

1 EASTERN INTERIOR FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE  
2 REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

3  
4 PUBLIC MEETING

5  
6 VOLUME II

7  
8  
9 Wedgewood Resort  
10 Fairbanks, Alaska  
11 November 20, 2013  
12 9:00 a.m.

13  
14  
15  
16 COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT:

17  
18 Sue Entsminger, Chair  
19 Lester Erhart  
20 Andrew Firmin  
21 William Glanz  
22 James Roberts - (Telephonic)  
23 Virgil Umphenour  
24 Larry Williams - (Telephonic)  
25 Donald Woodruff  
26  
27 Regional Council Coordinator, Eva Patton

28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38

39 Recorded and transcribed by:  
40  
41 Computer Matrix Court Reporters, LLC  
42 135 Christensen Drive, Suite 2  
43 Anchorage, AK 99501  
44 907-243-0668/sahile@gci.net

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50

P R O C E E D I N G S

(Fairbanks, Alaska - 11/20/2013)

(On record)

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: This is Sue, the Chair. I'm checking to see who is online. Can you identify yourself, please.

MR. LIEBICH: This is Trent Liebich with OSM in Anchorage. Palma Ingles is here as well. She stepped out of her office for a second.

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Thank you, Trent. Is there anyone else on?

(No comments)

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Has anyone called in? If you would \*6 your phone, you're muting it and then you \*6 to come back on. Can you please make sure you're live. If anyone else is out there besides Trent, I'm not hearing anyone.

(No comments)

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We're calling the meeting back to order. I see a lot of new faces out there and I was just going to have people go around the room again. First I'll just let everyone know each of us have our name in front of us and where we're from, the RAC Council. Yesterday we had James Roberts online. He hasn't called in yet and when I hear that -- is that you, James? Did you come online?

MR. SHARP: It's not James, sorry. Dan Sharp with BLM.

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Hi, Dan.

MR. SHARP: Good morning.

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We're just starting. Starting over here, could you just say your name, please.

MR. MCKENNA: Good morning. I'm Brian McKenna, fisheries department Tanana Chiefs Conference.

1 MS. YUHAS: Jennifer Yuhas, Alaska  
2 Department of Fish and Game.  
3  
4 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Can you just go  
5 across like this. Pippa, you're next.  
6  
7 MS. KENNER: Pippa Kenner, OSM Anchorage.  
8  
9 MR. BROWN: Randy Brown, fisheries, with  
10 Fish and Wildlife Service here in Fairbanks.  
11  
12 MR. GLASPELL: Brian Glaspell, refuge  
13 manager at Arctic Refuge.  
14  
15 MR. HAWKALUK: Nathan Hawkaluk, deputy  
16 refuge manager at Yukon Flats.  
17  
18 MR. MATHEWS: Vince Mathews, subsistence  
19 coordinator for Arctic, Kanuti and Yukon Flats.  
20  
21 MR. MASCHMANN: Gerald Maschmann with  
22 fisheries here in Fairbanks.  
23  
24 MR. MEARS: Jeremy Mears, Fish and  
25 Wildlife Service, Fairbanks.  
26  
27 MR. CAIKOSKI: Hi, I'm Jason Caikoski,  
28 wildlife biologist for Alaska Department of Fish and  
29 Game.  
30  
31 MS. LENART: Beth Lenart, Alaska  
32 Department of Fish and Game, wildlife biologist.  
33  
34 MS. LANGAS MILLER: Maribel Langas  
35 Miller, acting for the Tetlin National Wildlife refuge  
36 manager, from Virginia.  
37  
38 MR. PELTOLA: I'm Gene Peltola, Jr.,  
39 assistant regional director, Office of Subsistence  
40 Management.  
41  
42 DR. JENKINS: Good morning. David  
43 Jenkins with OSM.  
44  
45 MR. ESTENSEN: Madame Chair. Jeff  
46 Estensen with the Alaska Department of Fish and Game.  
47  
48 MR. MCKEE: Chris McKee, biologist with  
49 OSM.  
50

1 MR. MARACLE: Bryan Maracle with CATG.  
2  
3 MR. TWITCHELL: Hollis Twitchell,  
4 assistant manager of Arctic Refuge.  
5  
6 MS. HERBERT: Darlene Herbert. I'm a  
7 Gwichyaa Gwich'in from Fort Yukon and I'm one of the  
8 people that owns land up here in Yukon Flats.  
9  
10 MR. MATESI: Joe Matesi. I'm just a  
11 person.  
12  
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Like the rest  
14 of us, Joe.  
15  
16 MS. CELLARIUS: I'm Barbara Cellarius.  
17 I'm the subsistence coordinator for Wrangell-St. Elias  
18 National Park and Preserve out of Copper Center.  
19  
20 MR. JAMIESON: Sandy Jamieson. I'm from  
21 Fairbanks and I'm a guide in the Arctic Refuge.  
22  
23 MR. BUE: Fred Bue, Fish and Wildlife  
24 Service, Yukon River fisheries.  
25  
26 MS. MONCRIEFF: Catherine Moncrieff,  
27 Yukon River Fisheries Drainage Association.  
28  
29 MR. SWEETSIR: Kirk Sweetsir, Yukon Air  
30 Service.  
31  
32 MR. PEARSON: Glen Pearson, Yukon Flats  
33 (indiscernible).  
34  
35 MR. MAUER: Fran Mauer, public at large.  
36  
37 MR. NEWLAND: Eric Newland, Alaska  
38 Department of Fish and Game, Yukon area summer season  
39 manger.  
40  
41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Could you  
42 introduce yourself right here.  
43  
44 MS. JAMES: I'm Sarah James. I'm from  
45 Arctic Village. I'm a Native Village of Venetie Tribal  
46 Council member. I live in Arctic Village and I'm a  
47 chairperson of the Gwich'in Steering Committee.  
48  
49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.  
50 Thank you, everyone, and welcome. Where we are on the

1 agenda is Proposal 48. We have deferred these two  
2 proposals for this morning so other people could be here  
3 due to a funeral potlatch that was in town yesterday and  
4 we would like to -- okay, you can introduce the proposal,  
5 but I was also asked for another report from the State  
6 biologist. I was thinking we'd give that report. You  
7 can stay there. So, Jason, would you like to give that  
8 or whoever is giving that report.

9

10 MR. SAM: Is anybody there?

11

12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes, we're  
13 here. Who is this? Did someone just call in?

14

15 MR. SAM: Yes, ma'am. Edward Sam, Arctic  
16 Village. I'd like to testify today.

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, Edward.  
19 Good morning. This is Sue. How are you?

20

21 MR. SAM: Madame Chair.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's right.  
24 How are you?

25

26 MR. SAM: Okay. I was going to call a  
27 couple days ago, but I didn't get through.

28

29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. So this  
30 morning we started our meeting and we're going on  
31 Proposal 48. I don't know if you have anything in front  
32 of you, but that is the moose proposal and then the sheep  
33 proposal will be next, so this one could take a while  
34 just to let you know.

35

36 MR. SAM: Okay. Madame Chair, I just  
37 heard this Regional Advisory Board meeting was yesterday  
38 and in the release it said October 31, but I was given  
39 only 18 hours notice, but I'll try to do my best to  
40 protect the sheep in my area.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So you're  
43 interested in the Proposal 51, which is Red Sheep Creek  
44 and Cane Creek and you want to testify?

45

46 MR. SAM: Yes, ma'am.

47

48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We'll sign you  
49 up. Okay.

50

1 MR. SAM: Yes, ma'am.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
4 We're setting up a projector right now and it took some  
5 time, so we'll soon be starting.

6

7 MR. SAM: Okay. I'll be listening.

8

9 MR. MCKEE: Good morning. My name is  
10 Chris McKee with OSM. Proposal WP14-48 begins on Page  
11 124 of your meeting booklet. It was submitted by Joe  
12 Matesi and requests that a portion of Federal lands in  
13 Unit 25A be closed to the taking of moose except by rural  
14 residents of Arctic Village, Venetie, Chalkyitsik, and  
15 Fort Yukon with a Federal registration permit, and that  
16 a harvest quota be established for that portion of the  
17 unit.

18

19 The proponent states that moose  
20 populations in Unit 25A have declined significantly over  
21 the last 22 years and have yet to recover from these  
22 declines. Additionally, it is stated that the migratory  
23 population of moose move into the unit during the fall  
24 hunting season and are more vulnerable to harvest due to  
25 the low shrub cover and open tundra present in the area,  
26 along with the fact that migratory routes are well  
27 defined and have resulted in high hunter success. The  
28 proponent feels that a reduction in hunting pressure is  
29 needed to conserve the moose population and aid in  
30 recovery.

31

32 Periodic surveys suggested that moose  
33 numbers in Unit 25A declined in the area from the late  
34 1980s through the early 2000s. Surveys along the Sheenjek  
35 and Coleen Rivers within Unit 25A have been done  
36 sporadically since 1977. Both drainages have seen  
37 declines in moose populations since 1991, and you can see  
38 these survey results on Table 1 Page 140, though the  
39 population in the Sheenjek River appears to have  
40 stabilized at a low level since 2000.

41

42 Composition surveys on the Coleen and  
43 Sheenjek River drainages in 1991, 2000, and 2002 showed  
44 an average bull:cow ratio of .87 on the Coleen River and  
45 1.9 on the Sheenjek. The  
46 most recent survey along the Sheenjek River showed a  
47 calf:cow and bull:cow ratio of 0.38 and 1.23  
48 respectively, while a recent survey on the Coleen River  
49 had a calf:cow and bull:cow ratio of 0.38 and 1.09  
50 respectively.

1 Moose habitat in Unit 25A is limited to  
2 narrow corridors which support a low density population  
3 of moose. Harvest is low due to the remoteness of the  
4 area and the time, distance, and expense of accessing  
5 hunting grounds. Population dynamics of the area are  
6 poorly understood but predation may be serving to  
7 maintain moose populations at a low density. The moose  
8 in the Coleen and Sheenjek River drainages are thought to  
9 be part of a larger meta-population that includes animals  
10 in the Firth, Mancha, and Kongakut River drainages of  
11 Unit 26 and the most recent available surveys for these  
12 areas has shown an increase in moose numbers.

13  
14 A study of moose movements and population  
15 identity in the southeastern Brooks Range from 1995 to  
16 1998 indicated a population with a high proportion of  
17 migratory animals. A majority of migrants moved to the  
18 Old Crow Flats region in the Yukon Territory of Canada  
19 beginning in March, where they calved  
20 and spent the summer. These moose then moved to winter  
21 ranges in the upper Sheenjek and Coleen River drainages  
22 of Unit 25A in late August, with the migration completed  
23 by the rut in early October.

24  
25 An additional study was conducted in  
26 2007-2009 using satellite collars to track individual  
27 moose movements at finer temporal and spatial scales.  
28 Data analysis is not yet complete, but preliminary  
29 results corroborate the seasonal movements identified in  
30 an early study along with high fidelity to wintering and  
31 rutting areas and straight line migration routes to and  
32 from winter and summer areas in Alaska and Canada, making  
33 them highly susceptible to harvest.

34  
35 An average of nine moose have been  
36 harvested per year on the upper Sheenjek River and 12  
37 moose per year on the Coleen and Old Crow River drainages  
38 over the last two decades. Hunter success has declined  
39 in both areas over the last 20 years. However, decreased  
40 hunter success might be due to larger number of hunters  
41 in the field rather than an actual decline in the number  
42 of legal animals for harvest. Indeed, bull:cow ratios  
43 indicate a surplus of bulls available for harvest in both  
44 the Coleen and Sheenjek.

45  
46 Between 1983 and 2010, the majority of  
47 moose harvested in the Sheenjek, Coleen and Old Crow  
48 drainages of Unit 25 has  
49 been by nonresident hunters. That's Figure 5 on Page  
50 139. Of the communities with a customary and traditional

1 use determination for moose in Unit 25A, only Fort Yukon  
2 reported any harvest in the drainages in question with a  
3 total of 61 moose  
4 being harvested between 1983 and 2010 and an average of  
5 2 moose harvested per year.

6  
7 If this proposal is adopted, it would  
8 have a minimal impact on Federally qualified users as  
9 historical harvest by local users has been low. This  
10 proposal would implement a Federal registration permit  
11 which would allow managers to better monitor and manage  
12 the hunt on this small migratory moose population.  
13 Non-local hunters including guides would be eliminated  
14 through closure of Federal lands to moose hunting except  
15 by residents of Units 25A and 25D.

16  
17 Commercial guiding for moose would be  
18 eliminated by the closure but might benefit in the  
19 long-term if the moose population is built up as a result  
20 of the closure to non-residents. Since the Federal moose  
21 season opens almost two weeks prior to the State season,  
22 it is unlikely that non-local resident hunting has been  
23 impacting Federally qualified  
24 subsistence users.

25  
26 The proposal would also designate a  
27 portion of Unit 25A open to moose hunting to Federally  
28 qualified subsistence users only. This would result in a  
29 boundary change and designation of the  
30 remaining portions of the unit as Unit 25A remainder.

31  
32 As I mentioned, moose populations on the  
33 Sheenjek and Coleen Rivers in Unit 25A have experienced  
34 declines over the last 20 years, but seem to be at a low  
35 but stable level for the past 10 years. Again, the moose  
36 are a migratory population moving between Alaska and  
37 Canada, certainly making them more highly susceptible to  
38 harvest. However, composition surveys show that there is  
39 a surplus of bulls for harvest, so hunting is unlikely to  
40 be a limiting factor to population growth. Hunter  
41 success has declined in both drainages and guided hunting  
42 has remained low, while the majority of successful  
43 hunters have been nonresidents.

44  
45 The current earlier Federal season should  
46 help to minimize any potential impact on local hunters by  
47 non-local and nonresident hunters. Moose habitat in the  
48 area is limited and predation may be serving to maintain  
49 moose numbers at low densities. Again, the moose found  
50 on the Coleen and Sheenjek River drainages are thought to

1 be part of a larger population of moose in Unit 26 and  
2 surveys there have shown increased numbers of moose.

3  
4 Management of the species should be based  
5 on these biological realities rather than by management  
6 units. More data on moose numbers in the affected areas  
7 is needed prior to managers moving forward with a hunting  
8 closure as requested by the proponent.

9  
10 So the OSM preliminary conclusion is to  
11 oppose WP14-48. That's the end of my presentation.

12  
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
14 Council members, would you like to ask questions now or  
15 hear the other report.

16  
17 MR. GLANZ: Let's hear the other report,  
18 Madame Chair.

19  
20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Are we  
21 ready?

22  
23 MR. CAIKOSKI: We're ready.

24  
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
26 Introduce yourself.

27  
28 MR. CAIKOSKI: So I guess for the record  
29 my name is Jason Caikoski. I'm a wildlife biologist for  
30 the Alaska Department of Fish and Game. I prepared a  
31 presentation regarding moose in eastern Unit 25A  
32 specifically addressing Wildlife Proposal 48.

33  
34 I guess to start off the State strongly  
35 opposes this proposal. It would close 7,350 square miles  
36 to non-Federally qualified subsistence users. It would  
37 result in a significant loss of moose hunting opportunity  
38 both by State general season hunters and by subsistence  
39 hunters defined by the State. Furthermore, the State  
40 contends there's absolutely no biological justification  
41 for the closure.

42  
43 I guess at this point I'll just mention  
44 that I have reviewed the analysis and recommendations by  
45 the Office of Subsistence Management and agree with their  
46 conclusion. They also oppose this proposal. I generally  
47 agree with most of the content of their analysis as well.

48  
49 I know you guys have heard a lot about --  
50 seen a lot of presentations over the last years about

1 moose in Eastern 25A. I apologize if I'm repeating  
2 things in presentations that you've heard, but hopefully  
3 I'll be able to provide some additional information so  
4 that you guys can make an informed decision about this  
5 proposal.

6  
7                   On the screen I have a map of Unit 25A.  
8 The orange hash area would be the area affected by  
9 Proposal 48. Again, it's 7,350 square miles. It  
10 includes all of the Coleen River drainage, the Old Crow  
11 drainage and the Sheenjek drainage upstream from and  
12 including Monument Creek. Those black squiggly PolyDoms  
13 at the headwaters of the Coleen and the Sheenjek are  
14 trend count survey areas that have been conducted  
15 sporadically.

16  
17                   So this is where that survey data is  
18 coming from that's in the OSM reports that's presented by  
19 the author of the proposal. That is how those survey  
20 trend count areas lay on the land. It's important to  
21 note that they represent a very small proportion of the  
22 proposal area, less than 10 percent. They only occur at  
23 the headwaters of those two drainages.

24  
25                   Moose hunting occurs throughout the  
26 orange hashed area, primarily along the river corridors  
27 and maybe some of the larger drains that dump into those.  
28 Hunting occurs both inside those trend count areas and  
29 outside the trend count areas.

30  
31                   So Unit 25A as a whole, nowhere in Unit  
32 25A has a survey ever been conducted to estimate  
33 abundance. That is a survey designed to tell us how many  
34 moose there are in a given area to determine, let's say,  
35 density. We do have these trend count survey areas that  
36 have been occasionally conducted and those data have been  
37 presented in multiple documents. The proposal itself,  
38 OSM's analysis. I'm going to talk a little bit about  
39 that data here.

40  
41                   So this is what the data looks like. The  
42 blue diamonds are the number of moose observed in the  
43 Coleen. The red squares are the number of moose observed  
44 in the Sheenjek. As you can see, there's been a decline  
45 in the number of moose observed in the last 20 years  
46 compared to the late '70s and '80s. We don't know why  
47 this decline has occurred or whether there's actually a  
48 decline in moose in Eastern Unit 25A. Nevertheless,  
49 we've observed fewer moose in the last 20 years than in  
50 the '70s and late '80s.

1 I will note that I got an arrow with  
2 incomplete survey pointed at that 2012 blue diamond.  
3 ADF&G conducted that survey. Weather constraints caused  
4 us to not complete that survey. We surveyed most of the  
5 area. We likely missed some moose. I do not think we  
6 missed a significant number of moose, so I would not  
7 expect that blue diamond to be up around 200 like it was  
8 in the '70s had we completed the survey. We may have  
9 observed a few more moose, but it certainly wouldn't have  
10 been the same number observed in the '70s.

11  
12 What is actually far more useful,  
13 especially with respect to this proposal, it's not the  
14 actual number of moose we observe, it's the ratio data  
15 within the observed population because that gives us some  
16 idea as to if a decline is occurring, why is that  
17 occurring and is hunting and the harvest of bull moose  
18 affecting fewer number of moose observed in the Sheenjek  
19 and the Coleen.

20  
21 So when we look at demographics, we're  
22 talking about different age and sex classes in the  
23 population, bull:cow ratios, calf:cow ratios, yearling  
24 bull ratios. That gives us an index of recruitment of  
25 calves into the yearling age class. So those red squares  
26 is the bull:cow ratio. The blue diamonds is the calf:cow  
27 ratio and the yearling bulls are the green triangles.

28  
29 So if we look at bull:cow ratio, that has  
30 remained extremely high, greater than 80, hovering around  
31 one. That is an extremely high bull:cow ratio. If  
32 hunting of bull moose were affecting this population,  
33 we'd expect to see a decline in the bull:cow ratio. We  
34 don't see bull:cow ratios at these levels really anywhere  
35 in the state unless those populations are slightly hunted  
36 or non-hunted.

37  
38 Calf:cow ratios, I wouldn't consider them  
39 exceptionally high nor low. They're kind of average  
40 within the range of what we see in Alaska. Yearling  
41 bulls are kind of all over the place. That 1991 number  
42 and 2000 number, those are pretty good yearling bull:cow  
43 ratios indicating high survival of calves into the  
44 yearling age class. The variability may just be a  
45 product of sample size. The 2002 numbers on the low side  
46 again. Those yearling bull:cow ratios are likely  
47 bouncing around more because of variability associated  
48 with small sample size rather than some biological  
49 function.

50

1                   So the question is if we have a bull  
2 moose only hunt and the population observed in those  
3 trend count areas has declined, is it a result of  
4 hunting. Well, the bull:cow ratio hasn't declined and  
5 that's the only segment of the population in which  
6 additional mortality could occur. So what we'd expect to  
7 see is a reduction in the number of moose across all age  
8 and sex classes.

9  
10                   This next slide will better illustrate  
11 that point. It's the same survey data. It's the number  
12 of moose observed except it's broken down by bulls, cows,  
13 calves and, again, yearling bulls. As you can see --  
14 well, I'll go through the different shapes on the figure.  
15 Bulls are red squares, the circles are cows, the blue  
16 squares are calves and yearling bulls are again the  
17 diamonds.

18  
19                   So, as you can see across all age and sex  
20 classes, there's been roughly the same rate of decline  
21 between survey years and across survey years. Bulls and  
22 cows have declined at roughly the same rate, yet we only  
23 have a bull only hunt. So the question is why are cows  
24 declining at the same rate of bulls when cows aren't  
25 subjected to the additional mortality as a result of  
26 hunting. This pattern through these surveys fits really  
27 nicely with classic moose population dynamics.

28  
29                   As the number of cows decline, there's  
30 less cows on the landscape. When there's less cows on  
31 the landscape, they produce fewer calves. When you have  
32 fewer calves on the landscape, then there's less calves  
33 to be recruited into the yearling age class. As you can  
34 see, cows and bulls have declined. So have calves and so  
35 have yearling bulls. This fits very well with classic  
36 moose population dynamics where survival potentially of  
37 all age classes has occurred uniformly. It's not  
38 indicative of any hunting effect.

39  
40                   Switching over to harvest, I combined the  
41 Sheenjok and the Coleen for the Sheenjok just upstream  
42 and including Monument Creek into a single figure. It's  
43 the area of the proposal. The number of hunters has  
44 bounced around over the last 20 years between the low  
45 20's and the high 60's. If you throw a trend line  
46 through that data, it's going to be a slight increasing  
47 trend in the number of hunters across 20 years. If you  
48 throw a trend line through that data let's say over the  
49 past 10 years, it would be a decreasing trend in the  
50 number of hunters. So trend is obviously a product of

1 the actual data and the time period specified. So that's  
2 what the data looks like.

3  
4 I'll let you guys kind of determine, you  
5 know, what trend you want to use, whether you want to use  
6 more current data or the full suite of data. Harvest, on  
7 the other hand, has basically remained constant  
8 throughout the period. It's bounced around between 10  
9 and 25 moose in all years except for '90 and '91. It was  
10 a little higher. You throw a trend line through those  
11 data, it's flat. Very close to a slope of zero. It  
12 averages out at 19 moose per year. In fact, that's  
13 really close to what the current harvest is, is 19 moose  
14 per year.

15  
16 So in other areas of the state where we  
17 do have estimates of abundance, that is we designed a  
18 survey to determine how many moose are in a certain area,  
19 we can then take that number, divide it into the survey  
20 area, come up with density and you can present those data  
21 in either way. The total number of moose in the survey  
22 area or the density.

23  
24 At any rate, when we have abundance, what  
25 we can do is calculate harvestable surplus rates and  
26 those harvestable surplus rates in general hover around  
27 5 percent. That would be for a population with a  
28 relatively good bull:cow ratio. Let's say anything over  
29 30 bulls per 100. The harvest rate may warrant  
30 adjustment downward or upward if bull:cow ratios are  
31 lower or higher, but in general they hover around 5  
32 percent. So, for example, if you had a moose population  
33 of 1,000 moose with 30 bulls per 100 cows, we would  
34 expect to sustainably be able to harvest 50 bulls per  
35 year.

36  
37 The problem is we don't have estimates of  
38 abundance for Unit 25A, so we can't perform those  
39 calculations. One thing we can do is we can flip those  
40 calculations on their head and do them in reverse and try  
41 to come up with a theoretical population that would be  
42 required to support the current harvest. So this in no  
43 way is estimating how many moose are on the landscape.

44  
45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Someone out  
46 there needs to push \*6 and mute your mic because there's  
47 a lot of background noise. Thanks.

48  
49 MR. CAIKOSKI: So, at any rate, we can  
50 flip those calculations on their head and come up with

1 theoretical population sizes that would be required to  
2 support the current harvest. So, again, I want to make  
3 clear this is not estimating how many moose there are on  
4 the landscape. This is just a tool we can use to  
5 determine is it reasonable that we have adequate number  
6 of moose to support the current harvest.

7

8                   So that's all I've done on this slide.  
9 I took the 22-year average harvest of 19 bull moose. The  
10 22-year average and the current harvest are close to each  
11 other, so I use them interchangeably. If you divide that  
12 by the harvest rate, you get 380 moose. If you take 380  
13 moose, divide it by the proposal area, you get a density  
14 of .05 moose per square mile. So the question becomes  
15 are those numbers reasonable for the area that we're  
16 talking given the habitat, given what we know about  
17 moose, given bull:cow ratios, et cetera.

18

19                   To give you an idea of what a density of  
20 .05 moose per square mile, that's in the neighborhood of  
21 four to six times fewer moose than in Yukon Flats. I'm  
22 not comparing that the habitat is the same in Yukon Flats  
23 or the Coleen or the Sheenjek. It's just .05 moose per  
24 square mile is an extremely low density. We rarely see  
25 densities of that nature that they're that low and it's  
26 extremely unlikely that there are fewer than 380 moose or  
27 a density of .05 moose per square mile. So it's highly  
28 unlikely that there's not adequate moose to support the  
29 hunt and, in fact, the ratio data supports that.

30

31                   You guys have heard a lot about collared  
32 moose, migratory, non-migratory moose. I'm not going to  
33 go into that data in length, but I'd like to make a  
34 couple of points. Eastern 25A has a migratory/non-  
35 migratory component and this is not unique. It turns out  
36 that most populations have both resident and some  
37 migratory component and it turns out that researchers  
38 have collared more and more moose with GPS collars. The  
39 rarities are actually resident only populations. It's  
40 far more common to have migratory components or entirely  
41 migratory -- or the moose are entirely migratory and  
42 that's just the life history strategy that they use  
43 between calving summer range and winter range.

44

45                   I've got locations up on the map of their  
46 winter locations by two studies. One study was conducted  
47 by Fran Mauer. He's in the audience. Now retired. At  
48 the time, he was a biologist with Arctic National  
49 Wildlife Refuge. Those winter locations from that  
50 project are depicted by the green diamonds. The blue

1 diamonds is a more recent study conducted in late 2000s  
2 by Dorothy Cooley and some colleagues with Yukon  
3 Department of Environment. Those moose were collared in  
4 Old Crow Flats. Again, those are winter locations only  
5 for those moose.

6  
7 I'd like to point out that there would be  
8 additional winter locations on this map I didn't display.  
9 I kept the locations to the proposal area. There would  
10 be locations in the Kongakut, the Firth, Mancha. There  
11 would be locations in the hills north of Old Crow Flats  
12 and the hills south of Old Crow Flats and east of Old  
13 Crow Flats.

14  
15 I guess the primary point that I'd like  
16 to make about these locations is that a significant  
17 number of them occur outside the survey area, so it's  
18 clear that those trend count survey areas aren't  
19 capturing the entire population, capturing demographics,  
20 capturing in total numbers that we see. It also shows  
21 that moose are distributed throughout the area.

22  
23 I want to talk a little bit about  
24 distribution of hunters. Recently the Council of  
25 Athabascan Tribal Governments in cooperation with  
26 Division of Subsistence with the Alaska Department of  
27 Fish and Game conducted household surveys of land mammals  
28 by communities in Yukon Flats. This figure up here is  
29 scanned from that document. It's a technical report. If  
30 you guys would like to see that, I can get you copies.

31  
32 This is where moose are harvested by  
33 residents of Yukon Flats. It's not a census of every  
34 hunter in the Yukon Flats. These are estimates, but it  
35 gives us a pretty good idea of where moose hunting occurs  
36 by residents and it's not a big surprise along the Yukon  
37 River corridor, Porcupine River, Christian, Black,  
38 Chandalar in the case of both Fort Yukon and Venetie.

39  
40 If we look at the next year's data, very  
41 similar pattern. Harvest concentrated along the Yukon  
42 River, Porcupine, Black, Christian, Chandalar. You can  
43 see some harvest does occur in that lower Coleen. In  
44 general, throughout my tenure there's been very little  
45 conflict between local users and moose hunters in the  
46 majority of the proposal area. That's not to say that no  
47 conflict doesn't exist and that's not to say that this  
48 captures every moose hunter in Yukon Flats, but in  
49 general those two user groups overlap.

50

1                   One thing that's on my radar is if that  
2 area of Proposal 48, if that proposal passes, where are  
3 those hunters going to go. Typically when we close large  
4 areas to moose hunting, those hunters are displaced. If  
5 they're accustomed to hunting in this region, it's going  
6 to -- you know, potentially there's going to be more  
7 hunting on the Porcupine, float hunters on the Porcupine.  
8 I had a call the other day from someone who had a planned  
9 hunt up there. He heard about this proposal. He said,  
10 well, can I still hunt caribou there and then float down  
11 the Porcupine and hunt moose. Yeah, legally you can  
12 still do that.

13  
14                   We have no data to know where these  
15 displaced hunters are going to go, but one possibility is  
16 an increase in the number of hunters in the area that  
17 local hunters are currently using and whether there's an  
18 increase in harvest, whether there's even an increase in  
19 hunters, we don't know what effect that would have on  
20 moose. But that's on my radar when you close a large  
21 chunk of adjacent public land to hunting.

22  
23                   That more or less concludes my  
24 presentation. I guess a couple final remarks. The data  
25 is pretty clear that moose hunting and the harvest of  
26 bull moose has not played any role in the decline in the  
27 moose we're observing in those trend count areas. That's  
28 not to say that a decline hasn't occurred. We don't know  
29 what magnitude or extent. The most likely causes are a  
30 decrease in survival across all age classes, particularly  
31 cows. They're the reproductive component of the  
32 population.

33  
34                   If cow survival is decreased, that's like  
35 the result of habitat and predation issues or some  
36 combination of both. It could be that there are way too  
37 many moose for the habitat in both that upper Sheenjek  
38 and Coleen in the '70s and that the number of moose we're  
39 observing now is actually a number that the habitat can  
40 support on more of a long term.

41  
42                   There's one other possibility and that's  
43 moose just aren't -- there hasn't been a decrease in  
44 survival across eight classes. Rather those moose are  
45 just using different areas, so they're not in those trend  
46 count survey areas like they used to be. They could have  
47 moved south or east or west.

48  
49                   You know, peer review is a big part of  
50 science, whether that's through the publication process

1 or whether that's sharing data with colleagues and  
2 friends and bouncing ideas. I presented all of this data  
3 to all the moose biologists, my colleagues at Fish and  
4 Game, and with Federal counterparts and all of us have  
5 come to the same conclusion regarding, you know, what  
6 factors may be influencing this moose population and it's  
7 clear to us that hunting hasn't played a role.

8

9 With that, I'll answer any questions you  
10 guys may have regarding information I presented or  
11 something that I didn't. Thanks.

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thanks, Jason.  
14 Okay. We have two people with two reports and you guys  
15 can question either one. Any questions.

16

17 MR. WOODRUFF: I have a question.

18

19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Donald. You  
20 need your mic back.

21

22 MR. WILLIAMS: Yeah, Madame Chair. Larry  
23 Williams.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm sorry, who  
26 is this?

27

28 MS. PATTON: Larry Williams. He's  
29 online.

30

31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hi, Larry.  
32 Welcome. When did you come on?

33

34 MR. WILLIAMS: Good morning. Good  
35 morning, Madame Chair. This is Larry Williams and I've  
36 been listening in on the report. As you probably know,  
37 it's pretty hard on people listening in to see what kind  
38 of, you know, findings that they have on the graphics and  
39 all that. I would respectfully ask the presenters to  
40 please speak up.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Was the last  
43 presenter hard to hear?

44

45 MR. WILLIAMS: Well, I know for me.  
46 Maybe I m just getting old, which it was pretty hard for  
47 me to hear.

48

49 (Laughter)

50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I  
2 understand that actually. Okay. Do you have any  
3 questions, Larry.

4  
5 MR. WILLIAMS: Yeah. Jason, how long  
6 have you been doing this survey? I was just wondering  
7 how long they've been having -- you've been doing the  
8 survey. They must have been doing this for a little  
9 while, at least a year, to do a report like that. Can  
10 you give me a timeline of how long you've been doing  
11 this.

12  
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You're asking  
14 the Department how long they've been doing surveys?

15  
16 MR. WILLIAMS: Yes, ma'am, that's  
17 basically what I'm asking.

18  
19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'll let them  
20 address that. We actually did hear it, but for your  
21 information it would be great to hear it again. Go  
22 ahead.

23  
24 MR. CAIKOSKI: Larry, the first thing I  
25 want to make clear is the Department of Fish and Game is  
26 not the one that's responsible for conducting all those  
27 surveys. They've been done by both Fish and Wildlife  
28 Service and Alaska Department of Fish and Game. They've  
29 been done sporadically since the '70s. There's long  
30 stretches between surveys where we have no available  
31 data, but from the late '70s sporadically until 2012.

32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Jason, you're  
34 going to need to pull that mic right up to yourself. I  
35 think that's why you're kind of hard to hear. Larry, do  
36 you have any other questions or could you hear him?

37  
38 MR. WILLIAMS: No, I'm sorry. Since this  
39 is such an important question for the people of the Upper  
40 Yukon area, which we represent -- I represent, I think  
41 this should be addressed in a different meeting where  
42 everybody is physically presented instead of on a  
43 teleconference. But, like I say, I don't know if that  
44 can be arranged. It's just something that I feel very  
45 strongly about and I'd like to hear more facts and  
46 figures and I'd like to hear the people present the other  
47 side of the coin who supports this proposal.

48  
49 I have another doctor's appointment sorry  
50 to say at 10:30 and I have to get off the phone here for

1 a little bit. As I said, I m very interested in this and  
2 see how it comes out. I'm not going to say whether I can  
3 support this proposal or not. Like I said, it's  
4 something that's very important to the people in Yukon  
5 Flats.

6  
7 I know I'm repeating myself, but we have  
8 to remember Yukon Flats -- as a general rule, all the way  
9 down from Eagle -- all the way down from Circle all the  
10 way down to Eagle and Stevens Village limited to  
11 restricted times. We have to remember that. We will at  
12 least -- we're going to chaos. Might as well make it a  
13 controlled slide into chaos. That's what I have to say.  
14 Probably Council members here about having this at a  
15 different time.

16  
17 Thank you.

18  
19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, yes.  
20 Larry, where we are on the agenda, we just took the  
21 report, the introduction of the proposal of the analysis  
22 and ADF&G report. So we are now going to go into -- the  
23 Council here, if any of them -- does anyone else have a  
24 question of these two reports.

25  
26 Council members.

27  
28 Don.

29  
30 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame Chair.  
31 I have a question for Fish and Game. The surveys that  
32 you've been doing off and on, are they consistent  
33 throughout the month of survey? In other words, do you  
34 make the survey every November or every March or how does  
35 that work so that you're getting consistent counts of the  
36 same demographics and same moose?

37  
38 Thank you.

39  
40 MR. CAIKOSKI: Member Donald Woodruff  
41 through the Chair. The surveys are always conducted in  
42 the fall within a reasonably close -- you know, they're  
43 not conducted on the exact same days in the fall every  
44 year. They're conducted generally in October or  
45 November. Could there be moose movement issues if we did  
46 a survey in October in one year and let's say late  
47 October in one year and then early November in another  
48 year, could that affect, let's say, the proportion of  
49 bulls. It could have some effect, but across all years  
50 we've had surveys that have occurred throughout those

1 entire time periods. When you look at the data as a  
2 whole, it's very unlikely that survey timing would result  
3 in any errors or biases in the ratio data that we're  
4 observing.

5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Is everyone  
7 able to hear him?

8  
9 (Council nods affirmatively)

10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Any  
12 other questions, Council members.

13  
14 (No comments)

15  
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We have a  
17 procedure for the audience out there that we have to go  
18 through and the first is the introduction and then we go  
19 through agency comments before we get to the public  
20 testimony. Bear with me out there. That's the way this  
21 has to be done. If you have any comments, bring them up  
22 at your public testimony.

23  
24 Next on the agenda, if there's no other  
25 questions of the Council members, is ADF&G's comments.  
26 Is there more comments?

27  
28 MS. YUHAS: (Shakes head negatively)

29  
30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. That is  
31 done. Next is Federal agencies. Are there any comments  
32 of our Federal agencies?

33  
34 (No comments)

35  
36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Next is Native,  
37 tribal, village or other. I know that you guys have all  
38 signed up blue cards and I guess we can take that up  
39 under -- are you individuals?

40  
41 MS. PATTON: Bryan Maracle is presenting  
42 CATG.

43  
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Bryan --  
45 yeah, some of this is going to come under public  
46 testimony and some is coming under your groups, your  
47 Native groups. So you're coming up for TACG [sic]?

48  
49 MS. PATTON: CATG.

50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Sorry.  
2 As he's setting up, it's looking like we might have six  
3 or seven public testimony. If you haven't signed up and  
4 you do want to testify, we need to have one of these.  
5 There's blue cards in the back. You need to fill it out  
6 and bring it up to Eva here, our coordinator.  
7  
8 MR. JAMES: This is Gideon. I live in  
9 Arctic Village. Are you asking somebody else to testify?  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Gideon, did you  
12 just come on?  
13  
14 MR. JAMES: No, I've been on for about 15  
15 minutes.  
16  
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Are you  
18 wanting to testify to what proposal? I will let you know  
19 when public testimony comes up and we'll sign you up.  
20  
21 MR. JAMES: I don't know how many people  
22 are in front of me, but I'd like to testify on the  
23 management and oversight.  
24  
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We have two  
26 proposals in front of us. One is on moose in 25A and the  
27 other one is 51, the Red Sheep and Cane Creek proposal.  
28 Did you want to testify for one or both of those?  
29  
30 MR. JAMES: Yes, one of my concerns is  
31 the Red Sheep. Also.....  
32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So 51 is.....  
34  
35 MR. JAMES: .....I'm from Arctic Village  
36 and I was going to support the moose management and stuff  
37 like that in the area. And also.....  
38  
39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We're  
40 going to sign you up that you'll testify then.  
41  
42 MR. JAMES: Okay.  
43  
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
45 Thank you. We're getting more and more people who want  
46 to testify, so in an effort to keep the meeting rolling  
47 we're going to limit to five minutes for testimony and  
48 we'll probably be pretty sharp on that, so I apologize  
49 for that.  
50

1 Are you ready?

2

3 MR. MARACLE: Yes.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Go

6 ahead.

7

8 MR. MARACLE: Hello, Madame Chair. My  
9 name is Bryan Maracle and due to my services as natural  
10 resource director at CATG I've been asked to speak on  
11 behalf of the organization.

12

13 As a tribal organization in service of 10  
14 tribal communities, CATG is concerned about the declining  
15 moose populations in the Upper Sheenjek and Coleen. The  
16 migratory moose population that inhabits the Upper  
17 Sheenjek and Upper Coleen are a well-known resource to  
18 the Gwich'in people of both the American side and  
19 Canadian side in Old Crow Flats.

20

21 Among local people, over the last 20  
22 years it's common knowledge that this population has been  
23 declining. Because of this decline hunters have not  
24 hunted in these areas. Local hunters to the region have  
25 not hunted in these areas due to common knowledge that  
26 they're in decline in these areas.

27

28 On the Canadian side, the Old Crow Flats,  
29 there's been a working group established because the  
30 community of Old Crow has a concern over this population  
31 and they know that it's a migratory population. So  
32 there's been a working group that's been established  
33 between the Vuntut Gwich'in and the Yukon Territory  
34 Government. So we'd encourage the RAC to communicate  
35 with that working group on the Canadian concerns of this  
36 population as well.

37

38 So I will be brief as possible. As a  
39 fellow scientist, I have to disagree with the analysis  
40 provided by the State and by OSM in that it's incomplete  
41 and looks at a very small segment of the data versus  
42 taking a look at the larger picture. Here's a picture of  
43 the migratory population. We can see it comes out of Old  
44 Crow Flats and moves through into the Upper Kongakut and  
45 Upper Firth as well as through the Coleen and through the  
46 Sheenjek.

47

48 Given that this population as a whole is  
49 coming from the Old Crow Flats in all four of these  
50 areas, we kind of take a look at both these areas. Not

1 across management unit lines, but as a population. So  
2 within the Sheenjek, within the Coleen, the documented  
3 analysis is that population is declining. Kind of  
4 undisputable.

5  
6 In the Kongakut, in the Firth,  
7 preliminary data collected by the Fish and Wildlife is  
8 that the population is actually increasing and that is  
9 very recent survey data. The reason I'm showing this is  
10 that because in 1996 was a restriction on hunting within  
11 that 25C -- or 26C, I'm sorry, 26C management unit. Due  
12 to that hunting restriction it is felt that we're seeing  
13 an increase in population. It's kind of a preliminary  
14 analysis and it's bad science to use one data point to  
15 make overall decisions. So I just want to kind of  
16 clarify that. So preliminarily we look like we have an  
17 increasing population within that game unit.

18  
19 Here's kind of the raw data over the  
20 course from 1977 to 2012. Again, documented decline over  
21 the course of the time.

22  
23 Within the analysis provided by Fish and  
24 Game and provided by OSM we look primarily about bull:cow  
25 ratio, which is a very strong indication around bull:cow  
26 ratio. These sample sizes are quite small. Any time  
27 doing statistical analysis, as Fish and Game and OSM are  
28 well familiar, to do a common analysis, would be double  
29 regression analysis, you need a minimum number of sample  
30 size.

31  
32 Within the survey count areas, if you do  
33 achieve a minimum statistical analysis, a minimal sample  
34 size number, you can extrapolate out to total sample  
35 size. If you don't have that minimum number, you can't  
36 extrapolate. So the problem basically is, is there  
37 enough moose to count in kind of the short version  
38 without getting into all the geeky science stuff.

39  
40 Total populations. Again, looking at  
41 undisputable, we know that they're declining, they have  
42 declined, that's a problem. When we look at the declines  
43 and kind of put them into perspective, multi-year average  
44 across the entire -- from looking at 1971 to present day  
45 within Sheenjek we see an 81 percent loss. Within the  
46 Coleen we see a 66 percent loss. This is taking all the  
47 data into consideration over the survey years.

48  
49 So if we take all the data in as well,  
50 this is number of hunters in the area since 1990 to 2012.

1 If we look at all of those, the number of hunters is  
2 increasing. The number of hunter effort is also -- or  
3 number of hunter success is also decreasing. If there's  
4 not that many moose and there's more hunters, obviously  
5 success is going to go down. It's not too difficult to  
6 infer.

