

0001

EASTERN INTERIOR ALASKA SUBSISTENCE
REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL

PUBLIC MEETING

VOLUME I

Community Hall
Arctic Village, Alaska
October 4, 2023
9:02 a.m.

COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT:

Sue Entsminger, Chair
Andrew Bassich
Linda Evans
Amanda Pope
Dorothy Shockley
Donald Woodruff
Robert Wright
Charlie Jagow

Regional Council Coordinator, Brooke McDavid

Recorded and transcribed by:

Computer Matrix Court Reporters, LLC
329 F Street, Suite 222
Anchorage, AK 99501
907-227-5312/sahile@gci.net

0002

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2

3

(Arctic Village, Alaska - 10/4/2023)

4

5

(Invocation)

6

7

(On record)

8

9

10 call.

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Don, roll

11

12

MS. MCDAVID: Say the time we start.

13

14

MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame Chair.

15

16

(No comments)

17

18

MR. WOODRUFF: Linda Evans.

19

20

21 microphone.

REPORTER: Wait. Don. Your

22

23

24

So everybody remember, you have to turn
your mic on, and you have to talk in the mic. We're on
a new Program and the people on the phone cannot hear
you apparently unless you're talking right in the
microphone. Thanks.

25

26

27

28

29

MR. WOODRUFF: This is roll call.

30

31

REPORTER: Thank you, Don.

32

33

MR. WOODRUFF: Eva Burke.

34

35

(No comments)

36

37

MR. WOODRUFF: Linda Evans.

38

39

MS. EVANS: Here.

40

41

MR. WOODRUFF: Amanda Pope.

42

43

(No comments)

44

45

MR. WOODRUFF: Bill Glanz.

46

47

MS. POPE: I'm here.

48

49

REPORTER: Amanda's online.

50

0003

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Tina said
2 Amanda's on.

3
4 MR. WOODRUFF: Oh, good, thank you
5 Amanda.

6
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Tina said
8 there's two people online.

9
10 REPORTER: Well, there's probably more,
11 but two Council members, Amanda and Andy.

12
13 MR. WOODRUFF: Bill Glanz.

14
15 (No comments)

16
17 MR. WOODRUFF: Andrew Bassich.

18
19 REPORTER: Andy's online too. I'm not
20 sure why he's not coming through.

21
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: He should be
23 online, yes.

24
25 MR. WOODRUFF: Charlie Wright.

26
27 MR. WRIGHT: Here.

28
29 MR. WOODRUFF: Charlie Jagow.

30
31 MS. MCDAVID: Charlie will be joining
32 us later this morning.

33
34 MR. WOODRUFF: Me, Don Woodruff, is
35 here.

36
37 Dorothy Shockley.

38
39 MS. SHOCKLEY: Here.

40
41 MR. WOODRUFF: All right. Oh, sorry,
42 Sue.

43
44 (Laughter)

45
46 MR. WOODRUFF: Sue Entsminger.

47
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Here. Okay,
49 thank you. I do want to check. Eva was going to be
50

0004

1 online, Eva, if you are online we did not hear you.

2

3 (No comments)

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And Andy was
6 supposed to be online. Andy Bassich, are you online.

7

8 (No comments)

9

10 REPORTER: Well, he was online, maybe
11 problems with the mute again, I don't know.

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I have
14 a one minute audio from Andy Bassich that I should
15 listen to. But we do have a quorum, correct.

16

17 MS. MCDAVID: We have seven out of 10
18 Council members with two online so we have quorum.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, I
21 didn't hear Andy but they're telling me Andy's online.
22 So moving forward, meeting announcements.

23

24 Brooke.

25

26 MS. MCDAVID: Yes, good morning
27 everyone and welcome to the Eastern Interior
28 Subsistence Regional Advisory Council meeting. The
29 Council is here in Arctic Village, and Mahsi'Choo to
30 the Arctic Village Council and the Arctic Village
31 community for hosting us. We're so glad to be here,
32 the Council has been wanting to hold a meeting here for
33 several years now so it's great that it finally has
34 worked out.

35

36 I just have a couple of housekeeping
37 announcements before we get started.

38

39 There is a sign-in sheet on the table
40 by the door. If you could sign in each morning that
41 just gives us a record of who all was in attendance.
42 And if you're joining us on the phone you can find the
43 agenda and the meeting materials online on the Federal
44 Subsistence Management Program website, that's
45 doi.gov/subsistence and under the regions tab you'll
46 find Eastern Interior, and then meeting materials.
47 There was, unfortunately, a misprint on the copy of the
48 agenda for the teleconference phone number. So the
49 correct number, if you haven't found it already, I just

50

0005

1 did send out an email to regional contacts to correct
2 it, is 1833- -- so it's 833 instead of 866 -- 1-833-
3 436-1163, and the conference ID is still correct. So
4 our apologies for that, for that error.

5
6 It's 1-833-436-1163.

7
8 And for all participants that might be
9 calling in on the phone please remember to mute your
10 phones when you're not speaking. You can use the mute
11 button on your phone, or press star, six. If you
12 aren't muted and it's disruptive we'll give you
13 reminders throughout the meeting.

14
15 During this meeting we do invite public
16 comments on both agenda items and non-agenda items so
17 if you're here in person and you'd like to give a
18 comment to the Council there are little blue sign up
19 cards on the back table, they look like this, you can
20 fill those out and bring those up to me. You can
21 comment on any of the items that are on the agenda.
22 And also each morning we will have an opportunity for
23 comments on non-agenda items that are related to
24 subsistence. So just let us know, if you're here in
25 the room, with one of those blue cards if you'd like to
26 comment, and if you're on the phone and would like to
27 comment on an item when we get to it, you can start out
28 by addressing the Chair, Madame Chair, or Mr. Chair,
29 and wait to be called on.

30
31 I would also like to announce that we
32 are going to cover the Arctic Village Sheep Management
33 Area Closure Review as a time certain item and that
34 will be today starting at 5 p.m. The community has
35 requested that we do that in the evening and the Chair
36 has agreed that we will do an evening session so that
37 folks in the community can join us when they get off of
38 work. So head's up to folks on the phone. So that
39 will be the Arctic Village Sheep Management Closure
40 Review starting at 5 p.m., today.

41
42 Finally, we also accept written
43 comments. If you would like to give a written comment
44 here in the room you can pass that to me and I will
45 give it to the Chair. If you are online and would like
46 to submit a written comment on any agenda items or non-
47 agenda items, you can email those to
48 subsistence@fws.gov, and make sure you include your
49 name and the topic that you would like to comment on.
50

0006

1 I do have one Council membership
2 update. We do have a new Council member joining us
3 today, Dorothy Shockley from Manley Hot Springs, and
4 we'd like to welcome Dorothy to the Council and thank
5 you for volunteering to represent subsistence users in
6 the region.

7
8 And, finally.....

9
10 MS. SHOCKLEY: Thank you.

11
12 MS. MCDAVID: You're welcome.

13
14 And, finally, just a reminder about
15 conduct and ethics. We just ask that everyone be
16 respectful today and tomorrow during discussions and
17 comments. We know there's a lot of issues that are
18 close to people's heart and that matter a lot, and
19 we're all happy to engage in discussion as long as it's
20 respectful.

21
22 And also a reminder, when the Council
23 enters discussion amongst Council members and we have
24 moved past the public comment period on proposals, we
25 ask that folks on the phone and in the room don't chime
26 in once Council discussion and deliberation has
27 started.

28
29 And I think that's all for me.

30
31 I guess one more thing, sorry.

32
33 If there is any items on the agenda
34 that Council members feel like you have a conflict of
35 interest just state that for the record and we will
36 move forward.

37
38 Thank you.

39
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
41 Brooke. Any questions, Council members.

42
43 (No comments)

44
45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Next
46 on the agenda is our welcome. Welcome everyone to the
47 Eastern Interior Regional Advisory Council's biannual
48 meeting. Introduction to everyone, maybe we'll start
49 with Council members and then go around the room.

50

0007

1 Don.

2

3 MR. WRIGHT: Go with the sun.

4

5

6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go with the
7 sun. Charlie says I should go with the sun, okay, I'm
8 going to start with -- so we'll just start with
9 everybody in the room. Yes, go ahead.

10

11 MS. QUILLIN: Hi everybody, my name is
12 Michelle.....

13

14 REPORTER: Sorry, can you come on up so
15 we can get it on record.

16

17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Unfortunately
18 we need everybody on the recording so.

19

20 REPORTER: Thank you.

21

22 MS. QUILLIN: Good morning. My name is
23 Michelle Quillin. I'm from Hughes, Alaska and I
24 currently work for Tanana Chiefs Conference. Thank
25 you.

26

27 MS. WILLIAMS: Good morning. This is
28 Liz Williams, I'm an Anthropologist at the Office of
29 Subsistence Management at Fish and Wildlife Service.

30

31 MR. CEBRIAN: Good morning. My name
32 is Merben Cebrian. I am the Refuge Manager for Arctic
33 Refuge. Thank you.

34

35 MS. WESSELS: Good morning. My name is
36 Katya Wessels and I'm Council Coordination Division
37 Supervisor with OSM.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Tina.

40

41 REPORTER: What?

42

43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go ahead.

44

45 REPORTER: My name is Tina, the court
46 reporter.

47

48 MS. SHOCKLEY: Do we just introduce
49 ourselves?

50

0008

1 REPORTER: Yes.

2

3 MS. SHOCKLEY: Dorothy Shockley, Board
4 member.

5

6 MR. LEE: Good morning. This is
7 Michael Lee, Second Chief of Arctic Village.

8

9 MR. GILBERT: Hi. My name is Galen
10 Gilbert, I'm the First Chief of Arctic Village. Thank
11 you.

12

13 MS. YATLIN: Tiffany Yatlin. I serve
14 on the Native Village of Venetie Tribal Government as a
15 Tribal Council member.

16

17 MR. SAM: Edward Sam. Tribal member.
18 Welcome to our community. We wish you success in all
19 of your issues. Here to listen. Thank you.

20

21 MR. PLANK: Good morning. Tom Plank,
22 Wildlife Biologist, Office of Subsistence Management.

23

24 MR. VICKERS: Good morning, everyone.
25 Brent Vickers. Office of Subsistence Management. I'll
26 be representing the leadership team for this meeting.
27 And thank you very much, it's a lovely day here in
28 lovely Arctic Village so looking forward to it.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Dorothy, go
31 ahead. This is now the members of the Council
32 introducing themselves.

33

34 REPORTER: Okay, use the mic.

35

36 MS. SHOCKLEY: Dorothy Shockley, Manley
37 Hot Springs, Fairbanks.

38

39 MS. EVANS: Linda Evans, Rampart, North
40 Pole.

41

42 MR. WRIGHT: Charlie Wright, Eastern
43 Interior.

44

45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Sue
46 Entsminger from Mentasta Pass.

47

48 MR. WOODRUFF: Don Woodruff, Eagle.

49

50

0009

1 MS. MCDAVID: And good morning,
2 everyone. I'm sorry I forgot to introduce myself
3 earlier, I'm Brooke McDavid. I'm the Council
4 Coordinator and the Designated Federal Officer for this
5 meeting. Thank you.

6
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We
8 will go online to introduce yourselves. Do we have a
9 way to do the government agencies.

10
11 MR. BASSICH: Andy Bassich.

12
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, we hear
14 a voice, go ahead.

15
16 (Pause)

17
18 REPORTER: Go ahead, Andy.

19
20 MR. BASSICH: Yeah, Andy Bassich of
21 Eagle, EIRAC Council member.

22
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Good to hear
24 your voice.

25
26 REPORTER: Amanda are you there.

27
28 MS. POPE: Amanda Pope, Circle, EIRAC
29 Council member.

30
31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Good morning,
32 Amanda.

33
34 MS. CELLARIUS: Good morning, this is
35 Barbara Cellarius. I'm the Subsistence Coordinator and
36 Cultural Anthropologist with Wrangell-St. Elias
37 National Park and Preserve in Copper Center.

38
39 MS. CRAVER: Good morning. Amy Craver,
40 Subsistence Coordinator with Denali National Park and
41 Preserve.

42
43 REPORTER: Is that you Amy Craver?

44
45 MS. CRAVER: Yes, Tina, it's Amy.

46
47 MR. THOMAS: Good morning it's Bruce
48 Thomas with the Council of Athabascan Tribal Government
49 in Fort Yukon.

50

0010

1 MS. PATTON: Good morning. This is Eva
2 Patton, Subsistence Program, National Park Service in
3 Anchorage. Good morning.

4
5 MS. CARROLL: Good morning. This is
6 Holly Carroll, the In-Season Federal Manager on the
7 Yukon River with U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and I'm
8 based in Anchorage.

9
10 MS. KLEIN: Good morning. This is Jill
11 Klein and I'm the Regional Subsistence Coordinator with
12 the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service based in Anchorage
13 as well. Good morning.

14
15 MS. JALLEN: Good morning. This is
16 Deena Jallen and Christy Gleason with the Alaska
17 Department of Fish and Game. We're both out of the
18 Fairbanks Office, the Yukon River summer and fall
19 season managers for the Commercial Fisheries Division.

20
21 MR. GRAHAM: Good morning. This is
22 Cory Graham, Fisheries Biologist with the Office of
23 Subsistence Management.

24
25 MS. JOCHUM: Good morning. This is Kim
26 Jochum with the National Park Service, Subsistence
27 Program.

28
29 MR. PATTERSON: Good morning. This is
30 Dillon Patterson also with the National Park Service,
31 Regional Subsistence Program.

32
33 MR. LIND: Good morning. This is
34 Orville Lind, Native Liaison for the Office of
35 Subsistence Management.

36
37 (Pause)

38
39 REPORTER: Anyone else.

40
41 MR. BURCH: Hello, this is Mark Burch
42 from the Department of Fish and Game, Palmer Office.

43
44 MR. RINALDI: Good morning. This is
45 Todd Rinaldi with the Division of Wildlife Conservation
46 out of the Palmer Office.

47
48 MS. OKADA: Good morning. This is
49 Marcy Okada, Subsistence Coordinator for Yukon-Charley
50

0011

1 Rivers National Preserve.

2

3 REPORTER: Hi Marcy.

4

5 MR. HERRIGES: Good morning. This is
6 Jim Herriges, Wildlife Biologist for Bureau of Land
7 Management in Fairbanks.

8

9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anyone else
10 online.

11

12 MR. LEONARD: Yeah, good morning. This
13 is Paul Leonard with U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service.
14 I'm the Ecologist at Arctic Refuge based in Fairbanks.

15

16 MR. ERVIN: (In Native) Bruce Ervin.
17 University of Alaska-Fairbanks, Alaska Campus. Good
18 morning this is Bruce Ervin.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Good morning
21 everyone. Are there any members of the public online.

22

23 (No comments)

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Anyone
26 else online.

27

28 (No comments)

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right,
31 good morning everyone and thank you. Okay, the next
32 thing on the agenda is review and adopt the agenda.

33

34 Brooke.

35

36 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Madame Chair.
37 For folks here in the room there are green copies of
38 the agenda on the back table, that's the most recent
39 version. The version in the meeting book is slightly
40 out of date, not really very many changes, just I would
41 like to note there is a change -- we had two time
42 certain items that I'll just point out again. We'll be
43 covering the Arctic Village Sheep Management Area
44 closure review, that's WCR24-21, we'll be doing that
45 this evening at 5:00 p.m., so that folks here in Arctic
46 Village can attend. And we will also have a time
47 certain update from the Department of Interior tomorrow
48 at 11:30 right before lunch.

49

50

0012

1 So those are the only two things to
2 note as changes.

3
4 Thank you, Madame Chair.

5
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Don.

7
8 MR. WOODRUFF: Motion to adopt the
9 agenda, please.

10
11 MR. WRIGHT: Second.

12
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: There's been
14 a motion and it's been seconded by Charlie Wright. Is
15 there any discussion taking note the two time certain
16 things that Brooke had brought up.

17
18 (No comments)

19
20 MR. WRIGHT: Question.

21
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, the
23 question's been called for. I'm just going to ask for
24 unanimous consent, is anyone opposed.

25
26 (No opposing votes)

27
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And next is
29 the review and approval of the previous minutes that's
30 in our book.

31
32 Go ahead, Brooke.

33
34 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Madame Chair.
35 Council members can find the minutes from our winter
36 meeting starting on Page 7 of your meeting books.

37
38 MR. WOODRUFF: I make a motion to adopt
39 the minutes from the previous meeting.

40
41 MS. EVANS: This is Linda Evans, I'll
42 second the motion.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.
45 There's a motion to adopt the minutes from Don and
46 seconded by Linda. Any discussion or changes.

47
48 MS. SHOCKLEY: Madame Chair. I just
49 wanted to state that I was appointed on February 28th,
50

0013

1 the day before the meeting so along with that, you
2 know, it was a pleasant surprise but also, you know,
3 didn't give me much time to attend, but also I had a
4 loss in the family as well, so I wasn't able to attend.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 And I don't know if you want to state
9 that in there or not.

10
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Well,
12 welcome to you, Dorothy, really appreciate you here.

13
14 MR. WRIGHT: Question.

15
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And the
17 question has been called for to adopt the minutes. I'm
18 going to ask for unanimous consent once again. If
19 there's anyone opposed, now is the time.

20
21 (No opposing votes)

22
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, I'm
24 sorry.

25
26 REPORTER: It's not you.

27
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You mean my
29 mic wasn't on?

30
31 REPORTER: Yes, it was Sue, I wanted to
32 readjust the volume, I got it.

33
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. The
35 motion passes. Next is our reports. I'm hearing
36 somebody.

37
38 REPORTER: Yes, who's online.

39
40 MS. POPE: This is Amanda.

41
42 REPORTER: Go ahead Amanda.

43
44 MS. POPE: I was wondering if people in
45 the room can speak louder into the microphone it's
46 really hard to hear.

47
48 REPORTER: Okay, Amanda, this is Tina,
49 the court reporter. We're doing the best we can, we're
50

0014

1 having to do it over a cell phone so we will keep that
2 in mind and I'll make sure everyone does.

3

4 MS. POPE: Thank you.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, and
7 what we need to do is -- I'd like to, for purposes of
8 Amanda and the people online, I went through this at
9 the SRC meeting where people can't hear, so this mic,
10 nearly, you almost have to kiss it for them to hear so
11 let's just do a short test.

12

13 Dorothy, see if they can hear you.

14

15 MS. SHOCKLEY: Hi this -- yep, I'm sure
16 you can.

17

18 (Laughter)

19

20 REPORTER: And it can change at any
21 minute so you can test it all you want.

22

23 (Laughter)

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, really.

26

27 REPORTER: Yeah.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I'm
30 getting -- the court reporter said this can change any
31 minute so this might not be a good exercise.

32

33 REPORTER: Just keep with your mic on
34 and if there's a problem I'll say something.

35

36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, so just
37 speaking this close to the mic has really been helpful
38 to the people online, so, yeah, pull it right up to
39 your mouth. Amanda, you hearing us okay?

40

41 MS. POPE: Yes.

42

43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, I'm
44 really not hearing her that great.

45

46 REPORTER: So we're not going to hear
47 them either unless I turn this microphone on and put it
48 on the cell phone.

49

50

0015

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh.

2

3 REPORTER: So if they're just saying,
4 okay, you know, I'm not going to probably going to do
5 that.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

8

9 REPORTER: But if anyone wants to talk
10 or starts talking, yes, I will turn it all on. It is
11 what it is.

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.
14 Okay, well we're working through our little issues
15 here. Okay. The next thing on the agenda is Council
16 reports and since Dorothy hadn't gone through this
17 before we'll start with Don.

18

19 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame Chair.
20 One of the strongest cultural handicaps for the people
21 in the upper Yukon is that there are no chinook to
22 harvest and there are no summer -- fall chum and those
23 are the two species that go up into Canada. And one of
24 the issues with salmon spawning is the water
25 temperature. And about the 15th of August, the water
26 temperature at the Eagle sonar was 68 degrees, which is
27 surprisingly hot, and from what I've read about
28 fisheries biology it's detrimental to spawning success.
29 The fish at those temperatures are working really hard
30 to get to the spawning grounds but they don't have the
31 energy to spawn and in fisheries, that's called
32 ineffective spawner. So say we get 15,000 chinook
33 across the border at Eagle sonar, that doesn't mean
34 that those fish are necessarily spawning and that's a
35 misconception, I think, by fisheries people, a lot. I
36 think that's a big hinderance to the recovery of our
37 chinook salmon.

38

39 And we've had some pretty interesting
40 discussions about whitefish harvest and bycatch of
41 chinook and in our district we never put any nets in
42 this summer so there was no harvest whatsoever because
43 we didn't want to intercept any king. We feel like
44 every king is precious.

45

46 And at our Fish and Game meetings we
47 also had a lot of discussion about focusing more on
48 moose harvest and caribou harvest. And I noticed in
49 Amanda's report from last cycle, she talked about it

50

0016

1 not being safe to hunt on the Steese Highway. And I
2 think that the set back that they used on the Taylor
3 Highway a few years ago, I think that would be a very
4 effective method, it's 100 foot set back so that people
5 aren't shooting from the roadway.

6
7 There were no caribou this year. They
8 were all over on the Steese but I don't hunt there and
9 most of the people in Eagle don't hunt there, just
10 because it's a long ways and it's unsafe to hunt there
11 now.

12
13 And that concludes my report.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Charlie.

16
17 MR. WRIGHT: Good morning. This is
18 Charlie Wright for the record. I first want to say
19 thank you to the people of Arctic Village for welcoming
20 us to your beautiful country. Mahsi'Choo.

21
22 I also want to talk about fish this
23 morning. It doesn't seem like we're getting any
24 headway on making any difference on the return to the
25 numbers getting better. Don has good perspective of
26 his area and watching the spawners. In the Interior,
27 Rampart area, I've told many people this, that in 2019
28 the heat stress year, a bunch of king salmon went into
29 our creek called (In Native), they went in there so
30 thick that they jumped on each other and they were bank
31 to bank according to witnesses. So the next year,
32 hunting moose in the falltime I witnessed babies all
33 over the Valley as I rode out on my fourwheeler and
34 every little puddle going across the road that had a
35 flow had king salmon in it. So I know they weren't
36 there since the mining and probably around the turn of
37 the 1900s. I think 1898 or something the gold strike
38 happened in Rampart and they watched cannon blasted,
39 water blasted over burden and filled the gills of the
40 salmon in that creek and killed them, so I know the
41 kings weren't there for years. But I did see chums in
42 there the last 10 years or so going up.

43
44 But what I'm trying to get at is salmon
45 weren't in that creek, so I think that they short-
46 circuited their migration up the river and sought out
47 colder creeks on the Alaska side of the border. And I
48 think just because -- I tried to get people -- told
49 biologists in ADF&G about it, some certain people that
50

0017

1 I know and they didn't seem to be too excited about it,
2 but king salmon, they rear for two years and then they
3 go to ocean. Now, third and fourth year there's no
4 more salmon in there so this was a one time event in my
5 mind. So we'll see if they return. And then when they
6 do, if they do, I hope we could do some kind of
7 analysis or genetics on them to see if they are really
8 Canadian or Alaskan.

9

10 The salmon are not big anymore, they
11 are fighting for food in the ocean with all the
12 hatchery fish. They have no strength to make it to
13 Canada no more in my mind with their size and their
14 shape, their health, so I think we need to start
15 looking on the alaska side to see if there's anything
16 going on that we don't know of.

17

18 And the moose population, I've been
19 stating year after year here on this Board that the
20 numbers are way down in the Interior. I don't know if
21 anybody will know that because I don't hear or know of
22 any real good moose counts going on other permits. We
23 talked about that before, they do a moose count out of
24 the number of permits, kills that were reported, and it
25 takes the whole season to get a moose now instead of
26 two or three days like it was 20 years ago. So the
27 moose numbers are way down in the Interior.

28

29 I talked to the people in Tanana this
30 morning and they said they've got two moose in Tanana
31 this fall, the whole village. I know Rampart got one
32 or two also. So the moose numbers are getting really
33 bad. So we need to start thinking about doing
34 something for the people there, helping the moose
35 population, by doing something because the people are
36 suffering with no fish and no meat.

37

38 Trapping is still just the same because
39 of overcrowding in the area now.

40

41 So I don't want to take up too much
42 time so I think those are the most important topics
43 that I have on my mind and I'll pass it on.

44

45 Thank you.

46

47 Good morning everybody.

48

49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,

50

0018

1 Charlie.

2

3 Linda.

4

5 MS. EVANS: This is Linda, good
6 morning. Thank you for inviting us up here and
7 allowing us to meet here in Arctic Village. It's been
8 a long time since I've been here so it's really nice.

9

10 I am concerned about the Arctic
11 Village's concern with having a closure on the sheep so
12 I hope we can work together and get that settled for
13 them.

14

15 Also I did -- was able to go to a
16 meeting in Fort Wainwright and Brooke -- kind of
17 education for the soldiers there on Base, it was all
18 right but I think it would have been better if they
19 would have let us have a panel there and us talk about
20 -- or ask us questions about Native ways of doing
21 things or, you know, how to take care of your game when
22 you -- after you get it, you know, different ways to do
23 that.

24

25 Thank you.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
28 Linda.

29

30 Dorothy.

31

32 MS. SHOCKLEY: Good morning. Thank you
33 to the people of Arctic Village for having us here in
34 your beautiful country. I always tell people that this
35 is one of Alaska's secrets. It's one of the most
36 beautiful places, I think, in the state, so Basee' and
37 Mahsi'Choo.

38

39 Since this is really my first meeting I
40 wanted to introduce myself. My name is Dorothy
41 Shockley. I grew up in Manley Hot Springs. My family,
42 my late mother, Judith Starr Woods is from Tanana, the
43 CrossJacket area, my father is the late Walter Woods
44 from the Rampart/Stevens area.

45

46 I was appointed, like I said, on
47 February 28th of 2023. I appreciate this opportunity
48 to be on this Council. I have a long history of
49 advocating and attending meetings, not only with the

50

0019

1 Board of Game and Fish, but I also attended the State
2 RAC meeting some years ago. I'm not sure if that goes
3 on annually or how often that -- but that was pretty
4 significant to have all the Regional Advisory Councils
5 together in one place.

6
7 I serve on the Yukon River
8 Comprehensive Salmon Plan.

9
10 I attended a lot of the Yukon River
11 Tribal Fish Commission.

12
13 I also attended the Kuskokwim Tribal
14 Fish Commission.

15
16 I serve on the YRDFA Board.

17
18 And this spring I attended the Marine
19 Resource Education Program. It was a four and a half
20 day workshop in Juneau and learned a lot about how the
21 State and Feds, NOAA, collect data for regulating the
22 fish and other species in the ocean.

23
24 Let's see I served eight sessions for
25 the late Senator Albert Kookesh and learned a lot. We
26 had a -- during the first, I guess when we first
27 noticed the population, or the chinook were -- the
28 numbers were down we had a Senate comprehensive -- or a
29 Senate Special Committee on fisheries. I learned a lot
30 about every State organized, I guess, and Federal
31 fisheries in the whole state and how, you know, we
32 believe everything is connected so if one area sees,
33 you know, low numbers or it's compromised in some way
34 it is going to affect everything, all the fisheries.
35 But also, not only the fisheries, but, you know, the
36 game as well. I know, you know, like I said we believe
37 everything is connected.

38
39 And also, we, as indigenous people are
40 the voice of the land and the fish and game and it's
41 important that, you know, we, not only speak on their
42 behalf but also for the agencies to listen. Not only
43 listen, but do what we're asking. As most of you have
44 -- especially those online, I cringe at the word,
45 management. Because management is something that you
46 control. And when you say you are fish and game
47 management, I mean that is so beyond the reality of
48 what you're doing. You and me, and everybody else
49 cannot manage fish and game, we are stewards. As
50

0020

1 Native people we have, in the past, always worked with
2 the fish and the game, we did not try to manage. And
3 what, you know, managers, so called managers are doing,
4 you're managing the harvesters, and I would like to see
5 those names changed because like I said you're not
6 managing the fish and game.

7

8 But, again, thank you, I appreciate
9 being here.

10

11 And I'm hoping that we can make some
12 headway on some of these serious issues we have in
13 feeding ourselves, you know, that's really important.
14 I mean I just have a hard time with people in Fairbanks
15 and Anchorage and Juneau telling us how and when we can
16 feed ourselves, that just does not make sense to me.

17

18 So I appreciate this time and look
19 forward to working with all of you.

20

21 Thank you.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
24 Dorothy. Next, Amanda.

25

26 (No comments)

27

28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Tina, is
29 Amanda on.

30

31 REPORTER: Amanda, are you there, go
32 ahead.

33

34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Amanda, are
35 you still there.

36

37 REPORTER: Yes, she is, she's starting.

38

39 MS. POPE: My name is Amanda Pope and I
40 currently reside within the Yukon Flats region in the
41 community of Circle Alaska. I have two children and a
42 husband who share a subsistence way of life in the
43 Interior Alaska. I wanted to say thank you to the
44 community of Arctic Village who had invited the -- who
45 had invited to host the EIRAC this year. I apologize
46 for not being there in person with you all today.

47

48 Thank you for inviting the Board there.

49

50

0021

1 I am hearing that -- I am hearing from
2 people all over the region that it's hard to harvest
3 fish and game all over.

4
5 The harvest of fish is hard in the
6 summer for everyone but most people are allowed to fish
7 only using a four inch net and only catching a few pike
8 here and there.

9
10 Hunting season is a busy time of year
11 for everyone when most people are spending their time
12 out on the land for a few months at a time and where
13 gas is expensive and it's getting even higher. Some
14 villages are seeing \$12 a gallon.

15
16 The numbers of moose in the Interior
17 are very low. The caribou are also getting low.

18
19 Charlie Wright mentioned the population
20 has been getting low and it's been seen in communities
21 all over the Interior. The population of moose in the
22 Eastern Interior region has dropped 30 to 40 percent
23 just last year. I feel it will be harder for people to
24 harvest an animal either big or small and it's just
25 going to get harder and it's not helping the people of
26 the region. As a Board member I'm making it a priority
27 for myself to keep attending at AC meetings across the
28 Interior to get people's perspective in ways they think
29 things should happen so I can bring it to this Board so
30 everyone has a chance to harvest what they need.

31
32 I serve everyone in the Interior region
33 at the Board meeting because I want to see everyone
34 have the right to use their ancestral lands the way
35 their ancestors used to. I believe in tribal
36 sovereignty and continually advocate for the tribal
37 input to our resources we have.

38
39 I thank you for your time to attend
40 online and I look forward to the meeting.

41
42 Mahsi'Choo.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
45 Amanda.

46
47 Andy.

48
49 MR. BASSICH: Yeah, am I unmuted.

50

0022

1 REPORTER: Yes. Yes, you are Andy, go
2 ahead.

3
4 MR. BASSICH: Can you -- okay, thank
5 you. Andy Bassich. I'm on the Yukon River at Calico
6 Bluff. I have a number of things on my mind. The
7 first thing I'd like to do is build on Member Don
8 Woodruff's comments on chinook and chum salmon.

9
10 My biggest concern right now is that a
11 passage of 15,000 chinook salmon into an incredibly
12 large (indiscernible) in Canada, very insufficient. We
13 share spawning escapement -- I'm sorry, spawning --
14 rely on (indiscernible) the fact that there are so many
15 spawning streams there and when an only few adult
16 returns it very quickly loses the ability to be a
17 productive spawning site. So I have great concerns
18 over the number of fish crossing the border and the
19 viability of spawning success for future runs
20 (indiscernible) to those numbers spread out over a huge
21 geographic area.

22
23 Also my concerns with chum salmon. I
24 believe right now -- I'm sure we'll get an update, but
25 I think the numbers are under 20,000 at this point for
26 chum salmon crossing the border. This is very scary to
27 me for the reasons mentioned above.

28
29 This area, we are very, very dependent
30 on chum salmon to continue our lifestyle which is
31 strongly based on dog teams, particularly in this area.
32 The area from Tanana up to the Canadian border on the
33 Alaska side is the last (indiscernible) for people who
34 want to live this lifestyle and it's dying very
35 quickly, and it's not affordable for most people to
36 maintain a dog team anymore with the loss of salmon,
37 and that's a huge culture lost, a great loss to the
38 state of Alaska and the traditional lifestyle.

39
40 The second issue that I'd like to bring
41 up which I've brought up at every single meeting for
42 the last 20 years is hatchery production in the state
43 of Alaska. I feel very strongly that hatchery
44 production, and, in particular, an overwhelming large
45 numbers of pink salmon being released into the marine
46 environment has been and is continuing to have a major
47 role in the decline of all salmon species with the
48 exception of sockeye salmon. There are many papers
49 that have been written stating the fact that the pink
50

0023

1 salmon biomass and the food consumption that they have
2 can be directly related to the health of other salmon
3 species and other species in the marine environment.
4 To clarify that, pink salmon have odd/even strong and
5 weak years and there is a very strong correlation
6 between a strong year component of pink salmon scarfing
7 up all the food and leaving all other salmon and some
8 other species, including crab and a few other Alaska
9 fish to suffer the consequences and not grow. And I
10 believe this is -- has been and is continuing to be the
11 one thing that we have controls over that we must take
12 immediate action on.

13
14 There has never been a long-term
15 successful hatchery anywhere in the world, all
16 hatcheries have always had ill effects, a detrimental
17 effect to wild stocks and this has been proven
18 throughout the world where hatchery production has
19 displaced wild stocks and in many cases there's been an
20 extirpation of wild stocks with only hatchery
21 production being left. Hatchery production relies on
22 wild stock genetics to be successful, but at the same
23 time it destroys wild stock genetics through
24 (indiscernible) and other means. We must take action
25 on this from the State of Alaska and I ask that the
26 Federal Program, OSM look into doing what they can to
27 influence the State of Alaska and the Board to reduce
28 hatchery production so that our salmon have food to eat
29 in the marine environment where they spend most of
30 their adult life.

31
32 My third concern, and this is a very
33 big one for me is I am seeing no birds, both waterfowl
34 and song birds anymore. I'm very concerned about this.
35 I'm not sure why this is happening but to me it's an
36 area (indiscernible). When we don't see song birds or
37 waterfowl there's a big problem in the migration route,
38 could be due to virus, I have no idea what's happening
39 to them but I'm very concerned about this. I have seen
40 no more (indiscernible) migrations this year, this fall
41 there have been no migration of Canada geese, sandhill
42 cranes in this area whatsoever. This is a concern to
43 me.

44
45 The other thing that's concerning to
46 me, probably due to climate change is bees. Bees
47 coming up into Alaska in summer are very important
48 pollinators and it's going to affect a lot of the other
49 plant species which (indiscernible). I'm not sure
50

0024

1 there's anything we can exactly we can do about some of
2 these things but I wanted to bring it to the Councils
3 and the Board's attention that these are issues, other
4 species, and they're viability in the future.

5
6 The last thing that I am really
7 concerned about is conservation of chinook and chum
8 salmon from Yukon River is going to rely on people not
9 fishing into the future. The only way the people -- or
10 the only way the people can be expected not to fish is
11 to have some sort of replacement for the fish that they
12 would normally harvest. The Federal government and the
13 State of Alaska needs to develop programs in the near
14 term to make sure the people have food to eat so that
15 they can buy into conservation of the salmon stocks on
16 the Yukon River. If people are going to give up
17 fishing completely well -- and that will not -- and
18 although it's a poor second choice, it's not going to
19 make a lifestyle people, we have to start thinking
20 about how we're going to do a long-range rebuilding
21 plan. It's going to take many life cycles to rebuild
22 both the chum salmon, especially chinook.

23
24 I'm not seeing a lot of moose in our
25 area. This area is traditionally low with moose but I
26 think it's -- this adds to the hardship of replacing
27 protein because we haven't been able to fish.

28
29 I'm concerned about the Fortymile
30 Caribou Herd. I believe that a lot of the problems
31 we're having with the caribou herd is a result of some
32 poor management decisions, harvesting high numbers and
33 I think that the decisions should be managed through
34 the Fortymile Coalition on a yearly basis so that
35 there's full agreement, unanimous consent with the
36 Fortymile Coalition before they open up heavy harvest
37 or at the same time restrict harvest. The Fortymile
38 Coalition has been a very successful program but in
39 recent years I don't feel like it's been utilized the
40 best way it could for the sake of caribou and their
41 long-term success in our country out here in the
42 Eastern Interior.

43
44 I want to say something that I've said
45 at every meeting that I've ever attended for the
46 Eastern RAC and that is that subsistence people have
47 one need and that is a consistent reliable access to
48 the resource. And if it is not consistent and if it is
49 not reliable subsistence users suffer and it's very
50

0025

1 difficult to maintain your lifestyle. Management on
2 all fronts, both and fish and wildlife, must be managed
3 on a long-term plan not a year to year -- not a year to
4 year harvest plan. They need to start thinking about
5 not working on maximal sustained yield of both fish and
6 game. The reason why I feel this is so important is
7 the change with climate change and we don't know what
8 those impacts are going to be so we must be a lot more
9 conscious now than we ever have been. What has worked
10 in the past, well marginally worked in the past, is not
11 working now so managers have to rethink how they manage
12 for long-term consistent reliable access and population
13 of those resources that they're managing.

14
15 The final comment I have is I'd like to
16 request that OSM please speed up the modernization of
17 our teleconferencing of these meetings. There are many
18 platforms out there such as Zoom, Microsoft, et cetera
19 that are being used regularly by many other agencies
20 and organizations. I think it's imperative for OSM to
21 fast-track the use of that for our meetings to benefit
22 all the people that can't be there.

23
24 I appreciate my time here, thank you,
25 Madame Chair.

26
27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
28 Andy. Is Eva Burke on.

29
30 (No comments)

31
32 MS. MCDAVID: Eva, if you're on you
33 might have to unmute yourself by pressing star, six.

34
35 (No comments)

36
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm getting a
38 message that she is online but Charlie's checking.

39
40 REPORTER: Maybe press star, six again.
41 Sometimes it takes two times on this Teams platform.

42
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, I'm
44 told that you have to -- sometimes push star, six twice
45 to get unmuted.

46
47 (No comments)

48
49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. As
50

0026

1 they're checking, I would think that if Charlie Jagow's
2 getting here it's about right now but he would have to
3 get a ride if the airplane lands up there, to get down
4 here. Any luck on Eva.

5

6 MR. WRIGHT: She said she was on.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Eva.

9

10 (No comments)

11

12 (Pause)

13

14 MS. EVANS: Did she call the wrong

15 phone number.

16

17 MR. WRIGHT: I'm talking to her right

18 now.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Can she hear

21 us?

22

23 MR. WRIGHT: She said she was on.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We'll just

26 give it a minute.

27

28 (Pause)

29

30 MS. MCDAVID: Eva, if you're able to

31 text Charlie the number that you're calling in from I

32 can check on the computer and make sure your mic is

33 unmuted.

34

35 (Pause)

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It was 833,

38 right, not 866, but everything else is the same?

39

40 MS. MCDAVID: Right.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

43

44 (Pause)

45

46 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you all for bearing

47 with us for a few moments while we sort out some

48 technical difficulties.

49

50

0027

1 (Pause)

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I've had a
4 request from cold Council members that we slide this
5 whole thing closer to the fire.

6

7 (Laughter)

8

9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So while
10 we're waiting for Eva I think we'll take a short break
11 and we will do that so that means all hands in.

12

13 REPORTER: Oh, I had us on mute, sorry,
14 wait a minute.

15

16 MS. MCDAVID: And for folks online I'm
17 going to try to send out.....

18

19 REPORTER: Wait a minute, wait, wait,
20 wait, I'm still on mute from the pause. We were on
21 mute. Okay, go ahead, Brooke.

22

23 MS. MCDAVID: For folks online we're
24 going to take about a 15 minute break, we're going to
25 move things around in the room here and try to get
26 closer to the wood stove and also deal with some phone
27 issues.

28

29 (Off record)

30

31 (On record)

32

33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, it
34 sounds like we're hooked up and ready to go. And while
35 you're getting back to your seats I'd like to -- from
36 the Council and everyone.....

37

38 (Pause)

39

40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. On
41 behalf of all of us I would really love to extend our
42 condolences to Eva for the loss of her father. It's a
43 tragic, tragic thing to have happened and, Charlie, if
44 you could take that back to her we really appreciate
45 it. I know you've been through a lot looking for him
46 so, very sorry. Charlie's trying to get a hold of her
47 and she's not -- maybe you'd like to speak -- she's not
48 feeling too good and she's going to send a report in to
49 Eva [sic].

50

0028

1 So next would be -- Charlie Jagow is
2 not here yet I take it.

3
4 MS. MCDAVID: Not yet.

5
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So next would
7 be my own report.

8
9 MR. WRIGHT: Can I say something before
10 we get started.

11
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes. Charlie
13 would like to speak.

14
15 MR. WRIGHT: On behalf of Brooke and --
16 or I mean Eva and the family and I'd just like to say
17 thank you to everybody who reached out and said --
18 reached out to Eva and the family with their
19 condolences, really appreciate it, and all the people
20 who helped search and I thank the Council for saying
21 so, Madame Chair. She's not feeling very well today so
22 she's going to write a comment and have Brooke read it.

23
24 Thank you.

25
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
27 Charlie. Yes, it's just so tragic.

28
29 Okay. The next is the Chair's report,
30 which is me. And I first want to say that the 22
31 years, I guess, that I've been on the Council I have
32 learned a lot about the Federal process and I've
33 learned a lot how challenging this process is at times
34 and I have some deep, deep concerns about people
35 respecting each other, Native and non-Native, urban and
36 rural. There comes a -- I don't know, the way the
37 government is working together, the State and the
38 Federal, I feel like there could be way deeper respect.
39 Sometimes things just -- for me, just an outsider
40 looking in it doesn't look like we're going forward,
41 we're going backwards at times and that is really
42 troubling to me because I think there's really good
43 people in the state, where respect is definitely
44 something that people can respect and those are the
45 kinds of things I'd like to see us working on, working
46 together. I feel like even the State and Federal
47 biologists and that, it's gotten to where there's a
48 liaison from the Federal side and a liaison from the
49 State side and, we, the RAC members are told we can't
50

0029

1 work directly with our biologists, we have to go
2 through the head liaison person; I just don't think
3 that system's working that well, I think it's just
4 breaking down terribly because you can work a lot
5 better, regionally, with your people.

6
7 And I have a concern, at the
8 Subsistence Resource Commission I just attended, the
9 Nelchina Caribou have taken a nosedive from 53,000 four
10 years ago down to less than 8,000 and they had to have
11 the emergency closures and these kinds of things, it
12 just doesn't seem like things are -- it just doesn't
13 seem like that should happen that quickly, that's just
14 crazy. Where did all the caribou go. And it's -- like
15 it was brought out at our meeting at the Subsistence
16 Resource Commission meeting, there's going to be the
17 same amount of bears and wolves out there and they will
18 be preying on these caribou and, you know, things have
19 to be done. You have to look at things on a whole and
20 there's some -- in our region, just -- we're in the
21 bottom portion, Unit 12 is where I live and it's that
22 bottom section of the Eastern Interior and it looks --
23 we have two unique systems in our region, the road
24 system and the river system and even the Arctic is
25 slightly different than those two systems. And you'll
26 be hearing reports on parts of this region that you're
27 not familiar with and I just -- I'm concerned also
28 about what's going on on the Yukon. I mean I remember
29 the first meeting I went to, it just seemed like things
30 could have -- it's just going down, down, down, it's
31 just unbelievable what's going on and I don't
32 understand how managers are not finding what's going on
33 on the Yukon.

34
35 And then it concerns other rivers, like
36 the Copper River is -- will that happen there?

37
38 And then the sheep, there's a -- the
39 sheep numbers have dwindled in certain places in the
40 Alaska Range, they're stable in maybe the Wrangell
41 Mountains, but it's a deep concern. I've had reports
42 where people have found dead sheep and they're -- did a
43 -- were able to pick them up and found this new
44 pathogen called emovi in -- two in our area in Unit 12,
45 and it kind of takes me back to when I was guiding
46 sheep hunters in the Delta Controlled Use Area found a
47 ram that had big puss pockets in its lungs and those
48 were -- I took the sample, it was sent to the
49 veterinarian for the Fish and Game in Fairbanks and
50

0030

1 they're saying that these are -- you know, these things
2 have been in the sheep population in the past and they
3 have lived through some of these lung diseases that
4 they had but then it was reported to me -- now this is
5 all anecdotal but somebody saw a sheep, a little sickle
6 horn we call it, just pop down and die in 14C when they
7 were hunting and that one was retrieved and they found
8 the lungs were solid black. So they actually saw that
9 sheep fall over and die. So I have concerns about the
10 sheep and I feel like there needs to be a lot more work
11 being done that probably isn't being done.

