area as
7 well. And we were not given that consultation before
8 the public comment period ended.

9

10 So and also that to the Secretary of
11 Interior that we ask for a section 810 analysis. And
12 that's where the 17B easements come in on and BLM I
13 believe is also calling in on the phone, where it
14 affects ANCSA corporation lands and the impacts to
15 that. And clearly it states with the Department of
16 Interior that we don't know what these impacts are
17 going to be.

18

19 So this is a real important topic and
20 I'm sad that we have such limited time to talk about
21 this. But including it in the annual report, a letter
22 to the Department -- the Secretary of the Interior is
23 very important and that's what we were going to ask.
24 And I just wanted to remind the Council if you guys
25 needed to approve your annual report and what was going
26 to be included in that.

27

28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Gayla, I
29 didn't get I guess copy of that.

30

31 Any, I guess, comments for Gayla.

32

33 (No comments)

34

35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I think Donald
36 took in your, you know, directives for, you know,
37 possibly placing -- placing your comments or your
38 request in our -- what is that, annual -- was it annual
39 report. And.....

40

41 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

42

43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

44

45 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
46 Ms. Hoseth requested that this Council do a
47 correspondenceto the Federal Subsistence Board or we --
48 from this Council send a correspondence to the Federal
49 Subsistence Board endorsing the comments from the

50

1 Department of Interior. She also requested that we
2 include that as part of our annual report. So if the
3 Council wishes to do so we need to make a motion to
4 that effect.

5

6 Thank you, Madame Chair.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Gayla.

9

10 MS. HOSETH: Thank you, Madame Chair.
11 Just for clarification, I guess there's two asks. One
12 would be to write a letter to the Department of
13 Interior saying that we are in support of the comments
14 and that would also go to the Army Corps of Engineers.
15 And also include that in the annual report that is
16 reported to the Federal Subsistence Board. That we're
17 in support of the Interior's comments to revise -- that
18 the Army Corps prepare a revised or supplemental DEIS.
19 That's one request. The other request -- so a letter
20 to the Secretary of Interior and then also in the
21 annual report. But then also a request for a section
22 810 analysis. And also to notify the Federal
23 Subsistence Board as Courtenay stated on the record
24 going to our tribal consultation that we asked for the
25 tribal consultation that was not given to us as tribes
26 before the comment period was over, to have the section
27 810 analysis included in this EIS.

28

29 So it's a real serious, critical point
30 that was missed and we've been asking for it on the
31 record and that's why we are here today, to get it from
32 the support of the RAC so that when it goes to the
33 Federal Subsistence Board this is reported on. But
34 then we will also be contacting -- hopefully you guys
35 will also write the support letter to the Department of
36 Interior.

37

38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Gayla, could
39 you maybe possibly give that -- your request in writing
40 to Donald. Yeah, so I think it would probably be
41 better if you would bring your request to Donald in
42 writing because you have several directives there, you
43 know, for this Board. And I'm not certain that, you
44 know, if we can meet all those directives.

45

46 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

47

48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

49

50

1 MR. MIKE: Yes, Madame Chair. We are
2 able to do that, but we need an action from this
3 Council for me to go forward. And right now we don't
4 have a quorum and one of the Council members will be
5 calling in to reestablish quorum. So once we get that
6 quorum back we'll need to take action through this
7 Council to go forward with the correspondence.

8
9 Thank you, Madame Chair.

10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

12
13 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Frank.

16
17 MR. WOODS: Thanks. I'd like to
18 support I think Gayla and Courtenay's request and
19 hopefully somebody calls in. We requested one more
20 member to call in so we could have a quorum.

21
22 And I read all of our mandates, you
23 know, Gayla, that there's no communication. I asked
24 Courtenay what you guys were talking about. As a new
25 Board member I had no idea that any of this stuff was
26 going on or even -- I'm trying to connect up, we do
27 have rights to recommend, initiate, review and evaluate
28 proposals pertinent to subsistence. You're right.
29 There's a better way of doing this. In writing, before
30 this Board, we have -- you've seen the packets and
31 information that we have. I have no problem reviewing
32 and adding to the menu of our existing long couple
33 days. The problem I have is that we without
34 delineating or being able to read what you're talking
35 about, we just got this. On page 3 like you said our
36 stance on subsistence coincides with your request.