7  
8                   Number of moose killed over the same time  
9 period has also increased. So even though we have more  
10 people in the field, there's more hunters that have  
11 actually killed moose and that's displayed by this graph.  
12 Now, if we take that over the course of the population  
13 dynamic, the population is falling. I mean, again, it's  
14 kind of repetitive that that happens.

15  
16                   So looking at OSM's analysis, moose in 25  
17 have declined over 20 years. Bull:cow ratios given.  
18 Moose are highly susceptible to harvest because they're  
19 migratory. The majority of successful hunters -- this is  
20 from their analysis. The majority of successful hunters  
21 are non-residents, meaning they are non-Alaskans. This  
22 is by definition of what non-resident means in the  
23 regulatory books. And there's a need for more data.  
24 None of this we are in dispute with. None of this  
25 analysis is what we're in dispute with.

26  
27                   The issue is the application of  
28 particularly the use of a single scenario in low sample  
29 sizes. This quote is actually from Walden in 2012 that  
30 when using -- in small sample sizes, which we know we  
31 have in the Coleen and the Sheenjek, that caution should  
32 be used when applying bull:cow ratios. Now we know we  
33 have a small sample size, but the entire analysis  
34 presented by Fish and Game and by OSM hinges on this  
35 bull:cow ratio. Within Fish and Wildlife Service, this  
36 is even -- this is from their report that said this  
37 should be used with caution and I agree that this should  
38 be used in caution. We have very low sample sizes and we  
39 have a very low population as a whole.

40  
41                   So in kind of responsible conservation,  
42 the only mechanism that we have in our toolbox at this  
43 time is a restriction in hunting. We understand that  
44 there are multiple factors in the grander picture of  
45 population dynamics; weather, predation, climate change,  
46 habitat change, all play into factors. None of those  
47 factors we have control over. We don't have control over  
48 predation. We don't have control over climate. We don't  
49 have control of the weather and we don't have control  
50 over habitat in these areas, but we do have control over

1 hunting effort and hunting restrictions.

2

3                   So, in the Council's view, to being  
4 conservationists, and applying a conservative approach  
5 until we do have the ability to collect more data both on  
6 moose abundance, as the state mentioned as needed, which  
7 we agree it's definitely needed, and total area. So, by  
8 restricting hunting we can actually use the one tool that  
9 we have in our toolbox as a regulatory agency and that's  
10 what we're asking. We believe that the population is in  
11 trouble, showed by the data, and there's something going  
12 on. So we feel it's prudent to act conservatively and do  
13 the one thing that we can do and that's restrict hunting  
14 to non-resident hunters.

15

16                   That is the conclusion of my slide. So  
17 given the documented decline of total population of  
18 moose, overall increase of non-resident hunters, CATG is  
19 compelled to support Proposal 48 and further restrict the  
20 allowable take of bull moose in the Upper Sheenjek and  
21 Coleen Rivers because the population dynamics are not  
22 well understood and restricting hunting activities is the  
23 only conservation activity under direct control. CATG  
24 asks the EIRAC to support Proposal 48 and help protect  
25 the migratory population of the Sheenjek and the Coleen  
26 from irreparable damage.

27

28                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Council  
29 members. Any questions.

30

31                   MR. GLANZ: If the closure is necessary  
32 and so forth and so on, how come this 48 proposal has  
33 struck the bull moose and listed five moose in the  
34 villages selected?

35

36                   MR. MARACLE: The proposal would restrict  
37 to a permit hunt to local residents and documented takes  
38 on moose in that area is nine moose currently, is the  
39 average of nine moose taken out of that region. If the  
40 proposal moves forward, then you would go from nine moose  
41 to five moose, which would be a conservation of the  
42 population.

43

44                   MR. GLANZ: You missed the point of my  
45 question. I see here the dates and so forth and it's one  
46 antlered bull. The proposal that's before me here is  
47 five moose. It doesn't say bull. It says five moose,  
48 which can be construed as cows, calves.

49

50                   MR. MARACLE: Under the State regulation

1 and under the regulation already in place, it's already  
2 a bull hunt.  
3  
4 MR. GLANZ: You missed it. The one that  
5 Joe said here it says five moose.  
6  
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, I'm  
8 looking at the existing State proposal is -- the existing  
9 State regulation is at the bottom of Page 125 and then  
10 the proposed regulation.....  
11  
12 MR. FIRMIN: It says five bulls.  
13  
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Only five  
15 registration permits will be issued.  
16  
17 MR. GLANZ: Okay, I see here. He pointed  
18 out five bulls down there. Okay. All right.  
19  
20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So we got that  
21 covered.  
22  
23 MR. GLANZ: Another question -- another  
24 question for you then is did you do your survey or are  
25 you just doing -- combining the surveys that everybody  
26 else has done?  
27  
28 MR. MARACLE: This uses the exact same  
29 data as the analysis of Fish and Game and of OSM, so  
30 those surveys are collected by the agencies.  
31  
32 MR. GLANZ: So figures don't lie, but  
33 liars can figure. That's what my dad used to tell me.  
34  
35 (Laughter)  
36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I won't  
38 ask you what your -- Virgil.  
39  
40 MR. UMPHENOUR: Thank you, Madame Chair.  
41 Have you looked at Proposal 79 that this RAC submitted to  
42 the State Board of Game?  
43  
44 MR. MARACLE: I have not.  
45  
46 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay. You need to look  
47 at this proposal, Proposal 79, that's addressing this  
48 issue. I would like you to tell us.....  
49  
50 MR. WOODRUFF: What page is that?

1 MR. UMPHENOUR: It's on Page 105. I'd  
2 like you to read it and then after a while I want to call  
3 you back up and I want to get your opinion on whether you  
4 think that addresses this problem adequately or not.

5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: He might need  
7 to do that now. We don't want to get too carried away  
8 here because we'll be all day.

9  
10 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay. Well, it won't  
11 take you long to look at it.

12  
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just give him  
14 a short version of it, 25A, that portion consisting of  
15 the Sheenjok River upstream and not including the Konesh.  
16 Yeah, basically it probably doesn't close it to -- do you  
17 see it there?

18  
19 MR. MARACLE: I do. In the essence of  
20 time, I could be able to read this and come back to that.

21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Let's do  
23 it that way. Any other questions. There is some noise  
24 in the background out there on the teleconference. What  
25 you have to do is push \*6 to mute and then when you want  
26 to talk you push \*6 again to come back on, so please try  
27 to remember that.

28  
29 (No comments)

30  
31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: There's no  
32 other questions, so we will continue on. Do we have any  
33 InterAgency Staff Committee comments that want to be  
34 spoke at this time.

35  
36 (No comments)

37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I don't hear  
39 anyone. If someone is online and didn't push \*6 please  
40 butt in. Advisory group comments, neighboring RACs, ACs  
41 and SRCs.

42  
43 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. We have no  
44 comments from the Regional Advisory Council. We have one  
45 comment submitted by the Central Fish and Game Advisory  
46 Committee. They unanimously oppose Federal Proposal 14-  
47 48 to restrict hunter access to Game Unit 25A. That is  
48 the only Advisory Council that has weighed in at this  
49 point.

50

1 Thank you.

2

3 MR. FIRMIN: Who was that?

4

5 MS. PATTON: That is the Central Fish and  
6 Game Advisory Committee.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm still  
9 hearing background noise. \*6 please. Summary of written  
10 comments. It does sound like they're building a house.

11

12 MR. MARACLE: Thank you, Madame Chair.

13

14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We're hearing  
15 some bang, bang, bang out there that we need to mute.

16

17 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. For the  
18 written public comments that were formally submitted to  
19 the Federal Subsistence Management Program we have one  
20 written comment from Donald Woodruff as a public member,  
21 mayor of Eagle. Does not support. As presented to the  
22 Eastern Interior RAC spring 2013 meeting,  
23 the moose in this area travel over 300 miles between  
24 ranges. These moose should be further studied before a  
25 season and bag limit is set.

26

27 And then we have a support for the  
28 proposal from the Gwichyaa Zhee Gwich'in Tribal  
29 Government is in support of this proposal as it addresses  
30 a conservation concern that is shared by many people in  
31 the Yukon Flats, Arctic National Wildlife Refuge and  
32 Venetie Tribal Lands. Many of these concerns originate  
33 from the lands we use and the common resources that we as  
34 local users have access too as Federally qualified  
35 subsistence users and caretakers of the land for a  
36 millennia.

37

38 The area in question is a natural  
39 migratory route for moose populations in the area and add  
40 to the openness of the terrain, and it results in a high  
41 success rate for moose hunters in these areas. The lack  
42 of survey data and other factors lead to a lack of  
43 information and they would like to see this proposed  
44 permit system implemented until a time in the future more  
45 information could be gathered to determine the moose  
46 population in the area.

47

48 They note there is a similar proposal in  
49 to the State Board of Game that will only place an antler  
50 restriction on hunters during the season. They support

1 Federal users and show that they are concerned about this  
2 population and would like to practice conservation.

3

4 Another letter in support of 14-48 -- and  
5 that was from Gwichyaa Zhee Tribal Council -- we have a  
6 long letter from Fran Mauer, which the Council has in  
7 your books. We also have more books in the back if  
8 people would like to read the full letter. I believe  
9 Fran Mauer is also here today as a public member to  
10 comment.

11

12 In summary, Fran Mauer supports Proposal  
13 14-48 because it would limit the harvest of moose in the  
14 Upper Sheenjek, Coleen, Old Crow River drainages where  
15 populations have significantly declined. And he provides  
16 a great deal of background and biological data. Again,  
17 the Council members have the full letter in your book for  
18 consideration.

19

20 He offers in conclusion there is still  
21 time to prevent such a loss for the Sheenjek and Coleen  
22 areas. By enacting the provisions of WP14-48 and  
23 maintaining the wildlife closure in the Kongakut and  
24 Firth areas, the Federal Subsistence Board would be  
25 taking significant conservation actions that would help  
26 to restore the moose population and enable a sustainable  
27 harvest in the future. That is from Fran Mauer, a public  
28 member.

29

30 That concludes the formal written  
31 comments.

32

33 Thank you.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Now we're up to  
36 public testimony. Do we need a short break or do you  
37 want to just keep going.

38

39 I heard both.

40

41 Short break all in favor.

42

43 MR. GLANZ: Okay.

44

45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Five minute  
46 short break.

47

48 (Off record)

49

50 (On record)

1                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We're  
2 going to start and all of you who are visiting you'll  
3 have to be quiet. The first one for public testimony on  
4 Proposal 48 is Darlene Herbert. Could you please come  
5 forward and state your name and where you're from.

6  
7                   Thank you.

8  
9                   MS. HERBERT: Hello.

10  
11                  (In Gwich'in)

12  
13                  Hello. My name is Darlene Herbert and I  
14 was born outside of Fort Yukon on my father's trapline by  
15 Black River and we were out on a trapline and my father  
16 had to hitch up the dogs and put my mother in there and  
17 drive to -- take the dogs to Fort Yukon and I was born in  
18 Fort Yukon on January 27th, 1948 and it was 60 below out.  
19 Most of my life I lived subsistence lifestyle. My first  
20 language is Gwich'in and when I first started BIA school,  
21 I had to learn how to talk English. That wasn't very  
22 much fun either.

23  
24                  On this proposal here, I'll probably use  
25 something that my grandmother told me a long time ago.  
26 I wish I could talk in my language, but none of you would  
27 understand me. Maybe Andrew might understand one word  
28 here and there. I use very high words when I talk my  
29 language. (In Gwich'in) means a long, long time ago.  
30 That is how we begin our stories. That is how I learned  
31 from my grandmother.

32  
33                  (In Gwich'in) the Native people always  
34 know what's coming. I don't know how that is ingrained  
35 in them. We knew everything that was coming before it  
36 was here. We know, like my grandmother and her  
37 ancestors, they knew that you guys were coming here  
38 before you got here. We know a lot of stuff and we do  
39 know that we have to save our animals. Hard times are  
40 coming. Starvation is coming. When there's starvation,  
41 there won't be any animals, there won't be any canned  
42 food, there won't be any oil We can't eat oil anyway.

43  
44                  We have to save our animals for when the  
45 starvation comes. Our kids, we are teaching them how to  
46 survive off of the land. I think that only the  
47 (indiscernible) will survive. And we've been here for  
48 thousands and thousands and thousands of years and we'll  
49 be here at the end of time too because we know how to  
50 live off the land, we know about the air, we know about

1 the trees, we know about the plants, we know about the  
2 ants.

3

4           If we don't save our animals and we  
5 continue to destroy our animals, by destroying our land  
6 with oils and everything and tearing down our trees and  
7 everything, then that day comes when there's starvation.  
8 It's not going to be fun because you just can't go out  
9 there and kill a moose. Why? Because you killed it.  
10 You killed it way before it's time.

11

12           The moose and all the animals are  
13 supposed to survive forever like us, but if you keep  
14 continuing and getting in your planes and wearing downs  
15 and killing them, we will all not survive. Nobody will  
16 survive.

17

18           I like this proposal very very much. The  
19 only thing I'd like to have amended on it is to amend it  
20 to say not only Chalkyitsik, Fort Yukon, Arctic Village  
21 and Venetie. I would like it to say all the villages in  
22 the Interior of Alaska or the whole Alaska for that  
23 matter.

24

25           I think that you should consider this  
26 proposal with the amendment because I would hate to see  
27 the future without no moose. I would hate to see the  
28 future without no fish. I would like to see the future  
29 to survive. We are all getting older. We are not going  
30 to live forever. We are not doing this for ourselves.  
31 We are doing this for our future.

32

33           I know that the State say that the reason  
34 they're against this is because they say there's a lot of  
35 moose out there. I really don't understand your books.  
36 Look how thick it is. I mean do you all seriously sit  
37 down and read the whole book? I mean it looks like a  
38 Bible almost. I mean me, I know -- I know I don't need  
39 no piece of paper to tell me what's good or what's bad.

40

41           A long time ago we never used a piece of  
42 paper to know who owned the lands. It's been handed down  
43 from generation to generation. And also the way you guys  
44 do the animals, we always knew when the moose or the fish  
45 is going down low. We have ways of telling each other.  
46 You have to stop hunting like this. Save the moose and  
47 then they'll stop for awhile until they grow again.  
48 That's the way it's always been.

49

50           I really don't understand all your maps,

1 all your writings and everything, but I do know that a  
2 starvation is coming. I do know it's coming. I do know  
3 we have to save the animals in order to save the future.

4

5 Thank you very much.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,  
8 Darlene.

9

10 Council members, any questions.

11

12

13 (No comments)

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Next is  
16 Fran Mauer and after Fran would be Kirk Sweetsir.

17

18 MR. MAUER: Madame Chair and members of  
19 the committee or, excuse me, the Council. Thank you for  
20 the opportunity to appear before you again. You probably  
21 remember I was here in February and gave the information  
22 about how the moose migrate from Old Crow Flats over into  
23 this area and I want to now say that I m here today to  
24 speak in support of Wildlife Proposal 14-48, which from  
25 here forward I'll just call Proposal 48 rather than  
26 spelling all that out.

27

28 I also want to provide a few comments  
29 regarding the Office of Subsistence Management's analysis  
30 and perhaps some points in reference to the presentation  
31 that the Alaska Department of Fish and Game has just  
32 presented.

33

34 The main reason why I support this  
35 proposal is because of my concern for the decline in the  
36 population and that I believe it's the prudent thing to  
37 do at this stage, is to restrict harvest in some manner,  
38 whether it's by the mechanism of this proposal or some  
39 other approach. But I do support this proposal as it's  
40 proposed at this time.

41

42 We know the reason why the data has been  
43 presented here several times, that there's significant  
44 decline has been documented with the aerial fall trend  
45 surveys. And I would add that these trend surveys have  
46 been proven to be highly reliable. There was a question  
47 earlier about whether there's movement and the  
48 consistency of when the survey was done. Over the years  
49 we found it to be a very reliable method of tracking.

50

1                   These surveys were set up under the  
2 mentoring and advice of a well-known Fish and Game  
3 research biologist, the late Dr. Bill Gasaway. He's the  
4 one who helped us design these things in the first place.  
5 He also got involved when the first wave of hunters  
6 descended upon the Sheenjek in the mid 1970s. There was  
7 a wave of hunting that went up there at that time as a  
8 result of the low numbers of moose and the crash of moose  
9 in Unit 20A on the Tanana Flats.

10

11                   At that time, Bill went up and took a  
12 look at the situation and he wrote a letter to the Refuge  
13 Manager expressing concern about the vulnerability of  
14 these moose. He didn't know at that time that they came  
15 from Old Crow Flats, but he was well aware that there was  
16 a movement during the hunting season from the Lobo Lake  
17 area on the Sheenjek, northward up towards where we now  
18 do these trend counts.

19

20                   He stated in his letter at that time that  
21 he could see where it would be easy for hunters to remove  
22 all the moose from that valley in one season if the  
23 pressure continued. Fortunately, the hunting pressure at  
24 that time tapered off and that kind of damage did not  
25 occur.

26

27                   Well, after I discovered where these  
28 moose go to with our radio tracking surveys, I had the  
29 opportunity back in about 1993 to visit with Bill again  
30 before he passed away about the vulnerability of these  
31 migratory moose. He agreed with me that if you  
32 overharvest a migratory population, you could lose the  
33 tradition. In other words, the ability of these moose to  
34 sustain themselves in this migratory tradition.

35

36                   He believed at the time that there once  
37 was a strong migratory moose segment in the Yukon Flats  
38 and that excessive hunting by float planes from Fairbanks  
39 in the '50s and '60s when there was a same day airborne -  
40 - or there was no same day airborne rule and these  
41 migratory moose were on lakes in late August when the  
42 season was open in the '50s and '60s, that that migratory  
43 component in the Yukon Flats had been greatly diminished.

44

45                   I asked Bill, you know, how certain are  
46 you about that. He looked me straight in the eye and he  
47 said I'm very certain. Bill was well known to be a very  
48 honest and objective biologist. Well, that got my  
49 attention and that's why I'm here speaking to you now,  
50 because I believe there's a serious conservation concern

1 because of the vulnerability of these migratory moose.  
2 The way the season is laid out right now, there's no  
3 limit on the number of hunters that can go up to this  
4 area and focus on these migratory moose.

5  
6 The other point I'd like to make is that  
7 a long time resident of the Upper Coleen noticed fairly  
8 recently that there was more hunters and less moose.

9  
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Can you wrap it  
11 up. I'm sorry.

12  
13 MR. MAUER: I'm sorry. It's going to be  
14 difficult for me to wrap it up real fast here. At any  
15 rate, he supposed a proposal, as you know, and it was  
16 supported and the Game Board chose to not support it. So  
17 I'm here today to express concern because the concern  
18 continues.

19  
20 The other thing that I'd like to add is  
21 that this scenario that seems to be taking place on the  
22 Sheenjek and Coleen reminds me of what happened up on the  
23 North Slope in the late '80s and early '90s. I happened  
24 to be involved in doing trend counts up there through  
25 that time period and saw the collapse of the North Slope  
26 moose.

27  
28 We see strong parallels to what's  
29 happening here. Well, guess what. The North Slope moose  
30 is also in a place where moose are highly vulnerable,  
31 very easy to see from a distance and .....

32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Fran.

34  
35 MR. MAUER: Yes.

36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm in a  
38 position that I tell everyone they have five minutes and  
39 if I did let people go over.....

40  
41 MR. MAUER: I have a problem with that  
42 because why should I have to stop after five minutes when  
43 other people have had an opportunity to give a much  
44 longer presentation?

45  
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: They are part  
47 of the Staff and the public is not part of our Staff.

48  
49 MR. MAUER: So the public is limited to  
50 five.....

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I apologize  
2 where we're at. Council members are -- I think you could  
3 provide us.....  
4  
5 MR. MAUER: .....five minutes.  
6  
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....with that  
8 document that you're going by and -- I m going to ask  
9 Council members if I allow one person at the public to do  
10 this, I m going to be put in a position to do it for  
11 everyone. How would you like to proceed?  
12  
13 MR. GLANZ: Five minutes, Madame Chair.  
14  
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So I would  
16 really appreciate it, Fran, if you could present that  
17 document to our Staff and we will look at that and when  
18 people are at break you can talk to them. I have to do  
19 this for everyone. So I apologize. I'm going to have to  
20 ask is there any questions of Fran from the Council.  
21  
22 MR. FIRMIN: I just had one about the  
23 float hunters in the '50s and '60s. Was that in the  
24 Tanana Flats area?  
25  
26 MR. MAUER: No, I was referring to the  
27 Yukon Flats.  
28  
29 MR. FIRMIN: Oh, okay. That's what I  
30 wasn't sure. Thank you.  
31  
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Are there any  
33 other questions.  
34  
35 (No comments)  
36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,  
38 Fran. If you could provide that to Eva, that would be  
39 great.  
40  
41 MR. MAUER: Okay.  
42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.  
44  
45 The next person is Kirk Sweetsir.  
46  
47 MR. SWEETSIR: Hello. I m Kirk Sweetsir.  
48 I have more questions than statements concerning this  
49 proposal. I've only very recently been made aware of it.  
50 In fact, last night David Hayden -- or Daniel Hayden, a

1 good friend of mine, called and expressed some great  
2 reservations about this. I was sort of unaware that this  
3 was moving ahead, which is a little surprising because in  
4 these issues I have been typically consulted by the  
5 people that have been putting these ideas together and I  
6 haven't been in this case. I don't know why that is, but  
7 it takes me by surprise.

8  
9 The thing that concerns me is this seems  
10 like a very dramatic proposal to go from the open hunting  
11 that has been in place in these drainages to a full  
12 closure without first trying lesser restrictions, such as  
13 antler restrictions, which apparently has been proposed  
14 in this 79 that Virgil is suggesting everybody read. I  
15 bumped into that last night while I was desperately  
16 trying to catch up on what this was about.

17  
18 It seems like these greater restrictions  
19 may well be warranted, but a full blown closure is an  
20 awful big shift from where we are today to what is being  
21 proposed for tomorrow. It suggests that the situation is  
22 more perilously poised than perhaps it may be. I have  
23 been supporting people, visiting the Refuge for over 26  
24 years now and I don't see personally such a dramatic  
25 change in those areas.

26  
27 I think Andrew is very aware of my  
28 position with regard to hunting in these areas and I have  
29 great reservations about how it is conducted and the  
30 ability of the players involved to regulate it and to  
31 control some of the problems that exist there. This  
32 seems like sort of a veiled attempt to me to address some  
33 problems that go quite beyond biology and get into  
34 politics and that seems troubling to me.

35  
36 I would like to address those political  
37 issues, but I don't know that this is the way to do it.

38  
39 I worry about that.

40  
41 I think that's it.

42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Council  
44 members, any questions of Kirk.

45  
46 MR. FIRMIN: Do you support Proposal 79  
47 in the State book?

48  
49 MR. SWEETSIR: I do actually, yeah.  
50 Well, as far as I understand it, that is a proposal that

1 I have thought to be cunning, something that we are  
2 moving toward in this area. I have been sorely  
3 disappointed in the lack of ability of the regulators to  
4 control some of the issues that go on there. I think you  
5 and I had spoke about this, Andrew, the way there seems  
6 to be only an ability to control commercial use in these  
7 areas and very little control of private use and that  
8 neighborliness tends to be at a minimum when it comes to  
9 people in jet boats zinging by and heading into these  
10 areas.

11  
12 The idea that closing this area will  
13 somehow help reduce animosity between local and non-local  
14 users, I don't think this is true. Every year I deal  
15 with endless contacts from hunters who want to do things  
16 which I will not support because they impinge on local  
17 hunters. I have a very strict rule and I've tried to  
18 bring along other air services in the area to refuse all  
19 proposals that interfere with local hunting.

20  
21 I know where local hunters go. I'm very  
22 aware of it. I stop them at those places. They want to  
23 float beyond a certain point, I say I'm not supporting  
24 you. You have to stop here because that's the limit of  
25 where local hunters go. I get no support in that matter  
26 from any regulatory agency. If somebody says, well,  
27 that's your opinion and we're going to do what we want,  
28 then I have no ability to control that.

29  
30 My ability as a concerned person who  
31 cares to take care in these issues is very limited. When  
32 I see -- I was involved in a terrible problem on the  
33 Sheenjek with some people that floated down. It was a  
34 ridiculous situation. They broke hundreds of rules, they  
35 stole a boat, they shot and wasted all kinds of meat. The  
36 lack of justice that was meted out in that case was  
37 profound and nothing was ever -- nobody in Fort Yukon  
38 ever got word about what happened there and it's a good  
39 thing because it was atrocious. I'm so disappointed I  
40 can't even begin to speak.

41  
42 These are the kinds of things that drive  
43 the animosity that exists out here and push people to  
44 make such radical proposals where they aren't necessarily  
45 warranted. I don't believe a closure is warranted. I  
46 believe some consideration of the real and abiding  
47 tensions that exist out there that are simmering away  
48 under the surface is needed and I think this is a result  
49 of a great deal of that simmering tension.

50

1                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Did you have  
2 another question?  
3  
4                   MR. FIRMIN: No.  
5  
6                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, okay. Any  
7 other questions.  
8  
9                   Bill.  
10  
11                  MR. GLANZ: Yes. I know that Heimo, he's  
12 contacted me and he's pretty distraught about this being  
13 passed. Do you know of any other families or people  
14 that's going to be.....  
15  
16                  MR. SWEETSIR: Well, I'm disappointed  
17 that Heimo isn't here. He's.....  
18  
19                  MR. GLANZ: Me too.  
20  
21                  MR. SWEETSIR: Anyway. As I said, Daniel  
22 Hayden, who unfortunately is flying this morning, told me  
23 last night that he was opposed to this and he grew up on  
24 the Sheenjek and is very active in the business of  
25 supporting hunters out there. He flies for Wright Air  
26 Service. So he's aware of the pitfalls and the  
27 opportunities and the realities of what s going on there,  
28 as am I. We're also very aware that everyone has a  
29 particular view.  
30  
31                  I do think that this proposal will make  
32 things worse for local hunters. I think it will  
33 absolutely push what pressure there is out there closer  
34 to Fort Yukon, closer to Chalkyitsik, closer to the Black  
35 River, closer to the Coleen, closer to all the areas that  
36 we are actively trying to keep the pressure away from.  
37 Saving the migratory moose that exist at that very upper  
38 level, which is totally inaccessible to the people of  
39 Chalkyitsik and Fort Yukon, they don't access it because  
40 it's too far away and it's not practical hunting country.  
41  
42                  A concern for that does not translate  
43 into a better situation for the people of Arctic or Fort  
44 Yukon or Venetie. I don't think. I don't think the  
45 result of this will improve those people's lot in terms  
46 of moose hunting. I think it will reduce it because it  
47 will push what pressure there is out there closer to  
48 them. It will remove this as a possible area to hunt for  
49 non-local people.  
50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Are there any  
2 other questions.  
3  
4 (No comments)  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,  
7 Kirk.  
8  
9 MR. SWEETSIR: You're welcome.  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Sandy Jamieson.  
12  
13 MR. JAMES: (Indiscernible).  
14  
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm sorry?  
16 Who's online?  
17  
18 MR. JAMES: I don't have a question, but  
19 I have a comment on this issue.  
20  
21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Who's speaking?  
22  
23 MR. JAMES: This is Gideon James.  
24  
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, hi, Gideon.  
26 Gideon, we -- are you wanting to testify on this  
27 proposal?  
28  
29 MR. JAMES: Yes.  
30  
31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We'll  
32 call you after Joe Matesi, okay?  
33  
34 MR. JAMES: Okay.  
35  
36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.  
37  
38 Go ahead, Sandy.  
39  
40 MR. JAMIESON: Okay. I'm Sandy Jamieson.  
41 I've been guiding up in that area for 30-some years and  
42 as a current concessionaire for the subject area for  
43 moose and other animals I take one to two moose per year  
44 out of that migratory population. My observation has  
45 been there's also a large non-migratory or a more  
46 confused migration anyway. It's not something that's as  
47 path specific as those ones that come out of the Old  
48 Crow, but the moose move around a lot up there.  
49  
50 I don't think that in general you can say

1 that the population ends as a whole in the Porcupine  
2 drainage is changed only in the number of migratory moose  
3 that come out of the Old Crow. I think those moose  
4 numbers are reflected also in the numbers at large in  
5 the Yukon Flats and also specifically in the Porcupine  
6 drainage. My observation has been that it's been maybe  
7 gradually getting more moose. Not big numbers, but  
8 gradually changing for the better after a precipitous  
9 decline in the early 2000s.

10

11 Also speaking of Daniel Hayden, he asked  
12 me to speak a little bit on his behalf saying that he was  
13 just two days ago up on the Sheenjek getting his trapline  
14 set up out at Big Fish Lake and he was surprised at the  
15 very high numbers of moose he saw in the Middle Sheenjek.  
16 As Kirk reported, he's against this proposal. It would  
17 affect him in the fact that he's just outside that area  
18 and probably bring more hunters in on Big Fish Lake and  
19 the Lower Sheenjek.

20

21 Also there's other people like Heimo  
22 Korth and Bob Hart who are up on the Coleen who would be  
23 not necessarily awarded the permit, single permit for the  
24 area from wherever they -- however they would administer  
25 that, that's another hard to figure out administrative  
26 issue.

27

28 Beyond that, I just reviewed the proposal  
29 that Virgil had, that referred everyone -- referred us to  
30 for the State Board of Game and I think that has in it  
31 some good ideas. Those of us that are limited by  
32 commercial permits are pretty much predictable to be  
33 within the biological limits of the area, whereas the  
34 numbers of people that come in from Outside right now are  
35 not controlled.

36

37 My observation has been that they  
38 particularly are concentrated on the Upper Coleen, more  
39 like the Middle Coleen from the forks down to about  
40 Heimo's place and they're mostly there for caribou, but  
41 usually they're parties of two or three people and one  
42 person buys a moose tag because it's so easy for them,  
43 they just buy one. If they get a chance to get a moose,  
44 they will. Otherwise not. But they don't tend to float  
45 very far past where they expect to get caribou.

46

47 So I would say that if you somehow  
48 limited the number of permits just for that area, you  
49 would achieve 90 percent of Fran Mauer's goal in reducing  
50 the target or the concentrated effort on this migratory

1 population.

2

3

4                   When I hunt over on the Old Crow, as I  
5 say, I take one, sometimes as much as two moose out of  
6 there, my observation has been that those moose above  
7 Bilwaddy Creek are headed for the Firth area and you can  
8 pretty much just watch them go on up there. That's in  
9 concordance with the maps that the gentleman from CATG  
10 presented.

11

12                   So that's all I have.

13

14                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You did a good  
15 job. Five minutes.

16

17                   Any questions.

18

19                   (No comments)

20

21                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Thanks,  
22 Sandy. Joe Matesi. And after Joe Matesi is Gideon. If  
23 you're listening, Gideon, that would be the time. After  
24 Joe is finished we'll call on you.

25

26                   MR. MATESI: Thank you, Madame Chair.  
27 I'm going to try really hard to stay in five minutes.

28

29                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I would  
30 appreciate it.

31

32                   MR. MATESI: Yeah, well, I'm going to  
33 try. Of course, you can just shut me up when the time  
34 comes. I m sure everybody on the Council knows what my  
35 position is. Would you mind passing those out. I just  
36 spent 26 bucks printing out these handouts, all in color  
37 and everything, so that I could -- look at this number,  
38 look at that number. So I'm asking Eva to pass them out  
39 even though we probably don't have time to go over them.  
40 I just want to get, you know, a little bit of my 26 bucks  
41 worth out of it.

42

43                   The main reason, even though I wrote the  
44 proposal, so you already know how I feel about it, but  
45 the reason I want to talk here today is because I feel  
46 that the analysis provided by OSM and especially by Fish  
47 and Game has some serious omissions and errors that I'd  
48 like to point out because it actually has a bearing on  
49 the conclusion. I just lost my train of thought.

50

51                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That happens to

1 me a lot too.

2

3 MR. MATESI: Yeah, my Alzheimer's is  
4 kicking in. Well, what I'll do is just kind of start  
5 from the top and point out some mistakes that I think  
6 might have a bearing on the conclusion. I'll start right  
7 with regulatory history in the analysis. It was actually  
8 incomplete. I'd like to remind everybody there at the  
9 table was on the Council when this Council approved a  
10 proposal to the State Board of Game that was submitted by  
11 Heimo, by the way, and that was State Proposal 170. That  
12 was an attempt to curtail hunting in this area because  
13 Heimo was witnessing these problems and it was fairly  
14 mild.

15

16 Chairperson Entsminger and I presented  
17 this information to the Board and it was shot down by  
18 Fish and Game. So that should have been included in the  
19 regulatory history because that was significant. In  
20 fact, the regulatory history actually goes back at least  
21 to 2003 when the people in Old Crow were raising holy  
22 heck over in Canada with their Fish and Game folks saying  
23 we've got all these moose that we're growing here in the  
24 Old Crow Flats and sending them off to Alaska and there's  
25 a 50 percent decline because they're getting shot off by  
26 sport hunters.

27

28 The Yukon people contacted the Refuge  
29 people and said what are we going to do about this and  
30 they just kind of blew it off. They came up with the  
31 business like, well, we don't think it's hunting, we  
32 think that maybe it's weather or something like that.  
33 This was in spite of the fact that they didn't have any  
34 weather data, they didn't have any browse data. They  
35 were just looking for an excuse to be able to explain it  
36 without having to do anything about it. Oh, I'm sorry,  
37 that's interpretive, so I'll take that back.

38

39 I'm just trying to point out errors are  
40 occurring in the analysis. I think the biggest thing is  
41 -- I'm going to skip right to it here -- is this business  
42 about, well, we have a bull:cow ratio that's really high,  
43 therefore, according to our cookbook method of wildlife  
44 management, we can say that we automatically have enough  
45 bulls that we have a harvestable surplus.

46

47 I'd like you to turn to your meeting  
48 book, Page 295. I'll read what it says there. This was  
49 written by Eric Wald, who is the staff wildlife biologist  
50 in Arctic National Wildlife Refuge on this very issue.

1 He wrote that it is inevitable to miss moose and more  
2 likely to miss single moose or segregated moose such as  
3 cows and cow/calf pairs. And that's true.

4  
5 I've talked at length with the people  
6 that do these surveys and they see these moose down there  
7 in the willow flats along the river, but on other surveys  
8 where they've flown up and looked for collars that are  
9 emitting the radio signal, they find, oh, there's a  
10 signal coming from way up there in the mountains  
11 somewhere and they go up and they go up and they go up  
12 and they look for it and, guess what, they find this cow  
13 hiding in this little tiny clump of willows where she can  
14 get away from the wolves and these are being missed on  
15 these surveys.

16  
17 That's just one example how in a small  
18 sample size you can have artifactual errors showing up  
19 that will give you information that really isn't very  
20 useful. That quote in your book continues. It says  
21 ratio data should be used with caution because of the low  
22 sample sizes. Actually that was also written in the  
23 official memo that was written concerning that survey.

24  
25 What I'm contending is that a bull:cow  
26 ratio 1 to 1 using that to justify continuing basically  
27 almost unregulated hunting is a smokescreen. It's a lot  
28 more complex. It's just like -- I really appreciate  
29 Bill's comment about numbers can be used to prove just  
30 about anything.

31  
32 I almost laughed myself out of the chair  
33 when I watched Fish and Game walking backwards from a  
34 certain set of numbers and, oh, suddenly invented 380  
35 moose out of thin air and they're releasing something  
36 like 0.05 density per square mile. Well, moose in that  
37 area, they're just not subject to that kind of  
38 description. It's much more complex spatially and  
39 temporally. In the summertime, there's no moose. It's  
40 zero. Zero moose per square mile.

41  
42 Five minutes? Okay. How can I summarize  
43 this. I'll summarize it this way. We're going to have  
44 a closure like this, just like we ended up on the North  
45 Slope. We can do it now, proactively, in which the  
46 healing process will be a lot easier to happen, we can  
47 get the moose back again, or we can take these little  
48 baby steps like a little antler restriction here and  
49 there and keep going -- keep circling the drain until  
50 we're going to have to have this restriction anyway. So

1 we could be proactive or do it after the fact.

2

3 Thank you, Madame Chair.

4

5 Questions.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I had to turn  
8 on my own mic. Thanks, Joe.

9

10 Any questions from the Council.

11

12 (No comments)

13

14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thanks, Joe.  
15 Okay. We have Gideon James at Arctic Village. Gideon,  
16 now it's time to push your \*6 so we can hear you and you  
17 can talk about this proposal for the moose in 25A.

18

19 MR. JAMES: Okay. I pushed my star to  
20 get in here.

21

22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, we got you.

23

24 MR. JAMES: Okay. My name is Gideon  
25 James and I live in Arctic Village and I'm 74 years old.  
26 I'm going to testify on this mainly for the migratory  
27 routes for some animals that are in some wintering area  
28 or whatever. Anyway, I am a retired tribal  
29 administrator, 40 or 30 years, and I'm very familiar with  
30 the subject I'm testifying today.

31

32 I was moved by Darlene Herbert's  
33 testimony earlier and I would thank her very much for her  
34 very moving statements there. My testimony today will be  
35 in a forum of (indiscernible) in a forum as it happened.  
36 This is no fancy assumption and content of my testimony.  
37 Most of all I would like to comment on the Federal  
38 Subsistence Board recognizing the need to address and  
39 taking action on Fish and Game regulations in surrounding  
40 areas of rural communities.

41

42 I am very disturbed by comments or  
43 testimony given on assumption. Very little attention is  
44 given to rural concern where disturbance to game area  
45 continue to happen. The outside influence is out of  
46 control where outside hunters compete for very limited  
47 resource or species.

48

49 The game are depleting in a lot of areas  
50 as it is today. The State of Alaska just don t get the

1 message as extreme measure where State of Alaska needs to  
2 take things. I am just pointing out that a lot of  
3 communities in rural areas go without subsistence use or  
4 traditional food gathering for a number of seasons.  
5 Oversight by game management is very poor, I mean poor,  
6 especially in Arctic Village area.

7  
8                    Hunters have spotted -- our village  
9 hunters have spotted private aircraft, float planes, late  
10 at night. This is towards late evening when it gets dark  
11 and we conclude that there's only one lake in the area  
12 which is accessible for float plane and this is an Upper  
13 Sheenjek River. These hunting parties often shoot in  
14 closed area. Past testimony by residents of Arctic  
15 Village still stands.

16  
17                    Real concern where this disturbance to  
18 animals continually happens in other village area. We  
19 have mountainous and some rolling hills on the mountains  
20 and these aircraft, these private aircraft land on these  
21 rolling hills many times over and lakes. They land on  
22 lakes. I am testifying on the fact that these things are  
23 happening. These things are happening in our area  
24 continuously. Our hunters have spotted these aircrafts.  
25 They land on the sand bar and they disturb the migration  
26 pattern of the caribou. Especially the gentleman that  
27 testified on the Sheenjek River is true.

28  
29                    Those animals need to go to the breeding  
30 ground in a season where they know where the breeding  
31 ground are and that's where they migrate to.  
32 Disturbance, continual disturbance happens not only to  
33 the caribou but to the sheep area and to the other areas  
34 where these rural residents utilize for their hunting and  
35 fishing.

36  
37                    Sheep management area should remain  
38 closed. It should remain closed because oversight is  
39 poor. They don't actually follow every aircraft that  
40 comes to this area. I understand -- I understand very  
41 well this action by the State of Alaska in using the  
42 resource. We live in a state where resource are not  
43 managed well or used wisely for people that live in  
44 Alaska.

45  
46                    For instance, we have a lot of oil, we  
47 have a lot of gas, but the big corporations sit on their  
48 lease forever and wait until the price go up. We live in  
49 Alaska. Rural Alaska is the ones that has the burden of  
50 paying high price for the energy.

1 What I'm saying is that State of Alaska is a puppet to  
2 the big corporations in this country.

3  
4 The testimony I was giving a couple years  
5 ago on the sheep management in Arctic Village still  
6 stands.

7  
8 Thank you.

9  
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,  
11 Gideon. Did you hear me turn my mic on? I'm kidding.  
12 Are you still there.

13  
14 Any questions of Gideon.

15  
16 (No comments)

17  
18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Hearing  
19 none, we will continue. I believe we got everyone that  
20 wanted to testify on this Proposal 48. We're going to  
21 continue with our process and this goes into our  
22 deliberation.

23  
24 MR. UMPHENOUR: Move to adopt Proposal  
25 WP14-48.

26  
27 MR. WOODRUFF: Second.

28  
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Discussion. We  
30 are now in discussion with the Council and I believe  
31 Larry might still be on and I don't know if James is  
32 still on. Was he on this morning? At any rate, James or  
33 Larry can jump in any time. You guys, if you want to  
34 speak, you have to push \*6. After you have muted  
35 yourself, you have to do that to get back on. Gentlemen,  
36 discussion on the proposal.

37  
38 They don't know who's going to lead off,  
39 but it looks like Bill is doing body English.

40  
41 MR. GLANZ: It looks like I got  
42 appointed.

43  
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You guys have  
45 some good-looking sausages there.

46  
47 MR. GLANZ: Yeah, I know. The sausages  
48 were provided by Virgil.

49  
50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: One second,

1 Bill. I'm sorry. Did we miss your blue card?  
2  
3 MS. PATTON: My apologies. You'd like to  
4 speak to 14-48 as well, Sarah. Okay. My apologies. We  
5 have you for 51.  
6  
7 Please come and address the Council.  
8  
9 MS. JAMES: Thank you. Sorry.  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We made a  
12 mistake. Our apologies.  
13  
14 MS. JAMES: Sorry.  
15  
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No, we're  
17 sorry.  
18  
19 Go ahead.  
20  
21 MS. JAMES: My name is Sarah James. I  
22 live in Arctic Village all my life. I was raised on  
23 hunting and fishing and trapping by my parents along the  
24 Yukon and up Junjik River and East Fork River. I still  
25 speak my language. English is my second language. I  
26 tried to include everything that I remember what we've  
27 been told for generation to generation that we should  
28 take care of what we use from the land. Not only the  
29 land, but the air, the water, the land and life.  
30  
31 I understand the moose calving ground is  
32 (in Gwich'in), is land of lake. That's where they go to  
33 have their calf. We call those places (in Gwich'in) and  
34 that means a sacred place where the life begin. Every  
35 animal has a place to have their birth and those places  
36 is sacred to our people and they call those places (in  
37 Gwich'in). So now that they come over to Canada and  
38 mingle up in the upper part of Yukon and the plane come  
39 in. Most of them land on sand bars and they're private  
40 and some of them are commercial. The traffic is growing  
41 more and more from Arctic Village. We continue all the  
42 time hearing those small airplanes flying over, heading  
43 to Salmon River or over at Coleen River because there's  
44 moose and caribou there. That's a caribou migratory  
45 route there too toward Arctic Village. That's why we put  
46 Arctic Village where it is when we were forced to  
47 colonize into village life. The whole area all around us  
48 is our traditional ground. We didn't give it up because  
49 we couldn't go that far. Sometime we could go that far  
50 just later on. I talk about sheep. We had to go a long

1 ways. It used to be a way of life that one place we go  
2 and gather, but now we have to live in the village life  
3 and our people have to work and our kids have to go to  
4 school and still maintain our traditional way of life,  
5 which is very difficult when you have to live in two  
6 worlds and that's what we're doing to our children and  
7 we're doing the best we can to teach them to use the land  
8 in the way our ancestor did and at the same time teach  
9 them the good way of life outside our culture. So we  
10 have to live two life and we really need to work this  
11 together to make it happen for everybody.