12
13 But for me the bottom line is, we have
14 to get together and work together and I really
15 appreciated, Linda, when you said that it seems like
16 they should be asking you guys questions and I have to
17 say, I agree with that, that's true. There are certain
18 things and even with this Arctic Village Sheep
19 Management Area, I -- as I said at the -- some of you
20 heard it -- at the government to government
21 consultation, a way that that wouldn't come up is -- I
22 mean the biologist there, Tom Plank, brought up an idea
23 to open -- have it -- lift the closure and then have --
24 he called it a closure by the Fish and Wildlife
25 Service, delegation of authority letter, there's all
26 these things that the government can do but I know that
27 -- I think only Andy and Don were on when I brought
28 this up, let's lift the closure and turn that Arctic
29 Village Sheep Management Area, and the State put it on
30 a permit area, which it happened. The State Board of
31 Game passed a limited draw and they passed a hunter
32 education and orientation before anyone could ever go
33 in there and hunt. And there was no non-residents that
34 could ever hunt on that because there's no guide use
35 area open and they have to have a guide to hunt sheep.

36
37 And it's just a discussion point that I
38 want to bring up because that would never come up as a
39 Federal review again under those circumstances and then
40 the State would be challenged to work with people.
41 And, to me, working with people and developing a hunter
42 education program specific for that area makes them go
43 out to the villages and back when this happened, when
44 this passed, the State liaison, Jennifer Yuhas, worked
45 with the villages, Andrew Firmin who is no longer with
46 us, and people in Venetie -- I'm not sure where all she
47 worked, but these things have happened in the past and,
48 to me, these things are the kinds of things that need
49 to happen in the future.
50

0031

1 So I just wanted to bring up things
2 that I've thought about long and hard to make the
3 people work -- I mean make the government work together
4 because sometimes I don't think they're working
5 together that well either. So these are my concerns.

6
7 I just know in my area we have lots of
8 bears and wolves and I think at some point there has to
9 be some balance. So that is my report from my area.

10
11 And I'm going to move on on the agenda
12 and the next thing is the public and tribal comment on
13 non-agenda items and I have one blue card in the room
14 for non-agenda items. Trimble Gilbert. One minute --
15 yes, Charlie, go ahead.

16
17 MR. WRIGHT: Trimble, I'd just like to
18 recognize you, recognize the Traditional Chief before
19 he speaks.

20
21 Thank you.

22
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay,
24 Trimble, these are on non-agenda items.

25
26 MR. GILBERT: Good morning.

27
28 IN UNISON: Good morning.

29
30 MR. GILBERT: Someone told me it's five
31 below this morning.

32
33 (Laughter)

34
35 MR. GILBERT: So now we got to work
36 harder, a little bit harder to prepare for the winter.
37 So, you know, the young people, everywhere, and all
38 people, a long time ago, it's really different the way
39 they handled the cold weather.

40
41 My father, he's a very strong person,
42 and my mom too and the way my father had been trained
43 and he was kind of maybe six, seven, eight years old
44 and his mother is (In Native), and cold weather in a
45 tent he told them build a fire, he just got up without
46 pants and run around the tent and then he ran around
47 the tent and then he built a fire. So not only him a
48 long time ago, this is the way that young, working and
49 training the young people. I try to do that almost all
50

0032

1 my life. And in cold weather, I don't want to go back
2 to sleep, I got to do something for the day, I have to
3 keep myself warm.

4
5 Mary told me, my wife, why don't you
6 sleep, no, I got to get warm at the house so that's --
7 this is the way they prepared for the cold weather a
8 long time ago.

9
10 And they saved -- they tried to save
11 whatever they got and like maybe five pounds of sugar,
12 one pound of tea, we have to be careful how to use all
13 that, we want more than that, we got to limit. So
14 today is real different, we got everything we need so
15 there's a lot of waste. Everywhere I go see that and
16 -- but I don't know how we going to help them to make
17 them understand and save what we got, even the
18 firewood. I got my own rules. I can't stay up late
19 burn my firewood so I get tired, 8, 7, so I save quite
20 a bit of wood every year because we never know what's
21 next, what happens next everywhere, everywhere on this
22 small planet. So to be ready, every time I say that
23 then I kind of convince to the people to be ready.

24
25 Time is really, the years just go by so
26 fast. A few years back I remember I worked with an
27 Athabascan teacher, there's a lot of them I've been
28 working with. Linda is one of them. She's Linda. Not
29 only in the village but I work up river, we spend time
30 up there, and different places. I spend a lot of time
31 with teachers out in the woods, there's a bunch of
32 them. So the respect -- a lot of respect for them to
33 learn their own cultures and the cultures they work on.
34 So I'm not seeing them now, even now, I guess they're
35 all getting retirement.

36
37 So I still got a little bit strength,
38 strong, and I try to use it. Whatever I got I try to
39 make good use out of it. But when we were young we got
40 a lot of energy. So we think we know a lot of things
41 but we don't. So a lot of them make mistakes.

42
43 Athabascan people, that teaching from
44 our elders everywhere. They're not trying to be
45 different, cultures are different but they're still
46 hanging on to their own cultures so I've been traveling
47 around to a lot of places, even down to the states,
48 Peru, Bahamas, I travel a lot, all over. And when I
49 got into Peru, there's something -- people did
50

0033

1 something for the future generation, it's still there.
2 They didn't use a machine. Nothing. Just everything
3 by manpower. We call -- they call it Machu Picchu
4 Huge rocks. Big ones. I don't know how they carry,
5 move it around, all that. It's quite a build by hand.
6 I don't know how many thousands of years ago they did,
7 way up on top of a big mountain, right on top of the
8 mountain. Everything just -- you name it it's there.
9 People been using that years and years, I don't know
10 how much they make, money out of it, and they did
11 something for their own people. That as an interesting
12 thing I seen. It's -- that mountain is -- that big
13 mountain we have (In Native) out there, I think -- I
14 don't know, I didn't remember the elevation but it's
15 really high on top. And the next one, the mountain, I
16 see some people walk around, I don't know how they
17 climbed that. Only thing that scares me is when I got
18 on the bus on the bottom, I traveled with a group, you
19 know, that big huge bus going up the mountain like
20 this, all the way up, it seemed to that the road is not
21 too wide for me. I looked down that, way down this
22 river, I don't want to say it but that's scary. One
23 other thing is they pass each other to get on top when
24 some of them are coming back down.

25

26 So there's a lot of things that we need
27 to see. We all have a short time here. And what we
28 see, what we learn, much less not independent life, we
29 all got talents, every human being got talents. So we
30 have to use our talents to help one another. If we
31 don't do nothing with.....

32

33 MR. MAYO: Hello.

34

35 MR. GILBERT:it's not going to
36 grow.

37

38 MR. MAYO: Hello. I think.....

39

40 REPORTER: Hello, if you could just
41 wait a minute please, Mr. Gilbert is speaking right
42 now.

43

44 MR. GILBERT: You have to help other
45 people with what you've got. That's where I am at
46 right now.

47

48 (Teleconference interference -
49 participants not muted)

50

0034

1 MR. GILBERT: So I did so many things,
2 I just stay home and do nothing because of a sickness,
3 just lay back, and my wife pushed me around, and go
4 over there, this morning again she told me that. So
5 seems like what retirement is.....

6
7 (Teleconference interference -
8 participants not muted - Mr. Mayo)

9
10 MR. GILBERT:I believe that the
11 Native people, because we live in this cold climate we
12 have to work harder and harder for the young people.
13 So old people, especially, they get pushed around, many
14 times I remember I grew up with old people, I hunted
15 with them, snowshoe, maybe from here to way up to the
16 lake, a long ways when you're breaking snow trail. I
17 hunt with old people and then after we got to hunting
18 up there, getting dark, I don't know how he made it
19 that far, to snowshoe with me, he fall on me coming
20 back down, many hours -- we put in a lot of many hours
21 coming back with our meat. We were packing meat. And
22 once awhile, she's tired, so we stand there and they
23 rest and then keep going. So those are the things that
24 give you strength. If I don't do nothing today there's
25 nothing.

26
27 My talent, but that one young guy
28 before he died he told me, once you're appointed to be
29 the leader you have to make yourself strong. If you
30 don't do nothing, you don't say nothing, then you don't
31 going to keep your strength, you're going to get weaker
32 and weaker. But every day you do something then you do
33 something for the people, other people, not just
34 yourself and talk to somebody and you're bigger and
35 bigger and bigger, you're strong, getting stronger and
36 stronger, that man told me.

37
38 Another thing, we just kept doing
39 things like that by our independent life. We never
40 know good or bad. Even the little ones. We have to
41 say do something for the (indiscernible) and you could
42 feel it and then that means you're growing a little
43 bit. You do something good you can feel it, I feel
44 good, keep myself good. And when I look around every
45 morning, this mountain over on that, over there, all
46 the kids watching you, mountain (indiscernible) they
47 know all that mountain, every day, they could see it.
48 So they know the name of it. Once you get on top of
49 the mountain then all the lakes we have, we got our
50

0035

1 language -- the big lake by the airport, yesterday, I
2 mentioned that, a big one, in fact we are losing water
3 level but some guy fishing down there, he caught about
4 75 fish, whitefish and he gave it around. That lake
5 has been there thousands of years. That's where we've
6 been eat -- eat fish from it, and another one back
7 there. This is how much we need that mountain, and
8 whatever we got and where we were born.

9
10 We have to respect the good water we've
11 been drinking right from it, yeah. And that's clear
12 water there. But another one from the west we call (In
13 Native) some more clear water, pure water. Some people
14 coming back with five gallon, they fill it up and they
15 put in some kind of jar and they send it to their own
16 people in Fairbanks so that water we've been drinking
17 thousands of years, that one guy said I've been
18 drinking it all my life and I'm still here, it's good
19 water. Everything is good. But we ruin it. People
20 ruin it. Human activities. Too much human activity on
21 this small plant. There's a lot of people got normal
22 life, some people have fever, (indiscernible), a lot of
23 people got fever and they want money out of it, nothing
24 wrong with it. But we all got short life. How about
25 the next two generations. We have to think about
26 future too, not only -- not only me, I need, so where
27 we sit right now is we've been fighting for the next
28 generation so we talk about culture, I travel all over
29 and when we feast at different places -- I was at
30 Barrow one time, Kaktovik, many -- they have a feast,
31 they call that -- when I land there with somebody and
32 that couple who picked me up to take me to the feast,
33 they got whale, they share with it. I start eating a
34 little bit. I didn't even look at all of the food,
35 just -- just like my own food. I don't want to talk
36 about it. I know this is their culture, they've been
37 there thousands of years eating the same food, that's a
38 gift. They bless the food. Respect. One guy he's
39 talking about -- yeah, no, he said it's okay -- the
40 person, he traveled around, he felt about some kind of
41 food, some kind of animal and at a big meeting he's
42 talking about it and they all laugh, I don't want to
43 laugh. So this is the way we have to respect other
44 cultures, the way they live, thousands of years. Once
45 you get into some villages you don't know nothing,
46 somebody come to you and he's going to teach you about
47 the life.

48

49 So yesterday I talk about kind of

50

0036

1 worriedness, I shouldn't be worried but now, Mary and
2 I, we talk about -- my wife, we're getting old but we
3 don't have to (indiscernible) we have a lot of
4 grandchildren. But I, every morning, I pray for people
5 here, how about other people. I got a lot of people
6 all over the world, and I travel all over. Hundreds of
7 kids running around. There are happy because they've
8 been eating good. So we have to -- even though they
9 don't listen to us but we have to keep trying, we have
10 to teach them about our culture and our life so we want
11 the next generation to have a good life.

12
13 All we heard is that those people,
14 we're not supposed to be like that, we got to work
15 together. When Eisenhower talked about the military,
16 team work, they have to work together. That's the one
17 thing I hate to see on the TV. There's a lot of
18 different ways we can show them the good life on TV.
19 Yesterday I mentioned sorry to see -- even this
20 morning, I heard of a shooting again, that's all they
21 heard, they learn a lot of bad things on there, angry,
22 so little things, we're hurting kids and they growing,
23 they grow, instead of love -- something -- the life
24 helping works. If we search for it we could learn a
25 lot of it from the people. I learned from a lot of
26 good things, from people, I travel all over. Gosh, I
27 never heard that word, I can use it for others.

28
29 So now we're here, we are the last
30 Athabascan in this northern part of Alaska. A long
31 time ago it's really cold, 70 below, 75 below. Even
32 though kerosine, we use it for the lamp, even that
33 freezed kerosine is freezing. For two weeks, sometimes
34 three weeks. My brother, when he was alive we talk
35 about it. How did people living without food. So we
36 are very lucky to have electricity now, everything we
37 need is here. Every day I want to stand somewhere and
38 I just praise of what we got. Health facility is
39 almost everywhere. When somebody gets sick, they pick
40 them up. When I have pain one time in my tooth, out in
41 the woods, I even cried, no food, so I'm hunting, one
42 guy is with me, he says keep fire going and I was under
43 the blanket, next day I want to come back here, no food
44 here, no meat, and we start down, there's three people
45 ahead of us, I was in front of him, we were right in
46 the middle of river down there and that pain start
47 again, I think it start infected. He got a needle, I
48 don't know where he got a long needle and he told me,
49 go ahead and just put in the hole and just drill so I
50

0037

1 do that and then I went through, there was a lot of
2 blood right on the trail. After a minute, the pain is
3 going away. I pushed my dog, let's go and ran behind.
4 We were at the first track of caribou. And I got six
5 caribou. Nothing wrong with it, I come back, I'm still
6 here.

7
8 So thank you for your time.

9
10 Thank you for coming to visit my
11 people.

12
13 We got (indiscernible) up there, we
14 (indiscernible) my shelter, promises up there. Old
15 ladies that -- they just stay by the graveyard down
16 there, she's old, everybody help her. My mom and I, we
17 come by and visit her, she's all right. My mom told
18 them, did you ever get scared and she laughed, you see
19 the cross on top the tree, I never get scared she said,
20 that's a good answer.

21
22 So thank you and have a good day. And
23 there's a lot of people to say something, and thank you
24 very much, it's good to be here.

25
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
27 Trimble.

28
29 MR. GILBERT: I mention that Dorothy, a
30 long time ago, we catch one fish, I remember that.

31
32 (Laughter)

33
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.
35 Any blue cards.

36
37 (Applause)

38
39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Is there
40 anyone on the line that would like to testify to any
41 non- agenda items.

42
43 (No comments)

44
45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any public
46 members or tribal comments on non-agenda items.

47
48 (No comments)

49
50

0038

1 MS. MCDAVID: Okay, folks online if
2 you'd like to give a comment on a non-agenda item
3 you'll probably have to unmute yourself by pressing
4 star, six.

5
6 (No comments)

7
8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.
9 Another Council member just came in, Charlie Jagow,
10 welcome. You must have had a cold flight, uh.

11
12 MR. JAGOW: (Nods affirmatively)

13
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Good to see
15 you. Do you have any comments you wanted to give.

16
17 MR. JAGOW: Not at this time.

18
19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.
20 Is there anyone online that has a non-agenda item.

21
22 (No comments)

23
24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hearing none,
25 I'm going to turn the Chair over to Charlie, the Vice
26 Chair, and he will handle the next old business.

27
28 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, Sue.
29 On the agenda, we're on Item 10, Old Business. And I
30 see the Council Coordinator will take that over, Item
31 A.

32
33 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Mr. Chair. So
34 the first item under old business is your .805(c)
35 report summary. And for those Council members who are
36 new and folks in the audience who may not know, the
37 .805(c) report is a report from the Federal Subsistence
38 Board that the Board sends to the Council after every
39 regulatory Board meeting and it explains how the Board
40 voted in line with the Council's recommendations.

41
42 And so in your supplemental materials
43 on Tab 1 you will find the cover letter for the .805(c)
44 report and that letter will explain that there is no
45 .805(c) report this -- for this past fisheries meeting
46 because all of the Board actions were in line with the
47 Council's recommendations.

48
49 And, Mr. Chair, that concludes my
50

0039

1 summary. Thank you.

2

3

4 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you,
5 Brooke. And now we'll move on to B, Board Work Session
6 Summary.

7

8 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I
9 will turn the Council's attention to Page 19 of your
10 meeting books. There is a news release found there
11 that summarizes the outcome of the Federal Subsistence
12 Board work session this summer. I'll just point out a
13 couple of things that you might be interested to know.

14

15 At this work session, the Council did
16 -- or the Board, excuse me, went over the annual
17 reports from the Council and you'll find their replies
18 in the meeting book, that'll be the next topic here on
19 the agenda. The Board also reviewed the charter change
20 requests from the Council, and if you recall our
21 Council did request that a youth seat be added to the
22 Council and so the Board forwarded that request on to
23 the Secretary and we're still waiting to hear back if
24 that will be approved by the Secretary. So we should
25 know by the next meeting hopefully.

26

27 And I think that covers the main points
28 from the work session this summer.

29

30 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

31

32 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, again.
33 Still in old business, No. 10, we'll move down to C.

34

35 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I
36 will turn the Council's attention to Page 21 of your
37 meeting books. And on Page 21 you'll find the start of
38 the Board's replies to the Council for your annual
39 report topics last year. This is a pretty lengthy
40 document and it includes a lot of really important
41 concerns you brought to the Board.

42

43 Perhaps I could just read the list of
44 topics and then if there's any that the Council would
45 like to further discuss we could do that.

46

47 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay.

48

49 MS. MCDAVID: Okay. So as a reminder
50 the topics that the Council sent to the Board last year

0040

1 in the annual report were about sheep population
2 declines and the need for coordinated survey efforts.

3

4 You also let the Board know some
5 concerns you have about Fortymile Caribou Herd
6 management.

7

8 The third topic was about the ongoing
9 salmon fishing closures and low returns on the Yukon
10 River.

11

12 The fourth topic was letting them know
13 about the need for updated moose counts along the moose
14 -- not the moose, the Yukon River Corridor.

15

16 Topic five was about food insecurity.

17

18 Topic six was about the need for hunter
19 ethics education.

20

21 Topic seven was about incorporating
22 local and traditional knowledge into management and the
23 need for co-management.

24

25 Topic eight was about climate change
26 impacts, especially to the timing of the fall moose
27 rut.

28

29 Topic nine was about needed support for
30 subsistence education and culture camps.

31

32 Topic 10 was about the cost to use BLM
33 public use cabins for subsistence activities.

34

35 And topic 11 was about OSM's comments
36 to the Alaska Board of Fisheries.

37

38 And I'll turn it back to you, Mr.
39 Chair. Sorry, one thing I will note is that later in
40 this meeting the Council will be coming up with topics
41 for this years annual report so as we're going through
42 the meeting, you know, if there's certain topics you
43 all would like to include for this year we can note
44 those down. But at this time, yeah, if the Council
45 would like to discuss any of the topics in the annual
46 report, I'll turn it back to you.

47

48 Thank you.

49

50

0041

1 MS. WESSELS: Mr. Chair.

2

3 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Who was that?

4

5 MS. WESSELS: That was me.

6

7 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Oh, Katya, go
8 ahead.

9

10 MS. WESSELS: I just wanted to add
11 something to what Brooke already brought up. So you
12 will be, this meeting, formulating the topics for the
13 fiscal year 2023 annual report.

14

15 (Phone line dropped)

16

17 REPORTER: Hold up, we just got dropped
18 off the call. I'll need to call back in.

19

20 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Let's take
21 a break while we call back in.

22

23 (Off record)

24

25 (On record)

26

27 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Time to get back
28 to the meeting people. Please and thank you.

29

30 (Pause)

31

32 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, we're going
33 to get back to order here so go ahead, Katya.

34

35 MS. WESSELS: Okay, sorry, I will start
36 all over. I just wanted to add to what Brooke had to
37 say. Yeah, you're going to be developing the topics
38 for the new annual report. So then it's good to review
39 the topics from the last annual report and the Board
40 replies, so when you have a moment during break or, you
41 know, later in the day look, you know, at that and that
42 might help you to develop the topics for this year's
43 report. And one important thing to keep in mind that
44 this year you will be only able to develop the topics
45 at this meeting because in the winter of 2024 we're
46 going to have an All Council meeting where you will
47 have a meeting by yourselves, but it's most likely
48 going to be for half a day, maybe a day at the most so
49 there will not be enough time to add anything to your
50

0042

1 annual report. So the topics that you will develop
2 during this meeting, that's the ones that are going to
3 go forward to the Board and you will just approve the
4 draft during the winter 2024. So it's good to think
5 about the topics throughout the meeting and as they
6 come to your mind you can speak about them or just save
7 them for the time when that topic is on the agenda.

8

9 That's all I wanted to say, thank you.

10

11 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, go ahead,
12 Don.

13

14 MR. WOODRUFF: I'd like to respond to
15 what Katya said. We have some Council members that are
16 not here or online and they may not have the facilities
17 to develop annual report issues and I think we should
18 make that a priority if we have a whole day meeting at
19 this All Council meeting because I think that's pretty
20 important to get the Federal Subsistence Board to
21 understand a wide range of issues that are affecting
22 our district.

23

24 Thank you.

25

26 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.

27

28 MS. WESSELS: Mr. Chair, can I reply to
29 what Don said.

30

31 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yes.

32

33 MS. WESSELS: Don, it would not be
34 possible to add any more topics during the winter
35 meeting. I, you know, really encourage the Council to
36 settle on the topics this time. You know, the Council
37 members that are online they can come up with ideas, I
38 mean it's going to be your Council Coordinator drafting
39 the topics with the Council members that suggest the
40 topics. That's how it always works. They will be
41 included if they have any ideas. Right now you just
42 will provide the ideas. But there will just be no time
43 to add anything during the winter meeting. That's, you
44 know, this time, that's going to be how it happens.

45

46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I
47 would like to say, after Chairing this meeting for 16
48 years, I would tell the Council, look when we're -- as
49 we meet you'll bring up a concern and immediately you

50

0043

1 should go ahead and say that's a concern and a topic
2 that I would like on, and that should still be allowed
3 at our next meeting, even though it's an All Council
4 meeting. If somebody says, hey, I see this, it's not
5 in our Council report I would like to add it, that
6 should be allowed. Sorry, Katya, I think that's --
7 we're volunteers. So if somebody has a topic that
8 comes up at the next meeting they should be able to add
9 it.

10

11 MS. WESSELS: Well, we can save that
12 topic but it will be in the next year's report. The
13 Council meeting is in March and we really will be
14 pressed for time adding this topic for the Board to be
15 able to formulate their replies by the time they review
16 them during the work session during the summertime.
17 That's, you know, just because the Council meetings are
18 usually in February there is more time and this time
19 around by the time the All Council meeting ends there
20 will be no time. So it's not like you cannot put this
21 topic in but it won't be in FY23, that's all I'm
22 saying. It will be -- if you come up with a new topic
23 during the winter 2024 meeting that will be going into
24 your FY24 report to the Board.

25

26 MS. MCDAVID: Madame Chair. Mr. Chair.
27 I would just like to follow up on that. And if there
28 are major concerns at the winter meeting, like Katya
29 said, those can go in the FY24 report but we can also
30 write a letter in the meantime since that annual report
31 won't go out until after the fall. So kind of two ways
32 to go about those concerns.

33

34 Thank you.

35

36 MS. WESSELS: Yeah, and also, you know,
37 you need to be the good judges of what you put into the
38 report and what to make a letter. Sometimes it's
39 actually more effective to write a letter and receive a
40 quick reply from the Board than write -- because it
41 takes pretty much a year, you know, by the time you
42 write the report, you know, approve it, the Board
43 reviews it, writes replies, so if you want a more
44 immediate answer sometimes it's better to write a
45 letter.

46

47 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.
48 Katya, I got a question. Is it okay for the Council
49 members online and on the phone to make topics -- send
50

0044

1 topics to Brooke at this time, or in the next couple
2 days that'd be fine, and in the near future?

3

4 MS. WESSELS: (Nods affirmatively)

5

6 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, thank you.
7 So people online and on the phone I hope you heard
8 that, if not you can talk to Brooke about it.

9

10 Thank you.

11

12 MS. WESSELS: Yeah, as long as it's at
13 least mentioned during this meeting as a topic -- like
14 if they send it to Brooke, Brooke can read it into the
15 record because it needs to be on the record that this
16 topic is a concern to the Council.

17

18 MS. MCDAVID: Mr. Chair. We will --
19 there will be an item new business where we will
20 revisit the topics that you would like to include for
21 this next annual report. Perhaps at this time we could
22 return our focus to this past annual report and the
23 Board's replies and if there are topics of concern in
24 that, that the Council would like to further discuss,
25 we can do so now.

26

27 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. All right.
28 Replies or comments to the annual report replies. I
29 think Dorothy had one, go ahead, Dorothy.

30

31 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes, thank you. I
32 actually read part of, most of this, last night while I
33 couldn't sleep, and I was like there was lots of
34 mention of concerns and those kinds of things but I
35 didn't really see any action. So my question is, was
36 there any significant action taken during -- for the
37 last year report?

38

39 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I'd like to say
40 -- make a comment on that, I felt the same way, we're
41 getting nothing in return.

42

43 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yeah.

44

45 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: And that's a
46 comment that needs to go out and be on the record. It
47 seems like we're asking and putting comments and asks
48 in and we're not getting much in return, everything has
49 got an excuse or a reason why. I'm sorry but that's

50

0045

1 just the way I feel. I feel the same way.

2

3

Linda.

4

5

MS. EVANS: This is Linda Evans. Yes,
6 it said they hear our concerns but like Dorothy and
7 Charlie both said there's -- they don't give what
8 they're going to do about our concerns. You know it's
9 no use for us to keep bringing up concerns. I mean our
10 report from last year had 10 concerns in there, you
11 know, do we submit it again because we didn't get any
12 action or we didn't -- you know, that's what I'm
13 wondering about. What's the purpose of stating our
14 concern if no one is acting on it.

15

16

17

ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Any more
comments. Go ahead, Brooke.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I
can't respond on behalf of the Board for -- as far as
the replies go. We might have someone from OSM
Leadership that's online that might like to make
statement, but I can tell you at least about two things
that I was involved in and aware with, and that was
Topic 6 the hunter ethic's education. We did get
support from the Board for that. There was a little
bit of movement, you know, with Dorothy and Linda and I
attending that hunter information panel on Ft.
Wainwright. We'll also go over -- that's maybe the
next agenda item, so we'll talk a little bit more about
that and the next actions we can take.

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

And then the last item, Topic 11, about
OSM comments to the Board of Fisheries. I know that's
something that the ISC and OSM Leadership have been
actively meeting and talking about and as soon as
they're able to they will report back to us. It might
not be until the winter meeting.

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

So thank you, Mr. Chair.

ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you,
Brooke. And 50 percent of what you just said was the
negative return that we got from them not a positive
one. So that's something that should be also.

MS. WESSELS: Mr. Chair. Thank you.
One of the advice that I will make to the Council when
you prepare your annual reports, if you want maybe more

0046

1 action, like have a request for the Board, have a
2 concrete action that you want the Board to take. But
3 that is also done with an understanding that the Board
4 might not be able to perform on this action because the
5 Board is limited by certain parameters, rules and
6 regulations, but you still can ask. So the Board is
7 trying to do what they can in their replies, but some
8 of the things they can't -- if it's out of their
9 regulatory realm they can't do anything about it.

10

11 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, very
12 much Katya. Any more -- oh, Don, you had your hand up.

13

14 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Charlie. I
15 would like to repeat Item No. 1 about the sheep surveys
16 in our next annual report. And my concern is, after
17 reading these 400 pages and reading how sheep decline
18 all through our region, Yukon-Charley closed sheep
19 hunting on an emergency order this year. They were 69
20 percent below the average of the surveys in the past.
21 And my biggest concern is that these are five year
22 sheep surveys and a lot can happen in five years. If
23 we get two or three years of rain on snow we won't have
24 a sheep population and they won't be able to close the
25 fish -- the hunts and protect the sheep that are left.
26 So that's a big deal to me, thank you.

27

28 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I also want to
29 add a little bit on climate. We've been bringing it up
30 the last few years with concerns, and then some
31 problems that we have and we see and we bring forward
32 are blamed on climate by management, and nothing is
33 done about the situation. So I think that in
34 management going forward we need to have a climate
35 buffer for what Don just said, we don't know what's
36 going to happen in the future. So when managing, if
37 you have a caribou herd and you think you can take a
38 thousand animals, let's take 700 and so we have a
39 buffer on that herd to make sure that there's growth.
40 We need to start doing something with the client, it's
41 affecting everything. So we need to try to put our
42 heads together and think about a way to add that to the
43 management, to hopefully be a little bit more
44 successful going forward.

45

46 Thank you.

47

48 MR. BASSICH: Mr. Chairman, Andy.

49

50

0047

1 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Andy, we got
2 Dorothy first and you second. Thank you.

3
4 MR. BASSICH: Copy.

5
6 MS. SHOCKLEY: Thank you, Chairman. So
7 what are the meeting dates for the Federal Subsistence
8 Board?

9
10 MS. MCDAVID: The Federal Subsistence
11 Board will be meeting in April. I don't have the exact
12 dates in front of me. Perhaps someone from OSM Let
13 could confirm.

14
15 Thank you.

16
17 MS. SHOCKLEY: Do they just meet once a
18 year?

19
20 MS. MCDAVID: The Board will also be
21 having a work session in January. At that meeting
22 they'll primarily be focused on the Fisheries Resource
23 Monitoring program.

24
25 And then they also will have a summer
26 work session but that will be after their regulatory
27 meeting that's in April. the primary focus will be the
28 wildlife proposals that we'll be making recommendation
29 on today and that's when the Board will vote on those,
30 in April.

31
32 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.

33
34 REPORTER: Charlie, do you want to have
35 Andy talk.

36
37 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Oh, Andy, go
38 ahead.

39
40 MR. BASSICH: Yeah, thank you, Mr.
41 Chairman. This is partly a question and partly a
42 comment. First my comment.

43
44 My comment is in regards to the annual
45 reports, I wholeheartedly agree with the views
46 expressed by some of the Council members.

47
48 My main concern is some of our issues
49 with the fisheries and when we have addressed OSM they
50

0048

1 often tell us that they do not have regulatory
2 authority in areas like Area M and other canneries,
3 however, these entities in the marine environment are
4 managed by the North Pacific Council, which I believe
5 is a Federal entity, along with a lot of input from
6 NOAA and many scientists, and those outfits are housed
7 at the Federal level at the Congress Department and
8 the State Department, so the OSM Board is the directors
9 of many of these organizations, BIA, BLM, and so forth,
10 so although they may not have direct authority for
11 regulatory, they do have the ability to influence those
12 that do have that authority.

13
14 And that's what I would like to ask, a
15 little bit more clarification on that and make that
16 suggestion that when Councils bring concerns, which the
17 Board has no regulatory authority that those directors
18 of those Agencies carry that message to the State
19 Department, the Department of Commerce and those
20 entities within the Federal government in Washington,
21 D.C., to influence them.

22
23 That's how I see the process could be a
24 little bit better for the subsistence user in rural
25 Alaska.

26
27 But if anybody can clarify a little bit
28 of that to me, that would be helpful for future
29 thoughts.

30
31 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

32
33 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, thank you,
34 Andy. Brooke, you're next.

35
36 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, very much,
37 Andy, for raising those points. Something that I
38 should have mentioned earlier was that following the
39 Board's summer work session the Board saw that some of
40 -- especially related to salmon there are a -- there
41 were several Councils that brought forward salmon
42 issues and especially related to salmon management in
43 the marine environment and the need for cross
44 jurisdictional collaboration. And perhaps we could see
45 if Robbin or Scott might be online from OSM Leadership
46 that could talk a little bit more about that but my
47 understanding is that the Board has requested to try to
48 meet with the Secretary of Interior to try to talk
49 about some of these issues because they are outside of
50

0049

1 the Board's jurisdiction but they do keep being raised
2 by the Councils and folks across rural Alaska.

3

4 Thank you.

5

6 MS. WESSELS: Mr. Chair. I got the
7 information on when the main Board meeting will happen,
8 it will be April 2nd through 5th, 2024, that's the
9 wildlife regulatory meeting, the main meeting of the
10 Federal Subsistence Board of the year. And then on
11 February 7th, 2024 they're going to have a work
12 session, which Brooke was saying, and that's discussing
13 the fisheries manage -- fisheries management --
14 Fisheries Resource Monitoring Program projects --
15 sorry.

16

17 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you. Go
18 ahead, Dorothy.

19

20 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes. In order for us to
21 be more effective, I think it would be great to maybe
22 make a list of all of these different agencies, or at
23 least what jurisdiction each, you know, the Federal
24 agency and the State agency has so that we can get our
25 concerns and our proposals to the right people so that
26 we can get some action. See some action.

27

28 I mean it's ridiculous to send our
29 concerns to somebody who has no jurisdiction, or who
30 can't make a decision.

31

32 We need to start streamlining these and
33 get them to the right people.

34

35 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you,
36 Dorothy. Any more -- okay, go ahead, Katya.

37

38 MS. WESSELS: Oh, I just wanted to add
39 another thing about the Board meetings. Of course the
40 Council Chair or representative can attend any of these
41 meetings so if you as the Council want to talk directly
42 to the Board, either Chair or Vice Chair or a
43 representative, whomever you select, can come to these
44 meetings and bring your concerns directly to the Board
45 and it will be in an open public meeting so you will be
46 able to discuss it with the Board then and there as --
47 because the Councils are the liaisons to the Board, so
48 that would be an appropriate place, as well, to bring
49 some concerns.

50

0050

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I just want
2 to help you out a little bit. What she just said, is a
3 Chair or an appointed person from the Council goes to
4 those meetings and Don's been there for us and
5 Charlie's been there for us. Oftentimes, as the Chair,
6 if it's fisheries and the Yukon River, most of the
7 proposals, I'll send someone like Charlie because you
8 guys are near and dear to it, not me, and if it's
9 something that I have.....

10

11 MS. SHOCKLEY: No, I understand
12 that.....

13

14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Mic. Yes,
15 uh-huh.

16

17 MS. SHOCKLEY: I understand that. But
18 my last comment was that, you know, this report, I
19 mean, you know, it's reiterating our concerns but
20 there's no action. And if they can't make, you know,
21 the appropriate decisions, then they need -- we need to
22 send these concerns to the person who can take action.
23 And so, you know, it's like -- I mean they're just
24 echoing what we're saying for the most part.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, and I
27 just wanted to say, in my report this morning, that's
28 basically what I see not working and working through
29 this process, it's like -- and you asked for a list of
30 all of the entities out there, I did that one time
31 because I remember my -- one of my first meetings I
32 counted 40 government people in the audience and one
33 public and that -- that doesn't sound like it's working
34 to me and the problem is we're volunteers and often
35 times when we come to the villages they think that
36 we're getting paid to sit here and we're not, we are
37 volunteers and we get to meet twice a year and it makes
38 it really difficult for us and that -- and I remember,
39 Vince, I said why Vince, send me a list of all these
40 people and -- and then actually that would be good to
41 redo again but they keep changing hats and changing
42 hats and changing hats and so it makes it so hard for
43 us.

44

45 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yeah, well, I understand
46 that.....

47

48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

49

50

0051

1 MS. SHOCKLEY:as well. But in
2 order for us to be effective, and have some action we
3 need to be going to the right people that are
4 decisionmakers. I mean it just doesn't make sense to
5 me that, you know, everybody's concerned but nobody's
6 making a decision. And we need some action. We need
7 decisions made, so where do we go, what do we do.

8
9 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. I could
10 answer.....

11
12 MS. POPE: Mr. Chair, this is Amanda.

13
14 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Let Amanda go,
15 Tina. Go ahead, Amanda.

16
17 MS. POPE: Thank you. I just wanted to
18 share that I also got the same response with the
19 feedback we got and I think -- I just wanted to ask if
20 -- I understand everyone's concerns and I also feel
21 that things weren't really addressed and if there's a
22 way that we can address these as a Board, I would be up
23 to helping in any way I can.

24
25 I wanted to ask, there was a comment
26 earlier about some of these items being brought to the
27 Secretary of Interior, do we know which items are being
28 brought to them?

29
30 MS. MCDAVID: Charlie.

31
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Charlie.

33
34 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Brooke will try
35 to answer your question, Amanda, thank you.

36
37 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you for that
38 question, Amanda. Unfortunately that would be
39 something that OSM Leadership would need to answer.
40 The only item that I'm aware of is related to salmon
41 management.

42
43 And, Mr. Chair, if it's okay I'd also
44 like to respond to some of Dorothy's concerns.

45
46 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yes.

47
48 MS. MCDAVID: So, Dorothy, the Council
49 kind of has two avenues of raising these concerns, and
50

0052

1 sometimes these concerns are raised in a sort of
2 redundant manner and that is because like Katya said,
3 some of these things are outside of the Board's
4 jurisdiction and it's more through our annual report
5 we're making them aware of the concerns. The Council
6 can also, for any of these topics, write letters
7 directly to the agency that would deal with them such
8 as the North Pacific Fisheries Management Council, the
9 Council has written lots of letters to them in the past
10 commenting on bycatch, requesting reductions in
11 bycatch. The Council could write to BLM directly about
12 cabins, stuff. They could write to Fish and Game about
13 Fortymile Caribou. And so that's also a reminder to
14 the Council that throughout this meeting if there are
15 correspondence that you would like to send directly to
16 an entity or agency we can also do that. We just can't
17 always guarantee from those outside agencies that we
18 will get a response. You know if we write to Fish and
19 Game or we write to the North Pacific Fisheries
20 Management, there's no guarantee that there will be
21 action or a response.

22
23 So that's all I wanted to say, thank
24 you.

25
26 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I agree, Dorothy.
27 Under another hat I went all the way to Deb Haaland's
28 office last year and we had government to government
29 consultation with that office three times in one year
30 and we were told that we're working on something but
31 it's never come to light. So that's where it got us
32 to, last year, it took a whole year of working our way
33 there and that was what we got.

34
35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I did hear a
36 question of Dorothy's that would be interesting if it
37 can be done. I'd say it would take some work but to
38 put together a list of all the entities and then you
39 say they have this jurisdiction and they have this
40 jurisdiction and when we say something about one of
41 these topics of concerns, identify who can do something
42 about it. That's kind of what I was hearing from you,
43 and I'm asking, can that be done. Because sometimes
44 there's always a roadblock. I hate to say this but the
45 government can throw up all these roadblocks, so can it
46 be done.

47
48 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: What I told them
49 when I went to the White House is that I'm not going to
50

0053

1 stop saying it, I'm not going away, I'm just going to
2 keep saying it over and over and over and over again.
3 That's what you have to do so we can't quit, we can't
4 stop trying. Our people depend on us in these chairs
5 we're sitting in so if we have to look for other
6 avenues and find other ways to send things then let's
7 do it. That's what we're here for.

8
9 Thank you.

10
11 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes, start writing
12 letters.

13
14 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Any other
15 -- oh, that guy right there, okay, you're up next.

16
17 MR. VICKERS: Hi, this is Brent Vickers
18 from OSM. I just wanted to add -- let you guys know
19 that in regard to the items that are being addressed
20 with the Secretary of Interior at the work session, I'm
21 going to find out for you exactly what I can about
22 that. I know that those at OSM who have a much more
23 clear idea are in overlapping Council meetings right
24 now. So I'll do my best. It might not be until
25 tomorrow but I'll do my best to get an exact item list
26 for you.

27
28 Thank you. That's all.

29
30 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, Brent.
31 Katya, you have the microphone.

32
33 MS. WESSELS: Yes, thank you. I also
34 wanted to add if the Council wants to elevate an issue
35 above the Board to the Secretary you can write the
36 letter and request the Board to forward it to the
37 Secretary. You can't write it to the Secretary but the
38 Board will forward your letter to the Secretary just
39 with their cover letter, you know, if it's a
40 subsistence related concern. That is one of the way,
41 you know, you need to think what are the most important
42 issues that you want to elevate to the Secretary but
43 that's another avenue how you can elevate an issue.
44 And it's good for, you know, you having this kind of
45 letter and putting things in the annual reports because
46 that creates a record of your concerns too. Because I
47 just want to point out that this Council, for years has
48 been asking about the hunter ethics education program,
49 since like 2009 and finally we started, you know, the
50

0054

1 process and we were moving in the right direction, it
2 might not be moving as fast as you would like to but
3 it's still, steps are being done. So when you raise an
4 issue and especially when you put it in writing, you
5 know, the record is important.

6
7 Thank you.

8
9 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you so
10 much. Go ahead, Dorothy.

11
12 MS. SHOCKLEY: I'd also like to add
13 that we write to the U.S. Congressional Delegation as
14 well and the State.....

15
16 MS. MCDAVID: You can't.....

17
18 MS. SHOCKLEY: Oh, you can't -- oh,
19 that's right. Okay, sorry.

20
21 MS. MCDAVID: Dorothy, I believe, in
22 the correspondence policy, we can't write directly to
23 elected officials. We can also like Katya just
24 mentioned, ask the Board to forward letters on to those
25 officials.

26
27 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Any more
28 comments or anybody got anymore to say about that.

29
30 MS. MCDAVID: Mr. Chair.

31
32 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead, Brooke.

33
34 MS. MCDAVID: I'll just remind folks,
35 if any of these topics you think are deserving of
36 letters now or later in the meeting we'll revisit
37 topics of concern, we can flag those and we'll work
38 together to get those letters sent out along with the
39 annual report topics.

40
41 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you so
42 much, Brooke.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I just want
45 to reiterate what Dorothy's saying and it'd be a topic
46 and I'm hoping that we're hearing that that be a topic
47 of concern.

48
49 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. So if
50

0055

1 everybody's satisfied we can move on, no more comments.

2

3 (No comments)

4

5 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Anybody online or
6 on the phone.

7

8 MR. MAYO: Hello.

9

10 REPORTER: Okay, yeah, who's online?

11

12 MR. MAYO: Hello.

13

14 REPORTER: Hello. Is there someone
15 that wants to speak.

16

17 MR. MAYO: Hello.

18

19 REPORTER: Is that Bruce or Randy, it
20 -- Bruce, is that you?

21

22 MR. MAYO: This is Randy Mayo.

23

24 REPORTER: Oh, that's who I thought it
25 might be, or Bruce. Randy, do you want to talk.

26

27 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead, Randy
28 if you got something to say. Go ahead.

29

30 MR. MAYO: I'm not sure where the
31 agenda items are but if given the chance I can make
32 some comments here. Mr. Chair.

33

34 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Well, it's not
35 really time for those comments right now, sir. How you
36 doing Randy.

37

38 REPORTER: Randy, somebody's going to
39 text you where we're at and when that time will be,
40 okay.

41

42 MR. MAYO: Okay.

43

44 REPORTER: Okay. Liz Williams is going
45 to do that.

46

47 MR. MAYO: All right, thank you.

48

49 REPORTER: Okay, go ahead.

50

0056

1 MS. MCDAVID: For folks online, just so
2 you know we are on the agenda, we're still under old
3 business, we're just finishing up Item 10c, we're
4 talking about the Board's annual report replies to the
5 Council. If there are folks online that would like to
6 comment on any of the agenda items you'll get a chance
7 to do so when we get to those items, such as any of the
8 wildlife proposals, there'll be a spot where the Chair
9 will call for public comments on those proposals. Same
10 for folks in the room, if you'd like to comment on any
11 of the topics or the proposals you can fill out one of
12 the blue cards on the back and turn that in to me.
13 There will also be an opportunity tomorrow morning to
14 comment on any non-agenda items. So if you want to
15 bring any concerns or topics to the Council that are
16 not on the agenda, as long as they're related to
17 subsistence, you're more than welcome to do that at
18 that time.

19
20 Thank you.

21
22 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you,
23 Brooke.

24
25 MR. MAYO: Okay.

26
27 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, if there's
28 nothing else to be said about the annual report replies
29 then we're going to move forward to summary of Council
30 correspondence.

31
32 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

33
34 (Teleconference interference -
35 participants not muted)

36
37 REPORTER: So if people online could
38 mute their phones, star, six, we're getting a whole
39 background conversation here.

40
41 MS. MCDAVID: I'll turn the Council's
42 direction to Page 58 of your meeting books. On this
43 page I've put together a small table that summarizes
44 the correspondence that you have either received or
45 that was sent by the Council after the last meeting and
46 some of these topics will come up as agenda items later
47 in the meeting. So just going through that table on
48 Page 58.

