

CODE OF FEDERAL REGULATIONS

TITLE 43—PUBLIC LANDS: INTERIOR

PART 4—DEPARTMENT HEARINGS AND APPEALS PROCEDURES

Current as of October 1, 2011

Subpart B—General Rules Relating to Procedures and Practice

Sec.

4.20 Purpose.

4.21 General provisions.

4.22 Documents.

4.23 Transcript of hearings.

4.24 Basis of decision.

4.25 Oral argument.

4.26 Subpoena power and witness provisions generally.

4.27 Standards of conduct.

4.28 Interlocutory appeals.

4.29 Remands from courts.

4.30 Information required by forms.

4.31 Request for limiting disclosure of confidential information.

AUTHORITY: 5 U.S.C. 301; 43 U.S.C. 1201.

§ 4.20 Purpose.

In the interest of establishing and maintaining uniformity to the extent feasible, this subpart sets forth general rules applicable to all types of proceedings before the Hearings Division and the several Appeals Boards of the Office of Hearings and Appeals.

§ 4.21 General provisions.

(a) Effect of decision pending appeal. Except as otherwise provided by law or other pertinent regulation:

(1) A decision will not be effective during the time in which a person adversely affected may file a notice of appeal; when the public interest requires, however, the Director or an Appeals Board may provide that a decision, or any part of a decision, shall be in full force and effective immediately;

(2) A decision will become effective on the day after the expiration of the time during which a person adversely affected may file a notice of appeal unless a petition for a stay pending appeal is filed together with a timely notice of appeal; a petition for a stay may be filed only by a party who may properly maintain an appeal;

(3) A decision, or that portion of a decision, for which a stay is not granted will become effective immediately after the Director or an Appeals Board denies or partially denies the

petition for a stay, or fails to act on the petition within the time specified in paragraph (b)(4) of this section.

(b) Standards and procedures for obtaining a stay. Except as otherwise provided by law or other pertinent regulation:

(1) A petition for a stay of a decision pending appeal shall show sufficient justification based on the following standards:

- (i) The relative harm to the parties if the stay is granted or denied,
- (ii) The likelihood of the appellant's success on the merits,
- (iii) The likelihood of immediate and irreparable harm if the stay is not granted, and
- (iv) Whether the public interest favors granting the stay;

(2) The appellant requesting the stay bears the burden of proof to demonstrate that a stay should be granted;

(3) The appellant shall serve a copy of its notice of appeal and petition for a stay on each party named in the decision from which the appeal is taken, and on the Director or the Appeals Board to which the appeal is taken, at the same time such documents are served on the appropriate officer of the Department; any party, including the officer who made the decision being appealed, may file a response to the stay petition within 10 days after service; failure to file a response shall not result in a default on the question of whether a stay should be granted; service shall be made by delivering copies personally or by sending them by registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; and

(4) The Director or an Appeals Board shall grant or deny a petition for a stay pending appeal, either in whole or in part, on the basis of the factors listed in paragraph (b)(1) of this section, within 45 calendar days of the expiration of the time for filing a notice of appeal.

(c) Exhaustion of administrative remedies. No decision which at the time of its rendition is subject to appeal to the Director or an Appeals Board shall be considered final so as to be agency action subject to judicial review under 5 U.S.C. 704, unless a petition for a stay of decision has been timely filed and the decision being appealed has been made effective in the manner provided in paragraphs (a)(3) or (b)(4) of this section or a decision has been made effective pending appeal pursuant to paragraph (a)(1) of this section or pursuant to other pertinent regulation.

(d) Finality of decision. No further appeal will lie in the Department from a decision of the Director or an Appeals Board of the Office of Hearings and Appeals. Unless otherwise provided by regulation, reconsideration of a decision may be granted only in extraordinary circumstances where, in the judgment of the Director or an Appeals Board, sufficient reason appears therefor. Requests for reconsideration must be filed promptly, or within the time required by the regulations relating to the particular type of proceeding concerned, and must state with particularity the error claimed. The filing and pendency of a request for reconsideration shall not operate to stay the effectiveness of the decision involved unless so ordered by the Director or an Appeals Board. A request for reconsideration need not be filed to exhaust administrative remedies.

§ 4.22 Documents.

(a) Filing of documents. A document is filed in the Office where the filing is required only when the document is received in that office during its regular business hours and by a

person authorized to receive it. A document received after the office's regular business hours is considered filed on the next business day.

