

1 BRISTOL BAY FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE
2 REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL
3

4 PUBLIC MEETING
5

6 VOLUME I
7

8 Dillingham, Alaska
9 October 6, 2008
10 3:25 o'clock p.m.
11

12
13 COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT:
14

15 Randy Alvarez
16 Pete Abraham
17 Alvin Boskofsky
18 Molly Chythlook
19 Dan Dunaway
20 Boris Kosbruk, Sr.
21

22
23 Regional Council Coordinator - Donald Mike
24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44 Recorded and transcribed by:
45

46 Computer Matrix Court Reporters, LLC

47 700 W. 2nd Avenue

48 Anchorage, AK 99501

49 907-243-0668/907-227-5312

50 jpk@gci.net/sahile@gci.net

1 P R O C E E D I N G S
2
3 (Dillingham, Alaska - 10/6/2008)
4
5 (On record)
6
7 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: It's about 3:25.
8 I'll call the meeting to order. Donald, would you give
9 the roll call and establish a quorum.
10
11 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. We
12 currently have 10 seats on the Council with one vacancy
13 and we currently have nine active Council members.
14 I'll start the roll call. Mr. Peter Abraham.
15
16 MR. ABRAHAM: Yeah.
17
18 MR. MIKE: Dan O'Hara.
19
20 (No comments)
21
22 MR. MIKE: Mr. Chair. I spoke with Mr.
23 O'Hara and he said he'd be here, but I guess due to
24 work commitments he couldn't be here today. Ms. Nanci
25 Morris.
26
27 (No comments)
28
29 MR. MIKE: Mr. Chair. Ms. Nanci Morris
30 contacted me via email and she said due to prior
31 commitments in King Salmon/Naknek she couldn't attend
32 this meeting. Mr. Boris Kosbruk.
33
34 MR. KOSBRUK: Here.
35
36 MR. MIKE: Mr. Alvin Boskofsky.
37
38 MR. BOSKOFSKY: Here.
39
40 MR. MIKE: Molly Chythlook.
41
42 MS. CHYTHLOOK: I'm here, but won't be
43 here tomorrow.
44
45 MR. MIKE: Right. She sent me an email
46 indicating that she'll be here part of the day
47 tomorrow. Mr. Dan Dunaway.
48
49 MR. DUNAWAY: Here.
50

1 MR. MIKE: Mr. Thomas Hedlund.
2
3 (No comments)
4
5 MR. MIKE: Mr. Chair. Mr. Hedlund had
6 prior commitments in Iliamna area and he couldn't make
7 this meeting here in Dillingham. Mr. Randy Alvarez.
8
9 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Here.
10
11 MR. MIKE: Mr. Chair. You have six
12 members present. You have a quorum.
13
14 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: All right. Thank
15 you, Donald. Number 3 welcome and introduction of
16 Regional Council, Staff and guests. I guess we'll go
17 through this again. Donald just got done with the roll
18 call. You all know who we are, so I guess we'll start
19 with the lady sitting right there.
20
21 MS. SPANGLER: I'm Beth Spangler with
22 the Office of Subsistence Management, Fisheries
23 Division.
24
25 MR. GOLDBERG: Gary Goldberg, Office of
26 Subsistence Management.
27
28 MR. ANDERSON: Todd Anderson,
29 Department of Fish and Game, Comm Fish, Chignik
30 management area.
31
32 MR. SHARP: Dan Sharp, subsistence
33 coordinator for BLM.
34
35 MR. HOEFFERLE: Terry Hoefflerle. I'm
36 the executive director of Nunamta Aulukestai.
37 Translated is caretakers of our lands.
38
39 MR. CHYTHLOOK: I'm Joe Chythlook,
40 regional coordinator for Fish and Game.
41
42 MR. CANNON: Dave Cannon, Bering Sea
43 Fishermen's Association.
44
45 MR. BEYERSDORF: Geoff Beyersdorf, BLM
46 Subsistence.
47
48 MR. KOEPESEL: Mark Koepsel, Alaska
49 Peninsula/Becharof Refuge.
50