12  
13 The hunters that comes in, you know, one  
14 of them is the traffic. I said the moose problem and I  
15 know that it's disturbing to caribou migratory route. I  
16 know that in our area they come over Dead Womans Creek to  
17 go down Arctic Village area so we can have moose, but  
18 it's getting less and less. So I really -- I'm really  
19 for to protect this area and give it a second thought and  
20 listen to the local people. You know, we like to go --  
21 you know, we like to go up to Coleen too, but it's  
22 expensive and we don't have small airplane. We have to  
23 pay and all that stuff.

24  
25 If you could protect this area from  
26 hunting, mainly private and cut down on that hunting. I  
27 think that would be good for our people because we do  
28 want to teach our children. You know, we didn't come  
29 from anywhere. We're not going anywhere. We're here to  
30 stay because God put us in this area to take care of this  
31 place and this part of the world as Gwich'in people and  
32 that's our responsibility and we're here to stay.

33  
34 Thank you.

35  
36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes. Thank  
37 you. I appreciate your comment that we should work  
38 together also.

39  
40 Any questions of Sarah.

41  
42 (No comments)

43  
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,  
45 Sarah. And I apologize for -- we have people doing both  
46 proposals and we missed you.

47  
48 MS. JAMES: Yeah, I'm for the proposal.

49  
50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Wait. Do you

1 have a question? Oh, okay, I'm sorry. Virgil -- are you  
2 speaking first and then Virgil. I do want to remind  
3 everyone here, the public and the Council, we're  
4 challenged with some hard decisions here and we have to  
5 look at everything. We can't just look at one thing. We  
6 have to look at everything. That's what we're challenged  
7 to do. I'm just going to remind people that that's how  
8 it has to be for us. It's hard to do sometimes. It's a  
9 tough job. So I appreciate your understanding and  
10 respect as we work through this process. Thank you.

11

12 Bill.

13

14 MR. GLANZ: I have to second your thought  
15 there, Madame Chair, because we're all volunteers. None  
16 of us is getting paid for this. Anyway, I really can't  
17 support 48. I feel that there's been no C&T taken or no  
18 other actions. Just a total closure is totally  
19 ridiculous to me. I mean there's different tools we can  
20 use to alleviate the problem. Closing the whole area is  
21 not one of them. None of the residents in the area -- I  
22 don't know if they've applied for C&T. I know there's  
23 C&T for the whole area.

24

25 So, anyway, my thoughts are I can't  
26 support it.

27

28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Virgil.

29

30 MR. UMPHENOUR: Yeah. Our RAC last year  
31 or early this year, when we had our last meeting, I  
32 believe we addressed this issue, but we addressed this  
33 issue once before. What we did -- I loaned my board book  
34 to one of the people out in the audience, but we wrote  
35 and submitted a proposal to the State Board of Game to  
36 address this issue and that will be heard I believe in  
37 February. End of February, first part of March when the  
38 State Board of Game meets here in Fairbanks. They will  
39 address this issue.

40

41 What our proposal does is it would make -  
42 - the non-guided non-residents would then be a drawing  
43 permit hunt and it would be up to the Board of Game, with  
44 recommendations from the public and from the Department,  
45 to determine how many permits would be issued for the  
46 non-guided non-residents. This area is National Wildlife  
47 Refuge, so the guides that guide there are told by the  
48 Refuge Manager how many hunters they can take, so that's  
49 already regulated, the numbers of those people. So we  
50 felt that was the best way to address this issue.

1                   So I will naturally be opposed to this  
2 proposal as well because we think we have taken action to  
3 address this problem.

4  
5                   Thank you, Madame Chair.

6  
7                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I think that  
8 was a gesture that you would like to speak, Andrew?

9  
10                  MR. FIRMIN: No.

11  
12                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, it was not.  
13 Okay.

14  
15                  Council, more discussion.

16  
17  
18                  (No comments)

19  
20  
21                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Are we really  
22 going to be this quiet.

23  
24                  MR. GLANZ: If no more discussion, I call  
25 for the question.

26  
27                  MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. If we may, we  
28 did have our Council member Larry Williams from Venetie  
29 who was able to join us a little bit this morning.

30  
31                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

32  
33                  MS. PATTON: He did have to step out for  
34 a medical appointment. He had emergency surgery on  
35 Sunday. I just wanted to check back in online if he was  
36 able to join us again.

37  
38                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
39 Larry, are you online?

40  
41                  (No comments)

42  
43                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Larry, if you  
44 are online, you need to press \*6 to come back.

45  
46                  (No comments)

47  
48                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Larry  
49 had emergency surgery recently, so he's healing. Okay.  
50 You called for the question, but there is one thing I

1 would like to say.

2

3 I think it's very important, you know,  
4 that people are respectful of each other. I think it's  
5 very important that subsistence users are respectful of  
6 other hunters and I think other hunters -- it's very  
7 important to be respectful to subsistence users. That's  
8 what makes our job hard.

9

10 I know we have Arctic Village, Venetie,  
11 Fort Yukon and Chalkyitsik was the village that would get  
12 subsistence only and everyone else is out. When I look  
13 at this picture, I look at the distance for these  
14 villages to be able to get to that area and it looks like  
15 it would potentially hardly be anyone go out there. And  
16 then I think about who are we leaving out in this  
17 proposal. Who would be left out. I think that this is  
18 more drastic than it needs to be and I know we worked  
19 hard as a Council on the other proposal.

20

21 So I just think that we should really be  
22 respectful and whenever we make hard decisions, if we  
23 make a decision that you don't agree on, I would  
24 appreciate that respect back because I don't think we're  
25 always going to agree on things and I do what I think is  
26 supposed to be right for the areas and I appreciate  
27 everybody's work on this, but we are volunteers like Bill  
28 said and we get hammered on pretty hard sometimes and  
29 it's a tough decision that we make and we don't make it  
30 lightly.

31

32 At this time I would prefer going to our  
33 Proposal 79 at the State Board and oppose this one.  
34 Virgil says he's not done. He wants to say one more  
35 little thing.

36

37 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay. What I wanted to  
38 point out is this is -- I believe all this hunting would  
39 take place in a National Wildlife Refuge. We have to  
40 remember what the mission of the National Wildlife Refuge  
41 system is. Each Refuge has their own mission, a little  
42 bit different some of them do.

43

44 We've got to remember there are  
45 congressmen, Congressman Don Young, whenever they made  
46 all these refuges back in 1980, he was our congressman  
47 then along with Senator Stevens, that's no longer with  
48 us, but they insisted whenever these refuges were made  
49 and a lot of the legislators from the Lower 48 all  
50 insisted these are National Wildlife Refuges. They

1 belong to all the people of not just Alaska, but the  
2 whole United States.

3

4 We will allow recreation on the refuges  
5 to include hunting. That was part of ANILCA, if I'm  
6 saying it right, Alaska National Interest Public Lands  
7 Act. That was part of that Act. That was debated by our  
8 senators and congressmen for the whole country. So  
9 that's something people have to think about because a lot  
10 of our issues that happen up here, like not being able to  
11 drill in the ANWR for oil, all these things have to get  
12 debated, deliberated and the decisions are made not in  
13 Alaska, but in Washington, D.C.

14

15 So the decision for hunting in these  
16 places was made there. Like several other Council  
17 members have said, what we do here, we try to be as fair  
18 as possible to everyone and that's what all of us try to  
19 do and do the best we can at doing that.

20

21 Thank you, Madame Chair.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I passed him  
24 the short version. I think I'm either blessed or I just  
25 love the sun. Council members. Eva has reminded me that  
26 -- did you say that Larry did want to speak to this?

27

28 MS. PATTON: He was interested in  
29 speaking to this.

30

31 MR. WILLIAMS: Madame Chair. This is  
32 Larry Williams. I just got back on about five minutes  
33 ago.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hey, good to  
36 hear your voice. How are you doing?

37

38 MR. WILLIAMS: Oh, Madame Chair, thank  
39 you for your concern.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, go ahead,  
42 Larry. You just got on about five minutes ago. We had -  
43 - the question was actually called for and you missed  
44 some discussion here, but go ahead, give us yours.

45

46 MR. WILLIAMS: Just give me a heads up on  
47 what was said. Maybe just a brief description.

48

49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'll do my  
50 best. We have some Council members that are opposed to

1 this, it's too restrictive and we have some that haven't  
2 really said.

3

4 That's where we're at on it.

5

6 MR. WILLIAMS: Okay. Excuse me, Madame  
7 Chair. Just when Darlene was giving her -- Darlene  
8 Herbert was giving her very moving speech about growing  
9 up there and I'm in the same boat I think on exactly what  
10 she's talking about. I'm from the same area and I speak  
11 the same language and I have the same values. Being that  
12 -- and I just talked -- when I was going over to the  
13 clinic I ran into another friend of mine. He mentioned  
14 just in passing that he's interested in restrict pretty  
15 much moose hunting, but he's talking about in the general  
16 Yukon Flats, not in that specific area. So I'm going to  
17 have to vote on my conscience and for my people and say  
18 that I support this.

19

20 Thank you.

21

22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thanks, Larry.  
23 Andrew or Lester, do you have anything to say.

24

25 MR. FIRMIN: I do. I guess I might be  
26 able to say a couple things. I think, like Larry said,  
27 on my conscience I want to support this, but the  
28 political side of me says that we need to be fair and  
29 that was why at our last meeting we developed that other  
30 proposal, the State proposal for the antler restriction.

31

32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

33

34 MR. GLANZ: Ready?

35

36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So are we ready  
37 to vote?

38

39 MR. GLANZ: Yeah.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Andrew, you  
42 need to do, I suggest, a roll call vote.

43

44 MR. FIRMIN: Okay. Roll call vote. I  
45 guess I'll start with somebody that's not here. Andy  
46 Bassich is excused. Is James Roberts on the line now?

47

48

49 (No comments)

50

1 MR. FIRMIN: Or William Koehler?  
2  
3  
4 (No comments)  
5  
6 MR. FIRMIN: He's not. Don Woodruff.  
7  
8 MR. WOODRUFF: No.  
9  
10 MR. FIRMIN: Virgil Umphenour. Virgil.  
11  
12 MR. UMPHENOUR: No.  
13  
14 MR. FIRMIN: Sue Entsminger.  
15  
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Opposed.  
17  
18 MR. FIRMIN: Andrew Firmin. I'll  
19 abstain. Larry Williams.  
20  
21 MR. WILLIAMS: Support.  
22  
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Was that in  
24 favor of the proposal?  
25  
26 MR. WILLIAMS: Yes, that was in favor of  
27 it.  
28  
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thanks, Larry.  
30  
31 MR. FIRMIN: Lester.  
32  
33 MR. ERHART: No.  
34  
35 MR. FIRMIN: And Bill Glanz.  
36  
37 MR. GLANZ: No.  
38  
39 MR. FIRMIN: So we have five opposed, one  
40 in support.  
41  
42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And one  
43 abstention.  
44  
45 MR. FIRMIN: And one abstention and three  
46 absent.  
47  
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, thank  
49 you. We are at 11:35. Should we start onto the next  
50 one, guys.

1 MR. GLANZ: Might as well.  
2  
3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
4 Proposal 51 is our next one that's up. I do have people  
5 that want to testify and I'm going to call out your names  
6 as Staff is coming forward. I have Edward Sam from  
7 Arctic Village. Hopefully you can hear me, Edward, but  
8 this won't come up until we get through all these  
9 reports. We have Jonathan John.  
10  
11 MR. SAM: I hear you.  
12  
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hi. Was that  
14 you, Edward?  
15  
16 MR. SAM: Yes, ma'am.  
17  
18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, we are  
19 now going into Proposal 51, which is the Red Sheep Creek  
20 and Cane Creek.  
21  
22 MR. SAM: Yes, ma'am.  
23  
24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hang on a  
25 second. Let me finish this and we'll go into that. We  
26 are talking about -- let's see now. Edward, you won't  
27 come up until after we discuss -- or the analysis is put  
28 forward and then it's Jonathan John, Joanne Riot -- I  
29 don't think I pronounced that right. Bryant?  
30  
31 MS. BRYANT: Bryant.  
32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Bryant?  
34 Bryant. Okay. For the first three and then there's  
35 others that will come up and we'll announce them as we  
36 go. A question by a Council member was asked of me.  
37  
38 MR. FIRMIN: I got clarification for me.  
39  
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It's on the  
41 agenda later, right?  
42  
43 MS. PATTON: Yes.  
44  
45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, okay. We  
46 handled that. Go ahead.  
47  
48 MR. MCKEE: Thank you. Again, Chris  
49 McKee with OSM. Proposal WP14-51 begins on Page 169 of  
50 your booklet. Proposal 14-51 was submitted by the State

1 of Alaska Proposal WP14-51, requests that the Red Sheep  
2 and Cane Creek drainages be opened to non-Federally  
3 qualified users August 10th through September 20th in the  
4 Arctic Village Sheep Management Area of Unit 25A, and  
5 that a person hunting within the Red Sheep Creek/Cane  
6 Creek portion of the Management Area possess proof of  
7 completion of a department-approved hunter ethics and  
8 orientation course, to include land status and trespass  
9 information, upon hunting in this area.

10  
11 The proponent states that the Red Sheep  
12 and Cane Creek drainages were closed unnecessarily and  
13 that the area was closed because of user conflicts  
14 focused mainly on issues of trespass. The Alaska Board of  
15 Game adopted an ethics and orientation course  
16 requirement to safeguard against user conflicts in this  
17 area in March of 2012. The proponent states that an  
18 ethics and orientation course would alleviate the need  
19 for closing the Red Sheep Creek and Cane Creek drainages  
20 to non-Federally qualified sheep hunting.

21  
22 There is a long regulatory history  
23 associated with the opening and closing of this area in  
24 question dating back to 1995. In January 2012, the Board  
25 adopted wildlife proposal 12-76 to close the Red Sheep  
26 and Cane Creek drainages to non-Federally qualified users  
27 for sheep hunting. Both the Eastern Interior and the  
28 North Slope Regional Advisory Councils supported this  
29 closure.

30  
31 Without going into it, we have additional  
32 regulatory history if you'd like to look at it in more  
33 detail in Appendix B on Page 186 of the analysis.

34  
35 In terms of biology, sheep surveys were  
36 conducted in 2006, 2007, 2008, and 2012 within the Red  
37 Sheep and Cane Creek drainages. Densities of sheep have  
38 remained stable with a density of 1.7 sheep/mile in 2006  
39 and 1.8 sheep/mile in 2012. In 2006, a total of 188 sheep  
40 were counted from Red Sheep and Cane  
41 Creek, while 197 sheep were counted in 2012.

42  
43 Although densities of sheep in the area  
44 are low relative to other areas in the Brooks Range, this  
45 is probably a reflection of the poor habitat quality of  
46 the area. In 2008, during a sheep population-composition  
47 survey, 130 sheep in 20 groups were observed with a ratio  
48 of 59 lambs per 100 ewes, suggesting good productivity.  
49 A 2012 survey from Red Sheep to Cane Creek counted 113  
50 ewe-like animals, 35 lambs, 35 other rams, and 14 mature

1 rams.

2

3

4                   There are significant differences in  
5 sheep abundance and distribution within the Arctic  
6 Village Sheep Management Area.  
7 Specifically, the region north of Cane Creek has  
8 supported a sheep density approximately eight times  
9 greater than the region between Crow Nest and Cane  
10 Creeks. This is probably related to differences in  
11 geology and vegetation; shale formations that occur more  
12 commonly north of Cane Creek support more vegetation and  
13 therefore more sheep.

13

14

15                   Data on reported use of the Management  
16 Area by Federally qualified users is sparse, and just how  
17 many sheep are harvested by Federally qualified  
18 subsistence users is not entirely known.  
19 Compliance with the harvest permit system is generally  
20 low for residents of Arctic Village, consistent with  
21 harvest reporting in other parts of rural Alaska. A  
22 total of six Federal permits to harvest sheep in the  
23 Management Area were issued between 1991 and 2004; none  
24 of these permits were returned. Between 2005 and 2007, 27  
25 Federal registration permits were issued; four sheep were  
26 reported harvested and 23 harvest reports were not  
27 returned. No permits were issued in 2008 and 2009. Four  
28 permits were issued in 2010 and, of these, one sheep was  
29 reported harvested.

29

30

31                   Harvest success by non-Federally  
32 qualified hunters in Red Sheep and Cane Creek drainages  
33 averaged 69 percent from 2006 to 2009. Sheep harvests  
34 under State regulations ranged from two to seven sheep  
35 annually between 2006 and 2009. However, between 2006,  
36 when the Red Sheep and Cane Creek drainages were  
37 re-opened, and 2009, a total of 18 rams were harvested by  
38 non-Federally  
39 qualified hunters.

39

40

41                   If adopted, this proposal would open the  
42 August 10th through September 20th sheep hunting season  
43 to non-Federally qualified hunters in Red Sheep and Cane  
44 Creek drainages and require all sheep hunters, including  
45 Federally qualified users, in these drainage to possess  
46 proof of completion of an ADF&G-approved hunter ethics  
47 and orientation course, thereby incorporating State  
48 regulations directly into Federal regulations. The State  
49 has not developed this course, which makes it difficult  
50 to anticipate any  
51 effects on subsistence users. Details of the State

1 course are needed prior to adopting any proposal based on  
2 such a course.

3

4                   Adopting this proposal and opening this  
5 area to non-Federally qualified users may adversely  
6 affect subsistence users access and ability to harvest  
7 sheep in the area and thereby fail to provide a  
8 meaningful preference for Federally qualified subsistence  
9 users.

10

11                   If adopted, this proposal would not  
12 affect the Dall sheep population in the proposal area.  
13 The most recent population surveys indicate good  
14 productivity of the sheep population. Allowing sheep  
15 hunting by non-Federally qualified users in these  
16 drainages is not a conservation concern because  
17 non-Federally qualified users would be limited to one  
18 full curl ram during the hunting season. A harvest of  
19 full curl rams would not be expected to reduce the  
20 productivity of this population.

21

22                   The proposal under consideration  
23 addresses the subsistence use clause of Section .815 of  
24 ANILCA, which provided the basis for the Board s action  
25 to close the area to non-Federally qualified users in  
26 2012.

27

28                   While there may be no conservation  
29 reasons to close this area to non-Federally qualified  
30 users, there are certainly reasons based on potential  
31 adverse effects to subsistence users to do so. Arctic  
32 Village residents have testified repeatedly that allowing  
33 non-Federally qualified users to harvest sheep in Red  
34 Sheep Creek and Cane Creek during the season dates  
35 adversely affects their ability to hunt in their  
36 traditional hunting area and impairs their ability to  
37 successfully harvest sheep.

38

39                   While the efforts of the proponent to  
40 require hunter education and ethics orientation are  
41 recognized as good-faith efforts, such efforts do not go  
42 far enough to assure that Arctic Village residents have  
43 continued opportunity to harvest sheep in these drainages  
44 and to receive the benefits of a subsistence priority.

45

46                   In addition, adopting this proposal would  
47 require Federally qualified subsistence users to take a  
48 State-approved hunter ethics and orientation course,  
49 which to date has not been developed. However, the State  
50 intends to work with the affected users to develop the

1 course.

2

3 The OSM preliminary conclusion is to  
4 oppose Proposal 14-51.

5

6 That's all I have for this proposal.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any questions,  
9 Council members.

10

11 (No comments)

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. No  
14 question. This is the procedure I must go through.

15

16 Comments from ADF&G.

17

18 MS. YUHAS: They're laughing already.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It keeps them  
21 awake.

22

23 MS. YUHAS: Thank you, Madame Chair. You  
24 had asked earlier about a biological presentation similar  
25 to what we gave for the moose and we went through that  
26 two years ago when we talked about the original closure.  
27 The biology hasn't changed and the biology hasn't been  
28 the issue.

29

30 When I took this job three years ago, our  
31 first wildlife cycle was two years ago. I looked at this  
32 proposal and it seemed really easy. There's no  
33 biological concern and under ANILCA .815 there's no  
34 conservation concern, so you wouldn't close it.

35

36 It seems pretty cut and dry.

37

38 I took this little -- I'm not trying to  
39 be cheesy here, but I took this little sign off my wall  
40 that I have had in every place that I've worked since  
41 1994 when I found it somewhere. It says what's popular  
42 is not always right; what's right is not always popular.  
43 I'd love to come to this meeting and be popular. I know  
44 there's a lot of things I'm going to say on this  
45 particular proposal that will make me unpopular.

46

47 I also know that when I heard testimony  
48 at the RAC meeting, at this RAC meeting two years ago,  
49 this proposal didn't look so easy anymore. Twenty people  
50 from Arctic Village and the surrounding area testify

1 about user conflicts, disrespect to their land, trespass  
2 and things that shouldn't happen and this proposal got a  
3 lot more complicated for me.

4

5                   It would have been easy to just say, oh,  
6 well, that's in the wrong arena. Trespass isn't decided  
7 by the Federal Subsistence Board. You don't go to  
8 traffic court for a divorce any more than you decide  
9 those type of legal issues here. That's an enforcement  
10 issue. That would have been easy. But I'm a public  
11 servant and a lot of times we put time and effort into  
12 things because we're trying to do what's right.

13

14                   It wasn't popular even within Fish and  
15 Game to run around trying to expedite a course for ethics  
16 and orientation to try and bring that to the Board of  
17 Game out of cycle. We'd already missed the proposal  
18 comment time -- or the proposal submission time. We  
19 expedited a special agenda request change in order to  
20 adopt an ethics and orientation class because they made  
21 the case that it's not okay to go disrespect people's  
22 land. It's not okay to have these types of user  
23 conflicts. It's not okay to leave trash on someone  
24 else's allotment.

25

26                   At the same time, there wasn't a  
27 justification that the State could see under .815 for any  
28 conservation concerns. .815 is also argued by some of  
29 our friends that it is to provide for subsistence uses  
30 and the continuance of those uses and that's true. It is  
31 to provide for those things.

32

33                   We heard testimony at the Federal  
34 Subsistence Board meeting that decided this proposal that  
35 someone was unable to have their usual subsistence  
36 experience because they saw someone else in the drainage  
37 and that it wasn't their culture to hunt with someone  
38 else in the drainage. It's been an interesting  
39 intellectual argument for some of the anthropologists I  
40 respect very much and work with, but it would be  
41 precedent setting to make that new reach.

42

43                   At yesterday's meeting, OSM was very  
44 reticent to set a precedent with regard to bear baiting  
45 on a refuge because it would be new, it would be  
46 precedent. This venture into what .815 speaks to in  
47 order to try and squeeze something in to make it work  
48 because trespass is wrong and trash is wrong and  
49 disrespect is wrong, still doesn't fit within the  
50 boundaries of the Federal Subsistence Board and the .815

1 closures. They're for conservation and they're also not  
2 supposed to unduly impact other users through the  
3 restriction of access to resources.

4  
5                   There's not a conservation concern. We  
6 find this an unnecessary closure for those reasons. I  
7 know that doesn't make me popular, but the State's  
8 mission is to protect those things and at the same time  
9 try and find relief for this. So the relief that we  
10 sought through this class was because when we asked  
11 enforcement, hey, this is really your issue, why isn't  
12 somebody doing something about this, the answer we got  
13 was it's really expensive and it's really hard to go fly  
14 around, land on people. And then the first time someone  
15 is trespassing all you can do is tell them to leave  
16 whether they're in this building and they're not supposed  
17 to be here or whether they're on an allotment and they're  
18 not supposed to be there. At the first contact, all you  
19 can do is tell them to leave. They need to know where  
20 they are.

21  
22                   We modeled a course in an expedited  
23 fashion after the GMU 23 course that the pilots have to  
24 take. The details of the full course have not been  
25 developed because we're not going to put efforts into the  
26 course for an area that's not open. The Federal staff  
27 have limited resources. The State staff have limited  
28 resources and we're not going to receive that assignment  
29 until the area is actually going to be opened for use.  
30 This proposal could be adopted to take effect once the  
31 course is developed and approved. We're not going to put  
32 that effort into something that's going to be a closed  
33 area. There's too many demands on staff resources to put  
34 that effort in until the area is going to be open.

35  
36                   The intent, as Mr. McKee said, was for  
37 the State to develop that with the local users. We don't  
38 intend to write a course in a vacuum and bring it to you  
39 and say does anybody like it and have people say nobody  
40 talked to us about it. But we're not going to go through  
41 a whole scoping effort if the area is not going to be  
42 open.

43  
44                   This is our good faith effort to try and  
45 meet the Federal program halfway. We want some relief  
46 for the people that live in this area for things that are  
47 not supposed to be happening and we also need to support  
48 our constitutional mandate to provide for access on these  
49 public lands to the other residents of Alaska and not  
50 unduly impact them through the restriction of access to

1 resources.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Body English  
4 tells me you're finished.

5

6 MS. YUHAS: (Nods affirmatively)

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Thank  
9 you.

10

11 Council members, questions of the State.

12

13 (No comments)

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I have one.

16 This course that you talk about, why would it be specific  
17 to just this proposal? Why couldn't it be a statewide  
18 thing? When we come up to these types of proposals where  
19 we're going to close to all users but Federal qualified  
20 subsistence, why couldn't it be a statewide thing from  
21 Fish and Game? Because these kinds of things are going  
22 to come up.

23

24 There's lots of other places where it's  
25 closed.

26

27 MS. YUHAS: To answer the Chair's  
28 question, it could be. That has not been proposed  
29 because we haven't had the same reasons for the closures.  
30 In other areas we've had closures based on biology. It's  
31 completely understandable and nobody has a problem with  
32 that. There's no other issue we're trying to solve  
33 besides the biology and the State hasn't contested those  
34 closures.

35

36 We modeled this after the user conflict  
37 issues associated with bear baiting and associated with  
38 Unit 23. There's something else besides the biology that  
39 we're trying to solve. Usually user conflict. Not all  
40 areas that are available to bear baiting require a class  
41 before you can bait there. It's only in areas where  
42 we've had high incidence of user conflict or predicted  
43 user conflict.

44

45 So every closure to non-Federally  
46 qualified users hasn't had the land disrespect issues and  
47 the trespass issues that we're experiencing here, so  
48 we're not trying to solve something else. It could be  
49 proposed. The Department didn't choose to do that  
50 because we think there would be too much backlash in the

1 other areas. Folks would say why do I have to take a  
2 class, there's no user conflicts there, but here there  
3 is.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: But my  
6 simplistic mind tells me that I see something wonderful  
7 that could happen to bring this respect that I think is  
8 deeply needed in this state of Alaska. The kinds of  
9 things that are happening that was mentioned by one of  
10 the testifiers that is bad, that's what gives a black eye  
11 to this -- you know, people that aren't subsistence and  
12 then there's other things that happen that gives the  
13 black eye the other way. So I think the State of Alaska  
14 needs to be thinking about this with the Federal program  
15 that there probably is something that we need to work out  
16 to where we are building respect because I don't see it.

17

18 MS. YUHAS: I greatly appreciate those  
19 comments, Madame Chair, and I hope that this board would  
20 use that as justification to adopt this proposal to give  
21 us a pilot program and if we show success, perhaps this  
22 can be expanded statewide.

23

24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm still  
25 thinking on the idea of something that's a statewide  
26 thing, but what I'm hearing from you is you just have to  
27 work on that proposal with those people to do this -- had  
28 you come up with something that -- you had come up with  
29 something with that, but the Board wouldn't take it up?

30

31 MS. YUHAS: So what I came up with was  
32 the expedited other option. So this was a Federal  
33 proposal two years ago to close the area. The State  
34 opposed the closure. They said isn't there another way  
35 we could do this. So we put the extra time and effort  
36 into coming up with the idea for a course to be required.  
37 The Board of Game did adopt that course, but it was two  
38 months after the Federal Subsistence Board already met.

39

40 So in the motion to go ahead and close  
41 the area, Mr. Haskett put on the record the State hasn't  
42 really adopted this. We don't know if they will or not  
43 when they meet, so since you don't have one in place, was  
44 part of the justification to say let's just close it  
45 because there's user conflicts there and some other  
46 issues. Two months after that decision the Board of Game  
47 did pass it.

48

49 So I had heard at a meeting earlier this  
50 summer nothing has changed, Jennifer. Well, something

1 did change between January of 2011 and March of 2011.  
2 The State Board took action. That's new information  
3 since the last time the Federal Subsistence Board made a  
4 decision.

5  
6 MR. JAMES: Do you want to hand me that  
7 string.

8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I hear a voice  
10 out there, but I didn't hear who it was. Is that Larry?

11  
12 MR. JAMES: Is this discussion on Red  
13 Sheep?

14  
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Who's the  
16 voice, please? Keep pushing \*6. Just push \*6 so I can  
17 hear your voice and stay on.

18  
19 MR. JAMES: Yes, this is Gideon James.  
20 Is this discussion on Red Sheep Creek?

21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: This is our  
23 reports, Gideon. You are signed up to testify to this  
24 and we will have you -- put your thought down on paper  
25 and you'll bring it forward when I call on you, okay.

26  
27 MR. JAMES: Okay.

28  
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you. Now  
30 you get to push \*6 again. Board members -- Council  
31 members. This is the Council member's chance to ask  
32 questions of the people that brought forth their reports.

33  
34 MR. JAMES: Who is that, some kind of  
35 judge?

36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, I'm the  
38 judge. Here come the judge. Watch out.

39  
40 (Laughter)

41  
42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Push \*6 because  
43 I heard you.

44  
45 MR. JAMES: Sorry.

46  
47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Donald, go  
48 ahead.

49  
50 MR. WOODRUFF: I d like to echo your

1 comments about hunter ethics and I think it actually  
2 should be in the manual, in our hunting manuals and that  
3 everybody should be able to read that and understand it,  
4 you know.

5  
6 You don't disrespect other people and  
7 their space.

8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: SO keep that  
10 thought for our discussion, okay. Any questions of the  
11 presenters.

12  
13 (No comments)

14  
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We're  
16 moving on. Right now I'm looking for agency comments.  
17 This was Fish and Game. The next would be any Federal  
18 agencies with agency comments. Hollis, did you have  
19 some? Because this is where you would bring them. For  
20 the Refuge, right? This is Federal agencies comments.

21  
22 MR. TWITCHELL: Yes, this is Hollis  
23 Twitchell, Arctic Refuge assistant manager and I wasn't  
24 planning to present any testimony, but if there were  
25 questions from the Council I would speak to it. I will  
26 just say a couple of points before I open the mic. I  
27 spent much of August and a good portion of September the  
28 summer before last based out of Red Sheep Creek and about  
29 a quarter of my August and early September moving through  
30 in and out of Red Sheep Creek, Cane Creek these last two  
31 years, so I can speak to that if you have any questions  
32 regarding some of the issues that have been raised here.

33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Are there any  
35 questions of Hollis. The reason I brought you forward  
36 was last time we talked about this you missed that for  
37 your report and I just wanted to make sure I didn't miss  
38 you. If you want to summarize something, I'm happy to do  
39 that. Any comments or -- Virgil has a question. What  
40 would you like to do?

41  
42 MR. TWITCHELL: Virgil first.

43  
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, Virgil.

45  
46 MR. UMPHENOUR: I'd like Hollis to  
47 summarize what happened two years ago when you were there  
48 and you spent a month and a half. Just a brief summary  
49 of how many local and non-local hunters you saw and  
50 whether there was any way these people even would know

1 what was private property and what wasn't other than  
2 going to BLM and to the Native allotment place and  
3 finding it out.

4

5 MR. TWITCHELL: Thank you, Virgil. The  
6 reason we decided to go there was beyond just the  
7 potential conflicts and concerns that were reported at  
8 the meeting. It was also extended because the State  
9 regulation booklet had removed the map depiction for that  
10 particular game management unit, that Arctic Sheep  
11 Management Area was there and was something that hunters  
12 should be aware about. T

13

14 hat following year that particular  
15 depiction was removed from their regulation booklet,  
16 which made it considerably more difficult for State,  
17 general and sport hunters to know by looking at the map  
18 for that game management area that it was different in  
19 some respect, that there was some special management  
20 area. Because it was removed and the action taken to re-  
21 close those two drainages, Cane Creek and Red Sheep  
22 Creek, it made it particularly challenging for hunters to  
23 look in the State reg book and see that something was  
24 there in terms of special management.

25

26 Because of that, the decision was made  
27 that we would have a particular emphasis in those two  
28 drainages the summer before last. That's why we based  
29 out of there. And we did have some issues that occurred  
30 there during that summer. We only had one point of  
31 trespass on a private Native allotment, which we moved  
32 the individuals off of there. They were unaware of the  
33 private land status there down at the confluence of Red  
34 Sheep Creek. They willingly had moved right on, so there  
35 was no aspect of them hunting. W

36

37 e did have hunters fly in the upper end  
38 of Red Sheep Creek late at night, 10:00 o'clock, to go  
39 hunting the next day and, indeed, they were up there  
40 hunting first light in the top end of Red Sheep Creek.  
41 It took two or three hours for us to finally locate them  
42 and communicate with them by dropping notes, informing  
43 them of where they were. Fortunately, when they came  
44 back down, they hadn't taken anything, they didn't know  
45 they were in a closed area. They had been hunting over  
46 on the next drainage and were unsuccessful there and had  
47 flown over and saw sheep and subsequently moved their  
48 group of three hunters and two aircraft over. They left  
49 the area after being contacted.

50

1                   The air taxis that were bringing in  
2 clients were very good about informing their clients if  
3 they accessed into Red Sheep Creek's main airstrip to  
4 hunt outside of the area. So I'd have to give credit to  
5 our commercial air taxi operators did a very good job of  
6 informing their clients who were accessing into the lower  
7 parts of those drainages that they were not eligible to  
8 be hunting locally. So we had good compliance on the  
9 aspect of the commercial operators coming in. So the  
10 biggest challenges were the Alaska hunters who may not  
11 have heard about the closures and had not seen the  
12 posters that we put up at our hub communities, nor did  
13 not hear the public press that we put out that those two  
14 drainages were closed.

15  
16                   So that's what happened in the first  
17 year. We had no local individuals hunting up in Red  
18 Sheep Creek and Cane Creek that year. Water levels were  
19 very, very low and access to Red Sheep Creek was nearly  
20 impossible by any water crafts, so the only way to get  
21 would have been by air and we didn't have anyone coming  
22 into those particular drainages in the fall hunt. That's  
23 not to say they didn't go up there in the wintertime, but  
24 in the fall hunt we didn't have anyone present that  
25 summer.

26  
27                   This summer, when I was in the drainage,  
28 we did have a local hunter, I believe he's going to  
29 testify here a little bit later in public comments, was  
30 hunting in that area. Again, the air taxis were the most  
31 successful in providing the information to the clients  
32 who were dropped off in Red Sheep Creek, which we had  
33 multiple parties. I'm guessing somewhere in the  
34 neighborhood of eight to ten parties that were dropped  
35 off in there by a commercial air taxi operators and those  
36 people hiked up drainage or crossed over to the other  
37 side of the East Fork, outside of the area.

38  
39                   So they continued to use the area as a  
40 point of access for getting into that region and hunters  
41 are going up above and have been successful in taking  
42 sheep in the drainages just north of Red Sheep Creek.  
43 We've had a number of other recreational other people  
44 just traveling through the area, but no issues or  
45 concerns with them with trespass or trash or anything  
46 like that. They were just back country users traveling  
47 through the area.

48  
49                   With this, I'm going to just close and if  
50 you have questions I'll try to answer them.

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any other  
2 questions.  
3  
4 (No comments)  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thanks, Hollis.  
7  
8 MR. UMPHENOUR: I want to ask one.  
9  
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It sounds like  
11 one question left. Sorry.  
12  
13 MR. UMPHENOUR: So there were some people  
14 dropped off that were just out there hiking and rock  
15 hunting or taking pictures, looking at flowers and  
16 stuff?  
17  
18 MR. TWITCHELL: Yes, there were. We had  
19 hikers the first year coming across from Spring Creek,  
20 which is a substantial multiple drainages to the west and  
21 came through. We also had this year a number of hikers  
22 who were dropped off and were hiking through the area.  
23 I initially had seen them in the drainage and I didn't  
24 see any rifle with them, so I had made a call to my other  
25 officer. Unknowing to me, I was broadcasting on the  
26 radio outside of our own frequencies and Kirk Sweetsir  
27 came back on the air saying, yes, indeed, he had just  
28 dropped those clients off and they were hiking through  
29 Cane Creek drainage and they were going to do a  
30 circumnavigation coming out Red Sheep Creek. So, again,  
31 Kirk, the air taxi operator, cleared the issue right away  
32 that they were not hunting, they were recreating in the  
33 area.  
34  
35 MR. UMPHENOUR: Do you think some of the  
36 conflicts from the trash and etcetera it gets blamed on  
37 sheep hunters could be from other people that aren't  
38 really sheep hunters?  
39  
40 MR. TWITCHELL: Could very well be. What  
41 happens, people fly through and they see an airstrip from  
42 the air and if they need to stop for breaks or refueling  
43 or others, they do that. We had hunters who later came  
44 into Red Sheep Creek who were scouting the area before  
45 the hunting season and stopped just at Red Sheep Creek  
46 big airstrip to refuel. We talked to them there and they  
47 were well informed that they couldn't hunt in the area.  
48  
49 I've had other instances of  
50 recreationalists, one of the trespass individuals on the

1 Native allotment, was actually on their way through and  
2 got weathered in, saw this landing airstrip, landed on it  
3 and subsequently I came through later that next morning  
4 and contacted them. They were not intending to hunt  
5 there. They were trying to get over the Brooks Range,  
6 saw this airstrip, landed, camped there. They were  
7 intending to go fishing.

8

9 But, you're correct, we have a variety of  
10 people coming in for other uses beyond just the hunting  
11 aspect. Although I will say that every year I've been in  
12 there I see the Super Cubs flying along the ridge tops.  
13 Whether they're intending to hunt in the area or just  
14 scouting for sheep as they look for an area to hunt in,  
15 there is aircraft and they do fly along the ridges of  
16 mountains for observation of where sheep are. So that  
17 activity will continue whether it's closed or open.

18

19 MR. UMPHENOUR: Thank you, Madame Chair.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: The short  
22 version was yes. I always tease Virgil about the short  
23 version. So, yes, other people are using the area. All  
24 right. Next is any Native, tribal, villages would like  
25 to speak, entities for comments that aren't with the  
26 public testimony. Are you with one of the villages?

27

28 MR. JOHN: Yes. Jonathan John, Arctic  
29 Village.

30

31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. You had  
32 signed up on the public testimony. Would you like to do  
33 that there?

34

35 MS. PATTON: He's with the Arctic  
36 Council.

37

38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Arctic Council.  
39 Go ahead.

40

41 MR. JOHN: My name is Jonathan John. I'm  
42 the second chief of Arctic Village Council. One of the  
43 first things I'd like to say is that in the whole thing  
44 in general with the animals around our area, like  
45 caribou, moose, sheep, whatever. In this last couple  
46 years there's a lot of strange things going on. Our  
47 caribou doesn't slowly get by like they used to. They  
48 just rush, rush, and they don't wait. There are so many  
49 wolves and they're a big pack and they've never been  
50 trapped, so they're getting bigger and bigger. They're

1 chasing these caribou all over, even in January where we  
2 don't even see them on the mountain before and they'll be  
3 way up in these sharp mountains and stuff like that.

4

5                   And then this year we notice all our  
6 trees. I think maybe climate change stuff. We have big  
7 clutters of pine cones. Almost every other tree I'm  
8 seeing it in our village, so it must be something in the  
9 air or something in the ground that cause something like  
10 that I've never seen. I mean every tree must have pine  
11 cones, I mean a clutter of them on top.

12

13                   In the village I do different things, but  
14 one of the things that I have done was my grandma -- I  
15 was raised with my grandma and grandpa and when I was 12  
16 she gave me a card and say that -- told me happy  
17 birthday, now you're a man. You know how to get work,  
18 you know how to haul wood with us, you know how to take  
19 care of dogs and you know how to shoot and kill caribous  
20 and skin them, pack them back. You're a man now. That's  
21 what they told me when I was 12. These days, when I look  
22 at 12-year-olds, wow, women, they like something like  
23 that. I didn't know that.

24

25                   Well, the thing that I testify again,  
26 again and again for our Red Sheep. Just give us a  
27 number. It's talking about, what, 35 rams. Well, these  
28 rams, you know, they get 40, 50 year old before they get  
29 to be a ram and that's one of the honorable things that  
30 when our people taking one of them they really respect  
31 the animal. Those animal, when they live long, even a  
32 big lake trout, they live about 30, 40 years before they  
33 get really big like a king salmon and they're respected  
34 also.

35

36                   The Red Sheep Creek, they mention about  
37 airports. Airports. There's a strip where you can land.  
38 Well, they only say one, but they made a second. They  
39 added another airport further west because all the sheep  
40 in the mountain range move back and then because this  
41 airport is so busy they're chasing the sheep back. And  
42 then there's another airport on the way back down that  
43 way and they are building another one when they will  
44 close that. So these are happening. They're building  
45 airports out there by themselves and giving them to them.

46

47

48                   How long will they sustain? I don't  
49 think 35 ram is going to sustain. They're talking about  
50 from 2006 to 2009 they took about three, four, five rams.

1 Well, in 15 years all 35 will be gone and that's a fact.  
2 And their diet consists also some -- that's why they call  
3 them red sheep. They eat the red salt or red rocks, red  
4 zinc and that's -- they found them on a certain mountain.  
5 The other mountain doesn't have it, only there. So  
6 they're getting chased back away from it. That's not a  
7 good thing.