(b) Service generally. A copy of each document filed in a proceeding before the Office of Hearings and Appeals must be served by the filing party on the other party or parties in the case, except as otherwise provided by § 4.31. In all cases where a party is represented by an attorney, such attorney will be recognized as fully controlling the case on behalf of his/her client, and service of any document relating to the proceeding shall be made upon such attorney in addition to any other service specifically required by law or by order of a presiding official or an appeals board. Where a party is represented by more than one attorney, service upon one of the attorneys shall be sufficient.

(c) Retention of documents. All documents, books, records, papers, etc., received in evidence in a hearing or submitted for the record in any proceeding before the Office of Hearings and Appeals will be retained with the official record of the proceedings. However, the withdrawal of original documents may be permitted while the case is pending upon the submission of true copies in lieu thereof. When a decision has become final, an appeals board in its discretion may, upon request and after notice to the other party or parties, permit the withdrawal of original exhibits or any part thereof by the party entitled thereto. The substitution of true copies of exhibits or any part thereof may be required by the Board in its discretion as a condition of granting permission for such withdrawal. Transcripts of testimony and/or documents received or reviewed pursuant to § 4.31 of these rules shall be sealed against disclosure to unauthorized persons and retained with the official record, subject to the withdrawal and substitution provisions hereof.

(d) Record address. Every person who files a document for the record in connection with any proceeding before the Office of Hearings and Appeals shall at the time of his initial filing in the matter state his address. Thereafter he must promptly inform the office in which the matter is pending of any change in address, giving the docket or other appropriate numbers of all matters in which he has made such a filing. The successors of such person shall likewise promptly inform such office of their interest in the matters and state their addresses. If a person fails to furnish a record address as required herein, he will not be entitled to notice in connection with the proceedings.

(e) Computation of time for filing and service. Except as otherwise provided by law, in computing any period of time prescribed for filing and serving a document, the day upon which the decision or document to be appealed from or answered was served or the day of any other event after which the designated period of time begins to run is not to be included. The last day of the period so computed is to be included, unless it is a Saturday, Sunday, Federal legal holiday, or other nonbusiness day, in which event the period runs until the end of the next day which is not a Saturday, Sunday, Federal legal holiday, or other nonbusiness day. When the time prescribed or allowed is 7 days or less, intermediate Saturdays, Sundays, Federal legal holidays and other nonbusiness days shall be excluded in the computation.

(f) Extensions of time. (1) The time for filing or serving any document may be extended by the Appeals Board or other officer before whom the proceeding is pending, except for the time for filing a notice of appeal and except where such extension is contrary to law or regulation.

(2) A request for an extension of time must be filed within the time allowed for the filing or serving of the document and must be filed in the same office in which the document in connection with which the extension is requested must be filed.

§ 4.23 Transcript of hearings.

Hearings will be recorded verbatim and transcripts thereof shall be made when requested by interested parties, costs of transcripts to be borne by the requesting parties. Fees for transcripts prepared from recordings by Office of Hearings and Appeals employees will be at rates which cover the cost of manpower, machine use and materials, plus 25 percent, adjusted to the nearest 5 cents. If the reporting is done pursuant to a contract between the reporter and the Department of the Interior Agency or office which is involved in the proceeding, or the Office of Hearings and Appeals, fees for transcripts will be at rates established by the contract.

§ 4.24 Basis of decision.

(a) Record. (1) The record of a hearing shall consist of the transcript of testimony or summary of testimony and exhibits together with all papers and requests filed in the hearing.

(2) If a hearing has been held on an appeal pursuant to instructions of an Appeals Board, this record shall be the sole basis for decision insofar as the referred issues of fact are involved except to the extent that official notice may be taken of a fact as provided in paragraph (b) of this section.

(3) Where a hearing has been held in other proceedings, the record made shall be the sole basis for decision except to the extent that official notice may be taken of a fact as provided in paragraph (b) of this section.

(4) In any case, no decision after a hearing or on appeal shall be based upon any record, statement, file, or similar document which is not open to inspection by the parties to the hearing or appeal, except for documents or other evidence received or reviewed pursuant to § 4.31(d).

(b) Official notice. Official notice may be taken of the public records of the Department of the Interior and of any matter of which the courts may take judicial notice.

§ 4.25 Oral argument.

The Director or an Appeals Board may, in their discretion, grant an opportunity for oral argument.