1 MR. MANGIPAN: Buck Mangipan, Lake
2 Clark National Park wildlife biologist.
3
4 MR. LABRIE: Neal Labrie, chief ranger
5 at Katmai National Park, National Park Service.
6
7 MR. BUTLER: Lem Butler, Alaska
8 Department of Fish and Game.
9
10 MR. WATTS: I'm Dominic Watts, Becharof
11 Refuge.
12
13 MS. MCBURNEY: Mary McBurney,
14 subsistence manager for National Park Service, Lake
15 Clark, Katmai and Aniakchak.
16
17 MR. BRITTON: Ron Britton, Alaska
18 Peninsula/Becharof Refuge.
19
20 MS. WILLIAMS: Liz Williams, OSM.
21
22 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Thank you. I guess
23 we should recognize that Ron is new. He's taking Ron
24 Squibb, the other wildlife biologist we had, his place
25 since he retired. I think there's a couple other new
26 ones.
27
28 MR. KOEPESEL: Do you want me to do
29 Staff changes now or wait for the agency reports?
30
31 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Since we started,
32 why don't we do it now.
33
34 MR. KOEPESEL: Thank you, Chairman.
35 Council members. Mark Koepsel, Alaska
36 Peninsula/Becharof Refuge. I just wanted to update you
37 on our Staff changes. First off, the refuge manager
38 Daryle Lons took a promotion and he's moved to Region 5
39 in Hadley, Massachusetts to be refuge supervisor. He
40 will be supervising about 14 different refuge managers
41 on the east coast. So he left about a week ago. His
42 replacement has already been made. It will be Bill
43 Shaft, who has spent the last eight years as the
44 manager at the Innoko National Wildlife Refuge in
45 McGrath. The date isn't set yet, but I would guess he
46 will show up somewhere around December 1st.
47
48 In addition to Ron Squibb retiring and
49 being replaced by Ron Britton, Dave Cox, our pilot and
50 law enforcement officer, has also retired and moved to

1 New Zealand. He's been replaced with Pete Finley, who
2 spent about four years in McGrath, but he was currently
3 coming from Bismark, North Dakota. He's been up here
4 about a month.

5
6 We've added a new position, a 6c 20-
7 year retirement law enforcement position that was new
8 funding that we never had before and we hired Jim
9 Whitcup, who is also coming from North Dakota, and he's
10 about to leave on October 20th. He's going to law
11 enforcement training in Georgia and we won't see him
12 again until March 20th. So he's got to go through all
13 the law enforcement training, come back from that, go
14 to field training in Kenai and somewhere else also
15 before he'll be up to where he can actually do law
16 enforcement, but he's also a pilot too. So we'll have
17 two pilots, Pete Finley and Jim Whitcup.

18
19 That's pretty much our Staff changes at
20 this time.

21
22 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Donald.

23
24 MR. MIKE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Mr.
25 Koepsel, I'd like, if it's appropriate, to mention that
26 Mr. Orville Lind, he was a Staff of Alaska
27 Peninsula/Becharof, and he's moving on. Can you give
28 the Council an update on that.

29
30 MR. KOEPESEL: Yes, Orville has moved to
31 Homer, Alaska, but he is still our employee. He
32 requested to be put on intermittent status, so we can
33 bring him over when we have needs for certain work. We
34 plan on getting him out to the village to introduce our
35 new people and also to work with the schools, to do the
36 migratory bird calendar contest in November/December,
37 that kind of stuff. He will also be working with
38 Alaska Maritime, even though he's on our payroll, if
39 they have needs. Like their science camp in the summer
40 at Sand Point. He tends to do that, so he'll still do
41 those activities too. He's starting his own personal
42 business and depending on how occupied that makes him,
43 we don't know how much time he's going to have to work
44 for us. It will be what he can spare for us.

45
46 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Commenting on
47 Orville, I know he was well needed. The liaison that
48 he was, he knew the people and knew their subsistence
49 because he is and was a subsistence user and he's from
50 the Chignik area. Somebody like that is kind of hard

1 to replace because the people have trust in him where
2 they can tell and say things that they wouldn't
3 normally say to somebody they don't know from who knows
4 where. So I think you need to use Orville whenever
5 there is going to be any contact or information
6 gathered from the villages that he was doing. Go
7 ahead.

8
9 MR. KOEPESEL: I 100 percent agree with
10 you. In fact, we did great leaps and bounds to keep
11 him as our employee. He wanted to resign and we
12 convinced him to stay on so we could use him from time
13 to time when he had time available from his own private
14 business. But we recognize his value and we did not
15 want him to go. This was a compromise that we worked
16 out with him to keep him on an intermittent status so
17 that he can still be in contact with the region and
18 still help us out. We don't want to lose his unique
19 abilities and the fact that people are so comfortable
20 talking to him. He can still be a conduit for
21 information from those villages to us even if he's not
22 living in King Salmon anymore.

