

1 BRISTOL BAY ALASKA FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE
2 REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING
3
4 PUBLIC MEETING
5

6
7
8

9 VOLUME I

10
11

12 Bristol Bay Native Association
13 Dillingham, Alaska
14 October 28, 2015
15 9:00 a.m.
16

17
18

19 COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT:

20

21 Molly Chythlook, Chair

22 Pete Abraham

23 Dan Dunaway

24 Nanci Morris Lyon

25 Daniel O'Hara

26 Senafont Shugak

27 Richard Wilson

28
29
30
31

32 Regional Council Coordinator, Donald Mike

33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40

41 Recorded and transcribed by:

42

43 Computer Matrix Court Reporters, LLC

44 135 Christensen Drive, Suite 2

45 Anchorage, AK 99501

46 907-243-0668/sahile@gci.net

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50

P R O C E E D I N G S

(Dillingham, Alaska - 10/28/2015)

(On record)

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Calling the meeting to order and it's 9:00 -- about 9:00 o'clock.

MS. MORRIS LYON: Not quite. Looks like.....

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Not about 10.....

MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, 8:57.

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: 8:00 -- about 8:57. And we'll -- Donald, you want to do the roll call to establish our quorum first.

MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair. Donald Mike, Fish and Wildlife Service. Roll call of the Bristol Bay Regional Advisory Council.

Mr. Pete Abraham.

(No response)

MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. Mr. Abraham, I understand that he couldn't make the -- the flight in yesterday due to weather.

Mr. Dan O'Hara.

MR. O'HARA: Here.

MR. MIKE: Ms. Nanci Morris Lyon.

MS. MORRIS LYON: Here.

MR. MIKE: Ms. Molly Chythlook.

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Here.

MR. MIKE: Mr. Senafont Shugak, Jr.

MR. SHUGAK: Here.

MR. MIKE: Mr. William Maines.

1 (No response)
2
3 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. Mr. Maines
4 emailed me stating that he had a meeting conflict and
5 couldn't attend the meeting.
6
7 Mr. Dan Dunaway.
8
9 MR. DUNAWAY: Here.
10
11 MR. MIKE: Mr. Larry Hill.
12
13 (No response)
14
15 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. Mr. Hill -- I
16 called Mr. Hill and he said he couldn't make it,
17 there's nobody to take care of his home in Iliamna.
18
19 Mr. Thomas Hedland.
20
21 (No response)
22
23 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. Mr. Hedland
24 also couldn't make this meeting.
25
26 Mr. Richard Wilson.
27
28 MR. WILSON: Here.
29
30 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. You have six
31 members present, you have a quorum.
32
33 MR. WILSON: (Invocation)
34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you,
36 Richard.
37
38 Okay. I'm going -- excuse me, I'll go
39 through the agenda items.
40
41 Number 1, we did the roll call and
42 established a quorum, invocation.
43
44 Number 3, call to order and we did that
45 at 8:59 or so.
46
47 Welcome, introductions, review and
48 adopt agenda.
49
50 Number 6 is review and approve previous

1 meeting minutes.

2

3 Number 7 will be the reports.

4

5 Number 8 public and tribal comment on
6 agenda items and this is a -- we'll make this available
7 every morning.

8

9 Number 9 is old business and there's a
10 list of old business here, redfish, rural
11 determination, Refuge proposal and rule on hunting.

12

13 Number 10 is new business and there are
14 eight of the wildlife proposals that we'll be dealing
15 with.

16

17 Under 10B is the delegation of
18 authority;

19

20 C, FRMP projects for Council
21 recommendation;

22

23 D, spring 2015 Emperor geese update;

24

25 E, identify issue for FY15 annual
26 report;

27

28 F, U.S. Coast Guard boating safety
29 initiative information for subsistence hunting in
30 Alaska.

31

32 And then number 11 are the agency
33 reports and there's agency reports A to G and they're
34 all listed here.

35

36 And then number 12 is future meeting
37 minutes and we'll be discussing the winter and also
38 select the fall meeting time.

39

40 So I guess we'll need the motion to --
41 well, review the agenda items and motion to adopt.

42

43 MS. MORRIS LYON: Do you want to do
44 that after your introductions?

45

46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh, I'm sorry.
47 I guess we'll go to number 5. We'll start with the
48 Board introductions and then we'll go out to the public
49 starting from Dan.

50

1 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
2 I'm Dan Dunaway, I live here in Dillingham and retired
3 from Fish and Game. I serve as Secretary on the
4 Nushagak Advisory Committee as well as this.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 MR. SHUGAK: My name is Senafont
9 Shugak, Jr., I'm from Pedro Bay. I've been on several
10 Boards that come down here, but this is my first
11 meeting for the Subsistence Board so I'm hoping to
12 learn a lot today.

13
14 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. Richard
15 Wilson out of Naknek. Glad to be here, pretty warm
16 situations we're under. Kind of -- kind of different,
17 but we're enjoying it. The redfish is drying just like
18 it's supposed to.

19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Good morning,
21 Molly Chythlook, usually from Aleknagik, but I am now
22 living in Dillingham, retired from Subsistence Division
23 and BBNA. And I'm enjoying my retirement finally, but
24 it's -- I recommend that if you want to retire don't,
25 wait until you enjoy your work. And like Richard said,
26 we are enjoying this -- I'm enjoying this warm weather,
27 usually by now we have snow. I guess later on we had a
28 little bit of snow, but it melted.

29
30 So welcome to Dillingham.

31
32 MS. MORRIS LYON: I'm Nancy Morris
33 Lyon, I come over from across the bay in King Salmon.
34 And I welcome you on the Board, Senafont, I appreciate
35 your appreciation for what we're doing here and look
36 forward to working with you.

37
38 MR. O'HARA: I'm Dan O'Hara, now here
39 in Naknek, originally from Lake Iliamna. Pretty big
40 Lake, Senafont, you're lucky to be living there. I
41 live in Naknek at the present time. I've been on the
42 original RAC so it's a long time. I never thought that
43 we would ever see 50 cents a pound again from a buck 20
44 to 50 cents a pound at -- with Bristol Bay, 60 cents a
45 pound in area M, 83 cents a pound in Chignik, but they
46 only got to fish a half a season and the -- Trident
47 pulled out. So that was really unfortunate that they
48 got such a low price, they got a buck 60 last year with
49 the final settlement and then to get 83 cents this year
50 and not be able to take the second season. Talking to

1 some of my clients down there they said they stood in
2 the lagoon and watched the fish jump for a whole month
3 and never put a seine in the water. So that's a
4 difficult thing. Kodiak got a buck 20 a pound, but
5 they don't have any fish, they have somebody else's
6 fish I believe mainly.

7

8 And last -- since we last talked with
9 you people here a year ago we did not have enough cold
10 weather to run a four-wheeler and no snow for a
11 snowmachine so we basically stayed at home and it's
12 nice to be here with the RAC today.

13

14 MR. MIKE: My name is Donald Mike, I'm
15 the Bristol Bay Regional Advisory Council Coordinator.

16

17 MS. PETRIVELLI: I'm Pat Petrivelli
18 with the Bureau of Indian Affairs, their Subsistence
19 Anthropologist and I work out of Anchorage.

20

21 MS. WORKER: Hi, I'm Suzanne Worker,
22 I'm a Wildlife Biologist for the Office of Subsistence
23 Management.

24

25 MS. DIANE: Diane (indiscernible).

26

27 MS. NELSON: I'm Hazel Nelson, Director
28 of Subsistence Division at the Department of Fish and
29 Game.

30

31 MR. MARK LISAC: I'm Mark Lisac, I'm a
32 Fisheries Biologist with Togiak National Wildlife
33 Refuge.

34

35 MR. PAPPAS: Good morning, George
36 Pappas, State Subsistence Liaison with OSM.

37

38 MS. CARTY: Good morning, Courtenay
39 Carty, Director of Natural Resources at BBNA. We're
40 also in fact funded through OSM for an FRMP program.

41

42 MS. HOSETH: Good morning, I'm Gayla
43 Hoseth, I'm the Subsistence Research Specialist at
44 BBNA.

45

46 MR. DYE: Jason Dye, Fish and Game
47 Sport Fish here in Dillingham.

48

49 MR. FO: Good morning, Ian Fo, Fish and
50 Game Sport Fish here in Dillingham.

1 MR. BARTEN: Good morning, my name is
2 Neil Barten, I'm the area Wildlife Management Biologist
3 with the Department of Fish and Game here in
4 Dillingham.

5
6 MR. ADERMAN: Andy Aderman, Wildlife
7 Biologist with the Togiak Refuge.

8
9 MR. SANDS: Tim Sands, Alaska
10 Department of Fish and Game, Commercial Fisheries
11 Biologist in Dillingham.

12
13 MS. RUPP: I'm Liza Rupp, I'm at Lake
14 Clark National Park and Preserve, the Chief of Cultural
15 Resources and Subsistence Manager.

16
17 MR. FOLKERTS: Good morning, I'm Mike
18 Folkerts with the U.S. Coast Guard, Boating Safety
19 Specialist out of Juneau.

20
21 MS. CHUNG: Good morning, Diane Chung,
22 Superintendent for Katmai National Park, Aniakchak
23 National Monument and Alagnak National Park.

24
25 MS. HENRY: Good morning, everyone, I'm
26 Susanna Henry, Refuge Manager at Togiak National
27 Wildlife Refuge.

28
29 MR. SUMMERS: Good morning, my name is
30 Clarence Summers. I'm in Anchorage with National Park
31 Service and I'm Alaska Regional Office Subsistence
32 Manager.

33
34 MR. HAMON: My name is Troy Hamon, I'm
35 the Resource Manager for the National Park Service in
36 King Salmon, serving Katmai, Aniakchak and Alagnak.

37
38 MR. CADY: Good morning, my name's Tom
39 Cady, I'm the Deputy Manager at Alaska Peninsula and
40 Becharof Refuge over in King Salmon.

41
42 MS. LA VINE: Good morning, I'm Robbin
43 La Vine, Anthropologist for the Office of Subsistence
44 Management.

45
46 MR. JOHNSON: And good morning, I'm
47 Carl Johnson, I'm the Council Coordination Division
48 Chief at the Office of Subsistence Management. And
49 it's a pleasure always to be here in Dillingham in the
50 fall.

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: And we -- Pete
2 Abraham just arrived. So introduction.
3
4 MR. ABRAHAM: I took a wrong turn
5 somewhere and ended up in the wrong place, that's why
6 I'm late. I'm usually am -- I'm usually the first guy
7 to be at the meeting place, but not this time, wrong
8 turn.
9
10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
11
12 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair, thank you.
13 During the roll call let the record look -- be known
14 that Mr. Pete Abraham is present for the Council
15 meeting.
16
17 Thank you.
18
19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
20 Welcome, Pete. I'm glad that you're back with us in
21 good health hopefully and hope to be -- have you with
22 us for a while.
23
24 MR. ABRAHAM: Well, I'm not quite full
25 health, but half a horse maybe.
26
27 (Laughter)
28
29 MR. ABRAHAM: Running on one spark
30 plug, but I'm still here.
31
32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
33
34 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair. I
35 just want to identify folks that are online. Please
36 identify yourself for the record and I'll have the mic
37 on.
38
39 You can get started.
40
41 (No response)
42
43 MR. MIKE: Hello, those online please
44 identify yourself.
45
46 MR. RICE: Hello, this is Bud Rice,
47 Management Biologist for the National Park Service in
48 Anchorage.
49
50 MS. TONNESON: Hi, this is Heather

1 Tonneson, I'm the Regional Refuge Ecologist for U.S.
2 Fish and Wildlife Service in Anchorage.
3
4 MR. SANDONE: Gene Sandone representing
5 Bristol Bay Economic Development Corporation.
6
7 MR. MIKE: Thank you. Anyone else?
8
9 MS. WILBURN: Dawn Wilburn with the
10 Alaska Department of Fish and Game. I'm the Chignik
11 Salmon Management Biologist.
12
13 MR. MIKE: What was your name again,
14 please?
15
16 (No response)
17
18 MR. MIKE: Can you restate your name,
19 please?
20
21 MS. WILBURN: Dawn Wilburn.
22
23 MR. MIKE: Thank you.
24
25 MS. LOEWEN: And this is Marybeth
26 Loewen, Subsistence Research from the Kodiak Office.
27
28 MR. MIKE: Thank you. Anybody else?
29
30 (No response)
31
32 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
33
34 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Donald,
35 could you go through -- go over the names of the people
36 that -- because I think there's some of us that missed
37 some names, just quickly go over the names that are
38 online?
39
40 MR. MIKE: Yes. The way I understand
41 the people online, we have Bud Rice from the Park
42 Service, Heather Tonneson from the Fish and Wildlife
43 Service in Anchorage, Gene Sandone representing the
44 Bristol Bay Economic Development Council and Dawn
45 Wilburn, is that correct.
46
47 MS. WILBURN: Wilburn, correct.
48
49 MR. MIKE: Pardon.
50

1 MS. WILBURN: Yes, Wilburn.
2
3 MR. MIKE: Wilburn. Dawn Wilburn. And
4 Marybeth from the Subsistence, Alaska Department of
5 Fish and Game; is that -- Mary -- Marybeth, can you
6 restate your name -- last name again, please?
7
8 MS. LOEWEN: My last name is Loewen, L-
9 O-E-W-E-N.
10
11 MR. MIKE: Thank you.
12
13 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
14 you, Donald.
15
16 I guess our -- the next agenda item is
17 review and adopt the agenda.
18
19 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.
20
21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.
22
23 MS. MORRIS LYON: I make a motion to
24 adopt the agenda as presented.
25
26 MR. O'HARA: I'll second that motion,
27 ma'am.
28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
30 been a motion by Nanci and seconded by Dan O'Hara to
31 approve the agenda.
32
33 All in favor say aye.
34
35 IN UNISON: Aye.
36
37 MS. MORRIS LYON: (Indiscernible - away
38 from microphone).....
39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Sorry.
41
42 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.
43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
45
46 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. There's a
47 motion to adopt the agenda and seconded by Mr. Dan
48 O'Hara and we need a discussion to review the agenda
49 before we can make final -- take final action on it.
50

1 Thank you.
2
3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Is
4 there discussion?
5
6 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
7
8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
9
10 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, I talked to several
11 Council members about changing the agenda. I just want
12 to give you this to sow some thoughts of what we might
13 do in the future. And that would be we give -- we get
14 the reports last after we've acted on the proposals
15 from the various agencies and I think that's kind of
16 backwards, but there's some good reasons why we leave
17 them until last and we're running for the plane about
18 the time you get ready to give your report. And so
19 it's kind of a mixed bag, but I want the Council to
20 think a little bit about that, maybe we could get our
21 reports ahead of time and then -- but as one member of
22 the Council said, you know, the staff is here and if we
23 have any questions on the proposal we can certainly
24 bring them to the mic and get all the information we
25 need.
26
27 Thank you, Madame Chair.
28
29 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.
30
31 CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.
32
33 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yes, thank you,
34 Madame Chair. I -- and also I would encourage anybody
35 out there whose got new and/or relevant information
36 that we perhaps have not seen or heard before to come
37 forward. We've always been an open Council anyway and
38 we want to make the best decisions we can make with the
39 information -- best possible information we can get.
40 So without you stepping up and saying -- instead of
41 afterwards saying well, it was in my report, well, it
42 doesn't do us any good if we're trying to make a
43 decision at that time. Please feel free if you think
44 it's relevant to the decision we're making to make sure
45 we have that information.
46
47 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
48
49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
50

1 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah. Thank you, Madame
2 Chair. I think Mr. O'Hara brings up a good point. I
3 recall a few times where it's like either we end up
4 getting the report in the middle of the meeting and
5 they finish up later, but, yeah, especially if you've
6 got relevant, critical information, we need to know it
7 during our deliberations.

8
9 So I appreciate Mr. O'Hara bringing
10 that up.

11
12 Thank you.

13
14 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

15
16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
17 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair. We
18 have some Board of Fish -- Alaska's -- Board of Fish
19 proposal and I'd like to add that under new business,
20 G, Board of Fish Proposal and that will be presented by
21 Mr. George Pappas.

22
23 And also, Madame Chair, for wildlife
24 proposals, there were a couple of wildlife proposals
25 that were left from our reading materials. So we'll
26 probably need to add wildlife proposal 16-34 and that
27 requests closure of Federal lands in parts of --
28 portions of unit 18. So that would be a crossover
29 proposal. And proposal WP16-35 requests the use of
30 artificial light to be allowed to aid in harvesting of
31 bear at a den site in unit 18. That's also a crossover
32 proposal. And those two proposals will be presented by
33 Suzanne Worker.

34
35 And, Madame Chair, I had handed out the
36 two wildlife proposals that were left out of our
37 meeting materials. And in addition to new business,
38 Board of Fish proposal, I have copies of the proposals
39 to hand out when the time comes.

40
41 Thank you, Madame Chair.

42
43 Those are the two items I'd like the
44 Council to consider to add to their agenda.

45
46 Thank you.

47
48 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

49
50 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

1
2 MR. O'HARA: We need -- we need an
3 amendment to the agenda now, to the motion, yes?
4
5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan or sorry,
6 Donald.
7
8 MR. MIKE: Yes, Madame Chair. If
9 there's any other agenda item that the Council wish to
10 add to the agenda before we can make the final -- take
11 the final action that -- I think that would expedite
12 things or make things run smoothly.
13
14 Thank you.
15
16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
17 other additions to the agenda?
18
19 (No comments)
20
21 MR. O'HARA: Hearing none, Madam, I
22 make a motion to amend -- a friendly amendment to add
23 the two agenda items, the Fish and Wildlife 16-34 --
24 hey, we can hear ourselves.....
25
26 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah.
27
28 MR. O'HARA:and 70P 16-35, the
29 harvest near the den area or something like that.
30
31 Madame Chair.
32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
34
35 MR. O'HARA: Need a second.
36
37 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, I'll second
38 that.
39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
41 been a motion by Dan O'Hara to amend the agenda to add
42 two wildlife proposals as he mentioned. And then
43 seconded by Nanci Morris. All in favor say aye.
44
45 IN UNISON: Aye.
46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
48 opposition?
49
50 (No opposing votes)

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
2 Then we need to vote on the main motion to approve --
3 to approve the agenda. All in favor.....
4
5 MR. WILSON: Madam.....
6
7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK:say aye.
8 Sorry.
9
10 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.....
11
12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.
13
14 MR. WILSON:I so move.
15
16 MR. O'HARA: No, it's already been
17 moved.
18
19 MS. MORRIS LYON: It's already.....
20
21 MR. WILSON: Oh, it's already been.
22
23 IN UNISON: Aye.
24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
26 opposition?
27
28 (No opposing votes)
29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I guess number
31 6 will be review and approve previous meeting minutes.
32
33
34 MR. WILSON: Move to adopt.
35
36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: There's been a
37 motion to adopt the minutes.
38
39 MS. MORRIS LYON: I'll second that.
40
41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seconded by
42 Nanci Morris. And if no discussions all in favor say
43 aye.
44
45 MR. DUNAWAY: Just for brief
46 discussion, Madame Chair, I've looked these over and
47 they seem to be in order to me so I see no corrections.
48
49 Thank you.
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. All in
2 favor say aye.
3
4 IN UNISON: Aye.
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
7 opposition?
8
9 (No opposing votes)
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seeing none,
12 approval of the minutes.
13
14 Okay. Number 7 would be reports,
15 Council member reports.
16
17 Dan Dunaway, any.....
18
19 MR. DUNAWAY: At this time, Madame
20 Chair, I don't really have any reports. I think when
21 we get to some of our wildlife proposals I'll as
22 Secretary of the Nushagak Advisory Committee I'll try
23 to kind of update at least what the Advisory Committee
24 has come up with, but I'll have to say those minutes
25 are in a draft state and haven't been approved yet.
26
27 Thank you.
28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
30 Senafont.
31
32 MR. SHUGAK: I don't have any report at
33 this time. Being that it's my first meeting here, just
34 trying to get used to or, you know, what's expected of
35 me on -- in this whole process there. So, I'm sorry, I
36 don't have a report.
37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, don't
39 feel bad. We're still learning as we go.
40
41 Richard.
42
43 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. I have
44 nothing at this time. A conversation will come along
45 I'm sure.
46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Nanci.
48
49 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah. Thank you,
50 Madame Chair. I -- you know, I would just report that,

1 you know, it was a successful summer with plenty of
2 fish and even though I didn't get out myself to catch a
3 moose for the fall hunt, I had lots of reports from
4 successful hunters which was nice to hear because it's
5 been a while since I've heard that much positive
6 reaction from folks in the field on that fall hunt.

7

8

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

9

10 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair. Richard and
11 I were just talking at breakfast this morning that we
12 had a pretty good moose season on the east side.
13 However if we want to figure out what a caribou is we
14 may have to go to the zoo in Anchorage with our
15 grandkids to find out what caribou looks like. So
16 that's not a good report.

17

18

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Pete.

19

20 MR. ABRAHAM: Well, I -- I'm learning
21 about a lot of things being a grandpa. And I thought
22 being grandpa that I was the leader, I was the guy to
23 go get them, but this -- this fall every time I say I'm
24 going with you guys they quit talking. The next thing
25 I know the boats are -- the boats are disappearing.
26 Gas station is no line, no nothing. So the grandkids
27 are grown now and they're doing all the work, going
28 after moose, fish, whatever. And I'm glad to this day
29 I taught them how to do it. I mean, it's worthwhile to
30 be a grandpa and to teach the younger generations how
31 you do -- going about subsisting and respecting and
32 respecting the other people's property out in the
33 field. It's worth it that I taught them. So I'm
34 especially proud of two boys, two grandkids I got over
35 there. One of them is taking after my footsteps, his
36 name is Kameil. He went to Kenai with us and gave a
37 presentation of what they done last -- all summer. I
38 remember -- I don't know whether I mentioned this or
39 not before, I started what they call a Ranger for a
40 Day. Taking your children up the river and stuff and
41 showing them how to pick plants out, what not. Well,
42 he done that this summer. And he gave a presentation
43 on our IT program -- meeting over there. He made me
44 proud. In fact, he done better than I did, that make
45 me a little jealous too.

46

47

(Laughter)

48

49

MR. ABRAHAM: But anyway he got off --

50 he got off on the right foot and he's doing it and I

1 hope he keeps doing it.

2

3 And my advice to you guys, all of us
4 anyway, don't ever, ever make a wall grow up -- build
5 up behind -- in front of you guys and your younger
6 generation and you guys, keep the wall down, talk to
7 them, be open, talk to them about a problem, talk to
8 them about -- to point lot of -- lot of things. And
9 there's a few good parents on this earth over here.
10 Like one good parent I know right now is Molly
11 Chythlook, one of the good parents in Dillingham here.
12 I'm proud of her too. So let's be good parents and
13 good grandpas to our younger generation.

14

15 Thank you.

16

17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Now that's --
18 I'm very honored to have Adam or Abraham say that.

19

20 Thank you.

21

22 I don't have anything -- any reports
23 regarding the Chair or regarding the RAC program that
24 we have. Like any other people here observing our
25 residents that live around us, they -- I think this
26 summer and even to the fall here has been successful as
27 far as subsistence resource harvesting is concerned.
28 And I'm thankful that people are -- people were able to
29 successfully harvest, the ones that made an attempt.
30 So with that we'll just be continued to be thankful for
31 what we have and all the protection that we've been
32 granted as far as resources that we've been given thus
33 far.

34

35 Thank you, Council members, for your
36 reports.

37

38 And at this time -- and I think this is
39 the most important section of our agenda is to invite
40 the public for comments. And our practice has been to
41 have this open for any of you that have any knowledge
42 and the items that you would like to discuss. And we
43 really appreciate the people that come and share with
44 us what's not on the agenda item and then what your
45 concerns are for us to listen to. And we -- from my
46 observation and my experience since I've been on this
47 Board this section of our agenda has always been a very
48 good informational portion of this meeting. So the
49 floor is open now for any of you that have non-agenda
50 items that you would like to discuss at this time.

1 (No comments)
2
3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Is there
4 anybody that has any knowledge and items?
5
6 (No comments)
7
8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
9
10 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, Molly, too don't we
11 usually invite folks that want to speak specifically to
12 items as we go through the agenda that we'll try to
13 make time for them at that time as well. So and what
14 is there a blue card process we have. So anyway we
15 certainly welcome public comments, it's really
16 important.
17
18 Thank you.
19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, and then
21 throughout the -- throughout the day we have these --
22 we have these cards that you can fill out.
23
24 And, Donald, do you have a comment?
25
26 MR. MIKE: Yes. Thank you, Madame
27 Chair. On the agenda items if the public wish to
28 provide comment or testimony we have blue cards in the
29 -- at the sign in table. You can put your name down,
30 the agency you represent or if you're an individual.
31 And if you wish to speak on a specific agenda item or
32 proposal please indicate on a blue card.
33
34 Thank you.
35
36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Hazel
37 Nelson.
38
39 MS. NELSON: Thank you, Madame Chair.
40 I'm glad to be out here in Dillingham with you today.
41 I wanted to express that the Commissioner's concerns on
42 subsistence statewide had been a priority with the new
43 administration. He has made a lot of efforts to engage
44 on subsistence related concerns as well as the
45 Lieutenant Governor, they have a really close working
46 relationship and to the extent that our Division can
47 assist we'd be glad to. I am deferring to the managers
48 on management related questions at this meeting. You
49 couldn't hear him, but on the phone is Drew Crawford
50 and since you may not be able to hear his comments

1 those of us who are here may be making the State
2 comments. We don't plan on commenting on everything,
3 just on some of the proposals.

4
5 And there's a new person in the
6 Commissioner's Office, her name is Jill Kline. She
7 just started recently and although she is not here with
8 us today she is at another RAC meeting and she'll be
9 participating in this process, helping the
10 Commissioner's Office stay engaged on RAC concerns,
11 Federal subsistence concerns and she'll be helping me
12 as well on Yukon River Panel issues. Some Kuskokwim
13 issues and perhaps some other wildlife related issues.
14 It's still too early to see the extent to which she'll
15 be engaging in a lot of these concerns, but she's a
16 great new member of the team and I'm sure that at
17 future Bristol Bay RAC meetings you'll be meeting her.

18
19 In the Division itself we have -- we've
20 been advertising to make some replacements. As you
21 know, Daven Hollen has moved on. We're in the process
22 now of filling that position. It'll be filled very
23 soon. I recognize that he's a PI on a couple of
24 research projects that have been proposed and that
25 position will be filled soon. I think you'll be
26 pleased to meet our new PI. That person will be
27 engaging in future Bristol Bay RAC meetings. And
28 there's a couple other -- there's an SRC III position,
29 Meredith Markeone and Sara Hazelo have both moved on
30 and we'll be filling those positions as well. Those --
31 both of those folks have done a lot of really good work
32 for Bristol Bay on research projects. So both of those
33 positions will be filled shortly.

34
35 Thank you, Madame Chair.

36
37 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you,
38 Hazel. Do you have any questions for Hazel at this
39 point?

40
41 (No comments)

42
43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seeing none,
44 thank you, Hazel, that was good.

45
46 At this time I'm going to call on
47 Courtenay to make an announcement regarding our lunch.

48
49 MS. CARTY: I need to do it on the
50 record?

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yes.

2

3 MS. CARTY: Good morning. Thank you,
4 Madame Chair. For the record I'm Courtenay Carty. We
5 will have a potluck lunch when we break here. I
6 believe we're going to break when the bell rings for
7 lunch. The potluck will be up at BBNA and we've got
8 some crockpots going up there already and hopefully
9 everybody can join us. I think in our discussion this
10 morning, I'm not sure if you've made a decision if
11 people are going to go directly to BBNA or if we're
12 going to have a set time, but that's obviously the call
13 of the Chair.

14

15 Thank you.

16

17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I think we
18 should have a set time. According to Donald we're
19 breaking here at 11:00 o'clock and I think we need to
20 set a time for lunch. And I'm going to say if we're
21 going to break here at 11:00 let's all plan to be at
22 the BBNA at noon. And what's the location, is
23 that.....

24

25 MS. CARTY: We'll be in the main board
26 room at BBNA. So for our guests the BBNA is at the top
27 of the Windmill Hill and it's -- there's like a house
28 property and then it's a right-hand turn. You'll see a
29 lot of large colored classrooms I guess is the first
30 building and then our potluck will be in the brown
31 building. And it's the first -- you'll got in the
32 door, you'll see the receptionist, you'll take a left
33 and then you'll see everybody. So that's all.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. So
36 let's plan on being at BBNA for lunch at 12:00 o'clock.

37

38 Thank you, Courtenay.

39

40 And I think I saw somebody walk in,
41 Frank Woods. Introduction.

42

43 MR. WOODS: Madame Chair. Thank you
44 for addressing or recognizing me. I'm here to
45 represent the Nushagak Advisory Committee. We reviewed
46 our own proposals this last meeting. In general we
47 thank the OSM and their process and there are changes
48 we agreed to, the same day airborne, the caribou
49 proposals, was our best effort to provide opportunity
50 on the Nushagak peninsula, but also align State and

1 Federal regulations to help the people in our area. I
2 think at the ground level and moving into management
3 side in the whole regime of staff behind me, that we
4 worked together on not only helping align the
5 proposals, but also make it easier for the users and
6 the subsistence users in particular that we not only at
7 the ground level and in management arenas have tried to
8 align as much as possible all the proposals that
9 everybody's faced with. When in holders like we are
10 just on the edge of Togiak National Wildlife Refuge, we
11 benefit from those management protections for rural
12 resident subsistence priority. We also have to sit in
13 the arena of State and I'm here to represent the AC and
14 why we recommended those changes, and we sit down and
15 for the last three or four cycles we've ironed out a
16 lot of differences in the 17A moose management plan,
17 the -- and that was -- that came from the village of
18 Togiak and Manokotak actually creating their own
19 mandates of restrictions on themselves to help that
20 population grow.

21

22 I'm here to thank you guys for
23 addressing this issue and OSM for taking on the
24 responsibility of outlining all the white paper that
25 came out. I really was impressed with all the work
26 that gets done in every proposal. In the arena I sit
27 in the majority of that we leave up to staff at ADF&G
28 and I see that it's just as important on the Federal
29 side and it's more left up to the agency responsibility
30 to come up with all the different alternatives. And
31 the AC process that's a little bit different, we put
32 that into public forum, we have a lot of public
33 testimony, we sit there and has it out in committee
34 meetings, you all know the process, and this process
35 seemed a little more user friendly that they outlined
36 alternatives, actions to be taken, impacts,
37 environmental impact statement and it goes through the
38 NEPA process. That whole process I think is a little
39 bit cumbersome for people to understand and I'll look
40 back and ask how many public do we have here today?
41 Yay.

42

43 (Applause)

44

45 MR. WOODS. That's -- that's the most
46 important person in the room. I'm -- what I -- I guess
47 my charge is how to engage more public, but also engage
48 more young people. Because time and time again I sit
49 in these meetings and we talk about number 1 the
50 philosophy that we're supposed to be helping and this

1 is a public process, but there's less and less public
2 participating because number 1 there is a huge, I think
3 a -- it's discouragement that when -- and I'll talk
4 about it from my own perspective, I'll put my Nushagak
5 Advisory aside and say number 1 we agree with all the
6 changes, thank you. My own personal opinion is number
7 1 we live in a -- basically a -- we still have a lot of
8 traditional minded and valued people out there, that
9 when they get tired of arguing, when they get tired of
10 fighting, I tell you what there's a whole generation
11 that thinks when they come to this table this is the
12 law, you guys are the law. And when they address you
13 and they think that you're going to change that law on
14 -- based on their testimony, and I see this time and
15 time again in rural Alaska, not on the State side, but
16 on the Federal side, that when they address you they
17 think that law's going to be addressed and their needs
18 are going to be met. And when that stops happening, I
19 think we -- we're less and less effective in that
20 arena. That's why I work hard and really address and I
21 applaud the management for working together. On the
22 State side we have our local biologist, both the past
23 and the present, working with the Federal system on the
24 -- in different arenas, not only the caribou, the bear,
25 the wolf, everything, every issue they work together on
26 a ground level. That's great.

27

28 I just attended a meeting on Friday of
29 last week when the National Park Service did a
30 directive in the rulemaking process and they're -- it
31 was a real hinderance to the whole process. I guess it
32 -- when I came out of that meeting I was pretty
33 impressed that the National Petroleum Reserve came up
34 with a process of their own to address each issue on a
35 Federal level because of all of the unfunded mandates
36 in every Federal system that I see that they can't take
37 action on and listen to the rural public and what
38 they're representing, I have a heartburn. I sat in
39 this chair and under the Chairman's regime at BBNA
40 Subsistence, we formed a -- basically a predator
41 control program that somebody said they would never
42 have in our area. That program was designed to help
43 the declining population of Mulchatna caribou
44 population. What Molly did was set up a pretty
45 stringent program not only at the Board of Game level,
46 but staff under Robbin La Vine's directive, she set up
47 a moose and caribou habitat project that meant it
48 brought all the players to the table and worked out the
49 differences. The proposals that are before you today,
50 the caribou and the moose ones, are a result of that

1 work.

2

3

Thank you, Molly.

4

5

6 Now as a result of all that work we in
7 the area have a healthy terrible moose population. It
8 might not be as good on the peninsula and that's from
9 -- and also interior, the Lake and Pen. The last time
10 I heard the Lake and Pen have a study on subsistence,
11 it was a subsistence timber wolf study that came out of
12 Lake Clark and Pen and their average take of wolves was
13 1.75 or 1.5 wolves per year. I don't know anybody that
14 has to eat wolf or has to -- if it comes down to that I
15 think we're all in trouble. My question to the Park
16 Service and these unbanded -- basically they're under a
17 different regime, I understand that. With the Park
18 Service we have a different plan. Number 1 we have to
19 operate and I'll tell you a local person in every arena
20 we have to operate under a different plan, that puts us
21 into hinderance of not being able to understand the
22 processes within that Federal bureaucracy. Your charge
23 is to help provide subsistence opportunity and really
24 that's the charge that we all have. What I seen in the
25 National Petroleum Reserve, they call it mitigation
26 strategy, it outlined the process from beginning to end
27 to address each item and address each little detail in
28 that Federal system, the outcome was going to be
29 positive not only for the villages and the communities
30 of Nuiqsut, but also I could see that, envisioning that
31 process working here in Bristol Bay is why I'm
32 testifying that now we have a process the Federal
33 government adopted, we have a process the Federal
34 government recognizes and if you look at the Bristol
35 Bay plan and how much that -- controversy that came --
36 that charge was from BLM, it changed how we look at
37 public process at least in my mind. The public process
38 is supposed to engage in certain levels of
39 understanding that litigated basically how we engage.

39

40

41 Well, I guess my philosophy I'm getting
42 at is we have a lot of issues here, I'm not going to
43 get into them, but I really would encourage OSM, U.S.
44 Fish and Wildlife Service, the Park Service and every
45 agency we deal with including the Federal Subsistence
46 Board to look at a new way of doing business, that we
47 all work together. My idea of Alaska is a unified
48 Alaska, that we on the ground level work together as
49 State and Federal agencies to help provide subsistence
50 opportunity for our people. When that gets taken away
51 and that process gets litigated through a Park Service

1 regulation that went from compendiums for five or 10
2 years, that was -- that was a regime that they used to
3 block any predator management on Federal lands. When
4 they came up with a rulemaking that changed everything,
5 I think we have to address the process and I guess my
6 recommendation in my public testimony is to keep
7 working at this.