37
38 The other flip side of that is that
39 demanding it in action items that I don't even know
40 what you're talking about. I had no clue that this
41 document or what you're requesting last week when you
42 came into my office. Basically for the record you said
43 and I'll state for the record that I had no clue what
44 this -- what you were talking about or what this meant.
45 I asked you to go through the Chair and that's my job
46 as a Board member is asking you to go through the
47 Chair, right.

48
49 So I'm going to support you in saying
50

1 we do need a request in writing from this Committee on
2 a subsistence issue.

3
4 The second part is when we do I will
5 request in a motion that we should write a letter
6 supporting subsistence use and impacts on the EIS,
7 correct, that's my job. And I am -- I'll applaud both
8 Dennis and the rest of the Board members and Nanci and
9 everyone else wanting to address your concerns.
10 There's a huge deficit here when as a member of this
11 Committee that I have nothing on front of me other than
12 what we just got presented.

13
14 I will support, I am -- I think
15 everybody is on the same page. And as soon as we get a
16 member calling in I will make that recommendation.

17
18 Thank you.

19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Gayla.

21
22 MS. HOSETH: And follow-up. Thank you,
23 Madame Chair. And maybe Chris could help, but once a
24 quorum is established at a Board meeting and if people
25 leave you already have a quorum established. I don't
26 know what the Federal rules are for voting, but I know
27 that on our tribal council if we establish a quorum and
28 somebody leaves we still have a quorum. So that's
29 something that needs to be looked at.

30
31 Second of all I'm not demanding. I'm
32 here as -- and requesting. And if we're going to quote
33 on the record I could also quote what you stated.
34 Pebble is not political. It is political and debate
35 everything, but we're also Federally-qualified users
36 that this is going to affect us. I was in contact with
37 Donald, the regional coordinator, to get this on the
38 agenda. I did call Molly and leave her a message on
39 her answering machine and did not get a call back. I
40 was trying through this process to get this as an
41 agenda item so that you will have the materials in
42 front of you to be prepared to act on this or to hear
43 this here today. As you can see this has been a battle
44 to try to get this even on the agenda.

45
46 Okay. It's very frustrating that this
47 is the last thing that we're talking about today that
48 affects all of us and the future of our next
49 generations. So it's -- make sure that -- you make
50

1 sure that you know what you're talking about before you
2 speak because I have tried to work up the chain of
3 command to get this on the agenda. And I was not given
4 that -- we got it on there. Okay. So I'm not
5 demanding, this is a request. And we need to find out
6 how do we get things on the agenda as Federally-
7 qualified users on important topics that are important
8 in our region.

9

10 So there's a big communication
11 breakdown here.

12

13 MR. WOODS: Well, I'm just explaining
14 my end of it, that I did ask to go through the process.
15 That's all I'm saying. And that's all I said to you.

16

17 So I -- I'm going to go back again. I
18 will support it being on the agenda, I did, I seconded
19 that motion from Dennis. I'm reviewing information
20 that's real pertinent. So we have something before us.
21 You know, Courtenay and Gayla, keep -- I'll keep
22 applauding you for pushing it forward, but there's a
23 timeline here. Sometimes it's kind of last minute
24 really sometimes works and doesn't work. We -- I'm
25 trying -- we're trying -- I think we're pushing it to
26 the limit by keeping this meeting open and it is real
27 important. That's why I'm speaking is to keep the
28 meeting open so we can continue until somebody calls in
29 and we can actually get an action item. And I'll ask --
30 maybe I'll turn it over to Donald and leave it there.

31

32 As soon as we get a quorum or we have
33 permission to continue we'll get it on the agenda.

34

35 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

36

37 MR. ANDREW: Madame Chair.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Bill and then
40 Dennis.

41

42 MS. CARTY: Madame Chair, this is
43 Courtenay.

44

45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I have Gayla,
46 Dennis and then Courtenay.

47

48 MS. HOSETH: Thank you, Madame Chair.
49 I believe Tom Doolittle is also on the phone and he

50

1 might be able to help us. I asked him to call in for
2 this topic, to maybe weigh in on your quorum question
3 about voting. But that's what I was wanting to say,
4 that Tom Doolittle is also online.

5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: So, Tom, are
7 you online?