8

9                   When we talk about hunting, I never know  
10 hunting was recreation. I thought hunting was for  
11 survival, to get your meat. That's hunting. I don't go  
12 out there and play at hunting. I don't do that. That's  
13 the kind of thing that I don't like to see, but it's  
14 written down in law, but we have to live with it.

15

16                   Also when -- Red Sheep Creek is connected  
17 to Cane Creek. Cane Creek connected to Junjik, Junjik  
18 connected to the haul road. So one of these days when  
19 they open something up, then they'll have access in there  
20 from the haul road and then we're really going to have  
21 big -- they'll all be gone.

22

23                   You know, a big territory in Arctic  
24 Village, we're in a big valley and on our east side, on  
25 our west side there's mountain. One time when the  
26 hunters come, they fly right in and refuel and stuff, but  
27 now they don't. They go right straight into their camp  
28 away where we don't even see the airplane. They sneak  
29 around those mountains and get way up right into the pass  
30 of the caribou migration.

31

32                   Last year, a couple years, I really got  
33 angry. We didn't know there was a hunting season started  
34 10 days before we even (indiscernible) and they already  
35 got those caribou and the caribou did not even make it to  
36 Arctic Village. There's things going around all over.

37

38                   It's really getting hard. When they say  
39 there's sheep hunting on the Red Sheep Creek, it's just  
40 like that's only millionaires can afford to go there  
41 sometime because we have to pull our boat through the  
42 shallow water day and day until we get close, then we  
43 have to pack it all in, pack our camp in to make base  
44 camp and then from there we go hunting. From there we  
45 pack down with dogs and stuff and that's how they usually  
46 do it. They had to have dogs them days to do packing and  
47 all that. So nowadays it's kind of difficult. Our gas  
48 price is \$10 a gallon and to go up that way you're going  
49 to spend \$500 on one way. It costs lots for us.

50

1                   We can't use stuff like airports,  
2 airstrips they're building. They are building them.  
3 They are sneaking them in. One of our plan -- one of our  
4 initiative thing to do is have a village-wide party of --  
5 well, a village-wide initiative to send some of our  
6 hunters up there next summer. That's one of the things  
7 that we're trying to sponsor and those are one of the  
8 things that we want to be into this permit and stuff so  
9 we have some records. Also educate the young ones about  
10 our sheep.

11  
12                   That's about all I have to say right now.  
13 Thank you.

14  
15                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,  
16 Jonathan.

17  
18                   Council members, any questions.

19  
20                   (No comments)

21  
22                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We are -  
23 - I have 12:16, but let me see if I can get quickly these  
24 reports down to public testimony and then public  
25 testimony will start after we break for lunch, okay. We  
26 haven't had anything from InterAgency Staff Committee for  
27 comments. Sometimes I wonder why this is on here.

28  
29                   At any rate, Advisory Committees.

30  
31                   MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. We have no  
32 comments from State Advisory Committees. We do have a  
33 comment from the North Slope Regional Advisory Council  
34 that took this proposal up. The Village of Kaktovik does  
35 have C&T determination for sheep in this area. They  
36 noted that that village -- you know, it's difficult to  
37 access the area. They don't hunt in that area often, but  
38 they do have C&T and the Council voted unanimously to  
39 oppose this proposal and noted on the record that in the  
40 past Fenton Rexford, who is from the Village of Kaktovik  
41 and was the chair of that Council in the past had spoken  
42 at length to this concern when it was taken up before.  
43 So, again, the North Slope Regional Advisory Council had  
44 voted to oppose this proposal and that's it for formal  
45 comments.

46  
47                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And written  
48 comments.

49  
50                   MS. PATTON: Summary of written comments.

1 We had just one written comment submitted by Donald  
2 Woodruff as a public member. Also said to not support.  
3 As a RAC member we met in this area and dealt with sheep  
4 in this area over and over again. The current  
5 regulations are good and have sound reasoning with years  
6 of discussions with the people of this area. The people  
7 of Arctic Village depend on this resource and the State  
8 fails to listen to their testimony. That was from Donald  
9 Woodruff as a public member.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Donald gets to  
12 talk twice. Okay. That's it for all the written  
13 comments. We have public testimony next. Hang on one  
14 second. Gideon, if you're still online, you're going to  
15 be the first one on this, then Darlene, Sarah, Ed Sam.  
16 Ed, I could take you right after Gideon if you like. Do  
17 you two hear me? Because you're both online.

18

19 MR. SAM: Can I be the first one? I've  
20 been waiting too long.

21

22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Do you  
23 guys want to hear him before we go? Let's hear Edward  
24 before we break. We have two people online and, Edward,  
25 will you go ahead right now because you guys have been  
26 online a long time and I appreciate you hanging on there.  
27 Gideon, you're welcome to do it and then we're going to  
28 break for lunch. I have to give you five minutes like I  
29 did the last guys. So if you can do it in five minutes,  
30 Edward, I'd really appreciate it.

31

32 Thank you.

33

34 MR. SAM: Thank you Madame Chair. Do you  
35 hear me?

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Very well.

38

39 MR. SAM: May I please the Board or the  
40 Council members. My name is Edward Sam. I lived all my  
41 life in Arctic Village. This is a brief history of  
42 Arctic Village Sheep Management. In 1975 I was elected  
43 first council and one of the first letters we got in the  
44 council was a letter from Arctic National Wildlife  
45 Refuge, Glen Kerr, giving us the obligation to outline  
46 the area where our ancestors have selected and a brief  
47 history of how we outlined the area. It's just not for  
48 the sheep. It's for our great great grandmother, on the  
49 north side of Red Sheep Creek. We've got historic burial  
50 sites, families from here, families from Canada, like Old

1 Crow.

2

3 I am the co-founder. There are three of  
4 us that outlined it, two deceased and I'm the only one  
5 surviving the statements. I have seen a lot of changes  
6 in 1973 to present day, like flying from my community of  
7 Arctic Village to Fairbanks, over White Mountain. I used  
8 to see a lot of sheep. At present day there are so few  
9 in there. That's like the drainage of the Wind River or  
10 the Chandalar River, East Fork Chandalar.

11

12 There used to be plenty of sheep that the  
13 older people talk to us about, Dall sheep, when there is  
14 no animal around or the hunting is scarce, we'll be  
15 dependent on. When the caribou is not migrating to our  
16 community, we have to depend on sheep. Matter of fact  
17 there's no caribou this winter in the valley of Arctic  
18 Village area. The meat is so scarce and I don't like to  
19 hunt from the Native store either when there's sheep that  
20 I could hunt. Matter of fact I'm going hunting in two  
21 weeks depending on the condition of the ice in the river.

22

23 I have hunted sheep for the past 85 years  
24 or seasons. We have to hunt further into the mountain  
25 because there have been too many traffics or people  
26 hiking through there. You can understand the sheep have  
27 10 times more visual power than human beings. They could  
28 hear you two miles downdraft or updraft. They can smell  
29 you for three miles. So it's kind of hard when you have  
30 to go charter a plane and you have to hike 10 miles into  
31 the mountain and sometimes you get nothing. It's kind of  
32 sad when you have to travel that far.

33

34 The other issue is on the south side of  
35 the Continental Divide. I'm helping the Fish and  
36 Wildlife monitoring aircraft, rafters, hikers at Red  
37 Sheep Creek area in 1994. From Jerry Jakes hunting, the  
38 guiding service, he emphasized that -- he told me that  
39 there is already three landing area outside the  
40 Continental Divide. My understanding is why are there so  
41 many landing area in that area north of Red Sheep Creek  
42 which we depend on? You know, it's kind of hard when you  
43 have to compete with hunters, both hunters. They got  
44 more access. We don't. Actually I save maybe \$100 a  
45 month just to make this trip every year.

46

47 So I am supporting a permanent closure to  
48 Red Sheep Creek area. Respect our burial sites, our  
49 ancestors. We see there's some people going up there  
50 trampling the area. The sheep are not used to that kind

1 of stuff.

2

3 I'd like to close for now. It's almost  
4 four minutes. I'd like to answer any questions.

5

6 Thank you.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Edward, I sure  
9 appreciate it. Thank you.

10

11 Do we have any questions of Edward by the  
12 Council.

13

14 (No comments)

15

16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We do not,  
17 Edward, and thank you. Thanks for hanging on there so  
18 long. Gideon, are you still on? Would you like to  
19 testify now? \*6.

20

21 MR. JAMES: Hello. Can you hear me?

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes, perfectly.  
24 Go ahead. Would you like to testify now?

25

26 MR. JAMES: Yes. I want to testify more  
27 on the sheep hunting area of Red Sheep Creek. Before I  
28 continue, I m listening to people that are saying this is  
29 a public access land, which may be true, which may be  
30 true. It's also stated in there that when you go to this  
31 area you respect the local people heritage areas, just  
32 like Mr. Sam was saying or Darlene Herbert were saying.  
33 We're not greedy. We're not greedy like a big company,  
34 big corporation company.

35

36 A pilot -- there's a guide that testified  
37 that -- he comment on the flying of the airlines and  
38 which may be true, but what we're talking about is  
39 private aircraft that sneaks around low in the valley and  
40 disturbs all the animals around. Our hunters see these  
41 aircraft and you have to believe. You have to believe  
42 these things are happening. These are happening while  
43 the goddamn planes are (indiscernible). So we have to  
44 get things in order where this has to stop.

45

46 I hear the testimony by Jonathan John  
47 about wolf control, wolf problem. Those kind of things  
48 need to be addressed instead of welcoming more people  
49 into the area. This is good if we have local people  
50 input for wolf control, then we'll have something going.

1 We'll have migration that's free from disturbance. Stuff  
2 like that needs to happen. Not welcome more people into  
3 the area where they find their way out and they find  
4 their way in.

5  
6 I sit here and listen to these  
7 testimonies. Some of them are good. Some of them are  
8 bad. I'm pretty sure if he or she also live in this area  
9 all their life and raise their family in order to make a  
10 point like we are making.

11  
12 Thank you.

13  
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you very  
15 much, Gideon, both you and Edward for hanging in there.

16  
17 Council members, any questions of Gideon.

18  
19 (No comments)

20  
21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Thanks  
22 again, Gideon. Your comments are well heard. I write my  
23 little notes down here.

24  
25 Thank you, both you and Edward.

26  
27 All right. Council members, how long do  
28 you want for lunch. 12:25. How much time -- do you want  
29 an hour and 15? An hour and 15 minutes puts us -- I  
30 can't even do my math -- quarter to 2:00. Okay, quarter  
31 to 2:00 we'll be back.

32  
33 Enjoy your lunch.

34  
35 (Off record)

36  
37 (On record)

38  
39 MR. SAM: Arctic Village.

40  
41 MS. PATTON: I'm sorry. Could you repeat  
42 your name again. I couldn't hear.

43  
44 MR. SAM: Edward Sam, Arctic Village.

45  
46 MS. PATTON: Oh, okay, Edward. Ed Sam,  
47 Arctic Village. Do we have anyone else joining us on  
48 teleconference at this time?

49  
50 MR. LIEBICH: Trend Liebich, OSM in

1 Anchorage.

2

3 MS. PATTON: Good afternoon, Trent. We  
4 have some public testimony this afternoon on wildlife  
5 proposals and we should be getting to the fisheries  
6 updates a little later after the wildlife, so it might be  
7 a little bit yet here for that.

8

9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: But the  
10 wildlife proposals for you out there are not the ones  
11 that we just took up. They are if we take up anything  
12 from the Board of Game. Who else is out there?

13

14 MR. SHARP: Dan Sharp with BLM.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anyone else?

17

18 MR. BERG: Jerry Berg with Fish and  
19 Wildlife Service.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anyone else?

22

23 MR. ROBERTS: James Roberts in Tanana.

24

25 MS. PATTON: Good afternoon, James.

26

27 Thank you for joining us.

28

29 MR. ROBERTS: I've been having a hard  
30 time. I can't hear anybody.

31

32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You can't hear  
33 anybody? This is Sue.

34

35 MR. ROBERTS: I mean the phones are  
36 really messed up right now.

37

38 MR. ERHART: Ask him how cold is it.

39

40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Lester wants to  
41 know how cold it is out there.

42

43 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: -23.

44

45 MR. ROBERTS: It's about 25 now.

46

47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: What?

48

49 MR. FIRMIN: 25.

50

1                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: 25? I'm sorry,  
2 James, I talked over you. Was it 25 below?  
3  
4                   MR. ROBERTS: Yes, ma'am.  
5  
6                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Gotcha. Hey,  
7 listen, we'll try to get people to speak closer to the  
8 mic. I'm sorry it's hard to hear. So right now we're  
9 going into public testimony for Proposal 51. We just  
10 took up two people that were on teleconference from  
11 Arctic Village.  
12  
13                   MR. ROBERTS: I couldn't get -- along --  
14 last I heard was -- that's the last time I talked with  
15 you guys.  
16  
17                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You are  
18 breaking up. What phone system are you.....  
19  
20                   MR. ROBERTS: I know. I think I need to  
21 be excuse because I just can't hear.  
22  
23                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Did you say you  
24 want to be excused because you just can't follow along?  
25  
26                   MR. ROBERTS: Well, I can't hear you guys  
27 and I can't -- so I'm just helpless out here.  
28  
29                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Are we breaking  
30 up like you are?  
31  
32                   MR. ROBERTS: Yes, you are.  
33  
34                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It must be your  
35 phone system, huh?  
36  
37                   MR. ROBERTS: It is. We're having a lot  
38 of trouble today.  
39  
40                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
41  
42                   MR. ROBERTS: So I'll just try to listen,  
43 but don't call on me for anything. I'll just keep  
44 trying.  
45  
46                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right. Did  
47 you say don't call?  
48  
49                   MR. ROBERTS: Yeah, because I can't hear  
50 you and I can't communicate effectively.

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
2 Okay.  
3  
4 MR. ROBERTS: All right. Thank you.  
5  
6 MS. PATTON: Thank you, James. Thank you  
7 for hanging in there.  
8  
9 MR. SUMMERS: Clarence Summers, National  
10 Park Service.  
11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Clarence  
13 Summers on from National Park Service. Anyone else?  
14  
15 (No comments)  
16  
17 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. I did try to  
18 reach Larry Williams and was not able to get through. I  
19 don't know if he's back at the doctor. He was hoping to  
20 join when he can for completing this proposal.  
21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Larry, are you  
23 on? Larry Williams.  
24  
25 (No comments)  
26  
27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I'm  
28 pretty sure he understands to speak up when he comes on.  
29 All right. We're coming back and the first one is  
30 Darlene Herbert to speak for public testimony. Is  
31 Darlene here?  
32  
33 (No comments)  
34  
35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. She's  
36 not here. We will call on her later to make sure that  
37 she has a chance. The next one is Sarah James. This is  
38 a difficult thing for me to request, but I do have to  
39 request try to keep it at five minutes. You will have a  
40 chance for questions. Oh, don't you worry about that  
41 time. We'll take care of it for you. Okay, go ahead.  
42  
43 MS. JAMES: My name is Sarah James. I  
44 live all my life in Arctic Village and Salmon River and  
45 along the Yukon to Birch Creek and up Junjik River and  
46 Wind River and Chandalar East Fork. I was raised with my  
47 parents. They never work for anything. They always  
48 subsist. That s how I was raised. One of them that we  
49 especially favorite to do or able to do is to go sheep  
50 hunting.

1                   To my people, the sheep are very sacred,  
2 just like all the other life. We use every part of it,  
3 just like we do to caribou, that's what we do to moose,  
4 even rabbit. Everything we use off the land we try to  
5 make use of every part of it. We don't waste from any  
6 animal that we use for food or clothing or tools. That's  
7 the way it was with sheep.

8  
9                   Before our first visitor came, we were  
10 nomadic people and lived wherever we need to gather food  
11 and settle for one whole winter in the various area and  
12 never at the same place. Now we have to be in the same  
13 place because our children had to go to school. So it's  
14 quite hard to reach Red Sheep Creek from Arctic Village.  
15 You've got to fly in and then, when we do get sheep meat,  
16 we can't fly it back out because nobody want to carry  
17 subsistence food, so we had to manage to make it back to  
18 the village with it for our traditional use and for our  
19 medicine.

20  
21                   There's various parts of the animals that  
22 we use for medicine. Somebody about to die asks for  
23 something, we go get it and we feed it to them and they  
24 were up and talking again. We always offer that food.  
25 So sheep is very much like that. Sheep takes a long time  
26 to be a ram. Lake trout in Old John Lake take a long  
27 time to be a lake trout. So to have that respect when we  
28 were living in a skin hut, we bring it in from the back  
29 door. Those two we have respect for them that way.

30  
31                   We want our visitor be able to survive  
32 and respect in our ways because we survived for many  
33 years, thousands of years we survived in this place,  
34 harsh cold winter and very distant. We're a distant  
35 people. So subsistence is a special thing and I cannot  
36 imagine people vote against subsistence. Earlier I  
37 forgot to say that when we were talking about moose, in  
38 that area I have allotment, so I haven't given up on that  
39 allotment yet. I haven't given up on any of our  
40 traditional ground or any of us are that way because  
41 that's where we came from.

42  
43                   So Red Sheep Creek, there s no other Red  
44 Sheep Creek in the world. There's only one and because  
45 it had a red streak in the back from that red mineral  
46 that they lick on, so it's very special to us. One time  
47 they shot the one with a cross on it, red cross, so that  
48 was very special to us. And we have a medicine rock into  
49 that Red Sheep Creek and Cane Creek and we have a lot of  
50 fossil within that area that we like to keep it. It's a

1 medicine for us. It's a footprint of our grandfather and  
2 grandmother.

3

4                   There's a graveyard there too. My sister  
5 got an allotment right in the Red Sheep Creek so the  
6 whole family are entitled to that, just like I'm entitled  
7 to one the other side Salmon River. There used to be a  
8 whole village in the Salmon River. All that is history.  
9 All that is who we are. We're not going to walk away  
10 from it. Our ancestors, our grandma and grandpa put a  
11 lot of footsteps and a lot of work and talked to us about  
12 it. We want to keep it that way.

13

14                   You know, there's no place in the world  
15 where a sport hunter is kept out for sheep hunting. This  
16 is the only place in the world. If this sheep is gone,  
17 we're never going to see a red sheep. Red Sheep Creek.  
18 That would be bad for our history, just like it did to  
19 buffalo, you name it. I can't imagine how people can  
20 just overlook that just for a job. I can't believe that  
21 people from the other side of the world or other places  
22 making decision for people that live here for thousands  
23 of years and respect that.

24

25                   You know, we're not wealthy either.  
26 We're wealthy in our land and our ways and of who we are  
27 and we're proud of that. I'm just really proud of being  
28 a Gwich'in because I still can speak my language. I  
29 still can have my traditional food and I still can walk  
30 my traditional ground and drink the water from the creek  
31 and get to look at aurora.

32

33                   Thank you.

34

35                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,

36 Sarah.

37

38                   Any questions of Sarah.

39

40                   (No comments)

41

42                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you very  
43 much.

44

45                   MS. JAMES: No questions?

46

47                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It doesn't look  
48 like it.

49

50                   MS. JAMES: I'm not moving until somebody

1 asks me a question.

2

3 (Laughter)

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That would be  
6 my philosophy too. Good job. Thank you. Next. I don't  
7 see Darlene.

8

9 Is Darlene Herbert back?

10

11 (No comments)

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Next is  
14 Joanne Bryant. Excuse me.

15

16 They wanted to speak together and they'll  
17 each use their five minutes, so go ahead. Introduce  
18 yourself.

19

20 MS. BRYANT: Can you hear me?

21

22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.

23

24 MS. BRYANT: Hello. My name is Joanne  
25 Bryant and I'm speaking as Gwich'in Athabascan and an  
26 individual from Arctic Village. I am not representing  
27 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service or any other agencies.

28

29 Today I want to briefly share about why  
30 I am opposing opening the Red Sheep and Cane Creek  
31 drainage to outside hunters and trespassers. My mother,  
32 Josephine Peter, is an owner of 60 acres of Native  
33 allotment in the Red Sheep Creek area and we, the  
34 siblings, are the heir to the Native allotment and I'd  
35 like to continue to see the land undeveloped, clean water  
36 and abundance of fish and animals for our future family  
37 generations to come.

38

39 In addition, the land northeast from  
40 Arctic Village is all sacred, as well as -- well, it's  
41 all sacred as well because the Gwich'in tribes all  
42 migrated, camp, fish and hunt around that area using  
43 caribou and sheep fences to capture caribou and sheep and  
44 I consider these areas very sacred and pristine. My  
45 people are the caretaker of the land and should respect  
46 their concerns regarding the Red Sheep and Cane Creek  
47 area. Mahsi' choo.

48

49 MS. ALLEN: Hi, my name is Mildred Allen.  
50 I'm speaking as Gwich'in Athabascan. I'm original from

1 Arctic Village and I'm not representing FWS or other  
2 agency. I was born and raised in Arctic Village. (In  
3 Gwich'in) which means village on side of hill and creek.  
4 I'll tell you again, I'm sure you heard it a million  
5 times, but Red Sheep Creek, red stands for the red dirt  
6 which mean (in Gwich'in). They use this for coloring  
7 snowshoes and drum.

8  
9 Our people traveled up there for  
10 thousands of years and took only what they needed, as far  
11 as Old Crow, Fort Yukon, Venetie and Chalkyitsik. Which  
12 can be -- sheep is ready to be harvested in November,  
13 which is the only time we harvest it. Never in the other  
14 months. Today we travel up there with the kids -- I mean  
15 back in the summer. They didn't hear any birds, no sheep  
16 and side of the rocky mountains no bears, but I see  
17 trash. Trash hurts animals out there.

18  
19 I work with kids in the summer. They  
20 took a trip up to Red Sheep Creek and we did not see any  
21 sheep, which was very disappointing. So please respect  
22 us and keep it closed.

23  
24 Thank you.

25  
26 Mahsi'.

27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,  
29 Mildred and Joanne. You're a little nervous, aren't you?

30  
31 MS. ALLEN: Yeah.

32  
33 (Laughter)

34  
35 MS. ALLEN: I'm not used to speaking in  
36 public.

37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I appreciate  
39 that very much. I'm so sorry. But you're doing good.

40  
41 Okay.

42  
43 Any questions, gentlemen, Council  
44 members.

45  
46 (No comments)

47  
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We really  
49 appreciate your testimony.

50

1 Thank you.  
2  
3 MS. ALLEN: Mahsi'.  
4  
5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's the word  
6 for thank you, right?  
7  
8 MS. ALLEN: Uh-huh. (Affirmative)  
9  
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Ah.  
11  
12 MS. PATTON: I'd like to check in online  
13 and see if there's anyone that has joined us that would  
14 like to provide comment on 14-51 on Red Sheep Creek.  
15  
16 (No comments)  
17  
18 MS. PATTON: Do we have anyone else  
19 that's joined us this afternoon.  
20  
21 (No comments)  
22  
23 MS. PATTON: If you don't wish to speak,  
24 if you could please push \*6 and that will mute your  
25 phone. If you would like to address the Council, you can  
26 press \*6 again and just please do speak up. Do we have  
27 Larry Williams online yet.  
28  
29 MR. JAMES: Arctic Village, Gideon James.  
30  
31 MS. PATTON: Okay. Thank you, guys.  
32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I would like to  
34 find out if Darlene Herbert is back.  
35  
36 (No comments)  
37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I do not see  
39 her. Out in teleconference land there's some real strong  
40 back feed coming through. If you could push \*6 and mute  
41 it, we would appreciate it. Thank you.  
42  
43 Next is discussion.  
44  
45 I need a motion.  
46  
47 MR. UMPHENOUR: Move to adopt Proposal  
48 14-51.  
49  
50 MR. GLANZ: I'll second that.

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Discussion.  
2  
3 MR. UMPHENOUR: Madame Chair.....  
4  
5 MR. JAMES: This is Arctic Village. I'd  
6 like to make comments on Red Sheep Creek.  
7  
8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes. Who is  
9 speaking?  
10  
11 MR. JAMES: Gideon James.  
12  
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Gideon, didn't  
14 you testify already?  
15  
16 MR. JAMES: What?  
17  
18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: He just  
19 testified before lunch. Yes, Gideon, we did have your  
20 testimony before lunch.  
21  
22 MR. JAMES: I thought that was the one  
23 for Red Sheep Creek.  
24  
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's what  
26 we're on right now.  
27  
28 MR. JAMES: Yeah, I'd like to make  
29 comments on that one.  
30  
31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I thought we  
32 heard them. Is there some confusion here because I was  
33 certain that we heard the ones on the sheep, on 51, when  
34 you spoke before lunch. That s the one we were on. What  
35 did we miss? Are you there?  
36  
37 MR. JAMES: Yes, I'm here. You sound  
38 like you don't want me to talk.  
39  
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No, it's not  
41 that at all. I thought I heard you talk. Did you have  
42 something you missed?  
43  
44 MR. JAMES: Yes. I'd like to make a  
45 comment on Red Sheep Creek. The subject is on there,  
46 isn't it?  
47  
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes, that's  
49 what we're on right now. I'm assuming that you feel like  
50 you did not testify to Red Sheep Creek the last time. Is

1 that correct?

2

3 MR. JAMES: It's just a short one.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Go

6 ahead.

7

8 MR. JAMES: Okay. My name is Gideon  
9 James and I live in Arctic Village. I hear testimony  
10 again on Red Sheep Creek, the same one that we did a  
11 couple years ago. It seems like every time these  
12 hearings come up we, as a Native people, we point out the  
13 traditional value of that area and I hear again the same  
14 testimonies that we hear years ago. For some reason  
15 people from far away think that these historical  
16 practices have changed. I'm here to tell you it's not  
17 so. We have a traditional tie to this area and a lot of  
18 families came forward to testify on all that.

19

20 Again, when the Red Sheep Creek was  
21 opened, we have aircraft that were flying out of control.  
22 People just don't fly to Red Sheep Creek. They fly to  
23 different places and our hunters see them. Late at night  
24 they see aircraft coming low in the area and late at  
25 night they see float planes flying low. Our hunters spot  
26 it already. That's why we have complained about traffic.  
27 The people that's supposed to control these traffic is  
28 not doing their work. So here again we need to respect  
29 these people that have a traditional tie to this area.

30

31 Thank you.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,  
34 Gideon. I agree with you there actually. So is there  
35 any new people out in the teleconference that have not  
36 spoke as public testimony that would like to.

37

38 I know James is out there, but he can't  
39 really hear us very well.

40

41 Larry Williams, did you come back on?

42

43 (No comments)

44

45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We do  
46 have a motion on the floor and we began our deliberation  
47 as the Council.

48

49 So, discussion.

50

1 Virgil.

2

3 MR. UMPHENOUR: Thank you, Madame Chair.  
4 Our Council has addressed this issue at least four times  
5 in the last 10, 11 years. At least four times. The  
6 Staff report this year basically says it's a social  
7 issue. There's no biological issue. The last time we  
8 addressed this one of the Staff, Hollis Twitchell, from  
9 Fish and Wildlife Service had a report, but we ran out of  
10 time. We didn't even get to hear his report, but we  
11 heard kind of a brief synopsis.....

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We did hear it  
14 last time.

15

16 MR. UMPHENOUR: .....of his report.  
17 Earlier today?

18

19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: But last time  
20 he gave us a long report. It was the next day after we  
21 voted, remember? But go on.

22

23 MR. UMPHENOUR: But anyway, so we've  
24 spent a lot of time on this issue. We even scheduled a  
25 meeting in Arctic Village, I don't know, five or six  
26 years ago and went there and spent a couple days at  
27 Arctic Village. But what I think is new this time is  
28 information that I really wasn't aware of and I wish that  
29 Mr. Twitchell was here. He was here earlier today.

30

31 But I took some notes from the questions  
32 I asked him. I think it was the fall hunt for 2011. He  
33 spent a month and a half there. And then he was there  
34 again in 2012 and maybe '13, I'm not sure. But one of  
35 the years he said there were eight parties dropped off at  
36 Red Sheep Creek that were sheep hunters, but Red Sheep  
37 Creek was closed. Only to Federal subsistence users from  
38 the villages. But those hunters were going to walk up  
39 Red Sheep Creek, over the pass, to the other side where  
40 sheep hunting was open.

41

42 I'm a sheep hunter. I don't hunt sheep  
43 anymore. Sitting next to a sheep hunter. Between the  
44 two of us, I can probably honestly say we've guided and  
45 harvested in excess of 100 sheep.

46

47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That sounds  
48 horrible.

49

50 MR. UMPHENOUR: I know it might sound

1 horrible, but we're both professional hunters and we've  
2 both been professional. I'm 71 years old. I've been  
3 doing it a long, long time. Anyway, sheep have 7 power  
4 eyes. It's like one of us looking through 7 power  
5 binoculars. When they see a human walking, and they know  
6 what a human is when it's walking, they don't care if  
7 you're a backpacker, a hunter, picking flowers or what  
8 you're doing, they're gone.

9  
10 I'm glad to see Mr. Twitchell just came  
11 back in the room. They leave the area. There's also  
12 people that just like to get out and hike around, pick up  
13 rocks and look at flowers and maybe take a smell of a  
14 flower and drink some good, clean, fresh mountain water.  
15 Sheep sees them they're gone too. Making it so that  
16 hunters can't go there during a 40-day period is going to  
17 do nothing to keep those people out that are going to  
18 make the sheep go to the high country.

19  
20 A big part of the justification here is  
21 the sheep go to the high country because of these  
22 hunters. Well, they're going to go to the high country  
23 anyway with all the posy sniffers, rock hounds and other  
24 people walking around out there and people just taking  
25 pictures, which I enjoy doing all those things myself.  
26 So this doesn't really accomplish the objective, I think.

27  
28  
29 The Department has said that it's a  
30 social issue. If it's a social issue -- in fact, I don't  
31 think the Board has the authority to kick all these other  
32 people out of there. Because if you really are concerned  
33 about people being able to go hunt unmolested sheep --  
34 when I say unmolested, that means the sheep haven't seen  
35 any humans for a year -- then this isn't going to do it.

36 It's a total -- it's just an idea. If  
37 you know anything about sheep hunting, it's not going to  
38 work. So I wanted to make sure I put that on the record.  
39 I'd like to ask Madame Chair if I could call Mr.  
40 Twitchell back up to the table because I'd like to get  
41 this a little bit clearer in my mind.

42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hollis.

44  
45 MR. TWITCHELL: Chair, Council members.  
46 I'm sorry I had to step out for another important  
47 meeting. I wanted to make sure I got back in time, so  
48 I'm glad I did. You had a question, Virgil?

49  
50 MR. UMPHENOUR: Yes, I did. When you

1 spoke earlier to the Council, you said -- was it in 2011  
2 or 2012 you spent about a month and a half out there?

3  
4 MR. TWITCHELL: A month and a half summer  
5 before last, so it was 2012. Then this year I spent a  
6 significant amount of time in and out of there, but I was  
7 patrolling over the Fuller Refuge at that time, so I  
8 wasn't there camping out -- basing out of those  
9 drainages.

10  
11 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay. So what you said,  
12 I think it was in 2012, that eight parties of sheep  
13 hunters were dropped off at the airstrip at Red Sheep  
14 Creek and that they had hiked out of the closed area into  
15 an open area to hunt sheep. That's what I think I heard  
16 you say.

17  
18 MR. TWITCHELL: In that, I was referring  
19 to this year. So I was on the ground quite a bit there  
20 for the opening, first week of sheep season, which is our  
21 busiest time throughout the whole Brooks Range for sheep  
22 hunting. So I was in and out of there pretty regularly  
23 on the first part of that and then I was periodically  
24 into that drainage camping out very often through the  
25 remainder of the sheep season. I would estimate that I  
26 know of at least somewhere between eight and ten parties  
27 that were dropped off on the airstrip at the confluence  
28 of Red Sheep Creek and the East Fork of the Chandalar.  
29 That's a big, long airstrip. So they use that as a place  
30 of drop off.

31  
32 Then the clients that I had spoke to and  
33 the other people I spoke to there talk about parties they  
34 hiked up to the next one or two drainage above Red Sheep  
35 Creek to hunt. There's other individuals that crossed  
36 the river and hunted sheep on the eastern side of the  
37 East Fork of the Chandalar, so it was a combination of  
38 going into other areas but using the Red Sheep Creek main  
39 airstrip as an access point.

40  
41 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay. So how far -- now  
42 they're probably -- they're not all going on the same  
43 route. They're going different places, I imagine. How  
44 far would they be walking from the airstrip -- would they  
45 have to walk to get to where they could legally hunt  
46 sheep then?

47  
48 MR. TWITCHELL: The first drainage -- you  
49 don't have any good maps here, but the first drainage  
50 just north of Red Sheep Creek would be approximately four

1 miles up drainage, so they'd have to at least hike four  
2 miles up drainage to get to the first draw outside of Red  
3 Sheep Creek and then there's another drainage just a  
4 short distance beyond that, probably about five miles.  
5 So those would be the distances they would have to  
6 traverse just to get into an area that would be open.

7  
8 On the Cane Creek, the year before we had  
9 a party of three hunters that landed at Cane Creek and  
10 they hiked clear to the top of Cane Creek, over the top  
11 to hunt in the Upper Canning River. So we had at least  
12 one party transitioning through the Cane Creek drainage  
13 to get to where they could hunt sheep outside of Cane  
14 Creek.

15  
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm sorry. How  
17 far was that?

18  
19 MR. TWITCHELL: This year, the majority  
20 of the people were going north of Red Sheep Creek about  
21 four miles to the north up drainage on the East Fork of  
22 the Chandalar and that puts them into an area open to all  
23 hunters.

24  
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

26  
27 MR. TWITCHELL: And it was in 2012 that  
28 three hunters hiked up through Cane Creek, over the top  
29 into the Canning River.

30  
31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Which is how  
32 far?

33  
34 MR. TWITCHELL: It was a long ways.

35  
36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So in that four  
37 miles up Red Sheep Creek, it's -- there's a little divot  
38 in there that looks like they just go over right there.

39  
40 MR. TWITCHELL: Yeah. That's where  
41 parties -- I think there was one sheep taken out of  
42 there. Another sheep that I saw was taken in that next  
43 draw beyond that little drainage about five miles up. So  
44 they were harvesting sheep above there.

45  
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: To most sheep  
47 hunters that have a backpack on their back, that's not  
48 very far, four miles, but 20 miles is a long ways.

49  
50 MR. TWITCHELL: That party that went up

1 Cane Creek, they were tough. I mean they were up there  
2 for over a week, week and a half hunt. They did bring  
3 one sheep back out, but the other hunters weren't  
4 successful.

5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So, Virgil,  
7 continue. I just -- were there any other questions?

8  
9 MR. UMPHENOUR: I think that pretty much  
10 answered my questions.

11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

13  
14 MR. UMPHENOUR: Maybe someone else wants  
15 to ask Mr. Twitchell a question.

16  
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, we're in  
18 deliberation, so let's -- anyone have any other questions  
19 regarding what information he has.

20  
21 MR. UMPHENOUR: Oh, I have one other  
22 question, Madame Chair.

23  
24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: When we get  
25 older we remember things.

26  
27 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay. What I was talking  
28 about before you got here or maybe I was when you got  
29 here is that sheep, you know, can see really well and  
30 when they see humans walking around, they go to the high  
31 country or go over the ridge. They disappear in a hurry.  
32 So my other question is, you said there were just plain  
33 hikers going in there as well, people taking pictures,  
34 whatever they're doing, looking for rocks, et cetera. How  
35 many of those type people have you seen up in that area  
36 when you were staying there this last couple of years?

37  
38 MR. TWITCHELL: This year we had three  
39 hikers that were dropped off in Cane Creek at that  
40 airstrip. As Kirk described to me, they were hiking up  
41 to the top of Cane Creek, over to sort of the headwaters  
42 of the Canning and then coming back down into Red Sheep  
43 Creek. So they were making the traverse from Cane Creek  
44 up around down to Red Sheep Creek to the main airstrip.  
45 That was this year.

46  
47 Then the year before, 2012, there was  
48 another hiker that came across from Spring Creek through  
49 multiple drainages until he got into Cane Creek and then  
50 came down to that airstrip. I just happened to be camping

1 out there when he came in and he was picked up by an air  
2 taxi there.  
3  
4 MR. UMPHENOUR: Thank you. I don't have  
5 anymore questions, Madame Chair.  
6  
7 MR. TWITCHELL: Thank you.  
8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Before you go.  
10 So the hikers that -- do you have a handle on how many  
11 might really be going in there because they don't have to  
12 report in to anyone, right?  
13  
14 MR. TWITCHELL: No, they don't. It just  
15 happened that I had observed these people.....  
16  
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You run into  
18 them.  
19  
20 MR. TWITCHELL: .....that I noted them.  
21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I imagine  
23 there's going to be more and more of this.  
24  
25 MR. TWITCHELL: Well, I don't know. I  
26 didn't -- you know, since I spent so much time camping  
27 there in both of those access nodes at the bottom of Red  
28 Sheep Creek and Cane Creek. I can't expect that there'd  
29 be too much more than what I actually observed in there.  
30 If there is more, it's a very low number.  
31  
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Except when  
33 people go home and write their article and have it  
34 printed in a magazine even though hikers do that. It's  
35 a great place to go. Let's go over here.  
36  
37 MR. TWITCHELL: It's a beautiful place.  
38  
39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh. I  
40 know. That will get talked about. Any other questions  
41 regarding this. We're in deliberation, so I don't mind  
42 asking questions to help you along, but this proposal is  
43 to open Red Sheep Creek and Cane Creek to other hunting  
44 and not be restricted to Federally qualified subsistence  
45 users. Let's have some discussion.  
46  
47 MR. UMPHENOUR: I'm just going to finish  
48 up mine.  
49  
50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, my God,

1 he's not finished. (Laughs) Go ahead, Virgil.

2

3 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay. When we heard this  
4 the last time, we had maps of the various Native  
5 allotments and there was people that actually made kind  
6 of a half an air -- or half of an airstrip was one one  
7 Native allotment, I can remember that from a couple years  
8 ago. Anyway, people were complaining about trash and et  
9 cetera there.

10

11 What this proposal has is that if it was  
12 opened up, then the people would have to get a permit  
13 from the State certifying that they had attended this  
14 course on ethics and et cetera and, of course, part of  
15 the thing in the course is going to be where the private  
16 property is and you can't get on private property, you  
17 have to be on public property. If that were done, then  
18 enforcement, if people did trespass on private property,  
19 would be simple because the people would know that it was  
20 there and they should not be there. So I see that  
21 problem can be eliminated.

22

23 Beings I guide in a National Wildlife  
24 Refuge as well, I know that I am -- because I've been  
25 blamed for a number of things that myself and my guides  
26 and my clients didn't do. I'm basically the garbage  
27 collector out there. Every place we hunt trash that  
28 other people leave we pick up because we don't want to  
29 get blamed for leaving it there. So we haul out way more  
30 trash than we make.

31

32 What I'm saying is basically I'm in favor  
33 of this proposal because I think that, for the reasons  
34 given, to reject the proposal as far as not spooking the  
35 sheep so people can have a quality sheep hunt of  
36 undisturbed sheep, it doesn't hold water because there's  
37 other people going to be -- other people are out there  
38 walking around in the area, whether they're sheep  
39 hunting, just traversing through it or just out hiking,  
40 people are doing it. I don't think there's any way that  
41 that -- well, I know you can't stop them from doing that  
42 because that's a National Wildlife Refuge. It belongs to  
43 all the people of the United States.

44

45 And there's no conservation issue when I  
46 read the part in our book on Page 182 about the reasons  
47 for closing an area. The only thing I could see that  
48 would justify -- or where maybe it would be a stretch  
49 would be pursuant to other applicable law, but it doesn't  
50 say what the other applicable law is to close an area.

1 So I don't -- you know, there's no biological reason for  
2 it. There's no reason for it as far as people won't have  
3 a reasonable opportunity to go harvest a sheep. There's  
4 nothing there.

5

6 So I am for the proposal. Madame Chair.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Donald. You  
9 had your hand raised earlier.

10

11 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame Chair.  
12 When we were in Arctic Village, one of the things we  
13 tried to emphasize to the people there was the filling  
14 out of harvest data because when a proposal comes to the  
15 OSM and they do an analysis, if there's no harvest data,  
16 it makes it very hard for them to justify opening or  
17 closing a fisheries or a hunt if they don't have any kind  
18 of recorded use and that still sounds like it's a  
19 problem. I don't like filling out harvest data any more  
20 than anybody else, but I do it.

21

22 If I don't harvest anything, I still fill  
23 it out and that's what needs to be done to show that  
24 there's a need for this resource by the people. I can't  
25 emphasize that enough to the people of Arctic Village and  
26 Venetie and stuff, is that when you go hunting, you need  
27 to document it. I know that's not traditional in your  
28 culture, but it needs to be done so that we can make a  
29 sound decision on your use of the resource.

30

31 Thank you.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Council  
34 members, others, discussion.

35

36 MR. FIRMIN: I have a couple little  
37 things. One of them is it says a Department-approved  
38 hunter ethics and orientation, but the State can't even  
39 put in their own book that the area is closed for one.  
40 Also, like some of the other testimony earlier, what  
41 Jonathan said, was that the price of fuel and if you have  
42 to go that far and, let's see, you pull up to your  
43 favorite hunting spot and there's 15 people in multiple  
44 airplanes there, are you really going to stick around and  
45 hunt anyway. I mean that was part of the reason for it  
46 being closed.

47

48 I've got to disagree with Virgil about  
49 the biology because the last biology we seen never  
50 changed from when they closed it. It was the same when

1 they opened it again and it was still the same when we  
2 had it re-closed last year and then in 2012 when it was  
3 closed they finally went and did a study and it didn't  
4 change very much more from then either.

5  
6 I don't think -- I also agree with Don  
7 though that they need to start filling stuff out. Like  
8 I said, if you're going to go hunting and there's  
9 multiple airplanes and 15 people standing there, you  
10 probably aren't going to want to get out of your boat and  
11 pull over and, hey, I'm going to camp here next to you  
12 guys, okay. That's just not the way people are going to  
13 -- well, I'm going somewhere else.

14  
15 So I just kind of have to disagree that  
16 this -- going to oppose this proposal because we just got  
17 it closed and I don't see a reason to open it a year  
18 after it closed. It's kind of a mute point, but maybe in  
19 the future it could be revisited.