8

9 Thank you.

10

11 And I guess that's the hardest part in
12 the world. I've got 10 different hats and I just came
13 down from my day job to testify on behalf of the
14 Nushagak Advisory and I'll let Dan Dunaway, he's our
15 Secretary for that, in your deliberation they come up.
16 He's well vetted on this whole process.

17

18 So I'm not going to get into all my own
19 personal details on how things are run, but I really
20 would like to also recommend not only OSM, but also
21 Federal Subsistence Board looking at -- they called it
22 -- I don't have a presentation, but BLM came up with
23 this presentation, it was the mitigation process that
24 actually outlined and came up with positive outcomes
25 that we could use in different arenas.

26

27 Thank you.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you,
30 Frank. Any question from the Board for Frank?

31

32 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

33

34 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

35

36 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Frank,
37 appreciate your confidence in me. Some of what you're
38 bringing up here though I'm a little unfamiliar with.
39 I just want to make sure I understand. So there's kind
40 of a new process that the National Petroleum Reserve
41 came up with and they call it -- was it mitigation?

42

43 MR. WOODS: Mitigation. The
44 terminology was NPR-A mitigation strategy.

45

46 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay.

47

48 MR. WOODS: The strategy was to
49 identify the problem, say we have a -- well, a mandate
50 from Federal reserve, Federal government, Federal

1 whatever it may be. How they attack it is not looking
2 at the whole picture, they picked out pieces that we're
3 actually working on and I -- I've seen this happen in
4 different communities. If we're in consensus we're
5 able to move forward, correct, that process was able to
6 actually take them details and move forward with them
7 details. The outcome was positive. Now on the other
8 spectrum it set the mitigation, litigation, whatever it
9 may be, on the side so they could move forward. That
10 was pretty impressive, that was the first time I'd seen
11 the Federal government not only recognize a new way of
12 -- actually a productive way of dealing with things
13 because we're dealing with how many different Federal
14 lands in Alaska. If we're dealing with Park Service,
15 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, all the different
16 agencies how do we attack that as our -- how do we pick
17 that apart and come up with a positive outcome.

18

19 That's -- thank you, Dan.

20

21 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

24

25 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you. Another kind
26 of follow-up to that, it does sound very interesting.
27 I know one of my personal goals sitting on this
28 committee is to as much as possible see regulations
29 come together and work together in that very spirit,
30 but if there's a more efficient process I'd sure be
31 interested in it. But you also specifically brought up
32 predator control and specifically the Park Service.
33 And in our Advisory Committee we didn't really discuss
34 that too much. So if there was a -- you know, a little
35 more detail or are you going to be around to speak to
36 that later, I just want to make sure I understand.

37

38 Thank you.

39

40 MR. WOODS: What I testified on was the
41 National Park Service's regulation policy on
42 strengthening their stance on wolf and bear control in
43 the Park Service. What I asked the Director of
44 National Park Service in the Alaska Region was how do
45 you expect the villages and Nondalton in holders and
46 the Air Park Service and the fringes of that Park
47 Service, how do you expect them to feed themselves. In
48 that process he just -- he was dumbfounded, he didn't
49 understand what I was talking about. Well, I said
50 number 1, you say we have a -- there's no sports

1 hunting on Park land, but you provide subsistence
2 opportunity and the only report that I can see that
3 came out of the Park Service was subsistence wolf --
4 timber wolf study out of Lake Clark National Park and
5 Preserve, I said Nondalton hasn't been able to hunt
6 caribou or moose on a pretty consistent basis, how do
7 you expect the villages and in holders in like
8 Dillingham to provide subsistence opportunity, they
9 don't even recognize that this is a hinderance to that
10 ability to manage for human consumptive use. At least
11 the State recognizes amount necessary for subsistence
12 for goodness sakes. So the Park Service Director said
13 his answer to that and then I was sitting there with
14 him and I forget his name, his name was Doug and the
15 other guy's name was John, I got them mixed up in the
16 whole meeting so I'm -- you know, I'm trying to get my
17 point across is how do you provide subsistence
18 opportunity and his answer was to feed them fish. It
19 really ticked me off that I had to sit there and
20 imagine the whole village of Nondalton eating fish all
21 year. So I said number 1, how the villages have come
22 up with an alternative plan on how to deal with eating
23 fish plus they have to wait for their ceremonial
24 permit, when someone dies they have a potluck or a
25 potlatch in the village. And I'm not here to represent
26 the villages, but I'm -- I -- that is my -- just my
27 observation. And correct me if I'm wrong that the
28 villages that we represent have to look forward to
29 eating red meat and providing food for their families
30 and that even to taste a caribou or moose that they
31 have to wait for somebody to die. That's a crying
32 shame that this day and age, and I can name Port
33 Heiden's, I have buddies in Port Heiden that do the
34 same thing, they have a caribou population and we have
35 bear control on State lands, but the Federal government
36 will not recognize it on the back side of it. In that
37 process we -- we'll miss the boat and there's that
38 mitigation process I was talking about when we sit
39 there and we look at a problem and each agency and each
40 individual different bureaucracy be it the Forest
41 Service, be it the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, be
42 it NOAA, be it -- however it looks that we take that
43 process and we use it to our advantage because number
44 1, I want to come up with yes, I want to come up with
45 everybody's satisfied.

46

So thank you, Dan.

47

48

49

MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you. I hope you
50 might be around if we get into discussing this. I know

1 you've got many obligations, but I appreciate your
2 answer.

3

4 Thank you.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
7 you, Frank. If there's any other questions?

8

9 (No comments)

10

11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you,
12 Frank.....

13

14 MR. WOODS: Thanks.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK:that was
17 informational. Anybody else from the audience?

18

19 Gayla.

20

21 MS. HOSETH: Good morning, Madame Chair
22 and members of the Council. For the record my name is
23 Gayla Hoseth and I'm the Subsistence Research
24 Specialist at Bristol Bay Native Association. I'm here
25 to present the Council with information from the Alaska
26 Migratory Bird Co-Management Council. I'm the primary
27 representative for the Bristol Bay Region and the two
28 issues that I wanted to bring to your attention is the
29 wanton waste language that got adopted by the Pacific
30 Flyway Council and the Service Regulations Committee.

31

32 So for the proposed regulatory language
33 was to amend subsection 92.4 by adding a definition for
34 edible meat and by revising the definition for non-
35 wasteful taking treaty as follows. Edible meat means
36 the meat from the breast, back, thighs, legs, wings,
37 gizzard and heart, however the head, neck, feet and
38 other internal organs and the skin are optional. These
39 optional parts will be considered inedible byproducts
40 and not edible meat for the other provision of that
41 part. The non-wasteful taking will be defined as means
42 taking -- means making a reasonable effort to retrieve
43 all birds killed or wounded and retainable edible meat
44 until the birds have been transported to a location
45 where they'll be consumed. And this was originally
46 requested by the Bristol Bay Regional Management Body
47 in 2014. It was recommended that all edible parts of a
48 migratory waterfowl must be salvaged and harvested when
49 harvested. This issue originally arose on the
50 Athabaskan of Village Council President's Region after

1 an incident occurred where tundra swans were only
2 breasted and the carcasses found discarded. The
3 concern raised by Alaska Native representatives is
4 indigenous inhabitants are eligible to participate in
5 subsistence harvest and since the definition of
6 indigenous inhabitants includes any person, any race,
7 permanently residing in Alaska. These potential
8 harvesters will come from a variety of culture groups
9 and not necessarily know or understand the importance
10 of retaining the Alaska Native cultural and traditional
11 practices and ethics when participating in this
12 harvest.

13

14 It is the desire of the AMBCC Native
15 Caucus that regulations be adopted that include
16 retaining the whole bird for food and other uses. The
17 justification for the proposal is to follow the intent
18 of traditional subsistence harvest of migratory birds
19 and curb wanton waste. It is normal practice of all --
20 of Alaska Native hunters to utilize all parts of the
21 animals caught for subsistence and it was felt that
22 both the State and Federal regulations regarding wanton
23 waste are not restrictive enough. The State
24 requirements will be more restrictive as a result of
25 these efforts, however this regulation proposed by the
26 AMBCC is additionally more restrictive than State or
27 Federal regulations.

28

29 So that was approved at the Pacific
30 Flyway Council and the SRC. There's going to be time
31 for people to comment on the proposal at the end of the
32 year and that will be in the 2016 spring and summer
33 regulations booklet. So that was a really -- that was
34 a really good moving a step -- moving forward at the
35 AMBCC and it was unanimously passed by AMBCC to have
36 more restrictive wanton waste language for the
37 subsistence hunt.

38

39 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

42

43 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair. I
44 think that was, you know, part of the agency reports.
45 And, Madame Chair, if we can focus on our agenda, we've
46 got some (indiscernible), but we'll have plenty of time
47 for the Council to address agency reports. And thank
48 you for your report and if you need to address the
49 Council again to take action or consider
50 recommendations I think that would be fit under the

1 agency.....
2
3 MS. HOSETH: Under agencies?
4
5 MR. MIKE:agency reports.
6
7 MS. HOSETH: Okay.
8
9 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
10
11 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
12
13 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
14
15 MR. O'HARA: Gayla, are you finished?
16
17 MS. HOSETH: Well, if he wants me to
18 bring it up under agency reports I'll be happy to come
19 back and address the Council at that time.
20
21 MR. O'HARA: Oh, I had one question on
22 an acronym, AMBCC, what does that stand for?
23
24 MS. HOSETH: Alaska Migratory Bird Co-
25 Management Council.
26
27 MR. O'HARA: Oh, okay. That's -- yeah,
28 thank you. That's interesting on the wanton waste
29 thing, yeah.
30
31 MS. HOSETH: Uh-huh.
32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Yeah,
34 you can come back under agency reports and we'll deal
35 with that.
36
37 MS. HOSETH: Okay. Thank you, Madame
38 Chair.
39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Pete.
41
42 MS. HOSETH: I guess I didn't see it on
43 the agenda.
44
45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Pete.
46
47 MS. HOSETH: So.....
48
49 MR. ABRAHAM: I had a -- I glanced at
50 the -- at one of those cards on somebody's report.

1 When we -- emperor geese is one of the special birds
2 that Native people rely on. And when it come to wanton
3 waste the agencies should approach the elders first
4 before they approach the college kids in Fairbanks or
5 wherever. Wanton waste is something we don't have a
6 word for in Native villages. Wanton waste is where I
7 hear when it comes to sportsmen collecting or ptarmigan
8 or whatever, taking only breasts. The Yup'ik people
9 don't have any wanton waste words around the villages
10 especially when it comes to the elders surviving out
11 there. So if you approach even in Togiak elders first
12 about wanton waste you will understand more how the
13 Yup'ik way of life is living in those times. But of
14 course the times are changing today. Our younger
15 generation we don't know exactly how they -- how they
16 hunt out there because it's a little scary out there
17 sometimes when the younger generation go out to hunt.
18 As for spring hunting Togiak for over 20 years has been
19 very careful not to harvest emperor geese in the
20 springtime. But if you go further up north Goodnews,
21 Platinum, Quinhagak, that's a different story. Even
22 Eek. But you go further west out there from there on
23 again (in Native) those are entirely different. They
24 do harvest emperor geese out there every year. Because
25 every year about December, maybe January, because I
26 know those people, I make random calls here and there
27 because they'll tell me how they're doing, how I
28 observe because the graph of the emperor geese it never
29 changes much. The people still harvest those emperor
30 geese out there. And then the people don't trap white
31 foxes, red fox, otters, minks anymore. Those are the
32 worst predators out there in the field beside the human
33 being. So if the emperor geese lays five eggs, never
34 more than five, out of that five eggs sometimes none
35 survives because of the predators, not a human being,
36 but the foxes, white fox, mink, there are other
37 predators out there. So I have lived all these -- all
38 these bad things when I was young -- a younger guy
39 around Nelson Island, that's where I come from. I know
40 how it's happening out there. I know these people,
41 they trust me and they tell me what they're doing out
42 there because they know I won't tell on them. But I
43 keep checking on those because of curiosity. The
44 emperor geese is not going to go sky high and it's not
45 going to go way down, that's another problem right
46 there. But in this area over here is really not any
47 danger of people over hunting it, whatever they're
48 hunting out there.

49
50

That's all I want you to know because

1 contact your elders out there in the village if you're
2 ready to learn -- if you want to learn some more.

3

4 Thank you.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you,
7 Gayla. We'll get into more of your information during
8 the agency reports.

9

10 Thank you.

11

12 MS. HOSETH: Thank you.

13

14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Let's move on
15 to the old business. I guess it's the redfish Board of
16 Fish proposal.

17

18 Donald, are you going to be dealing
19 with this?

20

21 MR. MIKE: Yes, Madame Chair. The
22 redfish Board of Fish proposal was submitted by Mr.
23 Richard Wilson. And you'll find the -- you'll find the
24 actual proposal on page 11 in your meeting materials.
25 It was submitted to the Board of Fish for Mr. Richard
26 Wilson. And the Council discussed this at their last
27 meeting so we -- the Council approved the language and
28 I assisted Mr. Wilson to develop that proposal and it
29 went further.

30

31 And, Mr. Wilson, if you want to
32 elaborate on the proposal so you can talk to the
33 Council. And I understand Gene Sandone would like to
34 address this Council on this proposal once the
35 Council's discussed this and asked for testimony. And
36 I got some background information I can share with the
37 Council. And I'll give the table to Mr. Wilson.

38

39 Thank you, Madame Chair.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
42 Richard, you got the table.

43

44 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, thank you.
45 This has been a while in coming, finally we got
46 something in writing here. It's been worked at on all
47 ends. In the personal level where it started out at
48 this Council with our local Katmai National Park,
49 agency people. I'm very thankful for all the input and
50 trying to get language together that would -- that we

1 can move forward on. And this is just a -- there's not
2 many opportunities in a national park to try to, you
3 know, upgrade or, you know, move forward in any kind of
4 language there so it's -- this is very -- it's been a
5 challenging -- pretty challenging for all agencies
6 here. And I appreciate it all. I came to this Council
7 hoping to get their blessing on and have them move
8 forward with this proposal and I guess it's come out in
9 the individual's name here, but I'm hoping that, you
10 know, we can go forward with it, whatever the case may
11 be because it's all about the people and their needs.
12 And the language here we had approved, semi approved,
13 and just looking for the Council's input on this,
14 welcome others also. I know it's -- we're getting
15 close to the time here when we need to, you know,
16 hopefully they can move on it. And so I'm looking for
17 any input, it's been out here a while.

18

19 Thank you.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

22

23 MR. MIKE: Yes, Madame Chair. This
24 proposal is submitted by the Bristol Bay Regional
25 Advisory Council. It is already in Board of Fish
26 meeting materials. So the Board of Fish will be
27 meeting in -- for Bristol Bay fin fish in Anchorage
28 November 30th through December 9th. And if the Council
29 wish to send someone on behalf of the Council to
30 participate in the Board of Fish process this would be
31 an opportunity also.

32

33 Thank you, Madame Chair.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Dan, do
36 you have.....

37

38 MR. O'HARA: Yeah. Richard, let's see
39 the geographical locations that is on this map that's
40 put before us, is that satisfactory with your proposal
41 that is going to ADF&G.....

42

43 MR. WILSON: If you.....

44

45 MR. O'HARA:different locations
46 that -- where you fished redfish?

47

48 MR. WILSON: Through the Chair, Mr.
49 O'Hara. Yes, there's been a lot of discussion on -- we
50 added in the language there was addition to an area and

1 that was Idavians Creek. And if you guys have the maps
2 here it shows there it's in the north side of -- in the
3 Bay of Islands there. It's one other -- one other
4 drainage that has been traditionally used and we wanted
5 to include that in this proposal just so it would be a
6 more complete usage of the people. Right now the
7 redfish regulation as it reads everything is closed in
8 Lake Iliamna and all of us users know that this is the
9 time of year when you need to go get it. And it's --
10 and right now the only thing that's open up there is
11 the Brooks. And it's a ways in the lake, we use that
12 as a last resort when weather's good, but there's other
13 options that we have. And with times and funding and
14 stuff nobody likes to extend a lot of energy and stuff
15 out there because this is -- it's just a food resource
16 and we follow -- you know, follow the fish. You know,
17 you get them when you first -- first hitting the bay in
18 the spring, you know, you put that first one in the pot
19 and boil them up and, you know, as you go along you put
20 some up in the smokehouse and then later on in the fall
21 when -- when they get up into the lakes and they -- all
22 the fat leaves and, you know, they change colors and we
23 have a desire to have them then. And I feel like this
24 is the opportunity here to kind of help that in our
25 area up in Naknek Lake. So that's why we included
26 Idavians Creek in some of the language here to keep it
27 open longer, not necessarily earlier or later, it just
28 -- just keep it open for a longer period of time
29 throughout these other areas so that we have access to
30 that resource. And that was the whole idea here.

31

32 Thank you.

33

34 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

35

36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

37

38 MR. O'HARA: Richard, this proposal had
39 -- had it's beginning in a committee form in Naknek, I
40 think it was an open forum and mainly the Park Service
41 people were there when we addressed this and one of the
42 concerns we had was the time and areas that we would
43 fish these redfish in relationship to the tourists that
44 were coming to the Brooks mainly I think. And I think
45 we were all pretty satisfied if I remember correctly
46 that the times in which we would do the redfish would
47 be the time when the redfish were available at the
48 stage that we wanted them because that's a cultural
49 thing and I'm also glad to see the beach seine where
50 you -- if you have other species in there that you

1 don't want, you know, like trout or something else then
2 you can let them go. I think it -- if the Park Service
3 side of it's happy and we're happy it's a big
4 accomplishment.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 MR. WILSON: I'm sorry, what was the
9 question?

10
11 MR. O'HARA: The question was the time
12 and areas that we're going to be catching these fish
13 are pretty much the way we had -- you had proposed it
14 earlier; is that right?

15
16 MR. WILSON: Yes, it is. Yes. We're
17 okay with -- the only real concern it seemed like the
18 Park Service had was that they didn't want to have it
19 interfere with the Brooks -- you know, relationship to
20 Brooks Camp. So it was -- September 18th was their --
21 was their time of closure and after that it was
22 appropriate to do Brooks River then. So.....

23
24 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

25
26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan Dunaway.

27
28 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you, Madame
29 Chair. When I first got back into this country in '89
30 this was a percolating problem then and I never could
31 see why it should be so much of a problem, it's been a
32 glacial process, but I really want to compliment some
33 of the more recent Park Service people for being
34 willing to work on this. And there's been some times
35 where people got -- prominent people got busted for
36 doing traditional stuff which I think turned into an
37 embarrassment for everybody. So I'm inclined, really
38 strongly inclined, to support this if the folks who
39 live closest to it feel that it's workable. Do we have
40 gear adequately designed in this proposal and then one
41 other question I have is do we need to move -- make a
42 motion to support this or -- anyway.

43
44 Thank you, Madame Chair.

45
46 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

47
48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

49
50 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. Yeah, I

1 understand that there's some language that we need to
2 review yet that could possibly change some gear
3 restrictions or identify gear sizes and things. So I'm
4 willing to, you know, open that up if need be here.

5
6 Thank you, Madame Chair.

7
8 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

9
10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

11
12 MR. O'HARA: Well, this wasn't a
13 giveaway program by the Park Service by any means.
14 This had its origin with the Bristol Bay Native
15 Corporation, I was on the Board of Directors and
16 Chaired the Land Committee when we put a bill through
17 Congress to give this redfish area. And this is where
18 you people who are new, you -- all you people who have
19 been here for the last 20 years heard me say this over,
20 but it's worth repeating for new people that this was
21 an act of Congress. No place in the country can you
22 put a gill net, seine or anything else in the Park
23 Service subsistence, that does not exist. So this
24 didn't come without a few labor pains. And but I do
25 appreciate the fact that we have at the present time
26 longtime management people in the Park Service and a
27 manager who on a regular basis comes to the assembly
28 meetings and to the Native Council meetings, Chamber
29 meetings and is involved in the community effort. This
30 goes back to Frank Woods' comments where we start
31 getting this working together without hurting the
32 resource or other entities, I mean, that's a giant step
33 and I'm delighted to see where we're at and if we need
34 to carry on.

35
36 Thank you, Madame Chair.

37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Anybody
39 else in the.....

40
41 MS. CARTY: Madame Chair.

42
43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Courtenay, do
44 you have a comment?

45
46 MS. CARTY: Yes, thank you, Madame
47 Chair. For the record, Courtenay Carty, BBNA. So in
48 the Board of Fish I guess planning process that BBNA
49 engages with the RAC, the ACs, the Tribes, and also
50 BBEDC in coordinating some of the efforts and attending

1 our BBEDC regional Fisheries Committee meeting back in
2 September. Gene Sandone, I'm sure he's still standing
3 by on the line, is BBEDC fisheries consultant for this
4 year's Board of Fish cycle. And through the work that
5 Gene's been doing at BBEDC, he went through and
6 reviewed each of the Bristol Bay fin fish Board of Fish
7 proposals and has provided BBEDC with comments and
8 suggested language on a variety of proposals, 78 of
9 which was included and I guess the language before you
10 today is the -- Gene's analysis and also BBEDC's
11 recommendation or support of this proposal with some
12 suggested language change. And I'm sure Gene would be
13 happy to speak to that. But basically the language
14 that Gene came up with essentially captures the actual
15 essence of your proposal as put forward, but cleans up
16 to essentially the reg book format, what it would look
17 like in terms of regulation. And so those are the
18 pieces of text I guess before you today and also
19 includes the gear specifications that I heard you guys
20 discussing on the record. So that's that.

21

22 Thank you, Madame Chair.

23

24 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

25 Courtenay, so this is a proposal that you're addressing
26 right now and the highlighted items are the ones that
27 were suggested?

28

29 MS. CARTY: Yeah. So on top of this
30 document your original proposal is this text here,
31 proposal 78 which you guys submitted to the Board as
32 well as the issue. So the suggested language here just
33 takes your text in paragraph format and puts it into
34 what it would look like in the reg book. And also
35 includes the gear specifications by spear, dip net,
36 gill net, beach seine in that section. So I'm not sure
37 if this is exactly what the RAC wants, but that's
38 something for you guys to discuss. And I'm not sure if
39 this location on the map based on Richard's comment
40 earlier is a new location that needs to be amended and
41 added into the proposal or if that location is already
42 included here. So that's probably something that you
43 guys should discuss.

44

45 Thank you, Madame Chair.

46

47 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

48

49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

50

1 MR. WILSON: Yeah, there's -- it -- I
2 need a little -- you know, I think we need a little
3 time to kind of digest some of this other language
4 here. I -- you know, we've been working on this so
5 long I -- to have this put in front of me here this
6 morning and say okay, this language is good and this
7 one isn't is -- seems like inappropriate. So I -- you
8 know, if we had an opportunity here this morning or
9 throughout the day or something to kind of sit as --
10 you know, in committee forum or something to help, you
11 know, bring before this Council some language in me
12 that would be great.

13

14 Thank you, Madame Chair.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, I think
17 that's -- that's a good decision to -- I mean, comment.

18

19

20 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

21

22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

23

24

25 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, Madame Chair,
26 Richard. I agree and I think -- might I suggest that
27 we could put this aside until right after lunch and
28 over lunch we could sit down and take a look at it and
29 analyze our thoughts about it. Would that work for
30 you?

31

32 MR. O'HARA: Good words.

33

34 MR. WILSON: Sounds good.

35

36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I guess
37 we'll.....

38

39 MR. ABRAHAM: On this proposal over
40 here I see by seine or dip net, gill net, beach seine,
41 but it's not saying what size of net -- what size of --
42 the net size is over here. It's the most important
43 thing right there. In Togiak Lake they use -- they
44 tried to use king nets, let the females go through the
45 net. I think and actually they get a smaller fish over
46 there. If you use a king net the females will go
47 through that king net and capture the males only.
48 That's how -- that's how it worked in Togiak Lake over
49 there.

50

1 (In Native)
2
3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
4 you, Pete. So would you want to develop a little
5 committee to work with you during lunch just so that we
6 could know who is going to be working with you.
7
8 MR. WILSON: I'm certainly open to
9 that, Madame Chair. And just looking for opinions
10 here.
11
12 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.
13
14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
15
16 MR. MIKE: Gene Sandone would like to
17 address this Council on this proposal.
18
19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. If
20 that'll give us a little bit more information for the
21 committee meets, yes.
22
23 MR. MIKE: Go ahead, Gene.
24
25 MR. SANDONE: Okay. Thank you, Madame
26 Chair and members of the Council. I just want to say
27 thank you for that introduction, clearly I appreciate
28 it. She said a lot of things that I was going to say,
29 but she said it a lot better.
30
31 We took -- we at BBEDC, the Fish
32 Resource Committee, took every proposal that either the
33 Board (indiscernible) and there's a bunch of them, and
34 we went through and analyzed them and made specific
35 recommendations and if you want to know any of those
36 proposals or recommendations and rationale behind those
37 recommendations I'd be happy to provide them. Our
38 proposal 78 specifically what the Committee did is they
39 took your language of what you wanted and tried to put
40 it into regulatory language with -- on 5 AAC 01.320,
41 lawful gear and your specifications. And what they did
42 is they just took your language and if you have it in
43 front of you, the bolt, underlined language is the ones
44 that we inserted and the ones -- and the capitalized
45 language in brackets is what we are taking out of the
46 regulation. So you can see that -- take for instance
47 under (b) under (2), it says from August 30th through
48 and then the new language is December 31st and we took
49 out September 30th and the language in there is by
50 spear, dip net, we took out and, gill net and beach

1 seine along a 100 yard length of west shore at Naknek
2 near the outlet to the Naknek River as marked by the
3 ADF&G regulatory markers. So that's how you read the
4 new language. And we're not sure if we captured what
5 you wanted, but we do support this proposal fully.

6
7 And we also recommend that you look at
8 your beach seine specifications that were seine
9 specifications. And I've been involved with selecting
10 harvest gear on the Yukon and we're coming around to
11 using three and a half inch mesh both in the beach
12 seines and the popular purse seines that we're using up
13 in the river to selectively harvest chum salmon for
14 commercial harvest. And I would recommend because you
15 have a lot of (indiscernible) species in the lake such
16 as trout and other whitefishes, you want to get your
17 mesh size small enough where you're not getting of
18 those species. So I would recommend looking at maybe
19 three and a half inch mesh.

20
21 So that's about all I have to say and
22 I'd be happy to answer any questions that you may have,
23 Madame Chair.

24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
26 questions for.....

27
28 Dan.

29
30 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair. Maybe I'll
31 wait for Courtenay, she might have some more info, but
32 I really appreciate what Gene's done and his
33 explanations.

34
35 Thank you.

36
37 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Courtenay.

38
39 MS. CARTY: Thank you, Madame Chair. I
40 just wanted to offer my office space at BBNA during the
41 break and if need be we could also get Gene on the
42 phone at that time to have the Committee meeting if
43 that's helpful. And then that would kind of be
44 separate off of lunch. And then the other thing would
45 be at the Board level. So obviously your proposal is
46 forward in the Board packet to be weighed in on, but
47 the suggested language I guess as Gene said doesn't
48 really change anything, it takes your language and puts
49 it into the regulatory format which would make the
50 Board -- easier to present to the Board and someone

1 would need to put that into the record as a comment and
2 I think it would probably be the right thing for the
3 RAC to do since this is your proposal.

4 So I'd be looking forward to working
5 with the Committee at lunch.

6

7 Thank you.

8

9 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

12

13 MR. MIKE: Go ahead, Gene.

14

15 MR. SANDONE: Okay. Well, one thing I
16 would suggest is if you -- I would strongly suggest
17 that you get suggested language similar to what I've
18 provided for you and put it into the Board of Fish
19 process under written comments so that they can see
20 exactly what you want. And then they will certainly be
21 clear on what you want and they will vote on it.

22

23 Thank you, Madame Chair.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

26

27 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
28 Just for the record the Council discussed forming a
29 Committee during lunch and reporting back to this
30 Council. So I just want to identify who on -- from
31 this Council will be from the Committee and the
32 Committee will have to -- the Council will have to
33 adopt the Committee's recommendation and take action
34 from there.

35

36 Thank you.

37

38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: What I've --
39 what I've got so far is Dan O'Hara, Dan Dunaway,
40 Richard and Courtenay will probably work with -- and
41 Nanci.

42

43 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

44

45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

46

47 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. Yeah, I --
48 I'd really like to have some of our representatives
49 from the National Park in on this Committee because
50 this has been a collaborative effort. And that -- to

1 me that would be necessary.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Troy,
4 would you be willing to join the Committee?

5

6 MR. HAMON: (Indiscernible - away from
7 microphone).....

8

9 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I guess
10 we'd form the Committee and.....

11

12 Dan, did you have a comment?

13

14 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thanks, Madame
15 Chair. Sorry to interrupt. I don't want to be an
16 extra cook in the soup here so I don't -- I think I
17 could be happy to stand back. But I do -- I thank Gene
18 Sandone and I -- he basically said what I wanted to.
19 The point I wanted to make before we move on was that I
20 think we'll have a much better chance with the Board of
21 Fish if we put it in the language that they can
22 understand. So I'm ready to support whatever the
23 Naknek area people find is the most -- that's most
24 functional for them.

25

26 Madame Chair.

27

28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

29

30 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
31 Chair. Could I also suggest that we would add Gene
32 Sandone to the list on the Committee with your
33 permission?

34

35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yes. So I
36 think it makes sense to have Dan O'Hara, Richard,
37 Nanci, Troy and Gene and Courtenay. So that's the --
38 Dan Dunaway want -- it's just Dan O'Hara. So let's
39 table this until after the Committee meets during
40 lunch.

41

42 Thank you.

43

44 It is now 10:30 and we will go to the
45 rural determination. I think Robbin La Vine has that
46 or somebody does. Okay. Chuck -- Carl.

47

48 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you, Madame Chair,
49 members of the Council. Good morning. For the record
50 my name is Carl Johnson, I'm with the Office of

1 Subsistence Management. Basically this is an update of
2 the current status of changing the rural determination
3 process. Materials begin on page 12 of your meeting
4 book. And this is not an action item, again it's just
5 an update.

6
7 Page 12 is a news release that just
8 kind of highlights the action the Board take -- took at
9 its July work session. The materials that follow are
10 the short briefing materials that were provided to the
11 Board when it made its decision. There's kind of three
12 parts to this. The first part is if you recall a while
13 back there was a proposed rule from the Secretaries
14 because what drives our rural determination process is
15 in the Secretarial regulations, not in the Board's
16 regulations. So the Secretarial regulation is if you
17 recall there were those different criteria that are
18 taken into account when making rural determinations.
19 Well, there was a proposed rule to simply that to
20 eliminate all the criteria and just say the Board shall
21 determine which communities are nonrural, all other
22 communities are therefore rural. That was the proposed
23 rule that was before you that you provided input on.
24 And after hearing from all the other Councils and
25 Tribes and ANCSA corporations and lots of comments from
26 the public, the Board has recommended to the
27 Secretaries to publish that proposed rule as a final
28 rule as it was written.

29
30 But the Board also heard from you all
31 and from the public that they still wanted to see some
32 type of guidance in place as to how that would be
33 implemented. So that gets to the other two parts.
34 Well, the first -- the second part is well, where do we
35 start from as our list of nonrural communities. Well,
36 the Board decided to reenact the pre 2007 list of rural
37 communities and therefore basically any communities
38 that were changed from rural to nonrural as a result of
39 the 2007 action would again be rural just
40 automatically. That will be moving forward as a --
41 what's called a direct final rule which means there
42 won't be any additional public process on that unless
43 there are a significant adverse public comments as part
44 of that open comment period. Neither the final rule
45 nor the -- on the Secretarial regulations nor the
46 Board's direct final rule on reenacting that pre 2007
47 list have yet been published. They're in D.C. waiting
48 to be published and we'll let you all know when that
49 happens.

50

1 The third part that the Board decided
2 on was we need to have some type of guidance moving
3 forward as to how determinations will be made as to
4 what communities are nonrural, how will proposals be
5 submitted, how will the staff at OSM be guided in their
6 analysis, what will the Councils be doing exactly, what
7 will their role in the recommendations be. So the
8 Board tasked OSM to come up with options, should it be
9 by regulation, should it be by a policy that these
10 future guidances are in making nonrural determinations.
11 So the Board has tasked OSM to present options for
12 which path to follow and those should be presented at
13 the January, 2016 meeting of the Board when the Board
14 meets to discuss the FRMP.

15
16 And that is my update and I'll be happy
17 to answer any questions that the Council may have.

18
19 Thank you, Madame Chair.

20
21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
22 questions for the update?

23
24 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

25
26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

27
28 MR. O'HARA: Well, I think that's just
29 a lot of gobbledygook that's also impossible to figure
30 out. But I think Nanci Lyons had a leave us alone type
31 thing until we need you. That's a good policy. And I
32 don't want to speak for her because I think she could
33 say it very elegantly.

34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

36
37 MS. MORRIS LYON: Well, considering I
38 was the one who stepped out of the box and came up
39 with that originally, you know, it's -- it seems to me
40 -- couple things. I can understand why some guidelines
41 want to be built around it, but I also -- I can see
42 more the justification in why it originally was kind of
43 born because we shouldn't have to defend our way of
44 life and they should have to defend the reasons why
45 they want to take it away from us more so than why we
46 should be living it. So it seems like we're getting in
47 many ways right back to it, but I can also see why
48 guidelines probably need to be built somehow. My -- I
49 guess my big thing with it is that, wow, you know, I'm
50 getting hit with it now at the meeting and I'm supposed

1 to be laying them out on the table. I wish that we
2 would have been, you know, given a little bit more
3 notice so that we could have thought about this rather
4 than here in the next five minutes come up with a list
5 of guidelines that we'd like to see included because
6 that's -- you know, I guess that's -- I'd like a little
7 bit more direction. I think, you know, I guess my gut
8 instinct says well, you got to take a look at the
9 community and, you know, what they depend upon for
10 resources and what their behavior's been like and/or
11 continues to be like or has changed to. But again, you
12 know, it's one of those deals where I'm glad to hear
13 that they're willing to adopt the original idea. But
14 to flesh it out seems like a big task for a two day
15 meeting that involves a lot of other things for us to
16 take on.

17

18 Thank you.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Carl, do you
21 have a.....

22

23 MR. JOHNSON: Yes, Madame Chair, and
24 through the Chair, Nanci. I want to relieve your
25 concerns right now and say that we are not asking
26 anything of this Council or any of the Councils at this
27 time. It's actually -- the burden is now on OSM staff
28 to come up with just an outline of which path the Board
29 should take, should the Board develop its own
30 regulations as opposed to how it used to be with
31 Secretarial regulations guiding, should the Board come
32 up with regulations that will guide staff in making
33 analyses of future proposals or should there just be a
34 policy in place.

35 That's the only approach at this point in time. And
36 then if the Board says okay, draft a policy or come up
37 with a draft regulation for the public to review, then
38 at that time we'll start looking into what are the
39 different criteria, different factors, different things
40 to look at in developing either a draft regulation or a
41 draft policy we expect at that time the Councils would
42 all have an opportunity to weigh in on. And I would
43 suspect -- and I'm on the group at OSM that's tasked
44 with working on these options, I would suspect that our
45 starting point is going to be all the various things
46 that we have heard from the public and from the
47 Councils leading up to that proposed rule you reviewed
48 the last time because you remember two times ago we
49 were asking you a series of different questions and all
50 of them were, you know does this 10 year review work,

1 if not why, does this aggregation of communities work,
2 if not why. We're looking -- we're asking for your
3 feedback on all the different existing criteria and we
4 got a lot of great feedback from the Councils and the
5 public on the things that work, things that didn't
6 work, things that might be unique to a particular
7 region. So I would imagine a good starting point for
8 us in anything, in developing either a proposed
9 regulation or policy will be to look at all those
10 hundreds of comments we've already received. So you
11 don't have to worry about anything at this time.