49
50

0057

1 The Council received a letter from the
2 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Regional Director about the
3 complexing of the Yukon Flats and Kanuti Refuges. That
4 was a letter to let you know that that complexing, or
5 combination of those Refuges is in the works and there
6 will be someone from the Regional Office talking more
7 to you about that later on in the agenda and that will
8 give you a chance to ask questions or raise your
9 concerns.

10
11 The second letter that was received was
12 from the Wrangell-St. Elias SRC and that included the
13 SRC recommendations for wildlife closure reviews for
14 the Chisana and the Mentasta Caribou Herds. We'll be
15 hearing those comments from the SRC during the
16 proposal review procedures.

17
18 The Council also received a letter from
19 the BLM notifying you all that BLM was planning to
20 extend the withdrawal of BLM lands for the Army Yukon
21 Training Area and Donnelly Training areas. And I
22 believe there was a comment period they were letting
23 you know about for that.

24
25 The Council also received or was copied
26 on a letter from the Western Interior Regional Advisory
27 Council. The Western Interior Council raised concerns
28 about Dall sheep management and sent a letter to the
29 Alaska Department of Fish and Game and Federal
30 Subsistence Board. The Council also drafted some dall
31 sheep management guidelines that they would like to see
32 implemented and we'll be talking about that later on in
33 the meeting, especially since sheep came up as an issue
34 in our annual report also, that's something it seems to
35 be a concern across regionally.

36
37 So those were the letters, four letters
38 that were received by the Council.

39
40 Two letters that the Council sent after
41 the last meeting.

42
43 You sent comments to the National Park
44 Service about the proposed rule for sporthunting in
45 Preserves and we will have a couple of brief updates
46 from National Park Service coming up shortly under old
47 business to give you an update on where that's at.

48
49 And the Council also received -- or
50

0058

1 sent a letter to the Board recommending the Board
2 support continued planning for wood bison
3 reintroduction in the Eastern Interior and that that
4 planning process involve local communities.

5

6 And you will find copies of all these
7 letters in the following pages of your meeting book.
8 And like I said some of these topics will be coming up
9 later on in the agenda and that is my summary for now,
10 Mr. Chair. Thank you.

11

12 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you. Any
13 questions on the Council correspondence from anybody,
14 in the room, online, on the phone.

15

16 (No comments)

17

18 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Council members.

19

20 MS. SHOCKLEY: I'm just.....

21

22 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead,
23 Dorothy.

24

25 MS. SHOCKLEY: Is there going to be
26 some updates or anything on the wood bison, is it on
27 the agenda?

28

29 MS. MCDAVID: We do not currently have
30 it on the agenda. I did get a last minute notice from
31 someone at Fish and Game a couple of days ago that said
32 they might be willing to give a -- or be willing to
33 call in and give an update if the Council has time and
34 the Chair would like to entertain that later in the
35 meeting, that's something we might be able to
36 accommodate.

37

38 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay. I just have some
39 concerns from the Manley region.

40

41 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: So if it doesn't
42 come up there's public comment tomorrow where you could
43 talk about that too, yeah, okay. If that's something
44 that the Board would like to see -- the Council would
45 like to see then we could entertain that, uh-huh.

46

47 MS. MCDAVID: Mr. Chair.

48

49 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Uh-huh.

50

0059

1 MS. MCDAVID: I will see if I can get
2 in touch with Fish and Game representatives and see if
3 we could schedule a short update, perhaps tomorrow,
4 from them. Thank you.

5

6 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you so
7 much. Any other questions. Comments.

8

9 (No comments)

10

11 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, if there
12 aren't any more comments from the Council or on the
13 phone or on the internet or from the room here, I'd
14 like to ask people that are new in the room here to
15 introduce themselves. Please. We got someone here,
16 one row back there, at least.

17

18 REPORTER: Charlie, tell them to come
19 up the mic please.

20

21 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: If you guys could
22 come up to the mic and introduce yourself. We've been
23 trying to find a place to let you guys do that so you
24 can be recognized.

25

26 REPORTER: The silver button there.

27

28 MS. SOLOMON: Here.

29

30 REPORTER: Yep.

31

32 MS. SOLOMON: Okay. My name is
33 MaryBeth Solomon and I'm from Fork Yukon. I'm a
34 council member for the Gwitchyaa Zhee Gwichin Tribal
35 Government IRA. They sent me up here to see what's
36 going on and say a few words here and there perhaps. I
37 think I'll save my words for later so I get a feeling
38 of exactly where we're at. I know we have a
39 representative online, Amanda, I believe, from where
40 we're at. But I just thought I'd introduce myself. I
41 was kind of curious if anybody was going to say
42 anything.

43

44 (Laughter)

45

46 MS. SOLOMON: But just through
47 background, you know, my mom is Hannah Johnathan
48 Solomon, she's from here. She was born here and raised
49 all the way around Small Creek. And my dad is

50

0060

1 Johnathan Solomon, the late Johnathan. He does a lot
2 of stuff and I learned lots from him. And when I was
3 young I got involved with the tribe in the '80s, I was
4 very young, I'm one of their elders now and I also work
5 for them, a parttime job. But I've been involved in a
6 lot of things.

7
8 I feel like I was coming home, so just
9 introducing myself.

10
11 Thank you.

12
13 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you very
14 much.

15
16 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: My name is
17 (Indiscernible). I live here all my life, raise up my
18 kids, grandkids, and I want to say welcome, welcome,
19 welcome to our land and I hope you guys are enjoying
20 yourself and I'm glad you guys came up here to have
21 this meeting. Because it is really important to us.
22 Sheep. Every time they say sheep it reminds me of my
23 ancestors. And I hear people talking about it and now
24 I see where we're at we should stand behind them and
25 fight with them, stop it. And I'm just a volunteer,
26 always a volunteer person in the village, help out any
27 which way when they ask me to help, I be there. And
28 that's it, I just help out lots, yeah, that's it.

29
30 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.

31
32 MR. GARNETT: Hello. My name is
33 Brandon Garnett and I'm part of the tribal council.
34 I'm new to tribal government so I'm willing to learn.
35 I'm really interested to see what you guys do on the
36 Board. Thank you.

37
38 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.

39
40 MR. PETER: (In Native) Good morning.
41 My name is Evon Peter.

42
43 (In Native)

44
45 I'm from Arctic Village. I grew up
46 here with my grandpa and my uncle and I live between
47 here and Fairbanks and, yeah, I'm really busy so I'm
48 not going to be able to be here for most of your
49 meeting but I am going to try to make it back for when
50

0061

1 the proper public comment time is. And we're really
2 glad that you're here getting to be (In Native), you
3 know, this whole area and land around here is all of
4 our ancestral lands, where our people are from and
5 we're really proud to be from here and hopefully you
6 hear some good things from all of our people who are
7 going to make comments tomorrow.

8

9 So Mahsi'

10

11 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Just to let you
12 know we're going to be talking about the Red Sheep at
13 5:00 o'clock tonight.

14

15 MR. PETER: Okay.

16

17 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: And you have a
18 chance tomorrow for your public comment too.

19

20 MR. PETER: Okay. I'll come back at 5.

21

22 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Uh-huh, yep.
23 Okay, I think that's everybody -- oh, one more hiding
24 over there.

25

26 MS. MAGNUSON: Hi, good afternoon at
27 this point. My name is Emily Magnuson. I'm with the
28 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. I'm the recent
29 Assistant Manager for Yukon Flats Refuge. Born and
30 raised in Fairbanks, formerly a biologist and this is
31 my first time at a RAC meeting. I'm here to learn and
32 listen and I really appreciate everyone's time.

33

34 Thank you.

35

36 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you all for
37 introducing yourselves and we'll move forward now.

38

39 MS. JAMES: I'm not going to say very
40 much because I have another time tomorrow on Red Sheep
41 Creek. I just want to welcome everybody here to Arctic
42 Village, (In Native). And I hope you don't get -- hope
43 you guys didn't get cold too much. Well, anyway, I'm
44 concerned because of the agenda because we don't have
45 anybody representing us here on this board. At first
46 it was Larry Williams, which we lost just a week ago
47 and had the funeral in Venetie just recently and he was
48 our leader and he's, you know, he's a father, brother,
49 uncle and I just want to say that about him because he
50

0062

1 sat on this Board for a long time as a tribal member
2 from Native Village of Venetie, tribal government and
3 he did very well job for us. And then Joe -- not, Joe,
4 Andrew Firmin got on there. And also Andrew Firmin
5 from Fort Yukon, we lost him, I just really felt bad,
6 both of them -- you know, when he passed, because he
7 was a great help to me on this Board to get the right
8 wording in there and we need people, something like
9 that, that would understand, I would try to get on this
10 Board but English is my second language and I'm having
11 a hard time sometime explain anything in my language or
12 English, combined, they're totally different cultures.
13 So I kind of get confused sometimes. But it's just my
14 language. But I'm glad I got my language as a first,
15 and then English, I'm happy with it. But it's just I
16 have more -- more time to study, more time to spend and
17 I'm already doing enough out there on the Refuge and
18 doing education as an elder. So that's -- those kind
19 of things I want to mention.

20

21 Because I know the Council was in the
22 process of appointing somebody here so they can apply
23 for the seat and Ernie Peter was one of but, you know,
24 we lost him, too, so we're in the process of getting
25 somebody on the Board and hopefully somebody comes
26 forward soon because we do need people to speak on the
27 subsistence throughout Alaska.

28

29 I so admire these people that sitting
30 on this Board because it covers huge area, cover lots
31 and lots of traditional practice and ways of life for
32 us Native of Alaska so I just kind of admire you guys
33 for being here and doing a meeting here and I just want
34 to say thank you.

35

36 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you so
37 much. Okay, Brooke.

38

39 MS. MCDAVID: Sarah, I would just like
40 to respond to you quickly, please, thank you for
41 addressing the Council. We do have those applications
42 on the table back there and I made sure Chief Galen got
43 a copy and so we'll be accepting applications all the
44 way through March 15th next -- or maybe it's the 14th --
45 mid-March in 2024. So I know that the Arctic Village
46 Council knows how to get in touch with me so if you all
47 would like to nominate someone or submit an application
48 we definitely welcome you to do so.

49

50

0063

1 MS. JAMES: Yeah, thank you for
2 listening to us as a tribe because we did that in
3 Fairbanks with the sport and now we're doing it again,
4 we invite you guys up here, you made time to come up
5 here, it's a huge meeting, to me, it means a lot to me.
6 So I'm so happy you guys get to come up here and we'll
7 be sure to see you next time because sometimes in the
8 past -- like I said, Council here, or the tribal are
9 busy, I mean each village is like that and so much to
10 cover especially these things that threaten the salmon,
11 the caribou, the waterfowl, all that right now that
12 we're trying to stand up for and a lot of times our
13 leaders don't have time for this so sometimes in the
14 past I would be the only one to testify from the whole
15 group sometimes and that's really hard sometimes so
16 we're -- we're doing our best and we just need to move
17 on. Yesterday my brother, Gideon was saying, maybe
18 it's time that, like they did for Vietnam War, they got
19 on the street and they stopped the war, maybe Alaska
20 needs to do that. Because Alaska got a subsistence
21 life and 286 villages and each of them is a Federally-
22 recognized tribe by Ada Dare (ph) and we just lost Ada
23 Dare and we need to tell the world, you know, salmon
24 people are strong, salmon people losing -- lost their
25 way of life, they can't even go to fish camp with their
26 kids so they can camp out and cook to the fire and put
27 out rabbit snare and go out to the next lake to shoot
28 waterfowl, all that is not taking place. So it's
29 really serious.

30
31 I'm glad you guys are talking more and
32 more about sending messages directly to Washington.

33
34 Thank you.

35
36 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you. Go
37 ahead, Don.

38
39 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Sarah, for
40 your testimony. I would just like to say I'm impressed
41 by your engagement and staying engaged, that's very
42 good. Because if you don't stay aware of what's
43 happening things can just roll right over you.

44
45 Thank you.

46
47 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead, Katya.

48
49 MS. WESSELS: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

50

0064

1 Katya Wessels for the record. So in regards to that
2 issue that was brought up earlier about, you know, the
3 topics that will be conveyed to the Secretary of
4 Interior. I was corresponding with OSM Policy
5 Coordinator, Robbin LaVine, and, you know, actually the
6 Board have similar concerns to what you had, you know,
7 during this meeting that when we presented all the
8 annual reports from 10 Regional Advisory Councils to
9 the Board during the August 2023 session, they also
10 felt like they are not able to provide adequate replies
11 because some things are outside of their jurisdiction
12 so they are -- the Board is requesting a meeting with
13 the Secretary of Interior to bring up those issues over
14 which they don't have jurisdiction. And there is --
15 like currently there is no list of these issues yet
16 because, you know, they did not specifically get an
17 appointment with the Secretary, but they are also
18 concerned about the same thing.

19
20 And, you know, among the things that
21 they might want to talk about with the Secretary is
22 like marine issues that are outside of the Board's
23 jurisdiction that is, you know, affecting salmon or
24 some wildlife issues as well, or TransBoundary Mining
25 issues.

26
27 So I'm just giving you examples, it's
28 not like I have the list but also like if you have any
29 additional questions about that, the Policy
30 Coordinator, Robbin LaVine, she's online right now, you
31 can ask her if you have any questions.

32
33 But that's where we are with this, you
34 know, the Board and the Office of Subsistence
35 Management. So that's kind of the answer that I have
36 to that topic that was brought up earlier.

37
38 Thank you.

39
40 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you. Okay,
41 are we done with the summary of Council correspondence.

42
43 MS. MCDAVID: (Nods affirmatively)

44
45 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, we're
46 moving on. We're on E. Hunter Ethics, Education and
47 Outreach Initiative.

48
49 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Mr. Chair. So
50

0065

1 this is an initiative that this Council has been
2 working on for quite some time and it has moved very
3 slowly but we are finally starting to gain a little
4 momentum. I did, if you recall, present to the Board
5 on this at their last regulatory meeting, and the Board
6 supports the continuation of our efforts on this. I
7 mentioned earlier that this summer Dorothy and Linda
8 and I were able to attend a hunter information panel on
9 Fort Wainwright and we have made some good connections
10 with the natural resources management Staff at Fort
11 Wainwright who invited us to give feedback to them
12 about how that hunter information panel went and what
13 else we are -- or you all, as subsistence users, would
14 like to see included. Dorothy and Linda gave good
15 feedback and they're welcome to share more details
16 about what they thought about that.

17
18 But my suggestion is, and I know you
19 all had a working group on this hunter ethics
20 initiative in the past, my suggestion is that we get
21 that going again as a Council because there's not a lot
22 we can do at the meeting but between meetings we could
23 have a couple of teleconferences or in-person, or
24 hybrid meetings in Fairbanks and have also reached out
25 to some of the Fish and Wildlife Service, Office of
26 Communications Team about possibly assisting in
27 developing some of the outreach materials. One idea
28 that came up after the Fort Wainwright hunter
29 information panel was to try to maybe develop a short
30 video about hunter ethics that could be shown and it
31 could be an across agency effort. But, again, that's
32 probably details of things that we'd want to talk about
33 in a working group, outside of this meeting.

34
35 And so I'll turn it over to you, Mr.
36 Chair, if you think having folks nominate themselves to
37 be on a working group would be a good idea.

38
39 Thanks.

40
41 (Laughter)

42
43 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, ladies, if
44 you want to add anything about the hunter ethics trip
45 to Fort Wainwright you're welcome to do so right now.

46
47 (Pause)

48
49 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: No pressure.

50

0066

1 (Laughter)

2

3 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes, thank you. It was
4 informative. I mean I was impressed with the -- what
5 was he a Colonel, or something, and encouraging his
6 people, Army, infantry people to attend, and he really
7 wanted to reach out more to the people that are
8 actually going out hunting. So that was good. I mean
9 he, you know, explained, I think I took some notes but
10 I didn't bring them, but he explained, I think, the
11 difference between ethics and morals, right, and that
12 was interesting. I hadn't heard, you know, anybody
13 really talk about that. And so I think he has a really
14 good rapport and he really does want to do the right
15 thing. And I think it's something that we could
16 pursue.

17

18 As Brooke was talking, I did see a list
19 of hunting ethics from one of the areas in northern
20 Alaska and it was really helpful. I mean it was just a
21 one page list of things that they did in regards to
22 when they go out hunting for caribou. And I gave it to
23 Denakkanaaga, or a copy of it, thinking that maybe they
24 could come up with something as well, but it was just,
25 you know, for example, when they all go out for
26 caribou, you know, they take turns in regards to who's
27 in front so that everybody has an opportunity to get a
28 caribou. And they just take certain ones that are in
29 front of the line and so that was really interesting.
30 And I think that's something that we could work on
31 possibly. It doesn't have to be anything elaborate.
32 Just some of the practices that we use when we're out
33 hunting.

34

35 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Very good. You
36 answered my question. I was going to ask you how we
37 could do -- what we could do better from what you seen,
38 heard and learned from that trip, and really appreciate
39 that and really look forward to seeing that list and
40 seeing the group get back together.

41

42 Go ahead, Brooke.

43

44 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Mr. Chair. If
45 a working group is something that the Council would
46 like to do I think it would be good to have -- can you
47 guys still hear me?

48

49 REPORTER: Yes, but I'm going to replug

50

0067

1 it in, hold up.

2

3 MS. MCDAVID: Test. Test.

4

5 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Hello.

6

7 REPORTER: One more time, I didn't hear
8 the actual connection.

9

10 MS. MCDAVID: Test. Test. Okay, there
11 we go. As I was saying, Mr. Chair, I think a motion to
12 form a working group for hunter ethics and that it
13 involve Council members and outside agencies that are
14 relevant to the efforts would be great at this time and
15 then we can elect folks to be on that working group
16 after we form it.

17

18 Thank you.

19

20 MS. SHOCKLEY: So moved.

21

22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I have a
23 question.

24

25 MS. EVANS: Do you have.....

26

27 MS. SHOCKLEY: Well, I just said so
28 move that we.....

29

30 MS. EVANS: Okay. I'll second just to
31 get it on the table.

32

33 REPORTER: Mics.

34

35 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay, this is Linda, I
36 second the motion to get it on the table.

37

38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And my
39 question is, what happened to the working group that
40 had already been created, is that gone? Is this a
41 brand new working group?

42

43 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I think the same
44 one should -- they know the most about it and I think
45 they should pick it up and carry it on.

46

47 MS. MCDAVID: We just have some new
48 Council members so we'd want to make sure if they
49 wanted to be on the working group, that we elect them
50

0068

1 to be on the working group and those members who were
2 present on the group before can certainly also continue
3 to be on the group and we can continue to work with the
4 outside partners that we have been working with. But I
5 think just to reflect on the record who we're choosing
6 to represent the Council would be great.

7

8 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Of course I think
9 you're right and I think we should ask the ones that
10 were on there if they're willing to do it again because
11 things could change. So if you have that list
12 let's.....

13

14 MR. BASSICH: Mr. Chair, Andy.

15

16 REPORTER: Hang on, Andy.

17

18 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: We don't. Okay.
19 All right, well, the people who were on the list before
20 do you still want to be on there?

21

22 MR. BASSICH: Mr. Chair.

23

24 REPORTER: Hang on, Andy. Charlie.

25 Andy.

26

27 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead, Andy.

28

29 REPORTER: Go ahead, Andy.

30

31 MR. BASSICH: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
32 Yeah, I'm in full support of rejuvenating the program
33 and I'd be very happy to serve on that. I think it's
34 very important and I think we could relatively easily
35 pick up where we left off. We have very good records
36 of the meetings and the participants and I think it's
37 going to be really invaluable for us to keep this
38 moving, Covid kind of stopped it in its tracks but I
39 think we can move forward.

40

41 And I think the goal of the meeting
42 should be to try and develop between one and three
43 ideas for immediate development to put out into the
44 public and that's kind of where we left off. We were
45 working on a couple of different ideas for outreach,
46 some of them have been incorporated such as the liaison
47 program but a few others needed a little bit more
48 refinement and there was work on its way on those.

49

50

0069

1 So in a nutshell, I'd like to be able
2 to continue to be a part of that and look forward to it
3 and I thank our Council Coordinator for keeping this
4 alive in front of the Federal Subsistence Board. I
5 think it's really important statewide.

6
7 Thank you, Mr. Co-Chair.

8
9 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: You're welcome.
10 Under a few other hats that I wear there's been a lot
11 of interest in the hunter ethics program also so I
12 think we'll have some support now that this has become
13 such a big topic. Thank you, Andy.

14
15 Anybody else want to throw their name
16 in the hat at this time to help.

17
18 MS. POPE: Hello, Mr. Chair. This is
19 Amanda Pope.

20
21 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead, Amanda.

22
23 MS. POPE: Thank you. I would like to
24 help in any way I can. There's some things that I've
25 already been working on that I brought up to the Board
26 this past March and also would like to continue that to
27 help the hunter ethics education realm.

28
29 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you very
30 much.

31
32 MS. SHOCKLEY: I can.

33
34 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you,
35 Dorothy, I'm putting your name in there. Okay, well, I
36 guess we can move forward, or we're in a motion, this
37 is a motion. Tina.

38
39 REPORTER: Uh-huh.

40
41 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. All right
42 then.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And, Charlie,
45 I was on it before and I'm willing to continue but if
46 there's new people on there I might say that I would
47 step back and they move forward.

48
49 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Uh-huh.

50

0070

1 Appreciate you Sue.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, thank
4 you. Okay, did we have a second.

5

6 REPORTER: Yes, you did. Linda.

7

8 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Question.
9 Any further discussion.

10

11 MS. SHOCKLEY: What was the motion?

12

13 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: To continue the
14 hunter education and ethics program.

15

16 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay, that's good.

17

18 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay.

19

20 MS. MCDAVID: To clarify, the motion
21 was to form a working group but, yes.....

22

23 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah.

24

25 MS. MCDAVID:you got it. Thanks.

26

27 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you for
28 that Brooke.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I call for
31 the question.

32

33 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Any
34 further discussion.

35

36 (No comments)

37

38 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: We're ready for
39 the question.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Ask for
42 unanimous consent.

43

44 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Since
45 everybody agrees we'll ask for unanimous consent on
46 this. So all those in favor say aye.

47

48 IN UNISON: Aye.

49

50

0071

1 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just ask if
4 there's any opposed.

5

6 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Motion passes.
7 I'm sorry I'm a little rusty here, I haven't been doing
8 meetings all summer.

9

10 (Laughter)

11

12 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. So one
13 topic that just came up on the side is lunch, how are
14 we going to do that.

15

16 MS. MCDAVID: Do you want to do a half
17 hour.

18

19 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah, let's do a
20 half hour and if anybody is still eating we can go into
21 a working lunch.

22

23 MS. MCDAVID: Back at 1.

24

25 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, 1:00
26 o'clock, be back and ready. It's 12:30.

27

28 MR. BASSICH: Hey, Tina, what's going
29 to be the best way to stay connected.

30

31 REPORTER: Andy I'm going to keep the
32 line connected so it's up to you, just put it on mute,
33 and I'm putting this line on mute as well.

34

35 MR. BASSICH: Okay.

36

37 (Prayer for lunch)

38

39 (Off record)

40

41 (On record)

42

43 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, we're going
44 to get started again. And we have Council Member
45 Jagow over there that might have a little bit of a
46 report for us if he might. Just what you're seeing,
47 what's going on, you know the spiel.

48

49 Thank you.

50

1 MR. JAGOW: Yep, thank you. I'll keep
2 it brief. As far as a report, we had a pretty dramatic
3 break up on the Porcupine Yukon River drainages. Fort
4 Yukon flooded quite bad largely and due to the break up
5 on the Porcupine, Circle City as well got flooded out,
6 quite badly. And then once the water went down we had
7 a very cold -- well, not a very cold, but a cooler
8 summer and a summer without fires until summer was just
9 about over and then we had a lot of fires during
10 August, especially to the east of us in Canada, the
11 Village of Old Crow. I ended up having to evacuate in
12 August during the fire season so it was, once, again,
13 just another pretty dramatic fire season, which we're
14 having more and more of.

15
16 And moose season was difficult for
17 folks in the middle Yukon there and the lower
18 Porcupine. It was just very, very warm, moose weren't
19 on the rivers. I know a lot of folks had a difficult
20 time getting moose until the end of the season.

21
22 So that's about all I've got to report.
23 Very happy that we're having a meeting here. My dad
24 was actually up here in 1977, he was working up in
25 Prudhoe Bay and he walked off the job site and walked
26 all the way up here so that's -- I've never been here
27 but my dad had some good stories of it.

28
29 Thank you.

30
31 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you,
32 Charlie. Go ahead, Brooke.

33
34 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I
35 received a written report from Council Member Eva Burke
36 who was not able to be with us today and we send our
37 regards to Eva and her family.

38
39 So I'll read Eva's report for the
40 record and this is what she has to say.

41
42 I would like to start seeing more
43 defined regulatory changes that account for climate
44 change. In a lot of science reports in meetings
45 climate change is often listed as a main cause for
46 negative changes to species or habitats but no
47 regulatory action is taken by regulatory agencies and
48 bodies to account for that change. For example, when
49 the Fortymile Caribou Herd was expected to have a
50

0073

1 harvestable surplus of 10,000 caribou the regulatory
2 decision was made to take extra animals because the
3 land could not support the dietary needs of those
4 animals. Immediately after this regulatory action the
5 herd only had 600 harvestable surplus. This huge
6 decline that took place over two short years suggests a
7 rushed and uninformed decisionmaking process. Too many
8 caribou were taken and their habitat was further
9 degraded by the amount of ATV traffic. Additionally,
10 the vegetation assessment that was used to determine
11 how many animals the land could support should be
12 further investigated. Current technology is limited
13 for large scale landscape analysis of vegetation. The
14 proper decision would have been to take less animals
15 than was allowed to account for natural loss. This
16 would have also allowed for better understanding of the
17 carrying capacity of the land based on observations,
18 not just predictions, which is why it is important to
19 allow avenues for local and traditional knowledge to
20 influence and affect decisionmaking.

21
22 Another example of this is that even
23 more disturbing is the current way in which NOAA
24 describes winners and losers in a warming Arctic and
25 she has sent a link to a report, the North Pacific
26 Fishery Management Council that regulates off shore
27 fishing fails to recognize that there are people
28 associated with those winners and losers. It is not
29 only to blame climate change -- it is not okay to
30 blame climate change and not take action. I also think
31 that a false narrative is created when fisheries off
32 shore of Alaska are called sustainable. There are
33 rapid changes taking place in the ecosystem, multiple
34 species and fisheries are crashing and business will
35 not be able to continue as usual. The science that is
36 currently underway to understand the food web,
37 especially in the Bering Sea, is sorely lacking and
38 will take many years to understand. Historically
39 fisheries crash before science ever catches up. Last
40 year NOAA finally include the Arctic/Yukon/Kuskokwim
41 watershed in its ecosystem status report. While this
42 is good, it will take years to provide updated and
43 accurate information to reflect the current status of
44 our ecosystem including the people who rely on the
45 loser species. The EIS process is supposed to account
46 for the socioeconomic impacts to Alaskan fishing
47 communities is missing the fact that many of our
48 coastal communities live in poverty with limited access
49 to food and income. Even though scientists are warning
50

0074

1 us of unprecedented changes in the Arctic there is no
2 accounting for that in the total allowable catch that
3 is set every year.

4
5 The North Pacific Fishery Management
6 Council cannot use chinook bycatch alone to set their
7 TAC, or total allowable catch for the Bering Sea. The
8 data for chinook bycatch in the Bering Sea began in
9 2003, which was well after several bit crashes to this
10 species. The bycatch is low because the chinook
11 population is low. Scientists are beginning to say
12 that the Bering Sea fisheries TAC for pollock will need
13 to be lowered, that is the only way to account for
14 unpredictable and unprecedented changes in the ocean
15 due to climate change or not. Scientists also
16 understand the sheer biomass of fisheries itself, how
17 many pounds of seafood are taken out of the ocean each
18 year has a huge impact on the ocean especially for
19 warming waters and ocean productivity, but are still
20 trying to numerically paint that picture.
21 Unfortunately these mathematical models take lots of
22 data and years to develop and are still limited in
23 their ability to predict even three years ahead.

24
25 Therefore, it is urgent that we begin
26 to account for the unknown future that climate change
27 presents and begin a savings plan to ensure the future
28 of the loser species, the magnificent Alaska chinook
29 that feeds the hearts and souls of our people that
30 unites us with our ancestors. There is only one way to
31 do that in the near term, lower the total allowable
32 catch for the Bering Sea pollock.

33
34 Thank you, Eva.

35
36 That concludes her report.

37
38 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you so much
39 Brooke. And thank you, Eva, if you're listening.

40
41 Okay, we're going to move on. We're on
42 F, special action updates. Oh, is he here -- oh, yeah,
43 yeah, we'll do this, we got a blue card from Edward.
44 Come on up Edward.

45
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It's a non-
47 agenda item.

48
49 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: It's a non-agenda
50

0075

1 now, my friend.

2

3

(Laughter)

4

5 MS. MCDAVID: You have to eat all of
6 those Dorothy.

7

8

MS. SHOCKLEY: Great entrance.

9

10 MS. MCDAVID: We just had a bunch of
11 chocolate spilled on the floor.

12

13

(Laughter)

14

15

MR. SAM: Everybody settle down.

16

17

(Laughter)

18

19 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, Madame
20 Chair and Mr. Chair, thank you for giving me this small
21 opportunity to explain what's bothering me.

22

23

I emphasize.

24

25

26 I'm going to talk about whitefish and
27 king salmon. Now, I'm not a biologist but I'm doing my
28 best to review everything in biology and I do a lot of
29 research and physics. Anything that will disturb all
30 humankind. On this issue is whitefish.

30

31

32 I used to have a dog team and I catch a
33 lot of whitefish in lakes right above here about three-
34 quarters of a mile. We catch all the fish we want.
35 Another place is 15 miles away they call Old John Lake.
36 Now the problem I found on the fish in the area. It
37 got wound, wound just like on open skin, the best
38 analogy that I could present you is benzine, they call
39 benzine. Over in Canada along the Yukon River they use
40 those mill, lumber mills where they have chips,
41 leftover chips and they gather it all up and they do
42 dry it up and all that, and they put benzine in there
43 and they compress it to a certain type of table,
44 cabinets, all that is made with benzine. The residue,
45 after compressing -- after the residue remaining of the
46 particles it goes into the river. From my
47 understanding the wound on the whitefish is benzine.

47

48

49

So I'd like the wildlife to research
into that.

50

0076

1 Another issue is on the same matter, on
2 the Canadian side, I'm not just pointing at Canadian
3 but there's -- along the Yukon River, Fort Yukon on up
4 10 years ago, 10, 15 years ago me and my friend Eddie
5 Frank, his name is, we did some analogy and research
6 and fish counting, 60 percent of the fish diverted into
7 Chandalar River. Maybe because of cleaner water. I'm
8 not sure. I'm not a fish biologist.

9
10 Another main issue is those fisheries,
11 okay, those big trawlers, they catch -- they got --
12 they call mosh, they got big ones, they're using those
13 big ones to catch all those big king salmons. The one
14 that escapes is the smaller ones, that's what we've
15 been trying to regulate here. That's wrong. As a
16 matter of fact they ship all those good king salmon
17 overseas, China, Japan, Korea, six months later they
18 ship it back in a little can where you could just fish
19 for it and some places we are not allowed to on the
20 Yukon River because of regulation. They stopped
21 gillnet fishing. I see it on TV. I feel bad, it's
22 their livelihood, the family, the dogs, it's their
23 livelihood they're taking away. They should have
24 better regulations and look at the people that live in
25 the communities, what they depend on yearly, we depend
26 on caribou, the Yukon depend on king salmon.

27
28 I wanted to reiterate yesterday's
29 statement, opening of sheep management. I mentioned
30 about the President -- the first President of the
31 United States. I was hoping to get some answers but
32 halfway -- I only described it halfway so I thought if
33 somebody could give me a little idea of that poetry, a
34 picture, the first President of the United States, like
35 I indicated, there was no Polaroid camera back then but
36 the pictures are perfect, a person from France traveled
37 to United States on his vacation and seen this first
38 President going across Delaware, maybe he had the
39 calvary, he's supposed to, but -- and that painting
40 there was a buck clothing, a caucasian man, buck
41 clothing, moving ice, the President -- the President
42 have his arm like that. I seen that painting in 1965.
43 It was a painter from France, he went back to France
44 and he painted that picture like I indicated, buck skin
45 clothing. Behind him and the first President, behind
46 him there was a farmer, behind him was a pioneer lady,
47 across from them, across from her there was a negro,
48 way in the back there was an Indian, that's a dream, a
49 dream from France, painted that picture. A year or so
50

0077

1 he returned back to the United States presented that
2 picture to the Congress of the United States and oh it
3 looked so cool, a dream of a person from another
4 country had a dream, and that small boat of different
5 people is going to develop America. I wanted to finish
6 -- I was hoping somebody -- a lot of people have seen
7 that picture, I was hoping somebody would come up and
8 say something but I guess I'll just go along.

9

10 But I thank you for listening to my
11 comment about the salmon. I appreciate all your
12 concern, all your time. I'll cross my fingers and I'll
13 help you as much as I can. You all have a good
14 afternoon and thank you.

15

16 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you,
17 Edward. Okay. With that we're going to move into
18 special action updates. And we're going to ask for the
19 brief version. I think Brent's coming up first, yeah.

20

21 MR. VICKERS: Yep. Yep. Thank you
22 very much. Again, this is Brent Vickers for the record
23 and I am the Anthropology Division Supervisor with the
24 Office of Subsistence Management. I am here to update
25 the Council on two fisheries related special actions
26 from last summer.

27

28 First Fisheries Special Action FSA23-
29 02, which was submitted to OSM and requested the
30 Federal Subsistence Board to do two things. First
31 close Federal public waters to the Yukon River drainage
32 to the harvest of chinook, summer and fall chum and
33 coho salmon except by Federally-qualified subsistence
34 users in 2023 and, second, require Federal subsistence
35 fishing schedules, openings, closures and fishing
36 methods be determined by the Federal Fisheries Manager.
37 The request fell within the Board delegation of
38 authority and the Federal In-Season Manager, Holly
39 Carroll, so it was transferred to her. During the 2023
40 season, Ms. Carroll actively managed the fishery in
41 coordination with her counterparts at the Alaska
42 Department of Fish and Game. When there was a
43 harvestable surplus for summer chum, Ms. Carroll
44 limited participation in Federal public waters to
45 Federally-qualified subsistence users to ensure a
46 priority use during times of conservation.

47

48 If the Council has questions regarding
49 this, or any other Federal management action on the
50

0078

1 Yukon this season, please refer to Ms. Carroll's
2 written update she provided in the Council -- provided
3 to the Council, which can be found in your supplemental
4 materials.

5

6 This concludes the presentation on this
7 action -- special action. Does the Council have any
8 questions?

9

10 (No comments)

11

12 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I hear none.
13 Anybody online or on the internet.

14

15 (No comments)

16

17 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, hearing
18 none, we can.....

19

20 MS. CARROLL: Through the Chair, this
21 is Holly Carroll.

22

23 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, Holly go
24 ahead.

25

26 MS. CARROLL: Through the -- I mean I
27 just wanted to let you guys know that I was standing by
28 in case you had any feedback for me on this item or if
29 you had any questions about the Federal management.

30

31 (No comments)

32

33 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Council members,
34 any questions.

35

36 (No comments)

37

38 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Don't sound like
39 we have any questions from the Council, or on the
40 phone, or in the room.

41

42 MS. CARROLL: Okay. And, Mr. Chair,
43 may I follow up with a question for you guys?

44

45 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: What's that?

46

47 MS. MCDAVID: She wants to ask you a
48 question.

49

50

0079

1 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Oh, go ahead.

2

3 (Pause)

4

5 REPORTER: Holly, go ahead.

6

7 MS. CARROLL: So we decided not to give
8 a fisheries update on your agenda, hopefully that's
9 okay. I just wanted to let you guys know that we did
10 that so that you could spend more time on your wildlife
11 items. So I won't be on the call for fisheries updates
12 but one thing we did just want to hear any feedback on
13 is that one of the only systems that we were able to
14 open up for fishing was the T'eedriinkik, formerly
15 called the Chandalar River, and our whole management
16 team was curious whether any of you were able to go and
17 fish for fall chum in that drainage.

18

19 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Not seeing any
20 hands. Not hearing any comments. So I'm guessing no.

21

22 MS. CARROLL: Okay, thanks very much.

23

24 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you too.
25 And Andy, did you have a question.

26

27 (No comments)

28

29 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, so you can
30 go ahead and move forward with the next thing on the
31 agenda.

32

33 MR. VICKERS: Great, and thank you.
34 And thank you Holly for listening and speaking up and
35 stepping in, I really appreciate that.

36

37 Again, this is Brent Vickers with the
38 Office of Subsistence Management. I'm now going to
39 update the Council on Fisheries Emergency Special
40 Action Request FSA23-03.

41

42 OSM submitted this request to
43 temporarily enact the customary and traditional use
44 determination for coastal communities for salmon that
45 was recognized by the Board during their 2023 fisheries
46 regulatory meeting. The request was administrative in
47 nature and intended only to ensure the coastal
48 communities of Scammon Bay, Hooper Bay, and Chevak were
49 considered Federally-qualified subsistence users for
50

0080

1 all species of salmon during the 2023 fishing season.
2 The Board approved the request. This customary and
3 traditional use determination for these communities
4 will be formally updated to include all species of
5 salmon when the fisheries regulatory cycle final rule
6 publishes in the Federal Register this winter.

7
8 That concludes my presentation on this.

9
10 Are there any questions.

11
12 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you. Any
13 questions Council members.

14
15 (No comments)

16
17 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Anybody on the
18 phone.

19
20 MS. SHOCKLEY: I have a question.

21
22 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, go ahead,
23 Dorothy.

24
25 MS. SHOCKLEY: So what is a Federally-
26 qualified user?

27
28 MR. VICKERS: Thank you for that
29 question, Council Member Shockley. A Federally-
30 qualified subsistence user is a rural resident of
31 Alaska who has a customary -- lives in a community
32 which has customary and traditional use determination
33 for a specific resource. So in this case the
34 Federally-qualified subsistence users, and I -- I -- I
35 don't want to say it wrong, for the Yukon drainage for
36 salmon actually covers quite a bit of communities
37 within the Yukon drainage and on -- and when there's a
38 -- particularly when there is a closure -- you can
39 close the season to all except for Federally-qualified
40 subsistence users, then only those -- those people who
41 live in those specific communities listed with a
42 customary and traditional use determination are able to
43 harvest during that closure.

44
45 MS. SHOCKLEY: And who determines these
46 people?

47
48 MR. VICKERS: The Board makes
49 determinations through regulatory proposals. There's a
50

0081

1 list of communities, if you look through your
2 handbooks, for each species that says, specifically,
3 which communities have customary and traditional use
4 determination for that species in that unit. A lot of
5 those customary and traditional use determinations came
6 to -- were basically -- we inherited from the State
7 when we took over manage -- the -- the Subsistence
8 Program and the ones that have been made since are made
9 through the Board after a regulatory proposal so -- so
10 a community submits a proposal to request a
11 determination be made for that species, which you'll
12 actually see during this meeting.

13

14 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes, I remember when the
15 State was going through that process so I was just
16 curious how you.....

17

18 MR. VICKERS: Uh-huh.

19

20 MS. SHOCKLEY:came up with that,
21 as far as.....

22

23 MR. VICKERS: That.....

24

25 MS. SHOCKLEY:the Federal, I
26 guess.

27

28 MR. VICKERS: Yes, we inherited that
29 and have since made changes to the process that the
30 State was doing back in 2017 [sic] so it's a much more
31 -- the Council provides much more feedback, it's not a
32 checklist of things anymore, it's a much more -- I
33 would like to say qualitative in nature, we give an
34 evaluation and Councils make a recommendation and the
35 Board listens to those recommendations.

36

37 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay, thank you.

38

39 MR. VICKERS: Thank you. Anything
40 else?

41

42 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Any more Council
43 questions.

44

45 (No comments)

46

47 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Anybody else on
48 the phone or anything like that, in the room.

49

50

0082

1 (No comments)

2

3

4 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, hearing
5 none we will move forward to -- we're still on special
6 action updates F, and we are on No. 3, and that will be
7 Todd Rinaldi.

8

9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Tom Plank.

10

11 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Uh?

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And Tom

14 Plank.

15

16 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Oh, yeah,

17 Tom Plank.

18

19 MR. PLANK: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
20 members of the Council. And you're also correct, sir,
21 I believe Todd Rinaldi is also on the phone as well for
22 questions on this one. And I'm going to give a brief
23 overview of the Emergency Wildlife Special Action
24 WSA23-01 which was submitted by the ADF&G and WSA23-03,
25 which was submitted by BLM and AITRC's request that the
26 fall caribou season in Unit 13 be closed due to a
27 dramatic decline the Nelchina Caribou Herd population.

28

29 The most recent population information
30 for his special action was brought in July and the most
31 recent population estimate was for the fall of 2022 and
32 at that time it was 17,433 animals, which was a
33 reduction of 50 percent from the fall 2021 estimate.
34 And the Board approved this wildlife special action
35 recognizing the conservation concerns warranted a
36 closure of all users for the fall 2023 season.

37

38 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, is
39 that it?

40

41 MR. PLANK: Yes, sir, thank you.

42

43 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Any questions,

44 Council.

45

46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just one to
47 Fish and Game if Todd's still on. We didn't get the
48 report for how many Nelchinas were counted in '03 -- I
49 mean '23, sorry -- I'm going back 20 years.

50

0083

1 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, if there
2 are no other questions, I guess we'll move on.

3
4 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I need an
5 answer.

6
7 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: You need an
8 answer.

9
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

11
12 MS. MCDAVID: Todd was supposed to be
13 on.

14
15 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, we'll wait
16 for Todd.

17
18 REPORTER: Todd, are you online?

19
20 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Is he online
21 Tina.

22
23 MR. RINALDI: Yes.

24
25 REPORTER: Go ahead, Todd.

26
27 MR. RINALDI: Good afternoon, this is
28 Todd Rinaldi with the Department of Fish and Game. The
29 question was what was the summer 2023 population
30 number?

31
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.

33
34 REPORTER: Yes.

35
36 MR. RINALDI: Yeah, so the minimum
37 count was 7,384 caribou, that included 23 bulls to 100
38 cows and there were 13 calves per 100 cows.

39
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And, again,
41 that's a pretty huge reduction from the year before.

42
43 MR. RINALDI: And then.....

44
45 REPORTER: Todd, wait a second, she's
46 still talking.

47
48 MR. RINALDI:this.....

49
50

0084

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I just wanted
2 to bring it out, thank you.

3

4 REPORTER: Todd. Todd, hang on, Sue
5 was still talking so we didn't get any of that.

6

7 MR. RINALDI: Okay.

8

9 REPORTER: Can you repeat it?

10

11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Did he get
12 that?

13

14 REPORTER: Yeah, because he was just
15 talking at the same time.

16

17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, I
18 apologize Todd, this phone system isn't that great.

19

20 MR. RINALDI: Okay.

21

22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: But I was
23 just wanting to make sure people understand that Tom
24 just gave the report from '21 to '22 a 50 percent
25 reduction and this is, I don't know what the percent
26 is, but it's over a 50 percent reduction from '22 to
27 '23.

28

29 (Pause)

30

31 REPORTER: Did you get that Todd, any
32 comment?

33

34 MR. RINALDI: No, I'm sorry, I only
35 caught the tail end of that, I didn't know that -- I
36 didn't hear a question in that.

37

38 REPORTER: I don't know that there was
39 a question but -- okay, she'll say it again, hold on.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just the
42 question is, or a statement that you can agree on is
43 what the percentage was between '22 and '23 reduction.

44

45 MR. RINALDI: Oh, it's probably about
46 50 percent, I'd have to look at it. But I think our
47 estimate last fall was about 18,000.

48

49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I

50

0085

1 guess I failed in.....

2

3 MR. RINALDI: That's fall to fall
4 there. Yeah, that's.....

5

6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER:math
7 because that's over 50 percent. I know I'm talking
8 over him again. Anyway, just a point that that's
9 quite -- it's a huge reduction, it's well over 50
10 percent. Thank you.

11

12 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you. If
13 there's no other questions we'll move on to No. 4, and
14 that says Tom Plank on it.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's Tom.

17

18 MR. PLANK: Yes, sir, Mr. Chair, give
19 me just one second.

20

21 (Pause)

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: What about
24 Todd Rinaldi, did he want to say anything else.