23
24 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Thanks, Mark. I
25 guess that's it for Staff and guests. Number four on
26 the agenda is review and adoption of the agenda. I
27 guess the only thing that we didn't have on the agenda
28 was this work group session. Do we need to put it on
29 the agenda and submit the timetable we discussed?

30
31 MR. MIKE: Mr. Chair. Like I said
32 earlier, I didn't put it on the agenda because it's a
33 work session, but when I had the cover letter issued
34 back on August 29th I mentioned that the Council will
35 hold a work session beginning at 1:00 p.m. on October
36 6th. It would be a good idea for the Council to
37 recommend its discussion here to let the work group
38 know what their Council's plans are, Mr. Chair. Thank
39 you.

40
41 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Okay, Donald. Under
42 what, new business?

43
44 MR. MIKE: Yes, that could be under new
45 business. I'd like to remind the Council if you're
46 going to review and adopt the draft agenda, it would be
47 nice to have a motion to that effect to review and
48 adopt the agenda and make any amendments to it. Thank
49 you, Mr. Chair.

50

1 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Yeah, that's the
2 plan, Donald. I probably didn't use procedure. What
3 we need to do is somebody move to adopt the agenda and
4 then we'll amend it. Dan.
5
6 MR. DUNAWAY: Move to adopt the agenda.
7
8 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: We have a motion to
9 adopt the agenda. Is there a second.
10
11 MS. CHYTHLOOK: Second.
12
13 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Seconded by Molly.
14 I guess we need to have a motion to adopt the agenda to
15 add on the working group. Dan.
16
17 MR. DUNAWAY: I'll move to add some
18 comments about working group into the new business.
19 I'm not sure of the right language to use.
20
21 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: That will be
22 adequate. That way we have an opportunity to bring up
23 anything else that might come before us on this
24 subject. Is there a second.
25
26 MR. ABRAHAM: Second.
27
28 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Seconded by Pete
29 Abraham. Any more question or comment.
30
31 (No comments)
32
33 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Seeing none. All in
34 favor of adopting the amended agenda signify by saying
35 aye.
36
37 IN UNISON: Aye.
38
39 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Opposed.
40
41 (No opposing votes)
42
43 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Motion carried.
44 Number 5. Review and adopt minutes of March 24-25
45 meeting held in Dillingham. The minutes are on Page 4
46 if anybody wants to look at those. Do we have a motion
47 to adopt.
48
49 MR. DUNAWAY: Move to adopt.
50

1 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Motion to move and
2 adopt the minutes of March 24th and 25th. Is there a
3 second.
4
5 MR. ABRAHAM: Second.
6
7 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Seconded by Pete.
8 Any comments or questions on the minutes.
9
10 (No comments)
11
12 MR. BOSKOFISKY: Question.
13
14 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: The question has
15 been called. All in favor of adopting the minutes of
16 March 24th, 25th, signify by saying aye.
17
18 IN UNISON: Aye.
19
20 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Opposed.
21
22 (No opposing votes)
23
24 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Motion carried.
25 Number 6. Chairs report. 805(c) letter. That's on
26 Page 12. If anybody wants to read that, that's a
27 letter from the Chairman of the Federal Subsistence
28 Board on the last actions and business, a couple
29 paragraphs. Okay. Number 6(B). Council members
30 report.
31
32 Donald, is that just anything the
33 Council members want to report on?
34
35 MR. MIKE: Yes, it's just an
36 opportunity for other Council members to present some
37 issues either subsistence related or resource
38 management related just to give an update to the
39 Regional Advisory Council, Mr. Chair.
40
41 The other thing I was trying to insert
42 myself here, but I got a call from Mr. Dave Cannon and
43 I think it would be appropriate to insert him under
44 Agency reports and he just wanted to present a short
45 presentation on the Bering Sea Fishermen's Association.
46
47 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Yeah. Pete.
48
49 MR. ABRAHAM: Yeah, a brief report.
50 Goodnews Bay had the first moose opening this fall and

1 out of 70 got seven moose. They are very cooperative,
2 they work hard with them over there and they're happy
3 people right now.

4

5 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Who was that again?

6

7 MR. ABRAHAM: Goodnews Bay. I think we
8 started about five years ago and it was like 2000 or
9 something, I can't quite remember when it was, but they
10 had the first moose opening this fall.

11

12 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: They got seven.

13

14 MR. ABRAHAM: Seven, yeah. We allowed
15 them 10 moose and they got seven.

16

17 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Okay. Good. Is
18 there anything else you wanted to comment on, Pete?

19

20 MR. ABRAHAM: Doi.

21

22 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Council members.