12

13 MS. MORRIS LYON: Well, good, that's a
14 huge relief. I -- sorry I misunderstood you the first
15 time. And that makes much more sense to me to have a
16 compilation of the comments that were received by
17 everybody as a starting point and some general --
18 generalizations from the content of those comments.

19

20 So I appreciate that. Thank you.

21

22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
23 Courtenay, did you have a comment?

24

25 MS. CARTY: Yes, Madame Chair. I just
26 wanted to brief the RAC that BBNA was also
27 participating in the rural determination process and
28 following it very closely. We had -- we participated
29 in the tribal consultation opportunity with Fish and
30 Wildlife Service as did four of our member tribal
31 communities or Tribal Councils, that was South Naknek,
32 Ekuk, Port Heiden and I don't know the rest. So that's
33 all. One -- there is another one, probably Dillingham.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
36 more questions, comments?

37

38 (No comments)

39

40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thanks for the
41 update, Carl.

42

43 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you, Madame Chair.

44

45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. The
46 next agenda item is Refuge proposal rule on hunting and
47 you can find this on page 17 of your book.

48

49 MS. HENRY: Thank you, Madame Chair and
50 members of the Council. I'm Susanna Henry, the Refuge

1 Manager at Togiak National Wildlife Refuge with our
2 office here in Dillingham. We have a short Power Point
3 presentation and we'll need about five minutes to set
4 up. And I think I possibly could get it done before
5 lunch or maybe we should skip ours and put it after
6 lunch.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: How long is
9 your presentation? Oh, it's five minutes? No, no,
10 five minutes to set up and how long is your
11 presentation?

12

13 MS. HENRY: I'd say my presentation is
14 12 minutes long and then last time we had two hours of
15 questions.

16

17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We can -- I'm
18 sorry. If the Board doesn't mind we can probably put
19 you through -- put you after lunch. We will put you --
20 where would we put you.

21

22 MS. MORRIS LYON: Well, we're going to
23 hear from the committee first so we could hear from the
24 Redfish Committee and then put her on right after that.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: What -- from
27 what Committee?

28

29 MS. MORRIS LYON: So could I suggest
30 this then. Maybe what we should do before we jump into
31 the wildlife proposals after lunch.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Here's
34 what's going to happen. We'll go ahead and take a five
35 minute break, you set up and then you give us a
36 presentation and then we'll start the discussion, if we
37 don't finish it by 11:00 then we can continue right
38 after.

39

40 MS. HENRY: Thank you. We'll do it.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. We'll
43 reconvene and then get Susanna's report, five minute
44 report, and then if we have any questions we'll deal
45 with that right after lunch.

46

47 (Off record)

48

49 (On record)

50

1 MS. HENRY: All right. Good morning
2 again. Thank you, Madame Chairman and members of the
3 Council. I'm going to be presenting to you a proposal
4 from U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to do some changes
5 to the code of Federal regulations. And if it sounds
6 familiar to you it really is. I had a presentation
7 that I gave along with Susan Alexander from Alaska
8 Peninsula/Becharof Refuge back at the RAC meeting that
9 we had in February in Naknek. And you should take a
10 look in your folders, there's some information that's
11 in there already. There's a fact sheet and frequently
12 asked questions and I passed a copy of my Power Point
13 and there's additional copies of the Power Point on the
14 public information table up front. I'll be going over
15 a few changes that have taken place over the summer.
16 There's been continued outreach, government to
17 government consultation and we've taken into account a
18 lot of people's comments. But the process continues
19 on. So for those that might not have heard the
20 presentation back in February I'm going to go through
21 it quickly and when the bell rings we'll stop and
22 resume after lunch if we need to.

23
24 All right. What are the proposed
25 changes. Part one concerns predator control. And the
26 proposal would be that there would be no predator
27 control on all of the National Wildlife Refuges in
28 Alaska unless it's determined to be necessary for
29 Refuge purposes, Federal law or policy and that it
30 would be consistent with Service mandates for natural,
31 biological diversity, biological integrity and
32 environmental health. And if there were predator
33 control it would be based on sound science in response
34 to conservation concern and demands for more wildlife
35 harvest would not be the sole or primary basis for the
36 predator control.

37
38 The next part of the proposed changes
39 has to do with predator reduction activities and it
40 would prohibit on Refuges the take of brown bears over
41 bait, take of bears using traps or snares, wolves and
42 coyotes during the denning season and we have carefully
43 defined that, same day airborne take of bears and then
44 lastly the take of bears, cubs or sows with cubs. But
45 there are exceptions for that that are particular in
46 the interior of Alaska in unit 21B, C and D, 24 and
47 25D, those are the exceptions along with parts of 19D
48 and 19A.

49
50 All right. How would this proposed

1 rule change things in the Bristol Bay RAC area. I'll
2 try to get that to work for us. It would really affect
3 the same day airborne take of brown or black bears and
4 it would make a change for wolf and coyote harvest.
5 There would not -- no longer be any harvest of wolves
6 or coyotes between May 1st and August 9th. That really
7 affects mostly coyotes where we have some year round
8 harvest currently allowed.

9
10 All right. The third part of the
11 proposed changes has to do with the public process,
12 closures of Refuges or portions of Refuges. And one of
13 the reasons that we could close part of a Refuge would
14 be conservation for natural -- of natural or biological
15 diversity, biological integrity, environmental health.
16 The closure could last 60 days instead of just 30. The
17 temporary closure duration is now only as long as
18 reasonably necessary with a mandatory review every
19 three years. That's a change since the meeting in
20 Naknek in February. And the Fish and Wildlife Service
21 is proposing to publish an annual list of Refuge
22 closures for public review and input. That's new since
23 February. And we're requiring consultation with State
24 and Tribes and Native corporations and regional
25 corporations. And there's a requirement for public
26 hearings prior to implementation of temporary or
27 permanent closures will remain. There was some
28 discussion about changing that to a public meeting, but
29 it's proposed currently to be a hearing. And expanding
30 the methods for public notice to include the internet
31 as well as the more traditional ways of contacting
32 people via flyers, newspapers and radio and television.

33
34 All right. Why is Fish and Wildlife
35 Service proposing these changes. And it has to do with
36 managing the Refuges consistent with our mandates. And
37 it is in response to recent regulations passed through
38 the Board of Game, in particular regarding practices
39 for the harvest of wildlife on Refuges. And also to
40 more effectively engage the public, broadening our
41 notification and outreach methods, consultations with
42 the Tribes and providing increased transparency and
43 providing additional opportunities for public comment.

44
45 And who do these proposals apply to.
46 They are proposed changes under Refuge hunting and
47 trapping regulations and intense -- and also for
48 intensive management activities. Those would be
49 something that would be taken up by Fish and Wildlife
50 Service or by the State. But they do not apply to

1 Federally-qualified subsistence users hunting or
2 trapping under the Federal subsistence regulations.
3 And it only apply on the National Wildlife Refuges in
4 Alaska. Those are the areas in purple on this map and
5 you'll see those brown inclusions on the Refuges, those
6 are private lands.

7
8 The timeline for the proposed rule has
9 changed since we were convened back in February. We're
10 continuing our outreach and scoping and our internal
11 review of the proposed rule and the environmental
12 assessment. We are proposing to have the proposed rule
13 published in the Federal Register sometime next month
14 or in December. We have at the same time would start a
15 public comment period. A public hearing is currently
16 scheduled for Dillingham, tentatively scheduled to take
17 place on Tuesday, January 19th of next year in the City
18 Council chambers. But they'll be more news about that
19 forthcoming. And then we would propose to finalize
20 that proposed rule after incorporating public comments
21 sometime in March or April of next year. And then
22 publish the rule in the Federal Register in May of
23 2016.

24
25 All right. So now is our time for
26 questions, but we might defer those until after lunch
27 or get started on them.

28
29 MR. ABRAHAM: (In Native).

30
31 MS. HENRY: I hear you.

32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We'll defer
34 the questions until after lunch. I think the plan
35 would be -- is to -- if the Council doesn't mind is to
36 deal with the redfish proposals first, you know, when
37 we first come in and then right after we'll do the --
38 answer questions for Susan and then we'll get back to
39 our agenda items.

40
41 MS. HENRY: Okay.

42
43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Does that
44 sound good?

45
46 (No comments)

47
48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. We'll
49 break for lunch until 1:00 o'clock. 12:00 o'clock
50 lunch at BBNA.

1 (Off record)

2

3 (On record)

4

5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I think we
6 could start now. I'll call the meeting back to order
7 at 1:00 -- I can't see what time it is, 1:05. And like
8 we've decided we're going to pick up the redfish
9 proposal and go through the proposal procedure with
10 this. And then go from there I guess.

11

12 Okay. Troy, are you going to be the
13 introductions of the proposal?

14

15 MR. HAMON: The actual details of what
16 we talked about over the lunch break are something that
17 Nancy has got the notes on so I'll hand that back off
18 to her, but I will follow-up just to say that we
19 covered a bunch of the topics that were discussed, the
20 -- we discussed the proposal as it was shown to us and
21 I -- it fell out of my -- and so you want the actual
22 one here, this is not what's in the Board of Fish book
23 and it's not the one that you were looking at.

24

25 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. This is a
26 Committee report that deals with the redfish issue.
27 And if it's -- if the Council wish to do so they can
28 adopt the Committee's recommendation and make it their
29 own and move forward -- go from there.

30

31 Thank you, Madame Chair.

32

33 MR. HAMON: Madame Chair, members of
34 the Council The Committee that met discussed the
35 proposal that was brought up earlier in session. And
36 our recommendation was with a few additional specifics
37 that I'll let Nanci follow-up with, that we do think it
38 would be good for the Council to recommend in comment
39 to the Board of Fish that this regulatory language be
40 adopted. So the regulatory language is in -- on a
41 document entitled Bristol Bay Subsistence, Five
42 Proposal, 7882 at the top, it's page number 73. And
43 the suggested language is not going to be simple to
44 read, I'll do my best. It's under 5 Alaska
45 Administrative Code 01.320, Lawful Gear and Gear
46 Specifications. And the changes are primarily in the
47 date so what -- it starts with (b), outside the
48 boundaries of any district salmon may only be taken by
49 set gill net except that salmon may also be taken as
50 follows. And then under part two from August 30

1 through December 31 by spear, dip net, gill net and
2 beach seines along the 100 yard length of the west
3 shore of Naknek Lake near the outlet to the Naknek
4 River as marked by ADF&G regulatory markers. Part
5 three from August 30th through December 31 by spear,
6 dip net, gill net and beach seine at Johnny's Lake on
7 the northwestern side of Naknek Lake. And part four
8 from August 30 through December 31 by spear, dip net,
9 gill net and beach seine at the outlet of Idavians
10 Creek on the north side of Naknek Lake. Part five from
11 September 18 through December 31 by spear, dip net,
12 beach seine and gill net at the mouth of Brooks River
13 at Naknek Lake.

14

15 The intention of the changes in the
16 dates was something that was discussed a little bit
17 here and we clarified that in Committee. What was in
18 regulation before was different dates for each location
19 and dates that didn't necessarily correspond with when
20 salmon could or would be available or best available.
21 There was no conservation reason so the Park Service
22 has been happy from the beginning of our Committee
23 meetings to support season dates that are more
24 expansive and offer people the opportunity to harvest
25 these fish when they're appropriately available. Our
26 one request within the agency was that we do have the
27 Brooks River fishery open later. The beginning of the
28 season there opens later and that's to avoid having 300
29 people on the ground at the same time that this
30 traditional activity is happening. That's probably not
31 a recipe for success. And that's the one -- the one
32 difference in the dates is that opening date at Brooks
33 River.

34

35 The other -- maybe the rest of the
36 Committee report should be from Nanci.

37

38 MS. MORRIS LYON: Okay. I'm going to
39 start by jumping in and making a motion that we adopt
40 this new lang -- or support this new language that's
41 been read into the Council in front of us and then I'm
42 going to have an amendment in addition to that language
43 that I would also like us to vote in support of.

44

45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

46

47 MR. O'HARA: Are you going to read
48 this?

49

50 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, I will, but do

1 you want me to read the amendment first or do you want
2 to second it, shall we put it on the table first?

3

4 MR. O'HARA: I'll second it.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
7 been a motion by Nanci and second by Dan O'Hara.....

8

9 MR. O'HARA: Yes.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK:to
12 support the.....

13

14 MR. WILSON: Could you put the proposal
15 number in there, please.

16

17 MS. MORRIS LYON: Sure. Oh, yeah, and
18 I would -- that would be identified as proposal number
19 78 in the Fish and Game proposal books with the
20 language as submitted by BBEDC that is in conjunction
21 with the language originally written by Richard Wilson
22 and his group with the Park Service.

23

24 Is that more thorough, Richard, do you
25 think that covers us?

26

27 MR. WILSON: Uh-huh.

28

29 MS. MORRIS LYON: Okay.

30

31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

32

33

34 MS. MORRIS LYON: Okay. So then in
35 addition to that what we would also like to submit with
36 this language under comments for the Board of Fish
37 meeting is the -- a map that will be also submitted and
38 put together, it sounds like Troy will lead that one,
39 showing the locations highlighted so that the Board of
40 Fish will have clarity on the areas of the lake we're
41 going to speak to. We like the way the dates are set
42 and we're going to have those remain as they are. We
43 are not going to define nets, but under alternatives
44 considered portion of the proposal and in our comments
45 we will let -- let it be known that we considered being
46 more defined in the nets, but asking for seines not to
47 exceed 25 feet. And if they insist upon having.....

48

49 MR O'HARA: Fathoms.

50

1 MS. MORRIS LYON: Fathoms. I did that
2 twice in a row. Fathoms. And if the Board feels it's
3 necessary to include more defined length in an approved
4 regulation then we would suggest that they stick with
5 that because it's already in regulation for the area.
6 We would also like to include in the comments a history
7 of the fishery emphasizing the fact that it's -- it
8 came down in a legislative process, it's the only one
9 there is. The extreme small scope of the subsistence
10 users that are eligible to use it and the extremely
11 small area that's affected, emphasizing the fact that
12 it's not a statewide regulation or could it ever be
13 just due to the very nature of how it was implemented.
14 Add additional language at the bottom of the proposal
15 book, there's basically two lines in there that we'll
16 put in on the comment section too to make sure that
17 that's emphasized and also we thought it would be
18 beneficial to include an explanation as to why the
19 State is even involved in having this proposal passed
20 seeing as that it's a subsistence issue on Federal
21 lands so that the Board could more clearly understand
22 why they're even being asked to be involved in this
23 proposal.

24
25 Thank you, Madame Chair.

26
27 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

30
31 MR. O'HARA: I'd like to at this time
32 add a friendly amendment, the items coming from the
33 Committee that worked on the extension of this
34 proposal.

35
36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: You seconded
37 that?

38
39 MR. O'HARA: No, I made the motion.

40
41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Made a motion.
42 Okay. There's been a motion to add the -- I guess a
43 friendly amendment to this proposal.

44
45 MR. WILSON: I'll second that.

46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seconded by
48 Richard. Okay. Any further discussion?

49
50 (No comments)

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: If not, all in
2 favor say aye.
3
4 IN UNISON: Aye.
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
7 opposition?
8
9 (No opposing votes)
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seeing none,
12 carried. Oh, sorry.
13
14 MR. ABRAHAM: How many subsistence
15 users do we have in that region right there?
16
17 MR. HAMON: The users that are eligible
18 for this fishery are the residents of Naknek or
19 residents of the Naknek, King Salmon, South Naknek area
20 that are descended from people who lived in that
21 drainage and had -- we do not have a number that I know
22 the answer to. The Village Councils are responsible
23 for ensuring to us whether people are authorized to use
24 the fishery or not. And so if I had to draw it down
25 I'd say whatever the population of the area is, it's a
26 little bit smaller than that, but I don't know how much
27 smaller.
28
29 MR. ABRAHAM: Thank you.
30
31 MR. HAMON: Yep.
32
33 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.
34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
36
37 MR. MIKE: I just wanted to remind the
38 folks that are participating online, please put your
39 phone on mute. If you don't have a mute button please
40 hit star six, that will mute your phone. We're hearing
41 some background noise.
42
43 Thank you.
44
45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. So what
46 -- where are we at now, we're done with the.....
47
48 MS. MORRIS LYON: Now we're going on to
49 questions for Susanna.
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Dan.
2
3 MR. DUNAWAY: Vote on.....
4
5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
6
7 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair, yeah. That
8 was a question there. We got to have a result a little
9 bit.
10
11 MS. MORRIS LYON: Point of order.
12
13 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, point of order. So
14 now the main motion.
15
16 Thank you, Madame Chair.
17
18 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. And --
19 okay. Nanci made the motion and Dan made the amendment
20 -- seconded the amendment.
21
22 MR. O'HARA: Who seconded the
23 amendment?
24
25 MS. MORRIS LYON: Richard did.
26
27 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh, sorry.
28 Richard seconded the amendment. Now we're -- are we
29 ready to vote?
30
31 MR. O'HARA: Call for the question.
32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Question's
34 been called. All in favor say aye.
35
36 IN UNISON: Aye.
37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
39 opposition?
40
41 (No opposing votes)
42
43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Hearing none,
44 thank you.
45
46 Susan.
47
48 MS. HENRY: All right. Madame Chairman
49 and members of the Council, I'm back.
50

1 MR. O'HARA: Two hours.
2
3 MS. HENRY: Two hour limit, is
4 that.....
5
6 MR. O'HARA: Two hours. The last time
7 you went two hours.
8
9 MS. HENRY: Well, we didn't set a limit
10 last time and that's what happened.
11
12 I guess I'd start by saying I had -- I gave my
13 little presentation there before lunch, if you all have
14 any questions I'll be happy to entertain them and I
15 know Heather Abbey Tonneson, our regional Refuges'
16 Ecologist should be back on the line and can help
17 assist me in answering.
18
19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: For the record
20 could you enter in the presentation you made?
21
22 MS. HENRY: That's correct. This
23 morning before lunch I made a presentation on a
24 proposed rule change, changes to the code of Federal
25 regulation that affect all National Wildlife Refuges in
26 the State of Alaska.
27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
29 you. Dan, did you have your hand up?
30
31 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah. First it's quite a
32 bit to digest. I know one thing I want to compliment
33 Fish and Wildlife Service, I know they brought this
34 before us in the past and I really think they did it in
35 the right order, I appreciate that. But there's quite
36 a bit here I'm still trying to digest. It seems like
37 your -- some of your first slides I guess they call
38 them, talk about predator control and in the past we've
39 been requesting or very interested in predator control.
40 And you have some language addressing it, sounds good,
41 but I'm not sure what it means because I have a huge
42 concern especially ever since we had what I thought was
43 probably the most -- best example of a need, very clear
44 need and appropriate situation for predator control on
45 Unimak Island and yet Fish and Wildlife Service refused
46 to conduct it. And I have hunted and worked and lived
47 a little bit in the Cold Bay area and I'm kind of
48 familiar with that area. So my question is are you
49 really going to ever have predator control and where in
50 this language does it clearly layout we will have

1 predator control under these circumstances. I just
2 don't feel like it's clear enough and yet you have two
3 slides here and I only support predator control when
4 it's good science and scientifically based, but I'm
5 really, really concerned that you've got enough, what's
6 the right, wiggle room, obscuring language here that
7 you would forever be able to evade it and I don't want
8 that to be the case.

9

10 MS. HENRY: Mr. Dunaway, Madame
11 Chairman and members of the Board. The attempt is to
12 leave open the opportunity to do predator control when
13 there is a conservation reason for it. The last Refuge
14 I worked at which was down in Arizona in Region II, we
15 did have an active predator control program for
16 mountain lions because they are -- we -- they were
17 affecting the numbers of desert big horn sheep. And it
18 wasn't for subsistence use or even really for human
19 consumption reasons, it was just an overall numbers of
20 sheep were declining rapidly, there weren't enough
21 available for a transport program to other areas that
22 -- where there had been sheep. And then Fish and
23 Wildlife Service entered into an effort to do predator
24 control with Arizona Game and Fish Department. So
25 that's the sort of thing we want to leave open, we want
26 to be able to have predator control when it's for
27 conservation reasons, but if it's simply because we're
28 trying to provide a number of animals for harvest,
29 that's the idea that is being floated here.

30

31 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

34

35 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you, Madame
36 Chair. To continue. Okay. Well, you know, especially
37 here this morning I heard Frank Woods become rather
38 animated and I think he was more directed to the Park
39 Service than Fish -- than the Refuge, but we have
40 numerous Refuges with villages inside them or alongside
41 them that really depend on and have forever depended on
42 availability of game. And so somewhere in here I think
43 there's something about maintaining natural populations
44 and stuff. Well, what -- these populations we have
45 today, I'm thinking of Togiak and so on, have been
46 forever influenced to some degree by human consumption.
47 And they need to be considered in the future. And so I
48 kind of hope we don't just totally shut the door on the
49 legitimate use of providing food for the users. And so
50 I know there's -- again I almost feel a little bit --

1 there's reassurances this won't affect subsistence, but
2 some of this language, I feel like it -- it's re --
3 it's kind of reassuring, but when I saw what happened
4 in Unimak Pass I wasn't sure or Unimak Island and
5 having friends live in False Pass, I'm not sure that
6 subsistence users were fully respected in that
7 situation. I think also I fear that that language
8 seeks to drive a wedge between subsistence users and
9 other legitimate hunting interests as well. And so I'm
10 really reluctant to just give a nod and a go ahead on
11 this. I think there's been -- who's to say what the
12 natural order of things are right now when if you
13 assume natural means not influenced by humans because
14 humans have been affecting these areas forever and I'm
15 concerned about that.

16

17 And I had another point flit through my
18 head just a moment ago and it kept on going. Smart
19 water isn't working so good. But I'll leave it at that
20 for the moment, I don't think I'm really done with
21 this, but I really do appreciate you bringing this to
22 our attention. And I'll defer to other folks now.

23

24 Thank you.

25

26 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

27

28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

29

30 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
31 Chair. And, Dan, I -- we're coming to the same
32 conclusion. I'm approaching mine from a different
33 version. The language that you used to provide more,
34 what was it, to provide more animals for harvest, was
35 that correct or something.....

36

37 MS. HENRY: It's.....

38

39 MS. MORRIS LYON:akin to that?

40

41 MS. HENRY:wildlife for harvest.

42 Wildlife.....

43

44 MS. MORRIS LYON: I think.....

45 MS. HENRY:for harvest. Some of
46 our earlier language talked about human consumption,
47 but it's a little broader than that.

48

49 MS. MORRIS LYON: I remember. And I
50 guess my approach to it is I would prefer to see a

1 definition or a change so that the conflict that Dan is
2 proposing could potentially happen would be removed
3 because I think you have to take into effect there's
4 one thing for more animals for game to hunt and there's
5 subsistence users hunting. And it's a different use
6 and for different reasons. And I think that that
7 should be more clearly defined because if you've got
8 people that need that food and it's affecting --
9 predators are affecting those communities, that needs
10 to be looked upon differently than just food that's
11 being taken for the consumptive purposes that I read
12 this saying. I can understand that, but I think there
13 needs to be much, much more weight given to areas that
14 are depending on ungulates or whatever it is that
15 you're -- you know, that predator control is not being
16 considered for and there's a long historic use there.
17 I -- I'm not sure I'm verbalizing this very well, but I
18 think there's a definite difference between just going
19 hunting and subsistence users hunting.

20

21 MS. HENRY: Madame Chair and Nanci and
22 members of the Board. Under ANILCA it really points
23 that out, that Alaska Refugees are mandated it says to
24 provide opportunity for continued subsistence use by
25 rural residents as long as its use is not in conflict
26 with conservation of fish and wildlife populations.
27 And then it separates sport hunting and talks about
28 that as a recreational opportunity.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

31

32 MS. MORRIS LYON: And, yes, and I guess
33 my point is I realize that, but this new language
34 should include that definition in there so that
35 conflict doesn't occur later if somebody says well, how
36 come they get or why not this. I think it would help
37 clarify things to other user groups as well.

38

39 MS. HENRY: Right. Right.

40

41 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

42

43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

44

45 MR. O'HARA: We can't let you off that
46 easy. The -- on your presentation on the handout it's
47 the second page and it says predator control is not
48 allowed on Refuges in Alaska unless and then it says
49 two, for natural and biological diversity, biological
50 integrity and environmental health. And I would like

1 to relate that particular sentence or thought that
2 you've written down -- you have in your Power Point to
3 destroying the cougars in -- was it Colorado or what --
4 where's it at?

5
6 MS. HENRY: I was talking.....

7
8 MR. O'HARA: Mountain lions.

9
10 MS. HENRY:about Arizona.

11
12 MR. O'HARA: Okay. And the question I
13 would like to ask you then is if the cougars were
14 killing off the mountain sheep or whatever they were
15 doing, did the people in the region use those sheep for
16 human consumption?

17
18 MS. HENRY: Mr. O'Hara and everyone on
19 the Council, they did, but to a very limited extent.
20 In Arizona there's only about 119 sport hunting permits
21 given per year for big horn sheep, both Rocky Mountain
22 and desert. So the area that we were talking about
23 with the mountain lion predation control was -- as the
24 population went down there were less and less permits
25 given, it was down to about one or two and it's any
26 ram. But it was -- so it's was very, very limited.
27 The -- now it's true those animals would have been
28 eaten by someone and then there was requirements that
29 it not just be a trophy hunt. But the amount of food
30 was really very small.

31
32 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

33
34 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

35
36 MR. O'HARA: Yes, that's -- to
37 determine how very small was would be an interesting
38 thing, you know, if it went to a legal system. But so
39 let's just use the example then of your Refuge here in
40 -- over in the -- on the Alaska peninsula. The North
41 Peninsula herd had 20 -- 18 to 20,000 caribou and we're
42 down to -- what did we finally get down to, 270. I
43 just saw it in our book. And of course naturally the
44 -- we would not do subsistence hunting on that herd
45 because they're so decimated. And yet there wasn't any
46 predator control with a huge loss and believe me
47 there's plenty of predators to go around with the bear
48 and the wolves on the Alaska peninsula, you ask any
49 game guide. And so I think if you would put in your
50 Power Point here that for natural biological diversity,

1 biological integrity, environmental health and for the
2 assistance of subsistence use I think would be probably
3 a good thing for you to do.

4

5 Thank you, Madame Chair.

6

7 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

8

9 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

10

11 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. I -- looking
12 through here I found one of the other. There's a few
13 other things that come to mind here on this. Given
14 that -- let's see, dang that language is slipping away
15 from me, but just talks about the natural -- preserving
16 the natural diversity and I think abundance or
17 something. Does that mean you are going to then go in
18 and for every Refuge declare what -- are you going to
19 have like a formalized definition of what these are or
20 does this kind of stay in some amorphous state and then
21 when some people like we have in the past called for
22 predator control you can say we are out of line or
23 we're in line. In a way it would be nice to see
24 specifics for each Refuge, what does the -- what are
25 these -- what are the objective criteria to identify
26 what the natural abundance and range of diversity,
27 whatever our caribou are in Togiak Refuge. And partly
28 I think about this, when I first read it I go we didn't
29 use to have moose on the Refuge, should we really be
30 not allowing moose on there. That's -- in some ways
31 you can argue it's not natural. But we're all very
32 happy to have moose out there and if we have
33 consciously in a lot of the villages in Togiak
34 specifically adjusted their behavior to allow moose to
35 expand. That's one point I want to make.

36

37 The other thing is I see kind of
38 jumping ahead here this -- you are prohibiting or
39 proscribing some methods of harvest. And that's cubs
40 and dates and stuff. And, you know, we've sat through
41 a bunch of these meetings and my sense is that that's
42 generally in alignment with the basic ethics or the
43 ethical structure of people here. There was a time we
44 considered denning of wolves and the RAC pretty
45 emphatically shot that done. But I wonder would that
46 mean those methods, would they be prohibited if you
47 decided that predator control was necessary and would
48 -- should you possibly be handcuffing yourself and of
49 course this -- of course you got to have the science to
50 say you need predator control. And my hat's off

1 National Wildlife Refuge System Improvement Act and the
2 policy that stems down from that. So all of these
3 terms are definitely defined, we can talk through those
4 definitions or Susanna can make those available to you
5 if that would be helpful to facilitate understanding.

6
7 I guess to the second point as far as
8 predator control and the specific methods and means, I
9 will say that, you know, we've divided components of
10 this proposed rule into three separate parts for a
11 reason. The first part that Susanna talked about
12 really deals with predator control specifically and
13 when it would or would not be allowed on National
14 Wildlife Refuges. The Fish and Wildlife Service is
15 considering adopting the Federal Subsistence Board's
16 definition of predator control which is specifically
17 the intention to reduce predator populations to
18 increase prey populations. And the second part of the
19 proposed rule which really deals with the methods and
20 means although it is related to the first part it is a
21 separate component so we're not necessarily linking
22 these methods and means that are proposed for
23 prohibition on Wildlife Refuges with predator control
24 specifically. As far as whether or not some of these
25 methods and means would be allowed for predator control
26 should the Fish and Wildlife Service decide that they
27 needed to implement predator control, I can't really
28 say that with any certainty at this point, but I will
29 say though that Fish and Wildlife Service is not
30 restricting most state regulations for hunting and
31 trapping and those will still be available for use by
32 the public as well as harvest limits. You know, most
33 of the -- we're not changing any of the harvest limits
34 that the State has set out. So certainly, you know, if
35 the State wants to continue to increase harvest limits
36 they can do that and most likely those would be adopted
37 on National Wildlife Refuges unless there was a
38 separate process to change that.

39
40 Thank you.

41
42 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

45
46 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you, that
47 helps somewhat. I did review those definitions and it
48 -- it's just kind of more words. And it's more flowery
49 words supporting other flowery words that then can mean
50 anything that -- to whatever interpreter wants and I

1 guess maybe that's my days of having to come up with
2 some of these god awful objective criteria statements
3 we had to do in some of our sport fish scientific
4 surveys, but it kind of gets down to that in the end
5 sometimes. So I -- I'll kind of hammer away that I'd
6 sure like to see objective criteria in -- or some
7 effort to -- that would kind of provide a framework so
8 you could say okay, now the range conditions are X
9 percent depleted or whatever and on and on and
10 therefore we can kind of the steps that get to yes on
11 predator control or don't given good science. I'd also
12 like to see specific language making it clear that if
13 predator control were to be implemented what tools are
14 available to whoever conducts the predator control.
15 Because again it just -- like I just was sure it was
16 going to happen down there on Unimak Island and it
17 didn't on controlling wolves and I'd had friends
18 telling me how there would be a small band of caribou
19 in a small valley and all summer they just watched that
20 herd go from 20 or 30 to zero. And yet I guess in the
21 end it -- the wolves didn't fully extirpate the caribou
22 and some caribou do migrate across the pass so it
23 didn't end up as bad as it could have been, but at the
24 time with the information available the Fish and
25 Wildlife Service managed to avoid which looked to me
26 more like flat out refuse on more of a personal basis
27 to conduct very necessary predator control and I don't
28 want that happening. And this -- there's got to be
29 clear cut criteria and then you can't back away from it
30 when it comes.

31
32 So, thank you. I'll let somebody else talk.

33
34 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Pete.

35
36 MR. ABRAHAM: What are the proposed
37 change in part two on page 4 on same day airborne take
38 of bears, is that for subsistence or sport?

39
40 MS. HENRY: Pete and other members of
41 the Board. It has to be for sport because these
42 regulations do not affect subsistence.

43 MR. ABRAHAM: There's always been
44 confusion when these proposals are properly explained
45 to a rural area like especially for small village
46 there's always confusion that's why I'm pointing this
47 out here, Susanna.

48
49 MS. HENRY: I would just say, Pete,
50 thank you for that comment. I appreciate that. I

1 think there's been an effort through the summer to try
2 to make the language in this clearer and I -- and that
3 really goes to also what you said, Dan, about making it
4 clear what predator control measures you would have
5 administratively and making sure that it's spelled out
6 clearly and separated from a sport harvest method.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

9

10 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. Thanks for that
11 clarification. I also wanted to speak -- I want to
12 double check. You had in some of the later slides and
13 I'm looking at what are these proposed changes. One
14 that I really like, expanded methods for public notice,
15 that's excellent. Every method out there and we still
16 have one public or do we have one public even now, is
17 -- you know, so commend you on that. I think there was
18 some other lines in white that talked about providing
19 opportunity I think to review some of these temporary
20 or permanent closures. Anyway my impression was that
21 those lines in white, I hope they are included in the
22 -- in the latest version because I think they're
23 definitely improvements over when those lines were not
24 in there. It makes it clearer how it can be changed or
25 the terms of how this all works. But I was kind of
26 wishing on this handout it kind of would mark the new
27 ones because I can't -- it's all the same color here.
28 But anyway, yeah, those parts like that it definitely
29 looked like there was some improvement and I appreciate
30 that the Fish and Wildlife has -- I assume that's
31 responding to public concerns.

32

33 Thank you.

34

35 MS. HENRY: Yes, thank you, Dan. And
36 just so those that are on the phone understand in the
37 Power Point I had made some of the words white where
38 they differed from the presentation that we saw back in
39 February. So there were responses to comments that
40 we'd received to date. And I didn't go through this
41 handout and mark them some other way, I'm sorry.

42

43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Pete.

44

45 MR. ABRAHAM: (In Native). Regulatory
46 changes (in Native).

47

48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: (Indiscernible
49 - away from microphone). I'm sorry. How the agencies
50 are going to be contacting the tribal agencies and just

1 within a year or two the corporations. And I think,
2 you know, if this contact, this consultation would work
3 I think that it would be a prime example of what -- a
4 prime example of improvement in communicating to rural
5 villages. And I'm involved with the -- our local
6 Native corporation. And since I've gotten involved
7 with this I think once from another agency did we --
8 did we get a letter regarding how they wanted us to
9 consult and it was just in the process of building this
10 consultation. But I -- you know, this is a prime
11 example of our meeting here. We had one public, but I
12 don't see her anymore.

13

14 MS. MORRIS LYON: She's here.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: And so the --
17 oh, she's still here. So this consultation process I
18 think by agency should be taken seriously because how
19 else are we -- how else are you going to contact these
20 tribal people and also the Native corporation folks
21 regarding anything like this. And I just reading
22 through this policy here or proposed policy there's
23 like Dan Dunaway I've got a lot of questions that I
24 don't really agree with. But I think working together
25 in this setting and with other -- with -- you know,
26 with the tribes and corporations, it -- we can probably
27 work these issues out. And I hope that we can develop
28 something that everybody's going to understand to know
29 this consultation process.

30

31 Pete. Thank you.

32

33 MR. ABRAHAM: About three or four years
34 ago the Togiak villages were approached by Fish and
35 Wildlife about predator control. The local people
36 agreed to -- agreed with what -- I can't even quite
37 remember who it was, I think it was Paul Layberg
38 brought predator control. And the local people over
39 there didn't want no predator control allow. But if
40 the wording -- if the wording's corrected then this
41 over here would have less confusion out in the rural
42 areas. That is all the main reason was proposals
43 coming out without working with the local Traditional
44 Council first. If we -- if the agencies work with the
45 local people first and brought -- bring it up to the
46 Board over here it would be much easier for us to
47 understand what the local people want out there not
48 from the higher up, but from the local people. That's
49 who we are, that's who we work for, the local people in
50 Alaska. And that's where the information come from

1 first, what do they need, what do you want. So all the
2 more reason -- all the more reason to the agencies or
3 Refuge managers to visit the Council meetings or what
4 is involved in the Council meetings more and ask
5 questions, what do you want, is this all right, is this
6 -- will this work, is this understandable.