25

26 REPORTER: He didn't say anything, do
27 you want me to ask him.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

30

31 REPORTER: Yes, ask him or what?

32

33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: (Nods
34 affirmatively)

35

36 REPORTER: Hey, Todd, do you want to
37 say anything else?

38

39 MR. RINALDI: Thank you. Through the
40 Chair. I was just going to note that this year we had
41 a really unique opportunity to not only complete a
42 minimum count survey which is a survey approach that we
43 most often are forced into because of the lack of the
44 Nelchina's summertime aggregation, this year we were
45 able to do that minimum count and we were able to get a
46 photo census done for the first time. So that not only
47 will approve our models moving forward but it also
48 truths the relationship between a photo census and a
49 minimum count. So we're pretty comfortable with that
50

0086

1 moving forward and excited that we'll be able to get
2 both at such a critical time on the herd's status.

3

4 Thank you.

5

6 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.

7

8 MR. PLANK: Thank you, Mr. Chair and
9 members of the Council. I apologize. I collapsed that
10 screen too fast. And, again, for the record my name is
11 Tom Plank, Wildlife Biologist with the Office of
12 Subsistence Management. And this is a brief overview
13 of Wildlife Special Action WSA23-05, which was
14 submitted by the Yukon-Charley Preserve and it was to
15 close the sheep season within Yukon-Charley National
16 Preserve in Units 20E and 25C only from August 10th to
17 September 20th of 2023 to all users. The Board
18 approved WSA23-05 recognizing a conservation concern
19 due to a dramatic decline in the number of observed
20 sheep within the Yukon-Charley south of the Yukon River
21 warranted the closure. The most recent minimum count
22 survey data from the National Park Service showed that
23 the sheep abundance within Yukon-Charley is in serious
24 decline and in July 2023 the count was 72 total animals
25 detected which was a decrease of 67 percent since the
26 last survey in 2018 and a 77 percent decrease from the
27 long-term average. The minimum count survey observed
28 only two legal rams across all survey areas and,
29 although, not all areas surveyed by the National Park
30 Service showed such a decline, Unit 25B is not included
31 in the closure as sheep abundance in the Ogilvie
32 Mountain survey area had declined by only 28 percent
33 since the 2018 survey. So the closure was only
34 affecting the National Park Service managed lands in
35 Unit 20E, 25C and this allowed the National Park
36 Service managed lands in 25B to remain open to provide
37 some subsistence opportunities while also allowing for
38 State harvest.

39

40 And that is the end of my presentation
41 and I'm here if you have any questions.

42

43 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.
44 Council members, any questions.

45

46 (No comments)

47

48 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Anybody on the
49 phone. In the audience.

50

0087

1 (No comments)

2

3 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Hearing none, we
4 appreciate your time.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: What's next.

7

8 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, well, I
9 think you wanted to do this next one, didn't you?

10

11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

12

13 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, well, I'll
14 turn it over to Sue. Thank you, Sue.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, thank
17 you, Charlie, you're doing a good job. So this is an
18 action item and it's FR22-01 lower Copper River salmon
19 fishery. A request for reconsideration. Brent will
20 bring it up. And for the new member, we have a
21 process, it's on the back of our nameplate of how we go
22 through this, this is the introduction first.

23

24 MR. VICKERS: All right, thank you,
25 Madame Chair. My name is Brent Vickers, I am the --
26 from OSM. And this is an action item and you will be
27 making a comment to the Board on it. The analysis for
28 Request for Reconsideration, which I'll just call
29 RFR22-01 is on Tab 3 of the supplemental materials.
30 This request was submitted by Ahtna Incorporated in
31 response to Board action that created a salmon fishery
32 adjacent to the lower Copper River Highway Bridge.

33

34 We conducted a -- OSM conducted a
35 threshold analysis to evaluate the claims made in Ahtna
36 Incorporated's request and we, OSM, presented our
37 threshold analysis to the Board at the winter 2023
38 fisheries regulatory meeting. The Board found
39 potential merit with one of the claims and directed OSM
40 to conduct a full analysis of this claim. This claim
41 called Claim 4.1 suggests that the Board misinterpreted
42 information on the projected impacts of the new Federal
43 subsistence fishery in the lower Copper River on
44 Federally-qualified subsistence users in the upper
45 Copper River. The claim asserts that the harvest
46 projections in the analysis were based on faulty
47 assumptions. At the winter 2023 meeting the Board also
48 heard testimony that this information was inaccurately
49 conveyed to the public, the Councils and the Board.

50

0088

1 OSM analyzed this claim in two parts.

2

3

4 The first part evaluates how we
5 developed the estimate -- estimated harvest for the
6 lower Copper River fishery including who was most
7 likely to participate.

7

8

9 The second part evaluates how that
10 information was conveyed to the public, the Councils
11 and the Board.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

For these evaluations we conducted a
review of the past analysis, meeting materials and
meeting transcripts. After analysis of this
information our conclusion is to oppose RFR22-01.

REPORTER: Hang on, Brent. So we just
got disconnected so why don't you hold up while I
redial unless you don't care.

(Laughter)

REPORTER: It's up to you, I don't
care, I'm recording, but the people online won't be
able to hear, but we can.

MR. WRIGHT: I just want to bring the
Council members up to things, I went through with the
gals over here all these action items that we have in
front of us and we're going to be challenged to get it
done probably and there are things, like this one, that
if you choose not to take it up because it's something
we have taken it up in the past we can do that because
it's actually occurring on the down river but it
affects the people up river though, that's why that's
on our agenda and there's even crossover proposals.
It's just stuff that you look at, you decide, okay,
yes, I want to take it up, or, no, we don't have to,
but this is something -- this proposal -- or this
fishery is a brand new fishery and it was two --
Southcentral and Eastern Interior took it up.
Southcentral passed it to start with by a few votes
more than not and then it turned around and we voted
unanimously against it, it came back up again and then
it -- with some changes in some members on the
Councils, both Councils, and we stayed the same
unanimously against it and then because of the up river
people affected and then Southcentral -- if I remember
correctly there was one vote different and -- but the

0089

1 Federal Board passed the fishery.

2

3 So just to let you know that's a
4 synopsis of how -- and you might remember -- some of
5 you were on it then. Yes, okay. I'm just saying as
6 long as everybody is good we're taking this one up.

7

8 Charlie.

9

10 MR. WRIGHT: If I remember right this
11 will be the third time.

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh.

14

15 MR. WRIGHT: The first time we did --
16 we left it to the Southcentral.....

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No, we voted
19 on it, I think.

20

21 MR. WRIGHT: I thought we maybe just
22 voted to let them deal with it the first time, I
23 remember, and then we moved on it -- I can't remember.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We had a.....

26

27 MR. WRIGHT: Uh-huh.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER:a joint
30 Council meeting.

31

32 MR. WRIGHT: Yeah. At the joint
33 meeting it was said that -- but they put the whole --
34 or they let everybody in the Southeast [sic] area there
35 by Cordova fish in there, but originally they said that
36 it was the subsistence users of Cordova, that was the
37 original proposal that I remember reading.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Then it
40 became all of Prince William Sound.

41

42 MR. WRIGHT: Yeah. Yep. And then last
43 year at the meeting we talked about it and said that
44 originally that was only supposed to be for the locals,
45 not the whole area because of the people up river being
46 -- having a hard time getting fish.

47

48 Thank you, Sue.

49

50

0090

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you for
2 that additional information. Yes. Are we on?

3
4 REPORTER: Yes.

5
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, good.

7
8 REPORTER: So do you want to go back to
9 Brent.

10
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So I'm
12 assuming you all want to take it back up again so we
13 will continue through the process.

14
15 REPORTER: Which is still Brent.

16
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Right.

18
19 REPORTER: Okay.

20
21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh.

22
23 MR. WRIGHT: Yeah, go ahead, Brent.

24
25 MR. VICKERS: Okay, thanks. I'll just
26 pick up right where I was stopped, or where I think I
27 was stopped.

28
29 (Laughter)

30
31 MR. VICKERS: After analysis of this
32 information, our conclusion is to oppose RFR22-01.

33
34 The Board's purview is to provide
35 opportunity for Federally-qualified subsistence users
36 to harvest fish and wildlife, to conserve those
37 populations when necessary, and to uphold the Federal
38 rural subsistence priority. Our Program uses best
39 available information to estimate who would participate
40 in the fishery and how many salmon they might harvest
41 in a season. Through our review of the transcripts,
42 some of which are cited in the analysis, we determined
43 that information was accurately conveyed to the
44 Councils, the Board and the public through oral
45 presentations and written analysis, and, last, the
46 Board did not solely rely on the harvest estimate when
47 they approved the lower Copper River area fishery. The
48 primary reason the Board approved this fishery was the
49 under-served Cordova residents who did not have
50

0091

1 adequate access to or meaningful Federal priority for
2 Copper River salmon.
3

4 In short, we found that the harvest
5 estimate was based on the best available information
6 and our review of the meeting materials and transcripts
7 indicated that this information was conveyed accurately
8 to the public, the Councils and the Board. The
9 estimate harvest from this fishery was 2,000 sockeye
10 and 300 chinook salmon. The first year of the fishery
11 was 2022 and 113 sockeye and three chinook were
12 reported harvested. This year in 2023, 176 sockeye and
13 four chinook were reported harvested.
14

15 That is our summary of RFR22-01 full
16 analysis. We oppose this request.
17

18 Thank you, Madame Chair. Members of
19 the Council.
20

21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any
22 questions.
23

24 Brooke.
25

26 MS. MCDAVID: Brent, is it correct that
27 the Council may provide a comment to the Board if they
28 would like to do so. You can't provide an official
29 recommendation because it's not within your region but
30 just for your information.
31

32 MR. VICKERS: Thank you, Brooke. That
33 is correct. Because the communities of the Eastern
34 Interior do not have customary and traditional use
35 determination for the Prince William Sound area, that
36 this is an opportunity for this Council to make a
37 comment because as its has been stated by members of
38 the Council this fishery can impact upper river users.
39

40 Thank you.
41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Before you go
43 on, my question is we took this up before and so now
44 we're changing policy, now it's just you -- we took it
45 up as a.....
46

47 MS. MCDAVID: Madame Chair.
48

49 MR. VICKERS: Go ahead, Brooke.
50

0092

1 MS. MCDAVID: Just for your
2 clarification. We did take it up before but it was the
3 same thing, we had to provide a comment instead of an
4 official recommendation. The Board still took it under
5 consideration but we don't have the same deference as
6 the Southcentral Council does. And I did just get a
7 note from Robbin LaVine that the Southcentral Council,
8 they're meeting at the same time, and they just voted
9 to oppose RFR22-01, so you can take that into
10 consideration if you decide to make a comment.

11
12 Thank you.

13
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Council
15 members, what would you like to do.

16
17 Don.

18
19 MR. WOODRUFF: At our last review, I
20 quoted the village of Eyak about the fisheries review
21 for that district and they have a very good perception
22 on reviewing that fisheries and their comment was that
23 the fishery is so young that an evaluation of it is not
24 valuable, or valid. And my perspective is that 167 or
25 170 fish is not going to impact the people on the upper
26 Copper River. It's just a minimal harvest, I think.
27 100 fish is no big deal.

28
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So as the
30 Chair I'm just asking the Council, do you want to send
31 in a -- what are you calling it?

32
33 MS. MCDAVID: A comment.

34
35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: A comment.
36 All we would be doing is sending in a comment. What
37 would you like to do, do you want to just move on
38 because it's out of our region -- okay, I'm hearing
39 that we, a nodding of heads, if anyone is opposed to
40 this to move on because it's out of our region, we are
41 only given a comment. And I would say our comments
42 have already been in.

43
44 MR. WRIGHT: I think we should follow
45 Southcentral's lead.

46
47 MS. MCDAVID: You could comment that
48 you support the Southcentral Council.

49
50

0093

1 MR. WRIGHT: Yes.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, it's
4 one or the other, what do you want to do, it takes a
5 motion.

6

7 MR. WRIGHT: I, myself, would like to
8 follow the Southcentral's comments, or their vote. I
9 don't know how -- I can't speak for the rest of the
10 Council members so you'll have to speak up for
11 yourself.

12

13 MS. EVANS: This is Linda. I think
14 because it's not in our jurisdiction we should not
15 comment.

16

17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So we got
18 mixed feelings here. And it just takes a motion. So
19 if we don't take it up it would do the same, all of the
20 -- what would happen at the Federal Board is they'd
21 listen to Southcentral. If we did take it up, we would
22 just -- and go with Southcentral, we would just
23 reinforce Southcentral so it's one or the other.

24

25 MS. EVANS: So do we want to reinforce
26 Southcentral?

27

28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Charlie does.

29

30 MR. WRIGHT: Uh-huh, I do.

31

32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That takes a
33 motion.

34

35 MR. WRIGHT: I make a motion to support
36 South.....

37

38 REPORTER: Charlie, your mic.

39

40 MS. MCDAVID: Mic. Mic.

41

42 MR. WRIGHT: I'll make the motion to
43 support Southcentral's decision on the matter.

44

45 MR. WOODRUFF: Second.

46

47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. It's
48 been moved and seconded to support Southcentral's
49 position on this, which is they are opposed to -- let's
50

0094

1 get it clear. They are opposed to OSM's.....

2

3 MR. VICKERS: (Shakes head negatively)

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No. Okay, I
6 need help.

7

8 MR. VICKERS: Let me -- let me read
9 this. Okay, they voted in opposition of the RFR,
10 meaning that they support the OSM conclusion. The
11 justification that they had was the Council found the
12 harvest of the two years of this fishery to be so small
13 as to not impact other user groups. They noted that
14 the fishery supports the priority use of resources by
15 subsistence users as stated in Title VIII of ANILCA.
16 They are aware of the concerns up river, and they noted
17 that they feel that the community members who dealt
18 with the high water issues this past summer, they
19 recommended that instead of focusing on tribe versus
20 tribe or up river versus lower river, and that
21 restrictions be focused on non -- that restrictions be
22 focused on non-subsistence users groups and their
23 harvest in times of conservation need.

24

25 Thank you.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Discussion
28 Council members on the motion. Do you understand it.

29

30 MR. WOODRUFF: Call for the question.

31

32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. The
33 question's been called for -- any discussion at all.

34

35 (No comments)

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Don.

38

39 MR. WOODRUFF: Could you explain what a
40 positive and a negative vote would indicate?

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, you're
43 putting it on me, this is going to be a fun one. I
44 think he just did. This motion was to go with
45 Southcentral which was just read into the record. Is
46 that sufficient, Don.

47

48 MR. WOODRUFF: Yes.

49

50

0095

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

2

3 MR. WRIGHT: When he first stated the
4 -- he only said half of it, or I didn't hear it right
5 so I'm not changing nothing but I hear more the second
6 time. That's all I had to say.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, I
9 think, Charlie, what he did is he just read what they
10 did at their meeting just recently, which we didn't
11 have in front of this.

12

13 MR. WRIGHT: Okay, I have a question.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

16

17 MR. WRIGHT: Is this for Cordova people
18 only?

19

20 MR. VICKERS: Thank you for that
21 question. So I know that there was confusion and I
22 know that you made a comment during the Board meeting.
23 We looked back at the transcripts and everything, so
24 just -- although there may have been confusion, it was
25 always stated at the Council meetings and in the
26 analysis that all of the rural residents of the Prince
27 William Sound area have C&T but based on our reasonable
28 estimate that it would primarily be Cordova users who
29 participated in it and that's because of the logistics
30 of anyone from around the Prince William Sound area
31 actually going to Cordova to use this fishery, the
32 expenses and everything that that would entailed, that
33 it really just seemed -- for making it a -- as best and
34 accurate estimate they based it on the population of
35 Cordova.

36

37 MR. WRIGHT: Right. So if the whole of
38 Prince William Sound was allowed to go and fish there,
39 those numbers would change dramatically, wouldn't they?

40

41 MR. VICKERS: If more of the users --
42 if all the users from the Prince William Sound, I'm
43 sure it would, if you look in the analysis, we list out
44 reasons why we don't find that to be reasonable, just
45 the cost associated with flying or using a boat to get
46 to Cordova, if you have a boat to get to Cordova, you
47 could use the other fisheries en route and probably
48 harvest a lot more fish on the way.

49

50

0096

1 MR. WRIGHT: So one of the reasons I
2 remember being against this is because they have so
3 many more opportunities on the ocean. They have
4 mammals, they have so many different kind of fish and
5 the people up river don't so that was the whole problem
6 that I understood in the past so I don't -- I don't
7 know, it still bothers me.

8
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Charlie, it
10 sounds like -- do you understand what we're voting on?

11
12 MR. WRIGHT: Yeah, I'm just bringing
13 back a little history on it.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

16
17 MR. WRIGHT: Yeah, to make sure that
18 I'm clear.

19
20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh.

21
22 MR. WRIGHT: I just wanted to make sure
23 that I was clear and understanding properly, I wanted
24 him to tell me.

25
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

27
28 MR. WRIGHT: Okay. Thank you.

29
30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.

31
32 MR. WRIGHT: So it'll be on the record.

33
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah. Okay.
35 Go ahead, Brooke.

36
37 MS. MCDAVID: Yeah, I think those were
38 valid concerns that the Council expressed and now that
39 the fishery has actually been opened and we had that
40 data that the harvest was minimal and that alludes to
41 what Southcentral Council said, so hopefully that
42 addresses your concerns.

43
44 Thanks, Charlie.

45
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And I will
47 have to add, having been there on the Copper, on the
48 lower Copper River like that and dipnetting and not the
49 use of boat, it's challenging, it's extremely
50

0097

1 challenging and dangerous and very few places that they
2 can actually do it. I will say that. It's going to be
3 very challenging. And they do have -- a lot of the
4 people have so many more opportunities. This fishery
5 was created specifically for people who didn't have a
6 boat to use the State subsistence fishery.

7

8 Okay. Just more information.

9

10 So any more questions, Council members.

11

12 (No comments)

13

14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm going to
15 assume the question's been called for and I'm going to
16 ask for a roll call vote, please.

17

18 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Madame Chair.
19 And I'll just restate it so everyone's clear. So the
20 Eastern Interior RAC is going to submit a comment to
21 the Federal Subsistence Board supporting the
22 recommendation of the Southcentral Council and that
23 recommendation is to oppose RFR22-01.

24

25 So if you vote yes you're supporting
26 the Council and you're supporting the opposition of the
27 RFR.

28

29 Okay, I'll start with roll call here in
30 the room.

31

32 Linda.

33

34 MS. EVANS: I'm thinking.....

35

36 REPORTER: Turn your mic on for me.

37

38 MS. EVANS: I'm thinking.

39

40 REPORTER: Oh, you're still thinking,
41 sorry.

42

43 MS. EVANS: I'm still thinking how I'm
44 supposed to vote.

45

46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Do you need
47 help?

48

49 MS. EVANS: I do.

50

0098

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, Linda
2 needs help to understand. Maybe Linda, explain what
3 your wishes are so you know.
4

5 MS. EVANS: Okay. So I.....
6

7 REPORTER: But turn your mic on so it's
8 on the record Linda. Sorry.
9

10 MS. EVANS: I think I don't want to
11 vote on this issue because it's not in our region, our
12 area. And I -- should I abstain, should I pass.
13

14 MS. MCDAVID: You can abstain Linda if
15 that's your wish.
16

17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Clarification
18 from Charlie.
19

20 MR. WRIGHT: The upper Copper River is
21 in our area, that's why we're taking it up, the people
22 are, the people who would be affected, just so you
23 understand that.
24

25 MS. EVANS: The upper Copper.....
26

27 MR. WRIGHT: That would be the
28 upper.....
29

30 MS. EVANS: But what villages,
31 what.....
32

33 MR. WRIGHT: All of them except for the
34 mouth.
35

36 MS. EVANS: All of them so.....
37

38 MR. WRIGHT: All of them.
39

40 MS. EVANS: Oh, okay.
41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So in Unit 12
43 and Unit 11 there's people all in -- like in the upper
44 Tanana region they get to fish the Copper River.
45

46 MS. EVANS: Uh-huh.
47

48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And it's by
49 -- mostly by fishwheel and the fishwheels are in Slana,
50

0099

1 which is right there off the Copper River in Unit 11
2 and Unit 12. The Unit 12 residents is us, Unit 12
3 residents is us and we're the ones that get to go down
4 there and fish on that part of the river.

5
6 MS. EVANS: Okay. So.....

7
8 REPORTER: Linda, I have to have your
9 mic on, thank you.

10
11 MS. EVANS: Okay. A positive vote
12 would be supporting it or a negative vote?

13
14 MS. MCDAVID: A positive vote would be
15 opposing it in line with the Southcentral Council's
16 recommendation.

17
18 MS. EVANS: And Southcentral is the
19 Ahtna region, right?

20
21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes. Okay,
22 now I'm confused.

23
24 MR. WRIGHT: Yeah, it's very confusing.

25
26 MS. MCDAVID: Okay, so voting yes
27 opposes the RFR, and that is how the Southcentral
28 Council, the Council whose region this is in voted.

29
30 MS. EVANS: I would vote yes.

31
32 MS. MCDAVID: Charlie Jagow.

33
34 MR. JAGOW: Yes.

35
36 MS. MCDAVID: Dorothy Shockley.

37
38 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes.

39
40 MS. MCDAVID: Donald Woodruff.

41
42 MR. WOODRUFF: Yes.

43
44 MS. MCDAVID: Charlie Wright.

45
46 MR. WRIGHT: Yes.

47
48 MS. MCDAVID: Online. Andy Bassich.

49
50

0100

1 MR. BASSICH: Yes.

2

3 MS. MCDAVID: We heard a yes from Andy.

4

5 MR. BASSICH: Yes.

6

7 MS. MCDAVID: And online, Amanda Pope.

8

9 MS. POPE: Yes.

10

11 MS. MCDAVID: Sue Entsminger.

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.

14

15 MS. MCDAVID: Motion passes, eight to
16 zero.

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Are
19 you ready.

20

21 MR. WRIGHT: Unh-unh.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No, okay.
24 Okay. What we're trying to do here is trying to train
25 Charlie up to follow this what we're going through here
26 and unfortunately the next one -- oh, boy that's hiding
27 in there. I have all these red asterisks on my agenda
28 and there's no asterisk by H, so it's the National Park
29 Service proposed rule update by Eva Patton.

30

31 MS. PATTON: Hi, good afternoon, Madame
32 Chair and members of the Council.

33

34 REPORTER: Okay, hey, Eva, Eva, hang
35 on, just a second, let me get you on the speaker, we're
36 doing this on a cell phone unfortunately.

37

38 Okay, go ahead, Eva.

39

40 MS. PATTON: Hi. Good afternoon,
41 Madame Chair and members of the Council. This is Eva
42 Patton with the National Park Service, Regional Office
43 in Anchorage. Are you able to hear me okay?

44

45 MS. MCDAVID: We've got you, thank you.

46

47 (Pause)

48

49 REPORTER: Go ahead, Eva.

50

0101

1 MS. PATTON: Okay, thank you. I
2 couldn't quite hear, folks in the background there.
3 Yeah, so I have just a very brief updates on the
4 National Park Service proposed wildlife rule.

5

6 So back in the spring, the public
7 comment period for the wildlife rule was extended by
8 two weeks for a total comment period of 77 days and
9 closed on March 28th, 2023. The wildlife rule came
10 before most of the Councils and the Subsistence
11 Resource Commissions in the spring for your review and
12 comment. And a draft final rule was crafted after a
13 thoroughly public input, feedback from the SRCs, and
14 the Regional Advisory Councils and consultation with
15 tribes and it's now currently under review and ongoing
16 consideration in D.C.

17

18 The public, SRCs and RACs will be
19 notified as soon as the final rule is published.

20

21 So that's all we have to be able to
22 share right now. So it is under review in Washington,
23 D.C., and we're waiting to receive final word from them
24 on the final rule.

25

26 Thank you, Madame Chair.

27

28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
29 Eva. Quick question. When you say draft, was drafted,
30 does that mean that it'll go out for public comment
31 again?

32

33 MS. PATTON: No, so the draft was out
34 for public comment, all of the public comment received
35 and comments from the RACs and SRCs and tribal
36 consultation was considered and a final draft developed
37 and that's what's in Washington, D.C., right now, so
38 once they make a final determination then that will
39 become the published rule and we'll let folks know as
40 soon as that does publish.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Thank
43 you for that. Appreciate it. Any questions of Eva,
44 Council members.

45

46 (No comments)

47

48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.
49 Hearing none the next thing on the agenda in new
50

0102

1 business is Temporary Wildlife Special Action on the
2 Nelchina Caribou, 23-02 and 04, the winter closure, and
3 this is an action item for us and, again, it's caribou
4 that come into our region and we have a C&T from our
5 region is why we're taking it up.

6
7 MR. PLANK: Thank you, Madame Chair.
8 Members of the Council. Again, for the record my name
9 is Tom Plank, I'm a Wildlife Biologist with the Office
10 of Subsistence Management. And I will be presenting a
11 summary of the analysis for Temporary Wildlife Special
12 Action Request, WSA23-02 and 04. And Special Action
13 Request was submitted by the Alaska Department of Fish
14 and Game and Special Action Request 23-04 was submitted
15 by the Alaska Board of Game, and these requests could
16 be found in your books starting on Page 97.

17
18 Temporary Wildlife Special Action
19 Request WSA23-02 requests the hunting of the Nelchina
20 Caribou Herd on Federal public lands in Units 12 and 13
21 be closed to all users for the remainder of the 2023/24
22 regulatory year.

23
24 Temporary Wildlife Special Action
25 Request WSA23-04 requests the same closure but asks to
26 add Unit 11 to the closure area.

27
28 The proponents submitted the request
29 because they are very concerned about the low numbers
30 of the caribou observed during recent population
31 surveys, results from the fall 2022 survey estimate is
32 17,433 caribou and the most recent results from July
33 2023 estimated at an even lower 8,800 animals.

34
35 The proponent states that the severe
36 weather over the last two winters caused a high
37 mortality in both adults and calves and low recruitment
38 into the 2021/22 calf cohort. The low levels have not
39 been sufficient to increase the population over the
40 last (indiscernible - phone interference) years
41 (indiscernible) from their fall estimate that there was
42 no harvestable surplus and closed all State hunts for
43 Nelchina Caribou Herd and after the summer survey
44 results returned with an even lower number ADF&G
45 anticipates not offering any regulatory year 2024 hunts
46 on the Nelchina Caribou Herd.

47
48 The regulations regarding management of
49 the Nelchina Caribou Herd have varied along the
50

0103

1 fluctuation of the population since as early as the
2 1990s. For many years in the '90s a State Tier II
3 system was in place and that changed to a Tier I which
4 reverted to a Tier II before changed to being changed
5 to a Tier II in combination with community harvest
6 hunts in the late 2000s. In 2016 as the population of
7 the herd fluctuated around the upper limits of the
8 management objective the Board authorized actions to
9 increase Federal opportunities to harvest from the herd
10 in Units 13 and Unit 12. ADF&G issued four emergency
11 orders in 2018 changing the harvest limit from one
12 caribou to one bull, establish a three day report
13 requirement and closed several fall hunts as harvest
14 quickly approached quota. The State ended up closing
15 winter hunts before they were to start as all the
16 harvestable surplus was taken during the fall hunting
17 season. In 2019 ADF&G extended all State caribou
18 seasons in Unit 13 reduced the population back to
19 within the population objective, at the same time the
20 Board rejected a request to close Federal public lands
21 in Unit 13, determining a closure was not warranted for
22 conservation purposes as Federal harvest remained
23 consistent and that a closure would not alleviate
24 public concerns -- public safety concerns. Then in
25 2020 the Board changed the harvest limit in Unit 13
26 from two bulls to two caribou for regulatory years 2021
27 and '22. The Board approved a change in harvest limits
28 to provide additional subsistence opportunity because
29 there is no conservation concerns. They also approve
30 the closure to Federal public lands in Units 13A, and
31 13B to moose and caribou hunting by non-Federally-
32 qualified users for the same season. The Board
33 supported the closure for reasons of public safety and
34 the continuation of subsistence uses. In 2022 the
35 Board adopted a proposal which gave delegated authority
36 to the Superintendent of Wrangell-St. Elias National
37 Park and Preserve, this allowed for a minimal
38 subsistence harvest opportunity on the Nelchina Caribou
39 Herd if they migrate through Unit 11 and then also in
40 2022 ADF&G took action to decrease population decline
41 of the Nelchina Caribou Herd by changing harvest
42 limits. The resident caribou harvest limit in Unit 13
43 set at one bull only and they determined a harvestable
44 surplus of a thousand bull caribou was available. Both
45 State registration hunts were closed by emergency order
46 when quotas were quickly exceeded. June 2023 the State
47 announced the closure of all Nelchina Caribou Herd for
48 2023/23 [sic] via emergency order and then as we heard
49 earlier, September the Board closed the Federal fall
50

0104

1 Nelchina Caribou Herd by request of ADF&G and BLM via
2 WSA23-01 and 03. And then last week Emergency Wildlife
3 Special Action WSA23-06 was submitted by the Alaska
4 Department of Fish and Game requesting that Temporary
5 Special Action Request submitted to close the winter
6 caribou season in Units 11, 12 and 13 be considered as
7 an emergency special action due to a possibility of a
8 Federal government lapse in funding and this closure
9 request is due to dramatically declined -- is due to a
10 dramatically declining Nelchina Caribou Herd
11 population, and the Board approved this action for the
12 same reasons stated in WSA23-01 and 03.

13
14 State management goals and harvest
15 objectives for the Nelchina Caribou Herd are based on
16 the principles of sustained yields. Since the 1990s
17 ADF&G has aimed to maintain a fall post population of
18 35,000 to 40,000 caribou with a goal of three to 6,000
19 caribou harvested annually. Population of the Nelchina
20 Caribou Herd has fluctuated greatly over time.
21 Population estimates from 2003 to 2022 range from
22 21,000 to 53,000 caribou. Many times the herd has
23 exceeded State population objectives and harvest
24 regulations have been liberalized to quickly reduce the
25 population to preserve habitat condition. The summer
26 of 2019, the Nelchina Caribou Herd population estimate
27 increased to the highest measurement on record of
28 53,500 caribou, however, since estimates have continued
29 to return lower numbers until they reached an all time
30 low of 8,823 caribou in July 2023. State management
31 goals are to maintain ratios of 40 bulls to 100 cows
32 and 40 cows to 100 cows [sic]. These ratios also have
33 fluctuated greatly over time between 2003 and 2023,
34 bull average 41 to 100 cows and calves averaged 36 to
35 100 cows. The composition survey conducted in July of
36 2023 resulted in the lowest ratio for bulls of 23 to
37 per 100 cows [sic] and the lowest observed calf ratio
38 of 13 calves per 100 cows, indicating another
39 potentially low recruitment rate for 2023. Deep snow
40 across the range of the Nelchina Caribou Herd during
41 winter of 2021/2023 led to increased adult mortality,
42 spring thaw has also late -- spring thaw was also late
43 that year delaying migration and calving which led to a
44 low calf recruitment, preliminary indicators suggest
45 difficult winter conditions for 2022/23 once again led
46 to poor recruitment.

47
48 The Nelchina Caribou Herd is a popular
49 herd to hunt and experiences heavy harvest pressure.
50

0105

1 Harvest quotas are adjusted annually to achieve State
2 management objectives and keep the herd from growing to
3 unsustainable levels. Over 95 percent of the total
4 Nelchina Caribou Herd harvest occur in Unit 13 but in
5 recent years caribou have largely been unavailable on
6 Federal public lands during the fall Federal season.

7
8 Between 2001 and 2022 harvest from the
9 Nelchina Caribou Herd under State regulations in Unit
10 13 ranged from 519 to 5,785 caribou per year. For
11 comparison, caribou harvests under Federal regulations
12 for the same period ranged from 102 to 610 caribou per
13 year. Federal harvest accounts for an average of 14
14 percent of the total Unit 13 caribou harvest. Federal
15 permits issued from 2019 to 2022 averaged 2,746 which
16 is comparable to the overall average since 2001.
17 Reported Federal harvest from 2022 and '23 of 142
18 caribou, however this was much lower than the long-term
19 average from 2001 to 2022 of 371 caribou. Success
20 rates for the Federal caribou harvest deeply -- for
21 Federal caribou harvest depends largely on caribou
22 availability which is a function of migration timing
23 rather than abundance. Nelchina Caribou Herd harvest
24 also occurs on Federal public lands in Unit 12
25 Remainder during the may be announced winter season,
26 this hunt has been conducted annually since 1998 and
27 while this hunt sees less participation than Unit 13
28 hunt with a smaller pool of Federally-qualified
29 subsistence users it still produces an annual harvest
30 with an average of 28 caribou. This hunt has
31 historically allowed for the harvest of cows, which has
32 averaged 40 percent of the total harvest.

33
34 The range of the Nelchina Caribou Herd
35 falls largely within traditional territory of the Ahtna
36 Athabascans. The winter range of this herd, though
37 variable, also extends east into the traditional
38 territory of the Athabascans of the upper Tanana
39 region. Caribou historically provides an important
40 source of food in winter when other resources are not
41 available. ADF&G Division of Subsistence conducts
42 periodic subsistence surveys, the results of surveys
43 between 1982 and 2015 show that communities continue to
44 depend on caribou with an average estimate of harvest
45 of up to 39 pounds of caribou per person per year and
46 an average of 25 percent to 64 percent of survey
47 including -- surveyed households using caribou.
48 Residents of the upper Copper and Tanana regions have
49 expressed frustration with the number of non-local
50

0106

1 hunters coming to the region harvesting caribou and
2 moose, which has created serious concerns among --
3 about hunter safety, competition and impacts on the
4 habitat of the Nelchina Caribou Herd.

5

6 If this special action is approved by
7 the Board there will be no harvest of caribou for the
8 Nelchina Caribou Herd on Federal public lands in Units
9 11, 12 or 13 by any users for the winter of 2023/24
10 season and this would be a major reduction of the
11 important subsistence resources available to Federally-
12 qualified subsistence users. While this restriction
13 would eliminate a much relied upon natural resource of
14 Federally-qualified subsistence users the expected
15 reduction in harvest may help conserve the Nelchina
16 Caribou Herd viability and aiding its recovery. Any
17 achieved population increase will provide more
18 subsistence opportunities in the future.

19

20 So, therefore, the OSM's preliminary
21 conclusion is to support WSA23-04 and take no action on
22 WSA23-02.

23

24 And that completes my summary, I'm here
25 if you have any questions.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Council
28 members, any questions.

29

30 (No comments)

31

32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Now if
33 we look on the back of our name tag, the next thing
34 would be a report on Board consultation, tribes and
35 ANCSA Corporations.

36

37 (No comments)

38

39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: What am I
40 missing?

41

42 MS. MCDAVID: Orville, are you online
43 to share the summary for the Nelchina Caribou tribal
44 consultation. Thank you.

45

46 (No comments)

47

48 MS. MCDAVID: Is anyone online with OSM
49 in Anchorage?

50

0107

1 (No comments)

2

3 REPORTER: Orville, are you online.

4

5 (No comments)

6

7 REPORTER: Anyone from OSM for 23-02/04
8 to report on the tribal consultation.

9

10 MS. VOORHEES: Hello, this is Hannah
11 Voorhees with OSM.....

12

13 MS. LAVINE: This is Robbin LaVine --
14 oh, Hannah.

15

16 REPORTER: There's a couple, yes.

17

18 MS. VOORHEES: Robbin, you can go
19 ahead, too, but I will try to track -- the consultation
20 summary -- either Orville or (breaking up) to the
21 Council if you give me a second, thank you.

22

23 REPORTER: Okay, who's talking, is that
24 you Hannah?

25

26 MS. MCDAVID: Hannah.

27

28 REPORTER: Oh, Hannah, okay, thank you.

29

30 MS. VOORHEES: Hannah Voorhees.

31

32 REPORTER: Okay, sorry, Hannah.

33

34 (Pause)

35

36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, we're
37 going to come back to that one. Are there any agency
38 comments from ADF&G.

39

40 (No comments)

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Federal
43 agencies.

44

45 (No comments)

46

47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Or tribal
48 entities.

49

50

0108

1 (No comments)

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Can --
4 yeah, I see that, Edward, do you have a question.

5

6 MR. SAM: How big is the caribou herd?

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: If you can,
9 can you just ask a Staff on a break on that, that would
10 be helpful. Is Orville on for the report for the
11 tribal consultation?

12

13 (No comments)

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Tina.

16

17 REPORTER: Are you on, Orville?

18

19 (No comments)

20

21 MS. MCDAVID: Madame Chair. I think it
22 would be important to hear that summary because Ahtna,
23 I recall, did have some comments about the Unit 13 and
24 like a resident herd that's in Denali that might not be
25 part of Nelchina Herd and they wanted to provide some
26 comments on that. So hopefully we can get that summary
27 here shortly.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Can you text
30 him, it sounds like something's going wrong here.

31

32 MS. WESSELS: Yeah, I already texted
33 him.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Well,
36 this is very important, I agree, and the only reason I
37 moved on is because of timing. And I'm -- and Orville
38 when you get on you just butt in here we're going to
39 keep going.

40

41 MR. VICKERS: (Indiscernible - away
42 from mic) going to email me the tribal consultation
43 summary.

44

45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Orville's
46 going to do it?

47

48 MR. VICKERS: Hannah Voorhees is going
49 to.....

50

0109

1 MS. MCDAVID: They're going to email it
2 to him.

3
4 MR. VICKERS:email it.....

5
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, they're
7 going to email him the tribal consultation.

8
9 MR. VICKERS: And I'll -- I'll.....

10
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: He'll butt
12 in, okay. The next would be Advisory Committee -- or
13 group comments -- so other Regional Advisory Councils,
14 have they met -- okay, we'll stop for one second.

15
16 (Pause)

17
18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go ahead.

19
20 MS. CELLARIUS: I have an SRC comment.

21
22 REPORTER: Barb is online.

23
24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Wait a
25 minute.

26
27 REPORTER: Okay, hang on Barb.

28
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Barbara we're
30 going to get to you, I'm on the Regional Advisory
31 Councils and then we'll -- Fish and Game and then the
32 SRC. Sorry about this confusion here, it's just very
33 hard on the phone.

34
35 Other Regional Advisory Councils. Did
36 the Southcentral take it up, go ahead.

37
38 MR. PLANK: Yes, Madame Chair, this is
39 Tom Plank. I just got a message that Southcentral took
40 it up and they supported it.

41
42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.
43 Anyone else -- that was probably the only one that
44 would take it up.

45
46 (No comments)

47
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any Fish and
49 Game Advisory Committees have taken it up, does anyone
50

0110

1 know.

2

3

(No comments)

4

5

6

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Now
Barbara, Subsistence Resource Commissions, go ahead.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

MS. CELLARIUS: Good afternoon, this is
Barbara Cellarius, Wrangell-St. Elias National Park and
Preserve and I'm presenting a comment from the
Wrangell-St. Elias National Park Subsistence Resource
Commission which met last week.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

The Wrangell-St. Elias National Park
Subsistence Resource Commission unanimously supports
Temporary Special Action WSA23-04 with the additional
request that OSM immediately begin an ANILCA Section
.804 subsistence user prioritization analysis and that
the analysis include both State and Federal harvest
data. The Commission supports the closure due to
conservation concerns associated with the current
population status of the Nelchina Caribou Herd.
However, it is also concerned about the impacts of a
closure on the continuation of customary and
traditional subsistence uses especially if it takes a
long time for the herd to recover. The .804 analysis
is needed to identify which Federally-qualified rural
communities are most dependent on the resource so that
when there is a harvestable surplus there can be a
limited Federal subsistence hunt for those communities
with a small quota to continue customary and
traditional uses. And I will add that the SRC also
submitted a special action request to OSM requesting
that .804 analysis.

36

37

Thank you, Madame Chair.

38

39

40

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Thank
you, Barbara. Did you have that report?

41

42

43

REPORTER: Orville, are you online,
star, six if you're online.

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

(No comments)

MR. VICKERS: I've heard that he is
online but for some reason we can't hear him.

REPORTER: Orville press star, six

0111

1 again. Sometimes you have to do it more than once.

2

3 MR. LIND: Hello.

4

5 REPORTER: All right, we've got you, go
6 ahead.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hello, go
9 ahead, Orville.

10

11 MR. LIND: Can you hear me?

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.

14

15 MR. LIND: Oh, okay. So I couldn't
16 hear you guys at first so I had to call back in. And I
17 believe the request was to hear the consultation on 23-
18 02 and 04; is that correct?

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes. WSA.

21

22 MR. LIND: Okay, I'm not hearing
23 anybody but I'll go ahead.

24

25 REPORTER: Yeah, it's WSA23-02/04,
26 Nelchina Caribou.

27

28 MR. LIND: Nelchina Caribou, okay.
29 Good afternoon, Madame Chair and Council members.
30 Orville Lind, Native Liaison, Office of Subsistence
31 Management. We did have consultations and I'm just
32 going to go ahead and go through -- go through this,
33 it's fairly lengthy.

34

35 So starting off with a resident from
36 the Native Village of Kluti-Kaah stated that the count
37 -- on the use of the caribou traditional --
38 traditionally, and they just calling in to see what
39 they could do to get help in the -- in the region and
40 they are wanting to see steps to take to secure the
41 herds for the future use.

42

43 AITRC President wanted to recognize the
44 loss of Gene Peltola.

45

46 In regard to Nelchina closures, they
47 did not -- they did not get information -- the Federal
48 agency did not give members -- or numbers until just
49 before the public hearing. There were no population
50

0112

1 numbers for anyone to make an effective decision. They
2 told them that they would need these numbers before
3 putting a proposal in for winter closures. And they
4 also requested that the OSM start an .804 user analysis
5 and the Federal take has been pretty flatlined for over
6 a decade and they -- the State community hunt has been
7 flatlined for over a decade and the thing has been
8 fluctuating is different State hunts -- the State hunts
9 have increased, not the Federal hunts. They've taken
10 -- four to 10 percent of the caribou take for the
11 entire time and -- and they urge the Feds to look at
12 their own numbers and population estimates, start
13 collecting them and try to take -- they're trying to
14 take away the rural priority rights. And this process
15 is pretty frustrating. The middle of hunting season,
16 not a caribou -- a single caribou to be seen, toward
17 the ends of August -- the State has closed Unit 13 only
18 but not for the other units that the Nelchina Herd has
19 gone in to, not parts of 20E, parts of 12. The State
20 has left those open. The other thing, anytime there
21 is a potential for a closure, a consultation should
22 automatically be scheduled prior to the public comment
23 hearings, or near the same time. It wasn't until we
24 made the request that we got this session started right
25 in the middle of our moose hunting season. We are more
26 dependent on the moose now because of the caribou
27 closures. An area biologist said that it could take 20
28 years for this herd to recovery and that's a long time.
29 A generation will lose out to the ability to go
30 hunting, to harvest. We got the may be announced hunt
31 for Unit 11 on the books for last year but just
32 difficult to see that there would be any rural
33 priority. They've also been working on the change of
34 classification of the landscape. DNR has changed --
35 it's approximately 15 percent of wildlife of (breaking
36 up) and 50 percent recreational. When we looked at the
37 map, part of that 50 percent was BLM and part of it is
38 Ahtna land, in their own mapping they are not
39 accounting for the wildlife habitat. If the herd is so
40 critically low I would urge you to oppose -- they would
41 urge you to oppose that plan to protecting the Nelchina
42 Caribou Herd. Recently they found that DNR/UAA is
43 looking to get land on the highway, University land
44 ends up getting sold, we expect to have another sight
45 with recreational cabins everywhere that's destroying
46 the caribou habitat. We've got the Tangle Lake
47 archaeologically district that's protected. We're
48 getting it from all fronts, working hard to protect the
49 wildlife. Looking at healthy populations is literally
50

0113

1 becoming a full-time job for our biologists, ecologists
2 and herself. It's a frustration that we have to work
3 so hard for that. And now that the State is trying to
4 take away our Federal rights as well. They
5 (indiscernible - breaking up) constitution of what is
6 held and reserved by the Department, we would be able
7 to monitor and hunt on our own land. We would be able
8 to regulate the hunting on our lands, work more closely
9 with them and (indiscernible - breaking up) on wildlife
10 management but that's not the case right now, ANCSA,
11 Native allotments are under State management. If they
12 just hadn't watered down ANCSA, hadn't watered down
13 ANILCA we wouldn't be having this fight. The State
14 continues to have a hunt when they know the population
15 was at 21,000 animals, Tier I, it's below management
16 objectives. They don't give the confident intervals
17 but they were very confident that they were at 46 to
18 100, it's one or the other. We have asked for a five
19 year moratorium at the March meeting. We submitted
20 papers with numbers and asked for a five year
21 moratorium but that wasn't even mentioned, now they are
22 looking at Federal closures. I want to take this
23 moment here to thank you for your time. And one of the
24 things that we were talking about in the -- manager --
25 the in-season manager -- the Federal harvest falls
26 within the State's confidence intervals. That is --
27 anyway, we want to thank you for your time and we -- we
28 appreciate you listening.