20  
21 I do agree with the hunter ethics and  
22 orientation part of it, but I just don't see that helping  
23 a whole lot if the State can't even put in their own book  
24 that the area is closed to begin with. So I don't know.

25  
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So that isn't  
27 in the books, Jennifer? Yes/no. Trying to make it fast.  
28 That's a good point. How would people know -- if you have  
29 a season in there and it's -- that would be something the  
30 Feds and the State have to have coordinated when there's  
31 a Federal closure, the State can't have it in the books  
32 if it's open. Go ahead.

33  
34 MS. YUHAS: The answer was yes or no and  
35 the answer is no and that's new information. And I hate  
36 to be a bureaucrat that says I don't print the book, but  
37 there are often discrepancies in both sets of handy  
38 dandies and I'm not as impressed as anyone else is here.

39  
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I wonder if  
41 there's cases like that around the State besides this one  
42 where it might have a season and it doesn't note that  
43 this is only Federally qualified -- open to Federally  
44 qualified. Are there other places that it notes it?

45  
46 MS. YUHAS: There have been other  
47 mistakes made in the handy dandies that are handed out by  
48 both agencies every year.

49  
50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: But is there

1 places in it today or has there been where it's noted  
2 this is only open to Federally qualified subsistence  
3 users?

4

5 MS. YUHAS: Yes.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. This has  
8 been in there. It just hasn't gone in on this one.

9

10 MS. YUHAS: It's a mistake.

11

12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
13 That's a bad deal. Eww. Yikes. Any other discussion.  
14 I have a few things myself after you guys are done.  
15 Anyone else want to have any other discussion.

16

17 (No comments)

18

19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I think the  
20 State brings up -- from what I'm hearing and what I heard  
21 in this testimony today, there really is a need for the  
22 governments to get together and come up with ethics.  
23 Ethics of respect for each other, especially in places  
24 like this. I think something like this ethics could be  
25 in the handy dandy and it could be in the Federal  
26 regulation book.

27

28 I think, Jennifer, that's a good place to  
29 work on and I know what you're saying, that it isn't done  
30 yet and not really energetic about working on something  
31 when it would be closed anyway, but I see a statewide  
32 approach for stuff like this that could occur. I see  
33 where there's general problems out there that could be  
34 breached by both Federal and State that could be in both  
35 handy dandies. I see some really -- and one is, what  
36 we're hearing, is cultural sensitive, a respect for each  
37 other, the respect for the land.

38

39 The State is going to have to provide  
40 maps of private lands. The State and the Federal should  
41 have maps available for private lands because that's --  
42 I mean everybody -- I can see some ahhh, but, you know,  
43 if people know where it is, normally people would like to  
44 respect that, normally. There are bad and good in every  
45 culture of life. Somehow or another it has to be made  
46 available to people. I know that some of the area  
47 biologists have maps in their office and people can walk  
48 in there and they can look at them and it helps a great  
49 deal.

50

1                   The other thing that I'm a bit sensitive  
2 to is the aircraft. Sometimes in our areas there's lim -  
3 - aircrafts are limited in certain areas. There's  
4 certain places where they can land and can't land. I can  
5 see that down the road that's going to be an issue  
6 everywhere, not just in this little area.

7  
8                   I appreciate what the State is saying,  
9 but I guess I'm hanging my hat on this working together,  
10 hunter ethics and respect, which leads me to think that  
11 those kinds of things should probably be worked out,  
12 worked out first possibly.

13  
14                   I understand everything you're saying,  
15 Virgil. That's the hard part about our job. Our job is  
16 -- ANILCA is what we have to go by, so in one sense of  
17 the way this is brought up -- it is true. It's a social.  
18 What Virgil brings out is true. So I'm having a little  
19 difficulty on how to feel about this because I do  
20 remember Richard Carroll was at that meeting up in Fort  
21 Yukon and he spoke -- that's your uncle from Fort Yukon  
22 and he spoke pretty strongly about encouraging people to  
23 fill in their reports and that's important and that's  
24 important that people need to know that.

25  
26                   To just say that you hunted and don't  
27 fill out your reports isn't helpful. It needs to be  
28 done. He was strong about that, I remember, to the point  
29 where he'd write them a citation. He was very strong  
30 about that. I remember that, so I have to bring that up.

31  
32                   I'd like to hear just a little bit more  
33 on the record how you guys feel and then whenever you  
34 call the question that's okay. Bill and then Donald.

35  
36                   MR. GLANZ: Yeah, Madame Chair. There's  
37 people out here from Arctic Village. I've been on this  
38 board since '05. I think this is the fourth or fifth  
39 time we've had this same conversation and we still get  
40 the same results; no, we didn't fill out any. The first  
41 time they blocked it off. The next year we had a lot of  
42 talks with people in Arctic Village. Yeah, we got some  
43 sheep, but, no, we didn't turn in the paperwork.

44  
45                   I know it's a paperless type society  
46 there. Like Don says, I don't like putting the paperwork  
47 in either, but you have to do it to show usage. In our  
48 area, I insist everybody in Circle and Central and all  
49 those areas go out and shoot some ducks and send some  
50 paperwork in. Even if you don't shoot some ducks, send

1 some paperwork in so that you can maintain your use. If  
2 you don't use it, you lose it.

3

4 I hope this is the last time I have to  
5 vote on this issue. Anyway, thank you.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I can guarantee  
8 it won't be.

9

10 MR. GLANZ: Oh, please, Lord.

11

12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Donald.

13

14 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame Chair.  
15 I have a very difficult time making a decision only on  
16 the biological because of the spiritual and emotional  
17 involvement of the local people with the resource. It  
18 really hurts my heart to have to be so divided. ANILCA  
19 says we have to make a decision only on the biology. Is  
20 there a conservation issue. Because I really feel for  
21 the resource that people depend on. People that fly in  
22 there with planes aren't depending on the resources. So  
23 I'm going to vote for the local people this time.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Lester, did I  
26 see a gesture that you wanted to speak?

27

28 MR. ERHART: No.

29

30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, I misread  
31 you. Okay.

32

33 Virgil.

34

35 MR. UMPHENOUR: Thank you, Madame Chair.  
36 We had Mr. Twitchell up here and I asked him several  
37 questions and one of the things he said is that -- now  
38 we're talking about when the sheep season was closed to  
39 non-Federally qualified residents, when the season was  
40 only open for them and closed for everyone else, that the  
41 airplanes were still flying all around the mountains  
42 spotting sheep.

43

44 I hate airplanes spotting anything. For  
45 you and I, it's totally illegal. We can't do that.  
46 Guides are not allowed to do it. Anyone else can though.  
47 It's unethical for guides and it's a criminal act for us  
48 to spot animals from the air that we intend to hunt. But  
49 I don't like that anyway. It's against Boone and  
50 Crockett's rules to go spot an animal from the air and

1 then go hunt it. You cannot enter it in the record book  
2 if they find out about it.

3  
4 So all these guys out there buzzing  
5 around spotting sheep are going to still be doing that.  
6 It's not going to stop that. It's not going to stop the  
7 posy sniffers. It's not going to stop the sheep hunters  
8 that want to hunt, walk through the drainage, scare all  
9 the sheep off in the process, make them climb up over the  
10 top of the mountain. It's not going to stop any of that.

11  
12 It's a feel good deal is all it is and,  
13 to me, we should not be closing an area to the American  
14 public for a feel good deal that is not going to  
15 accomplish what people say they want to accomplish  
16 because it's illegal to accomplish what they want to  
17 accomplish, which is to take that Federal National  
18 Wildlife Refuge and make it off limits for everyone  
19 except the rest of you that live in Fort Yukon,  
20 Chalkyitsik or Arctic Village.

21  
22 I m voting in favor. Madame Chair.

23  
24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I believe we  
25 got your point. I just have to pick on you once in a  
26 while, okay.

27  
28 MR. UMPHENOUR: I know that.

29  
30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, okay.  
31 All right. Others. Andrew.

32  
33 MR. FIRMIN: I just kind of go back to  
34 that hunter ethics and orientation. That's something  
35 I've asked refuges to do since day one when I got on this  
36 board because they can't tell me how many people came and  
37 went through there, they don't know who went by my house,  
38 they don't know how many people went by my property.  
39 They don't know anything about who comes and goes or  
40 hunts in those areas and they don't know what they did  
41 there or if they even left there. Who knows what they  
42 did there. They're going to drown and swamp their boat  
43 and never see them again.

44  
45 That was where an orientation thing or a  
46 sign-in and say I'm going up here, I'll be back in 10  
47 days, whatever. Maybe something like a register, I'm  
48 registering to go -- just like you have to do in any  
49 National Park in the rest of the country, so you could  
50 actually say beyond a reasonable doubt that, well, these

1 guys are either trespassing or they're here doing this  
2 because they're registered to go, this is what they said  
3 they were going to do.

4  
5                   And that's one thing that I would like to  
6 see along with that hunter ethics and orientation because  
7 then if they're going someplace, they know they could  
8 look around and see who owns lands where and what so they  
9 would avoid all these user conflicts and they would avoid  
10 a lot of problems. Then you could also go back and not  
11 have to depend on harvest information on what people did  
12 or not because the State themselves don't depend on  
13 harvest information because it's never accurate.

14  
15                   Even if it's guiding, hunting, I don't  
16 care who you are, the State does not depend on harvest  
17 information turned in voluntarily themselves, so there's  
18 no reason to look at it from any other -- one user group  
19 or not, turning it in or not. How do you know out of all  
20 those planes up there they weren't shooting anything  
21 somewhere else and dragging them over the mountain or  
22 dragging them any other place.

23  
24                   There's a lot of people that fly around  
25 in the mountains and nobody knows who they are, where  
26 they're going, when they're leaving or if they even  
27 leave. That's why I believe this hunter ethics and  
28 orientation should be done in every refuge in the state  
29 and it should be done in joint with the State of Alaska  
30 so they have a better idea of who's coming and going  
31 where. It probably would help out a lot in the whole  
32 search and rescue scheme of things also.

33  
34                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anyone else.

35  
36                   (No comments)

37  
38                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm going to  
39 say that I appreciate -- I really appreciate the State  
40 and what they're trying to do here. I'm kind of going to  
41 reiterate what you're saying. I think it's very  
42 important to come up with this, some type of a  
43 coordination. And in the end, when it would be done,  
44 could develop into a deeper understanding of the people  
45 from Arctic Village, for instance, in this case to what  
46 is going on. I believe once people realize people  
47 respect them and their culture, they feel stronger and  
48 able to work with people when people recognize and  
49 respect their culture, but when there seems to be a  
50 disrespect, that's when things go awry.

1                   So I would encourage the State to work  
2 with the Feds and come up with that. In the meantime, I  
3 realize we're bound by ANILCA, I realize we're bound by  
4 these policies, but in this situation I just -- I don't  
5 know how I feel, where I stand, other than pushing the  
6 State to come up with this hunter ethics and respect and  
7 working together.  
8  
9                   Is that a quarter for my thoughts?  
10  
11                   MR. UMPHENOUR: No, flip it.  
12  
13                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, flip it.  
14 He wants me to go heads or tails and flip it.  
15  
16                   (Laughter)  
17  
18                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
19 Anyone else.  
20  
21                   (No comments)  
22  
23                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any other  
24 discussion.  
25  
26                   MR. FIRMIN: Question.  
27  
28                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: The question  
29 has been called. Yeah, I think we ought to go for a roll  
30 call.  
31  
32                   MS. PATTON: Can you check in and  
33 see.....  
34  
35                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, is Larry  
36 Roberts online.  
37  
38                   MR. FIRMIN: Larry Williams.  
39  
40                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Or Williams.  
41 I'm sorry. I put two of them together. I tried to talk  
42 -- make them one person, two people. Is Larry Williams  
43 online.  
44  
45                   (No comments)  
46  
47                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I hear somebody  
48 in their kitchen that didn't press \*6.  
49  
50                   MS. PATTON: Maybe we could just check in

1 with James and see if he.....

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: James, did you  
4 hear any of this? He told me not to call on him. Okay.  
5 The question has been called for and it doesn't sound  
6 like we have the two guys online. So go ahead, Andrew.

7

8 MR. FIRMIN: I'll start with myself and  
9 I oppose this proposal. Next is Lester Erhart.

10

11 MR. ERHART: No.

12

13 MR. FIRMIN: Bill Glanz.

14

15 MR. GLANZ: No.

16

17 MR. FIRMIN: Don Woodruff.

18

19 MR. WOODRUFF: No.

20

21 MR. FIRMIN: Virgil Umphenour.

22

23 MR. UMPHENOUR: Yes.

24

25 MR. FIRMIN: Sue Entsminger.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm going to be  
28 a chicken and abstain.

29

30 MR. FIRMIN: Okay. We have four opposed,  
31 one is for it and one abstention.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. That was  
34 a tough one. Do you want to continue?

35

36 MR. UMPHENOUR: Yeah, I want to take a  
37 break.

38

39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thanks for the  
40 quarter. He says a short break.

41

42 (Off record)

43

44 (On record)

45

46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We need to get  
47 back on our agenda folks.

48

49 (Pause)

50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Council  
2 members, please join us.  
3  
4 MR. FIRMIN: I don't think we're going to  
5 be done by 5:00.  
6  
7 MR. ERHART: No, it doesn't look like it.  
8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
10  
11  
12 (Pause)  
13  
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right, the  
15 next thing on the agenda is the Board of Game proposals  
16 and I would like -- Andrew, did you want to take this up.  
17  
18 We were kind of talking at break how to  
19 get us through this, and one of the things was, a lot of  
20 the ACs that many of us are members of, I go to the  
21 meetings, I'm not on one, I go listen, they haven't met  
22 yet on these Board of Game proposals.  
23  
24 So go ahead Andrew.  
25  
26 MR. FIRMIN: What we were thinking was  
27 just, I don't know, I guess we would have to make a  
28 motion just to support all our own ACs and whatever they  
29 decide, since they haven't been able to meet yet, on a  
30 lot of these Board of Game proposals. That would be --  
31 the ACs they're from the areas and they know what they're  
32 talking about and I guess we could just offer our support  
33 to whatever they decide.  
34  
35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And that's a  
36 motion.  
37  
38 MR. FIRMIN: And that'd be a motion.  
39  
40 MR. WOODRUFF: Second.  
41  
42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any other  
43 discussion on this.  
44  
45 MR. UMPHENOUR: Sue.  
46  
47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Virgil.  
48  
49 MR. UMPHENOUR: There's a number of  
50 proposals in this proposal book that address restricting

1 non-residents, a bunch of them are for sheep hunting, a  
2 bunch of them are to make all non-resident hunts drawing  
3 permit, and those proposals are counter productive to  
4 management and conservation. And a lot of people don't  
5 understand where the funding comes from for both  
6 SportFish Division and the Department of Wildlife  
7 Conservation but we've been talking about surveys, like  
8 the surveys that get flown for the proposals on moose in  
9 Unit 25A. And then we've talked about counting sheep.  
10 We've talked about these things. Where does the money  
11 come from. Where the money comes from, is it comes from  
12 the sale of the hunting licenses, the tags and the  
13 fishing licenses. We've got the Pittman-Robertson Act,  
14 which was a Federal Act from about 1935.....

15  
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Virgil. I'm  
17 going to have to.....

18  
19 MR. UMPHENOUR: No, this will only take  
20 me about two minutes Sue.

21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I know it's two  
23 minutes but did you hear the motion.

24  
25 MR. UMPHENOUR: Yeah. But it's  
26 important. I'm speaking to the.....

27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You're speaking  
29 to the motion.

30  
31 MR. UMPHENOUR: I'm speaking -- I  
32 heard.....

33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm not quite  
35 getting it.

36  
37 MR. UMPHENOUR: I heard the motion, I'm  
38 speaking to the motion. I'm just giving a little bit of  
39 a brief history of why I think we should do what we  
40 should do in support of the motion.

41  
42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We're  
43 supp.....

44  
45 MR. UMPHENOUR: And it's for people to  
46 carry back to their own ACs because not all AC members  
47 understand this.

48  
49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
50

1 MR. UMPHENOUR: And then they passed the  
2 Dingle Johnson Act in the early '50s, which is similar to  
3 the Pittman-Robertson Act, and what these Acts do, is the  
4 money that someone -- when someone buys a hunting  
5 license, if it's a resident it's \$25, if it's a non-  
6 resident, it's \$85. Residents get all tags free in  
7 Alaska, and every state west of the Mississippi they  
8 don't, they have to buy them. And so a moose tag is  
9 \$400, a grizzly bear tag is \$500, a sheep tag is \$425.  
10 Say someone buys a grizzly bear tag, it's \$500, Pittman-  
11 Robertson Act matches that three times, so three times  
12 500 is \$1,500 and then you add the 500 the guy originally  
13 paid, that's \$2,000 so they get \$2,000.....

14  
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: One minute.

16  
17 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay, one minute.

18  
19 (Laughter)

20  
21 MR. UMPHENOUR: So the State gets \$2,000  
22 for a non-resident buying one grizzly bear tag, that's  
23 not counting his \$85 license. A resident only has to pay  
24 \$25 and you can hunt everything there is to hunt here  
25 except for a brown bear on Kodiak and he has to pay \$25  
26 extra or maybe a muskox. So what this amounts to is  
27 between 70 and 80 percent of the budget to do all this  
28 science to make all these decisions, we have to base our  
29 decisions on the best available science. The money for  
30 the science comes from these non-residents, that's for  
31 hunting and fishing both.

32  
33 So eliminating all the non-residents is  
34 cutting your nose off to spite your face.

35  
36 So when you go back to your ACs remember  
37 that.

38  
39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

40  
41 MR. UMPHENOUR: Thank you.

42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: For those of  
44 you who don't really know Virgil, he believes that  
45 inflection helps to get his point across.

46  
47 (Laughter)

48  
49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So sometimes it  
50 might appear that he's angry but he really isn't as angry

1 as he sounds.  
2  
3 (Laughter)  
4  
5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So sometimes I  
6 have to calm him down.  
7  
8 (Laughter)  
9  
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: In my own way.  
11  
12 (Laughter)  
13  
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
15 Okay, Virgil, it kind of did speak to the motion, thank  
16 you, to support our ACs, and you have an AC that can take  
17 up a lot of those proposals also that you're the Chair  
18 of, I understand, and there's a meeting tonight, so I  
19 hope we don't lose our quorum when you walk out of here  
20 to go to your meeting.  
21  
22 (Laughter)  
23  
24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right. Any  
25 other discussion on this motion.  
26  
27 MR. WOODRUFF: Question.  
28  
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Question's been  
30 called for. All in favor say aye.  
31  
32 IN UNISON: Aye.  
33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anyone opposed.  
35  
36 (No opposing votes)  
37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, motion  
39 passes.  
40  
41 Andrew.  
42  
43 MR. FIRMIN: Since we heard lengthy and  
44 a lot of good testimony yesterday and today, Board of  
45 Game Proposal 79, which is to create the new hunt area  
46 for moose in Unit 25A, and that would then too -- that  
47 was our counter proposal to the one from Joe Matesi to  
48 close an area of 25A to Federal permit hunts only, that  
49 I think we all agree on that, that's our proposal and  
50 that was our answer to not going with the other proposal.

1                   And Proposal 80 is the harvest of brown  
2 bears over black bear bait in 25D, which we already spoke  
3 on yesterday and passed on the Federal side, so I don't  
4 think there's any reason to go over it again.

5  
6                   And we could just motion to approve our  
7 own proposals in the State book.

8  
9                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

10  
11                  MR. WOODRUFF: Second.

12  
13                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. And you  
14 identified them both, there was 78 and 79, am I right.

15  
16                  MR. UMPHENOUR: 79 and 80.

17  
18                  MR. FIRMIN: 79 and 80.

19  
20                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. 79 and  
21 80, okay. Any other discussion.

22  
23                  MR. FIRMIN: Refer to my comments I just  
24 said. They're our proposals, we've already talked about  
25 them. I'm not sure there's not much need for any more  
26 discussion.

27  
28                  MR. UMPHENOUR: Question.

29  
30                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Question's been  
31 called for, all in favor.

32  
33                  IN UNISON: Aye.

34  
35                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anyone opposed.

36  
37                  (No opposing votes)

38  
39                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. That was  
40 a lot shorter than I thought.

41  
42                  Next on the agenda is -- moving on to  
43 fish.

44  
45                  MR. GLANZ: Madame Chair. Excuse me,  
46 Ma'am, I had a couple from my AC November 11th meeting.

47  
48                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, Bill, go  
49 ahead, he had some from his AC.

50

1 MR. GLANZ: Okay. There are actually  
2 Proposals 51, 52, 53 and 54, and then 79 and 80 we voted  
3 to push that along too if we could, and we opposed No.  
4 55.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So what you did  
7 we support.  
8  
9 MR. GLANZ: Oh.  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Does  
12 anyone.....  
13  
14 MR. GLANZ: Oh, I misunderstood. Okay.  
15 Okay. That's okay, it's okay, I got it.  
16  
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, that  
18 should do it.  
19  
20 MR. GLANZ: Okay.  
21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's what  
23 we.....  
24  
25 MR. GLANZ: I misunderstood.....  
26  
27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....our first  
28 motion was to support our.....  
29  
30 MR. GLANZ: .....what we were doing.  
31  
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....ACs on  
33 these proposals.  
34  
35 MR. GLANZ: Okay.  
36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And if we did  
38 something wrong we'll know about it later, unfortunately,  
39 but I think we could all agree on most of it, so that's  
40 what we voted for.  
41  
42 MR. GLANZ: Okay.  
43  
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right. So  
45 now we are turning the wheel from wildlife to fish, and  
46 the first thing is the -- let me get something straight  
47 from our coordinator.  
48  
49 (Pause)  
50

1 MS. PATTON: So Madame Chair and Council  
2 and the public, we did have YRDFA representative here as  
3 well, Catherine Moncrieff. She did have to head back  
4 home, she was going to join us back on teleconference and  
5 we were going to combine all the fisheries updates, both  
6 the community-based surveys that the Yukon River Drainage  
7 Fisheries Association is doing, and then we have a joint  
8 update from the Federal and State fisheries in-season  
9 managers.

10  
11 We do have a presentation from the TCC  
12 fisheries biologist, Brian McKenna, can speak to some of  
13 the tribal fisheries monitoring projects and their  
14 student programs.

15  
16 And then we'll have the Fisheries  
17 Resource Monitoring Program research proposals, which is  
18 an action item for the Council to review and make  
19 recommendations for support or modifications.

20  
21 Thank you.

22  
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. So.....

24  
25 MS. PATTON: And do we have -- Catherine,  
26 were you able to join us on line.

27  
28 MS. MONCRIEFF: I am on line, can you  
29 hear me, this is Catherine.

30  
31 MS. PATTON: Wonderful, Catherine, thank  
32 you. And if it's all right with the Council and with the  
33 public, if we could give Catherine an opportunity to  
34 present on line. We do have Victor Lord who is also here  
35 and was going to be available to speak as a YRDFA  
36 representative also.

37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. That was  
39 what we wanted to do was get Catherine on line, so  
40 Catherine go ahead.

41  
42 MS. MONCRIEFF: Okay, thank you. And,  
43 again, I want to apologize that I wasn't able to stay and  
44 present this in person but I appreciate the opportunity  
45 to be able to do this over the phone. Can everybody hear  
46 me okay.

47  
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes, we can,  
49 loud and clear.

50

1 MS. MONCRIEFF: Okay, great. So good  
2 afternoon. As I stated my name is Catherine Moncrieff  
3 and I'm with the Yukon River Drainage Fisheries  
4 Association, which is also known as YRDFA.

5  
6 Some of you are longstanding YRDFA  
7 members and even Board members, and I would like to thank  
8 you for your work on behalf of the salmon resource. You  
9 may be familiar with some of YRDFA's programs that are  
10 funded by the Fisheries Resource Monitoring Program, or  
11 FRMP. These include our in-season salmon management  
12 teleconferences and in-season chinook salmon harvest  
13 survey program.

14  
15 I'd also like to give you an update on --  
16 I'd like to give you an update on these programs for the  
17 2013 fishing season, and following I'd like to give you an  
18 update on salmon bycatch in the Bering Sea pollock  
19 fisheries that our senior fisheries advisory Becca  
20 Robbins-Gisclair runs for YRDFA.

21  
22 I have two handouts today.

23  
24 One is a summary from the in-season  
25 salmon management teleconferences and the in-season  
26 chinook harvest survey program and the second is the  
27 salmon bycatch update.

28  
29 So to begin with I'd like to start with  
30 the in-season salmon management teleconferences.

31  
32 This year YRDFA held 14 in-season salmon  
33 management teleconferences every Tuesday in June, July  
34 and August. The calls followed an agenda each week,  
35 opening with -- I'm sorry -- opening with subsistence  
36 fishing reports, hearing from State and Federal managers  
37 on the fishery assessments and their management  
38 strategies. Hearing from the Department of Fisheries and  
39 Oceans in Canada and Yukon fishers in the Canadian  
40 headwaters. These teleconferences are funded by the  
41 Fisheries Resource Monitoring Program and the Yukon River  
42 panel. The important issues addressed this season during  
43 the teleconferences included the low Yukon River chinook  
44 salmon run and the conservative management strategies  
45 used in-season, salmon bycatch in the Bering Sea pollock  
46 fishery, and the Magnuson-Stevens Act reauthorization.

47  
48 So to begin with, the in-season salmon  
49 fisheries were managed conservatively and this was a  
50 major discretion point each week. How the run was coming

1 in and when the closures would take place and what gear  
2 restrictions were in place. People were concerned about  
3 the restriction to six inch gear as many people did not  
4 have it and did not have the time or money to purchase  
5 it. People also wanted to harvest king salmon because it  
6 is so important to them and there were a lot of  
7 discussions around this. People in different districts  
8 requested additional fishing time so they could get king  
9 salmon for food and fishwheel fishermen also asked about  
10 relief for dog food because they usually catch incidental  
11 fish for their dogs while the wheels are turning and this  
12 year the wheels did not turn much due to the closures.  
13 Others were concerned about how the information is shared  
14 from the teleconferences and YRDFA assured the public  
15 that the concerns raised on the calls would be shared  
16 with funding and management agencies supporting the  
17 calls, and the Yukon River Panel during communications  
18 committee report.

19

20 As for the Magnuson-Stevens Act we  
21 learned about the reauthorization process. This Act  
22 governs the North Pacific Fishery Management Council and  
23 manages the off shore fisheries. Senator Begich holds an  
24 important committee seat with responsibilities for  
25 reauthorizing the Act. Priorities for this round of  
26 reauthorization include increasing Alaska Native  
27 representation on the Council, providing authority for  
28 bycatch fines and requiring bycatch reduction. To  
29 provide input on the Magnuson-Stevens Act, we encourage  
30 you to be in touch with Senator Begich Staff and I have  
31 that contact information if you need it.

32

33 As for salmon bycatch on the  
34 teleconferences, the purpose of the in-season management  
35 calls is to talk about in-river fisheries management, but  
36 over the years people have asked a lot of questions and  
37 make a lot of comments on the issue of salmon bycatch in  
38 the Bering Sea. In order to address the need to discuss  
39 this important issue, we dedicated two calls, one at the  
40 beginning, the first call of the season and one towards  
41 the end of the season in August, and in each of these  
42 calls we dedicated half of the teleconference to talk  
43 about salmon bycatch in the Bering Sea pollock fishery.  
44 We had two guest speakers, Diana Stram of the North  
45 Pacific Fishery Management Council, and Nichole Kimball,  
46 Staff from the Alaska Department of Fish and Game  
47 Commissioner's Office who serves as the Commissioner's  
48 alternate on the Council to discuss this important issue  
49 impacting Western and Interior Alaska stock.

50

1                   And this leads me to the next topic  
2 called salmon bycatch update.

3  
4                   Fist salmon bycatch numbers for the  
5 Bering Sea pollack fishery for this year are as follows;  
6 for chinook salmon bycatch was 12,938 chinook salmon have  
7 been taken as bycatch as of October 26th, and for chum  
8 salmon 124,914 have been taken also as of October 26th.  
9 The pollock fishery generally finishes by late October or  
10 early November.

11  
12                   We have new genetic information for 2010  
13 and 2011 which is much more reliable, because the entire  
14 fleet is now required to have at least 100 percent  
15 observer coverage, and there's a better sampling plan in  
16 place. The results from 2010 and 2011 show that 73  
17 percent of Chinook salmon caught as bycatch were of  
18 Western Alaska origin. Bristol Bay, Kuskokwim, the  
19 entire Yukon River and Norton Sound. Chum salmon bycatch  
20 is a much lower proportion. Of the Western Alaska  
21 stocks, 25 percent in 2011, 21 percent in 2010.

22  
23                   The North Pacific Fisheries Management  
24 Council met at the beginning of October and discussed  
25 both Chinook and chum salmon bycatch. The pollack  
26 industry was united in calling for the Council to take no  
27 action at this time on Chinook salmon bycatch, while  
28 Western Alaskans were asking for the Council to reduce  
29 the bycatch further.

30  
31                   The Commissioner of Alaska Department of  
32 Fish and Game put forward an action which the Council  
33 supported unanimously which ignores the request of the  
34 pollack fishery and looks at ways to reduce bycatch  
35 further. The Council is looking at methods to reduce  
36 fishing during times of historically high bycatch, which  
37 is October. It's looking at ways to reduce bycatch of  
38 boats with consistently high bycatch, and how to continue  
39 to drive bycatch lower even when the fleet is well under  
40 the cap.

41  
42                   One of the options includes changing the  
43 timing for counting for bycatch by starting mid year  
44 instead of January 1st. the effect of this would be to  
45 put the high value roe fishery, which occurs at the  
46 beginning of the calendar year at the end of the bycatch  
47 year, creating very high incentives to keep bycatch low  
48 throughout the season so as not to jeopardize the highest  
49 value fishing season, thus effectively lowering the cap.  
50

1                   The Council indicated they are looking at  
2 regulatory changes to address these as well as changes to  
3 industry incentive plans for some, which indicates they  
4 are taking the need to reduce bycatch very seriously.

5  
6                   The Council will receive a discussion  
7 paper which looks at all these changes at the April 2012  
8 Council meeting in Anchorage, and will move forward from  
9 there.

10  
11                   Regulatory changes typically take at  
12 least a year or two to move through the Council process.

13  
14  
15                   The Council is also in the process of  
16 looking at chum salmon bycatch reduction measures. The  
17 process of addressing chum salmon bycatch is taking much  
18 longer than anticipated, because of the challenge of  
19 addressing chum salmon bycatch without inadvertently  
20 increasing Chinook salmon bycatch.

21  
22                   YRDFA continues to support bycatch  
23 reduction measures which reduce both Chinook and chum  
24 salmon bycatch. You can look at the separate handout for  
25 more details about the Chinook and chum salmon bycatch  
26 issue. You can look at the handout for more detail about  
27 chinook and chum salmon bycatch.

28  
29                   And I am happy to take any questions or  
30 comments from you on this issue and pass them along to  
31 Becca Robbins-Gisclair, our fisheries advisor who works  
32 on this issue.

33  
34                   Okay.

35  
36                   Next I'd like to move into the US Fish  
37 and Wildlife, YRDFA in-season subsistence monitoring  
38 program.

39  
40                   During the Chinook fishing season, YRDFA  
41 hires a person in 10 villages along the Yukon River to  
42 conduct interviews. This includes the villages of  
43 Alakanuk, Marshall, Russian Mission, Holy Cross, Huslia,  
44 Kaltag, Galena, Nenana, Fort Yukon and Eagle. The  
45 interviewers collect information measuring the progress  
46 fishermen make towards meeting their subsistence harvest  
47 goals for Chinook salmon, learning about fishing  
48 conditions, and also the quality of the subsistence  
49 catch. In 2013 126 households were interviewed, 372  
50 interviews as the Chinook salmon swam through the

1 villages. There was one community, Huslia, where we were  
2 not successful in finding a local hire to get the data  
3 and this resulted in a lack of data for 2013.

4  
5 As we all know, this was a challenging  
6 year for Chinook salmon fishers with low salmon numbers  
7 and pulse closures. Many communities reported very low  
8 progress towards harvest completion, zero to two percent  
9 for their communities. The communities that reported the  
10 highest Chinook salmon harvest completion were Alakanuk  
11 at nearly 34 percent, and Fort Yukon at 38 percent, and  
12 Kaltag at 45 percent. So while there's a range of some  
13 villages that harvested more fish than others, all of the  
14 participating villages and fishermen surveyed were at  
15 less than half of their desired harvest completion. And  
16 you can see the table on one of the handouts.

17  
18 This year a new question on the harvest  
19 survey asked fishers if they planned to reduce their  
20 Chinook harvest, and if so, what species would they use  
21 to replace chinook. Surveyors were able to gather  
22 information about fishers' conservation efforts and  
23 replacement species in half of these communities. The  
24 chart in your handout shows intentional conservation  
25 efforts reported by fisheries in Alakanuk, Galena,  
26 Nenana, Fort Yukon and Eagle. The other communities did  
27 not respond to this question. The chart also shows that  
28 summer chum and fall chum was the species selected most  
29 often as replacement for the subsistence harvest in  
30 Marshal, Kaltag, Galena, Fort Yukon and Eagle.

31  
32 Finally I'd like to report on our  
33 customary trade of salmon in the Upper Yukon project  
34 proposal, which YRDFA developed in partnership with the  
35 Alaska Department of Fish and Game, Subsistence Division.  
36 We are happy to receive a fund recommendation from our  
37 Fisheries Resource Monitoring Program proposal, customary  
38 trade of salmon in the Upper Yukon. This is a project  
39 that I'll be working on in partnership with Caroline  
40 Brown and David Koster from the Alaska Department of Fish  
41 and Game, Subsistence Division. This project, if funded,  
42 will be an interview and survey-based study to document  
43 historic and contemporary practices of customary trade in  
44 the Upper Yukon River communities, with particular  
45 attention to understanding the nature and scope of  
46 customary trade and its role in a larger continuum of  
47 exchange practices.

48  
49 We appreciate your continued support of  
50 our projects. We are hopeful that this project will be

1 supported by the RACs and the Federal Subsistence Board  
2 as it comes before them for review and action.

3

4 So that concludes my presentation and I'd  
5 be happy to answer any questions or provide contact  
6 information for others on the YRDFA Staff.

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.  
9 Council members, any questions of Catherine.

10

11

12 (No comments)

13

14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I don't hear  
15 any questions or hands raising here, so thank you  
16 Catherine.

17

18 MS. MONCRIEFF: Thank you for the  
19 opportunity.

20

21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You're welcome.  
22 Okay, we're going to move on -- there wasn't any action  
23 required from that so the next thing on our agenda is the  
24 Yukon River 2013 salmon season review from -- by Jeremy  
25 Mears.

26

27 Go ahead.

28

29 MR. MEARS: Good afternoon, Madame Chair,  
30 Members of the Council. My name is Jeremy Mears, I'm  
31 with the Fish and Wildlife Service here in Fairbanks.  
32 I'm going to present the Yukon River salmon season  
33 summary. This material is provided for you on Page 217  
34 of your RAC books.

35

36 The 2013 chinook salmon run was projected  
37 to range from poor to below average. Summer and fall  
38 chum salmon runs were projected to be average to above  
39 average and coho salmon were expected to be average.

40

41 Because chinook salmon have performed  
42 below expectations in recent years there had been a great  
43 deal of public involvement this past winter with the  
44 Federal Subsistence Board, the Alaska State Board of  
45 Fisheries, during their regulatory meetings; the three  
46 Yukon River RACs, numerous State Advisory Committees;  
47 US/Canada Joint Technical Committee; the Yukon River  
48 Panel and YRDFA all met to share information and receive  
49 input on conservation approaches. Key conservation  
50 approaches included:

- 1 1. The windows fishing schedule would  
2 begin early on May 30th at the mouth and  
3 progress up river based on fish swimming  
4 speed to help spread harvest.  
5
- 6 2. From the beginning gillnets would be  
7 restricted to a mesh size no larger than  
8 six inches to protect female and large  
9 chinook salmon while providing  
10 opportunity to harvest abundant summer  
11 chum.  
12
- 13 3. The first pulse of chinook salmon  
14 would be protected by closing at least  
15 one subsistence fishing period; and  
16
- 17 4. The commercial summer chum salmon  
18 season would be managed conservatively  
19 with no commercial sale of incidentally  
20 caught chinook salmon.  
21

22 In-season run strength assessment of  
23 chinook and summer chum salmon was primarily based on the  
24 lower river test fisheries at Emmonak, the Yukon River  
25 sonar near Pilot Station and subsistence fishermen catch  
26 reports. The regulatory windows subsistence salmon  
27 fishing schedule was initiated on May 30th in the coastal  
28 district and District 1 with gillnets restricted to no  
29 larger than six inch mesh size to coincide with the  
30 arrival of early chinook salmon. However, due to the  
31 late breakup the windows schedule was delayed one period  
32 while mesh restriction continued to allow harvest of non-  
33 salmon species. The delayed schedule with restricted  
34 gillnets was then implemented chronologically up river as  
35 the run progressed. The southern portion of the coastal  
36 district, which included Hooper Bay, Chevak and Scammon  
37 Bay as well as the Innoko and Koyukuk River all had their  
38 subsistence gillnet fishing gear restricted to six inch  
39 or smaller mesh size during the entire summer season.  
40

41 Initially one subsistence salmon fishing  
42 -- excuse me -- Initially one subsistence salmon fishing  
43 period was cancelled in District 1 and the northern  
44 portion of the coastal district beginning on June 20th,  
45 and then that was applied chronologically in each  
46 district or subdistrict as the pulse migrated up river.  
47

48 Unfortunately the chinook salmon run did  
49 not build much strength, while the overlapping summer  
50 chum salmon run came in well above average. All four

1 pulses of chinook salmon were protected by subsistence  
2 fishing closures. Brief subsistence fishing  
3 opportunities were provided in between the pulses of  
4 chinook salmon with the use of six inch or smaller  
5 gillnets when and where summer chum salmon were abundant.  
6 During these subsistence openings use of fishwheels was  
7 allowed with the stipulation that all chinook salmon were  
8 to be released unharmed. Areas that normally have few  
9 summer chum salmon available received less fishing time  
10 and most of their fishing effort would have been focused  
11 on the weak chinook salmon stock. Subsistence gillnets  
12 were restricted to six inches or smaller mesh size in the  
13 Innoko and Koyukuk Rivers but no fishing closures were  
14 imposed because few chinook salmon use those tributaries.

15  
16                   Despite these management actions the  
17 estimated US/Canada border passage was 30,000 chinook  
18 salmon was well below the interim management escapement  
19 goal range of 42,500 to 55,000 chinook salmon with no  
20 surplus available for the Canadian harvest share as  
21 stipulated by the Yukon River Salmon Agreement.

22  
23                   New commercial fishing gear options  
24 intended to allow for additional summer chum directed  
25 commercial fishing opportunity while allowing for the  
26 release of incidentally caught chinook salmon were  
27 implemented this season.

28  
29                   Commercial dipnet and beach seine gear  
30 was employed during most of the summer season when  
31 chinook salmon could not have been avoided with  
32 traditional gillnet gear.

33  
34                   Later in the summer season new 5.5  
35 gillnet gear was operated in special harvest areas and  
36 during specific times to harvest abundant chum and avoid  
37 concentrations of chinook salmon. Further up river  
38 special commercial periods were only opened for fishwheel  
39 gear to target summer chum salmon with the requirement to  
40 immediately release all chinook salmon alive. All  
41 chinook salmon caught in dipnets, beach seines and  
42 fishwheels were released while those caught in gillnets  
43 could not be sold but kept for subsistence use.

44  
45                   Preliminary commercial harvest from the  
46 summer season fishery is approximately 485,000 summer  
47 chum salmon, 1,125 chinook salmon were caught and  
48 released and 389 chinook salmon were caught but not sold  
49 and taken home for subsistence use.

50

1                   The fall season began in the lower river  
2 on July 16th with the expectation of a run size greater  
3 than 800,000 fall chum, enough to provide for escapement  
4 objectives, a normal subsistence fishery as well as a  
5 surplus for commercial harvest.

6  
7                   Subsistence salmon fishing reverted to  
8 the standard schedule of seven days per week in Districts  
9 1, 2 and 3 with closures 12 hours before, during and 12  
10 hours after announced commercial fishing periods. Since  
11 little or no commercial fishing effort was anticipated in  
12 District 4, and subdistricts 5A, B and C, these sections  
13 of the river began their fall season on a five day per  
14 week schedule as specified in regulation. Subdistrict 5D  
15 returned to a normal seven days per week schedule. And  
16 District 6 continued on its standard two, 42 hour periods  
17 per week regulatory schedule. Near the end of the season  
18 subsistence fishing in District 4 and 5A, B and C was  
19 relaxed to seven days per week.

20  
21                   Commercial fishing was initiated in the  
22 lower river at the start of the fall season to take  
23 advantage of the overlap in the summer chum salmon run  
24 and the anticipated -- excuse me, I'm going to start that  
25 over.

26  
27                   Commercial fishing was initiated in the  
28 lower river at the start of the fall season to take  
29 advantage of the overlap in the summer chum salmon run  
30 and the anticipated strong fall chum salmon run just  
31 beginning or in-river migration. Through the front half  
32 of the fall season chum salmon entered the river in above  
33 average run strength. During the second half of the  
34 season two large pulses of fall chum salmon entered the  
35 river and the run projection increased to a total run  
36 size between 900,000 and one million fish. Meanwhile the  
37 overlapping coho salmon run appeared to be developing  
38 below average. The commercial harvest of coho salmon  
39 remained at the upper end of the acceptable level to  
40 provide for necessary escapement needs and normal  
41 subsistence harvest levels.

42  
43                   In the lower river the fall commercial  
44 salmon fishing season closed by regulation on September  
45 1st, without extension as stipulated in the Yukon River  
46 Coho Salmon Management Plan because of the low coho  
47 salmon abundance.

48  
49                   Commercial fishing ended in subdistricts  
50 5A, 5B, and 5C on October 6th and ended in District 6 on

1 September 30th.

2

3                   The combined season commercial harvest  
4 through October 7th was 238,000 fall chum and 66,000 coho  
5 salmon. The fall chum salmon harvest is currently the  
6 third highest since 1995 and the coho salmon harvest is  
7 the fourth highest since 1995.

8

9                   Completed fall chum escapement projects  
10 ended above average with escapement goals being met or  
11 exceeded. The Eagle Sonar ended with 200,000 fall chum  
12 salmon passing the sonar. This is enough to meet border  
13 escapement goals including harvest sharing agreements  
14 with Canada.