8
9 MR. DOOLITTLE: Yeah, I'm here, Madame
10 Chair. Through the Chair. Again if you -- again at
11 your discretion you need to vote, but again you should
12 have a quorum of two-thirds. I believe you have a 10
13 member Council and you need -- you need six people.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I guess Gayla
16 -- Gayla's question was once we establish a quorum we
17 have a quorum, but two of our members have left. So we
18 have five, you know, five present now.

19
20 MR. DOOLITTLE: I'll double check with
21 Ken right now and see, you know, when people leave, but
22 my understanding is that you need, you know, six people
23 to be able to vote, Molly.

24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Tom or, excuse
26 me. Robert Larson, are you still with us online?

27
28 MR. LARSON: I'm here.

29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh, we have a
31 quorum. Robert's here. Okay.

32
33 MR. DOOLITTLE: So you're good, you got
34 a quorum then.

35
36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Pardon.

37
38 MR. DOOLITTLE: You got a quorum then?

39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yes, we have
41 -- we -- I guess we didn't check with Robert. Thanks,
42 Robert. So we do have a quorum.

43
44 MR. LARSON: Okay.

45
46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Sorry, Dennis.

47
48 Dennis and then Billy.

49
50

1 MR. ANDREW: Thanks, Madame
Chair. You
2 know, once we get our quorum going and we got a quorum
3 going and a gathering like this and stuff, in the past,
4 even the city side, the tribal side and stuff, even a
5 person, if he or she leaves they're accounted for, we
6 excused them to leave. And we still continue to -- our
7 business. So that was a quorum all these years. But I
8 haven't really gotten to the policy on this Board about
9 it. But to me if this happens again, because they been
10 here with us two days and due to trying to get home and
11 stuff, they got to jump and go. So in the future here
12 I think we need to fix this and say that we're looking
13 for guys to call in for a quorum. I mean, Gayla was
14 right, she was right on the money.

15
16 Thank you, Madame Chair.

17
18 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah. I don't
19 know what -- I don't know if there's a difference, you
20 know, with the RAC process regarding the quorum. We
21 need to I guess understand that for the -- for future.

22
23 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
24 For a quorum to be established for a 10 member Council,
25 this -- which the Bristol Bay Council is, we need six
26 members present to establish a quorum.

27
28 Thank you, Madame Chair.

29
30 We do have six members.

31
32 Thank you.

33
34 MR. TREFON: Madame Chair.

35
36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Bill.

37
38 MR. TREFON: Yeah. Gayla, this is kind
39 of like -- this is related -- this is with my tribe,
40 but if you have a question, we, my tribe council is
41 going to be meeting with the Army Corps of Engineers
42 next week behind closed doors. They want to keep it
43 closed doors because they don't want a whole bunch of
44 people coming and meeting. We'll be meeting with our
45 lawyers and with the Army Corps.

46
47 So I -- you got that much time to give
48 you something, maybe we could bring it to a -- I'll
49
50

2

49 bring it to -- from my point of view, but not from --

50

1 this sort of looks like it's part of our Council asking
2 the question.

3

4 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I think
5 we have Courtenay and then Dan.

6

7 MS. CARTY: Thank you Madame Chair,
8 members of the Council. I just wanted to close and in
9 closing I'll quickly just state that, you know, this
10 might feel rushed and Mr. Woods is a new Board meeting,
11 et cetera, but I'm just letting everyone know for the
12 record this all came up at the April Federal
13 Subsistence Board meeting. This is the next RAC
14 meeting since then. This is the process. It is not
15 always timely which is part of, you know, the things
16 that we have to work so hard and that we've all been
17 working for decades on.

18

19 In regards to Pebble, our tribe,
20 Curyung with Nondalton are the only two tribes that are
21 represented as cooperating agencies in the development
22 of the DEIS. And unfortunately, you know, researches
23 are short, we don't always get to be at the table. I
24 missed the cooperating agency reporting last week, but
25 I was at the entire technical meeting, I think the only
26 other person I saw in the room at that meeting was
27 Suzanne Fleek-Green. I think Troy Hamon was there for
28 a bit. And our Council was there every single day and
29 so were these agencies. These great, fact people
30 there, day in and day out, calling Pebble on the record
31 just as they have submitted in their comments to remind
32 them that when it comes to caribou and their population
33 estimate, the Fish and Wildlife Service and the Park
34 Service point out that you're using the wrong set of
35 data. Fish and Game's there to call them on the table
36 and we all work so hard together and we just don't --
37 nobody wants that ball to drop, we need to make sure
38 our net is as tight as can be and tacked as far and
39 wide.