29

30 There was a resident from Chickaloon
31 shared that there needs to be an indigenous people set
32 aside, he doesn't agree with the policies out there and
33 it makes most of the people unable to hunt. He doesn't
34 agree with the Tier system, he doesn't understand why
35 we have to get in line for a number, it's a travesty
36 with what's going on with (indiscernible - breaks up)
37 websites opening up, that's part of the reason there's
38 a crash, people moving into the territory, now even
39 more threats, people selling land in the area, I think
40 there should be a closure to everyone except tribal
41 peoples. A lot of people don't realize that Chickaloon
42 is a tribal village. In agreement with Ahtna what was
43 said it should be closed to everyone except tribal
44 peoples. Obviously the State and Federal government
45 aren't doing a very good job. Caribou herd used to be
46 120,000 and then -- and then it goes -- if it goes to
47 60,000 they would have knocked it down to 30,000,
48 what's wrong with -- it's just craziness, people don't
49 want to look at the real facts, that's what's going on
50

0114

1 up here and thank you for listening.

2

3

4 Another resident from Kluti-Kaah said
5 they were -- heard of anyone getting a moose this year,
6 the crises on the caribou is really devastating, it
7 will take 30 years to revamp that population. For six
8 years we testified to the State of Alaska and Federal
9 Subsistence Board, we want some action done, following
10 what indigenous peoples know about the lands and Ahtna
11 we know what the land -- we know what the land --
12 manage -- better than any other scientists. You see
13 caribou lasting one to five miles -- running through
14 Denali Pass getting (indiscernible - breaks up) Eureka,
15 this is bad management. If they gave Ahtna people a
16 seat at the table we would have better control of the
17 management of the land. This is caribou clan country,
18 Ahtna region, it hurts me that my kids will never get
19 to skin a caribou or how it tastes -- this continues --
20 we are going to do nothing -- if you are not going to
21 do anything about then you can at least say that you
22 have a -- that you did this consultation. There are
23 also a lot of predators out there and we thank you for
24 listening. One more thing the caribou are sustainable
25 meat. Moose came in the early 1900s. Before then our
26 people depended and lived on caribou for thousands and
27 thousands of years. We have oral history about when
28 the caribou first came to earth.

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

Chickaloon residents also shared that
there needs to be policies set aside for the people --
doesn't agree with Tier II systems -- and it's a
travesty what happened in this region. Overharvesting
caused the crash in the caribou he says.

Another resident wanted to point out
that the caribou have been taken from us. We need to
look at closing our hunting for non-locals,
prioritizing people who live in rural Alaska as tribal
people. Our caribou are gone now and we need to start
looking at our moose and start protecting that.

Again, the AITRC President replied --
she thanked the Kluti-Kaah resident -- we need to close
Federal lands to State users -- we are not allowed to
use our Federal permit on State lands but yet they can
use the State permit on Federal lands. Then they --
around closures. People from the Lower 48 will call in
but they do not understand the landscape there. They
do get different permits in the Lower 48 of course.

0115

1 The State is fighting against so hard against Katie
2 John the Governor is making comments about State
3 rights, this is for BLM -- the State selected land is
4 not incumbent -- it does not belong to them to manage
5 -- right now there is no priority -- we've been asking
6 for selections now we are waiting for -- for -- to go
7 away so that they can look at the mining and mineral
8 rights for Unit 13 where a majority of our BLM lands
9 are and they are looking solely for the mineral rights.
10 The caribou herd wouldn't survive. It would not
11 survive.

12
13 We get eight to 10,000 people to hunt
14 and fish on the Copper River salmon, this valley cannot
15 feed the entire state. The Kluti-Kaah, the tribal
16 administrative serving on the emergency planning
17 committee -- the plan was to be able to feed 10,000
18 caribou -- to feed state in an emergency -- it wouldn't
19 last Anchorage one day -- taking 10,000 caribou from
20 the Nelchina Herd right now would eliminate the herd.
21 The management by the State is a self -- it's supposed
22 to be a self -- best -- best -- and the best system in
23 the whole country but they are using permits, non-
24 resident permits as a fundraiser technique rather than
25 looking at what's best for the resource. We've been
26 asking them -- in March to look at what's best for the
27 resource. ANILCA is tribal law. Indian law. And it's
28 in the preamble there is a priority and a need -- start
29 working towards that -- I asked the (indiscernible -
30 breaking up) that you work -- do people work with the
31 State -- we've given the -- -- the State to do the
32 research -- contract indigenous organizations -- they
33 could do those calving counts or caribou counts for
34 you, AITRC as well, rather than giving it to the State
35 and once -- manipulating it all, tell you -- we -- we
36 don't know what you're doing -- a lot about Federal
37 agencies -- just -- they just take what the State tells
38 them. Trying to attach ANILCA and rural priorities --
39 thanks for dedication to serve on this Board it is much
40 appreciated. We know what it's like to serve on these
41 Boards, time away from family, time away from home.

42
43 Any time there is consideration of a
44 closure there should be something done for shutting
45 things down and also a part of a process for reopening.
46 This is only for this season -- we would ask that an
47 .804 analysis -- doesn't need to be done for this
48 closure, this is only through March of 2024. We need to
49 start setting priorities. We need to -- we should --
50

0116

1 it should never be on the public to request this
2 prioritization, it is something in the practices, not
3 part of the CFR. It's something that's needed and you
4 should -- it should be done. But when you look at this
5 -- all of this caribou numbers under Federal permits,
6 dependence is there -- we use whatever permit we can
7 get to get these caribou, Federal lands in Chistochina
8 are very (indiscernible - breaking up) Mentasta, we
9 will take caribou under State permit, this is the use
10 of caribou -- the caribou -- not whether it's under a
11 Federal permit, we do not move -- to move -- to harvest
12 caribou under a Federal permit when we can.

13

14 Again, we thank how the other
15 (indiscernible - breaking) are talking about caribou
16 over the years -- 1968 had the caribou herd at 80,000,
17 the State had a caribou management plan -- had a --
18 doesn't have a population amount -- it's an intensive
19 management plan we look everywhere for -- what about --
20 one of these proposals regarding caribou, this is from
21 Mentasta -- we're looking to recovery -- a recovery
22 plan, getting a caribou working group together. We
23 work with -- with BLM, Tetlin Refuge, ADF&G, WRST
24 subsistence -- actually we are talking about
25 information we do have looking for data gaps -- there
26 are data gaps in the Nelchina Herd as well -- we need
27 to work together to bring this population back and
28 create a recovery plan and have actual caribou
29 management plan so we don't get into this situation
30 again. Again, we want to thank the members of the
31 public, agency representatives on the Board for your
32 time, dedication. We appreciate it.

33

34 Chicka -- Chief of the Native Village
35 of Chickaloon stated that this is also on corporation
36 board because these corporations -- someone has to draw
37 the line -- somebody put us in the Cook Inlet when we
38 were Ahtna, that's why we got left out a lot, we don't
39 want any of our people hunting there. That's -- that's
40 not only wrong -- our people -- our people would go up
41 to the -- up there to hunt, now with the population
42 explosion that has occurred around these herds --
43 these people -- all these people who want to go on our
44 lands and they are just going to get something -- they
45 come back from Whitehorse -- the plane sat on the
46 tarmac for an hour -- he had to wait -- they had given
47 a seat away to an outside hunter, he almost didn't get
48 home. It's -- it's more than just with caribou -- it's
49 subsistence -- it's fishing -- people come in to our
50

0117

1 places, they are able to hunt and fish and yet we
2 aren't because we live on the other side of the line.
3 We need indigenous -- set aside -- we have to compete
4 with everyone else. This is wrong. AITRC mentioned
5 something with the State Constitution -- where it's not
6 supposed to mess with our subsistence rights, hunting
7 and fishing, it's something that people don't like to
8 hear but it's genocide and it's destroying our people
9 when we can't get our own foods. Last year the UN
10 resolution for countries reversed policies that are
11 genocidal and the genocidal -- that's canalization has
12 gone to subsistence -- these are some of the effects we
13 need to be aware of.

14
15 And during the ANCSA consultation that
16 afternoon that -- there was an elder that was -- said
17 -- he gave some history of being raised in Copper River
18 and all his life except his life in the military time
19 he grew up on moose and caribou and since the caribou
20 had crashed in this area, in Unit 13 -- the numbers are
21 way low -- it's going to take some time to open up --
22 he's concerned, like the rest of the people that the
23 caribou will go to other areas like up the Porcupine
24 hunt or the -- the Arctic Herd where you could get five
25 a day -- he was wondering if they can go to different
26 regions to get caribou. He asked a question.

27
28 Ahtna Board member shared that the
29 Federal government before the -- before the closure,
30 that they came up with their own management numbers, 96
31 of -- percent of harvest is done on the State side and
32 four percent is taken by the local subsistence users.
33 We are being forced out of our traditions and culture
34 by mismanagement by the State. As growing up in Copper
35 River born in the '50s hunting Nelchina Herd as young
36 boys -- traveling with his uncles in Paxson, Denali
37 Highway when it was open -- ANILCA exists because of
38 concerns -- ANCSA it didn't protect Alaska Natives --
39 the Secretary awhile back declared that the Title VIII
40 of ANILCA did -- is Indian legislations and encouraged
41 and directed by the Governor to resolve -- but he did
42 -- he also said he had to go back to say Title VIII is
43 Indian legislation and is part of Alaska Native Claims.

44
45 An elder from Tazlina also member of
46 the Ahtna Corporation called in to give support of the
47 closure of the Nelchina hunts as described in 11, 12
48 and 13 with some caveats. Something that all -- about
49 people are shooting everywhere -- one thing that I am
50

0118

1 concerned about is the over hunting. We've seen this
2 position, how do we get out of it, so we need to
3 preserve our culture.

4

5 Another Ahtna -- Ahtna member from the
6 Native Village of Cantwell is -- he's very involved
7 with everything with their tribes -- continue to share
8 with others and we like to bring moose and salmon to
9 family members -- we haven't seen caribou in the last
10 few years -- tell me -- they tell me please bring me
11 caribou if you can -- when we do see them the numbers
12 are low and that is -- and its -- then its after the
13 season.

14

15 Another Board member from Ahtna shared
16 that she'd been hunting caribou since 1952, she --
17 people understand but Native people have to have this
18 Native food -- if they don't they get sick. Believe it
19 or not we actually get sick she said. She doesn't know
20 how they're going to make it without this food. The
21 locals say there's a slaughter out there, it's down
22 right scary. We don't stand a chance, she said. She
23 almost want to -- excuse me (coughing) -- why Federal
24 government don't conduct their own surveys -- why has
25 the State given their information to us so late, it
26 doesn't make any sense. This is how we live on wild
27 game she said. I think we do a pretty good job of
28 taking care of our own wild game. All of us are having
29 a very hard time with this. It is -- so much land --
30 the caribou have changed in their migration patterns --
31 there are many (indiscernible - breaking up), the State
32 just sells, sells, sells, the Federal permit harvest is
33 only four percent -- because the State has sold so much
34 land the caribou doesn't come over to our lands that
35 she was -- she said she was sorry she gets very
36 emotional but it's the way of life that they live --
37 they can't hardly do this anymore, people are getting
38 sick -- the Federal government has to start looking out
39 for the Native people -- as our -- our Native people
40 have to stand up and say, look we are here, we were
41 here, the first people, and we are unknown -- unknown
42 people, they don't know us but we're here. We're not
43 going anywhere. The Federal government needs to step
44 up and take care of us and we -- we're never going
45 away.

46

47 Another Ahtna Board member shared on
48 behalf of the people yesterday, today and tomorrow we
49 are just dealing with this today, we are going to for a
50

0119

1 long time, it's because of State management by the
2 State of Alaska. We are forced -- to close it because
3 we preserve our wildlife -- we need to preserve our
4 wildlife, we don't want all the animals to go away so
5 we are going to have to agree with the closure. It's
6 not only caribou, it's going to be fish and moose
7 because of how the State manages -- we see it every
8 day, every year, for a very long time.

9
10 We testi -- they testified at the Board
11 of Game on caribou and moose but they don't listen to
12 us, they only listen to special interest groups,
13 Outdoor Council. We are overlooked and they give us
14 this little (indiscernible - breaking up) all the
15 committee (indiscernible - breaking up) which is
16 supposed to open to everybody but we have to prove our
17 eight criteria. Others don't have to prove anything,
18 that's how State manages wildlife and treats people
19 from the Ahtna region. We have been dealing with this
20 for a very long time.

21
22 We're here today to let you guys know
23 how we feel. We -- we don't want to be put in a
24 category with everyone saying that we are not the
25 public, we are not tribal members, we have grown up --
26 our grandparents came from Gulkana, Gakona and so forth
27 -- we don't just come here like some people that live
28 here one year and move along, we are here forever. We
29 encourage you guys to not just think about this years
30 winter hunt but our future hunts as well because the
31 caribou aren't going to come back right away -- start
32 thinking about people who depend on our -- who depend
33 on this food, we need it. We don't have stores to go
34 to. We have a little local store but they charge
35 double -- prices are very high -- triple sometimes for
36 things -- we're not asking for handouts but we -- we're
37 asking for what we deserve, our resources. Changes
38 need to be made -- the Federal government needs to
39 change the way they do their management so that -- can
40 do their own hunts -- now whatever needs to be done to
41 ensure the people do the Federal hunts -- so we know
42 what's going on -- we have a lot of traditional
43 knowledge and we think we need to rely more on the
44 knowledge, not on what the State says -- and not for
45 the people and their special interest groups -- there
46 are other interests -- but it's not the time and the
47 place to say it. I hope you guys include the Native
48 corporations and tribes in any consultations you do in
49 the futures.

50

0120

1 President of Ahtna again shared that
2 they could see a number of recreational users doing
3 away with the breeding grounds -- if you go through
4 that -- now the hundreds -- with the trucks and gear to
5 go out on the terrain -- ATVs included -- not much is
6 given to opening the area of homes and recreation us --
7 the word overhunting has been used a few times --
8 caribou has obviously been over harvested -- moose will
9 be next -- fish is already being over fished before
10 they even get to us. The priority should be for
11 subsistence purposes. Nobody knows -- wants to hear
12 the term predator control but we have wolves showing up
13 -- wolf packs are scaring our villages and you know
14 what they're doing to the animals. I don't hear State
15 and Federal officials talking about -- are listening --
16 and testimony over the years -- it's heartbreaking that
17 we have to come to the point where no one can hunt.
18 Someone has been hunting their whole life and then they
19 put you off kilter. Because that's your position in
20 your family you have to do it but now you can't --
21 there are people -- if people are going to go without
22 traditional food -- we are looking to you -- we don't
23 want to lose our traditional foods because of
24 mismanagement.

25
26 Kluti-Kaah member stated that those of
27 us living on this -- Ahtna land -- on this land, our
28 mind, body and soul, that's why we have a herd that
29 gets large and then you open it up for longer times so
30 longer -- larger harvest -- every time it gets too low
31 you close it -- you have some bad incidents where you
32 have accidentally overharvested -- allowed overharvest
33 and then had to shut it down -- he grew up in the '80s
34 -- Eureka -- for 45 minutes before a herd went by --
35 the childrens have never seen that -- fancy homes have
36 been built -- trails have decimated the hills -- hills,
37 we used to go through there.

38
39 Another Ahtna member stated that they
40 were focused on the Nelchina Herd -- in Cantwell we
41 have Denali Herd that stays on the Park lands but it's
42 a separate issue -- it's not being considered -- they
43 should be able to hunt the other herds -- Denali Herd
44 -- he wanted to make sure that that's being considered.

45
46 The Ahtna President said that we need
47 this Board to be an advocate for us, not a partner to
48 the State -- we have no recourse -- the managers have
49 to talk to our people, not just the State of Alaska --
50

0121

1 the State declared war on Alaska Natives. The State
2 has been working very -- to genocide Alaska Native
3 cultures. Any special considered for those people -- I
4 don't know what will it take besides -- these -- all
5 these animal populations. She wish you would do
6 something.

7

8 That concludes the -- a summary of the
9 consultation, Madame Chair.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, thank
12 you, Orville. It sounds like there was a lot that came
13 in there. Now, boy if we have long ones like that we
14 don't have enough time for our meeting here but I have
15 to go through this process. The next thing is is there
16 any written public comments.

17

18 MR. PLANK: Hannah, are you online.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm sorry, I
21 didn't understand what you said.

22

23 MS. VOORHEES: I am, Madame.....

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh.

26

27 MS. VOORHEES: Madame Chair this is
28 Hannah Voorhees with OSM. There were no written public
29 comments but we did have a public hearing and I can
30 present the outcome of that briefly.

31

32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That would be
33 nice if we could keep it briefly. Thank you.

34

35 MS. VOORHEES: Can you hear me -- just
36 checking if you can hear me?

37

38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We can hear
39 you great.

40

41 MS. VOORHEES: Thank you, perfect. So
42 a public hearing for WSA23-02/04, particularly to the
43 temporary -- the requested temporary closure of the
44 winter hunt for the Nelchina Herd was held on August
45 2023 from 4 to 6 p.m. by teleconference. 12 people
46 testified. Nine of those testifying were residents of
47 the Copper River Basin and one current resident of this
48 area also identified himself as a former manager of the
49 Nelchina Herd. Most of these individuals expressed

50

0122

1 support for the closure but were also very frustrated
2 that we have reached this position. In addition, the
3 Deputy Commissioner of ADF&G, a representative of the
4 Alaska Outdoor Council and a former resident of the
5 Copper River Basin also voiced support. Residents of
6 the Copper River Basin spoke to the importance of the
7 Nelchina Herd (indiscernible - breaking up) through
8 their dependence on the herd, residents are able to
9 provide for their families and have the knowledge
10 (indiscernible - breaking up). Those who testified
11 expressed frustration. Several older residents
12 identified the current decline (indiscernible -
13 breaking up) over his lifetime and expressed his
14 frustration over the current management -- questioned
15 the number of permits in previous hunts and the fact
16 that conservation (indiscernible - breaking up) such as
17 limiting harvest to bulls only or implementing a
18 harvest limit of one caribou would not (indiscernible -
19 breaking up). Residents who testified described
20 advocating for closures, moratoriums based on
21 indigenous knowledge (indiscernible - breaking up)
22 they're frustrating that their recommendations are
23 (indiscernible - breaking up). The Executive Director
24 of AITRC explained that Ahtna Stewardship dictates
25 harvest of caribou should be conservative even in times
26 of abundance and local residents noted that an increase
27 in recreational activities on the Nelchina calving
28 grounds significantly impacts (indiscernible - breaking
29 up). A prominent theme that we heard is the
30 frustration this (indiscernible - breaking up)
31 opportunities for hunt restrictions (indiscernible -
32 breaking up) .804 analysis under ANILCA. They also
33 felt that the lack of transparency and (indiscernible -
34 breaking up) State's communication of Nelchina
35 population numbers and related information and some
36 suggested that Federal managers could monitor the herd
37 independent than ADF&G and that a Section .804 would
38 have been requested had the information been provided
39 earlier.

40
41 So finally, those testifying described
42 a long road ahead to recover the Nelchina Caribou Herd.

43
44 (Indiscernible - breaking up)

45
46 A Native resident of Kluti-Kaah said
47 thank you for listening to me and may God give us our
48 caribou back (breaking up).

49
50

0123

1 That is the summary of public comment,
2 thank you.

3
4 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you. So
5 now we're moving on to Regional Council
6 recommendations.

7
8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Public
9 testimony.

10

11 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Oh, public
12 testimony, I thought that was what we were on, I'm
13 sorry I was outside. Public testimony.

14

15 (No comments)

16

17 MS. MCDAVID: Is there anyone on the
18 phone that would like to provide testimony for Wildlife
19 Special Action WSA23-02 or 04, Nelchina Caribou winter
20 season closure.

21

22 (No comments)

23

24 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Hearing none,
25 we'll now move on to Regional Council recommendations.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Don.

28

29 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you. I move to
30 support this proposal and unfortunately I think that
31 we're going to review this a few more times in the
32 future because for these caribou to replace themselves
33 it's going to take decades.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm going to
36 second it so you can continue.

37

38 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you. Do you want
39 me to move to discussion and justification.

40

41 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: (Nods
42 affirmatively)

43

44 MR. WOODRUFF: Okay. Is there a
45 conservation concern; obviously since there's -- this
46 season's count was 8,000 caribou.

47

48 How would the recommendation address
49 this concern; well it will stop the harvest for this

50

0124

1 winter.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10 or detrimental to the subsistence users; it will but
11 they can move to other herds in the area for harvest.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

Is the recommendation supported by substantial evidence such as biological or TEK; they did a photo census and the biology indicates that there is no caribou to harvest, there's no substantial surplus.

Will the recommendation be beneficial or detrimental to the subsistence users; it will but they can move to other herds in the area for harvest.

Will the recommendation necessarily restrict other uses; and it will but as stated just previously they can move to other caribou herds for harvest.

Thank you.

Oh, restate the motion for the record.

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And I would just reiterate conservation concern. This, do this.

MS. SHOCKLEY: I have a comment, Mr. Chair.

ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead.

MS. SHOCKLEY: Thank you. Well, to those that were on the phone speaking, Orville, especially, as this -- this is Dorothy Shockley -- as a new Board member to the Council, we hear you. We feel the same. We are very frustrated. You know as you were speaking I was Googling State management, and in 60 years, you know, the State and Federal government has -- I hate the word, use the word mismanage -- management -- but -- I mean management, but they have succeeded in destroying our fish and game with their harvest management. And, you know, we're sitting here trying to figure out how and what we can do. It's really difficult, you know, the agencies are a huge, you know, in -- well, in 1960s when the State took over, in '78, you know, the Alaska Legislature passed the first subsistence statute establishing subsistence as the priority use of Alaska fish and wildlife. And, again, you know, in 40 years, you know, we are at this state where we don't have enough fish and game to eat. I mean that's a huge message, not only to us, but it

0125

1 should be a huge message to those who are making the
2 laws and regulations. I mean it doesn't take a rocket
3 scientist to see what is happening. I mean we can't
4 continue to do -- we can't continue doing what we're
5 doing, we have to make some changes. We have to turn
6 this ship around if we're going to have fish and game
7 for our children in the future. And I just plead with
8 those who can make those decisions to hear the people,
9 they are speaking for the fish and the game and to do
10 something.

11

12 So thank you.

13

14 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you,

15

16 Dorothy.

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Do this next.

19

20 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Any other

21

22 discussion.

23

24 (No comments)

25

26 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Hearing none.

27

28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Call for the

29

30 question.
31 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. I'm going
32 to restate the final motion. Temporary Wildlife
33 Special Action WSA23-02/04 Nelchina Caribou Herd winter
34 season closure.

35

36 MS. MCDAVID: The motion was to

37

38 support.

39

40 MS. SHOCKLEY: Is that the only time

41

42 they can harvest?

43

44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You're the

45

46 Chair, come on.

47

48 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: What was the

49

50 question?

MS. SHOCKLEY: Is that the only time

they can harvest is in the winter?

ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I don't know. I

0126

1 don't have no idea.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No, I can
4 speak to that.

5

6 MS. SHOCKLEY: So.....

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: There's been
9 a fall season and a winter season, this is the -- they
10 already closed the summer season, or fall season, and
11 now this is to close the fall [sic].

12

13 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay.

14

15 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Finish it.

16

17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, now
18 he's ordering me to finish it.

19

20 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah, well, you
21 started it.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right,
24 but you're doing the next one.

25

26 (Laughter)

27

28 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We --
31 a motion to approve and he just read it and seconded
32 and I'm going to -- I'm really thinking I'm going to
33 ask for unanimous consent to approve this winter
34 closure. Anyone opposed.

35

36 (No opposing votes)

37

38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, the
39 motion passes -- or fails, unanimously. All right,
40 Charlie, are you ready to do another one?

41

42 MS. MCDAVID: I just want to correct
43 that, the motion passes to support.....

44

45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, you have
46 to help me out.

47

48 MS. MCDAVID: That's okay, it's on the
49 record.

50

0127

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's how we
2 get so confused here, sorry.

3
4 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah, my brain is
5 scrambled, I'm sorry.

6
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, yes.

8
9 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah, let's take
10 a little break.

11
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.
13 Okay, Charlie wants to take a little break and I'd like
14 to do it -- well we'll do it five and maybe we'll be
15 back in 10.

16
17 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah. Yeah, we
18 could do that.

19
20 (Off record)

21
22 (On record)

23
24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, are we
25 ready -- as soon as Brooke puts more snacks out and she
26 gets back to her chair we are ready. Because the next
27 thing on the agenda is the proposal process. Proposal
28 and closure review procedures for an overview and we're
29 going to -- we must hear that before we take up these
30 proposals.

31
32 (Pause)

33
34 MS. MCDAVID: Madame Chair.

35
36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.

37
38 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Madame Chair.
39 For the record there is salmon dip on the table if
40 anyone is interested.

41
42 (Laughter)

43
44 MS. MCDAVID: Just to break the ice
45 there a little bit.

46
47 (Laughter)

48
49 MS. MCDAVID: So I'll turn Council
50

0128

1 member's attention to Page 100 and this is just mostly
2 informational for folks in the audience. There's a
3 copy of the presentation procedure for proposals and
4 closure reviews on the table there and the Chair will
5 go through these steps for every proposal that we're
6 going over. You just kind of heard that as we went
7 over the special action. One note is that for Step No.
8 2 there have been no tribal or ANCSA Corporation
9 consultations for any of the proposals yet except for
10 the Arctic Village Sheep Management Area closure which
11 we did yesterday with the Native Village of Venetie and
12 Arctic Village Council. So for all the others we can
13 skip step two for now. Those consultations, this
14 year, are going to be offered after the RAC meeting
15 cycle ends and the hope is that this will reduce the
16 conflict with subsistence activities, those
17 consultations usually happen in the summertime when
18 folks are out fishing and very busy. So those will be
19 held sometime in November and those will be announced
20 after the RAC meetings. So I think Katya wants to add
21 one thing.

22

23 Thank you.

24

25 MS. WESSELS: In just hopes to reduce
26 the confusion, also on the back of your cards Council
27 members, you see that procedure is also on the back of
28 your cards, cross out the Step No. 2, because that's
29 what Brooke was talking about. I already crossed it
30 out on Sue's, you know, card, so when you talk about
31 the proposals and closure reviews, don't call for Step
32 2. Additionally, I want to add that if any tribes want
33 to make a comment during this meeting, they can do it
34 under Step No. 3(c), it's not -- it doesn't prevent
35 them from making a comment during this meeting. And if
36 they would email a comment, a written comment to us
37 we'll read it into the record but it's just Step No. 2,
38 that's consultations of tribes and ANCSA Corporations
39 with the Federal Subsistence Board, that would be that,
40 but they're going to be held after the Council meeting
41 cycle and they -- a summary of those consultations will
42 be added into the analysis that will be presented to
43 the Federal Subsistence Board. It will be a part of
44 the record for the Federal Subsistence Board.

45

46 So that's all I wanted to add, thank
47 you. Are there any questions.

48

49 (No comments)

50

0129

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I don't see
2 any questions. The next thing on the agenda is the
3 wildlife proposal and closure -- or proposals land
4 closure reviews -- okay. WP24-32 Units 12, 19, 20, 21,
5 24 and 25 extend the martin season until March 15th.
6 Tom will introduce.

7
8 MR. PLANK: Thank you, Madame Chair and
9 members of the Council. And, again, for the record my
10 name is Tom Plank, I'm a Wildlife Biologist with the
11 Office of Subsistence Management. I will be presenting
12 a summary of the analysis for Wildlife Proposal WP24-32
13 which was submitted by the Eastern Interior Alaska
14 Subsistence Regional Advisory Council and it begins on
15 Page 101 of your meeting books.

16
17 The proposal requests extending the
18 Federal martin trapping season in Units 12, 19, 20, 21,
19 24 and 25 from November 1st through February 28th to
20 November 1st through March 15th.

21
22 The proponents state change in the
23 closing date of the season will account for changes in
24 climate. Fall temperatures and snowfalls have been
25 more variable in recent years making it more difficult
26 to access trapping areas earlier in the season. This
27 proposal will also allow trappers to take advantage of
28 colder spring temperatures at the end of the season
29 when it is feasible to access traplines. In Units 12
30 and 20E this proposal will align the martin closing
31 season with the lynx closing season and in Units 24A
32 and 25 it will further extend martin seasons into the
33 lynx season and allow users to harvest both furbearers
34 at the same time. Many users target both animals while
35 trapping and this season extension will allow for the
36 harvest of more martins. Both Federal and State martin
37 trapping regulations have remained unchanged in the
38 last 30 years but identical proposals have been
39 submitted to the State Board of Game for consideration
40 at their March 2024 meeting.

41
42 While there is little scientific data
43 on martins in Alaska, the population is believed to be
44 stable. The Alaska trapper report questionnaire
45 reports martin abundance as stable in the Interior,
46 however, martin abundance does fluctuate greatly in
47 response to environmental factors and they are easily
48 trapped which can lead to overharvest. Harvest data
49 for martins is only collected through the Alaska
50

0130

1 trapper questionnaire which is voluntary reporting
2 method, response rates to this questionnaire are
3 typically low, with the 2021 response rate less than
4 nine percent. Martins are reported as one of the most
5 important and consistently trapped species in this area
6 and total reported harvest of martins have varied
7 greatly since 2011 and it appears to be tied to the
8 number of trappers, abundance and fur prices. Harvest
9 appears to be occurring at a stable rate, a sustainable
10 rate.

11
12 If this proposal is adopted the martin
13 season will be extended by two weeks and allow
14 Federally-qualified subsistence users increased
15 opportunities for martin, especially since most are
16 still trapping lynx, milder temperatures and more
17 daylight in March may allow an increase in trapping
18 effort and harvest, as people have greater access to
19 areas further from the roads. This may be a concern as
20 there are reports from trappers that more females than
21 males are -- get trapped in the late winter and since
22 this is a breeding portion of the population, that is
23 close to parturition which would be considered an
24 additive mortality. However, there is currently no
25 evidence that this would occur in the Interior region
26 of Alaska, but if it did it may lead to a conservation
27 concern. Agency Staff noted during the comment period
28 that most trappers self limit their efforts when they
29 start to catch more females than males, which may
30 alleviate this concern. There are opinions among
31 trappers that fur condition is not as prime in March as
32 it is earlier in the season and it is worth less on the
33 market. This may deter people from trapping at this
34 time were the season may be extended.

35
36 Adopting this proposal would missalign
37 Federal and State season dates which may lead to
38 regulatory confusion.

39
40 The OSM's preliminary conclusion is to
41 support Proposal WP24-32. The martin population in
42 these units show no indication of change. Harvest is
43 reported to be occurring at a sustainable level and
44 trends is in concert with efforts by trappers.
45 Increased participation in the lengthened season would
46 be moderated by other factors such as cost of fuel, fur
47 prices, fur condition and martin availability, all of
48 which contribute to the trappers efforts and trappers
49 are noted to self-regulate harvest of martins when
50

0131

1 populations are perceived as low. Therefore, extending
2 the season is not expected to have an impact on the
3 current population by itself but would be one factor in
4 the decision process by trappers whether or not they
5 participate in the extended season.

6

7 That is the end of the summary and I'll
8 be here if ya'll have any other questions.

9

10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Council
11 members, any questions.

12

13 MS. SHOCKLEY: I have a question.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes, go
16 ahead.

17

18 MS. SHOCKLEY: So when was this
19 proposal first submitted?

20

21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We did it at
22 our last meeting.

23

24 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay, that's what I
25 thought. I was just going to go through this -- the
26 Council's response. So why is it still -- I mean why
27 are we still, I mean, asking to support this again when
28 it sounds like the Council did before, right?

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, it's
31 the process. The process is you submit a proposal and
32 then they go through the analysis of the proposal and
33 then you vote to support or not support the proposal,
34 it's part of our process. We just put the proposal
35 forward is all.

36

37 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: For the Council.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I know.

40

41 (Laughter)

42

43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I was right
44 there with you when I started so I totally understand.

45

46 (Laughter)

47

48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It's okay.
49 Okay. Okay, any more questions.

50

0132

1 MS. SHOCKLEY: Well, that's job
2 security, right.

3
4 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: You bet.

5
6 (Laughter)

7
8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I love it.

9
10 (Laughter)

11
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes. Okay
13 any other questions of Council members.

14
15 (No comments)

16
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.
18 Now we go through this process on the back of our card
19 and we're going to step three, agency comments ADF&G.
20 Is there any ADF&G people online that would like to
21 speak.

22
23 (No comments)

24
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Usually Mark
26 Burch is online for stuff like this.

27
28 (No comments)

29
30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Mark, I don't
31 hear your voice. If you are trying to talk you got to
32 star, six.

33
34 (No comments)

35
36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Next would be
37 Federal agencies.

38
39 (No comments)

40
41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And usually
42 no one does.

43
44 (No comments)

45
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And next is
47 tribal entities. Native, tribal, village or others.

48
49 (No comments)

50

0133

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any comments.

2

3 (No comments)

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Next is other
6 Regional Advisory Councils.

7

8 (No comments)

9

10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: None.

11

12 Next would be Fish and Game Advisory
13 Committees.

14

15 (No comments)

16

17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm sure most
18 of them probably haven't even met yet. They usually
19 meet after fall hunting season.

20

21 And then next would be the Subsistence
22 Resource Commissions and I know that the Wrangells met,
23 so, Barbara.

24

25 MS. CELLARIUS: Thank you, Madame
26 Chair. The Wrangell-St. Elias Subsistence Resource
27 Commission supported WP24-32. I would note that the
28 vote was four in favor and three opposed. The proposal
29 will align the closing date of the martin and lynx
30 season and expand the overlap between the lynx and
31 wolverine season. In doing so it provides additional
32 subsistence opportunity.

33

34 Thank you.

35

36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
37 Barbara. Any questions.

38

39 (No comments)

40

41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: The vote was
42 four to three and I was opposed. Okay. Public
43 testimony. Any public testimony on this proposal in
44 the room.

45

46 (No comments)

47

48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Do they need
49 to do blue cards?

50

0134

1 MS. MCDAVID: No.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Yeah,
4 so we only -- and any public testimony online.

5

6 (No comments)

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Now
9 we're up to our recommendation which requires a motion
10 to support. And the reason for a motion to support,
11 Dorothy, is we -- it's supposedly not to confuse us.

12

13 (Laughter)

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We either
16 vote it down or vote it up.

17

18 MS. SHOCKLEY: So I move.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So moved.

21

22 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes.

23

24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.
25 Dorothy has moved a motion to support 24-32.

26

27 MR. JAGOW: Second.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And Charlie
30 Jagow has seconded it. Now discussion.

31

32 (No comments)

33

34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm your
35 Chair so I have to go last. Discussion.

36

37 Donald.

38

39 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame Chair.
40 I'm just going to go down the list.

41

42 Is there a conservation concern; no,
43 because there's no limit and it's a sustainable
44 harvest.

45

46 How would the recommendation address
47 the concern; it will let trappers be less confused at
48 the end of the season about whether the martin season
49 and the lynx season are aligned or some crazy idea

50

0135

1 that they should be separated.

2

3 Is the recommendation supported by
4 substantial evidence such as biology or traditional
5 ecological knowledge; I think that it is and Amanda put
6 forth this proposal and she said it was.....

7

8 MS. MCDAVID: It was Andy.

9

10 MR. WOODRUFF: It was Andy, oh, okay.

11 Yeah, anyway.....

12

13 MS. POPE: It was Andy.

14

15 MR. WOODRUFF:that they were
16 harvesting more martin later in the season rather than
17 getting unprime martin in the beginning of the season.

18

19 And so that would be that traditional,
20 ecological knowledge.

21

22 Will the recommendation be beneficial
23 or detrimental to the subsistence users and needs; yes,
24 it will be beneficial.

25

26 Will the recommendation unnecessarily
27 restrict other users; no.

28

29 That concludes my discussion.

30

31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any other
32 discussion.

33

34 MS. POPE: Madame Chair, this is
35 Amanda.

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Amanda. Go
38 ahead, Amanda.

39

40 MS. POPE: Yes, Madame Chair, this is
41 Amanda Pope. I was for this in the beginning and then I
42 had done some research regarding the information that I
43 got from State and Federal biologists is that there's a
44 chance of more of a bycatch for female martin and I
45 personally trap within 25C and our -- our martin
46 numbers have dropped dramatically just because they're
47 on their low cycle and the fire -- and the recent fires
48 within the area. There's so many threats, beneficial,
49 and such to this proposal, but I feel as the

50

0136

1 information that I've gotten I'm going to withdraw my
2 support.

3

4 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just for
5 clarification, Amanda, did I hear you say you withdraw
6 your support? This is Sue.

7

8 MS. POPE: Yes.

9

10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right, I
11 thank you for that. Did you have anything else.

12

13 MS. POPE: No, ma'am.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right,
16 thank you. Charlie Jagow.

17

18 MR. JAGOW: There's a couple of reasons
19 why I think this is a good idea, and the largest reason
20 is we are having a lot later freeze-ups, you know,
21 traditionally we were able to start trapping at the
22 beginning of the season and now it's pretty rare to get
23 to our main line until closer to the middle of
24 November, even December. So having a longer season,
25 obviously still allows for four months of trapping.
26 Now when it comes to martin numbers, and, you know, the
27 impact of harvest, at least in Unit 25 there's very,
28 very little trapping pressure, you know, it's a large
29 unit and there's very few people trapping and, you
30 know, it's just essentially a handful of folks who trap
31 very hard so I don't see how an extra couple of weeks
32 of season is going to really impact the population
33 negatively.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Charlie
36 Wright.

37

38 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I agree with
39 Charlie Jagow. Historically all my life trapping in
40 Rampart, we have the mountains there so we have to use
41 the river. All my life if it was November 1, we were
42 out across the river and we were moving, going to the
43 trap line, and now I don't feel safe getting on the
44 river until closure to the first of December. Our
45 springs have been extended with cold weather, 20 below
46 at night and colder and I also trap beaver and cats in
47 the spring and I think that it'll go hand in hand with
48 that so I support.

49

50

0137

1 Thank you.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anyone else.

4

5 (No comments)

6

7 MS. MCDAVID: Andy.

8

9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Did he say he
10 wanted to talk. Andy, if you didn't have anything I
11 was going to speak.

12

13 (No comments)

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

16

17 MS. MCDAVID: Is he on the phone?

18

19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I don't know,
20 is Andy on?

21

22 REPORTER: Andy, are you online. Hit
23 star six if you are, can't hear you if you are.

24

25 (No comments)

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

28

29 (Pause)

30

31 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Can we get a
32 clarification.

33

34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Charlie wants
35 a clarification of who wrote the proposal -- or who
36 supported the proposal in the beginning, I thought it
37 was Amanda and Brooke said -- we're all nodding our
38 heads but you guys are saying no.

39

40 MS. MCDAVID: It was Andy because we
41 put in a Fish and Game proposal that year, and Amanda
42 was the moose proposal.

43

44 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah.

45

46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. It was
47 clarified that it was Andy to start with and then
48 Amanda supported it, I'm pretty sure at the meeting,
49 but for me, personally, I was one that voted against

50

0138

1 it. I'd have to go with Amanda a little bit. I am into
2 conservation, you know, and it was reported to us that
3 the females could be already breed by that time and
4 being a skin sewer for almost 40 years and trapping,
5 all of that, the -- you normally -- where we trap in
6 Unit 12 and I'm not sure about the rest of the unit but
7 I'm going to speak specifically to Unit 12, we're on
8 the road system, there's a lot more trappers there and
9 it -- the hair quality begins to change. The martin --
10 or the hair tends to singe, the little hairs, the
11 little guard hairs tend to move over and they singe and
12 they just don't bring the money plus the sun tends to
13 bleach them out and that doesn't give hair quality
14 either and I can assure you that and -- because people
15 have caught them incidentally and then you can see that
16 this is occurring and for me I could argue a
17 conservation concern because normally when we're
18 trapping, you're going to catch your local martin right
19 away and then what's left can be females, your -- and
20 so I have this argument and I'm with Amanda I can't
21 support it at this time.

22

23 So any other discussion.

24

25 MR. WOODRUFF: Sue.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go ahead.

28

29 MR. WOODRUFF: I appreciate your
30 concern about the quality of the fur but this is a huge
31 area and the fur in 25 won't be the same as the fur in
32 12, which could easily be 20 degrees warmer in Unit 12
33 than it would be in Unit 25. And I trapped, illegally,
34 until the middle of March for 10 years and it's up to
35 the trapper to look at the fur and see if he's getting
36 quality fur, or if he's getting all females. If he is
37 he's going to stop otherwise he's out of business.
38 It's an individual choice when it comes down to the
39 wire.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You know I
42 don't want to argue it with anyone but it is a lot
43 different in Unit 12. So that would have to be amended
44 out to keep it at 25 -- go ahead, Charlie.

45

46 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I agree with Don.
47 It used to be that way when spring used to come when it
48 was normal, when it was cold right away in November and
49 we got a normal spring, not a stretched out cold spring

50

0139

1 like we've been getting. I've gotten some of the
2 nicest martin I've ever seen in March when I'm trapping
3 beaver. This is in 20F, it's different. I'm sure it's
4 different everywhere, but I always thought in the
5 mountains, you run out of martin very fast in the creek
6 -- like you said you catch the locals, then there's the
7 tricklers, one or two and that's not worth the gas so
8 we don't do it. I trap martin in a different place
9 where I trap beaver.

10

11 MR. BASSICH: Madame Chair.

12

13 REPORTER: Hold up, Andy, Charlie's
14 talking right now.

15

16 MR. BASSICH: Copy.

17

18 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: So when I go into
19 the beaver area there's a whole bunch of fresh martin
20 and they get into cat sets at the same time, so that's
21 a preference and every area is different I'd say.

22

23 Thank you.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Andy.

26

27 REPORTER: Go ahead, Andy.

28

29 MR. BASSICH: Yeah, thank you. Are you
30 able to hear me fine?

31

32 REPORTER: Yes.

33

34 MR. BASSICH: Okay, great. So I guess
35 I will speak to this. You know Charlie and Don have
36 brought up the two parts that primarily I was using
37 when I brought this to the table. In my view I was
38 looking at 20E and 25B, which is locally, and quite
39 frankly there's almost nobody out trapping in this
40 area. I'm not quite sure how some of these other units
41 got on to it but originally when I proposed this it was
42 for 20E and 25B as in Bravo. So my experience has been
43 is when you're out late in the season, some people like
44 to trap lynx out here a little bit later into the
45 season and all I was trying to do was make it so that
46 if you're out trapping a few lynx and you happen to
47 pick up an extra martin or two, that's great and you're
48 getting a little bit extra for your time out there.
49 But the real reality is there's almost nobody out
50

0140

1 trapping anymore and especially in the Units 20E and
2 25B and so this isn't going to make a -- it's not a
3 conservation issue in my mind at all. And if a person
4 is testifying that they want to be really conservative
5 then they don't have to trap. All it is is just trying
6 to allow for a little bit of extra opportunity for
7 someone and my primary reason for bringing this up is
8 the climate change up in our region has shifted a solid
9 three weeks. And it's warmer much later into the
10 winter -- or early into the winter and it is staying
11 cold much much later, and that's happening consistently
12 now for about five years.

13

14 And I think that's what I'm trying to
15 use to address this and I think there are some other
16 proposals that are addressing the other end of it with
17 it staying warmer so much longer people want to have
18 moose hunting go a little bit longer to get away from
19 some of the heavy pressure of the non-qualified
20 Federally -- Federal users.

21

22 So those are the points that I would
23 like to make. I think it's up to the trapper but I --
24 I don't see this as being a huge amount of animals
25 being harvested.

26

27 That's all, thank you.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thanks, Andy.
30 Anyone else that needed discussion.

31

32 (No comments)

33

34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I'm
35 silently hearing a call for the question. Go ahead and
36 do roll -- by roll.

37

38 MS. MCDAVID: Online, Andy Bassich.

39

40 (No comments)

41

42 REPORTER: Andy, are you ready to vote.

43

44 MR. BASSICH: Yes, I'll be in support.

45

46 REPORTER: Thank you.

47

48 MS. MCDAVID: Linda Evans.

49

50

0141

1 MS. EVANS: Yes.

2

3 MS. MCDAVID: Charlie Jagow.

4

5 MR. JAGOW: Yes.

6

7 MS. MCDAVID: Amanda Pope, online.

8

9 MS. POPE: No.

10

11 MS. MCDAVID: Dorothy Shockley.

12

13 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes.