15

16                   Escapement monitoring within the Tanana  
17 Drainage will continue through November but indications  
18 at this time are that all fall chum salmon escapements  
19 are expected to end within or above most escapement  
20 objectives for the 2013 season and coho salmon may end  
21 near the low end of the Delta Clearwater escapement goal,  
22 which is the only established goal in the drainage for  
23 coho salmon.

24

25                   Subsistence salmon harvest information  
26 collected in-season indicated that most fishermen did not  
27 meet their chinook salmon subsistence harvest goals.  
28 Generally fishermen reported a lack of fishing  
29 opportunity, having to fish later into the season or  
30 having to shift their fishing efforts to other species.  
31 Even with implementation of exceptionally conservative  
32 management actions that restricted both the chinook  
33 salmon subsistence harvest and the targeted summer chum  
34 salmon commercial fishery, less than half the Alaskan  
35 escapement objectives were attained and the US/Canada  
36 Treaty agreement was not met.

37

38                   It is well recognized that the Yukon  
39 River fishing community is heavily relied upon for  
40 assistance in conserving the chinook salmon run. To  
41 sustain this important resource fishermen incurred a  
42 significant hardship through reduced harvest. Given the  
43 trend in chinook salmon runs in recent years, we will be  
44 working with fishermen and interested parties this winter  
45 to develop conservative rebuilding strategies with the  
46 primary goal to provide for escapement needs and  
47 subsistence uses during low years while looking for ways  
48 to accommodate other fishing opportunities.

49

50                   Any ideas you could provide would be

1 greatly appreciated by the managers.  
2  
3 Thank you.  
4  
5 (Laughter)  
6  
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just a little  
8 bit of chuckles we have back here.  
9  
10 (Laughter)  
11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you for  
13 the report. Question's Council members.  
14  
15 There is one right here.  
16  
17 MR. UMPHENOUR: Yeah, why didn't you  
18 mention they added that friendly fishwheels.  
19  
20 MR. MEARS: Can you restate the question.  
21  
22 MR. UMPHENOUR: I said why didn't you  
23 mention that in order to fish for chum salmon with a  
24 fishwheel they had to have a special fish friendly  
25 fishwheel per the new regulations adopted last January.  
26 That cost a lot of money to do that and lots of work.  
27 Ask the guy in back of you about it.  
28  
29 He's raising his hand.  
30  
31 MR. NEWLAND: Madame Chair. Members of  
32 the Council. My name is Eric Newland with the Alaska  
33 Department of Fish and Game. I'm the Yukon area summer  
34 season manager.  
35  
36 I believe what Virgil is talking about is  
37 the requirement for commercial fishwheels that are  
38 operated in the Yukon in Districts 4 through 6, during  
39 times of king salmon conservation they are to be manned  
40 and they are to be constructed in a manner that's fish  
41 friendly, where the chute is padded and the fish can  
42 slide down and end up in the box without being beat  
43 unnecessarily and I believe the baskets have to be  
44 composed of a material similar to seine web. So in the  
45 fishery in Kaltag, in District 4, I believe, eight wheels  
46 were spinning there and they were all asked to be manned  
47 and built in that manner, as well as a few wheels in  
48 District 6 where that's the requirement as well.  
49  
50 At some point in the summer season when

1 most of the kings were gone, the commercial fishery  
2 shifted to more of an open gear type after -- where set  
3 net gillnet permitholders could also fish and that  
4 requirement was lifted, but for the vast majority of the  
5 season that requirement, those wheels will be manned and  
6 kings would be released and those wheels had to be made  
7 in a certain manner.

8

9                   So I hope that answers your question.

10

11                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That was a good  
12 question, Virgil, because my mind was thinking, hum, how  
13 are they doing that.

14

15                   (Laughter)

16

17                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So now I know  
18 except for the box they go into, are they into water  
19 right away.

20

21                   MR. NEWLAND: Yes, it's a box, or it can  
22 be -- people use a chute or -- which is kind of a  
23 functional chute, some people have kind of a sled or some  
24 kind of slide that they put in the -- at the chute and  
25 they slide off that sled right into the water. So they  
26 don't even end up in the box itself.

27

28                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh.

29

30                   MR. NEWLAND: The.....

31

32                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Nice.

33

34                   MR. NEWLAND: .....chum, the target  
35 species.....

36

37                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh. Uh-  
38 huh.

39

40                   MR. NEWLAND: .....would -- they would  
41 allow to fall into the box, but the chinook -- when they  
42 see the chinook in the basket they would get them back to  
43 the water as soon as possible.

44

45                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: They're not  
46 going this direction, they're going that direction, I  
47 see.

48

49                   Good question.

50

1                   Anyone else.  
2  
3                   MR. UMPHENOUR: Oh, let me.....  
4  
5                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Donald, then  
6 you.  
7  
8                   MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame  
9 Chairman. You asked for ideas.  
10  
11                   (Laughter)  
12  
13                   MR. WOODRUFF: When is this process  
14 beginning, today, or this winter.  
15  
16                   MR. MEARS: Today. This winter.  
17  
18                   MR. WOODRUFF: Okay. I have some ideas.  
19 Aside from the drastic measure of a moratorium on  
20 harvesting chinook up and down the whole river, I would  
21 suggest that you protect the first pulse, the second  
22 pulse and by golly, the third pulse by emergency order,  
23 if necessary. And I can foresee in the near future that  
24 this moratorium is going to become more and more popular  
25 if we ever want to see a king back in the river again.  
26  
27                   And I think a village by village  
28 commitment not to harvest chinook, and, us, all, working  
29 together, every village, and all the Federal people, all  
30 the State people, all the Regional Councils, we can all  
31 work together and resolve this issue of not being able to  
32 meet border escapement and actually getting some fish on  
33 the table for the people.  
34  
35                   Thank you.  
36  
37                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go ahead.  
38  
39                   MR. MEARS: I think we'd all like to  
40 avoid a moratorium and have the communities decide, in  
41 conser -- you know, get everybody on board with  
42 conservation would be the best possible solution.  
43  
44                   Virgil.  
45  
46                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes, Virgil.  
47  
48                   MR. UMPHENOUR: I have a suggestion,  
49 although I've suggested this in the past, in fact  
50 everything they did this year we've suggested in the

1 past. The one thing we've suggested in the past that  
2 hasn't been done yet, though, is totally abolish drift  
3 gillnetting. It's not a traditional fishery. It didn't  
4 start until the early '80s, and prior to that we didn't  
5 have problems.

6  
7 Make everyone go back to setnets or  
8 fishwheels.

9  
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Lester.

11  
12 MR. ERHART: Yeah, that's what happened.  
13 Back in the '80s when they opened up the driftnetting  
14 that's when the problems started, right there, with your  
15 customary trade and everything. The people found out how  
16 much fish they could catch if they got out in the middle  
17 and I talked to a lot of people down there, and as you  
18 know everybody's not legal, following the rules. They  
19 put extra section on for their king salmon, which is not  
20 right, but I listen to them anyway, I mean they're taking  
21 away -- we're trying to build this thing back up but  
22 they're taking it away.

23  
24 But if they go back to setnets in the  
25 '80s like they used to do I think this will solve a lot  
26 of problems.

27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You're getting  
29 lots of suggestions.

30  
31 MR. MEARS: Yes, I am. And I think the  
32 idea of abolishing driftnets is something, you know,  
33 we'll certainly take the comment but it's -- it would  
34 probably be a fairly contentious issue up and down the  
35 river or.....

36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Like some of  
38 these that we got to deal with.

39  
40 MR. MEARS: .....or down river -- yeah.

41  
42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

44  
45 MR. WOODRUFF: We can make that proposal.

46  
47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

48  
49 (Laughter)

50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, well, I  
2 mean it is something that -- you guys are managers and  
3 you want, what was it, help, you're getting your  
4 suggestions of help.

5  
6 MR. MEARS: And they are appreciated.

7  
8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I know  
9 it's contentious but sometimes stuff like that -- the  
10 resource -- when I first got on this Council, I think  
11 it's 12 years ago already, I could not believe the  
12 problems I was hearing then and it seemed like something  
13 needed to be done drastic back then, not 12 years later.  
14 And so maybe drastic measures is what you're going to  
15 have to do because those sheep -- oh, now it's sheep --  
16 ah, ah, ah, but, anyway, those fish they're in trouble,  
17 they need help. So, yeah, I take that to heart after all  
18 these years of listening about the Yukon fish, yeah.

19  
20 Anyone else want to help.

21  
22 MR. GLANZ: Yeah. I know in Central I'm  
23 so tired of hearing we got to eliminate the pollock  
24 fisheries, got to eliminate the pollock fisheries, that's  
25 what everybody's whining about and I don't think that's  
26 ever going to happen but -- other than the -- what do you  
27 call those guys that catch and check the fish, I don't  
28 know.

29  
30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Observers.

31  
32 MR. GLANZ: Observers, that's the word  
33 I'm looking for. But I know that ain't never going to  
34 happen.

35  
36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I heard stories  
37 about observers saying they were silenced at times, they  
38 weren't allowed to say everything they saw.

39  
40 MR. GLANZ: A little bit of dollars goes  
41 a long ways.

42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: People that  
44 actually worked out there. Yeah.

45  
46 MR. GLANZ: That's the trouble. If  
47 there's money, you can buy anything.

48  
49 (Laughter)

50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You got some  
2 really good one liners there.  
3  
4 MR. GLANZ: Well, no, you can.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, it's  
7 true, and I said they're good one liners.  
8  
9 MR. GLANZ: Don't forget I came from  
10 where you got to vote early and often.  
11  
12 (Laughter)  
13  
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Did you  
15 have anything.  
16  
17 MR. FIRMIN: I just think that, you know,  
18 like I got to agree with what everybody just said, like  
19 even with the driftnets because the driftnet thing is a  
20 large problem and it's only been around 20 years.  
21  
22 MR. ERHART: Yep.  
23  
24 MR. FIRMIN: And I don't know, I always  
25 hear and I feel for people on the lower river because  
26 they say, well, I can't afford gas, can't do this, well,  
27 neither can I but that still doesn't stop me from fishing  
28 as much as I can, or at least fishing with a partner or  
29 doing something, it still doesn't mean -- I just got to  
30 fish closer to town. Also more people for money, fish  
31 for more families, you know, share more, and that's  
32 something they should be already doing, too. I don't  
33 care if it takes them two hours to get your summer's  
34 catch down river, that's all they need, that's all they  
35 say they need and that's all they ever want, is two hours  
36 of fishing and I don't care about the rest of the summer,  
37 then they got all the king salmon they need. Well, it  
38 takes me that long just to -- cripes, I don't even know,  
39 get my boat ready to go back and forth to the net and the  
40 wheel three or four times a day and that's a real -- I  
41 don't know -- that, and then still go to work, and then  
42 go home and take care of the kids after that, it's not --  
43 I know I do it and I know a lot of other people could do  
44 it so I don't see why anybody on the lower river couldn't  
45 do it, regardless of the price of gas or their CDQ groups  
46 that buy them gas and nets and bought them all six inch  
47 nets this summer or, oh, wait, they already had them for  
48 their commercial fishing. And I just think that that  
49 would be something that nobody on the upper river would  
50 complain about.

1                   And like Bill said, you can't stop paying  
2 attention to the open ocean also with the North Pacific  
3 fisheries and the Bristol Bay fisheries and all the  
4 intercept fisheries. There's more than one effect that  
5 we're having on the fishery. But in river that's one  
6 thing that we could do, is just gear types.

7  
8                   Because I mean if we're giving the lower  
9 river beach seines and dipnets, woo-who, well, take  
10 their driftnets away from them and let them stay on the  
11 beach all day.

12  
13                   (Laughter)

14  
15                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That reminds me  
16 of what my friend always says, woo-who snart. Okay.  
17 Virgil -- wonderful Virgil has another one, short he  
18 said.

19  
20                   MR. UMPHENOUR: Very short. The bycatch  
21 in the June fishery in Area M, they need to GSI on it,  
22 genetic stock identification, that is important, because  
23 they are catching -- I don't know what they caught this  
24 summer but I know the June before they caught, let's see,  
25 I think it was 7,600 fish in three weeks, king salmon, in  
26 that June fishery. That's a lot.

27  
28                   And I do know this, I know that when Dr.  
29 Kosan was doing the ichthyophonus work on the Yukon  
30 River, that they also -- trying to determine whether we  
31 were getting infected, they sampled the herring because  
32 king salmon normally get ichthyophonus from eating  
33 herring in the marine environment, they sampled the  
34 herring in the Bering Sea and they could not find any  
35 ichthyophonus in the Bering Sea herring so the conclusion  
36 was that the king salmon, some of them are going south of  
37 Alaska Peninsula and getting ichthyophonus from eating  
38 infected herring in the Gulf of Alaska. That's why we  
39 need to do the GSI work on the bycatch in the Area M June  
40 fishery.

41  
42                   Thank you.

43  
44                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Anything else  
45 guys.

46  
47  
48                   (No comments)

49  
50                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Thank

1 you, very much.  
2  
3 MR. MEARS: Thank you.  
4  
5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh. And  
6 good luck.  
7  
8 A lot of these hard issues definitely are  
9 going to have to be worked out. It's kind of scary.  
10  
11 The next thing on the agenda is another  
12 report, how do you guys feel, it's almost 4:00 o'clock,  
13 do you want to keep going.  
14  
15  
16 (No comments)  
17  
18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Did you say you  
19 have to leave at 5:00.  
20  
21 MR. FIRMIN: I could probably go  
22 without.....  
23  
24 (Laughter)  
25  
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. And  
27 Virgil has to leave at 5:30, so I will lose my quorum.  
28  
29 MR. FIRMIN: What else do we have to have  
30 a quorum for.  
31  
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just our  
33 confirmation of the -- let's see -- we've already done  
34 the rural determination so, yeah, we just got to talk  
35 about the meeting dates, but we have a bunch of reports  
36 here.  
37  
38 (Pause)  
39  
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Let's see what  
41 we can do and then can you give me a head's up when you  
42 want to take off and let's.....  
43  
44 MR. FIRMIN: I'll stick around to 5:30.  
45  
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, we've got  
47 to 5:30. Do you want a break or do you want to keep  
48 going.  
49  
50 MR. WOODRUFF: Keep going.

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Partners  
2 Fisheries Monitoring Program, is that.....  
3  
4 MS. PATTON: No, no.....  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....what we --  
7 oh, that's OSM.  
8  
9 MS. PATTON: And Trent Liebich is on  
10 line, so (no microphone).....  
11  
12 (Pause)  
13  
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I don't  
15 know, I put a checkmark by one that I skipped over, I  
16 apologize. The Draft 2014 Fisheries Resource Monitoring  
17 Plan, Trent, you're on line.  
18  
19 MR. LIEBICH: Yeah, I'm here, can you  
20 hear me all right.  
21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes, go ahead.  
23  
24 MR. LIEBICH: All right. Good afternoon,  
25 Madame Chair, and members of the Council. We haven't  
26 worked in the past so I'm going to just give you a brief  
27 introduction but I'll try to keep this really short.  
28  
29 I'm Trent Liebich, I work as a fish  
30 biologist.....  
31  
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Trent, can I  
33 interrupt you for just one second.  
34  
35 MR. LIEBICH: Yep.  
36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.  
38  
39 DR. JENKINS: Madame Chair. This is  
40 David Jenkins with OSM.  
41  
42 I wanted to alert the Council to a little  
43 quirk we have with this FRMP program before Trent starts  
44 describing it to you.  
45  
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
47  
48 DR. JENKINS: Because it's going to  
49 affect this Council. We discovered last week that there  
50 was a proposal that was submitted to the FRMP

1 Program.....

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh.

4

5 DR. JENKINS: .....that was inadvertently  
6 not brought through the system, so the Technical Review  
7 Committee didn't get a chance to review it and  
8 consequently it's not in front of you for your  
9 consideration today.

10

11 It needs to go out to the Technical  
12 Review Committee, the OSM has quickly written up its own  
13 review of it, it'll take a couple of weeks to go through  
14 the Technical Review Committee and then this Council will  
15 need to look at that proposal and put it in the mix of  
16 the proposals that you see in front of you right now, so  
17 there's going to be one more showing up. The problem for  
18 this Council is that you're going to need to figure out  
19 how to consider that proposal in this mix, which will  
20 probably take a teleconference, and will take a  
21 teleconference that is publicly noticed, so if you can  
22 decide on a date that you all can talk about it, then we  
23 can only have a two week public notice.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Or, if we can  
26 agree to it today, is that possible.

27

28 DR. JENKINS: Well, the problem is the  
29 Technical Review Committee, which is the committee that  
30 reviews these proposals for scientific merit and  
31 technical merit hasn't met, hasn't reviewed it, so that's  
32 the review that takes place that then gives its advice to  
33 the Council and to the Board.

34

35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So we can't  
36 give advice first.

37

38 DR. JENKINS: So you can't do it today,  
39 you haven't seen it, it's not in front of you, you don't  
40 have the proposal here. It's on black fish and it has to  
41 do with the Yukon River and the Kuskokwim River as well.  
42 So there are three Councils that will need to take a look  
43 at this. So I wanted to alert you to that before Trent  
44 gets started with his FRMP.....

45

46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

47

48 DR. JENKINS: .....summary.

49

50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.

1 DR. JENKINS: And then Trent can add more  
2 details if you have questions.

3  
4 Madame Chair, thank you very much.

5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, thanks,  
7 David.

8  
9 All right, now, Trent, apologize for that  
10 but go ahead.

11  
12 MR. LIEBICH: Okay, no problem, that's  
13 important information. Thank you, David.

14  
15 So, yes, I was just going to introduce  
16 myself a little since I haven't met any of you in person.

17  
18 I'm relatively new to the Office of  
19 Subsistence Management and I was working in the Bristol  
20 Bay, Kodiak and Aleutian regions. In this past year I've  
21 really started kind of transitioning my work and focusing  
22 on the Yukon River and listening in on all the YRDFA  
23 calls and I was at the Western Interior RAC two weeks ago  
24 in Fairbanks. Called in and presented to the Yukon Delta  
25 RAC in Bethel last week. And then here today working  
26 with you folks.

27  
28 I've been in and out of Alaska numerous  
29 times for about 13 years now, living here permanently for  
30 several years. And before I moved to Anchorage last  
31 winter to work with OSM, I was living in Cold Bay on the  
32 Alaska Peninsula. And normally the only meat we eat in  
33 our home is stuff we harvest ourselves so I feel really  
34 fortunate to work in the subsistence program and it was  
35 really worthwhile to move to Anchorage to be part of it.

36  
37 I really look forward to working with you  
38 guys on the Yukon issues.

39  
40 That's a little bit about myself.

41  
42 I'll get into the business here.

43  
44 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. Madame Chair.

45  
46 MR. LIEBICH: For the record again my  
47 name is Trent, and I'm a fish biologist with OSM and I'm  
48 going to cover the Fisheries Resource Monitoring Program.

49  
50 If you'd turn to Page 221 of your meeting

1 book, if you want to follow along with the information on  
2 the Resource Monitoring Program, the FRMP.

3  
4 This is a funding opportunity for  
5 projects that provide information need to sustain  
6 subsistence fisheries on Federal public land. This  
7 funding's available every other year through OSM and can  
8 be used for projects lasting up to four years in length.

9  
10 So for example, you know, the projects  
11 we're discussing today could begin as early as 2014 and  
12 last up to 2017 if that length of time was appropriate  
13 for the project. And this four year timeline for this  
14 year's pool of funding and projects can always reapply  
15 for future funding and extend the length beyond four  
16 years if additional funding was received. So some of  
17 these projects go on a lot longer than four years but in  
18 the individual funding cycle they're up to a four year  
19 timeline.

20  
21 Projects come in -- submitted to OSM and  
22 then are evaluated by the Technical Review Committee.  
23 That Review Committee is made up of members of the five  
24 Federal agencies, three representatives from Alaska  
25 Department of Fish and Game are also on that committee.  
26 And then the fisheries and anthropology Staff from OSM  
27 are providing support for this Review Committee. There's  
28 four evaluation criteria that are used on proposals by  
29 the TRC:

- 30  
31 Strategic priority  
32  
33 Technical and scientific merit  
34  
35 Investigatory ability and resources  
36  
37 Partnership and capacity building

38  
39 During the last decade, so like 2000,  
40 2010, the available funding's been about \$6.25 million  
41 annually. As you know budgeting issues this funding is  
42 continuing to decline and it's projected this year that  
43 the available funding is about \$3.7 million for new  
44 projects starting in 2014. And this is the -- this 3.7  
45 million is funding projected for statewide project  
46 proposals that are requested either a stock status and  
47 trends or harvest monitoring, traditional ecological  
48 knowledge projects. Two-thirds of the funding is  
49 allocated to the stock status and trends projects and  
50 one-third is allocated to the harvest monitoring,

1 traditional ecological projects.

2

3                   So this year statewide we received a  
4 total of 56 investigation plans, with a total proposed  
5 cost for all those investigation plans, the total cost  
6 would be \$6.6 million. 43 of those projects were looking  
7 at stock status and trends, and 13 would be harvest  
8 monitoring and traditional ecological knowledge  
9 investigation plans. The Technical Review Committee  
10 looked over these 56 investigation plans and has  
11 recommended funding 40 of the 56 investigation plans and  
12 the proposed cost for those 40 would be \$4.8 million.  
13 So, again, there's 3.7 million estimated to be available,  
14 and right now the recommendation for funding is 4.8  
15 million.

16

17                   This 2014 funding recommendation works  
18 out to be about 21 percent of the funding to Alaska  
19 Native Organizations, 29 percent to State agencies, 43  
20 percent to Federal agencies and 7 percent to other non-  
21 government organizations.

22

23                   So that's the statewide overview for the  
24 FRMP.

25

26                   Now, I'll just describe within the Yukon  
27 region for this year's funding cycle. So if you want to  
28 look at that, Page 226 of your meeting book is where the  
29 Yukon region overview starts.

30

31                   As David mentioned this would normally be  
32 an action item to support or modify but we are still  
33 dealing with the blackfish proposal so it's not an action  
34 item as I understand it on today's agenda.

35

36                   For the Yukon River this year's funding  
37 there's seven priority information needs that were  
38 identified. And those priorities are listed on Page 226  
39 in your meeting book and they identify several chinook  
40 and chum salmon information needs and also some  
41 whitefish, sheefish and Northern Pike issues.

42

43                   Since the monitoring program began in  
44 2000, there's been 95 projects funded in the Yukon  
45 region. And nine of these projects are still underway in  
46 2014. For this year's funding opportunity, there's 12  
47 investigation plans submitted for research in the Yukon  
48 region. After review of these investigation plans by the  
49 Technical Review Committee in June, this past summer,  
50 nine of the proposed projects were recommended for

1 funding.

2

3 If you want to look at that list -- let  
4 me see the page number here.....

5

6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: 227.

7

8 MR. LIEBICH: 227, thank you. So if you  
9 want to look at 227 in your meeting book, you can see a  
10 list of the nine projects that were recommended for  
11 funding. It's the Gisasa River weir video integration;  
12 the East Fork Andreafsky River Chinook and summer chum  
13 abundance; the Gisasa River salmon weir Chinook and  
14 summer chum abundance; the Yukon River coho salmon  
15 microsatellite baseline, the Yukon River chum mixed stock  
16 analysis; Koyukuk River chum salmon video telemetry  
17 study; Henshaw Creek adult salmon abundance and run  
18 timing; the Lower Yukon River whitefish harvest  
19 monitoring; and a Upper Yukon area customary trade.

20

21 The funding guideline for the Yukon  
22 region for this year, for the 2014 funding cycle was  
23 \$1,073,000, for the nine projects I just described to  
24 you, and the estimated cost is approximately \$934,000.  
25 If you're looking at the budget in the book on 227, it  
26 shows \$916, but there's actually a modification or a  
27 little over \$18,000 modification to the Koyukuk River  
28 chum salmon radiotelemetry project and that increase is  
29 a result of adding abundance estimate for chum on that  
30 telemetry project and that was recommended by the TRC  
31 after review.

32

33 So overall the nine projects recommended  
34 for funding by the Technical Review Committee addressed  
35 strategically important information needs. They're based  
36 on sound science, and they'll promote cooperative  
37 partnerships.

38

39 Madame Chair and Council members, that is  
40 my summary of the monitoring proposals for the Yukon for  
41 this 2014 funding cycle.

42

43 Thank you.

44

45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.  
46 Council members, any questions.

47

48

49

50

MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you for that report.

1 So were all nine of these funded or were they just  
2 recommended for funding.

3

4 MR. LIEBICH: These were recommended for  
5 funding after the review -- the Technical Review  
6 Committee, so there was 12 projects submitted, they  
7 reviewed them and recommended nine of them for possible  
8 funding.

9

10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Is it my  
11 understanding that the one that David mentioned is going  
12 -- you guys are going to look at that and then come back  
13 to us and we're going to have this teleconference.

14

15 MR. LIEBICH: Yeah, I'm going to let  
16 David answer that.

17

18 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair and Council, if  
19 I may. There is information on the other three projects  
20 that were not recommended to forward for funding and the  
21 Council has the opportunity to also weigh in and review  
22 those. Just to bring to your attention. Those are  
23 listed in your book on 230 so that you're aware of all  
24 the proposals that were submitted for the Yukon region.

25

26 DR. JENKINS: Madame Chair. It seems to  
27 me that you can take action on what's in front of you and  
28 then when you have your teleconference work in the  
29 proposal that you haven't had a chance to look at. So if  
30 you're satisfied with these rankings and you would like  
31 to see these projects funded as recommended by the TRC  
32 then you can proceed that way. And then in the event --  
33 or after you see this next proposal you can take action  
34 on that one particular proposal.

35

36 It's up to the Council how you want to  
37 proceed.

38

39 Madame Chair.

40

41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. But the  
42 other three are also something that we can talk about.

43

44 DR. JENKINS: The do not fund's you can  
45 talk about as well, yes.

46

47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, okay.  
48 Okay, Council members what is your wishes.

49

50 (Pause)

1 MS. PATTON: And, Council.....  
2  
3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
4  
5 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair, if I may --  
6 oh.....  
7  
8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Donald.  
9  
10 MS. PATTON: .....go ahead.  
11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Donald.  
13  
14 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame  
15 Chairman.  
16  
17 On Page 246 there's an executive summary  
18 of a Bering Sea cisco spawning migration investigation,  
19 and I would like to put on the record that I think this  
20 is a sound project because the State of Alaska has a  
21 commercial fisheries on this fish stock and they have no  
22 clue the population size and that could be an issue. We  
23 get Bering ciscos up on the upper Yukon, and I'm going to  
24 be eating those instead of chinook so that's an issue for  
25 me.  
26  
27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. So  
28 that's one of those three, was it, I'm sorry, I'm not  
29 following along.  
30  
31 MR. UMPHENOUR: Yeah.  
32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah. So would  
34 you -- is that a motion to add it or what would you like  
35 to do.  
36  
37 MR. WOODRUFF: That's a motion for us to  
38 recognize its significant value.  
39  
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Sure.  
41 We're welcome to get all the help we can get.  
42  
43 MR. PELTOLA: Madame Chair. Gene  
44 Peltola, ARD, OSM.  
45  
46 I'd just like to mention I've observed a  
47 lot of the RACs for this fall cycle, and the different  
48 range of options that have been expressed by the RACs --  
49 as an example, the North Slope did not take any action,  
50 or they accepted the list, the recommendation of the TRC

1 as is. Yukon Delta, Southeast RACs, they took the list,  
2 they modified them, removed some projects, replaced some  
3 others. If the RAC decides to do that, you have to  
4 understand that, you know, for each area we have X amount  
5 of dollars to divvy out, and so if you replace one,  
6 you're potentially pulling another one out from  
7 potentially being funded. That's an option that's  
8 available to the RAC. And the Western Interior looked at  
9 the list, they asked for additional support from OSM to  
10 provide them some more background before they decided to  
11 look at the list and see if they wanted to modify or not.  
12

13                   Once the Eastern Interior, here,  
14 finalizes the projects with regards to the proposed  
15 projects, it'll go to the Federal Subsistence Board, they  
16 may tweak it just a little bit, and then the Southeast is  
17 a little bit different, but the list for potentially  
18 funded projects goes to Beth Pendleton, Regional  
19 Forester, she signs off on the obligation of their funds,  
20 and all the others come to me where I'll sign off an  
21 obligation of the Fish and Wildlife Service funds for  
22 them.

23  
24                   So there's a different range of options  
25 you have available to you.

26  
27                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Council  
28 members, any questions. You understand it.

29  
30  
31                   (No comments)

32  
33                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No questions,  
34 or, no, you don't understand it.

35  
36                   MR. WOODRUFF: Madame Chair. I understand  
37 it, but it's just a matter if we're going to support this  
38 one then we need to pull one of them out.....

39  
40                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

41  
42                   MR. WOODRUFF: .....I suspect.

43  
44                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah. And  
45 that's what -- well, except we don't have an.....

46  
47                   MS. PATTON: Madame Chair.

48  
49                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....estimate  
50 of the cost.

1 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair and Council.  
2 It is an opportunity -- so the Council doesn't  
3 necessarily have to say, we want to defund another  
4 project, there is an opportunity to reprioritize.....  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
7  
8 MS. PATTON: .....if that helps, you're  
9 not having to do the math today but.....  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
12  
13 MS. PATTON: .....you can prioritize and  
14 you don't have to say you don't want another proposal, if  
15 you do want to see that as well.  
16  
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So this list is  
18 one through nine, am I to assume that No. 1 is the  
19 highest priority and nine the least. Who can answer  
20 that.  
21  
22 MR. LIEBICH: Uh.....  
23  
24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Is that you,  
25 Trent, that wanted to answer that.  
26  
27 MR. LIEBICH: Uh, yeah, I.....  
28  
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Actually.....  
30  
31 MR. LIEBICH: .....don't have an answer  
32 to that right now for you.  
33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....just one  
35 minute.  
36  
37 MR. PELTOLA: Yeah, Gene Peltola again.  
38 The way this system is designed is that the TRC gave a  
39 list of recommend to fund and not to fund, not  
40 necessarily any prioritized list.  
41  
42 So there's two, recommend to fund and not  
43 to fund.  
44  
45 Example, like I mentioned YK-Delta, they  
46 decided to play with the list and they prioritized  
47 theirs. Others have not. It just depends on how you  
48 want this particular RAC to interact. If you want to  
49 prioritize it, that's fine, if you.....  
50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I see.  
2  
3 MR. PELTOLA: .....don't want to that's  
4 fine also.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: If we want to  
7 we can do that, yeah, okay.  
8  
9 Pippa.  
10  
11 MS. KENNER: Thank you, Madame Chair and  
12 Council members. I'd like to direct you to -- and, hi,  
13 Trent, this is Pippa -- Pippa Kenner with OSM. I'd like  
14 to direct you to Table 5 on Page 231, there you will find  
15 a list in the order of the project numbers, from 201,  
16 202, 203, and the top are stock, status and trends, and  
17 the bottom are what we call harvest monitoring and  
18 traditional ecological knowledge projects. In the middle  
19 column, at the top of the column, it says TRC, that's our  
20 Technical Review Committee, it's a group of highly  
21 qualified individuals who read all the investigation  
22 plans and meet with OSM Staff to discuss the rigor of  
23 each of the projects and you'll see the recommendation.  
24 There's a yes, yes, yes, there are three no's. Then at  
25 the bottom you'll see three lines. One says total, one  
26 says funding guideline, and one says TRC recommendation.  
27 You'll notice that all the projects that were recommended  
28 and not recommended, the total funding for 2012 would  
29 have been 1.099 million. We allocate, as a guideline,  
30 for the Yukon region, \$1.073,000 million, and currently  
31 through the TRC's -- the Technical Review Committee's  
32 recommendation, if all of those projects with a yes next  
33 to them were funded for 2012 [sic] it would be \$916,000.  
34 So currently the TRC recommendation is actually below the  
35 funding guideline. It's not that much below, it's  
36 actually pretty much right on and, therefore, the  
37 prioritization of projects isn't necessary because it  
38 looks like we're not going to fall below that funding  
39 guideline.  
40  
41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Questions.  
42  
43  
44 (No comments)  
45  
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any questions.  
47  
48  
49 (No comments)  
50

1                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, let's --  
2 thank you for that. And I heard one suggestion, and I  
3 want to know how you want to proceed.  
4  
5                   Virgil.  
6  
7                   MR. UMPHENOUR: We have two whitefish  
8 projects there and one of them they've recommended -- I  
9 believe they recommended to fund it.  
10  
11                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Cisco spawning,  
12 it says no.  
13  
14                   MR. UMPHENOUR: That's the Lower Yukon  
15 whitefish harvest monitoring, they've.....  
16  
17                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: One's not  
18 funded it looks like or.....  
19  
20                   MR. UMPHENOUR: Right. Well, that one's  
21 -- it says, yes, to fund.  
22  
23                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And that's at  
24 the bottom, uh-huh.  
25  
26                   MR. UMPHENOUR: Yeah, for 164,000.....  
27  
28                   MS. KENNER: For the record, this is  
29 Pippa Kenner. Could you.....  
30  
31                   MR. UMPHENOUR: .....that's for 2013.  
32  
33                   MS. KENNER: .....by any -- Virgil, it  
34 would really be helpful for us if you could cite the  
35 number to the left so we can know what you're talking  
36 about.  
37  
38                   Thank you.  
39  
40                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.  
41  
42                   MR. UMPHENOUR: 14-252.  
43  
44                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And the other  
45 one you were talking about that isn't.....  
46  
47                   MR. UMPHENOUR: Is 14-205.  
48  
49                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh, so,  
50 now, your point.

1 MR. UMPHENOUR: Well, we have to decide  
2 which one we think is the most important is what I think  
3 and prioritize it. If we think that the other one is  
4 more important, 205, then we should say, we need to -- we  
5 need to take five minutes and read them is what we need  
6 to do and decide which one we think is most important,  
7 because I think there's a good chance that maybe No. 205  
8 is more important than 252 to us up here. And maybe the  
9 lower.....

10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Is that what  
12 you're suggesting, you want to take five minutes and read  
13 them.

14  
15 MR. UMPHENOUR: Yes.

16  
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, let's  
18 take five minutes and read them.

19  
20 (Pause)

21  
22  
23 MR. FIRMIN: Virgil, I'll point out one  
24 thing to you right now, the 205, which is up in our neck  
25 of the woods is actually going to bring out some data and  
26 252 is going to be a harvest sampling and it's going to  
27 cost more, that's one thing that I don't get. You're  
28 already doing harvest -- you know, harvest data, you're  
29 already doing that, you're already asking people how much  
30 fish they caught, all you're adding is whitefish to it,  
31 so I don't see why that would cost more than a DIDSON  
32 sonar.

33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, and I  
35 heard.....

36  
37 MR. UMPHENOUR: Good point.

38  
39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That is a very  
40 good point.

41  
42 Do you want an answer to that or do you  
43 just want to discuss this among us -- yeah, you want  
44 to.....

45  
46 MR. FIRMIN: Pointing it out.

47  
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....hang on --  
49 you're just pointing it out. And I have to agree with  
50 you, well, that's that common sense I keep talking about.

1 MR. FIRMIN: And they spawn up here, they  
2 don't spawn down there.  
3  
4 MS. KENNER: Madame Chair. I need to  
5 make a correction. I was reading from the table and I  
6 wasn't paying attention. Again, for the record, this is  
7 Pippa Kenner from OSM.  
8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Pippa, can you  
10 pull that a little closer.  
11  
12 MS. KENNER: Sure. When we were looking  
13 at Table 5 on Page 231, it indicates that the first year  
14 of funding for these projects is 2012, that is wrong, the  
15 numbers at the top weren't modified from our last cycle.  
16 The first year of funding is 2014 and not 2012.  
17  
18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So do you want  
19 to help me out then, that 2014 should be clear over where  
20 it says 2012.  
21  
22 MS. KENNER: Correct. And the next  
23 number would be 2015.  
24  
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: 2014, and the  
26 next number is -- and then the next column would be '15  
27 instead of '13, and so on.  
28  
29 MS. KENNER: That's right. Just in case  
30 any Council member was confused.  
31  
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No wonder I  
33 don't understand this stuff.  
34  
35 (Laughter)  
36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
38 Council.....  
39  
40 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair and Council.  
41 If the Council had questions on those particular  
42 proposals, too, Staff, who were part of the review could  
43 so answer questions.  
44  
45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And who are  
46 they that's here.  
47  
48 MS. PATTON: Trent Liebich is on line.  
49 And David Jenkins. And there's also a summary as well.  
50 And Pippa Kenner.....

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And, Pippa,  
2 okay.  
3  
4 MS. PATTON: .....who is here with us,  
5 yes.....  
6  
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.  
8  
9 MS. PATTON: .....so if there's some  
10 questions or clarification of the.....  
11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah. The  
13 guys.....  
14  
15 MS. PATTON: .....review.  
16  
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....the guys  
18 that are on this, like they kind of eat and breath and  
19 sleep this stuff, not myself on this Yukon fish but these  
20 guys are in all these meetings, I think, from what I can  
21 see they understand it quite well.  
22  
23 (Pause)  
24  
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Donald.  
26  
27 MR. WOODRUFF: If I might make a  
28 suggestion. On the 205 proposal, for the Bering Sea  
29 cisco, the biologist is here and maybe he can say a few  
30 words to us to help us.  
31  
32 Thank you.  
33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And that is.  
35  
36 MR. WOODRUFF: Randy.....  
37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Right here.  
39  
40 MR. WOODRUFF: .....Brown.  
41  
42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And you would  
43 like him to give you some answers to that. So could you  
44 come forward and state your name please.  
45  
46 MR. BROWN: Thank you, Madame Chair and  
47 Members of the Council. My name is Randy Brown. I work  
48 with US Fish and Wildlife Service, and I am the proponent  
49 of that -- I got to get my reading glasses on here,  
50 Proposal 14-205 with the Bering cisco.

1                   So what exactly were you wanting.  
2  
3                   MR. WOODRUFF: Just some.....  
4  
5                   REPORTER: Donald.  
6  
7                   MR. WOODRUFF: Sorry. Just some  
8 information between the two projects, the TEK project and  
9 the cisco project.  
10  
11                  MR. BROWN: Okay. I don't know about the  
12 TEK project, and I haven't read it or seen it, so I can't  
13 speak to that.  
14  
15                  But the rationale for the Bering cisco  
16 project that involved the DIDSON was to provide some  
17 information on total run size of the Bering cisco  
18 spawning run. And it's -- the rationale for it was that  
19 there's a commercial fishery that's been operating for  
20 awhile and they would like to expand that and we thought  
21 that it was important to get an idea how many, you know,  
22 the magnitude of this spawning run prior to expanding it  
23 beyond what it is right now, and this was a means to do  
24 that.  
25  
26                  Now, I should point out that the TRC  
27 review rated it high in technical merit, they just  
28 thought there were some other things that should happen  
29 previous to it.  
30  
31                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Question was  
32 answered.  
33  
34                  I really rely on you guys on these  
35 fisheries things, okay, so, please where are we at -- and  
36 this is what Andy wanted to be a part of and he can't --  
37 Andy Bassich, and he's not on line.  
38  
39                  MR. UMPHENOUR: Andy's coming back.....  
40  
41                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No, Andy  
42 Bassich wanted to be part of and he's not on line and for  
43 some reason, I guess he wasn't able to call in, because  
44 we haven't heard him.  
45  
46                  MS. PATTON: I haven't been able to get  
47 through either.  
48  
49                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah. Okay,  
50 what are we doing.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50

(No comments)

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We have one suggestion. He got his answer, so does that change your opinion on priority.

MR. WOODRUFF: No.

MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right. Anyone else.

Virgil.

MR. UMPHENOUR: Well, I don't really have a question.

If you read -- it says the reason for do not fund, this project has lots of implications for the commercial fishery at the mouth of the Yukon River, in addition the project is premature and that the level of subsistence harvest of Bering cisco should be determined first. Projects of this nature should have a State co-investigator with the State of Alaska match involved, it is a State sanctioned commercial harvest of Bering cisco in the Yukon River.

If the State's not going to step up to the plate and do the research then we're back to -- well, allowing a commercial fishery is a good example would be the shellfish fishery in Cook Inlet, the best example of the worst failure of fisheries in the state of Alaska or maybe possibly one of them, where they just used harvest data as an indicator. When the harvest starts going in the toilet, we say, oops, or whoops, we must have caught too many of them, we don't have any more left.....

(Laughter)

MR. UMPHENOUR: .....and then the fishery is totally closed.

The same thing happened in Bristol Bay, it was closed for, I don't know 15 years. Southeast Alaska, I was on the Board of Fisheries and then they both got reopened finally after years of being closed.

We shouldn't really have a commercial fishery unless we know what the stock status is of the stocks, that's why I think Proposal 205 should take

1 priority. We need to know -- that's what that's intended  
2 to do, find out what the population is, the spawning  
3 population, that's why I think we should recommend that  
4 it be given more priority than the Project 252, the  
5 harvest monitoring in the Lower Yukon. If the commercial  
6 fishery people down there and the CDQ group, if they want  
7 that done so they can have a commercial fishery, they  
8 should foot the bill. They get lots of money -- they get  
9 lots of money from former Uncle Ted.

10

11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Did you  
12 get your question answered about why one project is --  
13 why one is 114.3, is that million -- no, thousand --  
14 Vir.....

15

16 MR. UMPHENOUR: It's thousand.

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, the other  
19 one is almost 40 percent less. Can anyone talk to that  
20 or -- why it can't be -- or why a TEK can't be part of  
21 another survey.

22

23 MS. KENNER: I'm not quite clear -- this  
24 is Pippa Kenner from OSM. Maybe you could be more  
25 specific about what you're asking.

26

27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Andrew  
28 mentioned.....

29

30 MS. KENNER: Or could you be more  
31 specific.

32

33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Andrew  
34 mentioned 14-252 is recommended to be funded at 114.3 and  
35 14-205 is not recommended, which Virgil is suggesting be  
36 recommended at 79, it's quite a bit less and Andrew  
37 brought out, why is that so bloody much money when it can  
38 be done with another survey that's already being done.  
39 That was my understanding.