7

8 Thank you.

9

10 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

11

12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

13

14 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, I'd like to expand a
15 little more on what Pete is saying there. Title VIII
16 came about after lands claim settlement when the
17 liberals in Washington, D.C. decided we better do one
18 more thing for those outlying Native people out there,
19 that would be us. And so we -- they gave us Title
20 VIII. Of course that's a big conflict between State
21 government and their regulations and the Federal
22 government. And of course we -- none of us like, you
23 know, two regulations going on, we like one. And but
24 one of the things that Title VIII did, exactly what
25 Pete's talking about, is supposedly and I don't know --
26 I don't see where you people did this on the Refuge
27 level, Title VIII starts at the -- a level of the --
28 when you say Council he's talking about a Traditional
29 Native Council in the village itself, not this Council
30 sitting here at another level. And, you know, your
31 wording would be different if you went to a place in a
32 community where they spoke English as their second
33 language, it would be totally different for what you're
34 doing here today with this group of people. And so a
35 lot of those things are missed, they're just -- I grew
36 up in a village of 40 people, I remember looking over
37 my shoulder when I went away to high school to a
38 private school, hardly ever again to see the
39 traditional type heritage that was mine which I see
40 here more interest in taking care of the animals than
41 taking care of the animals with the people. So I
42 think you got a good point there, I think something is
43 lost in the translation. And but I -- the State of
44 Alaska now, they start from the top on down. You ever
45 go to the Fish Board meeting, Game Board member in fear
46 and trembling. Yeah, we're not afraid of them, but a
47 lot of people are. And it's just a harsh system.
48 Title VIII with this -- does work here and this is why
49 this Council is working here, you know, and I just
50 don't see a lot of reflection of human needs. Believe

1 me we're going to quit eating caribou when they get
2 down to a certain level, there's no such thing as
3 recreational or sports hunting on caribou when they get
4 down to a certain level and that goes for the bears and
5 the wolves too.

6

7 Thank you.

8

9 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

12

13 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you and
14 thanks, Deanne and Pete. And you kind of -- it's
15 something that I've kind of sensed, but not been able
16 to articulate. But I saw -- well, the Park Service did
17 essentially the same kind of regulations and I think --
18 seems like every segment of the -- every Federal
19 government that manages some Federal land, maybe the
20 exception of BLM, has instituted essentially the same
21 thing or is seeking to. And it seems to be a reaction
22 to what the State of Alaska was doing and it didn't --
23 you know, it -- to my knowledge it didn't come through
24 the RAC or from the villages demanding this, this is
25 kind of a top down thing that my sense is that some of
26 what the State's doing offended the sense of ethics of
27 the Federal agencies at the Federal level and they
28 figured oh, my god, we've got to do something because I
29 don't recall us demanding these kinds of things other
30 than probably encouraging better communication modes.
31 We definitely have asked for that and we've definitely
32 asked for predator control. So in a way this is like
33 where's this coming from, if we had said we don't like
34 these and we need -- we just want you to adopt a more
35 uniform policy. So, yeah, that does bother me too that
36 it -- it's coming from the lower 48 and not from us or
37 from the villages or people we serve. So but we got it
38 in the right order here versus -- I really feel like
39 the Park Service jumped the gun on this one and
40 declared this as law and then have had to back up or at
41 least explain themselves before they brought it to us.

42

43

44 So thank you.

45

46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Susan.

47

48 MS. HENRY: Madame Chair and members of
49 the Board. Several great points were brought up. I
50 will bring up the fact that we have done three rounds

1 of what we call government to government consultation
2 on this particular subject. And the long period of
3 time that we've had, we've sent letters, emails and
4 made phone calls to all the Village Councils throughout
5 the state and as well as the local Native corporations
6 and the regional corporations have been involved as
7 well. There have also been some statewide calls,
8 conference calls where anybody could call in. We did
9 have participation from the Bristol Bay area on some of
10 those calls and we've gotten some phone calls. And I
11 know that John Dieseak on our staff, the Interpreter,
12 has called people specifically that he knew to make
13 sure that the ideas were getting across. So we have
14 been as an agency working hard in that direction,
15 recognizing that that's -- it's very important to
16 understand what people are feeling and desiring from a
17 local level.

18
19 The -- as for the impetus for this and
20 how it got started, I think one of the more important
21 ones, things that was brought up, is the changes
22 adopted by the Alaska Board of Game. And from what I
23 understand they began hunting and trapping regulations
24 and IM predator control in various parts of the state
25 that included particular practices for the harvest of
26 predators, same day airborne take of bears and wolves.
27 Those are the things that really caught the attention
28 of our regional office staff in Anchorage more than
29 anything else. Everything I've heard or understood it
30 was not something that came from the lower 48, it was
31 brought about by decisions made by the State of Alaska.

32
33
34 And, Heather, if you're still on, you
35 can correct me if I'm wrong about that, where the --
36 where the inception came from for this idea.

37
38 MS. TONNESON: Yes, through the Chair.
39 This is Heather Tonneson. I would agree with Susanna
40 as far as there was several (indiscernible) for
41 beginning the process of looking at -- essentially
42 clarifying our existing mandates under ANILCA which is
43 Alaska specific as you know and also we have another
44 mandate, the National Wildlife Refuge System
45 Improvement Act which applies to all Refuges both in
46 Alaska and in the lower 48. And essentially through
47 discussions, numerous discussions internally and when
48 talking also since then going out to the communities
49 and talking with them about the Fish and Wildlife
50 Service has determined that essentially the proposed

1 prohibited methods and means that Susanna explained
2 earlier, those five that were lifted, are inconsistent
3 with our mandates to manage Refuges in Alaska for
4 natural diversity, biological integrity, diversity and
5 environmental health. And so that's really where the
6 impetus for this process began was to ensure that we
7 are clarifying our existing mandates so that that's
8 clear. And there's also been in response to, you know,
9 I guess numerous requests for predator control in
10 situations there to ensure that we have some
11 consistency for Refuges across the State of Alaska to
12 really clarify, you know, this is what our mandates say
13 and make sure that that's in our regulations so that
14 it's clear both to our staff internally and externally
15 to the public.

16
17 Thank you.

18
19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any other
20 comments?

21
22 (No comments)

23
24 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
25 you.

26
27 MS. HENRY: Thank you everybody for
28 your time and great comments.

29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Pete.

31
32 MR. ABRAHAM: Twelve minutes it will be
33 an hour and a half presentation.

34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. We're
36 down to number 10, the new business. We're going to be
37 dealing with wildlife proposals now. And the very
38 first one that I see is proposal WP16-21.

39
40 MS. MORRIS LYON: Donald wants your
41 attention.

42
43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

44
45 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair. If
46 it's the wish of the Council we have both Federal and
47 State biologist staff here to provide the Council with
48 any biological information before they hear any
49 proposed wildlife proposals before you. So it's up to
50 the Council, Madame Chair.

1 Thank you.
2
3 And we have State biologists available
4 to do these presentation. And I don't know how long
5 it'll be, about five, 10 minutes.
6
7 Thank you.
8
9 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
12
13 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, a point of order
14 here. We overlooked something on the redfish proposal
15 and that is -- should be read into the minutes. So we
16 can do it at the end of the meeting if you like, but
17 someone needs to be assigned from this Council to
18 attend the Fish Board meeting, to carry the water, to
19 make sure that this proposal goes to fruition. We can
20 take care of it at the end of the service -- at the end
21 of the day if you like.
22
23 Thank you, Madame Chair.
24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Let's deal --
26 could we just deal with it now or -- before we get into
27 the proposals. Let's deal with it now just in case we
28 might.....
29
30 MR. O'HARA: Okay.
31
32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK:get.....
33
34 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, I think Richard and
35 Nanci and I discussed that a little bit in the
36 Committee meeting so maybe they have a suggestion that
37 either Richard as the proposer, he's the one who's
38 originating the thing or Nanci would like to go in or
39 Don -- Dan or anybody would like to go address the Fish
40 -- Fish and Game Board on this very important proposal.
41 So you guys should decide what you want to do on this
42 matter.
43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Well, are we
45 going to be requesting one or two people to going? My
46 suggestion would be Richard to attend the Board of
47 Fish.
48
49 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. I -- in
50 that arena I think somebody that's used to that type of

1 language and stuff like Mr. O'Hara or perhaps Nanci
2 would be more fitting for this proposal. I'm not --
3 I'm not -- you get me one on one I'll talk to you all
4 day, but you get me in front of one of them and it's
5 pretty straightforward. So I suggest Dan or O'Hara or
6 Nanci.

7

8 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

9

10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

11

12 MR. O'HARA: We could -- we could do
13 Nanci as a spokesperson for this and myself as an
14 alternate or if you need both of us, you know, we're
15 going to be in there for the Fish Board anyway. So I
16 think that would probably cover it if that's okay with
17 the rest of the Council.

18

19 Thank you.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. For the
22 record then Nanci as a spokesperson and Dan O'Hara will
23 be in there anyway to help her. So that -- that's how
24 we'll do it.

25

26 MR. O'HARA: Thank you.

27

28 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

31

32
33 MR. MIKE: Thank you for that
34 clarification, Madame Chair. And just for information,
35 I just got clarification, Mr. Neil Barten, he's -- he
36 will be here today only so I think this would be a good
37 opportunity for him to present any biological
38 information for you.

39

40 Thank you, Madame Chair.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Just
43 regarding the suggestion that Donald made, what's the
44 wishes of the Board for the biologist to come in and
45 give us five minute spiel?

46

47 Nanci.

48

49 MS. MORRIS LYON: Well, I guess it
50 would be my suggestion that I'm sure the biologists are

1 as familiar with these proposals as we are in that they
2 know they more updated or more relevant information
3 that what we were previously provided for them. I
4 would really appreciate them coming up and doing so and
5 if there's nothing that's more current or more relevant
6 than what we've already heard or are aware of then I
7 would say that, you know, we don't need to waste their
8 time or ours.

9

10 Thank you, Madame Chair.

11

12 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

13

14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald, did
15 you have.....

16

17 MR. MIKE: Yes. Thank you for that
18 clarification, Madame Chair. We still have staff --
19 the State staff will be here today only. If you need
20 him to do a presentation now's a good time to have him
21 come up and provide any biological information for this
22 region on any specific wildlife proposals.

23

24 Thank you.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Those
27 of you that are I guess involved, you heard Nanci's
28 suggestion. I don't see anyone running up here to the
29 front so there must -- okay. We got one.

30

31 MR. BARTEN: Thank you for inviting me
32 up here. For the record my name is Neil Barten, I'm
33 with the Alaska Department of Fish and Game here in
34 Dillingham, I'm the area Wildlife Management Biologist.
35 And the last time I saw all of you was about a year
36 ago.

37

38 So the information I'm going to
39 present, it's going to be short and sweet, I'm not
40 going to spend a lot of time. And, you know, it may
41 not be all that pertinent specifically to some of the
42 proposals, but it's just kind of an update on what's
43 going on with wildlife management in this area that I
44 think you guys will all find kind of interesting. And
45 I will keep it very brief and go with that.

46

47 Just this past 10 days myself, Andy
48 Aderman, Ted Kreig who just walked out, a number of
49 other people were involved in a lot of effort to collar
50 caribou in the Mulchatna Herd. We put out 21 satellite

1 transmitters which really gives us a lot of good
2 information for helping manage that herd. And I'll get
3 more -- get into a little more of that. But we also
4 did caribou composition counts which are an indices we
5 do every year for herds throughout Alaska where we're
6 looking at bull to cow ratios, calf to cow ratios. And
7 we also collared some moose and I'm sure Andy's going
8 to talk about later as well as his Nushagak peninsula
9 comp surveys which he'll talk about I'm sure as well.
10 But anyway so to, you know, looking at the Mulchatna
11 Caribou Herd which is really a big deal around here as
12 most of you know. We've been putting in a lot of work
13 in the last year, we did spring captures in April, we
14 put out 20 some collars then and again some in this
15 past week. We did a photo census in late June and our
16 estimate for the herd, a point estimate, is about
17 30,000 animals give or take about 7,000. Because it's
18 a very difficult thing as I mentioned last year to get
19 counts on these animals that are scattered between
20 Bethel and Lake Clark and here in Aniak. But anyway we
21 are getting better at it and we're trying to perfect
22 the methodology, but suffice it to say probably the
23 most important data that I can, you know, share with
24 you is this year again for the past -- as well as the
25 past seven or eight or nine years we've had increasing
26 weights in our 10 month old female caribou which is a
27 really good sign that the herd's doing really well on
28 the range that's out there. And what that does is it
29 produces two year old caribou that start becoming
30 pregnant, that, you know, have young of their own and
31 that really can increase the herd size and that's
32 really what we're striving for. So we've got really
33 good indices, bull to cow ratios were very good again
34 this fall. What we did last week, the calf to cow
35 ratios were pretty similar to last year, about 30 per
36 100 cows. And I think we're heading in a good
37 direction, we're getting a lot of good data, the
38 satellite transmitters are really going to help us do
39 our photo census and the information we're collecting
40 gives us a lot of confidence that this herd is doing
41 pretty well on the range. And hopefully that will
42 produce huntable caribou if we ever get any snow which
43 is really the limiting factor.

44

45 I'll segue into moose. We've had a
46 pretty good fall hunt, the Togiak 17A, RM 573 hunt, I
47 believe 37 moose were taken. Last year I think it was
48 36 so it's continuing to improve as the moose out there
49 really are kind of growing in number. So that looked
50 really well, really good. We're going to get into a

1 proposal a little later on moose for 17A for the winter
2 hunt that last year at the Board of Game we extended
3 the winter hunt out in that area by a month so we can
4 have a 30 day winter hunt between December 1 and the
5 end of February. So I think that's going to hopefully
6 help give us more time to try to catch a snowy period
7 and provide opportunity for people to hunt. The 17B, C
8 hunt here, RM 583, we took almost 170 moose which is
9 pretty darn good, last year it was 146. The average
10 over the last 10 years is about 174 so we almost made
11 the 10 year average which is actually pretty darn good
12 considering we had a really warm fall, the water levels
13 were low, people couldn't get to some of their
14 traditional places because of the low water levels and
15 it was really windy many days which makes it difficult
16 to hunt moose. So still people got almost 170. So
17 that looks really good. We're going to keep our
18 fingers crossed that we can get some snow this winter
19 and try to get surveys in which are really an important
20 part of managing moose and try to get at some bull/cow
21 ratios which are something we badly need here. But we
22 really need snow to make that happen.

23
24 The wolf control area out in 17B, C
25 that's up in the Koliganek country, for two or three
26 years running now that's kind of been a flop because
27 without snow the airplane hunters can't see the wolves,
28 they can't land and they can't track them. But, you
29 know, if we have snow this winter I think there's
30 probably a fair number of wolves out there, a fair
31 number of young wolves because they haven't really been
32 harvested the last couple of years. So I think the
33 program in spite of some criticism that it hasn't been
34 very effective, effective is totally based on snow and
35 snow cover and ability for pilots to fly, track, see,
36 land and harvest these wolves. So I think we could
37 have a pretty successful program if we get to that this
38 year.

39
40 So again there's so many aspects of
41 managing moose and wolves and things that we need a
42 real winter which we just haven't had much chance at.

43
44 I was going to touch a tiny little bit
45 on the Northern Peninsula Caribou Herd and the Southern
46 Peninsula. Trust me, I don't know a lot about that,
47 but Dave Crowley does and he gave me some information
48 so I'll sound smart. The Northern Peninsula for the
49 first time in what, since 2005, there's going to be a
50 hunt next fall, it's going to be a Tier II. And the

1 one thing that's really important with Tier II hunts is
2 they're basically a form of a draw hunt where people
3 have to put in for a permit. And for anybody here, I'm
4 sure Fish and Game's going to do a great job of
5 distributing information or getting news releases out
6 to get people to apply, but you have to apply between I
7 think it's the 1st of November and December 15th and
8 that's going to be for fall '16. So that's a pretty
9 big deal to get -- make sure people are aware of that
10 because a lot of people in this part of the country
11 aren't used to filling out permits like for draw
12 applications and a Tier II is similar to that. So I
13 think it's important to get the word out for that.
14 That herd is doing better, it's not anywhere near the
15 population objective yet, but it's doing better, good
16 bull/cow ratios, good calf/cow ratios and caribou herds
17 can start sustaining some kind of harvest when you get
18 into those situations. The Southern Peninsula, that
19 herd is really doing well and, you know, I think I
20 might have talked about this last year, when you get
21 back into 2005, 2007, you know, there was literally one
22 or two calves per 100 cows in that herd. And with some
23 really well targeted predator control last year it was
24 in the 40 to 45 cows -- calves per 100 cows, same with
25 bulls.

26
27 And right now the team that was here
28 helping Andy Aderman do a bunch of captures and comps,
29 they headed down to King Salmon today and they're going
30 to try to work their way to Cold Bay, weather
31 permitting, and do comp counts in Unimak and in the
32 Southern Peninsula Herd as well and then do some
33 captures of moose around King Salmon.

34
35 So anyway the -- you know, the caribou
36 herds are -- you know, the local ones, the SAP, the NAP
37 and the Mulchatna as well as the Nushagak Peninsula
38 that Andy will talk about, they're all seemingly doing
39 pretty well. And there's some pretty signs that things
40 are going to get better.

41
42 And that's all I'm going to say, you
43 could ask questions if you want, but again none of
44 those -- this information may be real specific to the
45 proposals, but I thought you might want to know that.

46
47 Thank you.

48
49 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
2
3 MR. O'HARA: Sounds pretty good on
4 paper, but it doesn't work in Naknek. We haven't seen
5 a caribou there for five years. And I think that a few
6 showed up in Levelock last year and they took a few of
7 them, but other than that they just haven't been
8 around. So I'm going to hope that the North Peninsula
9 Herd words a little better too.
10
11 Thank you.
12
13 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
16
17 MR. DUNAWAY: Real quick observation.
18 While I was moose hunting this fall I was unsuccessful,
19 but I was surprised to see wolf tracks on a lot of
20 different beaches that I'd stop on and I hadn't seen
21 that in a long time. I didn't hear any howling, I used
22 to hear packs howling during moose season, but and it
23 seemed like a lone wolf and not packs. I think one
24 place that looked like maybe it was a couple of pups
25 and a mom or something, but it was something I hadn't
26 noticed before, maybe because the water was low.
27
28 Thank you.
29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Andy other --
31 Richard.
32
33 MR. WILSON: If that was his short
34 version.....
35 (Laughter)
36
37 MR. WILSON:I wonder what the
38 long version is.
39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: My husband and
41 I fly quite a bit in the area and I don't know if
42 anybody's reported the two black wolves that run
43 between here and Manokotak. At our last flight we saw
44 -- we saw them running towards Snake Lake. So and then
45 flying downs towards the peninsula those are nice
46 looking, healthy caribou down there. And the village
47 folks are still hunting them I think because -- by boat
48 because we saw some boats along the coast.
49
50 So thank you. Thanks for your report.

1 Anybody else?
2
3 (No comments)
4
5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
6
7 MR. BARTEN: You're very welcome.
8
9 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Anybody
10 else, short report, updates?
11
12 (No comments)
13
14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seeing none.
15 Okay. I'll -- Andy?
16
17 (No comments)
18
19 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.
20
21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
22
23 MR. MIKE: Yeah, thank you, Madame
24 Chair. Person on the line, did you want to address the
25 Council and if you do identify yourself and the subject
26 matter, please.
27
28 MR. KLUTCH: Yes, this is Joe Klutch in
29 (indiscernible), just a little bit south of Old Harbor.
30 I wanted to comment on some proposals. Do you copy me?
31
32 MR. MIKE: Yes, I copy you. You said
33 you want to comment on some proposals. Do you have a
34 particular proposal in mind you want to address?
35
36 MR. KLUTCH: I do indeed and you have
37 the written comments or you should.
38
39 MR. MIKE: And which proposal is that,
40 sir?
41
42 MR. KLUTCH: Is the Council listening
43 right now or.....
44
45 MR. MIKE: Yes.
46
47 MR. KLUTCH: Very good. I think we
48 just had a hellish three days of rain and wind and it's
49 been pretty rugged over here, flooding. But I'm a
50 (indiscernible) Bay guide, you know me, I've testified

1 before the Council before. And appreciate you taking
2 my call right now. We had to come in here, we got
3 soaked up pretty good to get in here to do this. I'm
4 on a cell phone so I don't know when it may drop so
5 I'll just get right to it.

6

7 MR. MIKE: Okay. Excuse me, sir. If
8 you can identify your name and which proposal you'd
9 like to comment on for the record.

10

11 MR. KLUTCH: I will indeed. My name is
12 Joe Klutch and I'm going to go through a series of
13 proposals and I'm not going to -- I've got to get
14 through this quick, you don't understand my
15 communication issues right here.

16

17 MR. MIKE: Okay, Mr. Klutch.....

18

19 MR. KLUTCH: (Indiscernible -
20 simultaneous speech).....

21

22 MR. MIKE: Mr. Joe, if I can interrupt
23 you, I'm going to give the table back to the Chair,
24 Madame Chair, and she'll recognize you and put you on
25 record.

26

27 Thank you.

28

29 MR. KLUTCH: Yes, Madame Chair, Joe
30 Klutch. I appreciate the opportunity to be able to
31 speak to you. It's been pretty (indiscernible) for us,
32 but I'd like to go through this as quick as I can. And
33 I think you have my written comments. That may not be
34 - they may be a little scruffy, but anyway here I go.
35 Can you hear me?

36

37 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Joe, we
38 haven't really gotten into the proposals yet. We're
39 having agency comments, but just giving us a little bit
40 of insight before we get into our proposals. So I
41 guess I hate to.....

42

43 MR. KLUTCH: Molly, should I call back
44 later or how do you want -- how do you want me to do
45 this?

46

47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Since you're
48 online we'll have you go ahead and go through your
49 proposals that you want to bring before us.

50

1 MR. KLUTCH: Okay. I -- Madame Chair,
2 I'll go through this as quick as I can because I have
3 to get out there and it's pretty rough weather.

4
5 Anyway number 21, go through WP-121. I
6 think that's a good one. 22, I think that's a good
7 proposal. 23, no biological issues, but they're
8 conferring -- conveying a lot of authority to do
9 allocations to the agencies, the Federal agencies, I'm
10 nervous about that.

11
12 Now 24, and Chet or Richard's sitting
13 there, this one I don't think has merit. It conveys
14 all the opportunity, grants all the opportunity to
15 Federally-qualified hunters. In other words shut down
16 9B and C. The next thing that's going to happen, if
17 there's a bubble it'll be down in 9E. Based on the
18 harvest levels and the level of effort we're not
19 hurting much, not hurting anything really. I've never
20 seen a subsistence user out there where we're going and
21 that's the truth, the god's honest truth. I'm just
22 going to spill it out here. I'm 70 years old almost
23 and I'm just going to do a Sydney Huntington on you.
24 Let's cut -- let's cut through this. There's
25 reasonable opportunity with extended seasons and
26 there's opportunity when no other users can be out
27 there other than subsistence users. It doesn't deal
28 with the health of the population, we haven't had
29 accurate surveys because of weather conditions in the
30 last three years so the burden of proof is being put on
31 us to say why not. I don't think this is -- I don't
32 think this is reasonable and I don't think it's fair.
33 And, you know, I'm 100 percent advocate, we bring back
34 bone-in meat, what three -- two moose, three moose out
35 of unit 9C and that's all the new technology that has
36 come in, jet boats, three-wheelers, four-wheelers. All
37 this stuff, you put that amount of technology on there
38 it's not like it was 40 or 50 years ago. They had a
39 dozen hunters out of the village, they got out there
40 and they got their moose because they were good
41 hunters, they didn't have all this techno stuff. And
42 now all of a sudden you've got all this because of the
43 registration permit thing which I'm not opposed to,
44 you're showing a low success rate. Well, is a drive-by
45 shooting on Pike Ridge on a Sunday afternoon, is that a
46 legitimate moose hunt. I don't think it is. Because
47 people that -- you can show that moose to make it look
48 like things are unfair. We're talking about what, a
49 half a dozen moose or 12 moose in 9C. And I appreciate
50 -- I'm 100 percent for legitimate subsistence, but this

1 one is -- I've got to say I think this would be -- I
2 don't think it should be adopted and I could go on and
3 on.

4

5 But anyway here I am to some other
6 proposals because I'm going to make this as succinct as
7 I can.

8

9 When we come to number 25, bag limit
10 for caribou, qualified hunters, (indiscernible) harvest
11 objectives I think has a tremendous season already.

12

13 Then we're going to go on to proposals
14 that will talk about same day airborne. And the
15 Council dealt with these proposals, I don't know, about
16 eight or 10 years ago, I forget. I testified to them.
17 And what you're doing is you're going to convey the
18 power to harvest to people with the airplanes and
19 whoever has those airplanes relations or whoever's
20 connected. And the people that go out and they go on
21 foot, they go by skiff or whatever, are extremely
22 handicapped, I mean, they're not going to have nearly
23 the opportunity. And it's already going on. I know, I
24 mean, I've been around the block and 40, 50 years of
25 this stuff. And I can tell you right now if you think
26 same day airborne's going to make subsistence better, I
27 think you ought to rethink that. It's going to
28 restrict people who don't have that technology to do
29 that. And I have been an advocate, we're going the
30 other way in the nonsubsistence, I don't -- I don't
31 like the term sport fishing or whatever, sport hunting,
32 whatever. I'm telling you use airplanes and you're
33 going to grind this game population, it's going to get
34 ground down. And I don't -- I'm opposed to any
35 proposal for same day airborne even though I know
36 there's a lot of people that consider that traditional
37 and customary, I remember those days and I'll tell you
38 what the results are. It means loss of opportunity an
39 loss of allocation.

40

41 So I've been animated now because I've
42 been under a pretty heavy storm and I'm just laying
43 this out to you. And I trust your judgment, I know
44 you'll -- I know you'll do the wise thing.

45

46 As far as predator management is
47 concerned as I listened to the bureaucracies talk, the
48 bureaucrats talk, it just -- they're completely from my
49 side of the mountain confused. Come out here and boat,
50 I'll take them down to the Alaska Peninsula or

1 wherever. I'll show you some wolf dens, the stuff that
2 goes on. And all this diversity, I'm for that. We
3 have to have a balance here, but this is policy and
4 it's anti subsistence, I can guarantee you it is not
5 the right thing to be doing.

6

7 So I've -- I'm over animated right now
8 and out of line, but those are my comments. If you
9 have any questions I'll answer them.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
12 you, Joe. Anybody from the Board here and any
13 questions for Joe?

14

15 (No comments)

16

17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.

18

19 MS. MORRIS LYON: I just had a comment.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nancy Lyon has
22 a comment.

23

24 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, Joe, I just
25 wanted to thank you for taking the time to call in and
26 certainly recognize that you did it under duress and I
27 just appreciate the time you took to appear before us
28 and let us know your thoughts.

29

30 MR. KLUTCH: Thanks. Thanks to the
31 Board and thanks, Nanci. I am under some stress right
32 now, but we deal with it. I just wish you all the best
33 there and I wish I was there in the room with you so I
34 can talk with you personally and I know you'll make
35 good decisions.

36

37 So I thank you very much for taking my
38 testimony and even though I got a little bit animated
39 there, I could get more animated. But thanks so much
40 folks.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Well,
43 thank you, Joe, that was a good rundown. I'm glad you
44 called in. So -- and we miss you, maybe we'll see you
45 in -- at our.....

46

47 MR. KLUTCH: Yeah.

48

49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK:spring
50 meeting.

1 MR. KLUTCH: Is -- Molly, is Joe in the
2 room?

3
4 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: No, he's not,
5 he's kind of under the weather today so he didn't come
6 in.

7
8 MR. KLUTCH: Give him my best regard,
9 he's one of my best buddies.

10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I will.
12 Thank you.

13
14 MR. KLUTCH: Thanks much, Molly.

15
16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Andy.

17
18 MR. ADERMAN: Thank you, Madame Chair.
19 My name's Andy Aderman, I work as a Wildlife Biologist
20 for the Togiak Refuge. Just a couple of quick things,
21 I'll start first with Nushagak Peninsula Caribou.

22
23 In my report in the back you may have
24 noticed that that herd increased quite a bit from last
25 year and it's been increasing for the last several
26 years. As Neil mentioned we did a composition survey
27 this past Saturday and really good calf and cow to bull
28 ratios. The calves were in the mid forties and the
29 bulls were in the mid sixty per 100 cows.

30
31 An update on the harvest. The season
32 was open August and September. At this point I'm aware
33 of 41 that have been taken and that's the all time
34 high. Actually last year was the all time high with 15
35 so it almost tripled that. Thirty-seven of the 41 were
36 bulls, only four cows. But in spite of that we have
37 one of our best bull to cow ratios right now and I
38 think that's probably due to the lack of harvest last
39 year.

40
41 Moving on to moose. Neil mentioned
42 that we just recently did some calf survey operations.
43 We put out 19 satellite collars all on bulls. We
44 spread those all over the Refuge, a few in 17C, western
45 part of 17C, majority of them in 17A and I believe five
46 out in unit 18. These moose are going to be used along
47 with the collared cows when we conduct population
48 surveys. Hopefully we get snow, but we're going to try
49 to attempt it even if we don't get snow. There's a
50 certain percentage of moose that you'll see when you're

1 out doing it and if you spend a lot more time flying
2 over that area you'll turn up a few more, but there's
3 some that you're never going to see and that's where
4 the radio collars come in. If we know they're there we
5 can verify if the crew went in and actually saw that
6 moose or not. So that's what we're trying to get at to
7 better refine our moose population surveys. And we
8 haven't done really any in the last four years just
9 because of poor snow.

10

11 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

12

13 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

14

15 MR. O'HARA: When you see a moose a
16 second time do you recognize it?

17

18 MR. ADERMAN: Some you do.

19

20 MS. MORRIS LYON: I'm not -- am I
21 interrupting your report, because I -- my only question
22 I had for you is when you were talking about your
23 caribou is I know at one point you were concerned with
24 enough animals actually getting taken, it sounds like
25 we're still growing. Are you still going to encourage
26 more hunt effort there or.....

27

28 MR. ADERMAN: Yes, Nanci. We've been
29 increasing the number of permits and basically this
30 going into the fall season I told the villages if you
31 run out of permits let me know or if you're getting
32 close, you know, they're basically unlimited. And over
33 200 permits were issued in Dillingham, over 100 in
34 Manokotak, Aleknagik still has some of their permits
35 yet, but, yeah. And you've got a couple of proposals
36 that are looking at other ways that you'll be dealing
37 with here shortly to -- yeah.

38

39 MR. MIKE: Excuse me, folks online. We
40 can hear some background noise. If you can put your --
41 place your phone on mute, either hit your mute button
42 or star six, that'll mute your phone.

43

44 Thank you.

45

46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
47 questions for Andy?

48

49 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

2

3 MR. O'HARA: Andy, you were here when
4 we started the Sun Strand Valley, Togiak Drainage moose
5 when there was about 100, 110, Pete was on this Council
6 when we did that and that number's gone up to how many
7 animals, 1,700?

8

9 MR. ADERMAN: In 17A our last count was
10 just under 1,200, but that was -- that was four years
11 ago, over four years ago. We have a number of radio
12 collars on cows that we've monitored prior to that and
13 up to this point and the reproductive information that
14 we get from them suggests that that population is still
15 growing, fairly high twinning rates, I've had really
16 good adult survival and calf survival the last two
17 winters, hardly any moose dying.

18

19 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

22

23 MR. O'HARA: The -- that we -- there
24 agreement between the villages and the Refuge and this
25 Council that there would be no taking of moose and then
26 lo and behold a couple of guys go up and kill a couple
27 of moose and leave them. And that it really, really
28 aggravated people. And this happened, this is real
29 life. And then the villages just made up their mind
30 that they're going to conserve those animals and you
31 have no predators, obviously very little so -- and you
32 got good browse. So you got a good moose population.
33 It's a very good success story.

34

35 MR. ADERMAN: Thank you. And it's not
36 -- it's not only me or Fish and Wildlife, it's Fish and
37 Game and the ACs, Nushagak and Togiak and this Council.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, that's
40 -- that's one good example of co-management right there
41 with the -- you know, when you get the villages that
42 are harvesting these animals and working with them,
43 working with the -- everybody that's involved, I don't
44 know if you're calling it co-management, but I see it
45 as co-management. It's not cooperating, but it's co-
46 managing with everybody and I like that.

47

48 Any other comments?

49

50 (No comments)

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you,
2 Andy.

3
4 MR. ADERMAN: Thank you.

5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
7 other agencies before we get into our proposals?

8
9 (No comments)

10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Before we get
12 into our wildlife proposals let's take a little five
13 minute break so that we can be refreshed to the
14 wildlife proposals. So we'll be back in about five
15 minutes.

16
17 (Off record)

18
19 (On record)

20
21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Calling back
22 to order. I want to recognize, I guess it's Jackie
23 Wilson's class. Jackie Wilson's class, Alaska history
24 class are here to join us. So let's give them a thank
25 you, I'm glad you're here.

26
27 (Applause)

28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. WP16-
30 21, unit 9 caribou.

31
32 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Madame Chair.
33 My name is Suzanne Worker, I'm a Wildlife Biologist
34 with the Office of Subsistence Management. And I'll be
35 presenting the wildlife analyses for you today. Many
36 of you might know that Tom Jennings who was
37 representing the Wildlife Department on this Council
38 retired recently. And so I've inherited these analyses
39 from him, but credit goes to him for doing the bulk of
40 the heavy lifting. But if there's any comments going
41 forward I'll be handling those.

42
43 So we can start with WP16-21. This is
44 on page 23 of your books. This proposal was submitted
45 by this Council and the request is to change the
46 caribou season is units 9C remainder and 9E from the
47 current no open season to a to be announced season open
48 only to residents of units 9C and 9E.

49
50 So just a bit of history. In 1999 the

1 Board closed units 9C remainder and 9E to caribou
2 harvest except by residents of 9C and 9E. In 2006 that
3 closure was extended to all user groups and that
4 closure has been in affect since. The current proposal
5 was prompted by the possibility that the State might
6 open a limited Tier II hunt in the fall of 2016
7 contingent on the favorable population dynamics and
8 parameters. The analysis notes that restricting the
9 Federal hunt to residents of 9C and 9E may require an
10 804 analysis and so the 804 is a tool that we use to
11 identify priority among subsistence users because the
12 C&T determination includes additional users. And so
13 once we get into the discussion it might be important
14 for the Council to comment on whether restricting
15 harvest only to residents of 9C and 9E was your intent
16 and whether or not that makes sense because when I go
17 back and read the transcripts I'm not sure that that
18 was the intent.

19

20 So this herd suffered annual declines
21 between 1984 and 2009, going down from around 20,000
22 animals to about 2,000. The herd currently appears to
23 be growing, but does remain well below the State's
24 management objective which is about 12,00 to 15,000
25 animals. The last minimum population estimate was
26 2,700 animals and that was obtained in 2014. At that
27 time the bull/cow ratio was 40 bulls to 100 cows which
28 is the highest level since 2003 and it does exceed the
29 State's management objective. Between 1997 and 2005
30 which is when harvest was last allowed harvest success
31 was typically better than 60 percent and the reported
32 harvest by local residents during these years ranged
33 from 34 to 157 caribou.