§ 4.26 Subpoena power and witness provisions generally.

(a) Compulsory attendance of witnesses. The administrative law judge, on his own motion, or on written application of a party, is authorized to issue subpoenas requiring the attendance of witnesses at hearings to be held before him or at the taking of depositions to be held before himself or other officers. Subpoenas will be issued on a form approved by the Director. A subpoena may be served by any person who is not a party and is not less than 18 years of age, and the original subpoena bearing a certificate of service shall be filed with the administrative law judge. A witness may be required to attend a deposition or hearing at a place not more than 100 miles from the place of service.

(b) Application for subpoena. Where the file has not yet been transmitted to the administrative law judge, the application for a subpoena may be filed in the office of the officer who made the decision appealed from, or in the office of the Bureau of Land Management in

which the complaint was filed, in which cases such offices will forward the application to the examiner.

(c) Fees payable to witnesses. (1) Witnesses subpoenaed by any party shall be paid the same fees and mileage as are paid for like service in the District Courts of the United States. The witness fees and mileage shall be paid by the party at whose instance the witness appears.

(2) Any witness who attends any hearing or the taking of any deposition at the request of any party to the controversy without having been subpoenaed to do so shall be entitled to the same mileage and attendance fees, to be paid by such party, to which he would have been entitled if he had been first duly subpoenaed as a witness on behalf of such party. This paragraph does not apply to Government employees who are called as witnesses by the Government.

§ 4.27 Standards of conduct.

(a) Inquiries. All inquiries with respect to any matter pending before the Office of Hearings and Appeals shall be directed to the Director, the Chief Administrative Law Judge, or the Chairman of the appropriate Board.

(b) Ex parte communication--(1) Prohibition. Except to the extent required for the disposition of ex parte matters as authorized by law, there shall be no communication concerning the merits of a proceeding between any party to the proceeding or any person interested in the proceeding or any representative of a party or interested person and any Office personnel involved or who may reasonably be expected to become involved in the decisionmaking process on that proceeding, unless the communication, if oral, is made in the presence of all other parties or their representatives, or, if written, is furnished to all other parties. Proceedings include cases pending before the Office, rulemakings amending this Part 4 that might affect a pending case, requests for reconsideration or review by the Director, and any other related action pending before the Office. The terms "interested person" and "person interested in the proceeding" include any individual or other person with an interest in the agency proceeding that is greater than the interest that the public as a whole may have. This regulation does not prohibit communications concerning case status or advice concerning compliance with procedural requirements unless the area of inquiry is in fact an area of controversy in the proceeding. Any oral communication made in violation of this regulation shall be reduced to writing in a memorandum to the file by the person receiving the communication and shall be included in the record. Any written communication made in violation of this regulation shall be included in the record. In proceedings other than informal rulemakings copies of the memorandum or communication shall be provided to all parties, who shall be given an opportunity to respond in writing.

(2) Sanctions. The administrative law judge, board, or Director who has responsibility for the matter with respect to which a prohibited communication has been knowingly made may impose appropriate sanctions on the offending person or persons, which may include requiring an offending party to show cause why its claim, motion, or interest should not be dismissed, denied, or otherwise adversely affected; disciplining offending Office personnel pursuant to the Department's standards of conduct (43 CFR part 20); and invoking such sanctions against other offending persons as may be appropriate under the circumstances.

(c) Disqualification. (1) An Office of Hearings and Appeals deciding official must withdraw from a case if circumstances exist that would disqualify a judge in such circumstances under the recognized canons of judicial ethics.

(2) A party may file a motion seeking the disqualification of a deciding official, setting forth in detail the circumstances that the party believes require disqualification. Any supporting facts must be established by affidavit or other sufficient evidence. A copy of the motion should be sent to the Director.

(3) The head of the appropriate unit within the Office or the Director may decide whether disqualification is required if the deciding official does not withdraw under paragraph (c)(1) of this section or in response to a motion under paragraph (c)(2) of this section.

(4) For purposes of this section, “deciding official” includes an attorney decision maker or Indian probate judge as defined in § 4.201, an administrative law judge, an administrative judge, or a member of any Board.

§ 4.28 Interlocutory appeals.

