

Rural Determination Process Review Q&As

Overview

1. Why is the rural determination process review important to Alaskans?

Only residents of communities or areas determined to be rural by the Federal Subsistence Board are eligible to harvest fish and wildlife resources on Federal public lands under Federal subsistence regulations.

2. Why is the Federal Subsistence Board reviewing the rural determination Process?

On October 23, 2009, Secretary of the Interior Ken Salazar announced the initiation of a Departmental review of the Federal Subsistence Management Program in Alaska, and on August 31, 2010, Secretary Salazar, along with Secretary of Agriculture Tom Vilsack, made several recommendations to the Federal Subsistence Board to improve the program. One recommendation called for a review of the rural determination process and, if needed, regulatory change. The Federal Subsistence Board voted unanimously to initiate a review of the rural determination process (process review). In the meantime, the Board found that it was in the public interest to suspend the results of its May 7, 2007 rural determinations until after this current review of the rural determination process is complete and new rural determinations are made, or for 5 years, whichever comes first.

3. Who is participating in the process review and what roles are each playing?

The public is encouraged to participate in the rural determination process review by learning about the current process, commenting on it, and suggesting new ideas for a better, future process. The public is invited to testify in person at public hearings or provide written comments. The Regional Advisory Councils, Tribes, and Alaska Native Claims Settlement Act corporations may also provide comments or make recommendations to the Federal Subsistence Board. The Federal Subsistence Board will evaluate all the comments and present recommendations to the Secretaries of the Interior and Agriculture, who will decide the outcome of the process review.

4. What is the overall timeline?

The rural determination process review will occur between December 31, 2012 and the spring of 2015. The Federal Subsistence Board's goal is to conduct the new rural determinations review by February, 2017.

Existing rural determination process

5. What is the existing process for determining rural communities (or non-rural areas)?

The Federal Subsistence Board uses the rural determination process described in the Final Rule published in the Federal Register on May 7, 2007. The Federal Subsistence Board considered all of the following in making rural determinations:

- **Population thresholds.** A community or area with a population below 2,500 will be considered rural. A community or area with a population between 2,500 and 7,000 will be considered rural or nonrural, based on community characteristics and criteria used to group communities together. Communities with populations more than 7,000 will be considered nonrural, unless such communities possess significant characteristics of a rural nature.
- **Rural characteristics.** The Board recognizes that population alone is not the only indicator of rural or nonrural status. Other characteristics the Board considers include, but are not limited to, the following: use of fish and wildlife; development and diversity of the economy; community infrastructure; transportation; and educational institutions.
- **Aggregation of communities.** The Board recognizes that communities and areas of Alaska are connected in diverse ways. Communities that are economically, socially, and communally integrated are considered in the aggregate in determining rural and nonrural status. The aggregation criteria are: 1) Do 30 percent or more of the working people commute from one community to another? 2) Do they share a common high school attendance area? and 3) Are the communities in proximity and road-accessible to one another?
- **Timelines.** The Board reviews rural determinations on a 10-year cycle, and out of cycle in special circumstances.
- **Information sources.** Current regulations state that population data from the most recent census conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau, as updated by the Alaska Department of Labor, shall be utilized in the rural determination process. The information collected and the reports generated during the decennial census vary between each census; as such, data used during the Board's rural determination may vary. These information sources as stated in regulations will continue to be the foundation of data used for rural determinations.

6. When were the most recent rural determinations made and what were they?

The Final Rule on the current rural determinations was published in the Federal Register on May 7, 2007. The Federal Subsistence Board determined all communities and areas to be rural except:

- (1) Anchorage, Municipality of;
- (2) Fairbanks North Star Borough;
- (3) Homer area—including Homer, Anchor Point, North Fork Road area, Kachemak City, and the Fritz Creek East area (not including Voznesenka);

- (4) Juneau area—including Juneau, West Juneau, and Douglas;
- (5) Kenai area—including Kenai, Soldotna, Sterling, Nikiski, Salamatof, Kalifonsky, Kasilof, and Clam Gulch;
- (6) Ketchikan area—including all parts of the road system connected to the City of Ketchikan including Saxman, Pennock Island and parts of Gravina Island;
- (7) Prudhoe Bay;
- (8) Seward area—including Seward and Moose Pass;
- (9) Valdez; and
- (10) Wasilla/Palmer area—including Wasilla, Palmer, Sutton, Big Lake, Houston, Point MacKenzie, and Bodenburg Butte.