34

35 If this proposal is adopted it would
36 establish a to be announced season in unit 9C remainder
37 and unit 9E. And that harvest would be open to
38 residents of 9C and 9E if adopted as the proposal is
39 written. The to be announced season will provide
40 maximum flexibility to the manager of the Alaska
41 Peninsula/Becharof National Wildlife Refuge to open a
42 limited Federal season when that is warranted. And so
43 for these reasons the OSM preliminary conclusion is to
44 support WP16-21 with modification. And the
45 modifications would be to specify a may be announced
46 season rather than a to be announced season, to remove
47 mention of the Federal public lands closure, to remove
48 the language referencing the number of permits, quotas
49 and closure in the regulation and instead delegate
50 authority to the manager of the Alaska

1 Peninsula/Becharof National Wildlife Refuge to open and
2 close the season, set quotas and harvest restrictions
3 and specify permit conditions via a delegation of
4 authority letter.

5
6 So that's all I have for 16-21, but I
7 can try to answer any questions if you have them.

8
9 MS. MORRIS LYON:restrict mine to
10 when we're deliberating.

11
12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Uh-huh. Do
13 you have a comment?

14
15 MS. MORRIS LYON: No, I.....

16
17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh.

18
19 MS. MORRIS LYON:have no
20 comments. Dan does.

21
22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan

23
24 MR. DUNAWAY: I'm sorry. Ms. Workman,
25 if -- could you go over again the recommended language,
26 I couldn't quite keep up with that.

27
28 Thank you.

29
30 MS. WORKER: Sure. I'm sorry about
31 that.

32
33 MR. O'HARA: And what page would that
34 be in our books?

35
36 MS. WORKER: The -- through the Chair.
37 The analysis begins on page 23.....

38
39 MR. O'HARA: Okay.

40
41 MS. WORKER:of this book. So,
42 Madame Chair, to address Mr. Dunaway's questions. The
43 request is to change the caribou season in unit C
44 remainder and 9E from a no open season to a to be
45 announced season only open to residents of 9C and 9E.
46 And the OSM preliminary conclusion is to first specify
47 a may be announced season rather than a to be announced
48 season so a minor thin; to remove the mention of a
49 Federal public lands closure and I believe the reason
50 for that is because administratively a closure is much

1 different than a may be announced season so a closure
2 would preclude a may be announced season; to remove the
3 language referencing the number of permits, quotas and
4 closures and that information would instead be outlined
5 in the delegation of authority letter to the Refuge
6 Manager, and that simply gives the Manager the must
7 flexibility to manage the hunt given the current
8 conditions. Is that helpful?

9

10 MR. DUNAWAY: Yes, and in the process I
11 think I found where you're reading from. So that helps
12 a lot, but, yeah, it's good for me to hear it a couple
13 times.

14

15 Thank you.

16

17 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

18

19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

20

21 MR. O'HARA: This would be a
22 subsistence type hunt permitted by the Refuge or the --
23 on the Alaska Peninsula, right, and it's between the
24 dates -- you can your permit -- was it between December
25 -- November -- no, requesting the permits. Can you
26 address that?

27

28 MS. WORKER: So to answer your
29 question, yes, the hunt would be managed by the Manager
30 of the Alaska Peninsula/Becharof National Wildlife
31 Refuge and to answer your question about dates.....

32

33 MR. O'HARA: When you request your
34 permits or when you apply for the permits maybe.

35

36 MS. WORKER: That is a good question
37 that I can't answer. Perhaps someone from the Refuge
38 might have a better idea about how that permitting
39 would work.

40

41 MR. CADY: Madame Chair and Council,
42 I'm, for the record, Tom Cady. I'm the Deputy Manager
43 at Alaska Peninsula and Becharof Refuge. And can you
44 repeat the question, please, I wasn't.....

45

46 MR. O'HARA: We just had a report just
47 20 minutes ago saying if you want to get in on this
48 Federal permit registration it's going to be between
49 November and December, 2016.

50

1 MS. MORRIS LYON: The hunt is '16, but
2 the registration will be in the '15.

3
4 MR. O'HARA: Yeah. So the question is
5 what is the date for requesting a permit, when do you
6 -- when do you make that -- when do I go and see and
7 say I want a permit?

8
9 MR. CADY: Okay. Let me -- just a
10 clarification. Obviously I'm not the manager so I
11 don't have the authority to make the decision, but in
12 speaking with Susan before coming to the meeting and
13 speaking with Don Watts, the Wildlife Biologist at our
14 Refuge, we are more inclined to just simply recognize
15 the State Tier II permit once the State decides how
16 many will be issued to authorize the hunt on Refuge
17 lands. Does that make sense?

18
19 MR. O'HARA: Yeah. Thank you.

20
21 MR. CADY: Okay. So we would prefer
22 not to issue a Federal permit for this hunt.

23
24 MR. O'HARA: Okay.

25
26 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

29
30 MR. DUNAWAY: And then early in your
31 discussion, Ms. Worker, you asked about our intent on
32 whether we could only include was it 9C and E
33 residents, but you said you had concerns that there may
34 be other C&T qualified users. Could you refresh me on
35 that, I always get worry if I think -- worried if we
36 might somehow inadvertently exclude, you know, folks
37 that deserve to have a chance.

38
39 Thank you.

40
41 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Mr. Dunaway,
42 through the Chair. So in 1999 the Board closed this
43 hunt to all hunters except residents of 9C and 9E and
44 then later it was closed to everyone. However so for
45 -- well, I don't have the C&T in front of me, but it's
46 in the regulation book. The C&T includes more than
47 just residents of 9C and 9E and so as the proposal is
48 written it would exclude all except qualified users in
49 9C and 9E. And so if that's not your intent then this
50 is a good time to address that.

1 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.
2
3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.
4
5 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yes, thank you,
6 Madame Chair. Yeah, I was going to wait until we
7 deliberated to bring that up, but it -- as I recall
8 very clearly this was to be for residents of those
9 units alone because prior to the Tier II that we had
10 going on before it got completely closed we had major
11 issues with so many people applying for permits from
12 out of the area that it was displacing the people who
13 it was really meant to benefit. So in order to
14 preclude that issue it was indeed our intent to keep
15 this to residents only of the area.
16
17 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
18
19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
20
21 MR. DUNAWAY: I guess I do recall there
22 was quite a bit of dismay when a whole bunch of Tier II
23 qualifiers flew down from Anchorage while some of the
24 local folks were stuck on their porch with no permit
25 didn't go down well at all.
26
27 Thank you.
28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
30 other -- any other comments?
31
32 (No comments)
33
34 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: With this
35 regulation here did you say that you're going to be
36 using the State C&T process or am I -- did I
37 misunderstand that?
38
39 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Madame Chair.
40 So the intent isn't to use the State's C&T, we'll be
41 using the Federal C&T, but it sounds like the Refuge
42 would be inclined to issue permits using the State Tier
43 II system rather than requiring a separate Federal
44 permit.
45
46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
47 other comments?
48
49 (No comments)
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seeing none I
2 guess we're.....
3
4 MS. MORRIS LYON: Consultations.
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Reports
7 on Board consultations, Native tribes.
8
9 Donald.
10
11 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair. In
12 September 30th, 2015 the Office of Subsistence
13 Management, our Native Liaison sent out invitations for
14 tribal consultation on the wildlife proposals. So on
15 September 30th, 2015, the regions involved for some --
16 for tribal consultations on wildlife proposals included
17 the regions of Bristol Bay, Western Interior, North
18 Slope, Eastern Interior and Southcentral Council. And
19 during the tribal consultation there was no one from
20 the Bristol Bay region to provide consultation or
21 provide consultation to the Federal Subsistence Board
22 on the wildlife proposals, there was no one from this
23 region.
24
25 Thank you.
26
27 So it applies to the rest of the
28 wildlife proposals.
29
30 Thank you.
31
32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Next is
33 the agency comments. ADF&G.
34
35 MR. CRAWFORD: This is Drew Crawford,
36 can you hear me?
37
38 Over.
39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yes, we can.
41
42 MR. CRAWFORD: Okay. The Department's
43 preliminary recommendation for proposal WP16-21 is to
44 support as modified by OSM.
45
46 Over.
47
48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Are you
49 -- that's understood.
50

1 Thank you.

2

3 The next one is the Federal agencies.

4

5 MR. CADY: Madame Chair and Council,
6 Tom Cady again with Alaska Peninsula/Becharof Refuge.
7 I don't believe there's any other comment from our
8 Refuge at least other than the desire to just simply
9 recognize the State issued permit for the Tier II hunt.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
12 Native tribal. Anybody here to make any comments
13 regarding this?

14

15 (No comments)

16

17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seeing none --
18 oh, Courtenay.

19

20 MS. CARTY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
21 For the record, Courtenay Carty. The Bristol Bay
22 Native Association's Board of Directors now is
23 operating a Fish and Game Harvest Committee and our
24 Committee is trying to -- it's pretty newly established
25 in terms of regularly meeting to try to address every
26 regulatory proposal that's coming forward in our
27 region, and the Council or our Committee actually
28 discussed all of the wildlife proposals for the Federal
29 Subsistence Board and instead of choosing to act and
30 provide comment on each one specifically they would
31 like to just recognize the RAC for the hard work that
32 you do and all the knowledge that you bring to the
33 table in regards to subsistence harvest in your
34 communities and regions and defer to the RAC on all the
35 comments for the Federal Board.

36

37 Thank you.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
40 you, Courtenay.

41

42 InterAgency Staff Committee.

43

44 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

45

46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

47

48 MR. O'HARA: I came back from the break
49 a little bit late. Did you recognize the new group of
50 people that's come in here? You did?

1 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah.
2
3 MR. O'HARA: Okay.
4
5 MS. MORRIS LYON: We did.
6
7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. The
8 InterAgency.
9
10 (No comments)
11
12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nobody here.
13 Okay.
14
15 Advisory Group comments, regional --
16 other regional Councils.
17
18 (No comments)
19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We don't have
21 Frank here. Okay.
22
23 Fish and Game Advisory.
24
25 Dan.
26
27 MR. DUNAWAY: Molly, Nushagak Advisory
28 Committee didn't take this up because it was out of our
29 area.
30
31 Thank you.
32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
34 Resource Committee, Subsistence Resource Committee.
35
36 (No comments)
37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nobody. Okay.
39 Summary of written public comments.
40
41 Donald.
42
43 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. We did not
44 receive any summary of written public comments, but as
45 Mr. Joe Klutch indicated he submitted comments and I do
46 not have those comments, but when I do receive them
47 I'll make -- I'll share it with the Council.
48
49 Thank you.
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Public
2 testimonies regarding this 9C?
3
4 (No comments)
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nobody's not
7 jumping up to. Okay.
8
9 Regional Council recommendations.
10
11 (No comments)
12
13 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Motion to
14 adopt.
15
16 MR. JOHNSON: Madame Chair.
17
18 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Carl.
19
20 MR. JOHNSON: Yes, Madame Chair, Carl
21 Johnson. I don't know if I missed it, but I just
22 wanted to let the Council know that the Kodiak
23 Aleutians Council did take up this proposal and they
24 voted to support the OSM conclusion.
25
26 Thank you, Madame Chair.
27
28 MS. MORRIS LYON: Okay. I'm going to
29 move to support proposal WP16-21.
30
31 MR. DUNAWAY: With the amended language
32 or.....
33
34 MS. MORRIS LYON: We -- I didn't know
35 if we should -- yeah. Yeah, with the amended language.
36 I guess -- well, let's put it on the table and then
37 make an amendment if we want, please. I think I'm
38 going to leave it like that.
39
40 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.
41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
43
44 MR. MIKE: I just wanted clarification.
45 Ms. Nanci Morris Lyon moved to support the proposal,
46 did you mean to adopt the proposal?
47
48 MS. MORRIS LYON: I did mean adopt.
49
50 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.

1
2 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
3
4 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
5
6 MR. O'HARA: I'll second that motion.
7
8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
9 been a motion by Nanci to adopt the proposal WP16-21
10 and seconded by Dan O'Hara. Any other comments?
11
12 MR. WILSON: I want to speak to it,
13 please.
14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.
16
17 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. Yeah, I'm
18 in support of this, I mean, this has been a long time
19 coming, you know, we're -- several years now we've been
20 looking for opportunities to harvest. And this if it's
21 passed will give the agencies the ability to open prior
22 to the populations being -- population's going up and
23 they're assuming we're in good shape so this is kind of
24 a step because of the cycles of -- you know, our Board
25 of Game cycles and things. So this is a good thing, I
26 think.....
27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
29 other?
30
31 Nanci.
32
33 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, I would propose
34 some modified language. I do like -- and I kind of
35 have a question I guess too, but I do like the
36 suggested language of may be announced season just in
37 case. I think that that's a good safety net for us to
38 have in case something should happen and we see a need
39 to not make that happen. So I do think that may be --
40 the may be language should be something that we adopt
41 with this proposal, but I'm also wondering if it would
42 be -- if it would behoove us to make in this -- at the
43 same point make the statement that it is for residents
44 only. Is that something that we should do and I'm
45 looking at you or Donald, Suzie or Donald to give me
46 clarification on that because I want to make sure we
47 get it covered with our vote the first time and we
48 don't have to revisit it later.
49
50 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Ms. Lyon,

1 through the Chair. It's my understanding that if you
2 wish to support this proposal not as it's written, but
3 restrict it only to residents of 9C and 9E then this is
4 the appropriate time to make that desire known.

5
6 MS. MORRIS LYON: Okay. And I guess my
7 question wasn't clear then because you said that that
8 is what our language was and you didn't take it out so
9 then we wouldn't have to address it again or you said
10 it wasn't in there well enough?

11
12 MS. WORKER: My mistake. As written
13 the proposal is to support a to be announced season
14 open only to residents of 9C and 9E. So I was
15 mistaken.

16
17 Thank you.

18
19 MS. MORRIS LYON: No, no problem.

20
21 MR. O'HARA: The.....

22
23 MS. MORRIS LYON: Just want to get it
24 right. So in then that case I would just suggest that
25 we do change the language to the may be announced
26 season language and reference to the way that it is
27 exactly written there in the -- by OSM.

28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan O'Hara.

30
31 MR. O'HARA: Yeah. So are you making a
32 friendly amendment?

33
34 MS. MORRIS LYON: I am. Would you like
35 to second it?

36
37 MR. O'HARA: I would second that. No
38 seconds down there on the end, what's going on, you
39 guys fall asleep or.....

40
41 (Laughter)

42
43 MR. O'HARA: You guys understand
44 English and everything down there. Okay. I better get
45 off the mic, huh.

46
47 (Laughter)

48
49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Where
50 were we.

1 MS. MORRIS LYON: No, we got an
2 amendment too. So.....
3
4 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh, okay.
5 There's been a friendly amendment added to the WP16-21
6 proposal. Seconded by Dan O'Hara.
7
8 Did I do this right, Donald?
9
10 MR. MIKE: As far as process, yes, but
11 it brought up a question for me. The amendment
12 certainly address what the -- it is on page 32 of the
13 OSM preliminary conclusion with a may be -- may be
14 announced for unit 9C remainder and unit 9 and this
15 would be residents only of unit 9 and 9E.
16
17 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yes, that is -- that
18 is correct. That was my intent.
19
20 MR. O'HARA: Could I.....
21
22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
23
24 MR. O'HARA: Okay. Donald, residents
25 only of 9C and 9E versus qualified subsistence user of
26 9C, 9E. What is the difference, what are we driving at
27 here on this -- on this amendment.
28
29 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Mr. O'Hara,
30 through the Chair. This would apply to Federally-
31 qualified users that reside in units 9C and 9E.
32
33 MR. O'HARA: On Federal lands?
34
35 MS. WORKER: On Federal lands, that's
36 correct.
37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Carl.
39
40 MR. JOHNSON: Yes, thank you, Madame
41 Chair. And through the Chair, a question for the
42 amendment proponent. Do you -- I know you stated
43 explicitly the may be announced language you like in
44 the OSM preliminary conclusion. Does your amendment
45 also include the other OSM modifications?
46
47 MS. MORRIS LYON: Through the Chair,
48 yes. And I said through and including the rest of the
49 language that was on the OSM written thing. So thank
50 you for clarifying that, let's make sure everybody's on

1 the page because I -- to me the way I read this is that
2 the may be announced isn't going to work unless you
3 eliminate the rest of this. So, yes, I -- my intent
4 was to be all inclusive with that.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Are we
9 ready to vote on the proposal?

10
11 Dan.

12
13 MR. O'HARA: Call for the question.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: The question's
16 been called.

17
18 MS. MORRIS LYON: Amendment first,
19 Madame Chair.

20
21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah. We'll I
22 guess vote on the amendment first. Okay. All in favor
23 say aye.

24
25 IN UNISON: Aye.

26
27 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
28 objections?

29
30 (No opposing votes)

31
32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Hearing none,
33 thank you. And then the main motion.

34
35 MR. O'HARA: Call for the question.

36
37 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: The question's
38 been called. All in favor say aye.

39
40 IN UNISON: Aye.

41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
43 objections?

44
45 (No opposing votes)

46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
48 That was easy.

49
50 Okay. The next is the WP16-22. Unit 9

1 moose.

2

3

4 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Madame Chair.
5 This is Suzanne Worker again. WP16-22 begins on page
6 37 of your book. And this proposal was submitted by
7 the Alaska Peninsula/Becharof National Wildlife Refuge.

7

8

9

10 The request is to require a Federal
11 registration permit for moose harvest in a portion of
12 9C for the August 20th to September 20th season.
13 Specifically this is the portion of unit 9C that drains
14 into the Naknek River from the south. So Federal lands
15 within Becharof National Wildlife Refuge. Currently a
16 State registration permit is required for the fall
17 season while a Federal permit is required for the
18 winter season which runs December 1st through December
19 31. So the main problem with requiring a State permit
20 for the fall season is that the Federal season is
21 longer than the State season and the State days are
22 printed on the permit. And so this causes some
23 confusion for everyone. The proponent believes that
24 requiring a Federal permit will ease the confusion and
25 will also make the regulations consistent across
26 seasons by requiring a Federal permit for both the fall
27 and the winter hunts. The proponent also requests that
28 hunters continue to use a State registration permit and
29 to report their harvest via that permit. And the logic
30 here is that reporting via the State tends to result in
31 better harvest records.

31

32

33 In unit 9 a State registration permit
34 has been required for Federal subsistence moose harvest
35 since 2012 following the recommendation of the unit 9
36 Moose Working Group and with support from this Council.
37 In the fall of 2015 a special action was approved to
38 require a Federal permit for the fall moose hunt within
39 Becharof National Wildlife Refuge.

39

40

41 The moose population in unit 9 appears
42 to be stable although it is fairly low density
43 population. In unit C not including Katmai National
44 Park there are estimated to be around 800 moose.

44

45 The reported harvest in unit 9 between
46 2003 and 2013 was between 83 and 177 moose annually.
47 And the majority of this harvest -- the reported
48 harvest occurs during September. About 20 percent of
49 that harvest is attributable to local users.

49

50

So if this proposal is adopted it will

1 require the use of a Federal registration permit for
2 harvest of moose on Federal lands in unit 9C south of
3 the Naknek River and this would be for the fall season.
4 A Federal permit is already required for the winter
5 season. Requiring a Federal permit would clarify the
6 season dates and hunt conditions for hunters as well as
7 for management and for law enforcement officers.
8 However the Federal permit requirement would supersede
9 the requirement for a State permit and so the
10 proponent's request that subsistence users continue to
11 report their harvest through the State can't be
12 required if this proposal is adopted.

13

14 And so the OSM preliminary conclusion
15 is to support WP16-22 with modification to require only
16 a Federal permit for the fall season.

17 And I'll be happy to answer questions
18 for you.

19

20 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

21

22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

23

24 MR. MIKE: Yes, thank you. You
25 mentioned population estimate at 800 on these Federal
26 lands on remainder of 9C. Or can you -- can you give
27 me those numbers again and then there was a harvest
28 number that you gave. And where do these recent 800
29 numbers come from?

30

31 MS. WORKER: So what I have in my notes
32 and I can double check to make sure this is what the
33 analysis says, is that in unit C not including Katmai
34 National Park there are estimated to be 800 moose. And
35 that harvest -- and this is for all of unit 9, has been
36 between 83 and 177 moose over the past 10 years. For
37 the most part our population data comes from the State
38 and much of our harvest data comes from the State as
39 well.

40

41 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

42

43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

44

45 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, Madame Chair, Ms.
46 Worker. And I don't know how it works over there so
47 well. Could this mean that hunters would be having to
48 carry a State and a Federal permit in the fall or just
49 how does that work?

50

1 Thank you.

2

3 MS. WORKER: Yeah, thank you for the
4 question. Through the Chair. So that was the original
5 proposal, but generally the Federal permit would
6 overrule the requirement for the State permit. And so
7 the OSM recommendation is that only a Federal permit be
8 required because we can't require that you have both.

9

10 MR. DUNAWAY: So that doesn't mean
11 there's parts of the area that are open under a State
12 hunt and -- I mean, even still they couldn't require it
13 and it'll -- now it's going to require that the agency
14 coordinate harvest information. But I guess there's --
15 is there parts that are State lands that are still open
16 it would be under a State permit at the same time. And
17 I'm just kind of -- I really -- my -- one of my high
18 motivators here is to minimize confusion and stuff.
19 But I also remember that there was a quandary about
20 this different length of season. So maybe the folks
21 that live over there can explain it to me.

22

23 Thank you.

24

25 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, if I may. I
26 think where the confusion was is that there's two
27 separate dates, the Federal side and the State side.
28 And the Federal opens up before the State and even
29 though you're required to have a State permit in this
30 section here which basically we're talking Big Creek,
31 the upper portion of it is Federal, you can go up what,
32 five, six miles and you get into Federal lands. And
33 you can hunt that August 20 where State lands don't
34 open up until September 1st. And right now we're
35 required to hold a Federal permit on the December
36 season, a registration permit, but nothing yet is
37 required in this section and they're just trying to
38 simplify things by getting us a permit for this 10 day
39 window prior to the State opening up; is that correct?

40

41 MS. WORKER: Yes, thank you, that is my
42 understanding.

43

44 MR. WILSON: I'm not as easy as you guy
45 over here.

46

47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah. Okay.
48 I'm glad I don't hunt over there.

49

50 (Laughter)

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any other
2 comments?
3
4 MR. CADY: Madame Chair, Tom Cady again
5 with the Peninsula Refuge there. And regarding your
6 question, Mr. Dunaway, I was assisting in issue the
7 permits this summer. We got word out in -- it was late
8 July, early August, it was fairly short notice that we
9 were -- that we enacted the special action to have the
10 permit for that upper portion of Big Creek there. And
11 I think it was pretty well received actually, folks
12 that came in to get permits didn't seem to mind. I'd
13 say at least 30 to 40 permits were issued from our
14 office and I think a few got mailed out to folks
15 outside the area. So I think it was pretty successful
16 and I didn't hear any complaints.
17
18 Thank you.
19
20 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
21
22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
23
24 MR. O'HARA: Age old question, Tom,
25 what -- Susan could not -- Alexander the Manager could
26 not make it?
27
28 MR. CADY: Yes, that's correct.
29
30 MR. O'HARA: And you are the Deputy
31 Director?
32
33 MR. CADY: The Deputy Manager, yes.
34
35 MR. O'HARA: Okay. Without very much
36 authority?
37
38 (Laughter)
39
40 MR. O'HARA: That's what you said, I'm
41 just.....
42
43 MR. CADY: So.....
44
45 MR. O'HARA:trying to.....
46
47 MR. CADY: Yeah, more or less. I'm not
48 going to speak for her on complex subjects certainly.
49
50 MR. O'HARA: Well, we've got you on

1 record too. I guess the same old story of -- an
2 estimated 800 moose is -- doesn't sit very well. But
3 granted for the last two or three years Richard and
4 Nanci and we haven't had much snow and conditions have
5 not been good and so just to go on record if we
6 possibly could get moose counts, you know, area moose
7 counts and you -- Daniel is one of your stars as far as
8 getting things done, he's just an exceptionally good
9 pilot. So we would encourage who we possibly could,
10 last year I don't think we had any snow. So that's
11 just a concern.

12

13 Thank you.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any more
16 comments?

17

18 (No comments)

19

20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We'll go down
21 through the process. Report on Board consultation,
22 tribes, ANCSA corporations.

23

24 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
25 The statement I read earlier having the tribal
26 consultation held on September 30th, 2015 does not
27 apply to the remainder of the proposals on the agenda.

28

29 Thank you.

30

31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Agency
32 comments, ADF&G.

33

34 MR. CRAWFORD: Yes, Madame Chair. Drew
35 Crawford with the Alaska Department of Fish and Game.
36 The Department's preliminary recommendation is to
37 oppose proposal WP16-22. Increased regulatory
38 complexity does not benefit users or law enforcement.
39 Although this is proposed by a law enforcement officer,
40 the request is for an additional permit that it's
41 increasing complexity for law enforcement.

42

43 Over.

44

45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
46 you, Drew. Next is the agencies, Federal agencies
47 comments.

48

49 (No comments)

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Native,
2 tribal, village.
3
4 (No comments)
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: InterAgency
7 Staff comments.
8
9 (No comments)
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. I guess
12 we're down to Advisory Group comments, other regional
13 Councils. Fish and Game Committees, Subsistence
14 Resource Committees.
15
16 (No comments)
17
18 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Summary of
19 written comments.
20
21 Donald.
22
23 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. We did not
24 receive any summary of written comments.
25
26 Thank you.
27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Public
29 testimony.
30
31 (No comments)
32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
34 Regional Council recommendations.
35
36 (No comments)
37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We're going
39 pretty fast here. Okay. Just.....
40
41 MS. MORRIS LYON: Somebody else want to
42 put it on the table for a change.
43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. We --
45 discussions and justifications. Somebody needs to put
46 this proposal on the table.
47
48 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
49
50 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

1 MR. DUNAWAY: I'll move to adopt this
2 proposal to include the recommended language from OSM
3 unless you don't like taking it that way. I want to
4 commend -- it seems like pretty often OSM manages to
5 get it right, what we really meant. It's not too often
6 that they mess it up and I'm kind of impressed on that.
7 But I move to adopt with -- to include the recommended
8 language.

9
10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: There's been a
11 motion.

12
13 MS. MORRIS LYON: I'll second that.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seconded by
16 Nanci.

17
18 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

19
20
21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

22
23 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, I'd like to speak
24 to it a little bit. I was a little startled at the
25 Fish and Game comments, it seems a little bit narrow
26 view there. We're trying to fix kind of a quandary
27 between the Federal and State season and we certainly
28 aren't serving the public if they're in kind of a no
29 win situation. I don't like the inconsistencies that
30 we have to deal with here, but they're there and I want
31 to fix it so folks can hunt legally. I don't want them
32 in this kind of limbo. And so I'm going to be
33 supporting this. I -- and as much as possible untangle
34 the confusion, but when there is inconsistencies we've
35 got to make it work and I think this will work. And
36 I'm really glad to hear that it seemed like they didn't
37 have difficulty getting the word out to the public and
38 I know that there in King Salmon it's not too far
39 between Fish and Game and the Refuge to obtain those
40 permits. So I don't think we're putting any undo
41 burden on the public and that's -- so I'll be
42 supporting it.

43
44 Thank you.

45
46 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

47
48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

49
50 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. I also will

1 be in support of this. It just -- I was actually a
2 product of this fall's hunt there and having to go to
3 the agency to get the permit, it simplified it for the
4 people -- the user groups that are using that portion.
5 It just -- you had -- now you got a permit and it's
6 good for the fall and it's good for the winter season.
7 So it's not -- you know, it's -- you just -- you know,
8 it's a -- it just simplified things so it seemed to
9 work. And I don't see I guess with Dan here, I don't
10 see how the State can -- you know, it's just -- the
11 narrow view that they had, it didn't seem like it was
12 fitting. But to the user groups that use that portion
13 not having to worry about, you know, that 10 day lapse
14 wondering where you are, if you're legal, if you're
15 illegal, now you go in and you get a permit for it, you
16 know you're good. Ten days later, you know, you get
17 your State and you're on your way. So.....

18

19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

20

21 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, I just have the
22 brief comment too that I just like the idea of being
23 able to work off of the one permit system. I think
24 anytime we can reduce requirements for paperwork for
25 people in the area it's a bonus and I think everybody
26 wins with that too because you're more likely to get
27 accurate information and eliminate a lot of redundancy
28 that way.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Are we
31 ready to.....

32

33 MR. O'HARA: Call for the question.

34

35

36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: There's been
37 question called. All in favor say aye.

38

39 IN UNISON: Yes.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
42 opposition?

43

44 (No opposing votes)

45

46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seeing none,
47 thank you. Well, we're moving right along here.

48

49 Okay. The next proposal is WP16-23,
50 unit 9B.

1 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Madame Chair.
2 Proposal WP16-23 begins on page 49 of your books. And
3 this proposal was submitted by Leon Alsworth of Port
4 Alsworth. And he requests a change in the number of
5 permits that are issued for brown bear harvest within
6 Lake Clark National Park and Preserve. Currently the
7 harvest quota in that area is 10 bears annually and
8 only 10 permits are issued with not more than five
9 going to a single community. And so as a result not
10 everyone who desires a permit necessarily has access to
11 one. This system for allocating permits has been in
12 place since 1997. There are no known conservation
13 concerns for bears in this area. The most recent
14 survey that -- conducted in the Park was conducted in
15 2000. And at that time the bear density was estimated
16 to be 10 bears per 100 square miles, higher in coastal
17 areas. And the recent observations indicate that these
18 numbers probably haven't changed significantly in the
19 survey area since then.

20
21 Harvest within the Park is very low.
22 And the demand for permits is low. On average only six
23 permits are issued annually, however Port Alsworth
24 receives the maximum of five permits nearly every year.
25 And most of the reported hunting effort and all of the
26 reported harvest has been by residents of Port
27 Alsworth. Only seven bears were harvested between 2005
28 and 2013 so harvest is low, but people still can't get
29 the permits that they would like to hunt.

30
31 Because of this, because of the low
32 demand for permits and the low harvest and because of
33 the apparent disparity in the permit distribution the
34 OSM preliminary conclusion is to support WP16-23.

35
36 And I can answer questions for you if
37 you'd like.

38
39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Uh-huh. Yes.
40 Okay. Any comments on this?

41
42 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

45
46 MR. O'HARA: Yes. So Leon wants more
47 bear permits, is that right, Alsworth?

48
49 MS. WORKER: That's right. He -- so
50 the request is that there is not a limit on the number

1 of permits that are issued. Because it's a permit
2 there is a requirement of reporting period and the Park
3 Service -- the Lake Clark Park Service staff supports
4 this recommendation, but has requested that the
5 reporting period be reduced from the current five days
6 to three days just so they do have a good handle on,
7 you know, what's being harvested and they don't go over
8 the quota. But the harvest quota would not be affected
9 by this proposal.

10

MR. O'HARA: Thank you.

11

MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

12

13

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

Thank you.

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah,
Senafont, you have any comments?

MR. SHUGAK: I don't know if I could
speak to the reporting part, but, you know, I know that
there's quite an abundance of bears up around our area.
We always have a lot of trouble with bears there in
Pedro Bay, you know. And to see the -- it's not going
to affect it that much having, you know, the open
period on the -- or open for permits there. You know,
we'd like to see more hunting in our area in Pedro Bay.
You know, a longer reporting period might do a lot, you
know, good for the people there. And I don't see
anything wrong with a longer reporting period,
shortening it certainly doesn't, you know, help them
out. You go out there and you have to get in right
away and all that, you know, that would be the only
thing that I would see wrong with that.

MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

1 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, the any bull permit
2 for the State of Alaska that we get, you know, I think
3 you have -- Richard, did we have 10 days or two weeks
4 to report that after we did it and then you could call
5 in and say well, I'm going to keep this permit and do
6 the December hunt. So, you know, you might not get out
7 of the woods in three days, you know, some places like
8 -- these bureaucrats that go from King Salmon down to
9 Perryville, they got to go down there and back the same
10 day because they don't want to spend three, four, five,
11 six days if you can't get out. And so I think, you
12 know, if -- I think once this gets on the floor I'm
13 going to make a recommendation that we do a 10 day
14 reporting. And let these guys get a little chance to
15 get a few more bears.

16
17 I understand quite a few in Pedro Bay
18 can't swim, they kind of find them down in the bottom
19 of the -- but you don't have to answer that, that's
20 fine.

21
22 (Laughter)

23
24 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

25
26 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, I totally
27 support that, Dan, and will do so when you decide to
28 make that change. Just for the very reason I too agree
29 that three days is not a realistic number of days to
30 give somebody in case it's not the only reason they're
31 out in the field. To make them have to come in just in
32 order to fulfill reporting requirements seems like a
33 huge waste of time, energy and resources.

34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Dan.

36
37 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, question again.
38 And to repeat, you said there were seven bears killed,
39 is that per year or is that total for a time period.

40
41 Thank you.

42
43 MS. WORKER: That you, Mr. Dunaway,
44 through the Chair. There were only seven bears
45 reported harvested between 2005 and 2013. That's not
46 an annual statistic.

47
48 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. So our fear of
49 exceeding the quota seems rather overwrought to me.

50

1 Thank you.
2
3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
4 other comments?
5
6 (No comments)
7
8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Are we ready
9 to make a.....
10
11 MR. O'HARA: Are we ready to make a
12 motion?
13
14 MS. MORRIS LYON: No, we need to go
15 through this.
16
17 MR. O'HARA: We're going to finish
18 that.
19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah. Okay.
21 The report on Board consultation.
22
23 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair, thank you.
24 There were no tribes that commented on this proposal.
25
26 Thank you.
27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Agency
29 reports. ADF&G.
30
31 (No comments)
32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Federal
34 Native.....
35
36 MR. CRAWFORD: Madame Chair, this is
37 Drew Crawford with Fish and Game in Anchorage. The
38 Department is neutral on proposal WP16-23.
39
40 Over.
41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
43 you. Okay. Federal agencies.
44
45 (No comments)
46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Native tribal
48 village.
49
50 (No comments)

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: InterAgency
2 Staff.
3
4 (No comments)
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Advisory Group
7 Committees like the Regional Councils, Fish and Game
8 Advisory, Subsistence Resource.
9
10 MS. RUPP: Thank you, Madame Chair.
11 For the record I'm Liza Rupp on behalf of the Lake
12 Clark Subsistence Resource Commission. And on October
13 7th we had our fall meeting and we had a quorum and the
14 Commission discussed this proposal and officially
15 supports it.
16
17 Thank you.
18
19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.
20
21 MS. MORRIS LYON: Just because I have
22 you in the hot seat, so did they make any comments at
23 all about the time requirements or.....
24
25 MS. RUPP: No, they did not actually.
26
27 MS. MORRIS LYON: Okay. Thank you.
28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
30 Short and sweet. Thank you.
31
32 Okay. Where are we. Regional
33 Councils, we did that. Okay. The summary of written
34 reports.
35
36 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. There's no
37 written public comments received and there's no public
38 testimony requested.
39
40 Thank you.
41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Public
43 testimony.
44
45 (No comments)
46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Seeing
48 none. Okay. Regional Councils.
49
50 MR. O'HARA: Madam, are we ready for

1 the proposal?

2

3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yes.