40

41 MR. FIRMIN: Yeah. Well, the 252 is a  
42 year longer, but it's 458,000 total versus 271,000 total.  
43 And from the looks of it they're going to lower villages  
44 and asking them how much fish they used to catch, and how  
45 and then writing a technical paper on it for \$458,000  
46 versus, you know, maybe that's kind of -- I believe TEK  
47 data but at the same time when they're going to be asking  
48 elders at a time before there was driftnet fishing, or  
49 there was even commercial fishing or CDQ groups, so  
50 there's no telling how -- what kind of info you're going

1 to get out of them, and how the investigator's going to  
2 interpret that versus data for -- more bang for your  
3 buck, I don't know.

4  
5 I just -- that was my question, why is  
6 that so much more for a technical paper versus getting  
7 actual hard data, although this is hard.....

8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Pippa, you want  
10 to answer that.

11  
12 MR. FIRMIN: .....data but I guess I'd  
13 have to see the -- the type of interview and the scope of  
14 people they're going to be asking the questions is  
15 another big thing when you do an ethnography study, the  
16 type of questions and who you're asking could vary.

17  
18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Right. So do  
19 you need your question answered.

20  
21 MR. FIRMIN: Well, if they could.

22  
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Can you or not.  
24 Is it being a.....

25  
26 MS. KENNER: Thank you.

27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....I mean we  
29 don't need a.....

30  
31 MS. KENNER: Thank you for that question,  
32 Mr. Firmin, through the Chair. The two projects are very  
33 different types of projects, require different types of  
34 numbers of people working on the project, the two  
35 projects last for different lengths of time and their  
36 goals are very different.

37  
38 What I can say for sure is that the  
39 budgets, the timeline and the deliverables have been  
40 scrutinized and have been deemed appropriate for the work  
41 that's being done. And.....

42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right, I'm  
44 trying to expedite this and what I've got so far is  
45 what's in front of us, the nine, and the three that  
46 weren't recommended and then Donald's request and I  
47 believe I'm hearing your request to say that 14-205 is  
48 more important than 252, so I need direction from the  
49 Council and I want to make sure of one more thing -- we  
50 can do this now but it sounds like we're going to be on

1 a teleconference later; is that right.  
2  
3 MR. UMPHENOUR: Sue.  
4  
5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes would help.  
6  
7 DR. JENKINS: Yes. Yes.  
8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, got it.  
10  
11 Virgil.  
12  
13 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay. 252 basically is  
14 a history project.  
15  
16 MR. WOODRUFF: Yep.  
17  
18 MR. UMPHENOUR: No, that's what it is,  
19 it's a history project. History projects are nice to  
20 know information if we actually learned something from  
21 history but we don't, we keep repeating the same  
22 mistakes.  
23  
24 (Laughter)  
25  
26 MR. UMPHENOUR: And so.....  
27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.  
29  
30 MR. UMPHENOUR: And so 205 is a proactive  
31 study to determine whether or not -- or what's there so  
32 we can know what we really shouldn't do, that's why I  
33 think it's more important. I think we should take action  
34 now. I think, myself, history's nice, I'm a student of  
35 history, but the problem is, history's nice to know if we  
36 use it, however, using good scientific data with the  
37 state of the art sonars and top notch investigators to  
38 determine what is actually there so that we don't  
39 overharvest it is much -- and put ourself in the same  
40 situation with the whitefish as we are with the king  
41 salmon is more important,  
42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Right.  
44  
45 MR. UMPHENOUR: That's the way I look at  
46 it. So I think it's a lot more important.....  
47  
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So I would  
49 have.....  
50

1 MR. UMPHENOUR: .....to support 205.  
2  
3 MR. ERHART: Exactly.  
4  
5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So I would have  
6 to get consensus from the group.  
7  
8 MR. WOODRUFF: I'll second everything  
9 Virgil said.  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I think  
12 Lester did before you, I heard him.  
13  
14 (Laughter)  
15  
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No, the quiet  
17 man in the corner, he agrees also.  
18  
19 (Laughter)  
20  
21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So am I -- but  
22 help me out, Donald, did you have a number to that one  
23 that you requested.  
24  
25 MR. UMPHENOUR: 205.  
26  
27 MR. WOODRUFF: It's exactly what.....  
28  
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: The same one.  
30  
31 MR. WOODRUFF: It's exactly what Virgil  
32 said.  
33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, I'm  
35 sorry, I didn't write the number down, that's pretty  
36 helpful.  
37  
38 MR. WOODRUFF: It's make sense science as  
39 opposed to a history project.  
40  
41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So you guys  
42 would just, instead of 252, you'd recommend 205.  
43  
44 MR. WOODRUFF: Correct.  
45  
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Is that  
47 a consensus.  
48  
49 MR. GLANZ: Sounds good.  
50

1 (Council nods affirmatively)  
2  
3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Great.  
4 Anything else.  
5  
6 MR. GLANZ: I like the savings.  
7  
8 MR. UMPHENOUR: That also saves a couple  
9 hundred thousand bucks.  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: For another one  
12 which they're going to talk to us about later.  
13  
14 Okay. Is there anything else you want to  
15 -- do you want to have a consensus to recommend -- to  
16 agree with the group, these recommendations, and the  
17 change would be -- our recommendations would be the same  
18 except for instead of 205, it'd be 252.  
19  
20 MR. FIRMIN: No.  
21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, did I say  
23 that wrong.  
24  
25 MR. WOODRUFF: You got it turned around.  
26  
27 MR. UMPHENOUR: You got it backwards.  
28  
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Man, that's  
30 getting bad.  
31  
32 MR. UMPHENOUR: Instead of.....  
33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You guys  
35 understand, and my brain understands but I.....  
36  
37 MR. UMPHENOUR: Instead of 252.....  
38  
39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....didn't say  
40 it right.  
41  
42 MR. UMPHENOUR: .....we want 252 and 206  
43 flip-flopped.  
44  
45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Right. Our  
46 recommendation would take out 205 and add 252.  
47  
48 MR. UMPHENOUR: No.  
49  
50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Didn't I say

1 that right.  
2  
3 MR. UMPHENOUR: No, just opposite what  
4 you said.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, I see it  
7 now, I'm sorry. I'm tired. Say it again, Virgil, help  
8 me out.  
9  
10 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay. Fund 205, defund  
11 252.  
12  
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah. Can we  
14 do a consensus on that and you guys will -- we don't need  
15 a motion.  
16  
17 MR. WOODRUFF: I make a motion.  
18  
19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. The  
20 motion is made.  
21  
22 MR. GLANZ: And I'll second it.  
23  
24 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And it's  
25 seconded.  
26  
27 Any other.....  
28  
29 MR. UMPHENOUR: Question.  
30  
31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: The question  
32 has been called. All in favor.  
33  
34 IN UNISON: Aye.  
35  
36 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any opposed.  
37  
38 (No opposing votes)  
39  
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. That  
41 takes care of that, thank you guys. Sorry for my  
42 confusion. My brain is backwards.  
43  
44 Next -- or do you want a break.  
45  
46 MR. WOODRUFF: Take a little break.  
47  
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Short break,  
49 and then we'll have the Partners for Fisheries  
50 Monitoring.

1 MS. PATTON: Yes, and that's -- it's  
2 probably in there, and then let me check in with OSM  
3 Staff to give a brief -- they're up next after the  
4 Partners.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, break.  
7  
8 (Laughter)  
9  
10 (Off record)  
11  
12 (On record)  
13  
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Something was  
15 brought to my attention here that -- it's underneath the  
16 big paragraph and now that my eyes are getting old, I see  
17 not as well, that's probably why the numbers got messed  
18 up a minute ago.  
19  
20 We have to keep in mind, Council, that we  
21 have an annual report and I'm told that these are issues  
22 we should have been thinking about all through this  
23 meeting, so that's something we want to finish at the end  
24 of this meeting, is our -- what we're going to put in the  
25 annual report, the issues, so put it in your head and let  
26 it digest.  
27  
28 Next -- did he get his car started, where  
29 is he.  
30  
31 (Laughter)  
32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, good  
34 deal, he's getting it warmed up as he speaks.  
35  
36 MS. PATTON: And we've got OSM.  
37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes. And then  
39 OSM is going to give a report after that and it'll be --  
40 he has to be out of here, too, for flights.  
41  
42 So welcome.  
43  
44 MR. MCKENNA: Thank you. Good afternoon,  
45 Madame Chair, Members of the Council. Again, my name is  
46 Brian McKenna, fisheries biologist with Tanana Chiefs  
47 Conference.  
48  
49 This is my first RAC meeting that I've  
50 attended. I originally had prepared a PowerPoint

1 presentation for today but I think for sake of brevity,  
2 I'll just stick to some talking points.

3

4 All right, just a quick update on TCC  
5 Parks and Wildlife Department.

6

7 To me, I can only characterize it as a  
8 mismatch. TCC covers an extremely large area, over  
9 235,000 square miles, representing 42 villages and over  
10 10,000 Alaska Natives, and currently we employ two full-  
11 time individuals, myself and Orville Huntington.

12

13 The goals of our department are advocate  
14 for hunting and fishing rights for TCC members and to use  
15 science and traditional knowledge as a means to enable  
16 sustainable fisheries. Due in large part to the small  
17 department of our -- or the small size of our department  
18 we rely heavily on partnerships with other agencies to  
19 achieve these goals.

20

21

22 Moving on to a couple of the current  
23 fisheries projects that TCC Parks and Wildlife Department  
24 is currently operating. The first one I'd like to touch  
25 base on is the Alatna River sheefish population study.  
26 This is a project that's funded through OSM Fisheries  
27 Resource Monitoring Program. The goal of this project is  
28 to develop a genetic baseline for the spawning stock of  
29 sheefish in the Alatna River. We want to collect 200  
30 genetic samples to achieve this goal, also collect  
31 otoliths from these samples to help describe the  
32 demographic composition of these fish including age, sex  
33 and length. To achieve these goals we are partnering  
34 with local subsistence fishermen in the villages of  
35 Alatna and Allakaket. We aim to hire a boat driver from  
36 Allakaket to provide transportation from town to the  
37 spawning grounds on the Alatna River and also compensate  
38 any subsistence fishermen for their fish to allow us to  
39 sample. The project originally started in 2012, however  
40 to date we've yet to establish the genetic baseline. In  
41 2012 flooding inhibited collection efforts and again this  
42 year in 2013 adverse weather conditions inhibited  
43 collections. However, the funding remains sufficient and  
44 we are going to get after it next year in 2014 and try to  
45 collect these samples.

46

47 Moving on to the next project that's  
48 currently being operated through our Department at TCC,  
49 it's an ongoing project, Henshaw Creek Weir abundance and  
50 run timing of adult salmon at Henshaw Creek. Henshaw

1 Creek Weir is another FRMP project sponsored through OSM.  
2 The Henshaw Creek Weir has been operational for the last  
3 14 years providing longterm data sets dating back to the  
4 year 2000. The goals of this project are to determine  
5 escapement and run timing of chinook and chum salmon, and  
6 also to describe the demographic composition of the run.  
7 Another goal of the project is to provide a platform for  
8 hosting a youth summer science camp each year. To  
9 achieve these goals we partnered with the Fish and  
10 Wildlife Service, Kanuti National Wildlife Refuge, ADF&G,  
11 and also elders from the village of Allakaket. In 2013  
12 the weir was operational between June 30th and August  
13 5th. The run started on July 9th, that's when we saw the  
14 first chinook and chum both pass. However, a high water  
15 event occurred on the second day of counting and the weir  
16 was shut down for four and a half days and no fish were  
17 counted during these days. Upon reopening the weir after  
18 the high water event was over we were near the peak of  
19 the run. The first full day of counting after that shut  
20 down over 42,000 chum passed the weir and 150 chinook.  
21 So bering that in mind a conservative seasonal estimate,  
22 totals for chinook were 772, and for chum just over  
23 285,000.

24  
25 And, lastly, I just wanted to touch on  
26 two future projects that we currently have proposals out  
27 for that we would like to initiate in years coming.

28  
29 The first one is a genetic baseline study  
30 for chinook and chum salmon on the Black River near  
31 Chalkyitsik, and this is also to help establish a genetic  
32 baseline for these fish. The goal is to collect, again,  
33 200 samples for both species to help provide genetic  
34 representation of the Black River and Porcupine stocks,  
35 and to help identify Black River stock contribution from  
36 fish caught in the lower river test fisheries. Should we  
37 receive funding for this project we will be partnering  
38 with the village of Chalkyitsik's Natural Resource  
39 Department and, again, we would be hiring local members  
40 from the community, a boat driver to provide  
41 transportation and also compensate any subsistence caught  
42 fish.

43  
44 And the last project that I wanted to  
45 talk about today and maybe most important, is the  
46 continuation of the Henshaw Creek Youth Summer Science  
47 Camp. Last year funding was pulled from that due to the  
48 issues with Federal funds. So TCC has currently put into  
49 multiple funding pools right now trying to bring back  
50 enough money to get this going again next summer. The

1 camp emphasizes teaching youth the importance of both  
2 Western science and traditional knowledge, promotes  
3 active participation and the conservation of their  
4 natural resources. It aims to connect youth with nature,  
5 inspire the youths to become stewards and active  
6 participants and conserving their land and resources and  
7 also to educate the youth in both natural sciences and  
8 traditional knowledge. Some of the topics that we cover  
9 at the summer science camp includes salmon biology,  
10 aquatic and sex sampling and identification, traditional  
11 fish-cutting techniques and Athabascan language lessons.  
12 To achieve these goals we partner with the Kanuti  
13 National Wildlife Refuge, US Fish and Wildlife Service  
14 and elders from surrounding villages. We'd like to see  
15 this get back into action. And like I said the funding  
16 was pulled.

17

18 And that concludes my report.

19

20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you. Any  
21 questions.

22

23 Virgil.

24

25 MR. UMPHENOUR: How many of the chinook  
26 salmon did you do ASL sampling on?

27

28 MR. MCKENNA: That's a good question.  
29 All right, the run was just about 772, that was the  
30 estimate and we collected samples on about 250 chinook.

31

32 MR. UMPHENOUR: Well, when will that data  
33 be available.

34

35 MR. MCKENNA: That data is sent to ADF&G  
36 and usually it comes out in December or January. I was  
37 told this year not to expect it in any rush, I think  
38 they're short staffed this season.

39

40 MR. UMPHENOUR: Thank you.

41

42 MR. MCKENNA: Thank you.

43

44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I hate it when  
45 that happens.

46

47 Any other questions.

48

49

50 (No comments)

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you, so  
2 much.  
3  
4 MR. MCKENNA: Thank you, very much.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I hope your car  
7 is warmed up. I wish you could warm mine up too.  
8  
9 (Laughter)  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right.  
12 Then we'll.....  
13  
14 MS. INGLES: Madame Chair. This is Palma  
15 Ingles, did you want me to do the report on the Partners  
16 for Fisheries Monitoring Program.  
17  
18 MS. PATTON: Palma, we actually need to  
19 take up the OSM briefings right.....  
20  
21 MS. INGLES: Okay.  
22  
23 MS. PATTON: .....now, and if we have an  
24 opportunity we can provide the overview for.....  
25  
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.  
27  
28 MS. PATTON: .....the program. For the  
29 Council's interest, Brian McKenna is a TCC fisheries  
30 biologist funded through the Partners for Fisheries  
31 Monitoring Program.  
32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay,  
34 Council.....  
35  
36 MS. PATTON: But at this time I think we  
37 need to take up the OSM proposals [sic] thank you so much  
38 Brian.  
39  
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, Council,  
41 OSM report.  
42  
43 MR. PELTOLA: Madame Chair. Members of  
44 the Council. Appreciate the effort in letting me speak  
45 here early this evening.  
46  
47 I wanted to go over a couple issues on  
48 your agenda.  
49  
50 First of all is the budget.

1 OSM has been affected by sequestration  
2 like every other Federal program. This past fiscal year  
3 which ended September 30th, we absorbed a \$600,000  
4 reduction in our budget. Based on the projected cuts for  
5 this current fiscal year we're in, starting October 1st,  
6 in addition to a two percent cost of living allowance for  
7 Federal salaries, which the Federal government has not  
8 provided in several years, we are anticipating taking  
9 another \$600,000 cut this year out of our budget. There  
10 are numerous ways to account for that, you know, that  
11 shortfall. One of those kind of leads into the next  
12 topic I have here, Staffing.

13  
14 Currently on the OSM Staff chart, or  
15 organizational chart we have 11 vacancies, three of which  
16 we are trying to fill. One is our lead fisheries  
17 biologist, which was vacated by Steven Fried. Another is  
18 a fisheries biologist/biometrician which has been vacant  
19 for about a year, going on two years now. The other is  
20 an educational specialist position. That position is  
21 primarily responsible for putting the booklet you have  
22 before you together, putting our regulations together for  
23 the fisheries and the wildlife cycles, in addition to all  
24 the reports that come out to the Regional Advisory  
25 Councils and elsewhere.

26  
27 We're going to try to maintain eight  
28 vacancies in order to meet the majority of that 600,000  
29 plus requirement in the reduction of our budget for this  
30 current year. And also we're trying to balance that  
31 reduction out with not hampering or hindering the support  
32 we provide to the Board or the Regional Advisory Councils  
33 or the analysis and such.

34  
35 As for Staffing updates, myself, I came  
36 on in this position in August. We had Jeff Brooks that  
37 came into OSM as a social scientist within the  
38 anthropology division. And then we had Derek Hildreth  
39 who was selected as the new permit specialist within our  
40 office.

41  
42 We had some recent departures. We had  
43 our chief anthropologist, she retired. And like I  
44 mentioned earlier, Steven Fried, the lead fisheries  
45 biologist supervisor, he retired also. And then our  
46 outreach specialist, Andrea, she moved into -- lattered  
47 into a different position with our regional office in  
48 external affairs.

49  
50 With that being said then I'll have David

1 go through a brief summary of tribal consultation  
2 implementations.

3

4 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: David.

5

6 DR. JENKINS: Good evening. Let me just  
7 very quickly let you know what the Federal Subsistence  
8 Board has been doing in terms of tribal consultations.  
9 It says in your book here that the tribal consultation  
10 implementation guidelines are going through a final  
11 draft. The Board actually approved that draft so we do  
12 have tribal consultation guidelines.

13

14 And the Federal Subsistence Board had  
15 tribal consultations in August and consulted with three  
16 tribes and three corporations on August 14th, and, again,  
17 on September 11th when the Board consulted with 11 tribes  
18 and eight corporations and then once more on September  
19 16th. So the Board has been responsive to the  
20 President's [sic] directive to start actively consulting  
21 with tribes and corporations, and the simple fact that  
22 we've had these numbers of consultations is indicative of  
23 that effort.

24

25 I could answer some questions if you have  
26 any on that. But, briefly, that's what the Federal  
27 Subsistence Board has been doing.

28

29 And then in terms of the regulatory cycle  
30 update, as you are aware, the Board has elected to hold  
31 its wildlife proposal meeting in April, in the spring  
32 rather than in January, and hasn't yet decided on whether  
33 or not it should hold its fisheries meeting in the spring  
34 rather than in the winter, as well. But at this point in  
35 2014 the Federal Subsistence Board will meet on wildlife  
36 proposals in April of 2014.

37

38 And that's it.

39

40 MR. PELTOLA: Excuse me. And then one  
41 last summary regarding the MOU with the State of Alaska.  
42 The committee or the Board -- the committee met in June,  
43 a draft MOU was prepared, the Department took it to some  
44 of their ACs and now the Fish and Wildlife Service and  
45 the State are trying to work and incorporate some of the  
46 information or sections the AC's wanted to be implemented  
47 into the MOU and we continue to work forward to get a  
48 finalized draft of the MOU.

49

50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Quick question,

1 AC's being State or Federal.

2

3 MR. PELTOLA: The State.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, okay.

6

7 MR. PELTOLA: State.

8

9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Questions.

10

11

12 (No comments)

13

14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: One quick  
15 question. On that tribal consultation, is things  
16 working.

17

18 DR. JENKINS: Well, yes, as far as we've  
19 gone so far. I mean we're working through this process.  
20 We've had these consultations on the phone. There'll be  
21 another opportunity for tribes and corporations to  
22 consult with the Federal Subsistence Board in April and  
23 tribes and corporations can actually ask for consultation  
24 at any time so there are no specific periods in which  
25 they need to discuss. So far the consultations have been  
26 on wildlife proposals and on the rural determination  
27 process. So we are getting feedback from -- or the Board  
28 is, from tribes and corporations. So it is working to  
29 that extent and we hope to continue to make it work.

30

31 MR. PELTOLA: And one comment about  
32 consultation is that we're -- the government is supposed  
33 to consult with tribes on anything that affects the tribe  
34 and that's far and very broad reaching, and it could be  
35 very overwhelming with the number of proposals that we  
36 have to do, we have been utilizing teleconferences quite  
37 often. It's probably not necessarily the best medium to  
38 address it, but it's the best we have available to reach  
39 out to the number of individuals, organizations with the  
40 workload that we have.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Any  
43 other questions.

44

45

46 (No comments)

47

48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thanks. Thank  
49 you so much.

50

1 MR. PELTOLA: Appreciate. Pleasure  
2 meeting most of you, thank you.  
3  
4 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And you too,  
5 we'll probably be seeing you again.  
6  
7 Okay.  
8  
9 MS. PATTON: Have a safe trip home.  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes, have a  
12 safe trip home.  
13  
14 Okay, we're moving along, what is next is  
15 Native organizations. I think -- are there any other  
16 Native organizations that need to give a report to the  
17 Council at this time.  
18  
19 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. TCC was the  
20 only update that we had been contacted with.....  
21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
23  
24 MS. PATTON: .....for the meeting. Thank  
25 you.  
26  
27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, next is  
28 Fish and Wildlife Service, Yukon Flats first and then  
29 Arctic and then Tetlin.  
30  
31 Our familiar face.  
32  
33 (Laughter)  
34  
35 MR. MATHEWS: Yes. If you'd turn to page  
36 -- I'm not going to cover all of it, if you'd turn to  
37 Page 288. What I need direction on and Yukon Flats needs  
38 direction on is, if you look at Page 288, is that  
39 information you'd like to know and is that the format  
40 you'd like to know about it.  
41  
42 The construct of the summary is to  
43 address the concerns that you guys want to get  
44 information before there's a problem and you wanted to  
45 know what's going on in Refuges in your area.  
46  
47 So I'm not going to go over each of those  
48 items because of the lateness of the day, so I need to  
49 know is:  
50

1 1. Is this the format.  
2  
3 2. We were looking at this at the Flats  
4 of doing this just every fall but maybe  
5 your fall meeting is more decisional and  
6 your winter/spring meeting is more  
7 informational.  
8  
9 Maybe we need to reprogram that. So we  
10 need direction on that to say we would set aside more  
11 time at the spring meeting to go through more detail  
12 what's going on. I'm only speaking for the Flats at this  
13 moment. Brian will speak for Arctic. So if you could  
14 give us input on that because we are responding to your  
15 request that, hey, what's going on in the Refuge, we  
16 don't know what's going on, you guys are overseeing the  
17 subsistence use on Federal public lands and so this --  
18 both these reports, Arctic, Yukon Flats, and, of course,  
19 I work for Kanuti, they're responding to that. So either  
20 now you can tell me or sometime tell me that this is the  
21 format and this is the best time.  
22  
23 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you, Madame  
24 Chairman. I think this is a concise and informative  
25 report. If you were to do an oral presentation of this,  
26 I think the spring would be a better time, or the winter.  
27  
28 MR. MATHEWS: Okay.  
29  
30 MR. WOODRUFF: And that's it.  
31  
32 MR. MATHEWS: Okay. So I'll work that  
33 through Eva. And, again, I have to make sure that the  
34 Refuge manager agrees with that but I'm pretty sure he  
35 would. And the advantage of the spring one would be  
36 because right now surveys are going on on moose. Now,  
37 again, it's not the final data but you would get some  
38 indication on the moose that were collared on the Flats,  
39 what's happening and whatever else.  
40  
41 Okay. So I'll leave that for Yukon  
42 Flats, and I appreciate that input.  
43  
44 MR. WOODRUFF: Does the Council agree.  
45  
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, does the  
47 Council agree.  
48  
49 (Council nods affirmatively)  
50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Everyone.  
2  
3 MR. GLANZ: It's fine with me.  
4  
5 MR. FIRMIN: I like the format and all  
6 the information there and if I have questions normally I  
7 would bring it up with Vince, either on the side or go to  
8 the manager that's available.  
9  
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, I agree.  
11 Others.  
12  
13  
14 (No comments)  
15  
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, I think  
17 a head's up on that. Vince, I do know -- I think this  
18 brain is starting to malfunction right now, but when we  
19 have proposals before us it takes a longer meeting so if  
20 the spring meeting doesn't have a lot of proposals for  
21 us, yes, it's a lot nicer to have our reports because  
22 we're on a two year cycle now.  
23  
24 MR. MATHEWS: And that's why there's  
25 quite a bit of Refuge Staff here because if questions  
26 came up on the proposals they were there.....  
27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh.  
29  
30 MR. MATHEWS: .....if there was a  
31 discussion on that. They may be also present at the  
32 spring meeting but that's kind of why we focused, we had  
33 several biologists here and et cetera.  
34  
35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And, Vince, as  
36 you know well, being a coordinator for us, the reason  
37 that these Staff reports ended up last is because we were  
38 wrestling to get the time on these -- what we wanted as  
39 our action items so that's why it got reversed and there  
40 does seem at times where, oh, I wish I had that report  
41 prior to, so I think it's important for all of the Staff  
42 to remember that if there's something in that report that  
43 should be in front of a proposal, you give us a head's  
44 up.  
45  
46 MR. MATHEWS: Yes, I conveyed that to the  
47 three Refuges and both -- all those three Refuges, two  
48 for your area, their biologist know that game plan,  
49 meaning don't bring up your report at the end of the  
50 meeting when they need that information when you

1 were.....

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We just need a  
4 head's up ahead of time.

5

6 MR. MATHEWS: Yeah. And they're not  
7 afraid to get up here.....

8

9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

10

11 MR. MATHEWS: .....so far.

12

13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. I'm  
14 hoping -- that's usually what we see. Occasionally it  
15 goes the opposite direction.

16

17 (Laughter)

18

19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right. But  
20 -- all right, thanks, any questions of Vince.

21

22

23 (No comments)

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you,  
26 Vince.

27

28 Something for Frank to read when I get  
29 home.

30

31 Go ahead.

32

33 MR. GLASPELL: Good evening, Madame Chair  
34 and Council. My name is Brian Glaspell, I'm the Refuge  
35 Manager at Arctic National Wildlife Refuge.

36

37 Starting on Page 296 you have a report  
38 from us. I can work with Vince to put that in a format  
39 and deliver it at a time that will work best for you.  
40 And I certainly won't read this whole thing to you, maybe  
41 just touch on a few highlights that might be of  
42 particular interest to you.

43

44 The first one, this last year has been  
45 one of really significant change at Arctic Refuge. We  
46 had five people representing an extraordinary amount of  
47 experience and time on the Refuge all retire within the  
48 same year. And like you heard from Gene we're also  
49 affected by sequestration and restructuring of our budget  
50 so many of those positions were abolished or restructured

1 in some manner. So what we have on the Refuge is a real  
2 shift from a fairly senior group of biologists to a few  
3 senior biologists and a much younger crew coming in, that  
4 will affect our capacity and the kind of work we do for  
5 years to come. Ultimately it's a positive, but to use a  
6 sports team analogy we're kind of in a rebuilding phase  
7 right now.

8  
9 Also last year the Refuge completed its  
10 work on the final version of our Comprehensive  
11 Conservation Plan. That final draft is now at the  
12 Department of Interior for review. It's a really  
13 important document. It will high how we manage the  
14 Refuge and how we work with our partners and how we  
15 prioritize things for the next 15 to 20 years, at least.  
16 And so we're eager to see that plan get approved and  
17 released by the Department and there'll be quite a bit of  
18 work on our part to do consultation and work with all our  
19 various tribal entities and other partners to get the  
20 word out about the details in that plan as soon as we get  
21 the go ahead to do that.

22  
23 The last item is we are in the final  
24 throes of selecting guides for our big game guide use  
25 areas on the Refuge. In 2011 we advertised 10 of those  
26 areas and as I'm sure you know, those are exclusive guide  
27 use areas. The permits are authorized for a five year  
28 term and then they're non-competitively renewable for a  
29 second five year term. So, in essence, we're selecting  
30 guides that will operate on the Refuge with exclusive use  
31 of a given area for the next decade. It's quite a  
32 process. The initial selections were made at the  
33 beginning of this year and then there's an appeal  
34 process. We have several appeals that we're still  
35 working our way through but we will have permits issued  
36 that will be valid starting in 2014.

37  
38 And that's it for me, if you have  
39 questions.

40  
41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Questions.

42  
43 Virgil.

44  
45 MR. UMPHENOUR: I see here where you say  
46 two of the alternatives, including interim cap on  
47 commercial recreational guides operating on the Kongakut  
48 River, so you're going to start limiting these, I guess,  
49 these are eco-guide operations.

50

1 MR. GLASPELL: These are float trip  
2 guides and the Kongakut River was one of the areas of  
3 greatest interest by public commenters. Their concern  
4 was that there's just a whole lot of use and some  
5 crowding on that river because of the short season that  
6 everybody likes to use that area and the limited  
7 alternatives in terms of access points for putting on and  
8 taking off the river. So among the alternatives, yes,  
9 there's consideration, essentially, to freeze the number  
10 of guides and then do a more thorough analysis in a  
11 visitor use management plan to determine, you know, what  
12 the ideal number should be or how we should manage those  
13 numbers.

14  
15 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay. That brings me  
16 back to Red Sheep Creek. Do the people that do this --  
17 do you have actual guided operations that take tourists  
18 down it or those are just people that fly in on their own  
19 and, if so, do they register -- do you guys know how many  
20 -- do they get any kind of permit to do it or do you even  
21 know they're there unless you accidentally see them, or  
22 how does that work.

23  
24 MR. GLASPELL: They average Joe Public  
25 unguided visitor doesn't need a permit of any kind and  
26 they don't need to check in with us in any way to visit  
27 the Refuge. The best way that we get a handle on the  
28 number of folks going is that most people have to hire an  
29 air taxi to get to the Refuge. Those are permitted  
30 operations and they report the number of drop-offs and  
31 where they drop people off. So that's -- it's not ideal,  
32 people can access the Refuge in other ways, but we feel  
33 like we've got a pretty count and a pretty good idea of  
34 where they're going based on those air taxi numbers. At  
35 Red Sheep Creek, like you heard Hollis saying earlier,  
36 it's my understanding that that's a common stopover  
37 place, especially when people can't get over the top to  
38 the North Slope, that's a convenient place to put down,  
39 it's a big strip that you can land a pretty heavy  
40 aircraft at. At this time we don't have permitted guide  
41 operations that are targeting that area. That's not to  
42 say we wouldn't or couldn't.

43  
44 Also on that topic, based on the use  
45 numbers that we have from air taxis primarily -- we know  
46 that use has shifted around as certain areas or  
47 activities become more or less popular on the Refuge, but  
48 the overall volume of use has been pretty flat for the  
49 best part of a decade and there's probably less than  
50 2,000 individual visitors that are going to the Refuge

1 per year.

2

3 MR. UMPHENOUR: So do these air taxis  
4 fill out a report similar to the hunting guides at the  
5 end of the year that lists how many client use days they  
6 have and et cetera.

7

8 MR. GLASPELL: That's correct.

9

10 MR. UMPHENOUR: Thank you.

11

12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Any other  
13 questions.

14

15

16 (No comments)

17

18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I have one.  
19 I'm looking at that map on 300, you said there's 10  
20 offerings but there's 16 ARCs.

21

22 MR. GLASPELL: Yeah, that's a good  
23 question.

24

25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And I see one  
26 is not offered, and I'm wondering where the other -- that  
27 leaves five more that aren't offered then, uh.

28

29 MR. GLASPELL: There are two that are not  
30 offered, it's a little hard to see the writing. But over  
31 there on the western boundary.....

32

33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I see that.

34

35 MR. GLASPELL: .....10A.

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I see them  
38 both, but.....

39

40 MR. GLASPELL: Okay.

41

42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....one is  
43 part of 10, so that excludes -- and the other one's 12,  
44 so that leaves five that I'm not -- which ones are they  
45 that aren't offered.

46

47 MR. GLASPELL: One area and I think it  
48 was 16, but I would have to confirm, it was offered and  
49 we had no applicants.

50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Probably in the  
2 Flats somewhere where it isn't real desirable.  
3  
4 MR. GLASPELL: Yeah.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
7  
8 MR. GLASPELL: So that one is just sort  
9 of out of consideration for this current round.  
10  
11 And then we have four areas that are out  
12 of cycle for one reason or another.  
13  
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I see.  
15  
16 MR. GLASPELL: And two of those areas  
17 will come up in 2015, the other two will come up in 2019.  
18  
19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hum. I guess  
20 I thought they were all coming up at once there.  
21  
22 MR. GLASPELL: The ideal would be that we  
23 address them all at the same cycle but if somebody  
24 retires or dies or loses their guide license or the area  
25 otherwise becomes vacant, then we typically end up with  
26 an area that's.....  
27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So the total  
29 guides in the area.....  
30  
31 MR. GLASPELL: .....out of cycle.  
32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....would be  
34 more than 10.  
35  
36 MR. GLASPELL: Correct.  
37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. 15.  
39  
40 MR. GLASPELL: Well, it could be but a  
41 guide can hold multiple areas on the Refuge so the  
42 absolute number of guides is typically going to be.....  
43  
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It's less.  
45  
46 MR. GLASPELL: .....less than the number  
47 of guide use areas that we have.  
48  
49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Do many do you  
50 offer one guide.

1 MR. GLASPELL: They can.....  
2  
3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Three.  
4  
5 MR. GLASPELL: .....hold up to three.....  
6  
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Tetlin says  
8 two.  
9  
10 MR. GLASPELL: .....two.....  
11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I think.  
13  
14 MR. GLASPELL: It's uniform statewide so  
15 they.....  
16  
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So that's  
18 three.  
19  
20 MR. GLASPELL: .....can hold -- they can  
21 hold three permits, two on the Refuge.  
22  
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And that's not  
24 the same on each Refuge. Okay, thanks.  
25  
26 MR. GLASPELL: It is the same on each  
27 Refuge but they're limited in terms of the total number  
28 of permits within the National Wildlife Refuge system  
29 they can have, that's three, and they can hold two on a  
30 given Refuge.  
31  
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, okay,  
33 that's what my question was.  
34  
35 MR. GLASPELL: Okay.  
36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It's two.  
38  
39 MR. GLASPELL: Two.  
40  
41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right. Any  
42 other questions.  
43  
44  
45 (No comments)  
46  
47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you.  
48  
49 MR. GLASPELL: Thanks.  
50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Next is Tetlin.  
2 And before you start -- you got to leave how quick.  
3  
4 MR. UMPHENOUR: I got to leave now.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Where  
7 does.....  
8  
9 MS. PATTON: Can we do the meeting  
10 dates.....  
11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....that  
13 leave.....  
14  
15 MS. PATTON: .....as the action item.  
16  
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....before --  
18 one second. Maybe two minutes. We want to confirm  
19 meeting dates, Virgil, before you leave.  
20  
21 MR. UMPHENOUR: Okay.  
22  
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Because that's  
24 an action item and when you left we're left with reports  
25 and I believe not a quorum, and I don't really know what  
26 that means, if we can still take reports even though  
27 there's.....  
28  
29 MS. PATTON: Absolutely.  
30  
31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....not a  
32 quorum.  
33  
34 MS. PATTON: It's just the action items  
35 that need a quorum.  
36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right. If  
38 you guys go back to Page 340 and 341. We have on our  
39 schedule to meet.....  
40  
41 MS. PATTON: Wait, here's -- I didn't get  
42 you the updated on -- this is the updated one.  
43  
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....February  
45 through.....  
46  
47 MS. PATTON: Let me give these to the  
48 Council members.  
49  
50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....2014 and

1 we're scheduled to meet in Fairbanks February 26th and  
2 27th, so I assume that that won't change.  
3  
4                   You were asking -- well, I don't see that  
5 we're going to have a change for what we've already done  
6 unless Council members want to change it.  
7  
8                   MR. GLANZ: No.  
9  
10                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Do I hear any  
11 changes for February 26th and 27th.  
12  
13  
14                  (No comments)  
15  
16                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We got to get  
17 our traps pulled.  
18  
19                  MR. UMPHENOUR: March, how about March.  
20  
21                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Do you want to  
22 change it or not -- you do -- it's a little bit of a  
23 concern of mine. I will tell you that.....  
24  
25                  MR. ERHART: We got to pull our trap.....  
26  
27                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I have a  
28 meeting in Copper Center of the SRC the 4th and 5th of  
29 March.  
30  
31                  You're trapping aren't you.  
32  
33                  MR. WOODRUFF: Yep. It's inconvenient to  
34 pull our traps early.  
35  
36                  MR. ERHART: There it is, you're right.  
37  
38                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: There's three  
39 of us here.  
40  
41                  MR. WOODRUFF: And then I have to go back  
42 and put my wolf traps out.  
43  
44                  MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I think she's  
45 going to want you to push your button.  
46  
47                  REPORTER: No, it just won't go on the  
48 record.  
49  
50                  (Laughter)

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: But how about  
2 you, aren't you trapping or you have a full-time jobs at  
3 the -- you have one of those 9:00-5:00.  
4  
5 MR. FIRMIN: I'm a recreational.....  
6  
7 (Laughter)  
8  
9 MR. FIRMIN: I'm a recreational trapper,  
10 not a full-time trapper.  
11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, some days  
13 I feel that way.  
14  
15 (Laughter)  
16  
17  
18 MR. GLANZ: I do, too.  
19  
20 MR. FIRMIN: You know, like neighborhood  
21 dogs and cats, that kind of thing.  
22  
23 (Laughter)  
24  
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. But it  
26 is kind of -- the marten are worth a lot of money right  
27 now and having to pull my traps -- our traps.....  
28  
29 MR. ERHART: How about around the 6th over  
30 there.  
31  
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm fine with  
33 after the 6th but I have to be in Copper Center the 4th  
34 and 5th.  
35  
36 MR. ERHART: That'd be good.  
37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So  
39 unfortunately I'll probably.....  
40  
41 MR. FIRMIN: 6th and 7th.  
42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....I'll be  
44 driving.  
45  
46 MR. FIRMIN: What about the 6th and 7th.  
47  
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm trying to  
49 pull my brain together to see if I can get to Fairbanks  
50 that fast.

1 MR. GLANZ: The 7th.  
2  
3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Copper Center  
4 to here I'd have to come straight up.  
5  
6 MS. CELLARIUS: It's five hours. I don't  
7 think we're going to go two days.  
8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, okay. I'm  
10 good for that. I don't mind 6th and 7.  
11  
12 MS. CELLARIUS: We might meet until maybe  
13 noon on the second day, I don't think we'll meet two full  
14 days.  
15  
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm okay with  
17 the 6th and 7th. Staff won't complain, right.  
18  
19 MS. PATTON: I don't think so. I will  
20 advocate for you.  
21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Okay.  
23  
24 All agree March 6th and 7th.  
25  
26 MR. GLANZ: The only thing, Madame Chair,  
27 if we do that then people from Eagle is going to be stuck  
28 here for the whole weekend because there won't be no  
29 flights back on Saturday or Sunday.  
30  
31 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And, I'm glad  
32 -- that means you too Donald.  
33  
34 MR. WOODRUFF: Yeah.  
35  
36 MR. GLANZ: Yeah.  
37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Are you  
39 concerned about that. Would Andy be concerned about  
40 that.  
41  
42 MR. WOODRUFF: I don't know what Andy's  
43 concerned about but it's not terribly inconvenient to be  
44 here for the weekend shopping, okay.  
45  
46 (Laughter)  
47  
48 MR. WOODRUFF: As long as OSM wants to put  
49 me up.  
50

1 (Laughter)  
2  
3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Method to your  
4 madness, I hear it, okay.  
5  
6 Well, let's tentatively say 6 and 7 and  
7 as long as that's good with everybody, Eva will have to  
8 contact.....  
9  
10 MS. PATTON: I'll advocate for you.  
11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....us by  
13 email and give us suggestions when else it can happen.  
14  
15 MR. WOODRUFF: There's plenty of time for  
16 that.  
17  
18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yes.  
19  
20 MR. WOODRUFF: I mean.....  
21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, once you  
23 get closer to the meeting date you realize, my gosh,  
24 that's the end of trapping season, at least marten  
25 season. Okay, and they're worth a lot of money right  
26 now.  
27  
28 Okay, so in the spring -- or that was the  
29 winter -- or what is that called -- fall 2014. No  
30 meeting this week. What.....  
31  
32 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair and Council for  
33 the fall 2014 meeting, to avoid circumstances similar to  
34 what happened this year OSM wants to make sure that we  
35 don't have any cancellations in that first week of  
36 October which is the start of the Federal fiscal year.  
37 We do have -- so the calendar I just handed out to you  
38 has all the current dates, all the Councils have chosen  
39 their dates which are on this calendar that I just handed  
40 out to you. And then we did have Seward Penn called in  
41 and they have chosen October 7th and 8th for their fall  
42 2014 meeting. So our only limitation is that first week  
43 in October and then because we have limited Staff and  
44 resources we can only accommodate two meetings per week.  
45  
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, why  
47 didn't we meet first.  
48  
49 (Laughter)  
50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm going to  
2 tell the Staff something here.  
3  
4 MS. PATTON: Yes.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: With people  
7 wanting to have later moose seasons until the 30th of  
8 September, who's going to want to come to a meeting  
9 during that -- all that -- that whole month of September  
10 and then you got 10 Councils all wanting to meet -- you  
11 told us now we can't meet the first -- that -- no  
12 meetings this week, and now we're all going to want to  
13 meet those last two weeks, I find that a little  
14 frustrating.  
15  
16 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. If the  
17 Council wants to look at meeting after that window closes  
18 in October, the 16th.....  
19  
20 MR. ERHART: That would be good.  
21  
22 MS. PATTON: .....I -- I can bring that  
23 question forward and see if that would be possibility  
24 given the timeframe that's available here.  
25  
26 MR. ERHART: 15th and 16th.  
27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We can't meet  
29 October 15th and 16th because there are two Councils  
30 already on that week.  
31  
32 MR. ERHART: Oh, oh, yeah.  
33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So we -- we  
35 can't -- and she's saying she'll advocate for us so I'm  
36 advocating for after this window closes. I find this  
37 really frustrating.  
38  
39 MR. WOODRUFF: What's the significance of  
40 the window.  
41  
42 MS. PATTON: The main -- the main  
43 challenge is that the recommendations that the Council  
44 makes takes some time to develop and get forwarded to the  
45 Federal Subsistence Board, that's why it's put in this  
46 timeframe is to make sure that all Council  
47 recommendations are forwarded to the Federal Subsistence  
48 Board so that they can consider those recommendations.  
49  
50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

1 MS. PATTON: So that's why I would have  
2 to -- I would have to doublecheck to see if that  
3 timeframe would work for them. We have expanded that  
4 window before under circumstances like this. If it  
5 happened, you know, just the week following the closure  
6 might be our best opportunity for that.