14

15 MS. MCDAVID: Donald Woodruff.

16

17 MR. WOODRUFF: Yes.

18

19 MS. MCDAVID: Charlie Wright.

20

21 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yes.

22

23 MS. MCDAVID: Sue Entsminger.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No.

26

27 MS. MCDAVID: Motion passes, six to

28 two.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So we don't

31 always agree but that's okay.

32

33 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: We're just doing

34 our job.

35

36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah,uh-huh.

37 Charlie, do you want to take over.

38

39 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Do I have to,

40 okay.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

43

44 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, next is
45 WP24-33, Units 25B, 25C, and 25D Remainder extend fall
46 moose season to October 15th. You got it Tom.

47

48 MR. PLANK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

49 Members of the Council. Again, for the record my name

50

0142

1 is Tom Plank, Wildlife Biologist, Office of Subsistence
2 Management. And I will be presenting a summary of
3 analysis for Wildlife Proposal WP24-33 which starts on
4 Page 109 in your books.

5

6 Proposal WP24-33 submitted, again, by
7 the Eastern Interior Regional Advisory Council requests
8 that the fall moose season in Units 25B, 25C and 25D
9 Remainder be extended until October 15th.

10

11 This proposal would provide additional
12 opportunities for Federally-qualified subsistence users
13 to hunt moose in portions of Unit 25 after the State
14 hunting season closes. These subunits receive a great
15 deal of harvest pressure and the additional late fall
16 season harvest opportunities would help decrease
17 competition for this important subsistence resource.
18 Additionally, climate change is shifting, weather
19 patterns are -- and it is not becoming cool until later
20 in the fall. Hunting later in the fall during colder
21 weather reduces the chance of meat spoilage, it is
22 colder during the end of September/October timeframe,
23 which is more conducive to hanging and drying meat for
24 those who don't have a freezer and continue to process
25 harvested meat the traditional way.

26

27 The moose season in Unit 25C has
28 remained unchanged since the season was extended to
29 August 20th through September 30th back in 2010. The
30 moose season for Unit 25D Remainder has remained
31 unchanged since the closing date was extended to
32 October 1st back in 2010. Prior to the moose season
33 extension to October 7th for Unit 25B in 2018 the moose
34 season in Unit 25B has remained in place, without
35 change since 2000. The customary and traditional use
36 determination for moose in Units 25B and 25C was
37 updated in 2018 reflecting the current C&T for those
38 units.

39

40 Moose densities in Unit 25B have
41 historically been low and recent population trends are
42 not well understood due to limited data. No population
43 or composition surveys have been conducted for moose in
44 Unit 25B since the late 1980s. Moose population data
45 from adjacent subunits is the best available
46 information for northern Unit 25B. Moose populations
47 in Unit 25C is difficult to identify due to infrequent
48 surveys and low moose densities and moose surveys have
49 been conducted in Yukon-Charley Rivers National
50

0143

1 Preserve for nearly 30 years. The past seven surveys
2 have occurred within a 30 to 40 mile wide corridor
3 along the Yukon River between Eagle and Circle and
4 includes portions of Unit 20E, 25B, and 25C. Between
5 1997 and 2022 moose densities ranged from .20 to .37
6 moose per square mile. Bull/cow ratios have remained
7 consistently high averaging 61 bulls per 100 cows,
8 which greatly exceeds the State's management objective
9 of 40 bulls per 100 cows. Calf/cow ratios observed in
10 the Yukon-Charley Preserve surveys averaged 27 calves
11 per 100 cows between 1997 and 2022 indicating a stable
12 moose population in this area. Moose densities have
13 historically -- have been historically low across Unit
14 25D and between 1999 and 2015 fall bull/cow ratios in
15 Unit 25D Remainder average 64 bulls per 100 cows.
16 Between 1999 and 2007 fall cow/calf ratios in Unit 25B
17 Remainder average 48 calves per 100 cows. And in 2015
18 the fall calf/cow ratios were extremely high at 80
19 calves per 100 cows, however, caution should be used in
20 interpretation of demographic trends may be confounded
21 by variations in survey areas and small sample sizes.

22

23 Habitat is not considered a limiting
24 factor. Unit 25 as a whole contains excellent moose
25 habitat. And then predation by wolves and bears,
26 however, appear to be limiting the Unit 25 moose
27 population.

28

29 The average annual reported harvest in
30 Unit 25B from 2011 to 2021 was 29 moose. In Unit 25C
31 most successful hunters reside outside of Unit 25
32 including non-local residents of Alaska and non-
33 residents. This difference can be attributed to the
34 fact that relatively few people reside within Unit 25C
35 but portions of the unit are on the road system. The
36 average annual reported harvest in Unit 25C from 2011
37 to 2021 was 84 moose. The total number of reported
38 hunters during the same time averaged 352 with 307
39 being residents. The annual average reported harvest
40 in all of Unit 25B from 2011 to 2021 was 42 moose. The
41 total number of reported hunters during the same time
42 period averaged 112 per year with 97 being residents.
43 Most of the reported moose harvest in Unit 25D
44 Remainder occurs during the second and third weeks of
45 September. The State season closes September 20th.
46 Any harvest reported during the last week of September
47 is by Federally-qualified subsistence users.

48

49 (Cell phone ringing)

50

0144

1 MR. PLANK: Sorry.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Five bucks.

4

5 (Laughter)

6

7 MR. PLANK: If this proposal is
8 adopted, Federally-qualified subsistence users would be
9 able to harvest moose in Units 25B, 25C and 25D
10 Remainder until October 15th providing an additional
11 eight to 15 days of subsistence harvest opportunities
12 on Federal public lands depending on hunt area. Given
13 current trends of warmer falls due to climate change
14 extending the season could reduce meat spoilage and
15 ease meat care as hunters could wait for cooler
16 temperatures. However, an additional eight to 15 days
17 would increase the disparity between State and Federal
18 regulations increasing user confusion and further
19 complicating enforcement. The peak rut for moose is
20 September 26th through October 8th. Most mating occurs
21 during this time and extending the season to October
22 15th would put more harvest pressure on moose during
23 the rut. The increased harvest pressure during and
24 after the rut could significantly increase harvest
25 success rates beyond a sustainable rate. In Units 25B
26 and 25C where moose population status is difficult to
27 assess due to infrequent surveys and low moose
28 densities it is unknown if the additional harvest
29 opportunities could pose a conservation risk.

30

31 OSM's preliminary conclusion is to
32 support Proposal WP24-33. However, input from the RAC
33 and the local users pertaining to extending the season
34 through and past peak rut would be greatly appreciated
35 and important for consideration of the preliminary
36 conclusion.

37

38 Thank you, Mr. Chair, Members of the
39 Council. I'd be happy to answer any questions.

40

41 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you. Any
42 questions, Council members.

43

44 MS. SHOCKLEY: I have a question.

45

46 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead,
47 Dorothy.

48

49 MS. SHOCKLEY: In regards to extending

50

0145

1 the season at the end will it then open later?

2

3 MR. PLANK: No, Ma'am, this proposal is
4 just to extend it at the end. The opening season date
5 would stay the same. This is Tom again.

6

7 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay.

8

9 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Moose are not in
10 run during the normal season.....

11

12 REPORTER: Charlie, your mic.

13

14 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT:so they're
15 not coming to call is why it was put in to extend it so
16 that if they're in rut they'll come.....

17

18 REPORTER: Charlie.

19

20 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT:to call.

21 Sorry.

22

23 (Laughter)

24

25 REPORTER: I got it on this other mic.

26

27 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, thank you,
28 sorry.

29

30 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay.

31

32 REPORTER: You don't have to repeat it
33 not unless you want to.

34

35 (Laughter)

36

37 MS. SHOCKLEY: Well, I understand
38 that, I think. I mean I support extending, I mean, you
39 know, extending it later because of climate change but
40 I don't know if I want to start it at the same time.
41 And, you know, just I think this is happening in all of
42 the areas. We went to Manley the second week of
43 season, which was like the 9th through the 15th, and it
44 was warm. I mean the leaves hadn't really started
45 changing and people were waiting for that because
46 that's when my dad used to hunt, once the leaves
47 started changing. So, you know, we left on the 15th
48 and the leaves had just started changing and it got
49 colder. So we were thinking well maybe we have to wait
50

0146

1 until the third week, even though that area wouldn't be
2 open, the southern part of the -- the south part of the
3 Tanana is open later. So I mean I agree, you know,
4 with extending it but I just don't know if I like
5 keeping the beginning the same.

6
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm just
8 going to help you out.

9
10 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay.

11
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We have to go
13 through all of this process and then when it comes to
14 discussion of the proposal that would be the time to
15 bring it up, okay.

16
17 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay.

18
19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just to help
20 out you out, yeah. This would be if you have any
21 questions of Tom, and I'd usually turn that into a
22 question and then I'd have it covered.

23
24 (Laughter)

25
26 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Any more
27 questions, you done.

28
29 MS. SHOCKLEY: I mean.....

30
31 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay.

32
33 MS. SHOCKLEY: That's all right.

34
35 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Are you
36 satisfied, did you get your answer?

37
38 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes, my question was
39 answered.

40
41 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Okay. So
42 I guess we're moving on to agency comments. ADF&G.

43
44 (No comments)

45
46 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Federal agencies.

47
48 (No comments)

49
50

0147

1 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Tribal entities.

2

3 (No comments)

4

5 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: This is easy.

6

7 (Laughter)

8

9 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Advisory Group
10 comments, other Regional Councils.

11

12 MR. PLANK: I have not received
13 anything from the other Councils yet.

14

15 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you. Fish
16 and Game Advisory Committees.

17

18 (No comments)

19

20 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Subsistence
21 Resource Commissions.

22

23 (No comments)

24

25 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Moving on,
26 summary of written public comment.

27

28 (No comments)

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No?

31

32 MR. PLANK: Sorry, this is Tom again.
33 There is no written public comments for this.

34

35 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, Tom.
36 Public testimony.

37

38 (No comments)

39

40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: In the room
41 or online.

42

43 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: In the room or
44 online.

45

46 MS. JAMES: I know moose have hard time
47 with.....

48

49 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Your name.

50

0148

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Turn it on.

2

3 MS. JAMES: I know moose have a hard
4 time with.....

5

6 REPORTER: Tell us your name again even
7 though we know you're Sarah.

8

9 (Laughter)

10

11 MS. JAMES: Oh, Sarah James and I'm
12 from Arctic Village.

13

14 REPORTER: Thanks.

15

16 MS. JAMES: I know moose is having a
17 hard time with climate change. Last year we got a lot
18 of snow and they tend to be on the road and a lot of
19 them starve because they can't get to their food. I
20 don't know if this is part of the concern but, yeah,
21 it's my concern. I know the Indians down in Wisconsin
22 they kind of trim these willows way up there, it's good
23 for the tree and it's good for the animal when that
24 happens. If we want our animal population healthy I
25 think with this climate change they also need our help
26 too.

27

28 That's all I wanted to say because I
29 seen it in Fairbanks, they were a nuisance, they were
30 out in people's trails and highways and roads and
31 people's yards, they even dropped a calf on people's
32 backyard, that kind of stuff. So I could understand
33 the problem they're having because they can't get to
34 their food. They come around and eat the cabbage,
35 whatever, on the house that people's have planted. So
36 besides just hunting and fishing and harvesting, we
37 need to think about how we can help our animals.

38

39 Thank you.

40

41 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, Sarah.
42 Any more public comments.

43

44 (No comments)

45

46 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. We'll move
47 on to Regional Council recommendations.

48

49 Go ahead, Don.

50

0149

1 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
2 I make a motion to support this proposal.

3
4 MR. PLANK: Thank you.

5
6 MR. WOODRUFF: And the discussion.

7
8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We need a
9 second first.

10
11 MR. WOODRUFF: Oh, sorry.

12
13 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I'll second.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You're
16 Chairing.

17
18 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay.

19
20 (Laughter)

21
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You can't do
23 that.

24
25 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: But I want to.

26
27 (Laughter)

28
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, I'll
30 second it for Charlie.

31
32 (Laughter)

33
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go ahead.

35
36 MR. WOODRUFF: I'll go through the list
37 here.

38
39 Is there a conservation concern; I
40 don't think so since we've had lots of testimony that
41 the moose population is stable.

42
43 How will the recommendation address
44 these concerns; it would allow safe harvest of the meat
45 and respect to warmer fall temperatures.

46
47 Is the recommendation supported by
48 substantial evidence such as biological, traditional
49 ecological knowledge. And I think that the traditional
50

0150

1 ecological knowledge would indicate that a later bull
2 harvest would substantially improve the quality of the
3 meat so that you don't have to hang it for two weeks
4 before you could transport it.

5

6 Will the recommendation be beneficial
7 or detrimental to the subsistence needs of the users;
8 no.

9

10 Will the recommendation be unnecessary
11 restriction to other users; no, since it's only
12 Federally-qualified subsistence users that use this
13 period of time to harvest.

14

15 Thank you.

16

17 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you. Sue,
18 we have another Council member that wanted to comment.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

21

22 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Go ahead,
23 Dorothy.

24

25 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay. Going down the
26 list, I mean I think because we're not changing the
27 beginning of the season there could be conservation
28 concerns -- I don't know, can we amend this?

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, yeah.

31

32 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay. So I know there's
33 a motion on the floor but I would propose to amend the
34 proposal to -- so that we -- the season starts later,
35 like five days, six days, seven days.

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You have to
38 be specific.

39

40 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay. So.....

41

42 MS. WESSELS: You can't make a motion
43 to amend.

44

45 MS. SHOCKLEY: Oh.

46

47 MS. WESSELS: A motion to amend the
48 original motion.

49

50

0151

1 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes.

2

3 MS. WESSELS: Yeah.

4

5 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay. So I move to

6 amend, right?

7

8 MS. WESSELS: Yes.

9

10 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay.

11

12 MS. WESSELS: The original motion.

13

14 MS. SHOCKLEY: The original motion. So
15 I have to make -- be very specific on these, right, the
16 dates.

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You got to
19 state it first and then a second.

20

21 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay. So five, six,
22 seven.....

23

24 MS. WESSELS: You need to have a second
25 on your motion to be discussed.

26

27 MS. SHOCKLEY: So on all of these dates
28 I need to specify which date?

29

30 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: And Unit.

31

32 MS. SHOCKLEY: And Unit. Good God.
33 Okay. So Unit 25B, start August 30th through October
34 15th. So the next one -- well, that's the winter one
35 so we don't need to change that one. So Unit 25B I'll
36 start August -- again August 30th through October 15th.
37 Unit 25B start September 15th through October 15th.
38 And then 25B, so gosh, let's do September -- September
39 2nd through October 15th. And then 25C you would be
40 September 2nd, again, through October 15th. And then
41 Unit 25D, August -- well, see -- August -- well,
42 September 2nd, again, through October 15th.

43

44 (Pause)

45

46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Is that the
47 motion to amend?

48

49 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes.

50

0152

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, she'll
2 need a second.

3
4 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yes, I was just
5 going to state that, you'll need a -- we need a second
6 or the motion dies, from the Council.

7
8 MR. BASSICH: Mr. Chair.

9
10 REPORTER: And, Charlie, Andy would
11 like to speak.

12
13 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Did you all hear
14 me, she needs a second for her motion or it will die if
15 you agree.

16
17 MS. WESSELS: Do we need to repeat her
18 motion so you all hear?

19
20 MR. WOODRUFF: No. Unless you want to.

21
22 (Laughter)

23
24 MR. WOODRUFF: Repeat it again.

25
26 MS. SHOCKLEY: Oh, well, I could.

27
28 MR. WOODRUFF: Well, he asked if we
29 wanted you to.

30
31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You need a
32 second though.

33
34 MS. SHOCKLEY: Oh, you need a second,
35 yeah, right.

36
37 (Laughter)

38
39 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah, we need a
40 second or it can't go forward. Is there a second to
41 the motion amend -- or take away the front of the
42 hunting season and moving it back.

43
44 (No comments)

45
46 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, no. Nope,
47 the motion dies then. So we'll.....

48
49 REPORTER: Okay, first of all, could
50

0153

1 you put your microphone on.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You haven't
4 had your mic on at all.

5

6 REPORTER: Say that again, the motion
7 dies.

8

9 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. We need a
10 second for her motion or the motion dies.

11

12 (No comments)

13

14 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Hearing or seeing
15 none your motion is done.

16

17 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay.

18

19 MR. BASSICH: Mr. Chair, Andy.

20

21 REPORTER: Okay. Andy would like to
22 talk.

23

24 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, go ahead,
25 Andy.

26

27 REPORTER: Okay, go ahead, Andy.

28

29 MR. BASSICH: Yeah, thank you. We're
30 still on the original motion because the amendment
31 failed, is that correct?

32

33 REPORTER: Yes.

34

35 MR. BASSICH: Okay, thank you.
36 Speaking to the motion on the table, the original
37 motion made by Don Woodruff. I'm very much in support
38 of that. The reality of what's happening out in the
39 Bush is that in Unit 25B as in Bravo, there's almost
40 nobody living in that unit, it's a very remote area, a
41 few trappers are out there but not many at all anymore.
42 The pressure from non-local hunters has increased to
43 the point that many people who live out rurally, do not
44 even go out into the field and hunt much anymore. They
45 either go out very early in the season when the season
46 opens up or they wait until the State season opens and
47 the boats and other vehicles carrying the State hunters
48 leaves, that's the reality of what happens. What this
49 proposal will do is assist people who live primarily
50

0154

1 out in remote areas that have access to it, more local,
2 to harvest moose which are staying healthy and in good
3 shape much later into the season because of climate
4 change and the extension of warm weather into the fall
5 now.

6
7 So this proposal, in my view, there is
8 no conservation concern as Don has mentioned, there
9 aren't many people out in the country, period. In 25B.
10 I'm going to refer to 25B in my comments.

11
12 There is a lot of traditional and
13 ecological knowledge in the past that most people who
14 don't have refrigeration always waited until the
15 weather changed before they hunted so there was no
16 wanton waste of the animals.

17
18 This recommendation will be extremely
19 beneficial to people that live a subsistence lifestyle
20 out in the Bush. They're a dying breed at this point.

21
22 And I don't think we have to worry
23 about having closures (indiscernible - breaking up)
24 because there isn't a lot of hunting pressure in these
25 areas, the access is very difficult for most people.
26 So the Yukon-Charley portion of 25B really doesn't get
27 that much pressure and as stated their populations are
28 relatively low but they are stable and will support a
29 few extra moose being taken later in the season where
30 they're still good.

31
32 I'm going to vote in support of this
33 proposal.

34
35 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

36
37 MS. EVANS: Can you repeat the motion.

38
39 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, Andy.
40 Just so there's no mix up we're going to read the
41 proposal again.

42
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just repeat
44 the motion.

45
46 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah, her motion.

47
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: She's -- what
49 I heard was that Linda wanted the motion repeated
50

0155

1 so.....

2

3 MS. EVANS: The one that's on the
4 floor, yeah.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.

7

8 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay, that's what
9 I was going to do.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh.

12

13 (Laughter)

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We speak a
16 different language.

17

18 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Okay.
19 I'll repeat the motion. The proposal or the motion you
20 want to hear?

21

22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: The motion.

23

24 MS. EVANS: The motion.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's on the
27 floor.

28

29 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Her motion?

30

31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No.

32

33 MS. EVANS: No, that died.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: The motion on
36 the floor.

37

38 MS. EVANS: The original motion.

39

40 MS. MCDAVID: I can help if you want.

41

42 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead. You
43 guys all got me confused.

44

45 (Laughter)

46

47 MS. MCDAVID: Okay. The motion on the
48 floor for clarification. The motion is to support
49 WP24-33 to extend the fall moose season to October 15th
50

0156

1 in Units 25B, 25C and 25D Remainder.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: The motion
4 was to support.

5

6 (Pause)

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I think I
9 want to help you out Charlie.

10

11 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah.

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: This is a
14 proposal and a motion was made to support and seconded
15 and that's where we're at and Linda wanted us just to
16 repeat it, okay.

17

18 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

21

22 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay.

23

24 MS. SHOCKLEY: And I have something to
25 say.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And I just
28 wanted to speak, I appreciate what you're trying to do
29 Dorothy but sometimes we feel like changing the
30 beginning of a season is not necessary so I would like
31 to say that, yeah, I support the motion.

32

33 MS. SHOCKLEY: I still have something
34 to say.

35

36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

37

38 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead,
39 Dorothy.

40

41 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay. I appreciate, was
42 that Andy on the phone talking about 25B, I have
43 concerns about 25C, it's on the road system, and we're
44 going to extend it, I mean people are going to go out
45 there. And, you know, I just see that as a problem. I
46 agree with the very remote areas but if it's on the
47 road system, people are going to go.

48

49 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.

50

0157

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And I wanted
2 to help again. This is a Federal proposal and the only
3 people that can use it are the people that have C&Ts on
4 Federal lands and it's not -- I don't know if there was
5 one put in for the State but I don't think there was,
6 so I -- it's just a help to understand, yeah, but it --
7 Fairbanks can't go and take advantage of that, only the
8 people who have C&Ts and that's -- and he just went
9 over that. Does that help?

10

11 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yeah, I guess. But I
12 still have concerns just because.....

13

14 REPORTER: Dorothy, your mic.

15

16 MS. SHOCKLEY:I.....

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It's good to
19 speak your mind.

20

21 MS. MCDAVID: Would it be helpful to
22 hear who has C&T for that unit?

23

24 MR. WOODRUFF: Yeah.

25

26 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yes, please.

27

28 MS. MCDAVID: Brent Vickers or Tom
29 could help us with that.

30

31 MR. PLANK: This is Tom Plank and it is
32 going to be on Page 114 in your books and it is for
33 Unit 25C, it is Units 20D, 20E, 25B, 25C, 25D, Tok and
34 Livengood have a.....

35

36 (Laughter)

37

38 MR. PLANK:customary and
39 traditional use determination for moose in Unit 25B,
40 and 25C.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Livengood.

43

44 MS. SHOCKLEY: It kind of went over my
45 head but okay.

46

47 REPORTER: Turn your mic on, I know
48 it's a pain.

49

50

0158

1 MS. SHOCKLEY: Uh?

2

3 REPORTER: Turn your mic on if you want
4 to express what you're saying.

5

6 MS. SHOCKLEY: Well, I want.....

7

8 MR. VICKERS: And just to add to what
9 Tom said -- what has been said.....

10

11 MS. POPE: Mr. Chair.

12

13 MR. VICKERS:just to clarify,
14 it's only the rural residents of those areas, so it
15 does not include residents of Fairbanks and the North
16 Star Borough, and it does not include anyone who is not
17 an Alaskan resident living in those areas. Just to
18 clarify. Thank you.

19

20 MS. POPE: Mr. Chair, this is Amanda
21 Pope.

22

23 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead, Amanda.

24

25 MS. POPE: Yes, thank you. I wanted to
26 speak on behalf of 25C. Circle is, for instance,
27 surrounded by three different units, 25C, 25D and 25B.
28 That -- this proposal will provide my community, for
29 instance, to be able to hunt longer on their
30 traditional lands before and after the State hunt only
31 on Federal lands. The proposal for -- to extend the
32 Federal season is only supposed to be for rural
33 residents, as it was said, and for -- and only to be
34 participated in on Federal lands, which is very little
35 people along -- who are able to hunt on Federal lands
36 in 25C. There's not much Federal lands in 25C so
37 people will have to go the Federal lands to practice
38 moose hunting longer.

39

40 Thank you.

41

42 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you,
43 Amanda. Any more discussion on this.

44

45 (No comments)

46

47 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Hearing no
48 requests we'll ask for a roll call vote, thank you
49 Brooke.

50

0159

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Did you hear
2 a question.

3
4 MS. MCDAVID: A question.

5
6 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah, we didn't
7 hear a question.

8
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: A very silent
10 question was called.

11
12 MS. MCDAVID: I thought I heard that
13 question called.

14
15 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah.

16
17 MS. MCDAVID: All right. I'll repeat
18 the motion for the record. The motion is to support
19 WP24-33 to extend the moose season to October 15th in
20 Units 25B, 25C and 25D Remainder.

21
22 We'll start online with Andy Bassich.

23
24 MR. BASSICH: Support.

25
26 MS. MCDAVID: Andy votes in support in
27 case you couldn't hear.

28
29 Also online, Amanda Pope.

30
31 MS. POPE: I support.

32
33 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you.

34
35 Linda Evans.

36
37 MS. EVANS: Yes.

38
39 MS. MCDAVID: Charlie Jagow.

40
41 MR. JAGOW: Yes.

42
43 MS. MCDAVID: Dorothy Shockley.

44
45 MS. SHOCKLEY: No.

46
47 MS. MCDAVID: Donald Woodruff.

48
49 MR. WOODRUFF: Yes.

50

0160

1 MS. MCDAVID: Sue Entsminger.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.

4

5 MS. MCDAVID: Charlie Wright.

6

7 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yes.

8

9 MS. MCDAVID: Motion passes seven to

10 one.

11

12 (Pause)

13

14 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Well, everybody's
15 getting the deer in the headlights look now from too
16 much input including myself but we'll continue on
17 anyway.

18

19 (Laughter)

20

21 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: We were going to
22 start -- move on with WP24-36, Unit 25, rescind
23 customary and traditional use determination of sheep
24 for residents of Kaktovik.

25

26 MS. MCDAVID: And just for folks
27 online, so you're aware we're skipping over for now,
28 WP24-34 and 35 and we will take those up after the
29 sheep proposals. So it might not be until tomorrow
30 morning.

31

32 MS. WILLIAMS: I'm sorry, I have

33 to.....

34

35 REPORTER: Mic.

36

37 MS. WILLIAMS: This is Liz Williams,
38 Anthropologist for OSM. I'm trying to let some people
39 who want to submit public comment on the Unit 25D C&T
40 moose proposal know that we're not going to do it today
41 and that we're probably going to do it tomorrow,
42 because it's actually two proposals. The customary and
43 traditional use determination is one and then looking
44 at the moose population is another and there are a lot
45 of different opinions about this one. So pardon me
46 while I text the people that asked to do public comment
47 because I've been keeping them apprised of where we
48 are.

49

50

0161

1 (Pause)

2

3 MS. WILLIAMS: And Emily are you
4 sending a text as well -- thanks.

5

6 (Pause)

7

8 MS. WILLIAMS: Okay, thanks. Once
9 again my name is Liz Williams, I'm a Cultural
10 Anthropologist at the Office of Subsistence Management.
11 And we'll be looking at -- I forgot, let's see, where
12 did it go. Sorry, I wasn't expecting to do this one, I
13 was expecting to do a different one.

14

15 MS. MCDAVID: It's Page 169.

16

17 MS. WILLIAMS: Thank you, Brooke.

18

19 MS. MCDAVID: Glad I gave you that bite
20 of halibut earlier.

21

22 (Laughter)

23

24 MS. WILLIAMS: Anyway. So WP24-36 is a
25 proposal from the North Slope Regional Advisory Council
26 and they are asking to remove themselves from the
27 customary and traditional use determination for sheep
28 in the Arctic Village Sheep Management Area. We don't
29 often get requests to be taken out of a customary and
30 traditional use determination. There's some context to
31 this one that's probably not part of the official
32 record, I'm not sure the entire Council was totally
33 happy with that but they did vote to support this
34 request.

35

36 And so the conclusion that I've drawn
37 as the anthropologist is to oppose this request just
38 because there are three lines of evidence that show
39 that Kaktovik -- number 1, you don't ever want to get
40 rid of a C&T determination if you have one because
41 they're really hard to get again. But there may be
42 some people in this room who can help me with this, but
43 there about three lines of evidence that show that
44 Kaktovik has a long-term relationship with Arctic
45 Village and other Yukon -- upper Yukon -- or Yukon
46 Flats communities -- pardon me, these are centered at
47 Barter Island, which is where Kaktovik is, and there's
48 a map on the Page 172, but we have testimonies from
49 elder North Slope Council Members that talk about this
50

0162

1 relationship. It was a trading relationship. It was
2 all kinds of relationships. And people don't believe
3 it today but people walked through the Brooks Range to
4 trade and meet with each other, they had festivals
5 together, they went back and forth and ultimately they
6 shared marine mammal resources, and the people here
7 would share sheep resources or other mammals, like
8 moose and caribou. And the, you know, in times of
9 starvation as well, people in Kaktovik relied on sheep
10 but it was very much a ceremonial and family
11 relationship.

12
13 There's an early ethnographer/
14 anthropologist named Frederick Hadley West who worked
15 with the people here and documented their relationships
16 and past use of the trail between here and Kaktovik.
17 We have some statistical permit data in the analysis
18 that shows even today that people from Kaktovik have
19 harvested in Unit 25A. They haven't harvested in the
20 Sheep Management Area but they've come up the mountains
21 to harvest sheep.

22
23 And so there's three things.

24
25 There's that old time anthropologist
26 who interviewed people here and documented the Kaktovik
27 relationship with Arctic Village.

28
29 There's the permit data.

30
31 And there's testimony from an elder RAC
32 member, I don't -- it was a person who's last name was
33 Brower who acknowledged that they did harvest sheep on
34 this side.

35
36 So that's the reason OSM supports this
37 [sic], and we don't necessarily wish to go against the
38 wishes of the Council, of the North Slope Council, but
39 as we all know this process is complicated and kind of
40 a labyrinth and why get rid of it, even if you don't
41 use it, it's in your back pocket, so that's the
42 conclusion that OSM has come to.

43
44 And we -- that's the end of my
45 presentation. Thanks.

46
47 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.
48 What's the noise that I hear.

49
50

0163

1 REPORTER: If people could star, six
2 and mute yourselves, we're hearing multiple
3 conversations, or maybe children playing in the
4 background. Thank you.

5

6 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Moving on
7 to agency comments. ADF&G.

8

9 (No comments)

10

11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just ask if
12 any Council members have any questions.

13

14 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. First.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.

17

18 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Do any of the
19 Council members have any questions of her while she's
20 still sitting there. Darn. Okay, go ahead, Charlie.

21

22 MR. JAGOW: yeah, what was the
23 reasoning for getting rid of it?

24

25 MS. WILLIAMS: Good question. It was a
26 younger Council member who said they don't hunt sheep
27 there. And when we look at C&Ts we don't necessarily
28 focus on the present, we look at pattern of use,
29 period. And one Council member said they weren't sure
30 if that person really knew so.

31

32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You mean knew
33 the history?

34

35 MS. WILLIAMS: Correct, yes.

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, okay.

38

39 MS. WILLIAMS: Knew that they had done
40 it. Because they hunt them, I think up the HuluHulu
41 but probably not up and over.

42

43 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Any more
44 questions, Council members.

45

46 (No comments)

47

48 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Then we'll
49 move on to agency comments for ADF&G.

50

0164

1 (No comments)

2

3 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Federal agencies.

4

5 (No comments)

6

7 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Tribal entities.

8

9 (No comments)

10

11 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Any advisory
12 group comments, any other Regional Councils.

13

14 (No comments)

15

16 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Fish and Game
17 Advisory Committees.

18

19 (No comments)

20

21 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Subsistence
22 Resource Commissions.

23

24 (No comments)

25

26 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: We'll move on to
27 summary of written public comments.

28

29 MS. MCDAVID: We have not been notified
30 of any written public comments.

31

32 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: We'll move on to
33 public testimony.

34

35 (No comments)

36

37 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Or any online or
38 in the room.

39

40 (No comments)

41

42 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Regional Council
43 recommendations. A motion to support.

44

45 MR. WOODRUFF: I'll make a motion to
46 support.

47

48 MR. JAGOW: Second.

49

50

0165

1 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Any discussion.

2

3 MR. WOODRUFF: Charlie seconded.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, Charlie
6 seconded.

7

8 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I heard that.

9

10 MR. JAGOW: Yep.

11

12 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Board discussion.

13

14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Don wants to
15 talk.

16

17 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Oh, sorry, Don,
18 go ahead.

19

20 MR. WOODRUFF: Okay. I'm going to go
21 through the list of discussion and justifications.

22

23 Is there a conservation concern; I
24 don't see how that would apply.

25

26 Yeah, please go ahead.

27

28 MS. WILLIAMS: Through the Chair, Mr.
29 -- Councilman Woodruff. We don't really look at
30 population numbers for a customary and traditional use
31 determination, and this is a really good point for
32 tomorrow morning, we just look at patterns of use. So
33 all we're looking at is that, there probably is a
34 conservation concern but that's not germane to this
35 discussion. It -- we don't look at that with customary
36 and traditional use determinations.

37

38 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you. How will the
39 recommendation address this concern. Apparently
40 Kaktovik's not coming over and harvesting for some time
41 but they have in the past. And I think that, you know,
42 I'm confused about that recommendation, does it address
43 the concern of conservation.

44

45 Is the recommendation supported by
46 substantial evidence such as biological, traditional
47 ecological knowledge. The traditional ecological
48 knowledge from the past is that they harvested over --
49 sheep when the caribou weren't available.

50

0166

1 Will the recommendation be beneficial
2 or detrimental to subsistence needs and users; yes. I
3 think that if they pull their customary and traditional
4 use determination, if they don't see any caribou they
5 can't come get sheep like they did in the past, and I'm
6 sure that their kids are going to be upset that they
7 don't get any sweet sheep meat.

8
9 Will the recommendation unnecessary
10 restrict other users; I don't think so.

11
12 Thank you.

13
14 MR. BASSICH: Mr. Chair, Andy.

15
16 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Go ahead, Andy.

17
18 MR. BASSICH: I'll be in support of
19 this proposal. Quite frankly I think it's kind of
20 ground breaking and given the issues that we have now
21 with declining populations of various animals I think
22 this is actually quite forward thinking that if they're
23 not using that resource, if they want to support their
24 local neighbors, and I mean it may be a couple hundred
25 miles but they're still neighbors, I know we'll be
26 talking a lot about this with the community of Arctic
27 Village, it's been on our plate at the Eastern RAC as
28 long as I've been on the RAC since 2000, back and forth
29 with the sheep hunting in this area. I would love to
30 be able to read the minutes of the Council that made
31 this recommendation but if they are making the
32 recommendations to restrict themselves they do it
33 knowing full well and well armed with the knowledge and
34 implications on it. Now, this wasn't an individual,
35 this is a subsistence group up there, so correct me if
36 I'm wrong on that, but when I look at the -- it's the
37 North Slope Subsistence Regional Advisory Committee --
38 or Council, so that's a whole group of people, it's not
39 just one individual. And they've made the
40 recommendation that they don't want this any longer,
41 this C&T. So I -- you know, moving forward, I tend to
42 think about 20 years into the future a lot of times and
43 what I'm seeing happening is fish, wildlife and
44 waterfowl are all struggling and the Federal Program is
45 there in my mind to ensure that those resources are
46 available primarily to the local people and secondary
47 to the other people with C&Ts. That's what we're going
48 to run up against in 20 years when the population in
49 Alaska unfolds.
50

0167

1 So I think this is groundbreaking. I
2 think it's -- I applaud them for making that difficult
3 decision and I'm going to support the actions that they
4 have presented and put forward.

5
6 That's all, Mr. Chairman.

7
8 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, Andy.
9 Any other questions. Go ahead, Sue.

10
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, I have
12 a question of Liz. I just saw your little note, for
13 the rest of the Council, they haven't met on this
14 proposal but this proposal was set forth and a lot of
15 times when we do make proposals -- I'm just making a
16 point, you know, sometimes one person says, okay, let's
17 make this proposal and then this proposal is made and
18 then we have to go through a full analysis before we
19 vote on it, which is what we're doing right now, and,
20 you know, I think Liz brought out some points that are
21 interesting that we need to keep in memory and they
22 haven't taken it up yet. This is a hard thing to
23 reverse later. So it wouldn't be -- in my opinion, it
24 would not be wise to do that right now and it would be
25 very interesting for us to know more information from
26 them and we won't have it until they meet.

27
28 So I know we have a motion on the
29 floor. We might've wanted to consider not taking it up
30 after we learned all this stuff and let it be up to
31 them.

32
33 So sometimes when this happens during
34 the process, I will ask the second -- I mean if you all
35 agree, I would ask the second to -- and I think that
36 was me, wasn't it?

37
38 MS. MCDAVID: No, Charlie Jagow.

39
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, it was
41 Charlie. Charlie beat me to it. I would say, what
42 would you like to do, would you like to allow it to go
43 for them and then we don't take any action or do you
44 want to act on it. And if you don't want to act on it
45 you'd have to pull your motion, and his second. That's
46 my advice.

47
48 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: If I may say
49 something. I think it should be up to them to
50

0168

1 determine whether they should hunt there or not and it
2 should not be up to us. That's their livelihood so I
3 would oppose. Thank you.

4
5 MR. JAGOW: I'm going to rescind my
6 second.

7
8 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Motion fails.

9
10 And.....

11
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No, you have
13 to.....

14
15 MS. MCDAVID: Well, there was no vote
16 so.....

17
18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Not fails.

19
20 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah.

21
22 MS. MCDAVID: It's just dead in the
23 water.

24
25 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Okay. Dead duck
26 in the water.

27
28 (Laughter)

29
30 MS. MCDAVID: That's not in Federal
31 Roberts Rules terms but.

32
33 (Laughter)

34
35 MS. MCDAVID: We do have a suggestion
36 that there could be a motion to defer to the North
37 Slope, that way the Board knows that you considered
38 that.

39
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I make a
41 motion that we defer to North Slope RAC to this WP24-
42 36.

43
44 MS. EVANS: Second.

45
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Linda
47 seconds, can you turn your mic on.

48
49 MS. EVANS: Second.

50

0169

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And remember
2 to ask for a unanimous consent. You're the Chair.

3

4 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: If we could ask
5 for unanimous consent. Anyone oppose the motion.

6

7 (No opposing votes)

8

9 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: All right.

10

11 MS. MCDAVID: With no one opposed the
12 motion passes with unanimous consent to defer to the
13 North Slope RAC.

14

15 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: And at this time
16 we're going to take a break and get ready to go into
17 sheep after.

18

19 MS. MCDAVID: So we'll reconvene at
20 5:00 p.m., and we'll begin the Arctic Village Sheep
21 Management Area Closure Review at that time.

22

23 (Off record)

24

25 (On record)

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Now, we're on
28 the record. We can't take up 34 and 35 because those
29 people have left for the evening and are planning on
30 being on. They're planning on being on in the morning,
31 they've already been told.

32

33 MS. SHOCKLEY: So the 24-34 and 35,
34 right.

35

36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, right
37 after the 21 is 35 and 42. So if it's okay we'll take
38 those up and hope we have some people show up,
39 otherwise we're going to get a complete report from the
40 consultation yesterday.

41

42 Okay.

43

44 So, Tom, you're on again, 35.

45

46 MR. PLANK: Thank you, Madame Chair.
47 Members of the Council. For the record my name is Tom
48 Plank, Wildlife Biologist for the Office of Subsistence
49 Management. I will be presenting a summary of the

50

0170

1 analysis for Closure Review WCR24-35, which begins on
2 Page 211 of your meeting books.

3

4

5 Wildlife Closure Review 24-35 pertains
6 to the closure of caribou hunting in Unit 12 depicted
7 on Map 1 on Page 214. The southeast dotted hunt area
8 was closed to all hunters in 1994 to protect the
9 Chisana Caribou Herd. This area opened to hunting by a
10 few communities in 2012 and in 2016 this area opened to
11 all Federally-qualified subsistence users but remains
12 closed to non-Federally-qualified users. The Chisana
13 Herd ranges between Alaska and the Yukon Territory in
14 Canada, it's population declined from an estimated
15 1,900 animals in 1988 to a low of 315 animals in 2002.
16 Weather, predation and hunting contributed to the
17 decline. In 2003 an intensive recovery effort was
18 initiated and since then the herd has stabilized around
19 700 animals.

19

20

21 Since 2010 bull/cow and calf/cow ratios
22 have exceeded management objectives. In all years
23 except 2017 when the bull/cow ratio was just below
24 objectives the 2022 hunt was closed due to a calf/cow
25 ratio below the minimum threshold. In 2012 a hunt
26 restricted to only a few communities opened for the
27 Chisana Herd. In 2016 the hunt was opened by all
28 Federally-qualified subsistence users. The Chisana
29 Management Plan prescribes an annual harvest rate of
30 two percent allocated equally between Yukon and Alaska.
31 This translates to seven caribou available for harvest
32 in Alaska. Since the hunt opened in 2012 zero to three
33 caribou have been harvested each year indicating
34 harvest levels are sustainable. Last harvest was
35 during the 2020 hunt.

35

36

37 And the OSM preliminary conclusion is
38 to maintain the status quo due to conservation
39 concerns.

39

40

41 The Chisana Herd population appears
42 stable and current harvest levels are sustainable
43 indicating no additional restrictions are warranted.
44 The Wrangell-St. Elias National Park and Preserve
45 Superintendent has delegated authority to manage the
46 hunt and could respond to yearly conditions. And,
47 additionally, the low harvest quota could not support
48 the harvest pressure that could result from opening the
49 area to all users.

49

50

0171

1 Thank you, Madame Chair. Members of
2 the Council. I'd be happy to field your questions.

3
4 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any
5 questions.

6
7 (No comments)

8
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I just
10 want to let the Council know that this is Unit 12, and
11 the SRC took it up and we were in favor of keeping it
12 closed. So the next thing I would ask if ADF&G has any
13 agency comments.

14
15 (No comments)

16
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Federal
18 agencies.

19
20 (No comments)

21
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We ask this
23 question every time.

24
25 MS. CELLARIUS: Madame Chair, this is
26 Barbara.

27
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go ahead,
29 who's speaking.

30
31 MS. CELLARIUS: This is Barbara
32 Cellarius, I'm the Cultural Anthropologist and
33 Subsistence Coordinator for Wrangell-St. Elias. Just
34 to give you a little bit of an update from the
35 information that Tom presented. The hunt was last year
36 because the calf/cow ratio was below the levels
37 specified in the management plan but it was open this
38 year with a harvest quota of six caribou and so far
39 we've had two caribou reported harvested.

40
41 That's the update I'd like to provide.
42 Thank you.

43
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
45 Barbara. Any questions to Barbara.

46
47 (No comments)

48
49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Any
50

0172

1 tribal entities.

2

3

(No comments)

4

5

6

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Advisory
Groups, other Regional Advisory Councils.

7

8

(No comments)

9

10

11

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Fish and Game
Advisory Committees.

12

13

(No comments)

14

15

16

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.
Barbara, SRC.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

MS. CELLARIUS: Thank you. This is a
comment from the Wrangell-St. Elias Subsistence
Resource Commission. They unanimously supported
maintaining the closure. With the low calf population
there is justification for only the area open to
Federal users. The Wrangell-St. Elias Superintendent
has the delegation of authority to manage the Federal
hunt, if needed. Authorizing a State hunt -- a State
harvest would increase competition.

27

28

Thank you.

29

30

31

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.
Were there any public comments, written comments.

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

MR. PLANK: This is Tom Plank. There
were two written public comments. One of them was the
SRC that Barbara just mentioned. The other one was
from AITRC and they stated they supported the
continuation of the closure of caribou hunting of the
Chisana Caribou Herd to all but Federally-qualified
subsistence users. Given the small size of the Chisana
Caribou population and a negative customary and
traditional use determination established by the Alaska
Board of Game, it would be detrimental to Federal
subsistence use to open up caribou hunting to sport and
recreational hunters at this time.

45

46

47

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And is there
any public testimony.

48

49

(No comments)

50

0173

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Here or
2 online.

3
4 (No comments)

5
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, hearing
7 none it's time for our action. Go ahead.

8
9 MR. WOODRUFF: I would like to make a
10 motion to support 24-35.

11
12 MS. EVANS: Second.

13
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And Linda
15 seconded, without her mic on.

16
17 (Laughter)

18
19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.
20 Discussion. I just would like to say that since this
21 is in my region and the SRC already took it up and we
22 favor continuing the closure and there was plenty of
23 discussion on it, if you guys have any questions, or if
24 I forget something Barbara can answer it. But I would
25 probably just ask if there's any other questions or
26 discussion.

27
28 MS. MCDAVID: Who was the second?

29
30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Linda.

31
32 MS. EVANS: Linda.

33
34 MS. MCDAVID: Madame Chair, can I just
35 say something.

36
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Sure.