4

5 MR. O'HARA: Okay. I would like to
6 move that we adopt proposal 16-23 with the provision
7 that the reporting be 10 days and that would be, who do
8 they send to, the Federal -- who do they report to?

9

10 MS. WORKER: They would report to Lake
11 Clark National Park and Preserve.....

12

13 MR. O'HARA: Okay.

14

15 MS. WORKER:I believe.

16

17 MR. O'HARA: Within 10 days of the
18 permit being issued. Of the hunt, I'm sorry, of the
19 hunt. Okay.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
22 been a motion.....

23

24 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

27

28 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
29 Just to keep the process straight, the Council had
30 moved to adopt proposal 16-23 and then we can come into
31 discussion and then, Mr. O'Hara, we can bring that
32 amendment to the table. And.....

33

34 MR. O'HARA: It's in the proposal to
35 put it on.....

36

37 MR. MIKE: Right.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you,
40 Donald.

41

42 MS. MORRIS LYON: I'll second that.

43

44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Motion
45 and seconded by Nanci. And are we -- call for
46 question.

47

48 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, I'd like to
49 propose an amendment to the motion that would allow 10
50 days for the reporting of hunt results instead of three

1 days requirement.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
4 been a motion.

5

6 MR. SHUGAK: Second.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Second by
9 Senafont. Any other comments?

10

11 Richard.

12

13 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, yeah. So
14 now in the books they have a five day requirement
15 reporting, is that what's in the books now, is it five
16 days?

17

18 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Mr. Wilson.
19 Currently there is a five day reporting requirement on
20 that permit; that's correct.

21

22 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. I'm
23 wondering if -- you know, if they had a recent meeting
24 up there with the user groups and there's no mention
25 of, you know, the reporting being a problem. I
26 understand that trying to get it down to three, but
27 maybe for simplicity reasons if five worked for them.
28 It's too bad we don't have -- I mean, I'd like to hear
29 some other comments on that here from the Board.

30

31 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

34

35 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you. I don't know
36 if there's anybody can answer this and partly I'm
37 thinking about the practicality of reporting. And the
38 biggest concentration of population, and Dan O'Hara may
39 know this, is right there in Port Alsworth, but are
40 there other people around the lake and around the --
41 I'm not too clear where all these people might be
42 qualified to get or seek to get permits for this.

43

44 Thank you.

45

46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

47

48 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, Dan, on page 54
49 there's a graph that shows Iliamna and Nondalton usage
50 of the resource as well.

1 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. Thank you very
2 much, through the Chair. And, yeah, and partly that
3 does -- people are a little more far flung. Oh, I
4 think we want to give them reasonable time.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

9
10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

11
12 MR. O'HARA: Yeah. It -- Richard, it
13 liberalizes the hunt a little bit more if they have 10
14 days to do the reporting. And it certainly -- there's
15 not a threat of the bear population being hurt at all.
16 It's very rare to have a predator for the bear. They
17 do have a predator, I was watching a documentary on the
18 Alaska Peninsula over at Katmai National Park and a
19 mama bear walked through the bushes with three cubs and
20 came out with two because there was three wolves in
21 there. So, you know, we're -- it just might help a
22 little bit more of dealing with the bear population.
23 But if you feel uncomfortable about dealing with
24 somebody else's proposal from another Advisory Group,
25 that's -- I'd be glad to remove the -- well, I guess I
26 didn't make it or did it?

27
28 MS. MORRIS LYON: No, I did.

29
30 MR. O'HARA: Okay.

31
32 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. Yeah, I can
33 -- I can see your point there, Dan, and I'd -- I'm on
34 board with it. Ten days to me is perfect.

35
36 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, because it's my
37 amendment and I -- thank you, Richard, I appreciate
38 that and, Dan, you as well, but to me I guess the
39 reason I wanted to make the amendment was just to
40 liberalize it a little bit so that we would keep
41 potential illegal -- illegality from happening just in
42 case weather kept somebody kept out or who knows for
43 what reason and I just felt like three days is pretty
44 -- or five days is pretty restrictive and this just
45 gives a buffer zone. And I would certainly also
46 encourage if somebody can report within two or three
47 days then great, I think that report should be made.
48 I'm just wanting to protect the user from potential
49 harm rather than, you know, extending anything or
50 trying to make tidal waves out there.

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
2
3 MR. O'HARA: Susan, I didn't get your
4 last name, I apologize, what is your last name?
5
6 MS. WORKER: My last name is Worker.
7
8 MR. O'HARA: Worker. Worker.
9
10 MS. WORKER: Yes.
11
12 MR. O'HARA: That's not a bad thing.
13 Got two jobs before this one, huh.
14
15 MS. WORKER: Indeed.
16
17 MR. O'HARA: Okay. Just for the
18 Council's information I got the same day -- well, let's
19 see, remember when the caribou herd dropped down here
20 about six years ago and we went out -- we could get a
21 permit from the State of Alaska outside of -- and
22 within the time period which is liberal, I mean, it was
23 good, like about months, I completely forgot to make my
24 report. I got a bill in the mail and a citation for
25 \$69. And so it wasn't the State's fault, it wasn't the
26 fact that I didn't have a good time frame, I just
27 overlooked it. And so 10 days is I think a very
28 reasonable time to get back out of the words and pick
29 up the phone or email or fax or something.
30
31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Dan.
32
33 MR. DUNAWAY: I think Nanci's point too
34 that making compliance a little -- facilitating and
35 encouraging compliance make help people to comply
36 instead of the oh, what we call around here the three
37 S's, the shoot, shovel and shut up type thing. And so,
38 yeah, I'm really inclined to -- I was ambivalent about
39 five or 10 days, but geez, seven bears in how long and
40 they're worried about five bears being killed. I think
41 they got other things to worry about.
42
43 Thank you.
44
45 MR. O'HARA: Are we ready for the
46 question?
47
48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yes.
49
50 MR. O'HARA: Question.

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
2 Question's been called. All in favor say aye.
3
4 IN UNISON: Aye.
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: And now
7 opposition.
8
9 (No opposing votes)
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
12
13 MS. MORRIS LYON: Main motion.
14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh, and
16 then.....
17
18 MR. O'HARA: The main motion.
19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK:we'll
21 need to vote on the main motion.
22
23 MR. O'HARA: Question.
24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Question's
26 been called. All in favor say aye.
27
28 IN UNISON: Aye.
29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
31 opposition.
32
33 (No opposing votes)
34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you. We
36 need an automatic mic here, every time we start talking
37 it automatically turns on.
38
39 Okay. WP16-24, unit 9B and 9 -- yeah,
40 9B and C remainder moose closure.
41
42 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Madame Chair.
43 This is Suzanne Worker again. This is proposal 16-24,
44 it begins on page 57 of your books. And this proposal
45 was submitted by Richard Wilson of Naknek. And the
46 request is to close Federal public lands in units 9B
47 and 9C to moose harvest except by Federally-qualified
48 subsistence users. In unit 9 a State registration
49 permit has been required for moose since 2012 following
50 the recommendation of the unit 9 Moose Working Group.

1 The moose population in unit 9 is stable although it's
2 not a high density population. In unit 9B the bull/cow
3 ratio is at or just below the management objective
4 which is 40 bulls per 100 cows. And in unit 9C that
5 bull/cow ratio exceeds the management objective which
6 in 9C is 25 bulls to 100 cows. The cow/calf ratio has
7 been fairly erratic in this area. In 2013 it was
8 estimated to be 25 calves per 100 cows and I think
9 that's toward the higher end of the range of estimates.

10

11 The reported harvest in units 9B and 9C
12 between 2011 and 2014 has ranged from 44 to 66 moose
13 annually and about 55 percent of that harvest is
14 attributed to local users. So that's a little higher
15 than in unit -- sorry, a little bit higher than unit 9
16 as a whole. An average success rate for local users is
17 typically under 20 percent and that is similar to unit
18 9 as a whole.

19

20 This proposal does not meet the
21 criteria for a closure which is outlined in the Board's
22 closure policy. That policy allows the closure of
23 Federal public lands primarily to conserve healthy fish
24 and wildlife populations or to ensure the continuation
25 of subsistence uses by Federally-qualified users. In
26 terms of conserving wildlife populations the high
27 bull/cow ratio indicates that population growth isn't
28 necessarily limited by hunter harvest. Since unit 9
29 harvest is restricted to bulls we would expect to see
30 lower bull/cow ratios if, in fact, over harvest were
31 occurring, that these ratios remained sort of within
32 the target objectives suggest that the level of harvest
33 occurring now is not inappropriate. It's more likely
34 that population growth is limited by habitat or
35 predation and this is evident in the rather low
36 calf/cow ratios which signal low productivity or low
37 recruitment. In terms of subsistence opportunity
38 Federally-qualified subsistence users do have some
39 additional opportunity relative to resident sport
40 hunters. In unit 9B subsistence users have 31
41 additional hunt days and that includes both the fall
42 and the winter season. In unit 9C the additional
43 opportunity is between five and 17 days depending on
44 the hunt area.

45

46 So this proposal doesn't meet the
47 Board's criteria for a closure and so the OSM
48 preliminary conclusion is to oppose WP16-24.

49

50 Thank you, Madame Chair.

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard, do
2 you have a comment?

3
4 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. I just
5 didn't want to get ahead of your methods here, but
6 seeming how I was the one that got earmarked for this
7 proposal, the original proposal went out because of
8 several years sitting here on this Council and looking
9 for numbers. You know, we were sitting here trying to
10 get numbers in our area in 9B and 9C, some current
11 numbers on moose and caribou populations and we've been
12 struggling. And there's been a lot of talk about, you
13 know, lack of snow coverage and different things and so
14 that brought out this proposal, just the lack of
15 participation or the completion of surveys alerted me
16 to thinking well, we -- you know, our harvest levels
17 have been down and at this point before this proposal
18 was there the harvest levels were down and so instead
19 of guessing what the population is out there thinking
20 it was okay I thought well, I'm going to put a little
21 fire in there, throw this proposal out there and
22 perhaps, you know, it's going to light a fire under
23 some people's feet. So that was my, you know,
24 intention here definitely to protect the population
25 first of all and secondly to -- you know, to light a
26 fire, to get this thing -- get us some more recent
27 counts in our area.

28
29 Thank you.

30
31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
32 other comments and questions for Sue before we start
33 our process?

34
35 MR. SHUGAK: Yeah, I'm in 9B. Our
36 moose population -- or you know I was on the ADF&G
37 Board or the Iliamna Lake Advisory Board a few years
38 ago. And they got us some numbers there of the count
39 of the moose, but their problem was they didn't get up
40 into the Pedro Bay and then above. And I know we have
41 a problem there in Pedro Bay with our moose, bull moose
42 especially there. We haven't -- I haven't heard of
43 anybody getting one in the last five to 10 years. You
44 know, it might be a -- I saw somewhere there that there
45 was a -- we're opportunistic hunters, but we're not
46 there, you know, we try to -- if we see cows there we
47 try to preserve that, but we had so many bears there
48 that our calves are getting predated before the summer
49 is over. This year I was happy to see one make it
50 through the summer, you know, I was tracking two cows

1 and a calf this year, it started out that there was two
2 calves, but one got predated earlier in the year. And
3 one bull in the area that I saw, but as of, you know,
4 this last fall there hadn't been anything running
5 around in Pedro Bay for our September hunt. You know,
6 we sat there and there are people coming in from
7 outside or from Anchorage, you know, flying in and
8 doing that number and to give you an idea of how many
9 bears there are in Pedro Bay you go out to Flat Island,
10 we had one of our young men who was a -- who has a
11 plane and he was flying from Pedro Bay down to Yaugit
12 (ph) and it was without even trying to count on Flat
13 Island he counted 50 bears right on the island there.
14 And that's a lot of bears for that area, I mean, you're
15 talking he said how many bears per square mile, 10.
16 Well, you got one island there, there's 50 just
17 counting without trying to count, you know, 50 bears.

18

19 And so we got a -- you know, I think
20 this one here I would support this one here, you know,
21 just so we can have the local subsistence users as a
22 priority for that. I don't know if you want to say
23 priority for that, but, you know, just to be able to
24 limit the amount of people taken the moose from that
25 area. So that's -- I would be in support of this.

26

27 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

30

31 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you. I don't
32 know if -- I wish Joe could -- Klutch could still be on
33 the line here. He went on at length about problems
34 with this proposal and I was thinking that from other
35 times when he's testified to us he's talking about more
36 down towards Point Heiden or maybe even on the Pacific
37 coast. Do any of you know -- I have a few questions
38 here, the first one's do any of you know if Joe hunts
39 up in this area at every -- anytime or what he's
40 allowed to do?

41

42 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

43

44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

45

46 MR. O'HARA: Unless Ms. Lyon here knows
47 something about where he hunts, I have flown out of his
48 camp for years when I was flying with Pen Air and it's
49 Meshik, it's a hundred miles from any subsistence user.
50 I don't know what qualifies him to -- anyone can call

1 in I suppose, that's fine, that's okay, unless he is in
2 these.....

3

4 MR. KLUTCH: I am on the line.

5

6 MR. O'HARA: Yes, that's okay. Are you
7 hunting in the King Salmon and these areas with your
8 hunt?

9

10 MR. KLUTCH: I hunt in unit 9C on the
11 western boundary of Katmai in National Wildlife Refuge.
12 I think we've taken two or three moose in the last five
13 years. And I know -- I know the Meshik River, I live
14 there. It's -- I mean, that's part of where I'm at. I
15 don't think there's a biological issue at this point,
16 we sure wish there were more moose. There's a heck of
17 a lot more bushes out there and there's a lot more
18 technology out there. So you can look at this, I -- I
19 mean, I hunted before there were three-wheelers and
20 four-wheelers and jet boats or anything, before that
21 whole river front was developed. So you can look at
22 that data or the information about harvest rates and
23 stuff, you can drive to Grant's Landing on a summer or
24 a September afternoon, are you going to take the cruise
25 up on Pike Lake Ridge and that's called a moose hunt, I
26 don't know. I do it different and I don't use an
27 airplane to spot anything. God's honest. There's
28 moose out there, not as many as we would like, but it
29 doesn't justify a complete closure of the area. Look
30 at the amount of opportunity that is available, of days
31 of hunting without any other nonsubsistence users.
32 Preseason, late season, there's a heck of lot of
33 opportunity out there.

34

35 You know my feelings on this and it's
36 not like I just fell off the apple cart here, this is
37 -- I know about moose hunting and I know how to hunt
38 moose. And every bit of meat comes back, bone in. So
39 I just -- I have some -- you know my feel -- I've
40 written it as best I could and I've testified to you
41 now. I know the truth of what's going on out there. I
42 do. I know it. And so you make your decisions
43 accordingly and I'll trust your judgment.

44

45 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

46

47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

48

49 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, Joe, I was referring
50 to the Meshik camp is what I knew about, but I didn't

1 realize you were in 9C. And you say that's in the
2 northwest corner of 9C, is that where you hunt?

3

4 MR. KLUTCH: It's in the northwest
5 corner of 9C, it's in Becharof, BCH 01, is the Refuge
6 designation for that area. And it's not on the
7 Alagnak, the Branch, it's on the southwest boundary
8 going to Big Creek. And I don't hunt on Big Creek, I
9 put that in my operations plan, I stay off Big Creek
10 totally. I never go up there anymore, I used to, but
11 now there's jet boats and all this technology, the
12 plane goes up, boat goes up, moose comes down and --
13 and can't put that on me. I hunt someplace else and
14 that -- I don't hunt on the creek and I don't want to
15 even go into the river corridor stuff or any of that.
16 But I've done my very, very best, Council and Dan, to
17 stay out of the way and not have confrontations with
18 people. That's what I've done and I've done the same
19 thing in the Meshik area. And that's 9E. I'll tell
20 you what, this is pushing the bubble and the next thing
21 is that you -- the same rationale will call for a
22 proposal to close 9E. I know where this is going. And
23 it's -- I just don't think it's reasonable, I don't
24 think it's biologically justifiable based on the level
25 of harvest and I'm animated right now. Hell, I should
26 be out there in a boat hunting bears right now, but I'm
27 happy to be on the line with you guys even though I
28 sound grumpy right now. Anyway go ahead and ask me
29 anymore questions and I'll trust your judgment.

30

31 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

34

35 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, Joe, you're in the
36 Becharof Wildlife Refuge area on Kajulicplay,
37 Kagorlyply (ph), however, they pronounce it over toward
38 Polly Bay; is that right?

39

40 MR. KLUTCH: I didn't copy that. Go
41 ahead and try again.

42

43 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, you're at the
44 northwest corner of 9C and you're in the Kajulic, Polly
45 Bay area, that's the northwest corner?

46

47 MR. KLUTCH: I go -- I got to -- where
48 that Kajulic, there's two Kajulic, but Kajulic in 9E,
49 yes, I'm in National Park Preserve and National
50 Wildlife Refuge there, but in 9C I hunt on just the

1 western boundary from Three Hills and the lakes down to
2 Big Creek. That's 9C. I don't go north of 9C. I did
3 years ago when the -- before the guide area system. I
4 used to hunt all the way up to (indiscernible) and up
5 there in the (indiscernible) and around Sugar Loaf, but
6 I don't do that anymore because it's all inundated with
7 ATVs and airplanes and all that stuff. I don't go up
8 there, I'm not registered in that area. So I don't go
9 north of the Alagnak, but I'm not just thinking about
10 me, I'm thinking about the overall picture and the
11 integrity of this system. There's a lot at stake here.
12 So go ahead and ask me another question.

13

14 MR. O'HARA: Well, that cell phone of
15 yours is really doing pretty good so I think -- I
16 apologize, I was thinking of -- I was down in Meshik
17 area so I've been a little more informed.

18

19 Thank you very much, Joe.

20

21 MR. KLUTCH: Yeah, thank you. 9 --
22 Meshik is 9E, unit 9E. What this proposal would do was
23 would close nonqualified, nonqualified wouldn't be able
24 to hunt in 9C and 9B. But that portion of 9C would
25 affect me, but I'm looking at the overall picture here.
26 I'm not just thinking about what's -- what the hell,
27 three -- two or three moose in the last three years and
28 it all comes back bone in. And we're looking at six to
29 nine moose from nonqualified out of a year in a 15 day
30 season or a 11 day season now, it got cut back. I
31 don't think it's warranted, I don't think it's
32 justified, but I totally emphasize with where Richard's
33 coming from on this proposal. I do, I want to see more
34 moose. I'd like to see less bushes out there too.
35 I've got pictures from the old days and you do too,
36 Dan, you know, everybody there, from George Tibbits and
37 even my own pictures from back in the 1973, '74, there
38 weren't half as many bushes. But there's global
39 warming and what the hell ever, but a lot of those
40 moose are hiding in those bushes. And they also have a
41 hell of a lot more hunters out there using newer
42 technologies.

43

44 Am I still on? Do you copy me?

45

46

47 MR. MIKE: Yes, we do, Mr. Klutch.

48

49 Thank you.

50

1 MR. KLUTCH: Okay. I'm -- again I'm a
2 little bit animated because we're kind of blown out
3 here from weather, but I'll just -- I'm just putting
4 that out here, I don't think this proposal is warranted
5 and but I do emphasize and I understand, but I think we
6 need better data and understand that there's not going
7 to be a moose in every pot, there just isn't. The
8 proposal to allow additional caribou hunting now can
9 help for subsistence needs. I'm not opposed at all to
10 legitimate subsistence needs, but we're -- we've moved
11 into a different era now, there's all this technology
12 and I put it in my written comments because you've got
13 people that come from Peoria, Illinois that are in
14 there working for Lake and Peninsula Borough and
15 they're qualified. And I've got good friends that are
16 from Chignik, that are -- have to because of health and
17 (indiscernible), they have to go to Anchorage and
18 they're not qualified. There's some flaws in this
19 thing and it's not easy to solve. I'm not criticizing
20 anybody on this Council or anybody in the agency, I'm
21 just saying this is a difficult situation and we're
22 just going to have to work our way through it.

23
24 But give my thoughts your best
25 consideration and I'll trust your judgment.

26
27 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
28 you, Joe.

29
30 Dan.

31
32 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you, Joe,
33 that answers some of questions. I -- regardless of
34 Joe's concerns there, number 1 red flag for me is that
35 apparently we don't -- wouldn't even meet the Federal
36 standards on closing. I know -- I've sat in Advisory
37 Committee meetings from King Salmon, Aleknagik, Iliamna
38 and there's been a long, long frustration that there
39 just isn't the kind of habitat to support the kinds of
40 populations of moose we'd like to have over there. I
41 know they used to beat up on cellars every chance. Too
42 bad those bushes he's talking about weren't all healthy
43 willows, I think they're mostly alders. That's one red
44 flag.

45
46 I'm trying -- I had a second point
47 there that I'm concerned about. So right now I -- I'm
48 not so sure I'd support this though -- oh, I know. The
49 other issue is that as much as we want to try to push
50 funding with a proposal, I -- it doesn't work, I think

1 it goes off in the wrong direction. And we've pushed
2 on all of the biologists and we can't quite reach the
3 people that have the money bag, but -- and I share your
4 frustration, we all want better numbers, but it hasn't
5 -- in my experience hasn't been a productive avenue to
6 try to us a proposal to drive that which is my other --
7 couple of my red flags here.

8

9 So anyway I -- we probably ought to
10 discuss it some more or other people get an
11 opportunity.

12

13 Thank you.

14

15 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

16

17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

18

19 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, yeah. Dan,
20 thanks, but my initial response to all that was -- you
21 know, wasn't because of, you know, trying to generate
22 more -- you know, we need to generate more surveys out
23 there, but my initial proposal attempt here was, you
24 know, because of the lack of harvest opportunities out
25 there. And, yeah, this year is a little different, you
26 know, the -- whether it be the weather or the
27 conditions, something, you know, allow a little more
28 harvest out there this year. But the concern is there
29 and I just -- I'll stick with that.

30

31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: With no more
32 comments we'll quickly go through the process here.

33

34 Board consultation, tribal, ANCSA.

35

36 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. There were no
37 tribes commented on this proposal.

38

39 Thank you.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Agency
42 comments, ADF&G.

43

44 MR. CRAWFORD: Madame Chair. This is
45 Drew Crawford with the Department of Fish and Game in
46 Anchorage. The Department's recommendation is to
47 oppose proposal WP16-24. And we agree with OSM's
48 justification.

49

50 Over.

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
2 you. Federal agencies.
3
4 (No comments)
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Native tribal
7 village.
8
9 (No comments)
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: InterAgency.
12
13 (No comments)
14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Advisory
16 groups, Fish and Game and Subsistence Resource.
17
18 (No comments)
19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Summary of
21 written reports.
22
23 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair, there's no
24 written comments.
25
26 Thank you.
27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
29 you. Public testimony.
30
31 (No comments)
32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. We're
34 down to the Regional Council. Who's going to make a
35 motion?
36
37 (No motion)
38
39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: No motion. So
40 if there's no motion it fails.
41
42 Dan did you have -- Donald.
43
44 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. I'm just
45 waiting on some action, but if there's no action taken
46 here the proposal dies due to no action.
47
48 Thank you.
49
50 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Sounds

1 like the motion dies. And we move on.

2

3 Dan.

4

5 MS. MORRIS LYON: Carl.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Or Carl.

8

9 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you, Madame Chair.
10 I've been paying attention to the discussion and on the
11 one hand I can understand the desire to take no action
12 and just to send a silent message to the Board, but
13 this is the Council's opportunity to be a voice for
14 people in this region even if the Council and the Board
15 may disagree, it's still the opportunity for you to
16 send a message to the Board on what you feel about this
17 proposal. So I would encourage the Council to take
18 that opportunity, you know, as the Council is a
19 powerful and important voice for users in the region.

20

21 Thank you, Madame Chair.

22

23 MS. MORRIS LYON: Madame Chair.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

26

27 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, thank you,
28 Madame Chair. I guess my point, Carl, would be that
29 our comments that we've already made should be a part
30 of the public testimony and so we should be on record
31 with them. And I guess that's how I feel comfortable,
32 I mean, I think that being heard and being on record as
33 making the statements we've made and how we feel about
34 how things have proceeded with this issue in our area
35 hopefully will be heard.

36

37 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you, Madame Chair
38 and through the Chair. So I hear that, however absent
39 a formal action by the Council under Robert's Rules,
40 there will be no recommendation yea or nay passed to
41 the Board and therefore what you have been discussing
42 will not be presented to the Board. A suggestion would
43 be you go through the motions, you move to support, you
44 all vote it down and then for your deliberation and
45 justification just incorporate what you've already been
46 discussing on the record and then that way it does get
47 pushed forward and then you don't have to kind of re-
48 litigate it as part of a deliberation, but that way you
49 still -- you still take the formal action of making a
50 recommendation and then Donald can take your comments

1 and synthesize them as part of your justification.

2

3

Thank you, Madame Chair.

4

5

MR. DUNAWAY: Yes, that really helps a lot because I was trying to think strategically if it just kind of goes poof and the whole discussion goes away that's not good either. I'm inclined to move to adopt and then maybe refer to my objections to it before we adopt it. But I -- but that's later so I'm going to move to adopt.

12

13

MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

14

15

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

16

17

MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair, I second that motion. And then we'd like to have discussion.

19

20

MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: There's a motion to adopt by Dan Dunaway and seconded by Dan O'Hara and then discussion.

22

23

MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair. I -- there's just the fact the motion maker gets first opportunity to address the motion and then I'll speak to it also.

28

29

MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. Thanks. Speaking to the motion, couple things. I want to show respect to Richard who's put a lot of work into this and I appreciate it. Second we do want our thoughts on record. Third I'll repeat that I see red flags. Number 1 it doesn't meet Federal closure standards, that's kind of a -- I kind of see that's going to be kind of an impossible hurdle. Next I don't think proposals are the way to drive this though certainly the message goes across we need studies. I thought I heard either in a recess or something that some agencies are starting to explore other ways to count moose besides waiting for snow which I think might be a good angle to try. But I'll be voting against this although I am extremely sympathetic to Richard and a lot of the people that Senafont said I don't know how many times I've sat in Iliamna and Aleknagik and he just could feel this frustration that why can't we have more moose.

48

49

Thank you.

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

2

3 MR. O'HARA: I'm not -- I think the
4 proposal was to send a message and Carl was it that was
5 sitting there and this way we'll go on record. And I
6 think the frustration that we have had for years and
7 Richard has felt it too is the fact that we have 800
8 moose supposedly, that's not a good enough comment for
9 me and if we have to shut the operation now for them to
10 find the moose and shut it down. A number of years ago
11 when I was Chair and we made a proposal that -- and I
12 was Chairman of the Council, we went to the Federal
13 Board and the old guys who are sitting in the back, you
14 know, with their big cigars in their mouth and not
15 smoking, but sitting there. And we voted down that
16 they close down the entire Alaska Peninsula for moose
17 season and they came flying out of there. And this was
18 in April. And two days later there was a -- up and
19 down the peninsula with no snow there was a moose
20 count. So I think what we're saying here is, yeah,
21 okay, we'll vote it down, but, you know, we'll be back
22 again. And we want that Federal side to know that
23 we're not happy with the fact that we probably have 800
24 moose there somewhere. And if -- I know that the Fish
25 and Wildlife has a really exceptionally good pilot and
26 good equipment and he used to fly for Pen Air, I flew
27 with him, and he's a very good pilot, does a good job.
28 And he flew with Grant after Pen Air left. So we can
29 get the work done, but if it doesn't in the message we
30 should say, you know, contract it out, give it to
31 people who do this for a living. We want -- we want
32 the count. And so that's I guess the message that,
33 Carl, we should give if we're going to send this
34 message out to the Board and the Federal people.

35

36 Thank you very much, Madame Chair.

37

38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

39

40 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
41 Chair. Also I'm not going to be voting in favor of
42 this proposal and I would like to just justify my vote.
43 For many of the same reasons we've already heard, I
44 commend Richard for making the proposal. I too for
45 years have heard the same issues with our people up and
46 down the peninsula. Our lack of snow and lack of
47 information is very, very frustrating and very
48 difficult to work with. And it's hard, you know, we
49 talk about maintaining the integrity of the system, it
50 works on both sides and by not having the information

1 we need it also -- it decreases the integrity of the
2 system. So both sides of this system have got to
3 uphold their end in order to get this job done
4 properly. And without good information we're not
5 getting it done. And I think Richard had a very good
6 idea in driving this forward. Richard, I think you
7 should keep this proposal in your back pocket in case
8 it's needed again, but I'm just really hopeful that the
9 message gets heard loud and clear, the frustration
10 we're having with good information to be able to work
11 with in order to provide the people we represent with
12 good representation and protection for the animals they
13 depend on.

14

15 Thank you.

16

17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard, did
18 have a comment?

19

20 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, yes.
21 Thanks, Council members for your support/nonsupport.

22

23 (Laughter)

24

25 MR. WILSON: You know, it's well taken.
26 And I -- you know, it's not all lost. It's -- you
27 know, it's a gain/gain. I think we're gaining here.
28 And that was the whole idea, you know, to protect the
29 resource. If we can't do that then at least we're
30 going to alert people in the right places to take the
31 appropriate actions to give us those numbers, to, you
32 know, help us make good decisions sitting on this
33 Council. And I'm just frustrated with that end of it
34 and it came down to this.

35

36 So thanks.

37

38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, I guess
39 the comment that I would make regarding this, you know,
40 we had this similar issue not with the -- well, even
41 with the number of moose and caribou. And there was
42 agency people that are I guess players of these
43 affected resources, got together and dealt with -- and
44 I think -- I don't know what the funding is, maybe
45 Natural Resources could pick this up and spearhead it
46 to get, you know, this -- form a committee to deal with
47 this. I don't know how it -- how it -- I'd have to
48 think about this, but seemed like -- I feel like
49 there's some bodies that could take this and run with
50 it and come up with something that would help in

1 collecting numbers that we've been wanting for so long.
2 So I guess that's just a suggestion for now.
3
4 So are we.....
5
6 MS. MORRIS LYON: Question.
7
8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Question's
9 been called.
10
11 MR. O'HARA: Was there a motion?
12
13 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, and a second.
14
15 MR. O'HARA: Who seconded it?
16
17 MS. MORRIS LYON: You.
18
19 MR. O'HARA: Oh, Okay.
20
21 (Laughter)
22
23 MR. O'HARA: Question, Madame Chair.
24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Question's
26 been called. All in favor say aye.
27
28 IN UNISON: Aye.
29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
31 opposition.
32
33 IN UNISON: Aye.
34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
36
37 MR. JOHNSON: You have one yes vote I
38 think.
39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. One,
41 two -- one, two, three, four, five, six.
42
43 MS. MORRIS LYON: Do you want a roll
44 call?
45
46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Roll call, do
47 you want a roll call?
48
49 MR. WILSON: Yeah.
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: One
2 opposition.
3
4 MR. WILSON: No, two.
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Two
7 opposition.
8
9 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
10 The motion was made by Mr. Dunaway to adopt proposal
11 WP16-24, unit 9B, C -- 9C for closure.
12
13 Mr. Pete Abraham.
14
15 MR. ABRAHAM: Yeah.
16
17 MR. MIKE: Mr. Dan O'Hara.
18
19 MR. O'HARA: No.
20
21 MR. MIKE: Ms. Nanci Morris Lyon.
22
23 MS. MORRIS LYON: No.
24
25 MR. MIKE: Ms. Molly Chythlook.
26
27 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: No.
28
29 MR. MIKE: Mr. Senafont Shugak.
30
31 MR. SHUGAK: Yes.
32
33 MR. MIKE: Mr. Dan Dunaway.
34
35 MR. DUNAWAY: No.
36
37 MR. MIKE: Mr. Richard Wilson.
38
39 MR. WILSON: Yes.
40
41 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. There's four
42 no and three yes. Motion fails.
43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
45
46 MS. MORRIS LYON: Good message.
47
48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Let's
49 take a five minute break before we get into our next.
50 Take a little refresher stretch and then come back to

1 the -- it will be WP16-25 slash 26, portion of unit
2 17A. We'll pick this up as soon as we get back.

3

4 Five minute break.

5

6 (Off record)

7

8 (On record)

9

10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: WP16-25 slash
11 26.

12

13 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Madame Chair.
14 Proposal WP16-25 and 26 begins on page 75 of your book.
15 These two proposals were submitted by the Togiak Fish
16 and Game Advisory Committee and the Nushagak Fish and
17 Game Advisory Committee. They request the same thing
18 so they were analyzed in a single analysis and I'll
19 just present them together. These proposals request a
20 change in the season and harvest limit for caribou on
21 the Nushagak Peninsula which includes portions of unit
22 17A and unit 17C. Specifically the request is to
23 change the current split season which is August 1st
24 through September 30th and December 1st through
25 December 31 to a continuous season that runs August 1st
26 through March 31. It also requests that the harvest
27 limit be increased from two caribou to three caribou.

28

29 Harvest of the Nushagak Herd was
30 authorized by the Board in 1994 and at that time a
31 closure was established to all users except residents
32 of Togiak, Dillingham, Manokotak, Twin Hill, Aleknagik,
33 Clark's Point and Ekuak. Despite the increasing size of
34 the Nushagak Herd this Council recommended maintaining
35 the closure in both 2008 and 2012 based on the
36 continued difficulty harvesting moose and Mulchatna
37 Caribou. In April of this year a special action was
38 submitted by the Village of Manokotak requesting a
39 season extension due to poor winter travel conditions
40 and a subsequent low caribou harvest. And that request
41 was denied to the recent radio collaring activity and
42 concern that the immobilization drugs that were used
43 during those activities might be detrimental to human
44 health. The herd has declined to its minimum
45 population size in around 2007. Since then the
46 population has increased to approximately a thousand
47 animals. So that exceeds the Nushagak Caribou
48 Management Plan objective of 400 to 900 animals. And
49 at this point managers have begun to express concern
50 that continued grow might actually lead to a sharp

1 decline in population and that they support additional
2 harvest as we heard from Andy a little bit earlier
3 today.

4
5 Typically as this population has
6 increased reported harvest has also increased. For the
7 winters of 2012, '13 and 2013, '14 reported harvest was
8 over a hundred animals annually. However due to the
9 poor winter travel conditions the reported harvest in
10 2014, '15 felled only 16 animals. And so this is well
11 below the recommendation that is laid out in the
12 Management Plan which is to harvest all animals over a
13 minimum count of 750. The Management Plan also
14 recommends that all available Federal registration
15 permits be allocated to eligible communities based on a
16 formula where each community receives 5 percent of the
17 total permits plus additional permits based on a
18 percentage of the participating communities.

19
20 If these proposals are adopted the
21 current season split season for caribou would be
22 replaced by a single season that runs August 1st
23 through March 31st and the harvest limit would be
24 increased from two caribou to three caribou. This
25 longer season will provide additional opportunity
26 particularly given the increasingly variable winter
27 travel conditions and the more liberal harvest limit is
28 justifiable given the current population size, the
29 recently low harvest rates relative to the management
30 objectives and concern about future viability if this
31 population does continue to grow.

32
33 As a result the OSM preliminary
34 conclusion is to support WP16-25 with modification.
35 And the modification is to remove the regulatory
36 language that references harvest quotas and limits and
37 delegate authority to the Togiak National Wildlife
38 Refuge to set the number of permits to be issued, the
39 harvest quotas and the limits. And then to take no
40 action on WP16-26 since that proposal would be
41 addressed through action on 16-25.

42
43 So that's all I have for you now and I
44 can try to answer any questions if you have them.

45
46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
47 questions?