7  
8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. So we  
9 are volunteers and you can advocate for us.....

10  
11 MS. PATTON: Absolutely.

12  
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....this is a  
14 problem. This is a big, big, big problem and I think  
15 Staff -- or OSM, whatever, needs to really consider that  
16 we still have priorities in our life that we got to deal  
17 with and if it takes from my hunting time, I'm out of  
18 here. That's the way it's going to work for me.

19  
20 MR. ERHART: Me too.

21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It's pretty  
23 challenging, uh-huh.

24  
25 MR. FIRMIN: The 2nd and 3rd would work,  
26 but why is there no meetings that week.

27  
28 MS. PATTON: Through the Chair.

29  
30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh.

31  
32 MS. PATTON: Through the Chair. Given  
33 the circumstances that happened this year with a budget  
34 not being agreed upon by Congress, all the Federal  
35 agencies were not able to continue working. Our concern  
36 was to have set up a meeting and have to cancel it, if  
37 that were the case. I would like to have a little more  
38 confidence but it was to prevent having to cancel and  
39 reschedule if that happened again.

40  
41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, we can't  
42 predict that. And we can't predict if it's going to  
43 happen that week or the week before or the week -- or  
44 ever happening again. I -- I don't -- I don't accept  
45 that. I understand that they're saying it, but I don't  
46 accept it. I'm a volunteer and we're working in November  
47 right now and I don't see -- as a matter of fact, it's  
48 November 20th, quite a bit after the 17th of October, and  
49 I'm not taking it out on you, Eva, I'm just taking it out  
50 on -- my frustration of our lives here.

1 MS. PATTON: Because of the alternate  
2 years it would be a fisheries cycle and that cycle  
3 meeting is scheduled for January so they wanted to make  
4 sure to get the Council's recommendations at that time.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I understand,  
7 I'm just.....  
8  
9 MS. PATTON: But.....  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....trying to  
12 -- I want you to advocate for us.  
13  
14 MS. PATTON: Absolutely.  
15  
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Did you have  
17 something to add, Jennifer, I see you up there.  
18  
19 MS. YUHAS: After you're done talking  
20 about your fall meeting I'll give you some information  
21 pertinent to your spring meeting.  
22  
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You mean after  
24 I'm -- after I'm -- using my inflection like Virgil does.  
25  
26 (Laughter)  
27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, Council  
29 members, anything.  
30  
31 MR. WOODRUFF: I'd go for the first week  
32 of October, I don't care about if sequestration, that's  
33 not going to happen, I just talked to Congress.  
34  
35 (Laughter)  
36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: You just talked  
38 to Congress, I'll be calling them in the morning.  
39  
40 (Laughter)  
41  
42 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: If it were me  
43 I would prefer that week after the 17th, those two days,  
44 which -- I'd have to pull a calendar up, 18, 20, 21, so  
45 21, 22 of October and then I'd have my second choice, the  
46 one you just referred -- is everybody okay with that.  
47  
48 MR. ERHART: Sounds good.  
49  
50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. So

1 Virgil just said, yes, the week after as he left, so he  
2 would agree with that, so that's good, that's how we'll  
3 put it down.

4

5 MR. WOODRUFF: Tentatively.

6

7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Tentatively,  
8 yeah. Well, our first choice is 21, 22, and second  
9 choice is 1 and 2, unless you want another shopping spree  
10 and go 2, 3.

11

12 (Laughter)

13

14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. You'll  
15 be done this time, uh. All right, go -- Jennifer did you  
16 have something.

17

18 MS. YUHAS: Just as you prepare for your  
19 meetings, one of the things I try to do at each of the  
20 RAC meetings is make sure that the RACs are aware of  
21 their opportunities to comment on State Board of Game and  
22 Board of Fish proposals and so any of the comments for  
23 the statewide Board of Fish proposals will need to be  
24 decided at your upcoming teleconference, where you  
25 discuss your FRMP issues because you'll be -- your next  
26 meeting will occur after that meeting.

27

28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.

29

30 MS. YUHAS: And your spring meeting for  
31 the 6th and 7th tentatively will occur one week before  
32 the statewide Board of Game meeting so if you have  
33 comments for the statewide Board of Game, those would  
34 need to be on your spring agenda in order to comment in  
35 time.

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, thank  
38 you. And.....

39

40 MR. BUE: Madame Chair. I apologize  
41 dragging this out but what Ms. Yuhas referenced was there  
42 were three ACRs that were adopted at the Board of Fish  
43 work session in October, that they're not on this agenda  
44 but I wanted to make you aware of those for the Yukon,  
45 specifically for the Yukon so those will be coming up in  
46 March, whatever 17th through the 21st.

47

48 Thank you.

49

50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. You

1 might want to put those on the agenda.....

2

3 MS. PATTON: Uh-huh.

4

5 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....right guys

6 -- yeah, okay. All right.

7

8 Now, back to the regularly scheduled

9 program. I'm so sorry that it's gotten late but the

10 Council likes to hit their action items first.

11

12 MR. BERG: I will be brief.

13

14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Go ahead.

15

16 MR. BERG: Madame Chair and Council. My

17 name is Nate Berg. I am a wildlife biologist at Tetlin

18 National Wildlife Refuge. And, unlike, Arctic, where

19 they have some senior biologists, we no longer have any

20 senior biologists, I'm actually the most senior of the

21 biologists on Staff, having been there for three years.

22 We have multiple positions that are now vacant and at

23 present we're only allowed to fill one of those

24 positions. So we are down on Staff as well.

25

26 And, I'll be quick, I just wanted to

27 touch on a few things that are taking place on the Refuge

28 or in that area.

29

30 Our caribou hunt is open at present. We

31 opened it on October 21st of this year and it will remain

32 open through the winter until April, sometime, when the

33 Refuge manager decides to close that hunt.

34

35 This past year was pretty interesting, as

36 I'm sure you guys were aware. Weather-wise, May decided

37 to remain winter, and the Nelchina Caribou Herd, many of

38 them actually calved on Tetlin Refuge this year where

39 normally they calve clear over, you know, by the Denali

40 Highway and that area. So that was a little bit

41 interesting.

42

43 Another thing, we also had a major

44 songbird fallout in the Tetlin area where we had loss of

45 juncos and thrushes and blackbirds and robins, and you

46 name it, they all just kind of congregated in the middle

47 of May during a blizzard and we observed some pretty

48 interesting things. We observed robins and blackbirds

49 eating juncos, killing other songbirds and eating them,

50 which was pretty disturbing to a lot of the local

1 residents. But that kind of may have influenced our  
2 banding station. We have a long-term banding station  
3 that we run and this was our 21st year and we had really,  
4 really low returns of birds this year, the lowest that  
5 we'd ever recorded. So that was a little bit interesting  
6 as well.

7  
8 A little other information. We monitor  
9 snowshoe hares, we have for the past 20 years and we are  
10 now in the bottom of the cycle and we're about five years  
11 since the peak of the cycle so it should start picking up  
12 here in about a year or two.

13  
14 We do have one new project kind of out on  
15 the horizon. We have a graduate student from Mentasta,  
16 I don't know if you know her, Kate Galbraith, I don't  
17 know if that -- do you, okay. She's a student at Utah  
18 State University and she's also working with a professor  
19 at UAF as well and she's hoping to do some research on  
20 wolves, coyotes and lynx in the Upper Tanana Valley as  
21 well as in Unit 13, and she is collaborating with the  
22 Fish and Wildlife Service, as well, as Alaska Department  
23 of Fish and Game, BLM and a few others.

24  
25 So at present that's what I have for you  
26 guys.

27  
28 For the spring meeting, or the late  
29 winter meeting, we will try to have a summary as well,  
30 similar to Yukon Flats so you guys can stay up on the  
31 different projects that we have going on on the Refuge.

32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Questions,  
34 anyone.

35  
36  
37 (No comments)

38  
39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I will add to  
40 what you said about the songbirds. Frank has that Dead  
41 End salvage permit from the government, US Fish and  
42 Wildlife Service, and it's unbelievable the amount of  
43 song birds that died this spring. We attribute it to  
44 that rain that we had in January that created like two to  
45 three inches of ice on the ground and then they came and  
46 they got -- we had two feet of snow in early May, like  
47 the 8th of May and those poor birds were congregated any  
48 place they could find and people were just finding them  
49 dead and people were calling Frank all the time saying,  
50 oh, we got all these dead birds, and it was significant.

1 And one truck driver said from Tok to Fairbanks, he  
2 killed over 200 on the road.  
3  
4 MR. BERG: Yeah, and we had thousands in  
5 our yard alone, it was pretty amazing.  
6  
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh. Pretty  
8 sad.  
9  
10 MR. BERG: Yeah.  
11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh. Okay.  
13  
14 MR. BERG: All right, thank you.  
15  
16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Thank you. I  
17 think you'll do okay with one biologist.  
18  
19 (Laughter)  
20  
21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah. Because  
22 I remember a few years ago that's all there was.  
23  
24 (Laughter)  
25  
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Next.  
27 I think you guys know who it is without me grabbing my  
28 book. Park Service, Yukon-Charley. Is there anyone from  
29 Yukon-Charley.....  
30  
31 MS. PATTON: There she is, Yukon-Charley,  
32 Marcy.....  
33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....here she  
35 is, then Wrangells, and Denali.  
36  
37 MS. OKADA: Madame Chair. Council  
38 members. I'll make this as quickly as possible, just in  
39 the interest of your time. My name is Marcy Okada. I'm  
40 with Yukon-Charley Rivers National Preserve.  
41  
42 The community of Eagle has created a  
43 working -- a subsistence working group, since there's no  
44 SRC for Yukon-Charley, and we were scheduled to meet in  
45 Eagle on August 20th, but that ended up getting cancelled  
46 and we're hoping to reschedule for the future.  
47  
48 There was a 64 percent drop in wolf  
49 numbers from fall 2012 to spring 2013 in Yukon-Charley  
50 Rivers, and that was due to predator control that had

1 taken place around Yukon-Charley Rivers. And there's a  
2 series of information following that.

3  
4 An Air -- Galvin's Air Strip, which is a  
5 gravel bar located at Galvin's Cabin was basically  
6 warranted unsafe for landings in late July. This was due  
7 to the landing strip suffering damage from spring floods  
8 that occurred earlier in the year.

9  
10 There were no fires in Yukon-Charley  
11 Rivers National Preserve this season and no brush  
12 clearing work was conducted around any public use cabins.

13  
14 And there were also archeological surveys  
15 conducted -- well, supported by helicopter, looking at  
16 potential cave sites and lithic raw material sources  
17 within the Preserve.

18  
19 And then, lastly, this just came in, a  
20 new dinosaur discovery has been established in the  
21 Preserve by Dr. Tony Fiorello and the team discovered  
22 first evidence of dinosaurs, dinosaur tracks in the  
23 Preserve in 2010 and they continue to come back each  
24 summer and look for more evidence of dinosaur --  
25 dinosaurs.

26  
27 And that's it.

28  
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Question's  
30 anyone.

31  
32  
33 (No comments)

34  
35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: How do you  
36 discover a dinosaur track.

37  
38 (Laughter)

39  
40 MR. ERHART: I was just going to ask that  
41 question.

42  
43 (Laughter)

44  
45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's Lester's  
46 question.

47  
48 MR. ERHART: How do you find one.

49  
50 MS. OKADA: I mean I can't answer that

1 question at this time.  
2  
3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, okay.  
4  
5 (Laughter)  
6  
7 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: But you gave us  
8 the report. You're going.....  
9  
10 MS. OKADA: Yes.  
11  
12 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....to have to  
13 ask the person, I want to hear about that next time.  
14  
15 (Laughter)  
16  
17 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Give you some  
18 research to do.  
19  
20 (Laughter)  
21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: On another  
23 positive note the wolves will be back, they like to  
24 breed.  
25  
26 (Laughter)  
27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hey, thank you.  
29  
30 MS. PATTON: Thank you, Marcy.  
31  
32 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Barbara.  
33  
34 MS. CELLARIUS: Thank you, Madame Chair,  
35 Council members. My name is Barbara Cellarius and I'm  
36 the subsistence coordinator for Wrangell-St. Elias.  
37  
38 And before I just give you a few  
39 highlights for Wrangell-St.Elias. Let me mention that  
40 Amy Craver, who's the subsistence coordinator for Denali  
41 was not able to be here today but I believe you have a  
42 written report from her. If you have any questions  
43 today, I can pass them on to Amy or if you have  
44 questions, after you've had a chance to read the report,  
45 I think she probably has contact information on the  
46 report, I don't have it in front of me.  
47  
48 MS. PATTON: Here let me -- this one.  
49  
50 MS. CELLARIUS: No, that's mine. But if

1 you have questions for Amy, if you have them today I'll  
2 pass them on to Amy, if you don't there should be contact  
3 information on her report, or send them to Eva and we can  
4 work with Eva to get the questions to Amy. So that's  
5 Denali's report.

6  
7 And I gave you my Chisana caribou hunt  
8 report previously.

9  
10 The other things in my written report,  
11 there's some information about Federal subsistence  
12 hunting permits. And then I talk a little bit about our  
13 community harvest survey, and I'll talk about that  
14 briefly in a minute.

15  
16 Judy Putera, our wildlife biologist,  
17 hopes to have for you, for your winter meeting, results  
18 from the Chisana Caribou Herd survey that was recently  
19 done. I believe they did some kind of survey with the  
20 Mentasta herd, and she's actually out right now doing a  
21 moose survey. So hopefully have that for you at the --  
22 at your next meeting.

23  
24 We're continuing to implement our Nabesna  
25 Trails Plan. And as Sue mentioned our next SRC meeting  
26 is planned for the first week of March, but I think we  
27 can work to coordinate the -- if you guys end up meeting  
28 that week, I think we can make it work.

29  
30 So the last thing I wanted to talk about  
31 was really just briefly this handout. And we have been  
32 surveying communities, mostly in the Copper Basin, about  
33 subsistence. It's a household survey, we go to every  
34 household that we can in the small communities, do a  
35 sample of households in the larger communities; and I  
36 think the really interesting thing, if you look at the  
37 back page, the graph at the top, it shows for Copper  
38 Center, Mentasta Lake, Slana and Nabesna Road and  
39 Mentasta Pass -- and Mentasta Pass actually is in Unit  
40 12, it's Sue's neighborhood, and so it does include some  
41 information -- this report includes some information from  
42 your area.....

43  
44 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: End Nabesna  
45 Road is Unit 12, yeah.

46  
47 MS. CELLARIUS: Oh, right the end of  
48 Nabesna Road is Unit 12, too.

49  
50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

1 MS. CELLARIUS: I wish we had done a  
2 better job of separating out the end of the Nabesna Road,  
3 but hindsight is 20/20. Anyway, this is a graph of per  
4 capita harvest. The blue graph is 198 -- the blue line  
5 is '82, the red line is '87, and the green line is 2010.  
6 We stable to increasing harvest of subsistence resources  
7 on a per person basis in these communities as a result of  
8 this survey and I thought that was really interesting to  
9 see.

10  
11 So, anyway, that is the four page  
12 summary.

13  
14 I have copies of the 300-page report.  
15 I've given one to Don. Sue has one. If there are other  
16 RAC members I'm happy to give you copies. If there's  
17 people in the audience who would like copies we can -- I  
18 don't have an unlimited number of copies but if folks  
19 were really interested I can get you copies.

20  
21 And that's what I have.

22  
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I'm sorry, any  
24 questions.

25  
26  
27 (No comments)

28  
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Just for your  
30 information, guys, Mentasta Pass and Mentasta Lake was  
31 pulled apart. We were originally surveyed, that's why  
32 there's no blue line by Mentasta Pass, we were together  
33 in the blue line that year.

34  
35 I don't know why it was done, but it was.

36  
37 Okey-dokey.

38  
39 Thank you, Barbara. Barbara, you always  
40 get to be at the tail end of things, don't you.

41  
42 All right. And if I'm looking at this  
43 correctly, it looks like we -- BLM spoke and we do.....

44  
45 MS. PATTON: It's -- it's.....

46  
47 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....have.....

48  
49 MS. PATTON: .....it's the Central  
50 Yukon.....

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I know.  
2  
3 MS. PATTON: .....Resource  
4 Management.....  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I know. Yeah,  
7 I almost forgot.....  
8  
9 (Laughter)  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: BLM is here  
12 from the Central Field Office, or whatever -- oh, I wrote  
13 that down, but it's the Central something, Use Field  
14 Office Plan, and the reason why it might sound like I  
15 don't know what I'm talking about is there are so many  
16 plans out there I don't know that I remember everybody's  
17 name on these plans. The government is doing fast-track  
18 on planning lately it seems to me.  
19  
20 MS. COLE: Madame Chair and Council. My  
21 name is Jeanie Cole. I'm with the Bureau of Land  
22 management in Fairbanks. And, yes, we are,  
23 unfortunately, starting another land use planning  
24 process.  
25  
26 It's in your book.....  
27  
28 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So I was right,  
29 fast-track on plans, uh.  
30  
31 MS. COLE: Well, I don't know if I'd call  
32 it fast-track.  
33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
35  
36 (Laughter)  
37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: But, go ahead.  
39  
40 MS. COLE: There's a one page report in  
41 the book and this is a newsletter that we recently mailed  
42 out that we're handing out. If you look in the middle  
43 there's a map of the planning area, it's called the  
44 Central Yukon Resource Management Plan. Primarily  
45 affects the communities in the Western Interior but it is  
46 adjacent to the Eastern Interior RAC and it's going to  
47 cover about 16 million acres of BLM lands, including  
48 along the Dalton Highway and then along the kind of  
49 middle to lower Yukon River.  
50

1                   We're in the what we call our scoping  
2 period, which is where we go out and ask the public for  
3 input on what they think the issues are in the area or  
4 what their major concerns are about the area, how they  
5 think BLM should -- what they think BLM should consider  
6 in their planning process. We've been having communities  
7 -- or meetings at various communities. We've been to  
8 Nulato, Ruby, Lake Minchumina, Nenana, Wiseman and  
9 Venetie so far. We have meetings scheduled in Bettles,  
10 Allakaket, Hughes, and Tanana in the next few weeks.

11  
12                   So we primarily just wanted to let you  
13 know that this is happening and we're in our scoping  
14 period in case you had any concerns about it.

15  
16                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
17 Question. Donald.

18  
19                   MR. WOODRUFF: Jeanie Cole. This is  
20 similar to the Eastern Plan you just completed.

21  
22                   MS. COLE: Yes, it's similar to the  
23 Eastern Plan but unfortunately that plan is not quite  
24 done yet.

25  
26                   MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you.

27  
28                   MS. COLE: But it will cover similar  
29 types of issues and everything. And we did give a  
30 presentation at the Western Interior RAC meeting last  
31 week, I guess it was.

32  
33                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Other  
34 questions.

35  
36  
37                   (No comments)

38  
39                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And that was  
40 nice of you to hang in there like that, too.

41  
42                   MS. COLE: I do have a question. I guess  
43 I'd be interested in knowing if you would want us to  
44 continue to update you on this plan or not, or if we  
45 should just coordinate with the Western Interior RAC.

46  
47                   MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Gentlemen, your  
48 preference.

49  
50                   MR. WOODRUFF: A yearly update would be

1 beneficial.

2

3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Everybody agree  
4 to that.

5

6 (Council nods affirmatively)

7

8 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Sounds like it,  
9 yeah. Thank you, yeah. We're probably getting our  
10 brains full of information here, yeah -- all right, well,  
11 thank you.

12

13 MS. COLE: You're welcome.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh. All  
16 right. Did you have anything else, Jennifer.

17

18 MS. YUHAS: Thank you, Madame Chair.  
19 Jennifer Yuhas, Alaska Department of Fish and Game.

20

21 I have nothing as far as a report that we  
22 can't provide to you in written form for you to peruse  
23 later.

24

25 With regards to the OSM budget, we would  
26 like to note that the liaison office was zeroed out this  
27 year. You heard a report from Mr. Peltola regards to  
28 what OSM is going through with their funding, they used  
29 to support the liaison office, which meant myself and two  
30 positions, a fisheries biologist and a wildlife  
31 biologists, and that also was money we distributed to the  
32 Division so they could travel to the RAC meetings, and,  
33 so that's -- it's been entirely absorbed by the State at  
34 this point, and so you may see fewer attendees at some of  
35 the RAC meetings because we only have so much funds.

36

37 With regards to the MOU, Mr. Peltola did  
38 a good summary, but what we did not capture there is that  
39 the State signatories were unable to sign the revision of  
40 the document because the ACs had asked for things to be  
41 inserted that could not be done. Yeah, the Solicitor's  
42 Office could not put in predator management any more than  
43 the RACs who requested that, and on the State attorney's  
44 side, the Solicitor agreed as well, several of the RACs  
45 requested that the document be made binding and that  
46 there be consequences for deviation -- deviating from the  
47 MOU, we're unable to do that as the document is, in  
48 character, not binding, and so we're not real sure how  
49 far we can get on a redraft. Simplifying the document is  
50 much easier than making it binding. That's something we

1 cannot do, according to the attorneys. So we will  
2 continue to look at options.

3  
4 We'll continue to operate until November  
5 2014 under the existing MOU but we can't insert the  
6 things the ACs wanted, therefore, the State signatories  
7 could not sign it.

8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Any  
10 questions.

11  
12  
13 (No comments)

14  
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right. The  
16 one thing that -- now that we don't have a quorum and  
17 we're just taking reports -- I think I got everybody,  
18 right, that's out there that needed to bring up -- Peppa,  
19 did you have one more.

20  
21 MS. KENNER: Palma.

22  
23 MS. PATTON: We're just checking in on  
24 line there, I don't know if Palma was still on line. We  
25 had.....

26  
27 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh, yeah,  
28 that.....

29  
30 MS. PATTON: .....just provided a super  
31 brief overview for the FRMP.....

32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And she's not  
34 sitting in front of me.....

35  
36 MS. PATTON: .....and if Trent -- if  
37 Trent is there and you wanted to just provide that  
38 update, we may have missed him there.

39  
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No, that was a  
41 gal wasn't it.

42  
43 MS. PATTON: Yeah, Palma or Trent could  
44 have provided that update. Palma was.....

45  
46 MR. LIEBICH: Hi, Eva, this is Trent.

47  
48 MS. PATTON: Hi Trent. If -- if you'd  
49 like to provide that brief overview on the Partner's  
50 Program.

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Council  
2 members.  
3  
4 MR. LIEBICH: I am sorry. I do not have  
5 my information with me. I had to pick up my daughter  
6 from daycare.  
7  
8 (Laughter)  
9  
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Hey, would you  
11 say that again.  
12  
13 (Laughter)  
14  
15 MR. LIEBICH: I don't have my information  
16 with me on the Partner's Program, I had to pick up my  
17 daughter from daycare, sorry.  
18  
19 MR. WOODRUFF: Oh, well.  
20  
21 (Laughter)  
22  
23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's all  
24 right.  
25  
26 (Laughter)  
27  
28 MS. PATTON: That's okay, we do have.....  
29  
30 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Do you guys  
31 want it sent to you.  
32  
33 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair and Council.  
34 There is a written briefing and that's in your books, and  
35 I'll -- you're welcome to read that. It's a simple two  
36 page briefing, but it provides the overview of the  
37 Partner's Program. And, again, Brian McKenna, who spoke  
38 from TCC is actually funded through that program, and the  
39 projects that they work on with TCC are funded through  
40 the FRMP and OSM Partner's Program. So it provides an  
41 overview for you.  
42  
43 Thank you.  
44  
45 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I feel kind of  
46 bad because the person that said, oh, I have to add to  
47 that, what was her name.  
48  
49 MS. PATTON: Palma Ingles.  
50

1 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Palma Ingles.  
2 You're not in front of me Palma so, I forgot.  
3  
4 (Laughter)  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I call that  
7 CRS.  
8  
9 (Laughter)  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Are you out  
12 there and still want to report.  
13  
14  
15 (No comments)  
16  
17 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. I believe she  
18 may have left because we were indicating we were going to  
19 move on to the OSM updates.  
20  
21 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. And what  
22 report did she have.  
23  
24 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. The report  
25 Palma Ingles was going to touch on was the Partners for  
26 Fisheries Monitoring Program. So she works within  
27 OSM.....  
28  
29 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
30  
31 MS. PATTON: .....and oversees that  
32 program.  
33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Is that in our  
35 book.  
36  
37 MS. PATTON: And that is in your books,  
38 there's a two page briefing, which is on Page 221. And  
39 it provides an overview of how that program is set up.  
40 They're community-based fisheries biologists in the  
41 regions and those programs are applied for similar to the  
42 FRMP process. So currently there is a Partners Program  
43 biologist with ONC, Bethel area tribes, there's one with  
44 the Kuskokwim Native Association up river in Aniak on the  
45 Kuskokwim River, TCC has a Partners Program and that was  
46 Brian McKenna, who presented today so he was providing an  
47 update to the Council on the projects that are funded  
48 through the Partners Program.  
49  
50 They're community-based projects.

1 They're specifically identifying subsistence fisheries  
2 issues of concern and facilitating the community  
3 involvement and development of research and monitoring  
4 projects for subsistence fisheries. So they're a  
5 resource. I mean that was one of the things I just  
6 wanted to highlight in the Partners Program, is, Brian  
7 McKenna, through the TCC Program is a resource for this  
8 Council and the communities in the region to help  
9 facilitate local engagement in fisheries research and  
10 monitoring and to help bring forth subsistence fisheries  
11 concerns and also capacity building through science camp  
12 programs or partnership research and monitoring projects.

13  
14 So just to highlight that for the  
15 Council, they're a resource for you and your communities.

16  
17 There's also a program in Bristol Bay  
18 with BBNA, Bristol Bay Native Association. And then  
19 Native Village of Eyak on the Copper River.

20  
21 And it's a program similar to the FRMP,  
22 it's a competitive application process for those funds.

23  
24 Thank you.

25  
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. That's  
27 why I rely on you guys for fisheries, there's so much  
28 that you guys are doing that is different than what I'm  
29 doing. I'm mostly game, and then the Copper River  
30 fisheries, that's where a lot of us fish in our area.

31  
32 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair, if I may.  
33 There's one more update, is Brian McKenna's contact  
34 information is on that two page information sheet and I  
35 would encourage you to contact him if there's community  
36 projects that you'd be interested in or through this FRMP  
37 process, if you want to be engaged.

38  
39 Thank you.

40  
41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. We  
42 cannot do any more action items but I would like to ask  
43 Staff, on our annual report, if I have this straight in  
44 my head, that we should have issues that we provide you  
45 now that have to be in our -- in a draft form at the next  
46 meeting.

47  
48 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. It is as --  
49 as much that the Council can bring forth and speak to,  
50 some of the details on the record, this is an opportunity

1 to identify issues you would like to bring up in the  
2 annual report. If the Council does think of something  
3 later, that, oh, yeah, you know, we actually wanted to  
4 address this, you can still bring those to my attention,  
5 and I'll work with you on drafting that report. The  
6 topics need to be brought up here and soon so that I can  
7 begin to draft that report and the Council has the  
8 opportunity to review it at the winter meeting.

9  
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So can you --  
11 even though it's not an advertised meeting or anything,  
12 can you email us and remind us about issues that we would  
13 like to see in our annual report and see if we could have  
14 something sent to you from each of us by the next  
15 meeting. Can we do that, and that's all within our.....

16  
17 MS. PATTON: Absolutely.

18  
19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....privy.

20  
21 MS. PATTON: And let me -- let me make a  
22 recommendation, too, there was a request to -- to have a  
23 teleconference meeting of this Council to address  
24 the.....

25  
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Right.

27  
28 MS. PATTON: .....fish issue, we can also  
29 have some more discussion. If you want to think about  
30 the issues you want to bring forth in the annual report  
31 and then, with quorum, at a teleconference meeting, we  
32 would need to identify that date here on the record in  
33 order for it to be.....

34  
35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, to  
36 take.....

37  
38 MS. PATTON: .....publicly noticed.

39  
40 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh.

41  
42 MS. PATTON: So that's an option. If you  
43 want to identify a date for that teleconference meeting  
44 we can discuss the FRMP proposal and we can have more  
45 time for more detailed discussion about what you would  
46 like to address the Board with in your annual report.

47  
48 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So you're  
49 saying that has to be public noticed.

50

1 MS. PATTON: In order to have the  
2 teleconference meeting, if we announce the date today at  
3 a public meeting, that gives us the two week public  
4 notice window that's required. Otherwise if we came up  
5 with a date later we would have -- through the Federal  
6 Register because the Council's actions are part of a  
7 Regional Advisory Council.....  
8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. So  
10 how.....  
11  
12 MS. PATTON: .....so it would need six  
13 weeks.  
14  
15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: .....could --  
16 they need to meet before we get to do that, is that  
17 determined already, the.....  
18  
19 MS. PATTON: The Federal Subsistence  
20 Board.  
21  
22 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: No, no, the  
23 people that make the recommendations.  
24  
25 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: The TRC.  
26  
27 MS. PATTON: Oh, yes, the TRC has to  
28 meet. So if we identify an opportunity to teleconference  
29 today, that's two weeks out or near around that area, if  
30 there's in the next month there's an opportunity  
31 then.....  
32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So we don't  
34 have to have a specific date, we can just say we want to  
35 meet this month or something like that.  
36  
37 MS. PATTON: If you could identify the  
38 week that would -- that would be helpful. Some -- some  
39 general dates that might work for you.  
40  
41 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, I thought  
42 I heard you say that we could just send you -- each of us  
43 send you an issue.  
44  
45 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. To clarify,  
46 for the annual report, you can -- you can identify  
47 additional issues that -- that haven't been brought up  
48 today but if you wanted to -- if we're -- if we're going  
49 to teleconference to address that FRMP issue that got  
50 brought up today, what we could also do is have the

1 opportunity to dialogue about the annual report. The --  
2 the challenge.....  
3  
4 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Okay.  
5  
6 MS. PATTON: .....we're faced with in  
7 order to teleconference.....  
8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay.  
10  
11 MS. PATTON: .....with a quorum.....  
12  
13 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It has to be  
14 announced.  
15  
16 MS. PATTON: .....we have to announce  
17 that publicly.....  
18  
19 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: What's the  
20 wishes of the Council.  
21  
22 MS. PATTON: .....to make the two week  
23 window.  
24  
25 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: How do you want  
26 to proceed to do that. Do you want to have full  
27 discussion and have it publicly announced or do you want  
28 to send ideas in to her now -- or between now and when  
29 she drafts the letter.  
30  
31 MR. GLANZ: When did Dave say that letter  
32 would be ready for us, that he was going to send us, we  
33 was going to have the teleconference on.  
34  
35 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, I was  
36 trying to get that from you.  
37  
38 MS. PATTON: They'll -- they'll be  
39 preparing that very soon, I believe, so probably within  
40 this -- this next week they would be able to have that  
41 information.  
42  
43 MS. KENNER: Eva, through the Chair.  
44 This is Pippa Kenner with OSM. Eva, are you talking  
45 about the -- after the TRC's review.  
46  
47 MS. PATTON: Madame Chair. My  
48 understanding from David's recommendation was given the  
49 -- the need to consider this additional FRMP proposal,  
50 the Council was requested if they could teleconference.

1 MS. KENNER: I believe we don't have a  
2 time on that.  
3  
4 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's what I  
5 thought.  
6  
7 MS. KENNER: And I think they're going to  
8 try -- from what I understand, they're going to try to do  
9 it without the TRC actually meeting and that I thought he  
10 said more than two weeks. I remember it being, I think  
11 we should give them at least a month to get that  
12 complete.  
13  
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.  
15  
16 (Laughter)  
17  
18 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, first of  
19 all, let's identify, do you guys want to have -- do you  
20 want to have this published and pick a date -- that, or  
21 send ideas -- issues to Eva, meaning that we can't  
22 discuss it at the teleconference, right.  
23  
24 (Laughter)  
25  
26 MS. KENNER: I think it's for -- this is  
27 Pippa Kenner with OSM, again, Madame Chair. I think for  
28 planning purposes we cannot tell you when that will be  
29 ready. This is something that's just happened, they  
30 haven't been able to talk about it. It's going to be  
31 more than a couple of weeks. I said a month because it  
32 was far enough out I figured it will be by then, at  
33 least.  
34  
35 MR. WOODRUFF: Let's just get started.  
36  
37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Now, you  
38 provide -- I'm moving on to my Council, okay, let us  
39 figure this out.  
40  
41 (Laughter)  
42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Why did you  
44 hand it to me and not speak for yourself.  
45  
46 MR. WOODRUFF: Because I didn't want to  
47 interrupt what you guys were talking about.  
48  
49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Oh.  
50

1 MR. WOODRUFF: But I can recite that from  
2 memory, if you'd like.

3  
4 (Laughter)

5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. So what  
7 -- I'm perfectly happy to give you some -- I know we  
8 don't have a quorum but I'm perfectly happy to give you  
9 some issues right now. Because my number 1 issue is what  
10 you and I talked about -- or I talked about and you  
11 agreed with me about, is this hunter ethics and some  
12 means of something coming forward to have, you know, non-  
13 subsistence and subsistence have that respect built. And  
14 I feel like it can be done in -- like you were saying  
15 earlier, Andrew, force the Fish and Wildlife Service and  
16 ADF&G to start talking and have some educational stuff  
17 with the people in these areas, where there's problem  
18 areas, that would be -- the first place to be the most  
19 concerned is problem areas, where there's a conflict, and  
20 figure out what they're going to do about that. So to  
21 me, the hunter ethics, and respect of people, and if you  
22 guys could help -- I think from what we said on the  
23 record is what you could pull from. Okay, that's one.

24  
25 So do you want this back.

26  
27 He says he could speak to it by heart.

28  
29 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you. It's just a  
30 couple of ideas I had for the annual report and we talked  
31 about this.

32  
33 One of the ideas is that we do the -- the  
34 ideas that we gave to the fisheries guys, you know, to  
35 enhance the chinook recover, and one was the Area M  
36 issue. And my idea of the first, second, third pulse.  
37 I know the first pulse is already protected by order, but  
38 they can do EOs on those and the whole concept of us all  
39 working together up and down the whole river and a  
40 village by village commitment to reduce harvest. If we  
41 can put that on our annual report then everybody can see  
42 that we have strong feelings towards this issue, that  
43 that's not going to -- it's not going to go away if we  
44 keep harvesting fish.

45  
46 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Did you hit on  
47 that -- what you three agreed on.

48  
49 MR. ERHART: You have to do away with  
50 driftnet.

1 MR. WOODRUFF: Yeah, there's another one  
2 driftnets.  
3  
4 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And, Lester  
5 added do away with -- go ahead.  
6  
7 MR. ERHART: Yeah, do away with  
8 driftnetting.  
9  
10 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's  
11 something that would probably get an answer.  
12  
13 (Laughter)  
14  
15 MR. ERHART: Woah.....  
16  
17 (Laughter)  
18  
19 MR. GLANZ: Yeah, Madame Chair.....  
20  
21 MR. ERHART: .....that'll get us an  
22 answer.  
23  
24 MR. GLANZ: .....the last time we did  
25 that they sent a -- they made a motion to the Board that  
26 they eliminate the setnets, that we -- that all setnets  
27 should be eliminated on the Yukon, from down river.  
28  
29 (Laughter)  
30  
31 MR. FIRMIN: And no more fishwheels, too,  
32 that was their other proposal was, remember.  
33  
34 MR. ERHART: Yeah. Fishwheels don't do  
35 no damage.  
36  
37 (Laughter)  
38  
39 MR. GLANZ: Yeah, they don't.  
40  
41 (Laughter)  
42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Well, we  
44 know what we've been through but it doesn't -- well, and  
45 talk about the resource, the concern for the resource.  
46  
47 MR. WOODRUFF: And the respect part also,  
48 I think, comes into this whole fisheries issue. That  
49 it's -- it's not a Native or non-Native issue, we all  
50 want these fish to be rebuilt and that polarization that

1 comes out of some of this conflict is not productive, it  
2 doesn't solve the issue, you know.

3

4 MR. ERHART: It doesn't.

5

6 MR. WOODRUFF: And I don't like to speak  
7 to this issue of this polarization but it becomes more  
8 and more in the forefront, you know, that somebody should  
9 fish and somebody shouldn't fish. What we all shouldn't  
10 do is not fish and let the fish go to the spawning  
11 grounds, and for the whole population to recover, and if  
12 we all work together -- it's a challenge for us, it's an  
13 opportunity for us to step forward and make a commitment.

14

15 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And you guys  
16 have really been trying to work together through YRDFA,  
17 right. I mean there's been efforts to do it.

18

19 MR. GLANZ: Well, we had the TRI-Council,  
20 the salmon TRI-Council where we -- we went and met all  
21 the way down river with them people.

22

23 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Was that  
24 productive.

25

26 MR. GLANZ: Nope. It was very productive  
27 at the meeting with everybody there, they were all for  
28 it, but when we presented it to the villages, Tanana,  
29 everybody, I can't live on \$750 a year, this is  
30 subsistence fish, that was what we had the big argument  
31 with, you're not supposed.....

32

33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

34

35 MR. GLANZ: .....to sell any of it, you  
36 know.

37

38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So you didn't  
39 think that TRI-Council was productive even though that  
40 was a deal to work together.

41

42 MR. GLANZ: Oh, it was a deal to work  
43 together, only because when we got away -- the ocean  
44 people, they said, well, you know, when you guys were  
45 telling us we didn't believe you, and then when Western  
46 was telling us we didn't believe it, but guess what, now,  
47 we believe you it's happening to us, you know.

48

49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: So I'd say it  
50 was probably good.

1 MR. GLANZ: It was productive in that  
2 sense, yes.  
3  
4 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah, in that  
5 point.  
6  
7 MR. GLANZ: But we couldn't get any.....  
8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: That's a step  
10 in the right direction.  
11  
12 MR. GLANZ: It certainly was.  
13  
14 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh.  
15  
16 MR. GLANZ: I'd be glad to do it again,  
17 you know, if we had to -- I mean if we could get it to  
18 work.  
19  
20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Something's  
21 going to have to happen.  
22  
23 MR. GLANZ: We did pretty good, all three  
24 of us down there.  
25  
26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Do you guys  
27 have any other issues that we could bring up right now.  
28  
29 MR. FIRMIN: I guess I know it's not  
30 predator control, but predator management on Yukon Flats  
31 is one.  
32  
33 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I heard that  
34 from Gideon on that moose one.  
35  
36 MR. FIRMIN: Yeah.  
37  
38 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.  
39  
40 MR. FIRMIN: Yeah, it's not control or  
41 aerial gunning, it's predator management.  
42  
43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: It's  
44 management.  
45  
46 MR. FIRMIN: By making, you know, the  
47 harvest of those animals easier and more easier for the  
48 people.  
49  
50 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yep, we got to

1 keep pounding that away too. Uh-huh, and Lester's  
2 nodding his head.  
3  
4 MR. ERHART: Yep.  
5  
6 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Uh-huh. And  
7 Vince is out there smiling away like you guys are crazy.  
8  
9 (Laughter)  
10  
11 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: But you know  
12 what we're going to keep doing it. Yeah, yeah, we're  
13 going to keep doing it.  
14  
15 Anything else.  
16  
17  
18 (No comments)  
19  
20 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We pretty much  
21 have a lot of the same issues but we're going to hit them  
22 at a different angle this time.  
23  
24 All right, that would be it.  
25  
26 And you know what we always would do at  
27 meetings and we haven't been able to do is we'd go around  
28 and give our concerns and speak, would you guys like to  
29 do that or do you want to.....  
30  
31 MR. GLANZ: It sounds like we did them  
32 already.  
33  
34 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay. Isn't  
35 that funny how we used to it.  
36  
37 (Laughter)  
38  
39 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: We had it  
40 twice, at the beginning and at the end.  
41  
42 (Laughter)  
43  
44 Yeah, all right, anything else.  
45  
46  
47 (No comments)  
48  
49 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Okay, I don't  
50 think I need a motion to adjourn because we're not really

1 technically in a -- legally meeting, but, yeah, thanks  
2 guys.

3

4 MR. GLANZ: Thank you, Sue, for doing  
5 another good job. Thank you for doing a wonderful job.

6

7 MR. WOODRUFF: Thank you.

8

9 MR. GLANZ: Thank you, good job.

10

11 MS. PATTON: Thank you all Council for  
12 all your hard work and thoughtful consideration of all  
13 the public comments and what's come before you. Thank  
14 you for your hard work.

15

16 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Yeah.

17

18 MS. PATTON: Thank you. Thank you to all  
19 the Staff who have stayed on. We missed a few folks  
20 there at the very end but I really want to thank folks --  
21 I was letting a handful of people know the -- for the  
22 Council to listen and hear the deliberation and be  
23 available for questions is just as important so thank you  
24 very much.

25

26 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I will share  
27 with you guys that I'm humbled and honored that -- three  
28 or four people, maybe more than that came up to me and  
29 thanked me for doing a good job as Chair and trying to  
30 give people ample time to speak and keep it moving and  
31 one of them said, one of the Staff said that it's the  
32 best for efficiency and giving people opportunity to talk  
33 so that's quite nice to hear and appreciate it very much.

34

35 MS. PATTON: I second that.

36

37 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: Well, thank  
38 you.

39

40 MR. GLANZ: I'm glad you're doing it Sue,  
41 because I don't think I'd have the patience for it.

42

43 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: I think I'm  
44 starting to lose my patience, I hate to say, but it's  
45 very challenging, yeah.

46

47 I think my next request is something to  
48 hit this on that's extremely loud.

49

50 REPORTER: Just not on the microphone.

1 (Laughter)  
2  
3 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: And then we'll  
4 be doing good. And, yeah, she doesn't want me to hit  
5 this expensive microphone, and I keep doing it.....  
6  
7 (Laughter)  
8  
9 MADAME CHAIR ENTSMINGER: All right,  
10 thanks guys.  
11  
12 (Off record)  
13  
14 (END OF PROCEEDINGS)