38
39 MS. MCDAVID: As a reminder, since this
40 is a closure review, the motions are slightly different
41 usually. If you want to support the continuation of
42 the closure, it's to retain the status quo so.....

43
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm going to
45 ask the maker of the motion to accept that change and
46 the second to concur.

47
48 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame Chair.
49 I make the motion that we.....
50

0174

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Continue.....

2

3 MR. WOODRUFF:yeah, support the
4 status quo.

5

6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Got it.

7

8 MR. WOODRUFF: But this card says make
9 a motion to support so that's what I've been doing.

10

11 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you, Don. We
12 recognize that only for the proposals the procedures
13 are listed on the card, the closure reviews aren't on
14 there so perhaps we could edit the cards in the future
15 so we have both proposals and closure reviews on there.

16

17 MS. SHOCKLEY: Question. So how long
18 does this, if we.....

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Same as the
21 other one, they're four years.

22

23 MS. SHOCKLEY: Four years.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Four years.

26

27 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Linda.

30

31 MS. EVANS: No, I just said.....

32

33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: She
34 concurred.

35

36 MS. EVANS: I concurred with the status
37 quo.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. And
40 the next one is the same as this, it's just part of the
41 review, they're every four years, these closures to
42 non-subsistence qualified users, they come up every
43 four years.

44

45 MS. MCDAVID: And if you all want to
46 see all the options, it's Page 226, you'll see under
47 the OSM preliminary conclusion, those are the four
48 options for the closure review voting and you'll see
49 that retain the status quo is checked there.

50

0175

1 MS. SHOCKLEY: I have another question
2 for, Tom, right?

3
4 MR. PLANK: Yes, Ma'am.

5
6 MS. SHOCKLEY: When you're reading
7 these reports, are they in the book?

8
9 MR. PLANK: Yes.

10
11 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay. Because I try to
12 follow you and I get lost.

13
14 MR. PLANK: No, problem. Yes, ma'am,
15 they're in the book. Usually at the beginning I'll
16 tell you the page number where they start and.....

17
18 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yeah, okay, I look at
19 those and it's like -- thank you.

20
21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You remind me
22 of myself the first time I was serving on this Council.
23 It is hard to follow and he is giving a summary too so
24 -- but basically everything that he's reading we're not
25 seeing exact, which is helpful for us in one sense and
26 probably not helpful for a new member. But I feel like
27 these are quick and we can get through them because
28 they are extremely low and the local Subsistence
29 Resource Commission has -- takes these up each time and
30 it does before the meeting.

31
32 Is there any other discussion.

33
34 (No comments)

35
36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm going to
37 ask for unanimous consent for status quo.

38
39 MS. MCDAVID: Could we get some
40 justification for the record, please, if you want to
41 concur with the SRC or anything like that.

42
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We need
44 justification. They want me to move fast and then they
45 want all these other things.

46
47 (Laughter)

48
49 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah, hurry up
50

0176

1 but do this.

2

3 (Laughter)

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I just can't
6 win.

7

8 (Laughter)

9

10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I
11 would just refer to what the Subsistence Resource
12 Commission came up with, the justification. Would
13 everyone concur.

14

15 (Council nods affirmatively)

16

17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: They took it
18 up, they spent time on it.

19

20 (Council nods affirmatively)

21

22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Again,
23 I'm going to ask for unanimous consent for keeping the
24 Chisana Caribou Herd closure. Anyone opposed.

25

26 (No opposing votes)

27

28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hearing none,
29 we'll move to the next one and it's again Unit 12, this
30 is the Mentasta Herd.

31

32 MR. PLANK: Thank you, Madame Chair.
33 Again, for the record my name is Tom Plank, Wildlife
34 Biologist with the Office of Subsistence Management.
35 I'm presenting a summary of analysis for Closure Review
36 WCR24-42 which begins on Page 233 of your meeting
37 books.

38

39 Wildlife Closure Review 24-42 pertains
40 to the closure of caribou hunting in Unit 12, which is
41 depicted in Map 1 on Page 235. The southwest
42 crosshatched hunt area was closed to all hunters in
43 1993 to protect the Mentasta Caribou Herd. This area
44 has remained closed to all hunters.

45

46 The Mentasta Caribou Herd population
47 declined from an estimated 3,100 animals in 1987 to
48 less than a thousand animals in 1993 when the area was
49 closed for conservation concerns. Since 1993 the

50

0177

1 estimated population continued to decrease to an
2 estimated 495 caribou in 2021. And you can see that on
3 Table 1 on Page 243. Very poor calf recruitment due
4 mostly to predation is the primary reason for the
5 decline. The population has remained stable at
6 relatively low levels since 2004 as evidenced by low
7 calf survival. The bull/cow ratio has generally been
8 well above the management objective of 35 bulls per 100
9 cows but may be inflated due to the mixing with the
10 much larger Nelchina Caribou Herd. The ranges of the
11 Mentasta and Nelchina Herd significantly overlap in
12 winter, although the two herds have distinct calving
13 areas. There has been no targeted harvest of Mentasta
14 Caribou in Unit 12 since the 1993 closure, however,
15 some Mentasta Caribou may be incidentally harvested in
16 the winter when they mix with the Nelchina herd. In
17 Unit 11 there was a small Federal subsistence harvest
18 from 1996 to 1998 due to management objective criterias
19 in the Mentasta Caribou Herd Management Plan being met
20 for calf production and recruitment. Only one caribou
21 was reported as harvested.

22
23 Other alternatives considered is to
24 delegate authority to the Wrangell-St. Elias National
25 Park and Preserve Superintendent to announce season
26 dates, harvest quotas and number of permits to be
27 issued, to define harvest areas and to open and close
28 the season for caribou on Federal public lands in the
29 southeastern portion of Unit 12, similar to the may be
30 announced caribou hunt just established in Unit 11 via
31 adoption of Proposal WP22-35 in 2022. However, this is
32 outside the scope of the closure review and would
33 require a proposal be submitted.

34
35 OSM's preliminary conclusion is to
36 maintain the status quo due to conservation concerns.
37 The Mentasta Herd population remains low and cannot
38 withstand any harvest. The closure should be retained
39 to protect the Mentasta Caribou Herd and remains
40 necessary to assure its continued viability.

41
42 Thank you, Madame Chair. Members of
43 the Council. I'd be happy to field any questions.

44
45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any
46 questions.

47
48 (No comments)

49
50

0178

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, hearing
2 none. Is there any ADF&G comments.

3
4 (No comments)

5
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Federal
7 agencies.

8
9 (No comments)

10
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Tribal
12 entities.

13
14 (No comments)

15
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Advisory
17 Groups. Other Regional Advisory Councils.

18
19 (No comments)

20
21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Fish and Game
22 Advisory Committees.

23
24 (No comments)

25
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Subsistence
27 SRC. Barbara.

28
29 MS. CELLARIUS: Thank you, Madame
30 Chair. Again, this is Barbara Cellarius with Wrangell-
31 St. Elias.

32
33 The Wrangell-St. Elias National Park
34 Subsistence Resource Commission unanimously supported
35 Wildlife Closure Review 24-42. There's a conservation
36 concern for the Mentasta Caribou Herd due to low
37 population numbers.

38
39 Thank you.

40
41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Any
42 questions.

43
44 (No comments)

45
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Public
47 comments, written, anyone.

48
49 MR. PLANK: Thank you, Madame Chair.

50

0179

1 This is Thomas Plank. We had two written comments.
2 One was in support, which Barbara read, from the SRC.
3 The other one was to recommend a modification and that
4 was by AITRC and they stated that all hunting of the
5 Mentasta Caribou Herd is prohibited on Federal public
6 lands, however, in 2022 the Federal Subsistence Board
7 approved WP22-35 as amended which established a may be
8 announced Federal subsistence hunt in Game Management
9 Unit 11 for bull caribou when the Nelchina Caribou are
10 present in sufficient abundance to warrant an
11 opportunity. While the present population status of
12 the Nelchina Caribou Herd may be insufficient to
13 support a limited Federal subsistence hunt within the
14 range of the Mentasta Caribou Herd at the time, AITRC
15 supports a revision of the current wildlife closure of
16 caribou hunting in Unit 11 to allow for this newly
17 established may be announced hunt.

18
19 And that concludes the written
20 comments.

21
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Is
23 there any public testimony, here or online.

24
25 (No comments)

26
27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hearing none,
28 we need a motion to support.

29
30 MR. WOODRUFF: I make a motion to
31 maintain the status quo.

32
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I think we
34 got it right that time. Is there a second.

35
36 MR. JAGOW: Second.

37
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Charlie Jagow
39 seconds. Do you have any more discussion.

40
41 (No comments)

42
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, we can
44 make it really simple. I'm going to ask for unanimous
45 consent based on the justification of the Wrangell-St.
46 Elias Subsistence Resource Commission. Okay. Anyone
47 opposed.

48
49 (No opposing votes)

50

0180

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Moving
2 rapidly along and making Staff happy. Now, do we want
3 to -- do you have some blue cards for tonight?
4

5 MS. MCDAVID: Yeah. I'm not sure if
6 everyone is still here.
7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.
9

10 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: There's people
11 over there.
12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, I see
14 Galen came in. Yeah. So are we ready to take up
15 Arctic Village 24-21.
16

17 (Council nods affirmatively)
18

19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. That
20 would be -- Liz Williams starts this one, uh, the
21 introduction.
22

23 (Pause)
24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hey, Galen,
26 I'm just going to talk to you personally. We are to
27 the point where we're taking up this proposal -- well,
28 this -- the review of the Arctic Village Sheep
29 Management Area closure, and I know you guys went
30 through a comment period yesterday with consultation
31 and we -- I guess we thought we were going to have and
32 have people come in and want to speak again tonight and
33 she has some people that signed up to speak and we kind
34 of went ahead and waited for more people to show up so
35 -- yeah, go ahead. So we have to go through this
36 public process.
37

38 (Pause)
39

40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I know it
41 gets a little confusing, Galen, because they've already
42 spoken yesterday and they might feel like they did what
43 they wanted to do but it would be better if they could
44 come in again.
45

46 MR. GILBERT: They'll be coming.
47

48 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: The more the
49 merrier.
50

0181

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. So if
2 it's okay, we'll allow the introduction. I think the
3 people understand it because they've heard it multiple
4 times.

5
6 MS. WILLIAMS: Good afternoon, Council
7 and citizens of Arctic Village. I'm Liz Williams,
8 Anthropologist at the Office of Subsistence Management
9 in Anchorage.

10

11 And a lot of you heard this yesterday,
12 and I'll repeat there's not a lot that you haven't
13 heard before, or that you haven't told us. But what
14 OSM does is every year it reviews hunts that are
15 closed. And so we brought this up at the March Council
16 meeting and just presented it and it's WCR24-21.....

17

18 MS. MCDAVID: It's four years.

19

20 MS. WILLIAMS: Yeah, what did I say.

21

22 MS. MCDAVID: One year.

23

24 MS. WILLIAMS: How many -- oh, every
25 four years, sorry. Anyway WCR24-21, we're reviewing
26 the closure of the Arctic Village Sheep Management
27 Area. And I'll just go through a brief regulatory
28 history because there's always a pathway to how we got
29 to where we are with this closure.

30

31 Members of the Arctic Village and
32 Venetie Councils started asking for a closure in the
33 Red and Cane Sheep Creek areas before the Federal
34 Program began in the late 80s and early '90s. And when
35 Federal wildlife management began in the early '90s
36 they started working with the Federal Program and one
37 of the very first things the Federal Management Program
38 did in 1991 was to establish the Arctic Village Sheep
39 Management Area. But they did not include Red and Cane
40 Sheep Creeks in that first iteration of the set aside
41 area. And so that was changed in 1995 when the Arctic
42 Village Sheep Management Area, or the AVSMA, is called,
43 was expanded.

44

45 And it started out closed and in 2007
46 the closure was partially rescinded. It was opened
47 back up to harvest by non-Federally-qualified
48 subsistence users. In 2012 the closure was put back in
49 place and it's been closed ever since and we're

50

0182

1 reviewing that closure again.

2

3

4 And the OSM conclusion is to continue
5 the closure but there's a customary and traditional use
6 determination in this area for Fort Yukon, Chalkyitsik,
7 Arctic Village, Kaktovik, and who did I forget --
8 Venetie, of course -- sorry. So there's much more to
9 the regulatory history but that is the gist of it.

10

11 OSM, according to ANILCA, can only
12 close hunts to non-Federally-qualified subsistence
13 users for three reasons: Conservation concerns;
14 necessary to continue subsistence uses; or some sort of
15 public safety emergency. And the reason for the
16 closure initially was that Arctic Village residents had
17 said that a lot of fly-in hunters were coming in and
18 scaring the sheep and the sheep would run higher up on
19 the mountain making them inaccessible for residents of
20 Arctic Village who couldn't spot by plane, who weren't
21 landing at a private airstrip that was in the area at
22 the time and so the first closure was a combination of
23 two reasons. Conservation concerns, the health of the
24 sheep, even then and the continuation of subsistence
25 users -- uses. Because people here talked about, you
26 know, once the sheep get to a certain height they're
27 inaccessible -- and I said that already so. Those
28 reasons have fluctuated during the time of the closure.
29 Sometimes it's a conservation concern and a
30 continuation of subsistence uses issue because of
31 outside pressure. Right now I think the main problem
32 is still these rain on snow events and the sheep
33 populations are declining. We have hundreds of pages
34 of testimony because people from Arctic Village have
35 been testifying to the Federal Program since the '90s
36 and all of that is transcribed and I asked Sarah if
37 she's getting me tired of using her lines for these
38 analysis and she said, no.

39

40 (Laughter)

41

42 MS. WILLIAMS: But one of them is that
43 -- there's just a lot of things that come out to an
44 anthropologist, so what Sarah mentioned earlier about
45 dall sheep being brought in through the door that isn't
46 the commonly used door is a sign of respect. She
47 talked about how traditional management looks at
48 species like trout in Old John Lake, or sheep at Red
49 Sheep Creek, the rams, especially, it takes a very long
50 time for those to mature. And those animals, according

51

0183

1 to biologists, the sheep anyway, as well as indigenous
2 knowledge holders talk about how these older animals
3 transfer the culture of behavior to the younger
4 animals. Like teaching younger sheep how to avoid
5 predators, how to eat, things like that. And they also
6 talked about -- Tiffany Yatlin gave testimony about her
7 uncle, who's in the room, Edward Sam, who is -- or was
8 their hunting chief, and he says he's not a wildlife
9 biologist but he sure seems to act like one because he
10 provides a lot of information about sheep biology. He
11 can track, or used to track the number of hoof prints
12 on the trails that the sheep use and he knew without
13 even having to go all the way up, how many sheep there
14 were based on the numbers of hoof prints that he could
15 see. He told a story yesterday about sometimes the
16 community is mad at him because there are times when he
17 says, no, don't go sheep hunting, there's not enough, I
18 haven't seen any. So there are a lot more pages of
19 amazing testimony like that, that Arctic Village
20 residents have provided for more than 30 years. And so
21 a lot of that is in here. When Evon Peter was in here
22 this morning, I showed him that we did see his comments
23 from some of the earlier RAC meetings about there are
24 three sovereigns at play here and we would really like
25 to have them all at the table, the State, the Feds,
26 and, of course the Tribal Councils of Arctic Village
27 and Venetie. And so this is a very long analysis and I
28 apologize for that but there's so much history that's
29 been shared with the Federal program that a lot of it's
30 in here, four or five people have written this, and
31 just add on to it each time there's a new piece of
32 testimony or a new aspect of biological information
33 that we can incorporate.

34
35 And I think most people were here last
36 night and heard a lot of the public testimony and I'm
37 hoping we'll hear some more interesting public
38 testimony today. Sarah just told me how important it
39 is to pay attention to that relationship with Kaktovik
40 because they -- Arctic Village took Kaktovik in when
41 they had some really bad winters and they were
42 threatened with starvation so, you know, it was a
43 mutual relationship. And I hope she doesn't mind if I
44 quote her again but she says, this is traditional
45 tribal ways that we take care of each other, and she
46 would hate to see that C&T change just because it's
47 part of the history of that relationship.

48
49 So, again, OSM's preliminary conclusion
50

0184

1 is to support the continuation of the closure.

2

3 Thank you.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Council
6 members, any questions.

7

8 MS. SHOCKLEY: I have a question.

9

10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go ahead,
11 Dorothy.

12

13 MS. SHOCKLEY: So over these past 30
14 years, what is the issue of not closing it permanently,
15 is that the issue?

16

17 MS. WILLIAMS: Through the Chair. Yes,
18 Council Woman Shockley. So as we were talking when
19 ya'll call in yesterday, the Office of Subsistence
20 Management is guided by ANILCA. And we are limited in
21 what we can do. And right now the OSM policy regarding
22 closure reviews is every four years. Now that's
23 policy, that's not law. But that is part of the why
24 things haven't changed and why there's not a permanent
25 closure.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: But -- this
28 is Sue, just to help her out. But the review is law,
29 having a review?

30

31 MS. WILLIAMS: I am not the solicitor.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's what I
34 heard yesterday.

35

36 MS. WILLIAMS: Well, yeah, but how we
37 do them is -- is policy. And I'm not really qualified
38 to speak on that. I mean our solicitor should secure
39 that. I had to read a bunch of information the other
40 day and that's what I learned.

41

42 MS. SHOCKLEY: So has it been closed
43 the past 30 years every four years?

44

45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well,
46 sheep.....

47

48 MS. SHOCKLEY: No.

49

50

0185

1 MS. WILLIAMS: So there was a
2 brief.....

3
4 REPORTER: Liz.

5
6 MS. WILLIAMS: There was a brief --
7 there was an opening between 2007 and 2012 and that is
8 in the very lengthy regulatory history that's in here.
9 And I summarized it for you because it is long and it's
10 not easy to follow, but as these closure reviews go, I
11 looked at the Federal Register to look exactly at what
12 the Board decided each closure review and why because
13 we have transcripts, but that's not the official record
14 and the Federal Register is, and so I took the
15 information straight from the Federal Register and put
16 it into the analysis so that there was no room for
17 interpretation. And so I kind of detailed those, and
18 it really was educational to do that, to see the
19 different justifications. But in the Federal Register
20 there's just fact, there's no context, that's just what
21 the Board did. The Board's record of decision.

22
23 MS. SHOCKLEY: Okay, thank you.

24
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Does that
26 help.

27
28 MS. SHOCKLEY: Well.....

29
30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You know, I
31 think.....

32
33 (Laughter)

34
35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER:like
36 you, I think your -- your question was, you know,
37 there's the review that they do every four years and in
38 one of the reviews it was open for four years, okay.
39 Yeah, all right, does that help.

40
41 MS. SHOCKLEY: (Nods affirmatively)

42
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah. Okay.
44 Go ahead, Liz.

45
46 MS. WILLIAMS: If I may, Madame Chair.
47 Members of the Council. The summary is on Page 178 and
48 then we actually put the regulatory history in an
49 appendix because it's long. But it's important.
50

0186

1 (Pause)

2

3 MS. WILLIAMS: Yeah, I'm looking for
4 the appendix number, this -- or the appendix page
5 number.

6

7 MS. MCDAVID: It's 195.

8

9 MS. WILLIAMS: Oh, okay.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, that is
12 the introduction of the closure review, is there any
13 other questions of Council members.

14

15 (No comments)

16

17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, thank
18 you, Liz. And so now I need to go through our process
19 and the next thing on the agenda would be agency
20 comments and is Alaska Department of Fish and Game, and
21 we have some present here so, yeah, go ahead.

22

23 MR. NELSON: Thank you, Madame Chair.
24 For the record my name is Mark Nelson. I'm a Biologist
25 with the Alaska Department of Fish and Game based out
26 of Fairbanks. My area does cover this area, including
27 the Arctic Village Sheep Management Area.

28

29 You had some questions for me, Sue, I
30 know, and I don't know if you want me to kind of say
31 anything first or do you just want to ask some
32 questions or.....

33

34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, I
35 assume you have a report.....

36

37 MR. NELSON: Okay.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER:so go
40 ahead with your comments from the agency.

41

42 MR. NELSON: Okay. So as far as the
43 Arctic Village Sheep Management Area, a few years ago,
44 I believe it was 2017, the Alaska -- on the State side,
45 the Alaska Board of Game passed some regulations,
46 changed some regulations from a general season hunt in
47 this Arctic Village Sheep Management Area. They
48 decided to call it something else so in State
49 regulations you'll see the terms Eastern Brooks Range
50

0187

1 Sheep Management Area, so they're the exact same area,
2 they overlap each other identically but that is that
3 Eastern Brooks Range Management Area is the same thing.
4

5 The regulations that were passed then
6 are for a youth hunt 1-5 August, that would be a
7 harvest ticket, resident only, and the bag limit would
8 be a one curl -- or one ram, with full curl or larger
9 horns, pretty standard -- that's a pretty standard
10 regulation throughout most sheep hunting areas. All of
11 the Brooks Range has basically that same youth hunt.
12 Specific to this, that's different from everywhere else,
13 would be a drawing hunt, the dates would be August 10th
14 to September 20th, this would actually be open to
15 residents of Alaska and non-residents as well. The bag
16 limit would be one full curl ram or larger every four
17 years and that would be for residents as well as non-
18 residents. So that's a little bit different than
19 everywhere else. That's much more restrictive, a
20 drawing hunt under State regs is the most restrictive
21 type of hunt we have and the one every four years is
22 also the most restrictive bag limit we have for sheep
23 basically. The Board did not go so far as to set a
24 number. And in deliberation it was discussed that the
25 number would have to be very, very low. If it were --
26 if the Federal Board rescinded the closure and we had
27 to decide how many drawing permits to take, I can't
28 imagine very many at all, I would actually want some
29 input from folks in Arctic Village and this Council as
30 well, but I can't envision it being more than a handful
31 just to start, maybe less than five, probably is where
32 we would start, something very, very small. See if it
33 works. See if, you know, if it works for folks here as
34 well as everywhere else. But that's something that
35 would have to get worked out.
36

37 One other hunt that also is included in
38 this area that's currently closed is a subsistence
39 registration hunt, it's a winter hunt, it starts 1st of
40 October to the 30th of April. In this area that's one
41 ram with three-quarter curl horn or less and that's
42 also in every four years for this area.
43

44 So, again, all three of those within
45 the Arctic Village Sheep Management Area are
46 essentially closed with the Federal closure, but that
47 is what's on the books for the State if it were to be
48 rescinded.
49

50

0188

1 As part of that process, the Board also
2 passed a requirement for hunters in the Arctic Village
3 Sheep Management Area to pass a hunter education
4 program that would be specifically designed for people
5 hunting sheep in this area. That has not been
6 developed. That's something that if we went down this
7 road, if the closure was rescinded and that's something
8 that would have to kind of start here, we would have to
9 learn a lot about what folks would really want to see
10 that program look like. That's not something I can
11 just come up with off the top of my head. There would
12 be a fair amount of work to do to get those couple
13 things in place.

14
15 As far as population estimates for just
16 this Arctic Village Sheep Management Area, the State
17 has not flown surveys here but the Fish and Wildlife
18 Service has. The two most recent surveys were in 2012
19 when there were 309 sheep counted within the Arctic
20 Village Sheep Management Area and then the last one was
21 in 2020 where there was 279 sheep counted. It's not a
22 very big area so those numbers are probably on par. I
23 suspect if we were to do it today the numbers would be
24 less. There are fewer sheep across the entire Brooks
25 Range. All of the survey areas that happened, we have
26 one on the State side a little further to the west,
27 Gates of the Arctic has one and all across the same
28 thing has been happening, in the areas that are hunted
29 as well as areas that aren't hunted, and that is that
30 sheep numbers are much lower now than they have been.
31 That's not a new thing. We've gone through ups and
32 downs in the past and I'm prepared to talk more about
33 that stuff if folks are interested.

34
35 But that pretty much covers what I have
36 for just this Arctic Village Sheep Management Area.

37
38 Do you guys have any questions on that.

39
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Council
41 members, any questions. Don.

42
43 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame Chair.
44 Mark, my question is, or my request is that your hunter
45 education people, if they can develop some kind of
46 format that they could present to the Council, what
47 that would look like, because otherwise it's just a
48 balloon in the sky, you know, and develop that amount
49 of data after the approval of a hunt seems kind of
50

0189

1 redundant to me, you know, it should be done before the
2 hunt is approved. And I don't know if you know but our
3 Council is working on a hunter ethics program and I
4 think that would fit in good with what you're talking
5 about.

6
7 So that's my comment.

8
9 Thank you.

10
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any other
12 questions from Council members.

13
14 (No comments)

15
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, I'm
17 going to reiterate what Don's asking here. I want the
18 people of Arctic Village to know that I would like as
19 much information as possible. It's more important to
20 me to see the entities that do the managing working
21 together with the people. And it was three of us from
22 this Council that went to the Board of Game to ask to
23 really start that hunter ed thing, it would be a
24 requirement of any hunter that would ever get a permit
25 there, and I reiterate we asked the Board of Game,
26 would you please start it now, the best thing to do is
27 get it going right now. We had Charlie there, myself,
28 and Andrew Firmin. We each spoke to different things.
29 We spoke specifically to the Department starting that.
30 And it is the time that the Department created that
31 permit draw, and I don't feel like you can have a
32 working group with a group of people like here in
33 Arctic Village, if you don't start working with them,
34 and for some reason ADF&G is like, no, I don't want to
35 do that, you know, and I just feel like that's probably
36 the biggest thing for me. Because these people have to
37 come before this closure review every four years and I
38 wanted them to see that there might be, if we get a
39 bunch of things in place, something where they don't
40 have to go through that, and my idea is during this --
41 doing this hunter education thing, all the things that
42 they care the most about is all of this history of
43 their elders and that area, how important it is to the
44 people, to build that so people have some kind of
45 confidence in these managers. And you don't have it if
46 you don't work on it.

47
48 So that's something that I kept
49 thinking, how can we make this so the poor people don't
50

0190

1 have to take this up over and over and over again and
2 they're heard, their stuff is written and used by the
3 Department of Fish and Game also.

4

5 So that's -- and I'm asking the
6 question, like Don, do you foresee this happening or
7 are you in a roadblock situation?

8

9 MR. NELSON: Madame Chair. I'm in a
10 new situation. I'm brand new. So we can start fresh
11 right here today so I'm all for that. I think that's a
12 really good idea, especially if that is a roadblock for
13 opening this up on the Federal side, absolutely. I
14 would request help, maybe from folks from Arctic
15 Village as well, like I said I'm going to need help
16 with this so if there's, you know.....

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And I think
19 it's going to be you working with the Federal, the Fish
20 and Wildlife Service, the Refuge people too, and the
21 people here too.

22

23 MR. NELSON: Yeah.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: If people are
26 just working together and they're seeing something
27 positive towards the future, it has to start not after
28 it's open, it has to start before.

29

30 MR. WOODRUFF: So I went to this
31 caribou conference, an ungulate conference in Anchorage
32 and I chose to take a bunch of classes, we had a gamut
33 of classes we could choose from and I chose quite a few
34 of them on co-management. And this is perhaps the time
35 for me to say that it takes a bit of maturity both on
36 the Federal side and the State side to co-manage and to
37 realize that that's the future, you know, Fish and Game
38 and we're not the 1970s anymore, and co-management
39 works and it includes the tribes and the corporations
40 and the Feds and the State to get together and make it
41 happen and I hate to say this but on the Fortymile
42 Coalition, the Park Service is never, ever invited to
43 any of our coalition meetings, and why is that, because
44 the State doesn't invite them, now that's bad. That's,
45 you know, that's just going the opposite direction of
46 co-management, which is the future, or which is the
47 present. So that's all I got to say about that.

48

49 MR. NELSON: Through the Chair. Member

50

0191

1 Woodruff. Yeah, I agree with all of that. And some
2 bright spots there, we have started a sheep project
3 cooperatively with the Park Service, so the State and
4 the Park Service are working on a sheep project
5 together right now to really evaluate full curl harvest
6 strategy, looking at what rams are responsible for, you
7 know, reproductive success of that herd as far as what
8 age classes of rams and stuff like that.

9
10 I agree with you and I think we're
11 starting to take some of those steps, so thank you for
12 that.

13
14 Thank you.

15
16 (Teleconference interference -
17 participants not muted)

18
19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.
20 Any other questions of Fish and Game.

21
22 (No comments)

23
24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Certainly
25 appreciate that, thank you.

26
27 MR. NELSON: Thank you.

28
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Is there any
30 Federal agencies have any comments on this one.

31
32 (No comments)

33
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I think this
35 is where Merben should have been here.

36
37 (Laughter)

38
39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: He's hiding.

40
41 MR. CEBRIAN: Good afternoon. My name
42 is Merben Cebrian. I'm the Refuge Manager for Arctic
43 Refuge. And I would like to thank you for having me
44 make some comments.

45
46 First of all I would like to extend my
47 thanks to the State of Alaska and I would like to work
48 with you on making sure that we keep this resource that
49 is so very important to folks from here and we need to
50

0192

1 protect it. And, indeed, I agree, that co-management
2 is a good way forward.

3
4 That's my comment.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
9 very much Merben.

10
11 Any questions of Merben.

12
13 (No comments)

14
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm going to
16 make you get your exercise. Any questions.

17
18 (No comments)

19
20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you so
21 much. And Merben informed us he's also new so.....

22
23 MR. CEBRIAN: Yes.

24
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes, uh-huh,
26 since June.

27
28 MR. CEBRIAN: Since June.

29
30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, so
31 maybe new is good for working together. So next would
32 be any tribal entities, Native Tribal Village. So --
33 yes -- push the button and then sit and give your name.

34
35 MS. SOLOMON: My name is MaryBeth
36 Solomon. I was hear earlier, I've been listening and
37 learning your process. It's a lengthy process I see so
38 it's a lot of work. I'm a tribal council member for
39 the Fort Yukon Tribe, Gwitchyaa Zhee Gwichin Tribal
40 Government, and they asked me to come up here and
41 represent the tribe in the issues that I hear. At
42 first I thought it was just the sheep but it looks like
43 all natural resources that we're trying to protect. So
44 we support Arctic Village Tribe in the management that
45 they see fit for the sheep, the caribou, and also I --
46 there's other species, of course, but from this morning
47 when I heard Charlie mention about climate change. I
48 agree with Charlie. Anyhow that issue kind of just
49 triggered a lot of things that we're dealing with, what
50

0193

1 we see now that our grandfathers saw before us. They
2 shared and shared alike and now it seems like we're
3 competing for the resources out there in some form.
4 And some people are not responding. I know there's
5 jurisdiction issues, entities and all this stuff.

6
7 But overall we're trying to protect
8 what we're going to live off of.

9
10 And it seems like there's -- from what
11 I saw here and the poster and stuff, it seems like 25D
12 and 25A and you guys have different rules, over the
13 mountain or through the Valley, but overall we're
14 trying to protect what we learned to live off of, and
15 also protect it and preserve it for the future. And
16 always wondered where that hunter ethics training came
17 from, so it's you guys that kind of head that up, I
18 guess.

19
20 But as I listen I learn, I believe the
21 message from my tribe is that we will support the
22 tribal point of view here on their resources. We kind
23 of mingle around and also the resources that we have
24 down in the Yukon Flats, actually fly over the Arctic
25 Refuge to go up there to either migrate or to the
26 calving ground, for instance. I heard there were
27 salmon coming up this river here. I remember back in
28 the early days they never used to go to Venetie but
29 they are going there pretty steadily now, so I'm sure
30 they're coming this way. And back in the day even Old
31 Crow never used to get king salmon but now they're
32 getting more than me. They're coming into that
33 tributary instead of going up the Yukon River to their
34 own spawning ground. So even our fish are goofy. I
35 don't know, I guess it might be from the river and
36 water or whatever, but I go to fish camp and I learned
37 all that stuff with my parents since 1970. Recently
38 we're unable to do that. I haven't even been in a boat
39 for several years, due to Covid and then they closed
40 the fishing on us and all that on the Yukon, that
41 affects what we eat, so we're trying to hustle around
42 and do this and that too.

43
44 I believe in bartering, you know, we
45 could trade and stuff like that too, share and share
46 alike. Back in the day we saved each other.

47
48 But I would like to know some of these
49 issues that you guys talk about, it took me a little
50

0194

1 while to figure out how to manipulate the paperwork but
2 I wish I had had that document before I came here, but,
3 however, we want to know we're in unity, we're in
4 solidarity with some of the stuff that we hear here and
5 with the tribe. And also with the agencies that work
6 for us, you know, you're working for us, and we're also
7 providing the information to all of you.

8

9 And there's many different agencies
10 that one person will be involved in so it all comes
11 together. I see Charlie everywhere, you know, this is
12 actually my first meeting at this kind of deal. So
13 just to get up and make my comments on the tribal point
14 of view, the kind of message I was supposed to bring
15 up.

16

17 Thank you for your time.

18

19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.

20 Any questions.

21

22 (No comments)

23

24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.

25 Okay. In the essence of trying to do this right, I
26 wasn't supposed to skip over No. 2, right.

27

28 MS. MCDAVID: It's okay.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It's got a
31 big cross on it so I skipped over it. My apologies,
32 I'm told that Brent has a summary of the tribal
33 consultation that occurred yesterday and then the next
34 thing is Advisory groups and then we'll go into public
35 testimony. And I need to say that there was a bunch of
36 blue cards sent in yester -- or today, I mean, and that
37 we will call your name.

38

39 MR. VICKERS: Thank you, Madame Chair.
40 This is Brent Vickers, Office of Subsistence
41 Management. And I am going to give you a very brief
42 summary of tribal consultations. I know many people
43 here were present and so I'm going to give a very brief
44 summary.

45

46 And foremost what was said by those at
47 the consultation that they want this closure to be
48 permanent. They understand that this is not within the
49 purview of the Board to make closures permanent but

50

0195

1 what they want ultimately is for the leadership, Fish
2 and Wildlife, DOI, to work with them to find ways of
3 making this happen. To do something. To go forward
4 with something to help them alleviate these problems of
5 having to go through this -- the stress of having to go
6 through these closures every four years. One
7 alternative would be to prolong the periods in which
8 they have to do these closure reviews from -- longer
9 than just four years.

10

11 It was said that there are -- they have
12 their own -- here in Arctic Village, they have their
13 own culturally appropriate practices for using the
14 sheep, which are essentially one of the more culturally
15 venerated resource out here.

16

17 And from what they have observed when
18 the hunt was opened from 2007 to 2012 is that the
19 practices by people coming in from the outside often
20 conflict with their own cultural practices, such as
21 harvesting only those males -- the oldest males with
22 the biggest horns, or even harvesting just the horns
23 and leaving the unsalvaged meat. This is a great sheep
24 offense to the sheep, this is great offense to the
25 residents, this is beyond just not wanting to see this,
26 this is just something that is -- is completely wrong
27 and -- and -- and could end up and the sheep not having
28 that relationship with the residents that they've had
29 for so many years.

30

31 And another thing that was said is in
32 regard to complaints coming from people from -- people
33 from the outside, that the people here aren't using the
34 sheep like they could be, that they -- the reported
35 harvests are low, that there's more sheep that can be
36 harvested. That -- again, this is a cultural practice,
37 that the sheep are venerated, this -- they are only
38 used ceremonially, and when they are needed
39 ceremonially, and so it's not a matter of harvesting
40 what they can, as many as they can, but they harvest
41 when it's culturally appropriate to do so, it's not
42 about numbers, it's about being culturally appropriate.

43

44 That's the end of my summary.

45

46 Thank you.

47

48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you. I
49 do want to say one thing about people that would leave
50

0196

1 the meat are illegal. The State law says they have to
2 bring out the meat so that's not a cultural thing, it's
3 illegal. Yeah, I want to make sure that's known. And
4 that is not anything that -- the people that like to do
5 things right and love the meat, that's not anything
6 that they would practice.

7

8 All right, that -- okay, I keep getting
9 notes. Now, do I have any other tribal comments, and
10 tribal would be one of the tribes, like Arctic Village.

11

12 Thank you, Galen -- oh -- so how many
13 cards do we have -- we got three, okay.

14

15 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I'd like to
16 recognize.....

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. This
19 is Chief from Arctic Village, past Chief.

20

21 MR. GILBERT: Traditional Chief.....

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Traditional
24 chief.

25

26 MR. GILBERT: Traditional Chief a long
27 time here in -- and also at TCC and 43 villages. So I
28 know my friend, Charlie. I've been working with him
29 for a long time. And I get to know a lot of peoples
30 everywhere in our regions and even outside of our
31 region.

32

33 So we've been talking about
34 subsistence, the beginning of that is there's so many
35 of us testify for that but there's a lot of talking for
36 many, many years and then it's still going on. And we
37 try to let people know where we come from and we are
38 the people, we've been here thousands of years.
39 Yesterday I mentioned the story is still -- some of us
40 still remember it from the elder, which is true story,
41 but nothing is written down but we carry on with it.
42 We all know that and we live here and yesterday I
43 mentioned that it's really, really cold up here many,
44 many years ago. I even remember 70 below and 75 below
45 and I think for two or three weeks and that's really,
46 really a hard life. But we have to keep ourselves warm
47 some way and we got to hunt for the animals. So elder
48 keeps saying that and teaching to the young people and
49 we have to respect the traditional land. We live on

50

0197

1 the traditional land right here. And you can see all
2 around the mountains up north and all around here,
3 maybe 100 mile up north and 75 northeast and by foot we
4 cover the whole area in this country because a lot of
5 time we have hard time to find an animal. Because
6 transportation is really hard. It's kind of easy for
7 the young people but our old people, how can you carry
8 the old people everywhere. So a lot of them gave up
9 their life because then they want people to live, young
10 people, so they give up a life and they want the young
11 people to live. That's a very sad story so we live
12 here, this country and make it further up Red Sheep
13 Creek.

14
15 Yesterday I talk about a story about
16 the mountains and the ogres, like sheep laying on the
17 ogres, so it's down there, down here and they got him
18 over here, and so that was a really miracle thing to us
19 to remember what happened. That sheep came down here,
20 down the flat, and then the ogre is on it and so they
21 found out it came from the Red Sheep Creek.

22
23 So I've been there about 10 times up
24 that way, Red Sheep Creek because I seen a lot of
25 historical site and the sheep fence, caribou fence and
26 even (indiscernible) been using it and I see some stick
27 up there sticking out, all rotten. And also there is
28 some graveyards up there too. So even though I'm
29 young, but I know lots of traditional life and I see
30 where they built that skin boat and everything. So I
31 respect the land so I respect my people in the past,
32 even here in Venetie and Arctic, it's traditional land.
33 I don't know how many times I mentioned that, Indian
34 Power, I think about it. Ever since I was young, I
35 never bring any liquors into this country because out
36 of respect for my people, the land too.

37
38 So I know my people have been up there
39 thousands of years in the Red Sheep Creek. I don't
40 know about the population, up and down. About 20 years
41 ago when I first went up and then further down this way
42 there's some sheep everywhere on the mountain, a lot of
43 them, and now the population is declined, up and down.
44 But, you know, when the rich people, people with the
45 money, they want this antler so the way I think about
46 it is we should keep that place for the breeding area.
47 There's everywhere around here are landing strips, they
48 land on the sandbar. I see SuperCub land a lot of
49 places and they don't want other kind of vehicles to be
50

0198

1 on that area but the SuperCubs, us, we have to walk.
2 We know it's a good hunting place up there but some
3 people go up and camping and they spend a lot of time
4 up there so we want to keep that place for the future
5 generation to come and they can see the scenery and
6 they want -- I want my grandchildren to see that place
7 and that animal that we have up there. S o one time
8 before school start I took my family up there because
9 early -- my wife and couple boys, we spend more than a
10 week up there and one old man with us, too, I'm really
11 glad that I did that because I show them around that
12 historical part of, you know, a campsite and fence and
13 all that is there. And I showed it to them. And I
14 know that they want to see it later on but then we lost
15 the two boys. But I never give up talking about Red
16 Sheep Creek so we should keep it that way for not --
17 not just for my family, our people, but I don't mind
18 people to come to see the scenery, the beautiful place
19 up there and they could camp or take picture and
20 everything without harvesting anything up there.

21
22 So that's what we keep saying that, for
23 many years now.

24
25 I try to get up there with my friend,
26 Evon, last summer, but I forgot about my problem, leg
27 problem, so I want to go up with him and take the whole
28 picture and every mountain has a name, in our language.
29 Yesterday one huge mountain, I don't know how many
30 hunters hunt on that mountain, a long time ago, so one
31 herd of sheep up there, so they chase them around with
32 that arrow and pole, cane, so they've been using that
33 to climb mountain and those sheep got no way to escape
34 so they try to go around that, it's really a rough
35 place, so they try to hide this way but they're all
36 lined up and then the leader was in it, right there,
37 there's no way he can turn around. So -- so the people
38 waiting up for them up there so every day, every night,
39 they watch them, and one or two fell off the cliff, so
40 we called them not to be (indiscernible) so all the
41 sheep was died that day there, and we called
42 (Indiscernible). I brought David Salmon (ph), his
43 grandfather was up there, too (Indiscernible). And I
44 took David Salmon and Philip Peter and Timothy Sam and
45 my family so he check out the mountain, he called --
46 his father told him about that so I took him out and I
47 -- there's a lot of things I want to show to the people
48 what's happening up there.

49
50

0199

1 I'm an elder so that's what I want, we
2 want to keep that place for the generations to come.

3

4 So tonight I'm busy with something
5 else, and I'm working, but they call me here so I came
6 over here, rushed, so I'm glad to be talking to you
7 about this place up there, so thank you very much.

8

9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.
10 Thank you, very much. Any questions.

11

12 (No comments)

13

14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you
15 very much Trimble.

16

17 MR. TRIMBLE: Well, I'm 88 years old
18 and I never leave this place but I've been traveling
19 all over the world, Bahamas, Peru, Hawaii and all over,
20 so I just travel all over the world without money so
21 thank you.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I want to
24 know how to do that.

25

26 (Laughter)

27

28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Thank
29 you very much. Okay, moving on. That was the tribal
30 entities, now we're at Advisory Group comments. Were
31 there any other Regional Advisory Councils that took it
32 up, or Fish and Game Advisory Committees or Subsistence
33 Resource Commissions.

34

35 (No comments)

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hearing none.
38 Written public comment. Is there any written public
39 comment.

40

41 MS. MCDAVID: Madame Chair. I have one
42 comment from Matt Gilbert. He said he just wanted to
43 submit written support. He says I want the sheep area
44 in Arctic Village Sheep Management Area closed and he's
45 been doing some mapping of traditional use in that
46 area.

47

48 And then I believe the other folks
49 might be here in the room.

50

0200

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. So
2 that would be the written, so public testimony is next
3 so go ahead -- the first person to call on is Evon
4 Peter.

5
6 MR. PETER: Good evening.

7
8 (In Native)

9
10 My name is Evon Peter. Good to see you
11 all again, I said hello this morning. And anyone that
12 might not have been here this morning, you know, my
13 name is Evon Peter and, yeah.....

14
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Some people
16 can't hear very good, can you pull the microphone
17 closer.

18
19 MR. PETER: My name is Evon Peter, is
20 that better.

21
22 (Council nods affirmatively)

23
24 MR. PETER: Yeah. And this morning I
25 shared with you I'm from here, Arctic Village,
26 resident, former Chief from Arctic Village. I
27 currently serve also on the board of the Gwichin
28 Council International. I grew up here some with my
29 grandfather and my uncle.

30
31 I wanted to make comments on Red Sheep
32 Creek but also, you know, as I'm sitting there thinking
33 about the (In Native) is what we call it, I think about
34 how, you know, for our people it's hard to just isolate
35 one species and one place as important to our way of
36 life. And I heard from the consultation yesterday
37 there was talk about how our people used the sheep up
38 there ceremonial and when it's needed. And, in fact,
39 in the story that Trimble is telling about, (In Native)
40 which is a historic place name, there's a story behind
41 that that was a time that our people really needed to
42 harvest those sheep for us to make it through during
43 that time so, you know, there's a way that our people
44 have survived here for thousands of years which is by
45 being aware of how we can maintain our relationships
46 with all the different species of animals up here on
47 the land so that we can ensure our continued survival.
48 And also in Trimble's story he talked about, you know,
49 some of the sacrifices that our elders have made and
50

0201

1 this whole land up here, in every direction, pretty
2 much, you know, as far as you could walk in a couple
3 days it's riddled with place names and stories related
4 to them. You know even on the way up towards the (In
5 Native) there's a place we call (In Native) and that
6 place is known for a really good fishing area and when
7 people would go up to hunt the sheep, not everyone
8 could make it up there in the mountains, because like
9 Trimble was saying, you know, him and I were going to
10 go up there too but his leg wasn't feeling good and so
11 the elders would be -- would stay there, at (In
12 Native), it was a very plentiful fishing area so they
13 could leave some elders there and maybe some young kids
14 who couldn't make the hike up either so then the elders
15 become the babysitters and they'd survive on the fish
16 in that place. There's a hill up by that area called
17 (In Native) and that, in our language, means Fish Scale
18 Hill, and that Fish Scale Hill is coming from the story
19 of thousands of years of our elders taking care of
20 young people there and fishing and that's how many fish
21 scales came in that area that it made a hill that now
22 carries that name.