48
49 (No comments)
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: If not we
2 can.....
3
4 Dan.
5
6 MR. DUNAWAY: I'll just say I think she
7 summarized it very well.
8
9 Thank you.
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. We'll
12 go through the process. Reports from the Council or
13 consultation.
14
15 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. There are no
16 tribes commenting on this proposal during consultation.
17
18 Thank you.
19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Agency
21 comments, ADF&G.
22
23 MR. CRAWFORD: Madame Chair. The
24 Department's position is to support WP16-25 with
25 modification to remove current caribou hunting
26 restrictions on Federal public lands in unit 17A and
27 17C, that portion of 17A and 17C consisting of the
28 Nushagak Peninsula south of Ugashik River, Tukland
29 River and Tukland Hills west to Tvativak Bay to non-
30 local residents and take no action on proposal WP16-26.
31
32 Over.
33
34 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
35 comments, questions for him?
36
37 (No comments)
38
39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: If not -- Dan.
40
41 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you, Madame
42 Chair. Drew, is -- does that depart from the
43 recommended language in the -- that OSM has?
44
45 Over.
46
47 MR. CRAWFORD: Yes, through the Chair.
48 We recommend that the Federal restriction be removed
49 thereby allowing all Alaska residents to participate in
50 the hunting of caribou on the Nushagak Peninsula.

1 Over.
2
3 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. Thank you for
4 that. Sometimes I sure wish those could be written in
5 front of us.
6
7 Thank you.
8
9 Over.
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
12 other comments?
13
14 (No comments)
15
16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Federal
17 agencies?
18
19 (No comments)
20
21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Native tribal.
22
23 (No comments)
24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Interagencies.
26
27 (No comments)
28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Advisory
30 groups.
31
32 Dan.
33
34 MR. DUNAWAY: Is this the right place
35 for the Fish and Game Advisory Committee?
36
37 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yes.
38
39 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. Yeah, We took this
40 up at the Nushagak Advisory Committee and it was our
41 proposal. And some folks might not be aware, we have
42 one member on our Advisory Committee who's from Togiak
43 and the idea is so we can coordinate and they can speak
44 for us so we often coordinate proposals when we can
45 agree and show that we have a broader population and
46 geographic base for our actions. We moved to adopt
47 this as -- with the recommended language provided in
48 front of us and it was -- we had unanimous support
49 which is 12 to zero and we took no -- that was on 25
50 and we took no action on 26, but essentially have

1 adopted the wording as recommended by OSM.

2

3

Thank you.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
6 you. Native tribal or I guess we're -- we're in the
7 summary of written public comments.

8

9 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. We did not
10 receive any written comments.

11

12 Thank you.

13

14 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Public
15 testimony.

16

17 (No comments)

18

19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
20 Regional -- Pete.

21

22 MR. ABRAHAM: The Nushagak Peninsula
23 Herd sometimes expands to (in Native) area. It's close
24 to the beach sometimes. But so far to this day I have
25 not heard or seen anybody hunting those yet. But
26 that's question, you know, maybe I'll talk with Andy
27 and them guys. I always go about (indiscernible) here
28 because they're expanding, they're moving out now and
29 then. Which is -- those are peninsula herds out there,
30 roaming around the area.

31

32 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

33

34 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

35

36 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, I flew through the
37 Bay and saw about 15 caribou laying in a mudflats. I
38 circled them because I could not believe my eyes that
39 I'd see in Klukuk, that would be the eastern side. And
40 they were I think getting salt and stuff and it was
41 pretty cool.

42

43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

44

45 MR. DUNAWAY: I meant to add one other
46 thing to my comments is that even in my time here in
47 the Dillingham area we've seen that herd go up and then
48 kind of get too big and then go quite a ways down. And
49 so that's a lot of the reasoning like was describer by
50 Ms. Worker. We don't want to have them over graze

1 again. The herd's getting healthy and additional
2 hunting opportunity should be provided.

3

4 Thank you.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Dan.

7

8 MR. O'HARA: Who could give the answer
9 on if there's predators on these animals, what
10 department would that be?

11

12 MR. ADERMAN: Thank you. Through the
13 Chair. This is Andy Aderman with the Togiak National
14 Wildlife Refuge. To your question, Mr. O'Hara, there
15 are predators down there, probably the most significant
16 is brown bears. We've had wolves down there for a
17 number of years with one pack, up to 14 in number at
18 one point. There's coyotes and I suspect they probably
19 could kill a caribou calf along with wolverine and
20 eagles. So, yes, there are predators there.

21

22 MR. O'HARA: I got to tell you a story
23 about Andy. When I -- was recommended I be back on the
24 RAC Board, he called me up and he interviewed me, you
25 know, as if he didn't know who I was. So I said now
26 this -- this is funny. After I -- he talk -- finished
27 talking I said, okay, I'm going to interview you for a
28 while. And for about 45 minutes I got a good report on
29 what's happening over in the Togiak Refuge and I
30 appreciate that.

31

32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

33

34 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you. While
35 Andy's still here, but now I think we've seen at this
36 RAC before some studies that your supervisor/co-worker,
37 Pat, has conducted on wolves. And this is why we -- I
38 really refer to if we're going to have predator control
39 it should be on good science because they did some good
40 science that suggests unless it's changed, correct me
41 if I'm wrong, Andy, it's a surprisingly moderate impact
42 the wolves had on the caribou down there. And so calls
43 for predator calls there really weren't supported by
44 the science. But I don't know if they're still going
45 on, but it was a really, really interesting study, very
46 carefully done.

47

48 Thank you.

49

50 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Those wolves

1 down there eat salmon, that's why.

2

3 (Laughter)

4

5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Anymore

6 questions?

7

8 MR. ADERMAN: Madame Chair.

9

10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Andy.

11

12 MR. ADERMAN: I was just going to
13 respond to Mr. Dunaway and the previous wolf study that
14 was done was initiated in 2007 or 2008 that collared
15 some wolves. There was just one pack that essentially
16 uses the Nushagak Peninsula and it uses the area north
17 of the Nushagak Peninsula as well, but if you look at
18 table one on page 80 and look at that far right column,
19 you'll see the estimate of the herd size. At that time
20 it was right near the lowest point that it was. And
21 they monitored that wolf pack for about the next four
22 years, I think in 2012 the collars were taken off and
23 that was 2011 I think was when that wolf pack was up to
24 14. And that -- you know, that doesn't necessarily
25 eliminate any stragglers that, you know, individual
26 wolves that could be traveling through although we
27 don't have any record of that, but just because you
28 have the pack collared doesn't mean that you -- that's
29 all the wolves there are.

30

31 Thank you, Madame Chair.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: One question I
34 have for Dan, was it Drew at ADF&G I guess part of his
35 -- what is it that when you.....

36

37 MS. MORRIS LYON: Comment.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah. In his
40 comment mentioned that he was going to add in all
41 Alaska harvesters. Was that discussed -- in prior
42 years when I was involved with Togiak Council, Advisory
43 Council, they right from the get go objected, you know,
44 opening their area for everybody. And so I don't --
45 has there been any recent discussions regarding that?

46

47 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair. No I have
48 no record and recollection. My notes are not
49 finalized, I'm in the process of writing those up at
50 this point, but I don't recall, it was getting late in

1 the day the second day of the meetings, but we didn't
2 really discuss that. And I think too in anticipation
3 of some of the next proposals we'll see and understand
4 why we actually talk about same day airborne. But, no,
5 that didn't come up so I am -- I do not feel it would
6 be appropriate for me to speak for the AC on going on
7 beyond what we did.

8

9 Thank you.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
12 other.....

13

14 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

17

18 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, yea. Andy
19 I'd like to hear a little bit, maybe a comment or two
20 about what Drew Crawford mentioned about, you know,
21 extending that out on the subsistence side of things to
22 a statewide with only so many permits being out there.
23 What's you guys feel on this sort of thing?

24

25 MR. ADERMAN: Well, the herd is as big
26 as its ever been. And you can look back 20 years ago
27 and it was about the same size. Some of those caribou
28 were off the peninsula, but it went down, it went down
29 dramatically, you know. To get more harvest would be
30 desirable to, you know, maybe avoid that. A lot of it
31 comes down to access. If you don't -- this herd is
32 traditionally hunted in the wintertime by local
33 residents on snowmachine. And 80 percent of the
34 harvest over the years has been in the month of March,
35 that's when people go. Long daylight and good travel
36 conditions generally. We just haven't had that the
37 last several years and thus the herd is really, you
38 know, expanded. And, you know, we're at the point of,
39 you know, anybody in any of the participating villages
40 that wants a permit to hunt or permits to hunt caribou
41 down there, they can have them. These other measures,
42 you know, increasing the harvest limit up to three,
43 will probably help a little bit. Opening up October
44 and November, traditionally pretty sketchy months to
45 travel by skiff, certainly not by snowmachine at least
46 the winters I've been here. You might have snow, but
47 those rivers aren't froze up. Same day airborne that
48 you guys are going to be taking up, you know, those are
49 some of the most skittish caribou I've ever seen,
50 people on snowmachine will tell you that, you know,

1 you're luck if you see them because they're -- they
2 hear you or see you and they're gone. So I certainly
3 understand the State's position in, you know, allowing
4 additional users. One thing I've thought of and
5 haven't really investigated, but really all residents
6 of 17 and possibly 9 have C&T for caribou in 17 and so
7 this -- the existing pool of eligible villages right
8 now, I'm wondering if that couldn't be expanded. Yeah,
9 I don't know how much people elsewhere in 17 would
10 participate in that hunt though. We don't get a lot of
11 participation from Togiak, Twin Hills, it's too far.

12
13 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Do you still
14 have your committee members meeting on a regular basis?

15
16 MR. ADERMAN: We do. We haven't met
17 for about a year and a half and along those lines we're
18 going to try to get something here in mid November
19 going, if not then then early December, and talk about
20 these proposals and update the committee as well on,
21 you know, the numbers and what's been going on.

22
23 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

26
27 MR. WILSON: Thanks, Andy. Yeah, I
28 certainly would entertain that idea of including, you
29 know, some more communities over in unit 9, you know.
30 We're kind of all the same, you know, a lot of the same
31 things going on. If -- yeah, that was supported in
32 language or something, I think it's probably one way to
33 help, you know, increase, you know, especially if you
34 put a limit on the take of caribou, you know, by
35 permits it won't get away from you. So.....

36
37 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Susan.

38
39 MS. HENRY: Madame Chair and members of
40 the Council, Susanna Henry again, the Refuge Manager.
41 I wanted to add one other small thing about the
42 proposal that we're looking at. To just connect the
43 two seasons together in one long season, I know that
44 includes the time that the bulls are in rut and
45 traditionally it's felt that their meat then is --
46 doesn't taste near as good. And but I also noted from
47 Andy's earlier report that most of the animals taken
48 this fall in August and September were bulls. And I
49 was lucky enough to be able to go on one of those hunts
50 and I noticed that the cows were infinitely smarter and

1 more skittish. So maybe the bulls are more available
2 to the hunters. And so opening the season up in that
3 middle part of the time I can't -- I have to agree with
4 Andy, I don't know that it's really going to increase
5 the amount of harvest necessarily. And certainly if
6 there's three tags for a person that's -- they might be
7 able to take three caribou instead of just two if they
8 were in that -- in a position to be able to do it. But
9 it's certainly something to think about expanding the
10 number of available people for the hunt.

11

12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.

13

14 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair, yeah. I can
15 certainly sympathize with, you know, the idea of the
16 herd dropping out, look at over here on, you know, 9C,
17 9E, you know. And just when you -- you know, the
18 predators and, you know, the usage or whatever it is
19 when they drop out, it just -- how many years now,
20 it's, you know, we're looking at about 15 years here.
21 And maybe just now getting back to where we can have
22 something. So sympathizing with you there, if there's
23 opportunities to expand and to limit the expansion, I'm
24 game.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Do you have a
27 comment?

28

29 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Madame Chair.
30 I was just going to add, so the people that have C&T
31 for caribou in this area are residents of 9B, 17, Lime
32 Village, Stony River and so that's a larger pool than
33 is currently allowed to harvest caribou on the Nushagak
34 Peninsula. Currently Federal public lands are closed
35 to caribou harvest except to residents of Togiak, Twin
36 Hills, Manokotak, Aleknagik, Dillingham, Clark's Point
37 and Ekuk. So perhaps opening a harvest to all
38 Federally-qualified users would represent some sort of
39 intermediate strategy between the current closure to
40 all except those few communities and what the State is
41 suggesting which is open it to all State residents.
42 Now like Andy said whether or not that situation would
43 actually draw more hunters, I can't speak to, but I
44 just wanted to clarify that there is a larger pool of
45 users who have C&T in this area.

46

47 Thank you.

48

49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci.

50

1 MS. MORRIS LYON: Yeah, that's exactly
2 the same line I was going down much earlier when I
3 asked you about the concerns for the growing population
4 of the herd. And I guess I would -- I'm headed in that
5 direction and would like to hear possible discussions
6 maybe from folks such as Molly and Dan and Pete who are
7 closer to the population of the herd and potential
8 users of the herd as to what their fears might be if we
9 did open it up to all -- a more broader base. And, you
10 know, I understand Andy's concerns, but for those of us
11 on the other side who might have the potential to be
12 able to access them, it sure would be nice to remember
13 what caribou tasted like again. So I'd just throw that
14 one out there to hear if anybody -- any concerns were
15 out there if it was opened up more liberally because we
16 all know how these herds statewide can plunge if you
17 let them get too big. So I think we all can easily
18 acknowledge that too.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

21

22 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, Madame Chair.
23 First just to -- there was a comment there about we had
24 a gap in the season and now we're proposing to put it
25 together. I think it was to recognize that caribou --
26 rutting bulls don't -- just don't taste too good. They
27 are inedible and from every account I've had of the
28 people who for some darn reason shot one then, but cows
29 are edible. I think we wanted to allow a little more
30 opportunity if somebody from Clark's or Ekuk wanted to
31 boat across or come down from Manokotak or however,
32 other access, it's a real marginal time of year, right
33 in -- you know, weather wise and everything else, but
34 we thought well, what the heck and it makes it simpler
35 to follow.

36

37 I'm kind of amazed that Lime Village is
38 qualified. To -- some little history though that of my
39 own that I'm aware of is when is when I first came to
40 Dillingham around '89 we had growing and strong caribou
41 populations up along the Nushagak -- between the
42 Nushagak and the Mulchatna and Lake Iliamna. And I
43 remember -- of course we also had winter. We'd have
44 kind of like trains of Goodnews and I think Togiak
45 folks would come through Dillingham and we'd have six,
46 seven snowmachines out front and they'd all get their
47 caribou tags and then they'd shoot on up the Nustu (ph)
48 and then hunt out of there. So but nowadays I think
49 Nustu guides could come down, but like last year for me
50 I wanted to go hunting really, but it was like in my

1 opinion one day that was almost good enough. And I
2 knew of several folks that had better snowmachines,
3 faster, and they ripped down there and got some, but it
4 was like -- and there was not very many. But and I
5 heard a lot about some really trashed equipment when
6 they came back, but it was -- and it wasn't much better
7 the year before. I think we had decent travel
8 conditions that the folks around here especially in the
9 years where we don't do so well on moose which was last
10 year, there'd be a lot of people including me, I
11 haven't done so well, who would be eager to get down
12 there.

13

14 I'm not entirely opposed to broadening
15 it on a personal level. I just -- I can't speak for
16 the Advisory Committee, we just didn't discuss it. And
17 I think they're thinking more locally.

18

19 Thank you.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any other
22 comments?

23

24 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

27

28 MR. O'HARA: Well, do you ever think
29 about same day as airborne?

30

31 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, that's coming up.
32 We got -- is it 27, 28 or is it 29, 30, one of those,
33 30, 31, 31, 32. Yeah.

34

35 MR. O'HARA: Thank you.

36

37 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Courtenay, did
38 you have a comment regarding this?

39

40 MS. CARTY: Thank you, Madame Chair,
41 members of the Board. For the record Courtenay Carty,
42 BBNA. I guess I work with Andy on the -- what are we
43 called, the NPCCC, the Caribou Committee. And also
44 attending at the Nushagak AC meeting and the Togiak AC
45 meeting is yet to be scheduled. But just in hearing
46 this discussion I feel like and one of my concerns I
47 guess this summer with the hunt and not having all of
48 the C&T users able to access this population is that
49 obviously we have all these familial relationships with
50 villages that are unable to harvest so if folks from

1 Stu or Aleknagik are here with their family and wanted
2 to go hunt they wouldn't be able to access that.
3 Obviously the six -- the combined three proposals to
4 increase I guess the harvest rate of this herd in order
5 to get the population size back down and allow for a
6 better opportunity for the harvesters. I think just in
7 my own opinion opening it to all the statewide users,
8 all Alaska residents, wouldn't be the best thing. I
9 think a really good suggestion would be to open it to
10 all of the Federally-qualified subsistence harvesters
11 that have C&T in the area. And then I guess on
12 (indiscernible) about Lime Village, I think the C&T is
13 for the game unit for all of 17, not for the Nushagak
14 Peninsula Herd itself. But that would be quite a
15 distance to go.

16
17 So I think that would make sense. I
18 don't know if that's necessary at this stage of the
19 game. It would be nice to kind of I guess allow for
20 that opportunity if we're trying to get this population
21 harvested or to let these proposals go forward and see
22 what kind of harvest rates, how that changes by
23 allowing more permits.

24
25 And then one thing about the season
26 dates, also if it's one season then we only need to get
27 permits one time, right, correct, we don't need to get
28 two sets of permits whereas right now we have to go to
29 the Council to get a permit in the fall and then again
30 in the winter. Or is it.....

31
32 MR. ADERMAN: Madame Chair. The
33 permits that are issued are good for.....

34
35 MS. CARTY: Both seasons.

36
37 MR. ADERMAN:the August,
38 September season and if they're not used then they're
39 still good for the winter, the December through March
40 season. So.....

41
42 MS. CARTY: Okay.

43
44 MR. ADERMAN:that's not really an
45 issue.

46
47 MS. CARTY: It's the date on the.....

48
49 MR. ADERMAN: Yeah, it would -- yeah,
50 it would just be.....

1 MS. CARTY: Thank you. That's all.
2
3 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Courtenay.
4 She's doing such a good job.
5
6 I kind of vaguely remember, I think
7 again I was referring to when we talked about same day
8 airborne, that we were a little reluctant to rip it too
9 wide open. And if it were to open up to guys out of
10 Anchorage and Kenai who have planes, because we see a
11 pretty strong number of them come down here during king
12 season, and so it isn't a super big herd and it
13 wouldn't take too long to crop them off. It's not like
14 the herd's growing like the Nushagak Herd grew, it was
15 something like 20,000 animals a year there for a while
16 or some crazy number, it was a lot. So I'd rather opt
17 to go cautiously, but if that opened it to Federally-
18 qualified I would entertain that.
19
20 Thank you.
21
22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Anymore
23 -- any more discussions?
24
25 (No comments)
26
27 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: If not, I need
28 to entertain a motion.
29
30 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
31
32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
33
34 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair. I'll move
35 to adopt proposal 25 with language recommended by OSM.
36
37 Thank you.
38
39 MS. MORRIS LYON: Second.
40
41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
42 been a motion by Dan Dunaway to adopt WP-25, seconded
43 by Nanci.
44
45 MR. O'HARA: Question.
46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Question's
48 been called. All in favor say aye.
49
50 IN UNISON: Aye.

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
2 opposition?
3
4 (No opposing votes)
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
7 you. Okay. I guess 26.
8
9 MR. ABRAHAM: Molly, (in Native). I
10 didn't think I'd last this long, but I did.
11
12 MR. O'HARA: That's because your
13 union.....
14
15 MR. ABRAHAM: Huh?
16
17 MR. O'HARA:and you're doing
18 good.
19
20 (Laughter)
21
22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Pete is going
23 to be picked up by somebody at 5:00 o'clock and he'll
24 be excused. I guess he's surprised that he's lasted
25 this long, but he needs to go and rest. So he'll be
26 excused.
27
28 MS. MORRIS LYON: We'll see you
29 tomorrow.
30
31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. WP-26.
32
33 Donald.
34
35
36 MR. MIKE: Yeah, Madame Chair, thank
37 you. WP16-25 and 16-24 are presented as a combination
38 so I recommend that the Council adopt WP16-26 and based
39 on action in 25, I'll leave it to the Council, you can
40 take no action or comment or do -- vote on other
41 matters.
42
43 Thank you.
44
45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. We need
46 to.
47
48 MS. MORRIS LYON: Wasn't that part of
49 the language that we approved?
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: For both.
2
3 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, maybe I should have
4 moved to adopt them both. I don't know if we can
5 rewind it a little bit here and just call it a friendly
6 adjustment or what of to take no action on 26 which
7 is.....
8
9 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: (Indiscernible -
10 away from microphone).....
11
12 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. So I'll move to
13 adopt 26.
14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
16 been a motion to adopt WP-26.
17
18 MS. MORRIS LYON: I'll second it.
19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Second by
21 Nanci.
22
23 Dan.
24
25 MR. DUNAWAY: I'll just recommend we
26 take no action based on 25.
27
28 MS. MORRIS LYON: Agree.
29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. All in
31 favor say aye.
32
33 IN UNISON: Aye.
34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
36 opposition?
37
38 (No opposing votes)
39
40 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
41 Okay. We're to WP16-27, 28.
42
43 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Madame Chair.
44 WP16-27 and 28 begins on page 90 of your books. And
45 these two proposals were submitted by the Togiak Fish
46 and Game Advisory Committee and the Nushagak Fish and
47 Game Advisory Committee. These proposals request to
48 extend the time frame during which the up to 31 day
49 season for moose can be announced in unit 17A.
50 Currently that window of opportunity is December 1st

1 through January 31st. And the proposal is to extend
2 the window of opportunity from December 1st to the end
3 of February. These proposals also request that the
4 harvest limit be changed from up to two moose with no
5 antler restriction to up to two moose with a limit of
6 one antlered bull and one antlerless moose. The
7 proponents believe that these changes will allow
8 managers a better means of maintaining the population
9 objectives while the longer window will allow increased
10 flexibility in accommodating the more variable weather
11 and travel conditions.

12
13 There has been a winter season in unit
14 17A since 2003. In 2014 the up to 14 day season was
15 changed to the current up to 31 day season. And the
16 this year the Alaska Board of Game extended that window
17 of opportunity during which the 31 day season could be
18 announced from an end date of January 31st to an end
19 date of February 29th. This action by the Board of
20 Game also changed the harvest limit from one bull and
21 one antlerless moose to one antlered bull and one
22 antlerless moose. So as a side note the State winter
23 hunt is managed by registration permit, it has a
24 separate quota for antlerless moose.

25
26 So if these proposals are adopted it
27 would result in parallel State and Federal regulations
28 for winter moose harvest in unit 17A. The moose
29 population in 17A is currently growing and expanding
30 its range. At the last survey which was conducted in
31 2011, this is the latest data that I have in the
32 analysis, the population was estimated at nearly 1,200
33 animals which is approaching the upper limit of the
34 population objective. The population has been quite
35 productive with a calf/cow ratio averaging 127 calves
36 per 100 cows. And that was an average between 1998 and
37 2013. And recruitment for this time period averaged 30
38 -- sorry, 63 calves per 100 cows. A May, 2015 survey
39 indicates that both calf survival and recruitment are
40 currently exceeding this long term average. We don't
41 have current bull/cow ratios, but historically they've
42 been high.

43
44 The winter harvest in unit 17A has
45 averaged 11 moose between 2003 and 2014 and the
46 combined winter and fall harvest has averaged 37 moose
47 for the same time period.

48
49 If these proposals are adopted they
50 will result in a longer window of opportunity for the

1 may be announced season which will provide greater
2 flexibility for managers in terms of variable travel
3 conditions that increasingly we are seeing. The
4 proposed antler restrictions will provide protections
5 for both cows and bull moose and in particular will
6 protect cows once that small quota has been met and
7 will also provide protections for large breeding bulls
8 who have dropped their antlers and potentially shift
9 that harvest pressure to younger bulls that may carry
10 their antlers into early spring.

11
12 The OSM preliminary conclusion is to
13 support WP16-37 [sic] with modification and the only
14 modification is to more clearly specify the antler
15 restrictions and then to take no action on WP16-28.

16
17 Thank you, Madame Chair.

18
19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
20 comments, questions? Pretty clear?

21
22 Dan.

23
24 MR. DUNAWAY: As a way of explanation
25 more, again referring to these chaotic winter weather
26 anymore, get all set, think you're going to have the
27 season and then it just rains and blows. So we're
28 trying to maximize flexibility. And I think Andy spoke
29 to it earlier about how we had to extend the season
30 because it's just horrible travel conditions. And so
31 trying to -- and I understand with this really healthy
32 moose herd we don't want to exceed the carrying
33 capacity there either so our understanding is that this
34 would give managers maximum flexibility and maximize
35 opportunity for people to go out and get those moose.

36
37 Thank you.

38
39 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

40
41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

42
43 MR. O'HARA: And just for the over --
44 information of all of us, give us a geographical
45 location of these moose.

46
47 MR. ADERMAN: That's -- 17A is the
48 drainages between Cape Newenham and Cape Constantine.
49 So there's really not much for moose near Cape
50 Constantine until you get up to the Kalukik (ph) River.

1 There's a little bit there east in the Knik, that's
2 part of 17A. Moving across to the west Kalukik,
3 Uholava (ph), Nugoflik (ph) and the main Togiak and
4 that's the biggest system. And then going west,
5 southwest from Togiak all the way out to Cape Newenham
6 if it drains into Togiak Bay, you know, you're in 17A.

7

8 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

9

10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

11

12 MR. O'HARA: Is that -- are those
13 animals extending farther west?

14

15 MR. ADERMAN: They have. They have
16 infiltrated and increased in a similar manner, not
17 quite the numbers, but in the Goodnews Drainage which
18 is immediately west and north of the western part of
19 17A. And now they're getting into the Kanektok River
20 which is north of the Goodnews River. Those drainages
21 are in unit 18. I think they're still probably moving
22 west and north.

23

24 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

27

28 MR. O'HARA: Do they have good foliage,
29 do they have good graze or is that not a good question?

30

31 MR. ADERMAN: I think they do. I say
32 that because the high number of twins. Also we've
33 gotten weights on 10 and a half month old females that
34 are -- essentially they calves, they're calves until
35 they turn a year old and they're some of the heaviest
36 moose in the state for that age that have been
37 measured. There may be other populations like on the
38 lower Yukon that have some really big moose on them,
39 but to my knowledge they haven't been weighed. So I
40 think their forage is still pretty good, but I don't
41 think it can just go on and on forever like that. And
42 so, yeah, it's -- we've take -- undertaken measures to,
43 you know, increase that harvest. There's a nonresident
44 opportunity now in 17A, it's a drawing permit hunt, up
45 to 20 permits or that's what it's been the last two
46 years. It just started two years ago. Cow hunts,
47 extended winter hunts, you know, we don't want to see
48 it go the other way. So.....

49

50 MR. O'HARA: The Nushagak has got good

1 browse and good areas for moose and they're long legged
2 and they can kill a wolf in the brush and so they're
3 surviving quite well and there's a lot of moose in
4 there. And then you go on over to Cinder River and
5 lower Becharof, south end of Becharof in Nushagak one
6 and two and then on over to -- over the hill to the
7 Meshik and that's all -- you know, that's all good
8 moose county. And I'll tell you a little story. Two
9 generations ago, a generation is 25, so the generation
10 before me, that would be 25 years before when I was
11 about 12 or 13 years old, the generation before that.
12 So that sets it back 50 years, they killed the first
13 moose in Iliamna Lake, Iliamna River, they didn't know
14 what they killed, but it was awfully good and it -- and
15 it had come down here. And there were no moose in this
16 country before that and they're still going. And I'm
17 not so sure you're right, but we could challenge you a
18 little bit. They could move west if they got good
19 enough browse and they don't seem to have a predator
20 problem like you have on the peninsula, as many bears
21 as we have, but it's a good problem.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any other
24 comments?

25

26 (No comments)

27

28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Well, for me I
29 didn't think I'd live long enough to see the process.
30 It sounds like the process of moose started from down
31 the chain like the caribou. The caribou was
32 transported from down there to over here and now
33 they're over to Nushagak and now they're healthy. And
34 then the moose that are traveling, sounds like that
35 they've kind of stopped at Togiak now, but they started
36 from Sunshine Valley, you know, that herd. And they
37 just traveled over. And once they got over to Togiak
38 Valley they just flourished. Before the Togiak
39 residence I'm going to call it co-managed with, you
40 know, the agencies, they were killing -- they were
41 killing moose every time they saw and I witnessed it
42 because I worked for Subsistence Division starting
43 1980. And then once they started that co-management
44 and understood how they can protect the moose and make
45 it flourish so that they can have this moose to hunt,
46 they worked, that Council worked even to inform the
47 villages to the west because Platinum and Goodnews were
48 just as hungry for moose and every time they saw a
49 moose they'd kill it no matter what season. And their
50 request to save this moose transferred over to that

1 area and here we are with a healthy population of moose
2 and with all three communities over there co-managing
3 this, you know, in their own way. So I'm happy for
4 them.

5
6 Yes, if no moose comments, where are
7 we, are we ready to.....

8
9 MS. MORRIS LYON: No, we got to go down
10 the list.

11
12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Tribal.

13
14 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. We didn't
15 have any comments during the tribal consultations from
16 the tribes from this region on this proposal.

17
18 Thank you.

19
20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. The
21 agencies, ADF&G.

22
23 MR. CRAWFORD: Madame Chair, this is
24 Drew Crawford with the Alaska Department of Fish and
25 Game in Anchorage. The Department's preliminary
26 recommendation are to support proposal WP16-27 as
27 modified by OSM and take no action of proposal WP16-28.

28
29 Over.

30
31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
32 you. Courtenay, were you going to -- were you coming
33 up?

34
35 MS. CARTY: In the (indiscernible)
36 area.

37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Federal
39 agencies.

40
41 (No comment)

42
43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Native tribe,
44 village.

45
46 MS. CARTY: Madame Chair. I saw
47 Susanna squirming around over there so I don't know if
48 she's going to come up here or not.

49
50 But for the record, Courtenay Carty,

1 Bristol Bay Native Association. I guess I just wanted
2 to say in terms of smoothing over the process between
3 the Federal RAC and the ACs if potentially either
4 Susanna or Andy could present this at the Togiak AC and
5 maybe a RAC member or two could call in and participate
6 in that meeting, that would really help facilitate the
7 conversation at the Nushagak or the Togiak AC will have
8 on these same proposals. I was at the Nushagak AC
9 meeting and presented this information, I know Andy was
10 out doing that research. So it was able -- someone was
11 there to have the conversation, but it would be really
12 great if someone that was in this room today would be
13 able to do that for all of these proposals at the
14 Togiak AC meeting.

15
16 Thank you.

17
18 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Thank
19 you, Courtenay.

20
21 Okay. Advisory groups.

22
23 MS. MORRIS LYON: Dan.

24
25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh, Dan,
26 sorry.

27
28 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
29 The Nushagak Advisory Committee took this up and took
30 27, 28 up and supported the modified -- OSM recommended
31 modified language and took no action on proposal 28.

32
33 Thank you.

34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Carl.

36
37 MR. JOHNSON: Yes, Madame Chair. Thank
38 you. Carl Johnson. Since we're on other advisory
39 groups I just thought I'd let the Council know that the
40 YK-Delta Council voted to support these proposals
41 consistent with the OSM recommendations.

42
43 Thank you, Madame Chair.

44
45 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
46 Okay. Written public.

47
48 Donald.

49
50 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. There are no

1 written public comments.
2
3 Thank you.
4
5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Public
6 testimonies.
7
8 (No comments)
9
10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Hearing none
11 or seeing none, Regional Council.
12
13 Nanci.
14
15 MS. MORRIS LYON: Thank you, Madame
16 Chair. Yeah, I just wish we were having this problem
17 on our side of the bay, it's just -- it just breaks my
18 heart, but I'm really happy for you guys over here.
19 And with that I would like to propose that we accept
20 proposal WP16-27 as OSM has modified and in the same
21 breath take no action because of the action we'll be
22 taking on WP16-27 take no action on proposals WP16-28.
23
24 MR. SHUGAK: Second.
25
26 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: There's been a
27 motion to adopt WP-27 and taking no action on 28 by --
28 was it Dan?
29
30 MS. MORRIS LYON: No, I made the
31 motion.
32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Or I'm sorry,
34 by Nanci and seconded by Senamoth.
35
36 (Laughter)
37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Senafont.
39 Okay.
40
41 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
42
43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
44
45 MR. O'HARA: Call for the question.
46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: There's been
48 question called. All in favor say aye.
49
50 IN UNISON: Aye.

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
2 opposition?

3
4 (No opposing votes)

5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Seeing none,
7 thank you. Okay. Moving on to WP-29 and 30.

8
9 MS. WORKER: Thank you, Madame Chair.
10 WP16-29 and 30 begins on page 99 of your books. Again
11 these proposals were proposed by the Nushagak Fish and
12 Game Advisory Committee and the Togiak Fish and Game
13 Advisory Committee. And they request to add 16 days to
14 the end of the caribou season in unit 9B and portions
15 of unit 17. So basically everything except the
16 Nushagak Peninsula. Currently the season is August 1st
17 to March 15th and the proposed season is August 1st to
18 March 31st. The motivation for this proposal is to
19 provide additional opportunity for subsistence and to
20 simply regulations because it would result in the
21 alignment of Federal regulations with the recently
22 implemented State regulations. Many of the regulatory
23 actions in the past decade have reduced harvest limits
24 or shortened the seasons for caribou in response to the
25 declining population. In order to better assess
26 harvest and to be more responsive with in season
27 adjustments the State implemented a registration hunt
28 in 2013 and then in 2014 the Federal Subsistence Board
29 began requiring those hunting under Federal regulation
30 obtain that State registration permit. And the intent
31 again was to get a better handle on harvest and to
32 allow managers to be more responsive with their in
33 season management. Most recently in February of 2015
34 the Alaska Board of Game extended the State caribou
35 season from March 15th to March 31st. And this action
36 was taken in response again to the increasingly
37 challenging winter travel conditions and subsequent
38 reduced access to caribou. The current proposal would
39 do the same on the Federal side of things and if it's
40 adopted would result in parallel State and Federal
41 caribou regulations in this area.

42
43 The most current population estimate is
44 around 30,000 animals as we heard from Neil this
45 morning. This is the minimum population objective for
46 this herd. The estimate bull/cow ratio has been below
47 the management objective of 35 bulls to 100 cows since
48 about 2001 although it has increased slightly in the
49 last couple of surveys. In addition to the changing
50 population size, the herd's distribution and seasonal

1 movements have been fairly dynamic in the last couple
2 of decades and the western portion of the population
3 seems to be doing a little bit better than the eastern
4 population or the eastern portion of the population.

5
6 As a result of the declining population
7 and the widespread distribution the opportunities for
8 harvest are limited. And this is reflected in the
9 harvest rates which for the past five years have
10 averaged only 350 caribou per year. And this is a
11 dramatic decline from the maximum reported harvest of
12 nearly 4,000 animals that was reported in 2000, 2001.
13 It's also well below the objective of harvesting 2,400
14 to 8,000 animals although it is acknowledged that there
15 is probably a large unreported harvest of this herd.
16 Since 2007 an increasing proportion of the harvest has
17 occurred in February and March where historically most
18 of the harvest occurred in August and September.