40

41 I just needed to close saying that the
42 DEIS does not equate any human factor in a potential
43 breaching of tailings dam. Nothing -- according to the
44 DEIS it won't affect anybody, but we locals know that
45 there are cabins and people's subsistence sites within
46 miles of what would be covered in mud and water for
47 years. And that people will die at camp if a tailings
48 dam were to collapse. And that's just if there were a
49 catastrophe failure.

50

1 We all know that what's before us today
2 is a permit to pollute, not on your agenda of course
3 for action, but the Army Corps' table and the decisions
4 to be made that follow the publication of the final
5 EIS. And that just the standard daily operations alone
6 at Pebble are going to be destroying our water and land
7 for which our people have sustained themselves for
8 thousands of years.
9

10 And everyone in the room and everyone
11 on the phone have been working together 40 years now.
12 This is the 40th year of ANILCA so we need to go back
13 to ANILCA. Did you guys know that in section 1203 of
14 ANILCA it defines the Bristol Bay Cooperative Region.
15 It -- when it did that it foresaw this all coming. The
16 purpose of the section and I'll quote, is to provide
17 for the preparation and implementation of a
18 comprehensive and systematic cooperative management
19 plan to conserve fish and wildlife and other
20 significant and natural, cultural resources within the
21 region. And to provide for the rational and orderly
22 development of economic resources with an
23 environmentally sound manner. No other region talks
24 about that. Our region, Bristol Bay region, is written
25 into law to be protected.
26

27 And where is that happening. Today
28 we're talking about communications breakdown, but what
29 we're doing is really being boxed in to the Bristol Bay
30 Area Plan, the BLM plan, the Togiak Refuge plans, Lake
31 Clark plans. We need to open the books, quit boxing
32 ourselves up and let all these plans talk together and
33 come together. And that's why we asked the Federal
34 Subsistence Board back in April and that's why we're
35 asking the RAC so passionately to make sure that we
36 don't miss this opportunity.
37

38 Thank you so much.

39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

41
42 Dan and then Bill.

43
44 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
45 And thanks, everybody. I was -- I was also a bit
46 confused. I'm very concerned about this mine, I've
47 submitted a lot of personal testimony. I was just
48 trying to verify whether I sent six pages or 18. I
49 think it might have been 18 on the most recent
50

1 opportunity for the Corps of Engineers thing. I -- I'm
2 inclined to support it. I was just very concerned
3 whether we would be, you know, way out of our range of
4 authority. And if we are I'm -- I was worried about
5 that. But what Frank read and then what I'm
6 understanding from Donald and others is that this
7 should not be outside of our authority. And I've been
8 puzzling all along that in my work experience if you
9 can establish a Federal nexus you have some authority.
10 And I can't imagine that there's not a Federal nexus at
11 many, many places here. So if we are not out of line,
12 you know, with our authority, I'm fully inclined to
13 support what Curyung and BBNA are requesting.

14 I just -- thank you.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Bill.

17

18 MR. TREFON: Yeah, just to let you know
19 that the Army Corps that's showing up is not just a
20 panel, it's actually the lieutenant colonel that's been
21 showing up.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Go ahead.

24

25 MR. LARSON: Thank you, Madame Chair.
26 Cody Larson with the Bristol Bay Native Association.
27 Through the Chair to Mr. Dunaway.

28

29 Something that's been stated here, but
30 I'd like to reiterate it is that the RAC here as was
31 gone through the operating manual earlier, the Regional
32 Advisory Council operating manual states that this
33 RAC's responsibility is to provide a forum for the
34 expression of concerns to impacts to subsistence
35 resources in the region. It doesn't state State land
36 or Federal land or private lands, it's in the region.
37 So as far as expressing concerns of subsistence in the
38 region, this is the correct forum for it.

39

40 In addition, the RAC has purview over
41 title VIII. One of the things that's been mentioned
42 here is a section 810 review. 810 is within title
43 VIII. So to comment on this I think is definitely
44 within the purview of the RAC.