23 Dan.

24

25 MR. DUNAWAY: That's kind of exciting
26 news what Pete said. That represents some real work in
27 the Togiak area for allowing moose to grow in their
28 area and move farther west. A lot of this has kind of
29 happened in the time I've lived in this area. When I
30 first got here, there were folks coming over from
31 Togiak and some of them poaching moose up near Lake
32 Aleknagik, I think. Then that stopped and the moose
33 really started taking off in the Togiak area enough so
34 the Togiak area folks get moose. Somewhere in there I
35 remember this discussion where Togiak was inspired to
36 say, hey, let's let some of these moose go on by to
37 Goodnews. This is kind of neat progress in my mind and
38 I'm kind of glad to see that people are benefitting
39 from it. That's all, thanks.

40

41 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Yeah, they're moving
42 the wrong way. Okay. We could take public testimony.
43 Donald.

44

45 MR. MIKE: Yeah, Mr. Chair. Before you
46 move on I'd just like to give an update on the agenda
47 that the Council adopted. Under number 7, the bycatch
48 issue, we have two representatives from the North
49 Pacific Fisheries Management Council and they'll be
50 here tomorrow morning, so they'd like to do a

1 presentation and get some comments on their proposed
2 EIS they're going to be drafting on salmon bycatch in
3 the Bering Sea/Aleutian Islands area. If the Council
4 cannot accommodate them when they show up tomorrow
5 morning, we can have a PowerPoint projector set up, but
6 they'll have hard copies of their PowerPoint
7 presentations for the Council to follow with. That's
8 it, Mr. Chair. Thank you.

9

10 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: All right, Donald.
11 Yeah, I don't see any reason why we can't, when they
12 arrive, put them on the agenda. They probably want to
13 be leaving tomorrow night, so we can do that. Also, we
14 have Dave from the Bering Sea.

15

16 I guess first we will do Terry
17 Hoefflerle for his public testimony and then if you
18 wanted to, Dave, you can come after him or wait until
19 tomorrow. It's up to you.

20

21 MR. CANNON: I'm going to shoot for
22 tomorrow since there will be a PowerPoint projector.

23

24 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Okay, fine. Pete.

25

26 MR. ABRAHAM: Can we get a headphones
27 for Boris. I'm pressing one in my ear right now and I
28 can hardly hear it. There's too much echo here.

29

30 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: I don't know. I
31 don't have anything. Donald.

32

33 MR. MIKE: We have a court recorder,
34 but he should have some headsets. I have a personal
35 headset I can provide Boris with if that might work
36 better for him, but that won't be until tomorrow.

37

38 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Boris, can you wait
39 until tomorrow?

40

41 MR. MIKE: Mr. Chair. After public
42 testimony we could stand down for five minutes.....

43

44 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Yeah, we will.
45 Boris, do you have anything for Council report that you
46 want to say on subsistence?

47

48 MR. KOSBRUK: I have a lot to say, but
49 I can't understand what you guys are saying.

50

1 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Let's recess for
2 five minutes.

3
4 (Off record)

5
6 (On record)

7
8 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Okay, you guys.
9 Donald recommends that it would probably be best if we
10 took our public testimony that wanted to testify today
11 and then probably should adjourn to take care of some
12 of these other issues when the people will be here
13 tomorrow for these fisheries proposals and the Bering
14 Sea bycatch issue. So we will take care of public
15 testimony and anybody that has anything else. Maybe
16 Boris wants to do his Council member report after
17 public testimony.

18
19 Now we will have Terry Hoefflerle
20 testify.

21
22 MR. HOEFFERLE: Thank you, Mr.
23 Chairman. Can you hear me, Boris?

24
25 MR. KOSBRUK: Yes.

26
27 MR. HOEFFERLE: I deeply appreciate
28 your courtesy in accommodating my travel schedule, Mr.
29 Chairman and members of the Board. I'm here to talk to
30 you today about the proposed Bristol Bay oil lease sale
31 that is currently in the process of NEPA and
32 Environmental Impact Statement scoping. They're
33 proposing to have an oil lease sale, called North
34 Aleutian Basin/Bristol Bay Oil Lease Sale, in 2011.

35
36 The proposal focuses on an area that
37 starts at about Port Moller and runs along the north
38 side of the Alaska Peninsula. They anticipate that the
39 most productive area that they're going to take a look
40 at is about 60 miles south and west of Port Moller.

41
42 I'm very worried about this lease sale
43 and I think that the potential that it has to have an
44 impact on subsistence here in Bristol Bay and in other
45 areas along the coast of the Bering Sea is very high.