19
20 If these proposals are adopted they
21 would lengthen the caribou season in unit 9B and unit
22 17 by 16 days which would provide additional
23 subsistence opportunity. Although the population
24 remains at the lower end of the management objective,
25 the bull/cow ratios and the cow/calf ratios have shown
26 slight improvement in the last few years. With the
27 recent variability in winter travel conditions a longer
28 season will provide additional opportunity for harvest.
29 The reported harvest has been low and it's expected
30 that the population will be able to withstand this
31 additional harvest. And then finally adoption of the
32 proposals would also simplify regulations by matching
33 the recently implemented State regulation.

34
35 And so for these reasons the OSM
36 preliminary conclusion is to support 16-29 with
37 modification again to remove the regulatory language
38 that references seasons, harvest limits, hunt areas and
39 delegate authority to the Togiak National Wildlife
40 Refuge Manager to determine the season, harvest limits
41 and hunt areas by a delegation of authority letter.
42 And then again take no action on WP16-30.

43
44 And I'm sorry if I was maybe going a
45 little bit fast there.

46
47 Thank you.

48
49 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

2

3 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, in the Nushagak
4 area there's -- I think almost the entire time that we
5 had to shorten the seasons for caribou from the end of
6 March to middle of March, the Nushagak River villages I
7 think every year petitioned to get it extended because
8 occasionally a small amount of caribou would wander
9 through the villages just after the season, you know,
10 just like you see the bull moose the day after it
11 closes or the day before it opens. And especially in
12 the spring is a critical time for them to get meat.
13 And when the herd was really bomb their class was
14 parentally denied. So it's kind of -- it's a huge
15 relief that we saw enough biological data to support
16 setting it to March 31st. And we're eager to support
17 that, especially for those villages and other places.
18 It -- again the travel times in the winter, there's
19 still a lot of period they really weren't going to be
20 able to hunt as extensively as we used to.

21

22 So I'm -- the Nushagak Advisory
23 Committee was really supportive of this and almost
24 gleeful to be able to help our villages upriver.

25

26 Thank you.

27

28 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

31

32 MR. O'HARA: I know it's the end of the
33 day, but I remember coming out of Meshik and I had a
34 couple of moose hunters, picking up another moose
35 hunter at Pilot Point and I looked down and there's a
36 moose walking down the road the day after the season
37 was over. And those guys hadn't gotten their moose so
38 I know what you're talking about.

39

40 But I wanted to address this proposal
41 in that every year, Richard, some of us and Randy and
42 his brother Chet and we sitting around talking, well,
43 they close it on the 15th, but we can find out what
44 Federal land is in 9B we'll -- if we can get our GPS
45 out, it never worked out. I'm just glad to see the
46 extra two weeks put on and should it just be a group of
47 caribou going by a village where they can get some
48 meat. So I really think it's a good idea.

49

50 Thank you, Madame Chair.

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. If
2 there's no other comments let's go through the process.
3
4 (No comments)
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Consultation.
7
8 MR. O'HARA: Dan's got one.
9
10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh, Dan.
11
12 MR. DUNAWAY: Well, Madame Chair, I
13 move to adopt.....
14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We got to.....
16
17 MR. DUNAWAY: Oh, we've got to do that
18 first. At Fish and Game you move to adopt and then
19 discuss so I'm backwards all the time.
20
21 Thank you.
22
23 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
24 Consultation.
25
26 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Madame Chair.
27 There was no tribes commenting on this proposal during
28 consultation.
29
30 Thank you, Madame Chair.
31
32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Agency
33 comments, ADF&G.
34
35 MR. CRAWFORD: Madame Chair, Drew
36 Crawford with the Alaska Department of Fish and Game in
37 Anchorage. The Department's preliminary recommendation
38 is to support proposal WP16-29 and take no action on
39 proposal WP16-30.
40
41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you.
42 Federal agencies.
43
44 (No comments)
45
46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Native tribal.
47
48 (No comments)
49
50 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: InterAgency.

1 (No comments)
2
3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Advisory
4 Group.
5
6 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you, Madame Chair.
7 Also the YK-Delta Council took up this proposal and
8 voted to support consistent with the OSM
9 recommendations.
10
11 Thank you, Madame Chair.
12
13 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you,
14 Carl.
15
16 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
17
18 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
19
20 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, thank you, Madame
21 Chair. In the same manner the Nushagak Advisory
22 Committee supported with the OSM recommendations on 29
23 and no action on 30.
24
25 Thank you.
26
27 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Written
28 comments.
29
30 MR. MIKE: No summary of written
31 comments, Madame Chair.
32
33 Thank you.
34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Public
36 testimony.
37
38 MS. RUPP: Thank you, Madame Chair.
39 Liza Rupp on behalf of the Subsistence -- Lake Clark
40 Subsistence Resource Commission. And the Commission
41 voted to support proposal 29 with the OSM changes and
42 follow the OSM recommendation for 30.
43
44 Thank you, Madame Chair.
45
46 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Thank you. I
47 guess it's the Regional Council.
48
49 MR. DUNAWAY: Okay. Madame Chair. I
50 move to adopt proposal 29 with the OSM recommended

1 modifications and take no action on 30.

2

3 Thank you.

4

5 MR. WILSON: Second.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: There's been a
8 motion by Dan Dunaway to support WP-29 and no action on
9 30, seconded by Richard.

10

11 Okay. Any -- I guess we need a.....

12

13 MS. MORRIS LYON: Question.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Question's
16 been called. All in favor say aye.

17

18 IN UNISON: Aye.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any

21 opposition?

22

23 (No opposing votes)

24

25 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: No opposition.

26 Thank you.

27

28 Okay. The next is WP-31 slash 32, 17A
29 caribou. Robbin, we finally got you on the table.

30

31 MS. LA VINE: Good afternoon, Madame
32 Chair, members of the Council. My name is Robbin La
33 Vine, Anthropologist with the Office of Subsistence
34 Management. The analysis for proposal W16-31/32 begins
35 on page 117 of your meeting book.

36

37 So proposals 16-31 and 32 were
38 submitted by the Nushagak Advisory Committee and the
39 Togiak Advisory Committee and they request a change in
40 Federal subsistence regulations to allow same day
41 airborne harvest of Nushagak Peninsula Caribou during
42 the winter hunt, January 1st through March 31st. The
43 proponents state that allowing same day airborne
44 subsistence harvest of the Nushagak Peninsula Caribou
45 Herd in unit 17 would provide more opportunity for
46 Federally-qualified subsistence users during the winter
47 hunt season. They add that aircraft have traditionally
48 been used to harvest resources in the Bristol Bay area
49 and that poor snow cover has contributed to recent low
50 harvests of Nushagak Peninsula animal. Both proponents

1 state that allowing same day airborne harvesting would
2 not impact the herd as harvest is controlled by permits
3 issued, not by means of access. The Board has received
4 similar proposals in the past, proposal 48 in 1997 and
5 proposal 56 in 1998. The Board rejected proposal 48
6 and proposal 56 was rejected on recommendation from
7 this Council. Reasons for rejection included concerns
8 over harassment of the herd, a possible increased
9 harvest effort required by snowmachine hunters, the
10 possibility of a harvest advantage to rural residents
11 with a plane over those without and that some local
12 residents and the Bristol Bay Native Association
13 opposed the proposal. This spring of 2015 the Village
14 of Manokotak submitted a special action requesting a
15 season extension to the May -- to May 31st because of
16 poor winter travel conditions and low harvest. This
17 was rejected by the Board because of a risk of
18 consuming caribou that were darted during a radio
19 collaring project and a concern over disturbance to cow
20 caribou during the calving season. Allowing same day
21 airborne harvest would provide additional opportunity
22 for Federally-qualified subsistence users during
23 winters when snow cover is poor and travel by
24 snowmachine is difficult. While providing advantage to
25 residents with aircraft studies demonstrate Bristol Bay
26 hunters are generous with their success and distribute
27 meat throughout their community regardless of methods
28 used to access the resource. The Nushagak Peninsula
29 Caribou Herd has increased significantly from 462
30 animals in 2007 to 1,018 animals in 2014. Adoption of
31 this proposal is not expected to adversely affect the
32 Nushagak Peninsula Caribou Herd as harvest numbers will
33 be controlled by permit, not by the burden of poor
34 access.

35

36 So for these reasons the OSM
37 preliminary conclusion is to support proposal WP16-31
38 slash 32.

39

40 And I'm ready to take your comments.

41

42 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

43

44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

45

46 MR. O'HARA: Does it say somewhere in
47 this proposal that you're supposed to shoot -- you land
48 and you walk 300 feet from your airplane then you
49 shoot?

50

1 MS. LA VINE: Indeed.
2
3 MR. O'HARA: Okay. What's the
4 significance of that?
5
6 MS. LA VINE: For the record -- I'm
7 sorry, through the Chair. I believe it is 300 feet
8 upon landing.
9
10 MR. O'HARA: Well, what difference does
11 it make whether you were 10 feet or 300 feet, just give
12 the animal a chance to run or -- I've done both, I've
13 done a lot of same day airborne hunting?
14
15 MS. LA VINE: I defer to somebody that
16 might be more familiar with those regulations.
17
18 MR. ADERMAN: Yes, Dan, this is Andy
19 Aderman, Togiak Refuge. The proposal was kind of
20 written the way that when there was a same day airborne
21 for Mulchatna Caribou in 9B and parts of 17, that same
22 300 foot regulation was imposed then. And I think it's
23 just so people aren't maybe just landing and shooting
24 right out of the plane even though they're stopped on
25 the ground.
26
27 Somebody else may have a better
28 recollection than me.
29
30 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
31
32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
33
34 MR. DUNAWAY: Thank you, Madame Chair.
35 My memory's pretty hazy, but I get the sense that it
36 might have been thought to be a little more enforceable
37 and to be able to show that it wasn't shot from the
38 air. I know back when there was more relaxed
39 regulations this thing seemed to pop up as a way to
40 make sure people weren't like Andy said shooting
41 straight out of the plane or actually shooting from the
42 air and then landing next to it or something. So we
43 when we wrote this I think we were trying to find the
44 most recent acceptable language so that we didn't get
45 tangled up in whatever had come before. So that seemed
46 to be the acceptable standard the last time we had a
47 same day airborne like Andy says.
48
49 Thank you.
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Any
2 other comments?

3

4 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

7

8 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, I should go on. We
9 -- you know, when we were looking and earlier were
10 discussing on the lengthening season and raising the
11 bag limits, when we had these other ideas about maybe
12 bringing in other hunters or whatever else, there's
13 folks that have really longed for the old traditional
14 flying out and getting their animals and we thought it
15 would be a way to increase the harvest in a way that
16 would maybe crop down the herd, but not fling it too
17 wide open. And there was some discussion -- I was
18 looking through some of the older notes, I can't find
19 anything about bring -- you know, I know there was
20 comments saying well, the boys in the Naknek sure would
21 like to come over too and I don't know what kind of
22 discussion -- I don't have any record of, you know,
23 whether we should -- said yes to do that or no. I
24 don't find anything either way, but what I do remember
25 was they're very well of the interest.

26

27 Thank you.

28

29 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

30

31 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

32

33 MR. O'HARA: Let's see, three years ago
34 we had a very, very cold winter and you could do a
35 hundred miles an hour on a snowmachine, it was all the
36 way up to the top of the bushes and Richard and I went
37 out and got a caribou. And I missed the first one and
38 you jump off the snowmachine, go right up to your
39 waist, you know. And they run around and look at you
40 again so we got one. And you could have -- you could
41 have gotten a lot -- we got -- you could get -- it was
42 25 below though so we -- one was plenty good enough and
43 get back into the shelter. You could get another
44 winter like that and with skis you could kill off a lot
45 of caribou. So do you have a provision for reducing
46 the -- an emergency order to reduce the hunt if you
47 find out there's too many taken and I would imagine
48 there's going to be a permitting process going with it,
49 Andy?

50

1 MR. ADERMAN: Yeah, we kind of rely on
2 the hunters to follow the conditions of the permit and
3 report promptly the -- on their successful hunt like
4 that and, you know, with our most recent count a
5 minimum of 1,300 -- over 1,300 animals, there's
6 probably 1,400, that were down there at that time. And
7 we're a good 550 over what we think is ideal down
8 there. And the most we've ever harvested or reported
9 harvest down there in any season is 127 I think. So
10 we've got a fairly big cushion there I think, you know,
11 and it would just be something that we have to watch
12 and, you know, see what sort of interest level there is
13 and how much activity there is. I mentioned earlier
14 those animals are very skittish, they take off running
15 -- not that you can't land and, you know, get one an
16 hour later or, you know, whatever, but I don't -- I
17 don't know that it would be such a simple thing to spot
18 a group of caribou and land and then try to walk to
19 them or sneak up on them.

20
21 MS. MORRIS LYON: They're a different
22 breed.

23
24 MR. ADERMAN: Yeah. And, you know, I
25 think, you know, most people at least the current C&T
26 folks don't have access or the wherewithal to use a
27 plane. And that includes people in Dillingham, but
28 more so the people in the villages.

29
30 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

31
32 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

33
34 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, I was thinking
35 earlier when Andy mentioned how skittish they are,
36 there's a few guys here that are becoming incredible
37 snipers and they practice it five, 600 yards and I --
38 so I have one guy's shown me the bullets he's recovered
39 and I've seen him practicing out at the range, he's got
40 some really fancy equipment, I mean, to me that's a --
41 it's a half day hike to the caribou when they're
42 shooting them. But a few guys were doing that, but
43 I've also seen in other situations where people pool
44 their resources for berry picking and flying out,
45 chartering out and stuff like this. There seemed to be
46 some possible interest in doing that, I don't know how
47 many charter planes are available to fly out on skis,
48 but it was pretty broadly discussed in our Advisory
49 Committee and oh, of course we have -- let's see,
50 there's one, maybe two pilots on the Advisory Committee

1 and there's probably at least one in the audience.
2 There's quite a few of us that don't have planes, but
3 we all -- at the time it sure seemed like a good idea.
4 And so we went ahead with the proposal.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

9
10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

11
12 MR. O'HARA: They got those animals for
13 us so they better take good care of them.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, the
16 animals have been taking good care of the -- they even
17 look healthy.

18
19 Okay. If no more comments let's go
20 through the process.

21
22 Consultation.

23
24 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair, thank you.
25 There's was no comments from the tribes in this region
26 regarding this proposal during consultation.

27
28 Thank you.

29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Agency
31 comments, ADF&G.

32
33 MR. CRAWFORD: Yes, Madame Chair. This
34 is Drew Crawford with the Alaska Department of Fish and
35 Game in Anchorage. The Department's recommendation is
36 to oppose proposal WP16-31 slash 32. The Department
37 supports the concept on liberalizing hunting
38 opportunity to meet management objectives and considers
39 this a necessary goal for the management of this
40 caribou herd. However same day airborne hunting is the
41 most liberal method of taking caribou employed in
42 Alaska. It has only been used when populations cannot
43 be controlled through more standard methods in
44 unrestricted hunting opportunity for all user groups.
45 We sincerely believe that the inability to achieve an
46 adequate harvest under Federal regulations indicates
47 that the Nushagak Peninsula Caribou Herd can support
48 additional harvest by non-Federally-qualified users.
49 An alternative to same day airborne would be to remove
50 the restriction that limits opportunity to Federally-

1 qualified users and allow all State of Alaska hunters
2 to participate in this hunt through a State season.
3
4 Over.
5
6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Federal
7 agencies.
8
9 (No comments)
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Native and
12 tribal.
13
14 Were you going to speak on this?
15
16 MS. CARTY: (Indiscernible) member of
17 the public.
18
19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay.
20 InterAgency.
21
22 (No comments)
23
24 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. The
25 Advisory Groups.
26
27 Dan.
28
29 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, Madame Chair. Dan
30 Dunaway speaking for the Nushagak Advisory Committee.
31 We wrote proposal 31, we wrote it with the Fish and
32 Wildlife Protection Officer I think present. We did
33 consider some of the alternatives and we thought that
34 our proposal was the best way to go. We felt we were
35 in the conditions where we were having trouble to
36 control the harvest or control the herd with the normal
37 means of harvest. We -- I think we also proposed that
38 same day airborne at one time on the Mulchatna Herd and
39 then removed it when it was no longer appropriate. So
40 we are in full support of our own proposal.
41
42 Thank you.
43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: I guess the
45 question I'd have is has Togiak Advisory met?
46
47 MS. O'CONNOR-BRITL: They haven't.
48
49 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
2
3 MR. DUNAWAY: Am I mistaken or is 32 --
4 I think we -- here again the Togiak Advisory Committee
5 and Nushagak coordinated on these proposals, worked out
6 the language and then both submitted them.
7
8 Thank you.
9
10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Where
11 were we?
12
13 MS. MORRIS LYON: Written public.
14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Written.
16
17 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. There are no
18 written public comments.
19
20 Thank you.
21
22 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Public
23 testimony.
24
25 MS. CARTY: Hello, Madame Chair,
26 members of the Council. For the record my name is
27 Courtenay Carty and the testimony I'm going to provide
28 right now is for myself as a subsistence harvester and
29 not as Bristol Bay Native Association.
30
31 I just wanted to address proposals 31
32 and 32 and put I guess a different spin on the same day
33 airborne conversation. As it's written right now it's
34 -- except for flights and regularly scheduled
35 commercial aircraft and much of the conversation we've
36 heard about is people landing on skis in the tundra
37 somewhere and shooting via that plane. The situation
38 that I have come across in trying to access this herd
39 is charter hopping. My best friend's dad owns a air
40 service here and I could easily hop on a flight to
41 Manokotak that's not a regularly scheduled flight and
42 go with my friends from Manokotak straight out of the
43 village on their snowmachine to access this herd. But
44 as the regulation stands right now that's illegal
45 because it's not a regularly scheduled commercial
46 flight. And so I feel like opening it up to same day
47 airborne is going to allow for people from Dillingham
48 who could easily go if there's not adequate snow, the
49 Manokotak trail's been down for the last year or two
50 and we can't really get over to the peninsula to access

1 this herd with snowmachines from here, but people from
2 Manokotak are able to access from their village so I
3 feel like allowing for this would allow for some of us
4 who could potentially hop on our friend's flights or
5 backhaul on charter or other reg -- not regularly
6 scheduled flight to increase harvest opportunity with a
7 little bit of a different dynamic than just jumping out
8 of the plane in your snowgear and going 300 feet from
9 the plane.

10

11 That's my testimony. Thank you.

12

13 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

16

17 MR. O'HARA: Yeah, as it stands right
18 now you -- same day airborne is not legal. And so if
19 you made a same day as airborne you could jump on a
20 plane and go to Manokotak and go out on a snowmachine
21 or a four-wheeler thing. So but you're not supporting
22 same day as airborne, are you?

23

24 MS. CARTY: No, I do support same day
25 airborne. Personally I wouldn't mind being able to
26 jump out of a plane and I guess get my tags filled and
27 head home, but I guess I see that it could allow for a
28 different style of same day airborne, not just
29 necessarily tundra tires, but also not scheduled
30 flights to the villages.

31

32 I hope that answered the question.

33

34 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: So right now
35 it's commercial according to -- I haven't.....

36

37 MS. CARTY: Yeah, on page 118 and 119
38 that shows the current regulation and it says 26(b)(16)
39 take or assist in the tacking of a ungulate, bear,
40 wolf, wolverine, other furbearer before 3:00 a.m.
41 following the day in which airborne travel occurred
42 except for flights in regularly scheduled commercial
43 aircraft. So as it stands right now I could go to
44 Manokotak and do that, I would just have to overnight
45 there before hunting, I couldn't just fly over on a
46 Saturday morning and harvest and come home that evening
47 or even the next day. I'd have to sleep a night in
48 Manokotak and then go.

49

50 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: We're down to

1 Regional Council.
2
3 Dan.
4
5 MR. DUNAWAY: I move to adopt 31 and 32
6 as written with -- yeah, I don't think there's any
7 suggested changes by OSM. So we'd like to move to
8 adopt these as amend -- as written.
9
10 MS. MORRIS LYON: Are we adopting both
11 or not taking any action on 32 because of the adoption?
12
13 MR. DUNAWAY: Whichever's the better
14 practice. Maybe look into our -- get guidance and.....
15
16 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.
17
18 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
19
20 MR. MIKE: You can adopt 31 as it's
21 presented and go on record and make a motion to adopt
22 32 and take no action based on 31. So that's my
23 suggestion.
24
25 Thank you.
26
27 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
28
29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
30
31 MR. O'HARA: Are you suggesting that he
32 reword his motion?
33
34 MR. MIKE: Did anybody second it?
35
36 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: No.
37
38 MR. MIKE: Okay.
39
40 MR. DUNAWAY: Well, I'll try again
41 here. I'll move to adopt 31 and take no action on 32.
42
43 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
44 been a motion by.....
45
46 MS. MORRIS LYON: Nanci.
47
48 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK:and then
49 -- there's been a motion by Dan Dunaway to adopt WP-31
50 and not taken action on 32. Seconded by Nanci.

1 Dan.
2
3 MR. DUNAWAY: Just a quick -- again I
4 think I've said enough on why we did it and how we did
5 it and I hope you support it.
6
7 Thank you.
8
9 MR. WILSON: I'll second it just to get
10 some conversation.
11
12 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Nanci
13 seconded.
14
15 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.
16
17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.
18
19 MR. WILSON: Yeah, thanks. The --
20 let's see, I'm on page 117 here. And what I'm looking
21 at here on proposed regulations, that's the one we're
22 looking at, correct?
23
24 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: 31.
25
26 MR. WILSON: 117 or am I.....
27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, that's
29 us.
30
31 MR. WILSON: And it's got -- it's got
32 wolverine in here, caribou during -- let's see where
33 am I looking.
34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, 31, 32,
36 starting on page 117.
37
38 MR. WILSON: Somewhere I read in here
39 where it applies to same day airborne for wolverine
40 also, is that part of this proposal?
41
42 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
45
46 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, Madame Chair. Our
47 regulatory folks that were working with us suggested
48 this was the only place we could shoehorn this same day
49 airborne. It did not change any of the other
50 regulations for any other species, but it's sought to

1 address the caribou hunting only and for this area.
2 And that's my understanding.

3
4 Thank you.

5
6 But that -- that's the avenue in the
7 regulation where you can make it fit.

8
9 Thank you.

10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. There's
12 been a motion and second.

13
14 MS. MORRIS LYON: I still have a
15 question for.....

16
17 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Susan. Okay.
18 Susan, do you have a comment?

19
20 MS. HENRY: I was requesting a --
21 Madame Chairman, a clarification from my colleagues
22 here noticing that the same day airborne is only for
23 the part from January through the end of March, that
24 they're -- we're not addressing same day airborne in
25 what we're talking about now from August through
26 December. And that's the discussion of skis.

27
28 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, thanks
29 for catching that.

30
31 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

32
33 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

34
35 MR. O'HARA: I don't know, Richard, did
36 you get your answer that this is only for caribou and
37 not for other things; is that right?

38
39 MR. WILSON: Yes, I did.

40
41 MR. O'HARA: Okay.

42
43 MR. WILSON: Yes, and I just -- you
44 know it -- just a couple proposals ago we're trying to
45 look to see how unit 9 residents might fit into some of
46 this and I wonder if there was every any opportunity
47 here if we were to, you know, go this route, that we
48 would -- we would maybe include specific -- what would
49 you be, residents from the east side here, Federally
50 qualified.

1 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

4

5 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair. While
6 we're thinking about that, just a quick acknowledge of
7 Susanna Henry there. We did talk about what dates on
8 aerial hunting, same day airborne and we specifically
9 wanted to limit it to that time period, throw it wide
10 open and it would be very difficult to control, people
11 land on the beach in the fall and such and it could get
12 out of control too easy. The hope was that this
13 shorter period it would be more manageable and you
14 wouldn't have the problems of excessive harvest or
15 traffic.

16

17 Thank you.

18

19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yeah, I guess
20 Richard's concern is already -- any place in here that
21 would allow these people from the east villages to get
22 involved with the harvest here, harvest of the Nushagak
23 Peninsula Caribou Herd?

24

25 Robbin.

26

27 MS. LA VINE: Madame Chair. I just
28 want to kind of clarify what you may be suggesting. I
29 know that there was some discussion of opening up the
30 C&T. I have here in the summary on page 120, customary
31 and traditional use determinations. So residents of
32 units 9B, 17, Lime Village and Stony River do have a
33 customary and traditional use determination for caribou
34 in unit 17 in general. However by regulation Federal
35 public lands on the Nushagak Peninsula are closed to
36 the harvest except by the residents. of Togiak, Twin
37 Hills, Manokotak, Aleknagik, Dillingham, Clark's Point
38 and Ekuk. So this proposal only addresses those
39 Federally-qualified subsistence users who have
40 customary and traditional use determination for the
41 Nushagak Peninsula Caribou Herd and caribou only. If
42 you are interested in -- and again what we were looking
43 at was changing method of means, so allowing folks only
44 from those seven communities access to the caribou herd
45 by plane and that they could have same day airborne
46 harvestability. I think if we were to expand the
47 customary and traditional use determination for the
48 Nushagak Peninsula Caribou Herd that might be a
49 different proposition, a different kind of action and
50 may not be addressed by this proposal if -- unless

1 anyone wants to go a little deeper into than I at this
2 point.

3

4 Thank you.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.

7

8 MR. MIKE: Yes, thank you, Madame Chair
9 and Robbin. To expand the C&T determination you would
10 have to submit a different proposal to address C&T for
11 people in unit 9C to hunt in unit 17. So that would be
12 a separate wildlife or C&T proposal process.

13

14 Thank you.

15

16 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

17

18 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

19

20 MR. O'HARA: I think we as Council
21 members I'd like to recognize Courtenay. I think we --
22 I know we're at the end of the day and, you know, if
23 you don't -- if the Council doesn't mind she has -- I'd
24 like to have her speak to this.

25

26 MS. CARTY: Is that fine, Madame
27 Chairman?

28

29 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yes.

30

31 MS. CARTY: Thank you. Through the
32 Chair. I guess I'm hearing a couple different things
33 and I just wanted to maybe try to help piece this
34 together for you guys. When we went to the first
35 proposal and you guys were discussing on the record the
36 option of including all of the harvesters that have C&T
37 because we already have the C&T for the unit 17 caribou
38 for 9B users. In the original proposals you guys -- at
39 one point in time I actually thought you guys were
40 going to make an amendment to open it up, not just
41 increase the season dates, but also allow for our
42 neighbors on the east side to harvest as well. So if
43 the Council wanted to allow for that opportunity then
44 perhaps you would have to reconsider your original
45 motion, add that amendment in, and then it would
46 provide access for those people with the C&T finding
47 and then if this proposal is adopted for airborne then
48 everybody with that C&T finding would be allowed to
49 access with that method and means. Does that make a
50 little bit of sense?

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Yes.
2
3 MS. CARTY: And i don't know what your
4 proposal is for reconsidering, I know like Board of
5 Fish you have to have two members within 24 hours who
6 want to reconsider the vote, but that could potentially
7 be an option maybe.
8
9 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.
10
11 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
12
13 MR. DUNAWAY: Well, when I read --
14 actually read this customary and traditional
15 determination in here, I suspect that that C&T for
16 Nushagak Caribou is kind of year round. And so you'd
17 still have to have a total separate -- address that
18 regulation and couldn't just roll it into a season
19 change or bag limit change, I think you'd have to
20 address the C&T is what I'm guessing looking at that.
21
22 Thank you.
23
24 MS. CARTY: So perhaps in the next
25 cycle you guys could put forward a proposal to do that.
26 But I guess I just have a question on that process
27 because the C&T says residents of unit B, 17, Lime
28 Village and Stony River have a customary and
29 traditional use determination for caribou in unit 19 --
30 in unit 17. Sorry, it is late. However by regulation
31 it's only accessible -- I mean, the lands are closed so
32 you would have to do a regulation to change the
33 accessibility, open those lands. And I don't know if
34 that's a C&T regulation, I don't think C&T is a
35 regulation.
36
37 MR. DUNAWAY: It is.
38
39 MS. CARTY: It.....
40
41 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: That -- to
42 open it's not.
43
44 MS. CARTY: Yeah, so that would.....
45
46 MS. MORRIS LYON: That's where they
47 introduce caribou herd.
48
49 MS. CARTY: Yeah, so that was I was
50 saying. If you opened up your original action on the

1 caribou herd itself and offered a proposed amendment to
2 strike that language and open it up. It could be
3 something saved for another regulatory cycle or even a
4 special action request at some point in time.

5

6 MR. DUNAWAY: Madame Chair.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

9

10 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, I'm getting really
11 fuzzy headed and I'm looking for some real legal
12 beagles here that would help us.

13

14 Thank you.

15

16 MS. PETRIVELLI: Hello, my name's Pat
17 Petrivelli and I'm just going to -- hopefully I'll add
18 some comments.

19

20 Richard asked if the people on the east
21 side could come, but he -- you're in 9C, right, you
22 live in 9C?

23

24 MR. WILSON: Yes, 9C.

25

26 MS. PETRIVELLI: But the C&T
27 determination is for residents of unit 17 and 9B,
28 that's a C&T determination. The restrictions that
29 Robbin read was an 804 determination. And then that
30 804 determination is made when there's a resource
31 shortage and you restrict the pool of C&T users to a
32 smaller pool. Now this 804 determination could be
33 changed and it would make sense to say why are you
34 having this 804 determination and making restrictions
35 on subsistence users when you're allowing same day
36 airborne hunting, the most liberal harvest access and
37 you're lengthening the season and you're increasing the
38 harvest limit. Now that -- I think there would be
39 authority in modifying a proposal to take off the 804
40 restriction which would take off what -- what -- the
41 804 restriction restricted the harvest to Manokotak,
42 Twin Hills, and you could read that, that's an 804
43 restriction that's made. It's also made to continue
44 subsistence uses. So it could be argued one way or the
45 other. But I think it would be perfectly legitimate to
46 expand the pool to all eligible users with a C&T
47 determination which would be 17, but -- what Robbin
48 read before. But technically 804 determinations are
49 usually made when you make restrictions amongst
50 eligible users and the current eligible users are unit

1 17 and 9B.

2

3 Thank you.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Robbin.

6

7 MS. LA VINE: Yes, through the Chair.

8 I do not believe -- I think this is a very unique case
9 and because this is an introduced caribou herd I do not
10 believe an 804 was ever conducted, I believe it was
11 part of the working group plan.

12

13 MS. PETRIVELLI: Well, I think there
14 was discussions and it might not have been called an
15 804, but I think they made it with the knowledge and I
16 think Dan would have been here then too, that to
17 restrict the harvest to just those people and that was
18 necessary at that time. And I think they -- but I
19 remember -- and I looked back in the early ones and I
20 think it was a special, but.....

21

22 MS. LA VINE: A special action.....

23

24 MS. PETRIVELLI: Yeah.

25

26 MS. LA VINE:is usually.....

27

28 MS. PETRIVELLI: But regardless it's
29 technically an 804 because it has restricted the
30 harvest to a smaller group of users than who are
31 eligible.

32

33 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

36

37 MR. O'HARA: Well, I'm barely going to
38 vote for this anyway. And to expand it as much as we'd
39 like to and we're in 9B which doesn't come into 17C so
40 I'm not sure we can do it. And I would vote for the
41 motion the way it is, but I -- I think we're going to
42 put too much pressure on too small a group of animals.
43 And I think you ought to see what happens the first
44 year to see whether this is even going to work or not
45 because this is a very special project and it's a very
46 successful one and it's one that can be repeat other
47 places because it does have a great deal of success,
48 but barely. And I am -- in my estimation same day as
49 airborne is good anyway.

50

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. Where
2 are we. We're through with the process. I think there
3 was a motion.

4
5 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.

6
7 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard, did
8 you have a comment?

9
10 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair. So the
11 answer to me is no, we can't. So it -- I want to make
12 sure that's clear. I'm kind of fuzzy up here.

13
14 Thank you.

15
16 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Robbin.

17
18 MS. LA VINE: Through the Chair. What
19 you're voting on today I believe is something that can
20 only be addressed -- can only address the people
21 currently with customary and traditional use
22 determination for caribou, the Nushagak Peninsula
23 Caribou Herd. So it will only impact or provide access
24 to those folks already eligible to harvest the Nushagak
25 Peninsula Caribou. And if you are interested in
26 expanding the user base then that would be a different
27 action that you would take probably in the future. And
28 I would like to consult with my team to know exactly
29 what would be the next step. But for this you can
30 decide whether those seven communities should have same
31 day airborne harvest as part of their method and means
32 to access the Nushagak Peninsula Caribou Herd.

33
34 Thank you.

35
36
37 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.

38
39 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.

40
41 MR. O'HARA: If you want -- if
42 Richard's not satisfied with that answer we could table
43 this until tomorrow and you can get the legal
44 department to go after it if you really want to get
45 serious about this, you know. I mean, I -- you guys
46 are fine, but I'm sure there's people who can tell you
47 from the legal department whether we can do this or
48 not. But it's kind of the call. It doesn't make any
49 difference to me.

50

1 Thank you, Madame Chair.
2
3 MR. WILSON: Madame Chair.
4
5 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Richard.
6
7 MR. WILSON: Yeah, Madame Chair. No,
8 I'm fine here. I just was digging here trying to, you
9 know, see if there's opportunity under this proposal,
10 you know, to be modified or like Courtenay was saying,
11 you know, prior to the -- maybe adjust some prior ones,
12 you know, with their time limits, but I guess that
13 window is closed.
14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Carl.
16
17 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you, Madame Chair
18 and through the Chair to address several folks. It's
19 not really a legal question as much as it is a
20 procedural one in that the potential communities to
21 whom there could be an expansion in the C&T have not
22 been analyzed. So and it's not part of the public
23 notice about what would be addressed, it hasn't been
24 considered or contemplated. So there would be no way
25 to give a recommendation to the Board without the
26 underlying analysis by the anthropology staff. So the
27 most sensible course of action if this is something you
28 wish to do is what Robbin has already suggested and
29 that is implement as is now and if you want to expand
30 then the next wildlife proposal cycle would be the time
31 to introduce a proposal that would expand the C&T based
32 to include other communities.
33
34 Thank you, Madame Chair.
35
36 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
37
38 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
39
40 MR. O'HARA: Question.
41
42 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. The
43 question's been called, all in favor say aye.
44
45 IN UNISON: Aye.
46
47 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Any
48 opposition?
49
50 (No opposing votes)

1 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. That's
2 carried. And it's 6:15. I think we have a couple more
3 -- two more wildlife proposals we could take up first
4 thing tomorrow morning.
5
6 MR. O'HARA: Yes.
7
8 MR. WILSON: Thank you.
9
10 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: So we'll break
11 until -- what time tomorrow?
12
13 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
14
15 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
16
17 MR. O'HARA: 6:00 o'clock.
18
19 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: No, that's too
20 early.
21
22 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair.
23
24 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Donald.
25
26 MR. MIKE: We can meet at 8:30 or 9:00.
27
28 Thank you, Madame Chair.
29
30 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: 9:00 o'clock,
31 8:30.
32
33 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair.
34
35 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Dan.
36
37 MR. O'HARA: Madame Chair. If we
38 finished up and went up to Aleknagik and looked at a
39 new bridge.
40
41 MR. MIKE: Madame Chair. I suggest we
42 start at 8:30 and then head up to Aleknagik.
43
44 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Oh, head up to
45 Aleknagik for the afternoon?
46
47 MR. O'HARA: Just to adjourn.
48
49 MADAME CHAIR CHYTHLOOK: Okay. 8:30
50 tomorrow morning. And I think we could leave our books

1 here.

2

3

(Off record)

4

5

(PROCEEDINGS TO BE CONTINUED)