23
24 And I was also thinking that there's a
25 book that my grandmother had wrote, Katherine Peter,
26 called, (In Native), which means living in Neets'aai
27 Country, which is -- this is where you're at right now,
28 this is Neets'aai Gwichin Country. Earlier this
29 morning I said, (In Native), you know, this whole land
30 around this area, this is our people's land, our
31 territories. My grandmother was an arranged marriage
32 and came up here, she grew up in (In Native) in Fort
33 Yukon on the Yukon River and she tells a story in our
34 language, but you can read it in English because she
35 wrote it in English on the right side of coming up here
36 after that arranged marriage in the '30s and the whole
37 start of the book is of her story of moving with my
38 grandfather and my great-grandmother Sozen, because my
39 great-grandfather (In Native) had just passed on
40 actually while they were coming up and they moved up
41 through the mountains back over here up around a
42 mountain we call (In Native) up the Junjik (ph) River
43 and then they went back up around that mountain and
44 they went right up there and they spent the summer
45 hunting sheep. And I just encourage you to get the
46 book, it's called Living in Chandalar Country, because
47 if you want to hear a story that will give you another
48 depth of understanding about the relationship that our
49 people have with Red Sheep Creek, you can read that
50

0202

1 story.

2

3

4 And people think about those times as
5 like a long time ago but that was my grandfather, who I
6 grew up with. That's who's in that story, and my
7 grandmother who I grew up with. And all these place
8 names, and when we think about 100 years ago or
9 something, it doesn't sound that long ago to our
10 people.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

So the sheep is really important to our people in this community. We're really worried about what we're seeing, what our people to the south of us, our Gwichin, and other people to the south of us who are not able to fish for king salmon on the Yukon. I heard earlier you guys were talking about some of the impacts of climate change. There's compounding impacts that are affecting our people's way of life and we're worried about our future. And so protecting Red Sheep Creek is even more significant, perhaps, than it ever has been for us in this land because we don't know what the future holds and things are changing very rapidly and it's concerning and I think this is, as you all are probably experiencing, if you haven't been here before, this is really a unique and special community. We, you know, even in my childhood and upbringing we didn't have electricity and (In Native), you know, know and there was a place like when I was growing up and we were living our traditional way of life and all of our people were still just speaking our language to each other and learning how our people see and experience the world which is just really different than the Western framework. And the impacts, you know, that are starting to occur and even the past impacts to our people have really been challenging to us. And, you're right, I like someone saying like it's -- even for me, for someone who's kind of a first language speaker of English, and kind of understands, got Western educated, it's challenging come up before a committee like this or a board, you know, every few years to explain who are people are and why we deserve to be respected and to be able to continue to live our traditional way of life as we have for thousands of years. And that's all our people are really asking is like let us be who we are and let us continue to be the stewards of this land and animals around here because our people have done it for thousands of years. And so I think that this is one of the issues that you all, as leaders and decisionmakers, have these opportunities to help us to

0203

1 continue to be who we are and live our way of life.

2

3 And, you know, the issues, and I know
4 Red Sheep Creek, so I won't speak too much but I'm not
5 going to be here probably to speak to you all again
6 tomorrow, hunter ethics, I think is definitely needed
7 in this state. I have been around a few non-Native
8 hunters in other areas within this Eastern area that
9 you all have responsibility for and it's infuriating to
10 me to see the way people are treating the animals.
11 They don't know what they're doing, how to relate to
12 animals, animals just being drug around, like no
13 respect for them at all. My brother, in fact, this
14 fall went out and found a caribou that just had its
15 legs cut off, and that was it, the whole rest of the
16 caribou was just sitting there and so he harvested it
17 and took it back home but I have to tell you all that
18 for our people it's sad and it's painful for us to see
19 that happening to any of the animals, you know, out
20 here on our lands. So I really do think that our
21 people know a lot about these animals. We really do use
22 just about every useable part of the animal when we
23 hunt and have managed to have a respectful relationship
24 with them that has sustained us and helped sustained
25 healthy numbers of the animals too, you know, that are
26 here.

27

28 So that's it. I think that's what I
29 had to share today. I really appreciate your continued
30 decisions to keep the Red Sheep Creek area closed to
31 outside hunting so that our people can continue our way
32 of life here. Appreciate that.

33

34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any questions
35 of Evon.

36

37 Donald.

38

39 MR. WOODRUFF: Evon, you're very well
40 spoken, thank you for.....

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Don, your
43 mic. Mic.

44

45 MR. WOODRUFF:your presentation.

46

47 Evon, you're very well spoken and thank
48 you for your presentation. Did -- were you here
49 yesterday when we were talking about the National

50

0204

1 Preservation Act for sacred areas?

2

3 MR. PETER: No, I was not here.

4

5 MR. WOODRUFF: I think that that would
6 be an avenue to keep this area closed permanently. I
7 think that was the discussion yesterday. And I don't
8 know anything about it, you know, the National
9 Preservation Act, I didn't know anything about it until
10 yesterday. But I would imagine that your knowledge of
11 place names would be very valuable for that process.
12 So I would encourage you to be engaged in that. And I
13 don't know how OSM can help us and help you guys get
14 that moving forward but I think that would be very
15 valuable.

16

17 Thank you.

18

19 MR. PETER: Thanks for that.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.
22 Any other questions.

23

24 MR. PETER: Oh, actually I have one
25 more comment.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Evon,
28 go ahead.

29

30 MR. PETER: Which was that -- and this
31 is just because I don't know -- I know some of you, but
32 not all of you, and I still know that a lot of people
33 don't understand how much we depend on subsistence in
34 our way of life out here.

35

36 (In Native)

37

38 What I said is like, you know, like the
39 freezers, the two freezers that I take care of that are
40 by my house that are full of caribou, moose, geese,
41 ducks, different types of fish, all from this land, and
42 that's all that's in them. There's no beef or chicken
43 or pork or anything like that, and like -- so I want
44 people to understand that like our people really depend
45 on this for our way of life and to be able to live up
46 here. Like we could not afford to fill those freezers
47 with -- if we had to try to ship up all that kind of
48 food from outside. And so this is also why we advocate
49 so strongly to protect our way of life and to protect
50

0205

1 the animals that have provided for our people for so
2 long and continue to provide for us to this day.

3
4 So that's the last comment.

5
6 Mahsi'.

7
8 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, Evon.

9
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.
11 Thank you, very much.

12
13 MR. BASSICH: Madame Chair, Andy.

14
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Andy, go
16 ahead.

17
18 MR. BASSICH: Yeah, thank you, Madame
19 Chair. I just wanted to make the comment that I think
20 that that was one of the best testimonies that I've
21 heard in my 20-plus years on the RAC. I feel like it
22 covered all aspects of things that I, as a person who
23 lives off the land, hold really close to our chest,
24 it's really important. Talking about climate change
25 and what that is doing to people who want to live on
26 the land. But one of the things that I was going to
27 comment later on in our discussion aspect is the word,
28 stewardship, and stewardship is taking care of the
29 resources, the animals, the land, the waters of which
30 we depend on. And earlier in this delib -- in this
31 section of co-management. Co-management is not
32 stewardship. Co-stewardship might be the avenue for us
33 to take and to push forward, but co-management simply
34 means managing people. Managers don't manage wildlife,
35 they manage the people and the harvest of wildlife.
36 Stewardship is the protection, taking care of the
37 resource of which people depend on, and as I've stated
38 many times it's something that needs to happen
39 consistent over a long period of time, it can't be year
40 to year.

41
42 I just wanted to thank the presenter, I
43 really do think that that was one of the best
44 commentaries to our panels that I've heard in 20 years.

45
46 Thank you, Madame Chair. I like forward
47 to our discussion later on on this.

48
49 (Teleconference interference -
50

0206

1 participants not muted)

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, Andy.
4 I think Evon's already walked out the door.

5

6 Dorothy, uh-huh.

7

8 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes, I would like to
9 comment as well. As Evon was talking and talking about
10 the generations it reminded me that I am third
11 generation. My grandparents lived off the land and,
12 you know, traveled with the animals and, you know,
13 stayed at fish camp and my mother did as well. And so
14 I'm only, you know, third generation removed from that
15 time. And, you know, I'm second generation of Western
16 education and currency, you know, my mom talked about,
17 you know, when she was just a young girl, you know, the
18 boat used to come in, the barge, and somebody gave her
19 a quarter, I think. She didn't know what it -- you
20 know, it meant nothing to her. But in her 84 years she
21 went from there to being punished for speaking her
22 language to having a cell phone and, you know, a bank
23 account, you know, so, you know, we have adapted so
24 amazingly well, you know, in three generations, my
25 three generations, you know. My daughter, you know, is
26 fourth generation, her children fifth generation and
27 it's really worrisome, concerning, to think that my
28 grandchildren does not have the same opportunities we
29 had.

30

31 You know like I mentioned -- I don't
32 know if I mentioned this yester -- I think I maybe
33 mentioned this at YRDFA, but my daughter went to Kenai
34 to where she could get some fish, I went to the Yukon
35 with a four inch mesh but I -- for some reason -- we
36 were only there a couple of days and I wasn't able to
37 put it in, but she went to Kenai and I think she
38 brought home 12 reds and it took me -- we decided as
39 soon as she got home, it was like 10:00 o'clock, we
40 decided to, you know, take care of them. It took me a
41 couple of times to remember how to filet but I did but
42 my grandchildren, my granddaughters, 12 and 14, got
43 right in there and learned and we didn't have to cut
44 any of the fish because they did. They were so happy
45 to do that. And, you know, it's just mind boggling in
46 regards to how many, you know, just a few generations
47 ago where we were and today and what we're looking at
48 in the future.

49

50

0207

1 So I just wanted to mention that.

2

3 Thank you.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.

6 Yes, I understand. Actually at my age I see so many
7 changes even in the Western culture, some of it's very
8 scary when you look at the young ones coming up.

9

10 (Teleconference interference -
11 participants not muted)

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We're
14 moving on, we have another blue card from Alan Tritt
15 for public testimony. Is Alan Tritt in the room?

16

17 MS. WILLIAMS: He stepped out. He said
18 he would come back.

19

20 (Teleconference interference -
21 participants not muted)

22

23 REPORTER: Could we have people check
24 their phone and mute themselves, star, six. We're
25 having a fair amount of interference and we're still on
26 public testimony. Thank you. Star, six.

27

28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I am
29 all in favor of the public being able to be relaxed and
30 be able to come up to that microphone and speak. We
31 are doing blue cards because the Staff makes us do
32 that, it's not all her fault, she's in charge of doing
33 -- making me be good, I guess. But if we're in a
34 village I want to be able -- I want anyone to be
35 sitting out there wondering, oh, I want to speak but
36 I'm afraid to, you can't be that way, just come on up
37 and speak. But right now somebody sent me a blue card
38 and the name is Sandra Charlie. Is Sandra here --
39 okay.

40

41 MS. CHARLIE: Mahsi'choo. (In Native)
42 My name is Sandra Charlie. I am originally -- I come
43 from Old Crow Yukon. I've been up here for one week
44 teaching parka making to the community. So it's been
45 -- I used to live here in -- I think 1998 or something
46 is when I left and this is the first time I'm coming
47 back.

48

49 My grandfather, Charlie Peter, Charlie,

50

0208

1 Sr., he used to tell me lots of stories about when we
2 followed animals a long time ago and how some of our
3 people used to walk back and forth across the mountains
4 from Old Crow to Arctic Village or Old Crow to Fort
5 Yukon, just to trade, see relatives, get married to
6 somebody you don't know because it's arranged and do
7 what you need to do so that your family could survive.
8 And one thing that he told me was that when we didn't
9 have GPS, when we didn't have internet where we could
10 possibly see where the caribou were a couple of weeks
11 ago or we couldn't track animals the way we do now, he
12 said they willingly gave themselves to us because they
13 know we need them. And that is called a spiritual
14 connection that we have to the land and to the animals,
15 to the berries, to the fish, to the water, to the air,
16 everything that you see all around you right here, the
17 snow, any -- everything you walk around and touch it
18 has a purpose in our lives and it always has. And back
19 when early -- late 1800s, maybe early 1900s and before,
20 we used to have a one on one friendship relationship
21 with animals and in that relationship the animals would
22 tell us where they are and that's how we know where to
23 go to hunt them. In some years when there's no animals
24 around and there's no food then we dig, we dig for
25 roots, we dig for -- we look for rabbits, we look for
26 porcupine, we look for the small games that could help
27 our families survive and live for another year. And
28 that's one thing that people don't understand,
29 especially when it comes to people that come from the
30 outside on to our land, and I call this my land because
31 I'm Gwichin and our land goes right across Yukon into
32 Northwest Territories and all across Alaska and we walk
33 all over when -- before I was born. People walked all
34 over. My grandfather is -- who was living in Ft.
35 McPherson, Northwest Territories, his brother walked to
36 Venetie so I have family in Venetie. Their last --
37 Kenneth Tritt, he's my uncle. Him and his wife. And
38 then I used to live with James Gilbert up here, he's my
39 grandfather, he said he has a brother in Dawson or
40 family in Dawson, their last name is Joseph, because
41 his dad's name was Joseph or something. And if you go
42 to Dawson there's lots of Josephs there, he walked
43 there.

44
45 So if we walk up to the creek that
46 we're talking about, for the people that live here, you
47 don't need to tell them where to go to go to this
48 creek. And we're so confident in our children and the
49 way they grow up with the animals that they could go
50

0209

1 up. It's not uncommon for children as young as nine
2 years old to go out and kill a caribou with their own
3 gun and give that caribou meat to the elders to feed
4 their spirits because we know that keeps them strong.
5 And in a world where people have killed, taken away
6 identity, taken away language, taken away family
7 members to Indigenous people all over the world, we're
8 just trying to survive. We're just trying to ask God
9 to help us to protect that area for those little kids
10 that are not even born yet. That's all we're trying to
11 do. And we're not going to come up here and fight you,
12 we're going to do it in a good way because that's how
13 our elders expect us to behave. And it's hard to
14 explain that connection to people because they don't
15 understand it but I guarantee you if you lived in
16 Arctic Village for one year, and you went to Fairbanks
17 you're going to feel that spiritual connection, you're
18 going to feel it right in your whole body. And people
19 like us, we don't even know we have it because it's
20 natural and we just go on with life. And when we
21 really need something we depend on our elders and our
22 leaders and our God, (In Native) that we call him, in
23 our language. That's the only thing, and we've
24 survived over 10,000 years doing that.

25

26 So when somebody from Texas who has a
27 huge ranch and a couple million dollars wants to come
28 up and kill sheep on our land because they want the
29 trophy head to hang in their home, that's taking away
30 our spirituality, that's taking away our connection to
31 the land and that's robbing our children of their
32 spirituality and their future on this Earth. And if
33 you want to decimate and kill off another tribe then
34 that's the things that will do it. Bringing outsiders
35 on to our land without consulting us first. And when
36 you guys come up here and you say you're doing a
37 consultation, we're expecting that when you go back and
38 do your report, that all these are part of the
39 consultation. That things are not left out. That
40 we're depending on you guys to do your job in a good
41 way the same way we do ours.

42

43 Mahsi'Choo.

44

45 Thank you for listening.

46

47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yep, just a
48 minute, any questions.

49

50

0210

1 MS. SHOCKLEY: Just thank you so much.

2

3 MS. CHARLIE: Uh-huh.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes, thank

6 you. So anyone else here in the room want to speak,

7 okay, come on forward.

8

9 MR. NIKOLAI: Is this on?

10

11 REPORTER: Go ahead, it's still on.

12

13 MR. NIKOLAI: Hi, my name is Kobe
14 Nikolai. I'm a Council Member for Arctic Village, and
15 welcome to Arctic Village everybody. I'm going to talk
16 about in 2020 I went sheep hunting with a couple people
17 from here and it was a really awesome experience. It
18 was at Flat Rock Creek, I'm pretty sure you guys are
19 familiar with it. But, yeah, it was really awesome.
20 It was quite an experience. Yeah, I had lots of fun
21 going on the trip. I was supposed to go last year but
22 I missed out. I didn't travel by the plane, I went on
23 a boat and we walked up into the mountains and what
24 not, it was like we had to climb a couple of mountains.
25 It was really kind of a rough trip for me because it
26 was my first time but just being able to see like all
27 the views and all the -- just through the whole trip it
28 was an awesome experience. I think it's really
29 important that -- to keep the Red -- I've never been to
30 Red Sheep Creek, I want to go, but I think it's
31 important to keep it closed for younger generations who
32 want to go sheep hunting and stuff like that because
33 after going on my first sheep hunting trip it's like
34 that's kind of something I want to keep doing. Edward
35 is my uncle. I learned a lot from him, and my dad and
36 a bunch of other people around here.

37

38 I want to thank you guys for what you
39 guys are doing and coming to Arctic Village and stuff
40 like that.

41

42 Thank you.

43

44 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you.

45

46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hold on a
47 second.

48

49 (Laughter)

50

0211

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anyone have
2 any questions.

3
4 (No comments)

5
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, I want
7 to commend you for going on your first sheep hunt.

8
9 MR. NIKOLAI: Thank you.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's
12 something I did as a young woman too so it becomes part
13 of you and it's just awesome and I'm glad that you have
14 your grandfather back there, he's cheering you on right
15 now so I want to cheer you on too, keep going. You are
16 the future young man, keep it up.

17

18 MR. VICKERS: Could I ask you a
19 question? How many days did it take you hiking through
20 the mountains?

21

22 MR. NIKOLAI: For the whole trip we
23 were up there for about like nine days, which is kind
24 of long. Well, 11 all together because we had to drive
25 back home on the boat and sometimes we had to float
26 because there was a lot of weight on the boat and stuff
27 like that. But, yeah, probably about 11 days, but
28 maybe one or two days to hike into the Valley, up the
29 Mountain, one or two days.

30

31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Were you able
32 to get one?

33

34 MR. NIKOLAI: Yeah, we got two.

35

36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right,
37 congratulations, that's great.

38

39 MR. NIKOLAI: Thank you.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh.
42 Yeah, there's another.....

43

44 MS. SHOCKLEY: Just real quickly. I
45 just wanted to say thank you so much for not only
46 sitting on the Board but coming up here and speaking to
47 us, I know it's not easy but I really am proud of you.

48

49 Thank you.

50

0212

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Me too. And
2 you look so young.

3
4 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Good job
5 testifying. Really good job. Thank you.

6
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, we can
8 clap for him.

9
10 (Applause)

11
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Good job.
13 Would you like to speak?

14
15 MS. GILBERT: Yes.

16
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right,
18 come on up and introduce yourself there's a grey
19 button.

20
21 MS. GILBERT: My name is Annette
22 Gilbert. I'm originally from Fort Yukon but I lived in
23 Arctic Village most of my life.

24
25 About a year and a half ago I was at
26 this one house and these people there, this guy came up
27 to me and he told me you're from Arctic Village, aren't
28 you, and I said yeah and he said how come you guys
29 don't go hunt sheep up in Red Sheep Creek and I said,
30 what are you talking about and he said, yeah, you guys
31 got to start utilizing that grounds otherwise they're
32 not going to -- I don't know, going on and on and I was
33 like I'm pretty sure I just ate sheep meat last week
34 and, you know, these young -- that's when my godson
35 Kobe was up there too and then they utilize the grounds
36 up there. I know it, because I eat sheep meat from
37 there. And I just don't think it's a good idea for
38 people to come in and like Sandra is saying, they're
39 taking the food from us, you know, that our kids depend
40 on and we all live a subsistence lifestyle here. And
41 like Evon said, my freezers have lots of meat and stuff
42 like all kinds of subsistence food, I sure wish I had
43 some salmon though, but -- but, you know, it is what it
44 is, and I just wanted to let you guys know that people
45 do hunt for sheep and stuff and I appreciate all you
46 guys coming up and listening to us.

47
48 Thank you.

49
50

0213

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.
2 Any comments or questions.

3
4 (No comments)

5
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Is there
7 somebody else who wants to speak -- you bet, come on
8 up.

9
10 MR. LEE: Hello, ladies and gents. I
11 spoke yesterday. Mike Lee, Second Chief, Arctic
12 Village. First of all I'd like to say it's too bad we
13 can't make it a permanent closure. There was a little
14 debate yesterday, I guess policy is in the way and I
15 don't know why it can't be but every four years it
16 comes on the table and it keeps getting shut down which
17 is good, I guess. But sheep is -- just because it's
18 far away doesn't mean that we don't use that resource.
19 It's there for a reason. They don't have the numbers
20 like caribou do, which is we're good on caribou so we
21 don't just go up there and go, I'm going to get five
22 sheep, no, we know it's there and that source is there
23 and protected, that way there's more for generation to
24 come. And Mother Nature, of course, gives sheep a hard
25 time and just like the gentleman -- the Nelchina
26 Caribou Herd that was in discussion earlier today, that
27 was pretty surprising numbers to listen to and
28 disappointing. And now they can't even hunt for
29 subsistence out of that herd. Imagine if that happened
30 to the Red Sheep Creek area.

31
32 And interesting thing Edward said
33 yesterday, I didn't think about it but the young rams,
34 because all the big rams like get hunted and little
35 rams are mating with -- for the next generation and if
36 you think about it, the big rams they joist and fight
37 to see who's the dominant and have the right to mate
38 and obviously that's nature's way of showing who's
39 going to carry on that strong gene and who knows maybe
40 that messes with -- and there's so many loss of sheep
41 numbers. And having Mother Nature doing -- of course
42 taking its toll and people coming in and shooting
43 that's like no break, no break for that animal. But
44 what I was saying earlier, is that's like our -- like
45 ace in the hole, we know that's there, and when we want
46 it and we get it, and when people do get it, like Kobe
47 said, and whoever gets sheep like so and so has sheep,
48 cool, they hand out -- they don't hand out half an
49 animal, they hand out maybe here's some for a meal or
50

0214

1 two and it's cherished and hard work getting it. It's
2 a respected animal. Respect to it, it's precious. And
3 but since like we have caribou coming through we don't
4 need to bother them.

5

6 And the discussion with another meeting
7 about ANWR, I said what if the caribou went -- because
8 of that -- so that food chain, we'll go on to moose and
9 sheep and their numbers can't handle it and just like
10 what I was saying about treat it with respect and
11 cherish it and we do get it. And that protected area
12 is always up there for many generations to come if we
13 manage it. And maybe if -- because I know some people
14 are probably pro opening it but we can agree to
15 disagree. I like that saying.

16

17 Thank you for listening to all of us
18 and hearing our side of the story and appreciate it and
19 thank you.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any Council
22 member questions.

23

24 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anyone else
27 that has a public testimony.

28

29 REPORTER: Sue.

30

31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, it's my
32 mic that's off, sorry. Any other public testimony
33 tonight.

34

35 MS. GILBERT: I do.

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go ahead,
38 Sarah.

39

40 MS. GILBERT: I just feel like I need
41 to cover this and that and more to say because I'm
42 really concerned about Red Sheep Creek. Because in my
43 freezer in Fairbanks I do have that mutton. It's a
44 mutt -- it's like mutton, but it's located right here.
45 I told Gerald about it, be sure to bring that one home
46 because it's like mutton -- mutton -- yeah, to us. We
47 cut it off and it just gives you a lot of energy like
48 (In Native). And I got one in my freezer. And one of
49 the medicine, it's like a medicine but it gives us a
50

0215

1 lot of energy especially if there's a runner who is
2 going to have to run a long ways, they have it in their
3 pouch. There's a little jelly thing between the toe
4 and they got a little sac and you dry it like that, and
5 there's a little jelly thing that you put it in your
6 mouth and you taste really strong sheep, give the
7 runner energy to run more. I've been told about that
8 because a long time ago that's what they used for a
9 runner because they sent runner after messages or to
10 emergency, that kind of stuff. I know that one time we
11 have to send two guys from Salmon Rivers, it's like 15
12 miles over that way to Arctic Village because we
13 couldn't come back in time for Christmas. We were
14 having problem getting back over here because they want
15 us here because they want us to, you know, they need
16 more student in order for BIA to help start a school.
17 Because for years, even before my time they did their
18 best to keep the school going so they can have their
19 kids stay home instead of boarding school and other
20 stuff, mission, and all that. But anyway they needed
21 us here, we were out on trapline way over at Salmon
22 River and they want us back but there's no way we can
23 tell them we can't make it this year, we got to make it
24 in the springtime so we sent those two guys to run
25 here, that was Paul Tritt, Sr., and Abraham John, Sr.,
26 and they made it in four days and they were back by
27 just running. So I just think about, boy, I wish I had
28 that little licking thing from sheep, I was thinking
29 about that at that time. My mom said it will be great
30 if we have that, they'll have energy to run but they
31 did it, they did it and they did good.

32
33 I just want to put that in my story
34 about what parts of sheep, part of caribou, everything
35 that we use is scared and there's a spiritual
36 connection with that. So like, and many of them are
37 saying that it's a healing.

38
39 I said getting into mountains, getting
40 to Red Sheep Creek healed me from pain. Because elder
41 asked me to do that because I was having a lot of pain
42 in those days and now I don't know about pain now so
43 that's a healing.

44
45 We got a book called -- we put it
46 together because we thought we were losing our culture,
47 we're losing our way so this guy helped us to get a
48 book together see if we still practice what we do
49 today, our culture -- as a culture by preserving it.
50

1 Like how we get things in bow and arrow days. We start
2 out with bow and arrow and we ask this kid, he was --
3 no, he was -- we asked this elder, when you got your
4 first bow and arrow, what did your father say to you,
5 he said you're going to go get target shooting with me,
6 we're going to go out because you got your new bow and
7 arrow, just only four arrows and you're going to do
8 target shooting with that four arrows. He did the
9 target shooting. And then he said, okay, we're done,
10 now you know your bow you don't need any more target
11 shooting. And then we asked a little guy, eight years
12 old, he just got his rifle, he said when you got your
13 first gun what did your father say to you, well, we're
14 going to go target shooting and I'll give you four
15 bullets to do target shooting and they did target
16 shooting, same thing. He said, now, you don't need
17 target -- you don't need to shoot your arrow anymore,
18 you know your gun now so no more target shooting.
19 Because when they send us out with that new gun we're
20 going to come -- like four bullets they expect you to
21 come back with at least one and then they give you
22 another bullet until you get enough, you get four, you
23 get another four bullets, eight. So that's how we did
24 things and parents still do that. And this book we
25 call (In Native) Do It Yourself, just to prove that we
26 still practice our way and we know our way of life even
27 though we have to live in two worlds. We have to
28 respect our way and to be proud of who we are because
29 that's a practice we do and we learn.

30
31 So when earlier the Inupiat up there,
32 and Kaktovik, they pull out of this Red Sheep Creek,
33 they've been with us, Kaktovik, Arctic Village,
34 Venetie, Fort Yukon and Chalkyitsik, but now there's
35 only four because they pull out. They haven't -- the
36 Board haven't discussed it yet but they left it up to
37 Arctic Slope of what they said they're going to pull
38 out and that kind of put me -- that we will do it
39 ourself and we've been doing it ourself. And there's a
40 history told, we got names and places, Trimble named a
41 lot of places, Evon named a lot of places, and we do
42 know what we're talking about. We know our land. We
43 know where we are.

44
45 At one point back when my mom was a
46 little girl, like any other Native American or
47 Indigenous people, when we went through starvation, we
48 did, they did, and we had hard time, we went through
49 hard time after the contact. Everybody did. With the
50

0217

1 disease and the changes, we went through hard times.
2 These people, the Coast people had a hard time and they
3 asked us if they could stay here with us for winter
4 because it's much earlier, warmer and stuff like that
5 so we did. For a few years they've been coming over
6 for winter, there's even Eskimo village over at Salmon
7 River, it's set aside as a historical site, and that's
8 proof that they came over here and lived with us. But
9 then after awhile reindeer got introduced to them from
10 Norway and life got much easier up there so they didn't
11 have to come back down. Even my uncle Isaac, Reverend
12 Isaac Tritt, Sr., he knows how to talk Inupiaq and
13 there's another guy in Anaktuvuk Pass his name is
14 Elijah, he knows how to talk Gwichin because they grew
15 up together. And that proved that, you know,
16 everything we depend on to survive during the hard
17 times we did help each other and we did -- and we
18 always trade and bartered. Even today I still have
19 good friends up there from boarding school and they
20 love their hunting, they love their fishing, they love
21 to be our friends, but it's the corporations --
22 directors of their corporation is the one that really
23 vote for them for what -- what they want. So I just
24 want to make that clear because it kind of upset me
25 because there's Indian Law in place to protect Native
26 American resources, NAFTA they call it, well, anyway
27 and that's in place and -- uh -- well, anyway that's in
28 place already and we're kind of -- you know there's a
29 law to protect our resource as American Indians, and
30 jeopardizing that, I don't think I'll go for that
31 because I believe that we have that law.

32
33 I believe -- like Orville said, at
34 Chickaloon today, he said, ANILCA is Indian Law, and
35 that's what I said yesterday too, that to me it's
36 Indian Law. Too me is to protect the subsistence. And
37 then State of Alaska chose Subsistence Board to protect
38 that law and I think we have a law to protect our
39 subsistence, our way of life and we always did it
40 ourself. So that book, we Do It Ourself book, we
41 submit it into Refuge already so they got a copy of it
42 and we like to make copy and share with you, Council,
43 could allow that because at first when we wrote that
44 book we said we're going to keep it in Arctic Village,
45 it's not going to go nowhere, but after awhile it needs
46 to be taken out so we did a few times by a few
47 different Councils, so I'd like to see that.

48
49 And another thing is that, again, Red
50

0218

1 Sheep Creek, Arctic Refuge, there's too many study.
2 Just like the hunters they were up there hunting just
3 this last month when we got the caribou, they said
4 there's an airplane that buzzed the caribou they were
5 hunting for. That's happening repeatedly. There's so
6 many studies. Japanese, oil company, state of Alaska,
7 you name it they're out there studying what we're
8 talking about, is this true, you know, they're trying
9 to out beat each other saying that oh it'll be safe if
10 we do the gas and oil, oh, it'll be safe if we let the
11 sporthunting into Red Sheep Creek, we got to keep track
12 of who is all doing study out there too because it's
13 disturbing to caribou, and it's disturbing to our
14 hunting.

15
16 Trimble said many things that for real,
17 you know, that he -- he's very important to us because
18 he sits on Tanana Chiefs, 43 villages as a traditional
19 -- and he's a musician and he's also a priest and he
20 talk about the church up there. We got a church
21 steeple up there that tells you there's a four
22 direction arrow going out four direction and a cross
23 right there, one of them, and then underneath there's a
24 bowl of wood here and there. And that was the sun and
25 the Earth and the moon is under it. That means the
26 arrow going out is protecting the whole universe, solar
27 system, solar -- the whole solar. And it's protecting
28 the whole universe. How did they know that when they
29 first built the church. I didn't even know how to say
30 1949 when it was 1949. A lot of times when I was 13
31 years old I didn't even know when to say yes or no
32 because I don't know English and they didn't know
33 English when they first -- when the Bible got here, but
34 they know about their belief and they put that on our
35 steeple and it's still up there. I got a picture of it
36 in my house.

37
38 I just want to say I'm proud of my
39 people and we're here to stay like somebody said.

40
41 Thank you.

42
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,
44 Sarah. Is there anyone else in the room that wanted to
45 speak to this proposal -- oh, I should say this
46 closure.

47
48 MR. WOODRUFF: Edward.

49
50

0219

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Edward. We
2 cannot allow you not to speak, we need you to speak.

3
4 MR. SAM: This is not a recording.

5
6 (Laughter)

7
8 MR. SAM: Three, two, one, this is not
9 a recording.

10
11 (Laughter)

12
13 MR. SAM: No, just kidding. She works
14 a lot.

15
16 I want to thank the Board, you did an
17 extraordinary job. You followed the Roberts Rules of
18 Order accordingly.

19
20 (Laughter)

21
22 MR. SAM: Five minutes. I respect
23 that. The other main issue from the last two days of
24 people testimony, people want closure, permanent
25 closure.

26
27 I heard your voice. You spoken from
28 your heart. I hear your voice. Permanent closure is
29 in the works on my side under code of Federal
30 regulations, proceedings, I'm going to work on putting
31 a permanent closure. A lot of them are giving me
32 great, great ideas the last two days. Permanent
33 closure doesn't mean it will be closed forever.
34 There's got to be subsistence use. You can't over
35 populate the area, so I'll introduce a lottery every
36 five years or so, even if it's closure, to the public
37 where they would be satisfied with our decision.

38
39 Now, most of all I want to thank you
40 again. It's been a long day. I have to take one hour
41 break. I don't know how you all do that. Thank you
42 again and you have a good evening and we'll see you at
43 9:00 o'clock in the morning.

44
45 Thank you.

46
47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Unfortunately
48 it might be earlier.

49
50

0220

1 (Laughter)

2

3 MR. SAM: I'll be here.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any questions
6 of Edward.

7

8 (No comments)

9

10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, thanks
11 Edward. We appreciate you very much.

12

13 MR. SAM: Thank you. And have a good
14 evening.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We are
17 under the gun with a heavy agenda and we're trying to
18 get through it so we have action items and that was my
19 last call for public testimony. And Council members we
20 can -- we're up for a motion.

21

22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Do we need a
23 five minute break -- finish.

24

25 MR. WOODRUFF: Let's finish.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm hearing
28 finish.

29

30 (Laughter)

31

32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Donald.

33

34 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you. I'd like to
35 make a motion to support the status quo.

36

37 MR. JAGOW: Second.

38

39 MS. SHOCKLEY: I'll second.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: There's been
42 a motion to keep the status quo.....

43

44 REPORTER: Sue.

45

46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: There's been
47 a motion to keep the status quo and seconded by
48 Dorothy. The motion was by Don.

49

50

0221

1 Okay, Council members, this is your
2 turn to discuss. Does anyone have anything they want
3 to discuss or say.

4
5 Discussion.

6
7 Dorothy.

8
9 MS. SHOCKLEY: Are we going to propose
10 anything so that we can extend the closure or somehow
11 make it permanent?

12
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So this is
14 discussion on the proposal, if you have any additional
15 comments I suspect Staff will hear that and -- but we
16 did hear that there's certain things that their hands
17 are tied about. ANILCA says they have to review
18 closures. And unfor -- I don't make these laws --
19 that's what's happened here and that's why I come up
20 with that other idea, that it wouldn't come up if there
21 was a way to start the process to work through this
22 hunter education and -- I mean I feel like if the
23 Department of Fish and Game would just say, yeah, we're
24 going to work on this and we're going to work with
25 these people and we're going to see what we.....

26
27 MS. SHOCKLEY: Well.....

28
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER:can do
30 here, that something good could happen with that. And
31 I'm putting that forth because it's something that I've
32 thought about for a long time and I have to echo what
33 Donald started to say, you know, you don't get support
34 from people if something isn't started ahead of time.
35 So this is your discussion, Council members.'

36
37 MR. BASSICH: Madame Chair. Andy.

38
39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Andy, go
40 ahead.

41
42 MR. BASSICH: Thank you. I'm going to
43 fully support the closure. I think that there is some
44 concern for conservation and that is to a lifestyle and
45 to a way of living and, you know, not all threats to
46 wildlife -- or not all threats to people are the loss
47 of their wildlife, it's also their way of living and
48 the dependence on that wildlife. So I am concerned
49 about that and I do support the closure.
50

0222

1 In regards to the policy, policies can
2 be changed. Policies are set in place to make the
3 process work but policies should always be able to be
4 changed or amended or whatever, so I look forward to
5 hearing maybe the U.S. Government and OSM can review
6 their policy and maybe make some exceptions or come up
7 with a modification of the policy.

8
9 I think there was very strong testimony
10 on this and my feeling is if this closure was ever to
11 be lifted that it's opening up Pandora's Box. I just
12 seeing the way things for 30 years, being a part of
13 this process -- I see how one little thing happens it
14 opens the door and then slowly things get nibbled away
15 and then the people are left with what they were trying
16 to stop in the future.

17
18 So those are my comments. I will 100
19 percent support this closure and hope that OSM will
20 review policies within their agency and at the Federal
21 level. This would be the perfect case to look at that.
22 And when you look at the amount of time and effort that
23 goes into the amount of time spent to review these, the
24 peoples lives in Arctic Village aren't going to change,
25 that dependence on the animals is going to be even
26 greater in the future. So that's why I think this is
27 something that needs to be kind of a more permanent or
28 a longer time scale. The cost must be quite enormous
29 to review these closures every four years.

30
31 That's all, thank you, Madame Chair.

32
33 Good discussion. Great testimony. And
34 I look forward to voting on this.

35
36 Thank you.

37
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Charlie.

39
40 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Thank you, Sue.
41 I also support. I support because of cultural and
42 traditional connection. I know that living our way of
43 life is mental, physical, spiritual, cultural,
44 traditional, they're all -- it's all there. These
45 people are connected to that land and it's part of
46 their well-being. And like I said I think that's
47 really good thing to have the way the caribou are
48 going. I went to the caribou conference also with Don
49 and I learned that reindeer and caribou are in trouble
50

0223

1 all the way around the globe. So having that Red Sheep
2 Creek is important for the future in my mind.

3
4 So I support 100 percent.

5
6 Thank you.

7
8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: More
9 discussion.

10
11 MS. POPE: Madame Chair, this is Amanda
12 Pope.

13
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go ahead,
15 Amanda.

16
17 MS. POPE: Yes, thank you, Madame
18 Chair. For the record my name is Amanda Pope. I fully
19 support this because this is not only important to them
20 but hearing their testimonies and their frustration of
21 what they have to deal with is empowering and it helps
22 me as a Board member realize that the ancestral lands
23 to people around their area is very important and not
24 much folks in the Interior have that availability and I
25 wouldn't want people to lose that if they already have
26 it. If they have the availability to save the lands
27 then it should be done.

28
29 So I support this and I thank everyone
30 who took the time to speak to us today, I really
31 appreciate it.

32
33 Thank you.

34
35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: More
36 discussion.

37
38 (No comments)

39
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anyone.

41
42 (No comments)

43
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, I'm
45 going to reiterate that I think the government has to
46 work together. We've got two new -- a new Fish and
47 Game employee and a new Refuge Manager and I'd love to
48 see that type of work being done and working with the
49 people. And I'm going to support the closure at this
50

0224

1 time. So anyone else.

2

3 (No comments)

4

5 MR. WOODRUFF: I'll call for question.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. The
8 question has been called for. Roll call.

9

10 MS. MCDAVID: So the motion on the
11 floor is to retain the status quo, and that means to
12 keep the Arctic Village Sheep Management Area closed to
13 non-Federally-qualified subsistence users.

14

15 We'll start on the phone.

16

17 Andy Bassich.

18

19 (No comments)

20

21 REPORTER: Andy, are you voting, it's
22 your turn.

23

24 (No comments)

25

26 REPORTER: Andy, are you still on?

27

28 MR. BASSICH: I'm having a difficult
29 time unmuting. I am in support of the motion.

30

31 REPORTER: Thank you.

32

33 MS. MCDAVID: We got your yea vote,
34 thank you, Andy.

35

36 Online Amanda Pope.

37

38 MS. POPE: I support the closure.

39

40 MS. MCDAVID: Thank you.

41

42 In the room, Linda Evans.

43

44 MS. EVANS: Yes.

45

46 MS. MCDAVID: Charlie Jagow.

47

48 MR. JAGOW: Yes.

49

50

0225

1 MS. MCDAVID: Dorothy Shockley.

2

3 MS. SHOCKLEY: Yes.

4

5 MS. MCDAVID: Donald Woodruff.

6

7 MR. WOODRUFF: Yes.

8

9 MS. MCDAVID: Charlie Wright.

10

11 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yes.

12

13 MS. MCDAVID: Sue Entsminger.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.

16

17 MS. MCDAVID: Motion passes, eight to
18 zero.

19

20 (Applause)

21

22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Thank
23 you. It's been a long, long day, so -- but I'm still
24 being pressured by Staff that we may not make our 6:00
25 o'clock charter and Council members want to make the
26 charter.

27

28 MS. MCDAVID: We might make it now.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We might make
31 it now, okay.

32

33 (Laughter)

34

35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Well,
36 we're just going to plod along. All right, do.....

37

38 MS. MCDAVID: We're in a much better
39 spot now.

40

41 (Laughter)

42

43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, you're
44 not going to have a quorum otherwise.

45

46 MS. WESSELS: You're supposed to go for
47 another hour and 10 minutes, I'm not letting you out.

48

49 MS. MCDAVID: Oh, my Gosh.

50

0226

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: What.

2

3 MS. MCDAVID: Don't listen to her,
4 she's not the Coordinator anymore.

5

6 (Laughter)

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Yeah,
9 that's right. Good job Brooke.

10

11 (Laughter)

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. So is
14 there any need -- gang, to start earlier than 9:00.

15

16 MR. WOODRUFF: I don't mind.

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Give me a
19 time.

20

21 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: 6:30.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'd be there.

24

25 (Laughter)

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Do you want
28 to start at 8:00 or 8:30.

29

30 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: 9:30.

31

32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: 8:30. We want
33 to start tomorrow morning at 8:30. And we'll plunge
34 through -- plunge, plunge, okay.

35

36 MS. EVANS: How come not 8:00 o'clock.

37

38 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah, Linda says
39 how come not 8:00 o'clock.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Because you
42 said 8:30.

43

44 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: There you go.

45

46 (Laughter)

47

48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Would you
49 like 8:00 o'clock.

50

0227

1 (Laughter)

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Should we
4 have a vote?

5

6 (Laughter)

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All in favor
9 of 8:00.

10

11 MS. EVANS: Right here.

12

13 (Council members raise hand)

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All in favor
16 of 8:30.

17

18 (Council members raise hand)

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It's a tie,
21 it breaks.

22

23 (Laughter)

24

25 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: I didn't vote for
26 either.

27

28 (Laughter)

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, I missed
31 that.

32

33 MS. WESSELS: Break the tie Charlie.

34

35 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: 8:00 o'clock it
36 is.

37

38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I think --
39 8:00 o'clock it is. Okay.

40

41 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: That way we can
42 get through more of it.

43

44 MS. MCDAVID: But the thing is people
45 might not know to do public comment at 8:00 so we could
46 maybe do.....

47

48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We'll do some
49 other stuff, all right.

50

0228

1 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah.

2

3 MS. MCDAVID: Sounds good.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.
6 Okay. Stuff that we got to get through. There's a few
7 reports. And I hate to mention it but on our agenda
8 there's Board of Game proposals and you might think
9 about if there's any you wanted to take up.

10

11 MS. MCDAVID: Would anyone like the
12 list of Board of Game proposals to mull over this
13 evening.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It isn't
16 something we have to do but you can do.

17

18 ACTING CHAIR WRIGHT: Yeah.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So, okay, I
21 want you to think about it and five minutes before 8:00
22 I want to hear about it. Okay.

23

24 (Laughter)

25

26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We will
27 reconvene in the morning at 8:00. Thank you everyone
28 for your patience today.

29

30 (Off record)

31

32 (PROCEEDINGS TO BE CONTINUED)

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

0229

1 C E R T I F I C A T E

2

3 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)

4) ss.

5 STATE OF ALASKA)

6

7 I, Salena A. Hile, Notary Public in and for the
8 state of Alaska and reporter for Computer Matrix Court
9 Reporters, LLC, do hereby certify:

10

11 THAT the foregoing pages numbered 02 through
12 ____ contain a full, true and correct Transcript of the
13 EASTERN INTERIOR FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE REGIONAL ADVISORY
14 COUNCIL MEETING, VOLUME I taken electronically on the
15 4th day of October 2023;

16

17 THAT the transcript is a true and
18 correct transcript requested to be transcribed and
19 thereafter transcribed by under my direction and
20 reduced to print to the best of our knowledge and
21 ability;

22

23 THAT I am not an employee, attorney, or
24 party interested in any way in this action.

25

26 DATED at Anchorage, Alaska, this 28th
27 day of October 2023.

28

29

30

31 _____
32 Salena A. Hile
33 Notary Public, State of Alaska
34 My Commission Expires: 09/16/26

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50