46
47 The area that they're looking to
48 explore and develop is, for the winter months, covered
49 by broken ice. The industry has no experience in
50 drilling and producing petrol chemicals in that kind of

1 conditions. The Mineral Management Services, the ones
2 that are conducting this sale, have even said that
3 there's a 100 percent chance that there will be a major
4 oil spill during the exploration and development of a
5 field there. I can't think of an area that is more
6 productive in all the Bering Sea or North Pacific than
7 that area.

8
9 Many of you know that migratory birds
10 from all over the west coast of Alaska and the
11 northwest coast all congregate there before they fly
12 south for the winter. They spend several weeks in that
13 area in the eel grass beds and eating clams and stuff,
14 from Cinder River all the way down to Izembek Lagoon.

15
16 There are many other subsistence
17 species that are present in that area at certain times
18 of the year in quantities that are globally significant
19 parts of their population. Those of you that have gone
20 down along that coast in a boat, you'll remember if
21 you're there in the summertime, those walruses there by
22 Cape Seniavin the population is increasing every year.
23 Those walruses go all the way down to Port Moller and
24 Herendeen Bay while they're looking for food. They go
25 all the way up to Meshik by Port Heiden. People use
26 those walruses not just in the villages around here but
27 all the way up the coast. Right now they're fishing
28 for herring in Port Moller. This is the time they're
29 doing their herring for bait fishery there. Those are
30 the same herring that are here in Togiak in the
31 springtime and they're up in Nelson Island, a major
32 part of the Nelson Island subsistence diet.

33
34 Half of the lease sale area has been
35 closed to crab fishing for probably eight years. I'm
36 not sure about how many years it's been closed because
37 it's a critical habitat area for red king crab. The
38 entire area has been closed to halibut fishing because
39 it's a halibut nursery.

40
41 The thing that bothers me about all of
42 this is the fact that in 2006 the Mineral Management
43 Services at the recommendation of NOAA and the National
44 Marine Fisheries Service they recognized that all of
45 their scientific data was 20 or 25 years old. It was
46 gathered the last time that that area was put out for a
47 lease sale.

48
49 So they gathered, I don't know,
50 probably 80 or 100 scientists, everybody that has

1 worked in that area, in a hotel in Anchorage in 2006
2 for a week and they broke up into six or eight working
3 groups and they looked at all the scientific
4 information that was available and they came up with a
5 list of 40 studies that they said were desperately
6 needed to be done before an appropriate NEPA process
7 could be completed.

8
9 Many of those studies indicated that
10 they had to be underway before 2008. To date, the
11 National Marine Fisheries Service has two of them going
12 on. One with the North Pacific Right Whales. I think
13 there's only 100 left in the world and that's a
14 critical habitat area for them. They're doing another
15 study on the way that the wind blows different times of
16 the year and the way the current goes at different
17 times of the year.

18
19 But there were studies that were
20 recommended. You all know that we have very little
21 near-shore information and information about the fish
22 and fisheries that use the estuaries, whether you're
23 talking about Meshik or further east into Bristol Bay,
24 those were recommended as studies. There was a
25 recommendation that they undertake subsistence studies,
26 subsistence uses of the resources in that area. They
27 were told that the only subsistence resources that they
28 had the money to take a look at subsistence uses were
29 in the five villages in the Aleutian East Borough;
30 Nelson Lagoon and Cold Bay and Sand Point and King
31 Cove. I'm forgetting one.

32
33 I guess that I'm here to encourage you
34 to take a look at and if you're concerned about these
35 resources, to maybe take some action to call public
36 attention to what's going on here. The Mineral
37 Management Services people, in order to have a lease
38 sale, are only required to use all available scientific
39 information. They're not making any effort -- even
40 though the Congress has said you need to do these
41 studies, they're not getting them done.

42
43 So, if it's possible for this RAC to
44 write letters to the agencies that provide scientific
45 support to you, to write a letter to the Secretary of
46 the Interior and the head of the Mineral Management
47 Services and indicate concern about subsistence
48 resources and the fact that they're planning to have
49 this sale without essential scientific information. I
50 would urge you to do that.

1 They're planning to have as many as 200
2 or 250 wells. They plan on bringing their product
3 onshore right there at Herendeen Bay, right at Nelson
4 Lagoon, and take it by pipeline across the peninsula
5 over onto your side, Boris, and it's way north of Cold
6 Bay. You know that path that goes across there from
7 Herendeen Bay, that's where they'll put the pipeline.
8 They'll have a gas liquification plant and big tankers
9 coming into that bay right there.