Note that all changes made by the Board in 2007, except for changing Adak's determination from non-rural to rural, have been put on hold by the Board pending the outcome of the process review and new rural determinations. (See Question #1 for more detail).

“Process” Review (currently underway)

7. Are there any legal considerations I should be aware of when making my comments?

Yes. All ideas on how to improve the rural determination process that are consistent with ANILCA Title VIII and 9th Circuit Court of Appeals case law associated with the definition of rural will be considered. In *Kenaitze v. State of Alaska*, 860 F.2d 312 (1988), the 9th Court provided useful guidance regarding the meaning of the term "rural" as it is used in Title VIII of ANILCA:

Regarding the definition of "rural," the Court said, "The term rural is not difficult to understand; it is not a term of art. It is a standard word in the English language commonly understood to refer to areas of the country that are sparsely populated, where the economy centers on agriculture and ranching."

Based on this definition, the Court struck down the State of Alaska's approach to defining rural areas. The State's definition of "rural" included only those areas dominated by subsistence fishing and hunting, while excluding areas dominated primarily by a cash economy even if a substantial portion of that area's residents engaged in subsistence activities. In making this decision, the Court said that "Congress did not limit the benefits of [Title VIII] to areas dominated by a subsistence economy. Instead, it wrote broadly, giving the statutory priority to all subsistence users residing in rural areas."

8. What is the timeline for the process review?

- The rural determination process review began on December 31, 2012, with the publication of a Federal Register Notice requesting comments.
- Between August 20 and October 17, 2013 the Subsistence Regional Advisory Councils will meet and formulate comments for the Federal Subsistence Board. Public hearings, conducted by the Federal Subsistence Board, will be held in conjunction with each of these meetings to gather public comments.
- The deadline to submit all comments is November 1, 2013.
- By April, 2014 the Federal Subsistence Board will draft recommendations for the Secretaries of the Interior and Agriculture on possible changes to the process.
- The Secretaries will then publish a proposed rule in the Federal Register, opening a comment period, and by the spring of 2015 will publish a final rule.

9. Where can I find the Federal Register Notice that asks for input into the process?

It is available online at <http://alaska.fws.gov/asm/rural.cfml> In addition, the public can call 1 (800) 478-1456 to request a hard copy.

10. When and where can I provide official input into the process review?

By November 1, 2013 comments must be received in any of the following ways:

- *Electronically*: sent to subsistence@fws.gov.
- *By hard copy*: U.S. mail or hand-delivery to: USFWS, Office of Subsistence Management, 1011 East Tudor Road, MS 121, Attn: Theo Matuskowitz, Anchorage, AK 99503– 6199,
- *Hand delivery* to the Designated Federal Official attending any of the Regional Advisory Council public meetings or Federal Subsistence Board public hearings, or
- *By testifying* at public hearings held in conjunction with the Fall 2013 Regional Advisory Council meetings and in a few additional communities. The hearing schedule can be found at <http://alaska.fws.gov/asm/deadline.cfml>

11. How can I make my comments most useful to the Board?

Comments, and rationale for those comments, should address the following components of the current rural determination process: population thresholds, rural characteristics, aggregation of communities, timelines and information sources. All ideas on how to improve the rural determination process consistent with ANILCA Title VIII and the 9th Circuit Court of Appeals case law associated with the definition of rural will be considered.

12. Will the fall of 2013 be the only time I can comment on the process review?

No. If the Secretaries decide to make changes to the rural determination process, a proposed rule will be published in the Federal Register followed by another open comment period.

13. What will the Board do with my comments?

After the November 1, 2013 comment deadline, the Federal Subsistence Board will review and analyze all the comments it received during the comment period. The Board will make recommendations to the Secretaries of the Interior and Agriculture on possible changes to improve the rural determination process.

14. Who can I contact if I have questions?

Individuals can call David Jenkins, Office of Subsistence Management, at 907-786-3688 or email david_jenkins@fws.gov