45

46 The Department of the Interior's
47 comments that were submitted in July reference
48 significant impacts to fish and wildlife resources.
49 And so what the section 810 review does is analyzes and
50

1 evaluates impacts to subsistence users and their
2 resources. And so by supporting the Department of
3 Interior making the statement that fish and wildlife
4 would be significantly impacted, it also -- the Board
5 essentially is saying that if fish and wildlife are
6 significantly impacted, our subsistence users are going
7 to be significantly impacted. And that they're -- to
8 be socially and ethically responsible we should
9 evaluate those impacts on a project like this.

10

11 As Chris McKee mentioned earlier, OSM
12 evaluates impacts to subsistence users for proposals to
13 regulatory changes. And so I think it's responsible to
14 evaluate impacts for something the size and scope of
15 this change, social change, to the region. And I think
16 that it is within the purview of the RAC.

17

18 And so I think the asks succinctly are
19 to support the statements that the Department of
20 Interior already submitted, so a statement of support
21 for those statements and to urge and evaluate what the
22 impacts to subsistence users would be of that. So two
23 simple things would say we support the Department of
24 Interior's comments and we support evaluating impacts
25 to Federally-qualified users regardless of, you know,
26 what land they're standing on. It's that they're
27 within the region and they will be impacted by loss to
28 fish and wildlife.

29

30 Thank you.

31

32 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

33

34 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

35

36 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Mr. Cody Larson
37 for that statement. That's within the authority of
38 this Council to endorse this Army Corps' letter or the
39 Department of Interior letters to the Army Corps. So
40 if the Council wishes to do so they can endorse those
41 comments through a correspondence to the Federal
42 Subsistence Board.

43

44 And I hate to say this, but I'm over my
45 limit of my user obligations for the use of this
46 facility so if we can get business done it will be
47 appreciated.

48

49 But we certainly can take more comments

50

1 and I'll accommodate the public needs.

2

3 Thank you.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Let's
6 have Frank and then go on to vote on this.

7

8 MR. WOODS: So I'm -- Madame Chair, I'd
9 like to make a motion that we support the Department of
10 Interior's letter of recommendation on EIS and that we
11 urge OSM and this Board and the Federal Subsistence
12 Board to evaluate the impacts to subsistence in the
13 region.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
16 been a motion by Frank. We're you going to second the
17 motion and then we can.....

18

19 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, I'll second that.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK:we can go
22 into discussion.

23

24 MR. DUNAWAY: And I think -- do you
25 mean to also include the 810 analysis that they're
26 requesting?

27

28 MR. WOODS: Yes, 810 analysis. I'm
29 sorry.

30

31 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. And the tribal
32 consultation?

33

34 MR. WOODS: Yes.

35

36 MR. DUNAWAY: So I second that.

37

38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. So
39 there's been a motion by Frank, second by Dan. Is
40 there anymore discussions on this?

41

42 MR. ANDREW: Call for question.

43

44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Question's
45 been called. All in favor say aye.

46

47 IN UNISON: Aye.

48

49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any

50

1 objections?

2

3

(No opposing votes)

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

Okay. I think we're down to our -- this was our last agenda item. And I guess I just need a motion to adjourn.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

MR. TREFON: I'll make the motion.

MR. DUNAWAY: Second.

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Motion by Bill, second by Dan. Okay. All in favor say aye.

IN UNISON: Aye.

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any opposition.

(No opposing votes)

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

MR. MIKE: Robert Larson, (in Native)

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: (In Native), Robert.

MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, you're a hero. Staying on two days, that is really hard on the phone. I really admire you, man.

MR. LARSON: Thank you.

(Off record)

(END OF PROCEEDINGS)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50

C E R T I F I C A T E

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)
) ss.
STATE OF ALASKA)

I, Salena A. Hile, Notary Public in and for the state of Alaska and reporter for Computer Matrix Court Reporters, LLC, do hereby certify:

THAT the foregoing pages numbered _____ through _____ contain a full, true and correct Transcript of the BRISTOL BAY FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING, VOLUME II taken electronically on the 31st day of October 2019 telephonically from Anchorage, Alaska;

THAT the transcript is a true and correct transcript requested to be transcribed and thereafter transcribed by under my direction and reduced to print to the best of our knowledge and ability;

THAT I am not an employee, attorney, or party interested in any way in this action.

DATED at Anchorage, Alaska, this 29th day of November 2019.

Salena A. Hile
Notary Public, State of Alaska
My Commission Expires: 09/16/22