10

11 So, anyway, I would urge you to take
12 some information to see that somebody is protecting our
13 subsistence resources there.

14

15 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Terry, thanks. I
16 attended that meeting in Anchorage two years ago at the
17 Marriott for the Mineral Management Services where they
18 presented the issues. We formed into all those groups
19 and came up with our issues and our concerns and,
20 you're right, I haven't heard anything much since we
21 had that meeting.

22

23 One thing you mentioned too, you said
24 the exploration company they were probably going to
25 have a 100 percent chance of a spill when they're
26 exploring.

27

28 MR. HOEFFERLE: Yes, sir. Mineral
29 Management Services.....

30

31 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Said that?

32

33 MR. HOEFFERLE: Said that. And there
34 are other comments on the public record. NOAA went to
35 them and said when they put out this five-year leasing
36 schedule here just prior, that was why the meeting was
37 convened in Anchorage. I think the leasing schedule
38 was a 2007-2012 leasing plan. In NOAA's preliminary
39 comments, they said take Bristol Bay off of that list.
40 There is so much that we don't know and it's such an
41 important area for fish and marine mammals and birds
42 and migratory birds and sea ducks and just all kinds of
43 things, take it off the list. We don't know enough.
44 MMS just ignored it. Those comments are on the record,
45 Mr. Chairman.

46

47 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Yeah, that just
48 struck me as.....

49

50 MR. HOEFFERLE: And the industry knows

1 that they have no way of containing an oil spill in
2 broken ice conditions. The industry knows and MMS
3 knows that they have no way -- that none of these booms
4 that they use to contain petrol chemicals that work if
5 there's any more than a 2.3 meter sea. You know, it's
6 not going to happen on a calm, sunny day if something
7 goes wrong.

8
9 Those Seal Islands that are down there,
10 Boris, inside of them is all eel grass beds. On a
11 storm, oil and stuff would get pushed over those sand
12 islands and into those eel grass beds and they'd never
13 get clean.

14
15 MR. KOSBRUK: (Away from microphone)

16
17 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Boris, turn your
18 mike on and put it by your mouth.

19
20 MR. KOSBRUK: I was mentioning that
21 Aleutian Chain there is right in the middle of the ring
22 of fire, volcanoes. That's a problem itself right
23 there. That's scary.

24
25 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Any more questions
26 for Terry. Pete, then Dan.

27
28 MR. ABRAHAM: Terry, can your group --
29 Nunam Aulukeste, is that what you are?

30
31 MR. HOEFFERLE: Nunamta Aulukestai.

32
33 MR. ABRAHAM: Nunamta Aulukestai write
34 this Board a letter for the record so from there on we
35 can possibly take an action with the direction of our
36 Chairman here. A letter to the local areas over here
37 would be more effective than talking to the board of
38 directors over here. We will direct what needs to be
39 done and said. But we need to alert the Bristol Bay
40 region people here. I think that would be more
41 effective than us over here. Thank you.

42
43 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Dan, did you have a
44 comment.

45
46 MR. DUNAWAY: Yeah, Mr. Chair, thanks.
47 Terry, yeah, I think Pete's idea is a good one and I
48 appreciate the materials you've sent to me, but,
49 honestly, with some of the other things I'm concerned
50 about I get overwhelmed. I'm trying to remember, has a

1 lease sale occurred yet or when is it to occur?

2

3 MR. HOEFFERLE: Well, as you know, it
4 was sold once before and then we forced the government
5 to buy it back. Well, now they're going to sell the
6 leases again. The lease sale is scheduled to happen in
7 2011.

8

9 MR. DUNAWAY: Terry, thank you. In
10 your mind, where would be the most effective place to
11 contact, MMS or.....

12

13 MR. HOEFFERLE: I had this conversation
14 with Dan over one of the breaks. You know, there are
15 probably a couple of places to send it. Within the
16 Federal bureaucracy, probably Mineral Management
17 Services and to the Secretary of the Interior's office,
18 although both of those guys are probably packing their
19 bags already, understanding that once the election is
20 over they're going to be on vacation.

21

22 I have talked with both of our senators
23 and our congressman about this and also had
24 communications with the governor's office and they all
25 have said we would never let anything happen that would
26 hurt the fisheries and the resources in Bristol Bay and
27 unless science shows that it can be done safely, we
28 won't let it happen. What's happening is that the
29 agency that's responsible for seeing that this science
30 gets done is not doing their job. These are the same
31 guys that we read about in the newspaper having sex and
32 drug parties with Shell Oil employees, you know. It's
33 in all the newspapers.