There shall be no interlocutory appeal from a ruling of an administrative law judge unless permission is first obtained from an Appeals Board and an administrative law judge has certified the interlocutory ruling or abused his discretion in refusing a request to so certify. Permission will not be granted except upon a showing that the ruling complained of involves a controlling question of law and that an immediate appeal therefrom may materially advance the final decision. An interlocutory appeal shall not operate to suspend the hearing unless otherwise ordered by the Board.

§ 4.29 Remands from courts.

Whenever any matter is remanded from any court for further proceedings, and to the extent the court’s directive and time limitations will permit, the parties shall be allowed an opportunity to submit to the appropriate Appeals Board, a report recommending procedures to be followed in order to comply with the court’s order. The Board will review the reports and enter special orders governing the handling of matters remanded to it for further proceedings by any court.

§ 4.30 Information required by forms.

Whenever a regulation of the Office of Hearing and Appeals requires a form approved or prescribed by the Director, the Director may in that form require the submission of any information which he considers to be necessary for the effective administration of that regulation.

§ 4.31 Request for limiting disclosure of confidential information.

(a) If any person submitting a document in a proceeding under this part claims that some or all of the information contained in that document is exempt from the mandatory public disclosure requirements of the Freedom of Information Act (5 U.S.C. 552), is information referred to in section 1905 of title 18 of the United States Code (disclosure of confidential information), or is otherwise exempt by law from public disclosure, the person:

(1) Must indicate in the document that it is exempt, or contains information which is exempt, from disclosure;

(2) Must request the presiding officer or appeals board not to disclose such information except to the parties to the proceeding under the conditions provided in paragraphs (b) and (c) of this section, and must serve the request upon the parties to the proceeding. The request shall include the following items:

(i) A copy of the document from which has been deleted the information for which the person requests nondisclosure; if it is not practicable to submit such copy of the document because deletion of the information would render the document unintelligible, a description of the document may be substituted;

(ii) A statement specifying why the information is confidential, if the information for which nondisclosure is requested is claimed to come within the exception in 5 U.S.C. 552(b)(4) for trade secrets and commercial or financial information:

(iii) A statement specifying the justification for nondisclosure, if the information for which nondisclosure is requested is not within the exception in 5 U.S.C. 552(b)(4).

(b) If information is submitted in accordance with paragraph (a) of this section, the information will not be disclosed except as provided in the Freedom of Information Act, in accordance with part 2 of this title, or upon request from a party to the proceeding under the restrictions stated in paragraph (c) of this section.

(c) At any time, a party may request the presiding officer or appeals board to direct a person submitting information under paragraph (a) of this section to provide that information to the party. The presiding officer or board will so direct, unless paragraph (d) of this section is applicable, if the party requesting the information agrees under oath in writing:

(1) Not to use or disclose the information except in the context of the proceeding conducted pursuant to this part; and

(2) To return all copies of the information at the conclusion of the proceeding to the person submitting the information under paragraph (a) of this section.

(d) If any person submitting a document in a proceeding under this Part other than a hearing conducted pursuant to 5 U.S.C. 554 claims that a disclosure of information in that document to another party to the proceeding is prohibited by law, notwithstanding the protection provided under paragraph (c) of this section, such person:

(1) Must indicate in the original document that it contains information of which disclosure is prohibited;

(2) Must request that the presiding officer or appeals board review such evidence as a basis for its decision without disclosing it to the other party or parties, and serve the request upon the parties to the proceeding. The request shall include a copy of the document or description as required by paragraph (a)(2)(i) of this section and state why disclosure is prohibited, citing pertinent statutory or regulatory authority. If the prohibition on disclosure is intended to protect the interest of a person who is not a party to the proceeding, the party making the request must demonstrate that such person refused to consent to the disclosure of the evidence to other parties to the proceeding.

(3) If the presiding officer or an appeals board denies the request, the person who made the request shall be given an opportunity to withdraw the evidence before it is considered by the presiding official or board unless a Freedom of Information Act request, administrative appeal from the denial of a request, or lawsuit seeking release of the information is pending.

(e) If the person submitting a document does not submit the copy of the document or description required by paragraph (a)(2)(i) or (d)(2) of this section, the presiding officer or

appeals board may assume that there is no objection to public disclosure of the document in its entirety.

(f) Where a decision by a presiding officer or appeals board is based in whole or in part on evidence not included in the public record or disclosed to all parties, the decision shall so state, specifying the nature of the evidence and the provision of law under which disclosure was denied, and the evidence so considered shall be retained under seal as part of the official record.