34

35 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Terry, I've got a
36 question too. Did you say MMS is doing two studies
37 right now, one for Right Whales and another one for
38 currents? How many did you say.....

39

40 MR. HOEFFERLE: One for whales and
41 they're doing an overall climate and atmospheric study.

42

43 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Yeah, two all
44 together, whales and then current or something like
45 that. Anyway, how many more are required?

46

47 MR. HOEFFERLE: Well, I don't think
48 that any are really required. You guys and all those
49 scientists that got together a couple years ago at the
50 Marriott recommended 40 or 42 studies be done and that

1 they happen with the completed results and reports
2 before the lease sale. Well, many of these populations
3 are only in that area for a couple months a year. When
4 I look down that list of studies that were to be done,
5 there was a starting date and the duration date of the
6 studies that were recommended. They should be working
7 on 18 or 20 of them already and they're not. They're
8 not doing that stuff. I know that the congress has
9 given them money to do it.

10

11 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: You're bringing my
12 memory back now. The committee I was on, we
13 recommended them to do studies on smolt out-migration
14 because if they're going to be making sounding and
15 blasting and the run timing for when the salmon run, I
16 suppose we need them to submit that information so that
17 they know if they're going to be doing anything when to
18 do it and when not to do it. NASA doesn't launch a
19 shuttle into outer space until they have the window,
20 you know. There's so much debris floating around that
21 they need to find an opening to shoot the space shuttle
22 through. So, you know, these guys need to be the same
23 responsible.

24

25 MR. HOEFFERLE: They have no idea what
26 some of that seismic stuff would do to king crabs. I
27 mean they've got a whole different skeletal structure
28 and all that kind of stuff. I mean they've got no idea
29 what that kind of exploration would do to those kinds
30 of creatures it seems to me.

31

32 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Anybody else. Pete.

33

34 MR. ABRAHAM: Mr. Chairman. Can you
35 give me an estimate how long or how much of that oil
36 will fuel the United States from that?

37

38 MR. HOEFFERLE: I've seen some of those
39 numbers, Pete, and I can't remember what they are, but
40 I can tell you in dollars. They estimated that the
41 amount of revenue that would come out of that lease
42 sale would be \$7.5 billion. That was when oil was at
43 \$30 a barrel. Now it's \$87 a barrel. But that's
44 spread out over a 25-year period. We know that the
45 fisheries that that area is critical to produced \$2
46 billion a year worth of revenues. So, over the same
47 25-year period, the fisheries would be worth 50 billion
48 instead of 7.5 billion, and it's a sustainable
49 resource.

50

1 MR. ABRAHAM: Seven billion at \$30 a
2 barrel and you've got 40 states, you're looking at
3 maybe two months of fuel for the entire nation to gas
4 up the cars and trucks.

5
6 MR. HOEFFERLE: Probably not even that,
7 Pete. I don't think it was even that much. I have
8 that information someplace. It's been generated by
9 somebody. I can try to find it for you.

10
11 MR. ABRAHAM: It's no big deal. I just
12 wanted to know. A big risk that the people are doing
13 when renewable resource over here has been with us for
14 many, many years and will be here for many, many years
15 if we are careful of what we're doing. Two months of
16 gas to gas up the cars in the United States and blow up
17 the whole thing and then we've got nothing.

18
19 MR. HOEFFERLE: The Aleutians East
20 Borough was here a couple weeks ago when MMS had a
21 scoping meeting in Dillingham and, when pressed, the
22 manager of the Borough said that they would be tickled
23 to death if they got 100 jobs out of that whole
24 process. So, for 100 jobs and whatever the tax
25 revenues are that go to the Aleutians East Borough,
26 they're willing to put it all at risk.

27
28 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Dan.

29
30 MR. DUNAWAY: Mr. Chair. Mr.
31 Hoefflerle. You were talking about crabs and seismic.
32 I was working in Dutch Harbor when this sale first came
33 up with the Commercial Fisheries Division of Fish and
34 Game and I had personal friends working on some of the
35 seismic boats that at the time were doing work in
36 Norton Sound and we were really worried about king crab
37 up there where it's quite shallow.

38
39 A friend of mine working towing one of
40 those seismic cables, which, to my understanding, is
41 this big or bigger, and hundreds if not thousands of
42 wires in it, and somewhere along the line, I'm guessing
43 15, 20 fathoms of water, they pulled one of those big
44 air guns right over the top of their cable and he said
45 it looked like a bomb went off on that wire. Yet, at
46 the same time, we were getting assured that those
47 seismic guns weren't hurting the crab stocks that are
48 fished out in Nome because we had the responsibility of
49 managing that fishery at that time.

50

1 Now, there was also a big gold dredge
2 going on up there at the same time, but we did have
3 kind of a decline in king crab up there for a while. I
4 don't know what's happened to it since, but I share the
5 concerns with -- well, I'm pretty convinced that in
6 quite shallow water those seismic guns can do a lot
7 more damage than they want to lead you to believe. I
8 think they're better than dynamite, less damaging than
9 dynamite, and that's just one concern out of the many
10 like what you've raised. I sometimes personally get
11 overwhelmed with all the things to be concerned about
12 and where to start, but I appreciate you bringing it to
13 our attention. Thank you.

14
15 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Yeah, I appreciate
16 it too, Terry. I think we need to keep up on this and
17 probably ask what's being done on the recommendations
18 we came up with at that 2006 meeting. Any more. Boris.

19
20 MR. HOEFFERLE: Mr. Chairman.

21
22 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Terry.

23
24 MR. HOEFFERLE: If I could just ask
25 Pete, would you repeat your recommendation to me.

26
27 MR. ABRAHAM: It would be helpful if
28 Nunamta Aulukestai writes this Board a letter and then
29 have some flyers sent to each village in Bristol Bay
30 region, maybe more beyond, even as far as Nelson
31 Island. The commercial fishermen rely on the Bristol
32 Bay fish over here. Explain in simple words what can
33 happen, what can cause about the fisheries in Bristol
34 Bay.

35
36 MR. HOEFFERLE: Thank you, Pete. Mr.
37 Chairman. Thank you.

38
39 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Thanks, Terry.
40 Okay. Anybody else for public testimony or -- Boris,
41 did you want to report on anything?

42
43 MR. KOSBRUK: I was living in
44 Perryville, but I got home from one of my meetings and
45 Dad said there's a guy waiting to see me. I said who is
46 he. He said I don't know, he wanted to talk to you.
47 Do you know about what. No. So I went up to see him.
48 He was from Las Vegas, Herb Manu (ph), Atomic Energy
49 Commission and he's here to assure us that the blasts
50 they're going to do in Amchitka was safe. He was

1 trying to convince me it was safe. I said how can you
2 guarantee that. We know it's safe. I said if it's
3 that's safe -- you believe yourself. He says, oh,
4 yeah, I do. Well, take it to D.C. and blow it then if
5 you're that confident in yourself. He didn't answer.
6 He never did answer that.

7
8 What I'm getting at is the last few
9 years down in Chignik, you know, the talk is there's
10 fish caught down there that are deformed, heads are
11 deformed. That comes to mind, that blast. That's
12 happening just a couple years ago they talked about
13 more being caught like that, all deformed, heads,
14 salmon. So there is some danger, that's for sure, is
15 what I can say.

16
17 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Did you want to say
18 anything on moose?

19
20 MR. KOSBRUK: What moose?

21
22 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Okay. Then we'll
23 recess until 8:30 in the morning then. Unless there's
24 anything else, Donald.

25
26 MR. MIKE: No, I don't have anything,
27 Mr. Chair. Thank you.

28
29 CHAIRMAN ALVAREZ: Okay. Then we shall
30 be recessed until 8:30.

31
32 (Off record)

33
34 (PROCEEDINGS TO BE CONTINUED)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35

C E R T I F I C A T E

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)
)ss.
STATE OF ALASKA)

I, Joseph P. Kolasinski, Notary Public in and
for the state of Alaska and reporter for Computer
Matrix Court Reporters, LLC, do hereby certify:

THAT the foregoing pages numbered 2 through 20
contain a full, true and correct Transcript of the
BRISTOL BAY FEDERAL SUBSISTENCE REGIONAL ADVISORY
COUNCIL MEETING, VOL I, taken electronically by
Computer Matrix Court Reporters on the 6th day of
October 2008, beginning at the hour of 3:25 o'clock
p.m. at Dillingham, Alaska;

THAT the transcript is a true and correct
transcript requested to be transcribed and thereafter
transcribed by under my direction and reduced to print
to the best of our knowledge and ability;

THAT I am not an employee, attorney, or party
interested in any way in this action.

DATED at Anchorage, Alaska, this 15th day of
October 2008.

Joseph P. Kolasinski
Notary Public in and for Alaska
My Commission Expires: 03/12/12